TEACHING FOR DEMOCRATIC CITIZENSHIP: A CASE
STUDY OF ONE PRIMARY SCHOOL IN THE WESTERN CAPE

MATHILDA JOHANNA ABSOLOM

A mini thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of Magister Educationis in the
Faculty of Education, University of the Western Cape

Supervisor: Professor L. Green

February 2005
TEACHING FOR DEMOCRATIC CITIZENSHIP: A CASE STUDY OF ONE PRIMARY SCHOOL IN THE WESTERN CAPE

KEYWORDS

Democracy Education

Citizenship Education

Character Education

Moral Education

Values Education

Critical Thinking

Cognitive Virtues

Moral Virtues

Skills for Citizenship

Teaching for Citizenship
ABSTRACT

Since 1994, South Africa has been in the process of social, political, economic and educational transformation. The implementation of Curriculum 2005 (C2005) and Outcomes-Based Education (OBE) are some of the changes that took place in the education system. It is a consequence of policies based on human rights, which means there should be no discrimination against people. In South Africa educators are regarded as one of the stakeholders responsible for the mediation of values and morals in children and young people so that they will be effective citizens of a democracy. However, the success of this policy in schools depends heavily on the understandings, priorities and practices of educators.

The nurturing of moral development and education for democratic citizenship are overlapping concepts. Citizenship education always contains a moral element. Practices of moral development generally draw on the work of Kohlberg, which is linked to a Piagetian understanding of development. Vygotsky's approach may suggest different practices.

In this study a qualitative case study approach, was used to explore the practices and priorities of educators with regard to moral and citizenship education in schools. Perceptions, understandings, priorities and practices of moral and citizenship education within one school were explored primarily through interviews with staff and learners at the school, together with a semi-structured questionnaire for the learners.

The research was conducted according to international ethical guidelines and with the permission of the Western Cape Education Department (WCED). The conclusions in this study are meant to contribute to the on-going debate on educational transformation in the Western Cape Education Department (WCED) and in the country. If we are a democracy now, the questions raised should be of value and contribute towards the advancement on nation building.
DECLARATION

I declare that Teaching for democratic citizenship: A case study of one primary school in the Western Cape, is my own work, that it has not been submitted before for any degree or examination in any other university, and that all the sources I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by complete references.

MATHILDA JOHANNA ABSOLOM

Signed:.............................................. FEBRUARY 2005
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I want to thank my Heavenly Father who gave me the strength and without whose guidance this study would not have been possible.

In addition, thanks to the following:

My supervisor: Professor Lena Green, for her invaluable input, support, encouragement and understanding;

The Western Cape Education Department for permission to conduct the research in the school;

The National Research Foundation (NRF) for financial assistance;

To Estelle Maart for her typing and layout of this thesis;

Colleagues and friends for their interest and motivation, with special reference to my two dear friends Joan Jafthas and Ingrid Patmore for sharing my frustrations and supporting me;

My son, Ulrich who was my prime motivator, and for always believing in me;

The participants in the study for sharing their thoughts and experiences.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Key Words i
Abstract ii
Declaration iii
Acknowledgements iv
Table of contents v

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

1.1 Introduction 1
1.2 Motivation and background to the study 1
1.2.1 Social and educational context 1
1.2.2 Personal motivation 4
1.3 Moral development and education for democratic citizenship 4
1.4 Practices and research 5
1.5 Research Methodology 6
1.6 Overview of the study 7
1.7 Definitions 8

CHAPTER TWO: THEORIES AND PRACTICES OF MORAL DEVELOPMENT

2.1 Introduction 9
2.2 The relationship between moral and cognitive development 9
2.3 The influence of Piaget 10
2.4. Kohlberg's theory of moral development 11
2.5. Critique of Kohlberg's theory 13
2.6. The role of schools in moral and citizenship education 14
2.6.1. The importance of schools 14
2.6.2. School climate, curriculum and organization 16
2.6.3. Nurturing specific values and virtues 17
2.7. Practices of moral and citizenship education 18
2.7.1. Different forms of moral education 18
2.7.1.1. Indoctrination 19
2.7.1.2. Religious authority 19
2.7.1.3. Common sense approach 19
2.7.1.4. Values clarification 19
2.7.1.5. Philosophical /ethical enquiry 20
2.7.1.6. Moral dilemmas 20
2.8. Citizenship education 22
2.8.1. Different models of citizenship 22
2.8.1.1 Civic skills 23
2.8.1.2. Civic dispositions 23
2.9. Research findings related to moral and citizenship education in schools 24
2.10. Summary 26

CHAPTER THREE: RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction 27
CHAPTER FOUR: RESEARCH FINDINGS

4.1 Introduction 38
4.2 Civitas Primary School 38
4.3 Educators’ understanding of their role 40
4.3.1 Educator as conscientizer 40
4.3.2 Educator as role model 41
4.3.3 Educator as collaborator with parents 42
4.3.4 Role related concerns 42
4.4 Priorities at the school in terms of values and virtues 43
4.4.1 Love, care and care of the environment 44
4.4.2 Trust and loyalty 46
4.4.3 Responsibility 47
4.4.4 Respect 49
4.4.5 Justice, fairness and human rights 51
4.4.6 Decision-making and choices 52
4.5 Practices in the school 53
4.5.1 Rewards and praise 53
4.5.2 Relationship building 54
4.5.3 Holistic development 54
4.5.4 Involvement of the community 55
4.6 Summary 57

CHAPTER FIVE: DISCUSSION, LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 Introduction 59
5.2 Summary and discussion of research findings 59
5.2.1 Educators as role models 60
5.2.2 Educators as collaborators with parents 60
5.2.3 Educators’ role related concerns 61

5.3 Priorities at the school in terms of virtues and values 61

5.3.1 Love and care 61

5.3.2 Trust and loyalty 62

5.3.3 Responsibility 63

5.3.4 Respect 63

5.3.5 Justice 63

5.4 Practices in the school 64

5.5 Limitations of the study 65

5.6 Personal learnings 66

5.7 Recommendations 66

5.8 Suggestions for further research 67

5.9 Conclusion 67

REFERENCES 69

APPENDICES 80

Appendix 1 – Letter of application to the Western Cape Education Department (WCED) to conduct the research

Appendix 2 – Letter of confirmation from the Western Cape Education Department (WCED)

Appendix 3 – Letter to the principal of Civitas Primary School

Appendix 4 – Learner questionnaire

Appendix 5 – Learner activity-based lessons

Appendix 6 – Learner citizenship story task

Appendix 7 – Examples of educator interview transcriptions
CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY

“If one considers the effectiveness of education in the South African context, over the past thirty to forty years, it is clear that the education system needs to be dramatically transformed, if it is to succeed in preparing the child not only for the world of work, but also for social, political and moral maturity”.
(Naudé and Van der Westhuizen, 1996: 159)

1.1 INTRODUCTION

The study explores the understanding and mediation of the virtues associated with citizenship of a democracy at one primary school in the Western Cape. This chapter explains the motivation and context for the study. Thereafter it refers briefly to the literature to be discussed in Chapter two and the methodology to be discussed in Chapter three. Finally it provides an overview of the structure of the study and definitions of some key concepts.

1.2 MOTIVATION AND BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

1.2.1 Social and educational context

Since 1994 South Africa has become a democratic country. This means that all its citizens have the right to equal opportunity and that no one will be discriminated against on the basis of race, culture, gender or religion. This had major implications for education. Education is seen as having a responsibility to promote appropriate values. In a democracy citizens have responsibilities. In order to carry out their responsibilities they need both values and skills.

This context has a history that needs to be understood. In 1948 the National Party rose to political dominance and took control of education and other institutions. The government enforced a strict segregationist doctrine upon education. Separate
education departments were developed for different racial groups existing within this country. The South African education system was comprised of 18 separate education departments, separated by marked resource imbalances. (National Education Policy Investigation, 1993)

Central to the National Party government’s arguments for the establishment of these institutions was the claim that their intention was to promote the development of Black education along with their own undistorted cultural forms, or self-determination for each population group within its own sphere. All this division was geared at reinforcing the dominance of white rule through the exclusion of blacks from quality education and training. There was also a distinct lack of basic learning facilities, such as books and curricular material, classrooms, furniture, libraries, laboratories, sporting and recreational facilities in black schools. As a result learners were deprived of the opportunity to explore and discover their potential as learners.

In the “old” South Africa, under the Apartheid regime the education system for all race groups was based on ‘Christian National Education’ (CNE). According to Roberts (1993), Christian National Education (CNE) received its formal codification in 1948, with the publication of the Policy Statement by the Institute for Christian National Education in Potchefstroom. This Christian National Education system became the dominant ideology, which promoted separate education departments for different racial and ethnic groups in South Africa. It also assured that values would be taught from a Christian perspective. Now that there is no longer CNE there seems to be some confusion regarding the practice of values education.

The new education policy of the mid 1990’s changed dramatically. There was a change in the curriculum, which required educators to adopt a different approach to the one they used in the apartheid era. With the implementation of OBE (outcomes Based Education) and Curriculum 2005 new demands were placed on educators and education was faced with even more challenges than before (Naicker, 1999).

According to James (2001: 3-4) “It is boldly stated in the Constitution of the new South Africa, that we seek to heal the divisions of the past and establish a society based on democratic values, social justice and fundamental human rights by laying the foundation for a democratic and open society in which government is based on
the will of the people and every citizen is equally protected by law to improve the quality of life for all citizens and build a united democratic South Africa to take its rightful place as a sovereign state in the family of nations”.

Furthermore, it is recognised that people cannot automatically internalise the values embedded in the Constitution. These values are essentially important to an understanding of nation building. “The moral value system of the South African people is constituted and reconstituted in our schools, places of worship, on our sports fields and at the workplace”. (Department of Education, 1999)

It is recommended, both in South Africa and internationally, that schools and educators play a role in the development of values and their associated virtues (Gutmann, 1995; Inman and Buck, 1995; Killeavy, 1995; Schoeman, 2000; Green, 2004). Educators should be able to help develop in their learners the virtues and the competencies necessary for living in South Africa today and in the future as a citizen of a democracy. It is therefore important to investigate how educators understand their role in this respect and to know what educators and learners are really thinking.

In a recent research report on “Values, Education, and Democracy”, commissioned by the Department of Education (DOE 2001), the authors argue that articulation of values requires an environment where people are free to share ideas. Schoeman, (2000) points out, however, that a number of researchers describe a situation in which there is mistrust and fear; and where there appears to be little debate among educators across race lines and perceived cultural lines at some schools. The researchers further point to the need to understand the meaning of values across the many languages, belief systems and cultures that make up the nation and suggest that shared meaning will emerge from reflective experience and dialogue (Schoeman, 2000: 4).

Within the context of a democratic South Africa a new pedagogy is required to develop citizens who are independent, critical and reflective thinkers. The Department of Education in South Africa has implemented a new curriculum, which aims to contribute towards improving the quality of education for all learners. The new learning theory contributes to a pedagogy that helps educators to:
• Be effective facilitators and mediators of knowledge.
• Assess learners to help them improve.
• Be nurturing and supporting in the classroom.
• Work as a team with other educators.
• Guide learning.

(Department of Education, 1996)

Research conducted by the South African Democratic Teachers Union (SADTU, 1996) indicated that, with the introduction of the new curriculum, educators are desperate for support, especially in understanding and accepting the changes required of them and in implementing these changes in the classroom.

1.2.2 Personal Motivation

I have been an educator for 25 years. I taught formally in primary schools, but also have a qualification in Specialised Education and have therefore been involved with primary school learners who experience learning difficulties. I taught only in disadvantaged areas and have constantly been exploring ways of enabling learners to reach their full potential.

My work as a learning support educator in a primary school brings me into contact with other educators, who struggle daily to adapt to change – especially changes in the curriculum. I am interested in the moral development of learners and want to find out what other educators do to develop learners as citizens of a democracy. I am further interested in how other educators encourage moral and cognitive qualities like respect, responsibility, judgement; and whatever else they think is important. I want to learn more about how other educators work towards these goals.

1.3 MORAL DEVELOPMENT AND EDUCATION FOR DEMOCRATIC CITIZENSHIP

Many institutions and factors will play a role in, influence and shape the development of value systems. Most people agree that schools, colleges, learning centres and universities have an extremely important role to play in supporting the development of children’s value systems and in establishing qualities of character in children and young people. It is internationally recognised that schools have an important role to play in developing the virtues and positive qualities considered

Apple and Beane (1999) maintain that both curriculum and the organisation of the school need to reflect democratic values, but it is in the organisation that there will be more powerful results in producing social confidence in democratic values. Organisations will guide schools and students to live out these values. If children are to feel secure and confident in these values, it will not be a matter of simply devising programmes to teach them about the virtues concerned with individual autonomy, justice and free inquiry.

In addition children need to develop personal qualities or virtues. Education for democratic citizenship clearly overlaps with moral education and the promotion of moral development. Kohlberg and Piaget are particularly noted for the depth they imparted to research in this field and for constructing development models. Piaget’s development model is valuable for the study of moral thinking as it develops from childhood into adolescence and beyond. Piaget’s theory was expanded by Kohlberg (1976). Kohlberg (1976) studied a group of boys whose ages ranged from ten to sixteen years at the outset. This study continued for ten years. Kohlberg told his subjects stories in which moral dilemmas occurred and then asked them to respond to these stories telling him how they would deal with the dilemmas presented. Kohlberg was very interested in how his subjects reasoned to arrive at their answers. He concluded that moral development is closely linked to cognitive development, although other domains are also implicated, and that moral development could be divided into three levels, subdivided into six stages. According to Kohlberg (1978) the development of a person’s moral judgement and actions passes through a series of stages in unchanging sequence, but a person can be partly in one phase and partly in another at the same time, with the result that the person’s judgements will reflect the phases to and from which the person is passing.

1.4 PRACTICES AND RESEARCH

Recent debates suggest, however, that Kohlberg’s theory needs modification as claims that the stages of morality as conceived by him are universal are said to be
based on insufficient knowledge of other cultures and their moral values. However Kohlberg’s theory has had a powerful influence on practices of moral education, for example the use of moral dilemmas. In school programmes this might include questions like, for example, “How many times have you cheated on a test or major assignment in the past month/term? How many times have you defended a school mate against unfair gossip?” The recent emphasis on citizenship education includes the importance of developing values. Kohlberg’s approach assumes that learners can think for themselves and reason morally if sufficient peer interaction takes place. According to Fisher (1998) practices in schools to promote values have various labels, for example character education, civic education, values clarification and philosophical/ethical enquiry. These practices tend to draw on the work of Kohlberg. Kohlberg (1981) states that regardless of race or culture, people progress in their thinking about moral dilemmas through six stages of moral reasoning. In Kohlberg’s view the educator’s role is that of a facilitator. Vygotsky, however, suggests that education needs mediation through a more knowledgeable adult or peer. Morality defines what is intrinsically just and fair, because of its effect on the well-being of people. Convention on the other hand, defines what is correct based on social consensus (Oser, 1986). Although there has been criticism of Kohlberg’s theory, he did alert educators and others to the notion that the young are moral thinkers and that discussing moral dilemmas in classrooms under the guidance of a teacher, acting as questioner and facilitator, takes students merely beyond their own opinions and possibly enhances their moral reasoning abilities to a more mature level. Research in this area is limited, but it suggests that educators accept a moral role, but are not clear about practice (Green, 2004).

1.5 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research question was:

- *How and to what extent does this particular school attempt to develop democratic values and virtues?*

Important sub-questions were:

- *What values and virtues are considered important or desirable?*
- *How are they mediated?*
- *What concerns exist regarding the mediation of values?*
The research took the form of a case study. The bounded system (Merriam, 2001) was the staff and student community of one primary school in the Western Cape. Case studies attempt to gather information from a variety of sources and use varying methods of data collection (Merriam, 2001). A case study sometimes makes use of quantitative data but always includes a substantial qualitative element. A qualitative approach was considered appropriate because it involves the attainment of an understanding of a particular phenomenon (the case) and enables the researcher to adequately explore the setting or case in question. I have chosen a qualitative approach as my research method because this method of data collection is flexible and allowed me to be directly involved in the research process by observing and recording events in their natural setting (Cresswell, 1994; 1998). It allowed the participants to speak for themselves and maximised what could be learnt.

Case studies do not claim that the findings can be generalised. This study is descriptive of a unique setting and the school may find that it is a useful tool for discovering its own strengths and weaknesses and for exploring its approach to education for democratic citizenship. According to Stake (1995) people can learn much that is general from single cases; case studies become part of the experience of the reader and as such modify existing generalisations held by the reader. They also give the reader a sense of the setting ‘of being there’, and a sense of the place and the people.

This study collected interview data from educators, written data from learners and journal data obtained through personal observations by the researcher as participant observer. The data was thematically analysed according to patterns and themes following the guidelines suggested by various authors (Creswell, 1994, 1998; Merriam, 2001; Stake 1995). The case is presented in Chapter four as a portrait of the school, using the data to illuminate the research questions.

1.6 OVERVIEW OF THE STUDY

Chapter one explains the motivation and context for the study and provides a brief introduction to its content and structure. Some definitions of important key words are given.
In Chapter two various theoretical viewpoints are presented. It focuses on the relationship between moral and cognitive development and on forms of moral and citizenship education and then reviews research on educators’ perspectives.

In Chapter three the methodology is discussed. It provides the rationale for following a qualitative approach and describes the use of interviews, the case study method, observation and questionnaires and the analysis procedures employed. The chapter also discusses validity and ethical considerations.

In Chapter four the findings are reported and discussed. This chapter is organised, within the framework of the research questions, according to the themes identified in the staff interview transcripts, learner group transcripts, journal entries and learner questionnaires.

Chapter five discusses the case study findings, points out some limitations of the study, and makes some practical recommendations and some suggestions for further research.

1.7 DEFINITIONS

The following definitions from the Oxford English Dictionary (1994) have been adopted for the purpose of this study:

- **Character** The inherent complex of attributes that determine a person’s moral and ethical actions and reactions.
- **Citizenship** The status of a citizen with rights and duties.
- **Democracy** A political system in which the supreme power lies in a body of citizens who can elect people to represent them.
- **Education** The activities of educating or instructing or teaching.
- **Values** Beliefs of a person or social group in which they have an emotional investment (either for or against something).
- **Virtues** The quality of doing what is right and avoiding what is wrong.
CHAPTER TWO

THEORIES AND PRACTICES OF MORAL DEVELOPMENT

“... Moral education has been a troublesome concept for people to handle. The question of how individuals make the appropriate moral evaluation has been of concern since the time of Dewey...” Finchelescu and Dawes, 1998

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter includes a review of theories of moral and cognitive development as constructed within the discipline of psychology. It explores practices and trends in teaching values and citizenship and it reports on research regarding their effectiveness. Finally it discusses education for democratic citizenship in the South African context.

2.2 THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN MORAL AND COGNITIVE DEVELOPMENT

How we become moral human beings is one of the oldest philosophical questions. Throughout history; philosophers, priests and psychologists have wondered whether civilisations instil in each of their subjects a sense of right and wrong or whether they take away inborn tendencies to be good.

Chazan & Soltis (1974) note that, when a society finds its basic values questioned or even rejected by some groups, more often that not institutions of education are blamed for the failure to instil proper values in the young, and they respond with serious efforts to provide some effective form of moral education.

Garrod (1993) points out that, historically, the study of moral development has been based on the assumption that the whole of the moral domain is encompassed by the concept of justice, ideas of fairness, equality, reciprocity, the rights of individuals and the rules and roles that regulate and serve as guidelines to human behaviour. He adds that the equation of morality with justice has a long tradition within Western
philosophy that permeates psychological literature (Kohlberg, 1969; Damon, 1977; Rest, 1979). The justice orientation was first introduced into the moral development literature by Piaget (1965) and has been most extensively represented in Kohlberg’s theory and research. There is also a tradition of linking moral and cognitive development possibly because justice is seen as a form of reasonableness.

2.3 THE INFLUENCE OF PIAGET

Cognitive development for Piaget is a process by which the individual becomes able to reason logically about increasingly abstract content and this occurs in a fixed sequence of stages. According to Piaget, in all human beings there is a necessary developmental transformation from less sophisticated concrete forms of cognition to abstract forms of cognition (Moll and Slonimsky, 1989).

Piaget (1965) further maintains that children at around age six are capable of a new and different quality of thought, which is refined during the middle childhood years. He terms this kind of reasoning “concrete operational thought” and he claims it is a stage in a necessary sequence by which reasoning develops in all human beings. Once an individual has gained mastery of the concrete environment there is an emergence of abstract thought, which is logical and flexible and occurs at the adolescent stage. It emerges as a consequence of an individual’s adaptation to the concrete environment. Modgil and Modgil (1986), using the Piagetian framework, argue that the most important stage of human cognition is formal operational thought.

Piaget does not deny that knowledge is important, but his primary interest is in the development of reasoning as a means of constructing knowledge. Logical reasoning for Piaget is a form of adaptation to the environment. Piaget maintains that schemas develop through a process of assimilation and accommodation. Interaction with any new experience involves both assimilation and accommodation. Piaget concludes that this process is typical of all human beings and is driven by the innate human desire for equilibrium (Green, 2001; 2004 b).

With regard to moral development, Piaget studied the practice and consciousness of boys playing marbles. He questioned them about the rules of the game and about
rules in general (e.g. Where do rules come from? Could you invent a rule?) He then compared their responses with observations of what the boys actually did while playing the game. From this research Piaget generated a model of moral development from early through middle childhood focussed on the child’s changing understanding of rules. He characterised the concept of justice in early childhood as heteronymous morality, whereby the child believes that rules are immutable and externally imposed by powerful adult authorities and require unilateral respect.

Modgil and Modgil (1986) explain that Piaget used the term autonomous morality to characterise a different understanding of rules and justice that usually emerges around age eleven. By this age, children become aware that rules are a necessary condition for cooperating. Autonomous morality requires mutual respect and means anyone can create rules. Piaget argued that the inequality inherent in the adult/child relationship inevitably limits “mutual respect”, and the joint construction of rules in that relationship. He proposed that changes in children’s concept of justice result primarily from their interactions with peers rather than with adults.

The child and his peers are equals; their interactions open up possibilities for constructing rules, assuming roles and imposing sanctions for violations in ways not possible in adult/child relationships. An example of this is children forming clubs and devoting more energy to defining rules and roles than to fulfilling the club’s ostensible purpose.

2.4 KOHLBERG’S THEORY OF MORAL DEVELOPMENT

Kohlberg (1981) envisaged moral development as emerging parallel to the development of reason. He paid more attention to development from school age onwards. Like Piaget, Kohlberg equated the moral domain with the concept of justice. Kohlberg saw the relationship between self and society’s rules, roles and expectations as primary to moral development. He identified changes in people’s understanding of justice by studying their responses to hypothetical dilemmas, for example, the Heinz dilemma (Kohlberg, 1984). Kohlberg used his longitudinal study of males to generate a three level model of pre-conventional, conventional and post-conventional moral reasoning, with two stages in each level. Lickona (1976) describes the six stages of justice, the central issue in Kohlberg’s concept of
morality. He holds that a person’s view of justice permeates his approach to solving all moral conflicts and defining human rights and obligations. He agrees with Kohlberg that the concern for justice, like thinking about other moral issues, is given a new and wider definition at each higher stage. The stages are explained as follows:

- **Stage 1** The conception of justice is an equivalent of “an eye-for-an-eye and a tooth-for-a-tooth”.

- **Stage 2** The individual becomes conscious that he and others have different viewpoints and interests of which they are mutually aware, fairness takes on a positive dimension: “you help me, and I’ll help you, let’s make a deal”.

- **Stage 3** Justice becomes ideal reciprocity, being a nice guy, putting yourself in the other persons’ shoes regardless of what’s in it for you.

- **Stage 4** The relatively simple morality of interpersonal reciprocity is broadened; the person now thinks that getting along in a complex society and the just distribution of rights and duties requires a social system of roles, authority and law.

- **Stage 5** Comes the recognition that the social-legal order does not dispense rights to individuals but exists by social contract between the roles and rules of the subjects to protect the equal rights of all to settle conflict by democratic process.

- **Stage 6** Is what Kohlberg describes as a “second-order conception of Golden Rule role-taking”. This means that one wants to uphold a personal commitment to universal self-chosen moral principles (Kohlberg, 1973; 643 cited in Lickona, 1976)
Lickona (1976) further points out that Kohlberg states that from a psychological standpoint the higher stages are better because they are more equilibrated, more capable of handling diverse moral conflicts within their problem-solving framework. From a philosophical standpoint, Kohlberg maintains that each higher stage does a better job of measuring up to the long-standing criteria of reversibility, consistency and universality.

According to Spiecker and Straughan (1988) a number of studies of early childhood appear to confirm Kohlberg’s theory. These studies focussed on the child’s changing understanding of rules. This equation of morality with justice has a long tradition in Western philosophy and to a large extent informs the philosophical literature.

2.5 CRITIQUE OF KOHLBERG’S THEORY

According to Gouws & Kruger (1996: 178) Kohlberg’s theory is open to criticism although it contains useful insights, proposes interesting evaluation methods and has significant application potential. He notes the following criticisms:

- Kohlberg’s claim that the stages of morality as conceived by him are universal is based on insufficient knowledge of other cultures and their moral values.

- Kohlberg’s theory deals exclusively with moral reasoning, and the extent to which it applies to moral behaviour has yet to be determined.

- Kohlberg’s theory, as pointed out by Gilligan (1982), overemphasises justice and under emphasises care.

- Kohlberg fails to link morality to spiritual and religious values (Joy, 1983).

Vygotsky (1981) states that cognitive development needs active adult mediation not only through adaptive encounters with the physical world but also through
interactions between people in relation to that world. Children are introduced to a world, he states, that is not merely apprehended by the senses, but cultural, meaningful, significant and made so principally by language. If Vygotsky is correct, then classroom learning can best be seen as an interaction between the meanings of teachers and those of pupils; in which children might explore and extend their conceptions of reality through the learning environment.

According to Edwards (1991) Vygotsky suggested a theory of intellectual development which acknowledged that children undergo changes in their understanding by engaging in joint activity and conversation with other people. Vygotsky’s theory therefore suggests that there is a place for the role of the teacher. The teacher clarifies problems for the learners through skilled tuition, prompting and helping children to develop their understanding of the curriculum content. This is in line with Vygotsky’s concept of the zone of proximal development, defined as the distance between the actual developmental level as determined through problem solving and the level of potential development as determined through problem solving under the supervision of adults or in collaboration with more capable peers (Vygotsky, 1981). In practice, this would suggest a situation in which pupils’ knowledge is aided by the teacher’s questions, cues, and prompts to achieve insights that the pupils themselves seem incapable of. According to Vygotsky teachers may lead children onto new levels of cognitive and conceptual understanding by interacting and talking with them. For Vygotsky, human cognitive development is intrinsically social and mediational. This would imply that moral development requires active mediation.

2.6 THE ROLE OF SCHOOLS IN MORAL AND CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION

2.6.1 The importance of schools

According to Branson (1998: 1), democracy and the rule of law are not historically necessities, but a victory of moral sense that needs to be reinforced and renewed constantly in the minds of individuals. In as much as democracy requires good leaders and properly functioning organs of state, it also requires competent citizens who know their rights and appreciate the role they can play in promoting democracy
Schutz (2001), states that Dewey envisioned forms of democratic education that would empower educators and students to fundamentally change the economic and social nature of their society.

Kohlberg and Piaget had similar ideas of how they saw the moral mission of the school. According to Piaget (1932),

“The essence of democracy is to replace the unilateral respect of authority by the mutual respect of autonomous wills …”

Kohlberg and Piaget maintained that peer interaction is sufficient to stimulate moral development. Vygotsky suggests that this is not sufficient.

It is internationally recognised that the school has an important part to play (Gutmann, 1995). Many institutions and factors will influence and shape the development of value systems, but all agree that schools, colleges, learning centres and universities have an extremely important role to play in supporting the development of value systems. Steyn (1998), suggests that children should be educated in the home and the school so that they can develop the virtues of concern for individual autonomy, justice and free inquiry. By educating the children in democratic values, educators contribute towards building a democratic society in which a democratic ethos prevails. Consequently the school has a critical role to play in this respect. There is an overlap of moral education and citizenship education. The literature on citizenship education always includes a moral element. No-one is sure of the relationship between moral reasoning and moral behaviour, because simply discussing moral issues does not necessarily lead people to act in moral ways. But moral discourse is a way to think about important issues that individuals face in a society. Educators find themselves in a favourable position to address issues of morality and citizenship. Children, youth, adolescents and adults spend most of their educative years in educational institutions. Therefore school is the ideal place for transfer of the norms and ideals which society sees as fitting. Morality defines what is intrinsically just and fair because of its effect on the well-being of people. Convention on the other hand, defines what is correct based on social consensus (Oser, 1986).
2.6.2 School climate, curriculum and organization

Apple & Beyer (1998) state that school contributes to the value system each child is forming during childhood and adolescence. Parents are the primary source of values for children but school makes an important contribution. If the school is to make a positive contribution, it is important that educators are in agreement about the values they are promulgating. The moral climate of the school is of vital importance. The adults who set the example should be seen to behave in certain ways. Values need discussion and formulation as much as vision. This may not be easy, as there are different views from different people. Pring (1988) stresses the need for reflection on values and says that the capacity to engage in critical reflection upon generally accepted beliefs requires nurturing over a long period and will affect the way authority is exercised within the school. An important aspect of this work is the active mediation of children’s moral values. Moral education cannot simply be a matter of teaching what is right and wrong. Neither is morality a matter of obeying rules that are universally accepted. It is much more complicated than this. It is wrong to kill another person, except in wartime, when it may appear virtuous. It is also wrong to steal, but many quite moral people accept that a large company can do without a bit of stationery or a ballpoint pen.

Apple & Beane (1999) further point out that we firstly have to understand, just as democracy has had a multiple meaning in the larger society, so too has its interpretation with regard to schools been somewhat ambiguous. Secondly, democracy is a dynamic concept that requires continuous examination in the light of changing times. Democracy education is concerned with empowerment of all involved in the education process; therefore learner empowerment begins by providing the learners with an opportunity to communicate their thoughts and concerns thus allowing them to make their voices heard (Apple and Beane, 1999).

Apple and Beyer (1998) maintain that both the curriculum and the organisation of the school will reflect democratic values; but it is in the organisation that there will be the more powerful results in producing social confidence in democratic values. Organisation will guide schools and students to live out these values.
Donald, Lazarus and Lolwana (1997: 130) suggest that a systemic problem solving approach should be adopted in the classroom. Educators and learners should democratically decide upon a plan of action, and clear and honest communication should be the cornerstone of good classroom management. The relationship between the educator and learners should be “… marked by an interpersonal style with the stress being on mutual respect and partnership …” (Cooper, Smith and Upton. 1994: 177)

2.6.3 Nurturing specific values and virtues

Values are described by Hill (1991: 4) as, “beliefs held by individuals to which they attach special priority or worth, and by which they order their lives”. Values may be, but are not always, morally desirable. The literature frequently does not make a distinction between values and virtues, but when authors identify desirable values they are, by implication, suggesting associated virtues. Green (2004a) states that virtues are not independent of values. “They are the active manifestations of positive values, recognised in dispositions to behave in a particular manner.” Virtues are sometimes referred to as qualities of character. There is no final list of the attributes desirable in citizens of a democracy. Different authors suggest different forms of democracy and emphasise different virtues. Wilson (1972) maintains that in real life moral questions are not always posed in a straightforward way. Often people find themselves in situations where it is difficult to separate right from wrong. Nevertheless, most people recognise a kind of behaviour, which we label moral, and the qualities of persons fitting this behaviour pattern we call virtues.

Inman and Buck (1995) mention the following as core democratic values: respect for reasoning; respect for truth; fairness; acceptance of diversity; co-operation; justice; freedom; equality; concern for the welfare of others; and the peaceful resolution of conflict. Borba (2001) lists empathy; conscience; self-control; respect; kindness; tolerance and fairness as the seven critical / essential virtues. Green (2004) sums up the ideal citizen as one in whom the values appropriate in a democracy and their associated virtues have taken root, together with the cognitive virtues that enable reasoned judgement and considered action. It is widely
recognised that the nurturance of democratic values and virtues in children and young people should include attention to both cognitive and moral development. Education for democracy should emphasise the parallel importance of caring, critical and creative thinking. One important exponent of this approach is Lipman (1991). Related ideas are to be found in the work of Horton and Freire (1990) and in the literature on citizenship, character and moral education (Borba, 2001).

Lipman (1991) further believes that moral education for democracy requires the development of judgement, in other words, learners must have practice in thinking. This is echoed in McLaughlin (2000) and by Apple et al (1999). Schools play an important role in the lives of children. They spend a major part of their lives in it. The educators serve as role models and can actively mediate appropriate skills, values and attitudes to learners. Educators in their lessons can actively mediate by sharing ideas, brainstorming and active participation involving learners. Educators give instruction to children directly on a curriculum activity, explaining a task and watching / listening to children doing a task. Encouraging thinking is important for moral development.

2.7 PRACTICES OF MORAL AND CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION

2.7.1 Different forms of moral education

According to Fisher (1998), there are various ways in which moral and social values can be taught. Different approaches include:

- Indoctrination
- Religious authority
- Common sense approach
- Values clarification
- Philosophical/ethical enquiry
- Moral dilemmas

2.7.1.1 Indoctrination

18
Fisher (1998) states that some moral education is best taught as a form of moral training, that is through the thorough teaching of a set of moral rules. This involves children being told what they should know and what they should do. It prescribes a set of adult values to be accepted without choice or question. Fisher points out that, whether the indoctrination comes from a parent, a teacher or other source, such as a book, it remains a non-educative process. It may provide the necessary social boundaries and conditions for education to take place but is not in itself educative.

2.7.1.2 Religious authority

Many derive their moral and social values from religious authority, and from being members of a religious community. Discussion of religious values and beliefs in the classroom should help young people from whichever faith to gain personal and social skills in dealing with moral issues. It will also encourage young learners to develop a genuine respect for religions other than their own. It is assumed that by exploring the values held by various religious beliefs, learners will begin to understand how religious values can enrich their own lives and the lives of other people.

2.7.1.3 Common sense approach

For some people moral education is a matter of common sense. Personal morality is seen as a matter of deciding what is sensible in any situation, or of following social conventions such as school rules. The trouble is that this approach can become laissez-faire, with it being assumed that children know what concepts like 'right', 'wrong', 'fair', and 'truth' mean.

2.7.1.4 Values clarification

Values clarification involves learners talking about and sharing values in a neutral and non-judgmental setting, and reflecting on the implications of their values. One problem with this approach is what to do when values conflict. The approach can show that any value is defensible (it is possible to find arguments to support any moral viewpoint). But as Fisher says, if values are equally valid, just different, there
can be no certain or necessary basis for moral life. Clarifying moral values, by giving reasons and evidence in support of our beliefs, is important but is not a sufficient basis for moral education. Children need to understand that the concepts and criteria involved in making moral judgements are not a matter of anything goes but that one is accountable for actions and that there are consequences to be considered. It is for this reason that the development of moral principles is important.

2.7.1.5 Philosophical/ethical enquiry

There is an important link between moral development and intellectual development. This can be seen in the very different capacities that young people have for articulating a moral position and reflecting upon it. Some learners are able to justify a moral viewpoint in informed, coherent and reasonable ways. Others are less able to articulate what they think, in particular those whose attitudes are dependent on habits of deference and respect. Moral development is partly to do with the development of the capacity to reason. It follows that the best of moral education should be intellectually challenging and rigorous. It should be Socratic in the sense of questioning; demanding reasons and open to honest enquiry. If Vygotsky is correct about the need to learn to think, then it may also be true that children have to learn to be moral by means of the active mediation of adults. This is not the same as indoctrination, which is a set of rules or prescribed values to be accepted by children without choices or questions.

2.7.1.6 Moral dilemmas

What moral choices do people face? One way of stimulating moral discussion is through the use of dilemmas. Moral dilemmas such as those used by Kohlberg and Piaget can provide case studies through which moral principles can be discussed. It may be helpful with young children to discuss everyday or imaginary dilemmas that involve decision-making first. Picture books can provide a stimulus for this sort of discussion. Other possible introductions to dilemmas include posing questions which offer alternative choices.
Both Piaget and Kohlberg agreed that to become morally mature meant two kinds of growth; (i) vertical development to higher stages of moral reasoning and (ii) horizontal development, whereby one applies the highest stage of reasoning power to analyse moral situations and choosing a moral course of action. From this point of view, moral education is not indoctrination but rather the provision of conditions that could stimulate natural development. In this regard Kohlberg (1984) suggest the following six conditions, they believed to foster progress through moral stages:

- Being in a situation where seeing things from other points of view is encouraged.
- Engaging in logical thinking, such as reasoned argument and consideration of alternatives.
- Having the responsibility to make moral decisions and to influence one’s moral world by participating in group discussion.
- Exposure to moral controversy, conflict in moral reasoning that challenges one’s thinking and may lead to rethinking at the next stage up.
- Exposure to the reasoning of individuals who are one stage higher than one’s own — offering a new moral structure for resolving disequilibria caused by moral conflict.
- Participating in a just social environment where day-to-day human relations are characterised by concern for mutual respect and fairness. According to Kohlberg, (1984) when peers help each other they enjoy themselves because they are on the same level, and it is therefore possible to conclude that there were conditions conducive for effective learning to take place, and learners are then more open to new learning concepts.
2.8 CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION

According to Schoeman (2000), training in schools for citizenship has a long history in western society. In South Africa Citizenship Education was taught indirectly through History and subjects such as, Youth Preparedness; Inkatha Studies; Right Living; and Environmental Studies. Learners learnt about the nature and structure of government, the electoral process, yet an unquestioning acceptance of the status quo was promoted. Citizenship Education was, therefore depicted by many as a vehicle for the propagation of the political views of the ruling National Party and, consequently for indoctrination purposes.

2.8.1 Different models of citizenship education

Policy makers, public bodies, professional organisations and educators might agree on the need for citizenship education and each has a view, explicit or implicit of what it is or what it should be to be a citizen in a democracy.

Schoeman (2000), states that throughout history there have been conflicting definitions of critical strands of citizenship, such as who belongs, what they belong to and what it means to belong. However, within all these debates one can detect commonalities around a limited number of essential areas of citizenship (Inman and Buck, 1995: 39).

Hall and Held (1989), according to Schoeman have described essential areas such as membership; rights and duties and participation in practice. McLaughlin (2000) also describes a minimalist and maximalist view of citizenship. These different models of citizenship underpin the different models of Citizenship Education, which also fall into minimalist and maximalist models.

- **Minimalist model of education:**
  Is largely concerned with the provision of information about society, and with the socialisation of young people into a given society. Inman and Buck (1995: 50) maintain that such a model stresses duties and responsibilities and has very little concern for developing learners’ critical powers.

- **Maximalist models of citizenship education:**
Are concerned with empowerment. It is about learners’ ability to take control and exercise responsibility over their own lives. It involves learners’ ability to ask critical questions and evaluate evidence. It aims to develop self-awareness, knowledge and understanding on a wider societal and global level. Inman and Buck (1995) state that this concept of citizenship education is concerned with content and with learning processes.

According to Schoeman (2000) nearly all scholars on the subject of Citizenship Education (Newman, 1989; Inman and Buck, 1995; Branson, 1998) have identified three essential components of successful citizenship education, namely: civic knowledge; civic skills and civic dispositions.

Civic Skills

Civic skills are intellectual and participatory. Citizens need these skills to make informed judgements about the nature of civic life and the purposes of government. Intellectual skills in civics and government are inseparable from knowledge. Citizens should be able to think critically about political issues. The intellectual skills essential for informed and effective citizenship education are often called critical thinking skills. Citizenship education sensitises one to identify, explain and analyse public issues. In addition to interact is to be responsive to ones’ fellow citizens, to question, to answer, as well as to build coalitions and to manage conflict in a fair and peaceful manner. The participatory skill of influencing, refers to the capacity to affect the process of politics and governance in the community. Participating skills like voting are an important means of exercising influence, but voting is not the only means. According to Newman (1989) and Branson (1998), citizens also need to learn to use means such as petitioning, speaking, testifying before public bodies, joining ad hoc advocacy groups and forming coalitions.

Civic Dispositions

Civic dispositions refer to the traits of private and public character essential to the maintenance and improvement of constitutional democracy. Civic dispositions develop slowly over time as a result of what one learns and experiences at home, school, community and cross-cultural or societal organisations. These experiences
should engender understanding that democracy requires the responsible self-governance of each individual. Civic dispositions should promote political efficacy of the individual; the healthy functioning of the political system; the development of a sense of dignity and worth and the common good. Traits such as moral responsibility, self discipline and respect for the worth of human dignity of every citizen are imperative and indispensable to democracy. This aspect of citizenship education clearly overlaps with moral education.

2.9 RESEARCH FINDINGS RELATED TO MORAL AND CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS

With regard to moral and citizenship education, books and articles published in the last 20 years in England, North America and Australia have been primarily about practices at secondary schools (Thomas, Rest, & Barnett 1986, Garrod 1996). All of them draw upon interviews with teachers or notes of staff-room talks or classroom observations. These findings have implications for the engagement of educators in moral and citizenship education. Any values-education initiative in schools will have to take into account the personal positions of educators themselves.

International research cited in Green (2004 a) suggests that educators tend to accept that the school is a moral environment and that part of their role is to provide moral education.

Educators in Slovenia (Razdevzek-Pucko and Polak, 1995) supported principles of honesty, justice, peace, human rights and tolerance. A similar study conducted by Stephenson (1995) with educators in England, found support for curriculum principles of moral values, tolerance, respect and caring. Wood and Roach (1999) found that the five character education values that educators believe are the most important are: responsibility, honesty, good citizenship, respect and co-operation. In a study conducted by Bulach (2002) parents and teachers highlighted the importance of respect and honesty.

According to Ling, Burman and Cooper (1995) educators in Australian prioritised tolerance, respect for self and others, equality and social survival skills. Killeavy’s (1995) study of educators in Ireland listed curriculum principles such as democratic
values, honesty, truth, equity, care, respect, religious values and children’s needs. Educators in Israel (Zuzovsky, Yakir and Gottlieb, 1995) favoured leftwing and liberal curriculum principles and considered values education important, linking it to problem solving.

With regard to educators in South Africa, the Manifesto on Values, Education and Democracy (DOE, 2000) mentions research findings indicating educators believe that the government overemphasises human rights, and that this leads to classroom problems.

Research by Green (2004 a) indicates that educators are aware of a responsibility to nurture morality but suggests a number of concerns related to their capacity and to their understanding of their role. The research revealed that educators considered the moral and cognitive dispositions that the literature recommends to be important qualities to be nurtured. Educators did not however, prioritise cognitive dispositions and did not give much time to nurturing any of the dispositions that they claimed were important. Gender, professional experience and phase of education were each found to influence priorities.

Research evidence suggests that educators want to encourage a host of democratic values central to moral lives in as democracy; such as acceptance of diversity, cooperation, respect for reasoning and truth, concern for the welfare of others, equality, justice and freedom (James, 2001; Green, 2004 a). If Vygotsky (1979, 1981) is correct about the importance of mediation then it stands to reason that the nurturance of moral development in schools depends, inter alia, upon educators’ personal values and understanding of their professional practices. However, there has been little research regarding the content and process of moral education in South Africa. What is clear from the research that is available, both national and international, is that there are many complex processes involved and no one approach will suit all contexts.
2.10 SUMMARY

This chapter has reviewed various theoretical perspectives. It focused on the relationship between moral and cognitive development and on various forms of moral education. It also argued that moral and citizenship education in schools is important. Research findings suggest that this is a complex issue and further research is required.
CHAPTER THREE

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1 INTRODUCTION

The present study is a case study that tries to explore the understanding and mediation of the virtues associated with citizenship of a democracy at a primary school in the Western Cape. Given the exploratory nature of this study, qualitative methodology was considered the most suitable method to be used. This chapter looks at the use of qualitative methodology in relation to this study and in particular the strengths of qualitative research. It then describes the aims of the study, participants in the study, procedures of data collection, method of analysis and ethical precautions.

3.2 QUALITATIVE METHODOLOGY

Qualitative research designs have become increasingly important modes of inquiry for the social sciences. Qualitative methods permit the researcher to study selected issues in depth and detail Mouton and Marais (1988); Patton (1990). Most researchers, for example Banister, Parker, Taylor and Tindall (1994); Denzin and Lincoln (1994); Cresswell (1998), agree that one undertakes qualitative research in a natural setting where the researcher is the instrument of data collection, who gathers words or pictures, analyses them inductively, focuses on the meanings of participants and describes a process in expressive and persuasive language. Tuckman (1994: 46) defines qualitative research as “detailed study, thick description, enquiry in depth, direct quotation capturing people’s personal perspectives and experiences”.

The qualitative researcher talks to people about their experiences and perceptions. Furthermore qualitative research is defined by the above authors as a complex holistic picture that takes the reader into the multiple dimensions of a problem or issue and displays it in all of its complexity. This is what I tried to achieve in this particular school. As Hitchcock and Hughes (1996) remark, I learned first hand
about the social world I was investigating by means of involvement and participation in that world through a focus on what individual actors say and do.

Banister et al (1994) describe qualitative research as an exploration to uncover what is behind the directly observable:

(a) an attempt to capture the sense that lies within and that structures what we say about what we do;

(b) an exploration, elaboration and systematisation of the significance of identified phenomena;

(c) the illuminative representation of the meaning of a delimited issue or problem.

According to Denzin and Lincoln (1994) qualitative researchers stress the socially constructed nature of reality, the intimate relationship between the researcher and what is studied, and the situational constructs that shape inquiry such researchers emphasize the value-laden nature of inquiry. They seek answers to questions that stress how social experience is created and given meaning. As a qualitative researcher, I needed to be closely involved with educators and learners in the school.

Research involves collaboration with the participants whose native perceptions and meanings are valued in a consultative, co-constructing process. Qualitative research therefore embarks on the researcher’s self-reflective awareness of his or her constructions which demands a high degree of reflexivity on the part of the researcher. This meant that I had to reflect on my own values and biases.

Reflexivity according to Banister et al (1994) is an attempt to make explicit the process by which material and analysis are produced, thus acknowledging the role of the researcher in the construction on knowledge and that all the findings in the research process are constructions which may change in the future.
3.3 THE CASE STUDY APPROACH

Merriam (2001) agrees that qualitative research is an umbrella concept, covering several forms of inquiry that help us understand and explain the meaning of social phenomena with as little disruption of the natural setting as possible. Case study research, she states, is one form of qualitative research.

In a case study the emphasis is on a specific case, a study of an instance in action (Denscombe, 1998). The single instance is of a bounded system, for example a child, a class, a school, a community. In this case the bounded system was a school.

Case studies portray what it is like to be in a particular situation. Hence it is important for events and situations to be allowed to speak for themselves rather than to be largely interpreted, evaluated or judged by the researcher.

Case studies have several strengths and weaknesses but it is observed that case studies frequently follow the interpretive tradition of research – seeing the situation through the eyes of the participants rather than the quantitative paradigm.

There are also general criticisms of case study research. Firstly, it tends to use vague analytical procedures. Analysis might tend to be superficial and perhaps biased. Secondly it usually has to contend with a myriad of variables and often is faced with a large quantity of data that is difficult to analyse. (Patton, 1990; Yin, 1993). I experienced the problem of too much data and was forced to make choices, but I used the research questions to guide me. I tried to be systematic in my analysis and followed standard procedures. How I attempted to address the criticisms is to be found in section 3.4.2.

3.4 VALIDITY

3.4.1 Validity in qualitative research
Qualitative research has come under criticism for being subjective and unscientific, or only exploratory (Denzin and Lincoln, 1994). The issues of validity and reliability have been in question. Traditionally, validity refers to the extent to which findings can be considered true and reliable. It is described as the extent to which research findings can be replicated. In qualitative research, the definition of reliability as replication is problematic.

Qualitative researchers generally agree that a study cannot be repeated even by the same investigator, given the unique, highly changeable and personal nature of the research process Banister (1994).

According to Patton (1990) the validity and reliability of qualitative research data depend on the methodological skill, sensitivity and integrity of the researcher. The human being is an instrument of data gathering. Qualitative research requires that the researcher carefully reflects on, deals with and reports bias or error.

3.4.2 Validity in this study

In this study the question of validity was addressed using various methods of data collection namely interviews, questionnaires, informal conversations with educators and support staff and personal observations recorded in field notes. The study also accessed different sources of information. This process is often referred to as triangulation. An acknowledgement of my own role and possible bias was also important. Berg (1998) suggests transparency of the process and linking theoretical assumptions to other findings or similar works. The latter is undertaken in the final chapter.

3.4.3 Myself as researcher

I contacted the principal of the school and asked permission to conduct this research at this particular school. Unlike another principal, he was very kind and sympathetic to me. He welcomed and allowed me as much time and opportunity to decide with the educators what was important in order to obtain as rich data as possible. There was more than one contact session to establish rapport with the participants before focussing on research interests. This took various forms. I first adopted the role of
observer and was introduced to members of the staff with whom I was to conduct the interviews. Collection of data occurred during the second school term, during June 2003. This entailed interviews with the principal, various educators, support staff and learners at the school. The interviewees were interviewed individually in the privacy of an office, at a time negotiated.

During the Apartheid era in South Africa, a coloured female had limited career choices. If the family income allowed it and she went to high school, she would receive a bursary to further her studies. Then she would become either a nurse or a teacher or maybe a clerk. Otherwise a girl left school to work in a factory or became a domestic worker (servant girl).

One’s career training would start after having passed standard eight, the then Junior Certificate school leaving examination and be trained as a nurse or teacher. The trained nurse or teacher would then occupy the lowest ranks in the profession. Of the two career choices I preferred to teach. So I became a primary school teacher, placed in the lowest category in the hierarchy of teaching.

I started teaching in Cape Town at a primary school for the Department of Education, House of Representatives. This school was a church-funded state school. It was previously a mission school under the auspices of the church (Moravian) where I worshipped. Soon I learned that a teacher’s work did not belong to the classroom only, but involved numerous other forms of teaching after school. It was here that the opportunity to develop moral character took place. I taught in the Sunday School, sang in the church choir, was a lieutenant in the Girls Brigade, and was the youth leader in my congregation. In these church based organisations I could live out and adhere to the tenets of my Christian faith.

To help me understand teaching I began to separate school knowledge from teaching moral education to build character through the numerous social and religious organisations in the community. In the community we all need knowledge to understand the world in which we live. Therefore I am very interested in and embarked upon this topic “teaching for democratic citizenship”.

31
For as long as I can remember, the passion for learning has been the driving force in my life. Many experiences contributed to uncertainties about life in South Africa, during and after the Apartheid era.

I experienced varied situations that contributed to my life. There were also many personal obstacles that sometimes barbed my need to learn. However, no power has succeeded in suppressing this deep rooted urged to learn. During the past thirty years, as a “coloured” teacher in South Africa, this passion changed from a desire to learn for personal growth, to an urge to learn in order to become a more effective teacher and to motivate children, youth and adults, thereby showing them learning is rewarding. In the process I often asked myself and thought, did I have to teach them all the knowledge? Or was I to teach them what they wanted to know, or what I thought we should know to become morally good people. My own morals are deeply rooted as they were instilled in me and taught over the years. My life centres around them. What is my duty as an educator?

3.5 AIMS OF THE STUDY

The aim of the study was to explore the understanding and mediation of the virtues associated with citizenship of a democracy at a primary school in the Western Cape. From this aim, the following central questions guided the study:

- How do staff members understand their role with regard to instilling values?
- Which values and virtues do they prioritise?
- How do educators nurture and develop values and virtues in learners?

3.6 CONTEXT AND PARTICIPANTS

3.6.1 The school

The school is a well-maintained solid building in the Northern Suburbs of Cape Town. It is situated in a historically disadvantaged and predominantly working class and lower middle class community with a strong Christian ethos.
The school is well equipped and has sporting facilities at the back of the building facing a busy highway. The children attending the school do not all live in the immediate neighbourhood but come from as far as Mitchell’s Plain and Eerste River. The children are transported to school by their parents and private minibus or taxis. Hence the buzzing of activity before the start and close of the school day. An attitude of caring is portrayed in the members of the scholar-patrol who guide the pedestrians safely across the busy road towards the school gate.

The classes are from Grade R through Grade 7. There is also a learning support class for those learners who might need extra tuition. The language of instruction is both English and Afrikaans with Xhosa as an extra subject for those interested. The school welcomes children from the Rastafarian settlement into their school without prejudice or discrimination. One of the teachers on their staff is also affiliated to this minority group. For the staff there is a spacious staffroom where they meet for meetings and gather during intervals. The school also offers a myriad of extra-mural subjects for learners namely: Karate, Ballet, Folk dancing, Computer classes and music instruction. The school orchestra is the pride and joy of school and the educators and parents work hard to obtain sponsorship for tours.

The fascinating entrance hall with the sound of water bubbling and cascading from the indoor fountain gives an image of tranquillity, yet buzzing with activity. The walls are decorated with pictures and photographs of educators and learners participating in various fund-raising activities as well as sporting activities. The impression is that of a staff that are prepared to go the extra mile for the school and their learners.

3.6.2 Participants

The participants consisted of six female and two male members of staff. They were all in a permanent position and had been teaching at the school for more than ten years. Participants were volunteers emerging from a democratic discussion amongst the staff members. Five were from the foundation phase, one was a learning support educator, one was from the intermediate and one from the senior phase. Non-academic staff interviewed totalled five persons.
The learners involved were the grade 7 English medium class, 35 in total. These learners completed a questionnaire. The class was selected on the basis of availability and because of their senior learner status; it was felt that they were mature enough to answer questions regarding citizenship education.

3.6.3 Data collection procedures

Permission was obtained from the Western Cape Education Department (WCED) and the school principal to conduct this research. The condition on which access was granted was that the school remained anonymous. The collection of data occurred during the second term.

The data for the study consisted of tape recorded in-depth interviews, written responses to a questionnaire, my journal and field notes and materials collected during the activity based lessons for the grade 7 learners on citizenship education. Four forms of data collection were thus employed namely individual interviews, questionnaires, written tasks and personal notes in the form of field observation notes in a journal.

3.6.3.1 The interview

According to Hitchcock and Hughes (1996) and Denscombe, (1998) an interview is defined simply as a conversation with a purpose. “It is a conversation between the interviewer and the respondent with the purpose of eliciting certain information from the respondent” Bell (1989).

As a research technique, an interview enables the researcher to probe and gather information in some depth. The researcher can also ask further questions that will enable him or her to extract the information he or she needs. In addition, the interviewer can explore the point further by asking the respondent to clarify an answer if the reply fails to make sense or to match evidence collected. The interview further allows face to face interaction with the subjects and makes it possible to probe and expand on the respondent’s responses and get a sense of and understand the issues that were investigated. According to Denscombe (1998) the interview has many advantages, for instance, that the researcher is likely to gain
valuable insights from the key informants. It is most suited to small research endeavours as a method for data collection, furthermore interviews are the most flexible tool as they allow for a developing line of inquiry. Two group interviews were conducted with foundation phase and intermediate phase educators. The foundation phase educators consisted of six staff members. The intermediate phase educators were interviewed individually.

In this case the interviews were tape recorded and transcribed verbatim. They were conducted in English but the participants were allowed to respond in the language of their choice, either in English or Afrikaans. In some instances the participants felt hesitant to disclose their views or to participate in discussion. It was in such instances that I felt compelled to explain and share my experiences as a teacher with them. This resulted in a more open attitude and active participation in further discussions. The participants became more spontaneous as time went by and they became accustomed to my presence at their school. This method is also very flexible and has possibilities of depth. By questioning the researcher is able to clear up misunderstandings and it encouraged rapport with the participants.

3.6.3.2 Questionnaires

I devised a simple questionnaire which consisted of ten open ended questions. The questionnaire was completed by the grade 7 learners. The use of a questionnaire in relation to data collection is recommended in the literature by Mouton and Marais (1988); Denzin & Lincoln (2000); Merriam (2001). I gained valuable insights regarding attitudes and perceptions towards citizenship education. However the questionnaire has its strengths and weaknesses and no matter how thoroughly a questionnaire might be compiled it is not always able to provide a complete picture of the respondent’s views on a subject Banister et al (1998). Details of the questionnaire are presented in Appendix 4.

3.6.3.3 Tasks

I used activity-based lessons on the theme of democracy and citizenship since our new curriculum makes provision for educators to implement many of their own programmes as long as they produce the necessary outcomes. According to my
understanding, one can only produce the necessary and effective outcome if one has a clear understanding of what is required. I divided the class into groups and learners had a choice. A variety of methods were thus used to achieve a positive learning environment as it is seen as an essential part to educator and learner motivation. Educators are expected to use a variety of methods of instruction to help each learner to learn. Whole class and group-work were therefore methods of instruction. The lessons related to citizenship issues were given as background to the topic under investigation and to build a working relationship with the learners and class teachers. This also served to sensitize the learners to their analysis situation. After this activity each individual learner completed a simple questionnaire (Appendix 6). These tasks may however have influenced the answers that learners gave when they answered the questionnaire.

3.6.3.4 Journal

According to Cohen et al (2000: 305), observational data are attractive as they afford the researcher the opportunity to gather “live” data from “live situations”. It is also noted that in observation study the researcher is able to notice ongoing behaviour as it occurs and is able to make appropriate note about is main themes. Denscombe (1998) states that observation offers the social researcher a distinct way of collecting data. It does not rely on what people say they do or think. I kept a journal on each day I spent at the school in which I recorded events as they happened. Putting the events into sentences and paragraphs rather than in point form helped me sequence what happened during each visit and unravel meaning. The journal is an account, a narrative, but it is also a commentary on my visit to the school as well as the interviews I held with the educators and support staff connected with the research. It is an intermeshing of both actual and reflective experience.

3.7 ANALYSIS OF DATA

The data collected were thematically analysed. This interpretive process involves careful listening to the audio-tapes searching through the transcripts and synthesising information into patterns, themes and trends Merriam (2001). Data has to be constantly compared to assure that the data analysis is consistent. By
employing qualitative analysis an attempt is made to capture the richness of the themes emerging from the interviews as recommended by Denzin and Lincoln (2000).

Data gathered from questionnaires have been analysed qualitatively. When analysing data from individual questionnaires the responses that appeared to be the same were grouped together using the above process of constant comparison. The data collected were also thematically analysed into categories. This is an interpretive process that involves searching through the questionnaires and synthesizing information into patterns, themes, and trends. By employing qualitative analysis an attempt is made to capture the richness of the themes emerging from the questionnaire as recommended by Denzin and Lincoln (2000). In the qualitative approach, the raw data were divided into groups according to the themes identified, the themes were then grouped into broader concepts.

3.8 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Researchers using qualitative research methods are collecting data through human interaction. According to Smith (1994) it is important that the agreement must be based on full consent and open information. The principle of informed consent requires that the researcher provide the participants with sufficient and informed decisions regarding participation.

I made sure that the participants were fully aware of the purpose of the research project. For confidentiality, the participants and the school are not referred to in any way, which may identify them. The research findings have been shared with the participants as recommended by Patton (1990).

3.9 SUMMARY

This chapter has outlined the rationale for the research, described the participants, process of data collection and analysis. Chapter 4 will present and discuss the research findings. Chapter 5 will focus on discussion, limitations and recommendations.
CHAPTER FOUR

RESEARCH FINDINGS

…I would be a responsible citizen to my country if I do things for my country like trying to inform people about things going on in the country. I must also be kind and loving, caring, sharing, responsible and very friendly to my neighbours, people that I meet and people I see in the shopping mall. I must be sharing with my family, friends and street children. I must also help my teacher when she needs help and help her when she asks me to do something or help her if she is carrying her bags or her books. I must also be generous to the people that I know. I must not do things that are against the law. I must be obedient to my teacher. I must also think about others and be loyal to others. I must be proud of myself and must have pride in what I do. I must be fair to others ... Learner Story 9

4.1 INTRODUCTION

As previously stated the aim of the study was to explore the understanding and mediation of the virtues associated with citizenship of a democracy at one particular primary school and a case study methodology was adopted. According to Merriam (2001), a case study needs to report on or give a description of the context of the study. This chapter begins with an experiential account of Civitas Primary School. Thereafter the data have been analysed into themes under the headings of the three research sub-questions. Where applicable, data from the different sources have been integrated, but differences have also been identified. Quotations have been selected to illustrate each theme and give a sense of what is happening at this particular school. I tried for an average of three quotations, but found that sometimes I needed more quotations to illustrate my point.

4.2 CIVITAS PRIMARY SCHOOL

My first impression of Civitas Primary was of a well-maintained school. The orange and blue building looked newly painted and not a single windowpane was broken.
Amid well-kept gardens, a play-park for the pre-primary schoolchildren was shielded by a wall decorated with brightly painted nursery rhyme characters on the right and a row of adjoining residential dwellings on the left. I found my way to the main entrance. I pressed the button and the doors opened although I did not see anyone. As I entered through the double doors of the school, I heard the bubbling sound of water cascading from the indoor fountain. As my eyes moved from the bubbling image, I saw a man talking earnestly to two boys. He tilted his head listening to them, moving his eyes from one to the other. Becoming aware of my presence; he looked up, nodded his head, and acknowledged my presence.

I noticed a photograph on the wall, taken at the induction ceremony of the head boy and head girl of the school. I recognised the man, who was speaking to the boys, as the principal of the school, from this photograph. At that moment, another caption caught my eye. It read, “LOOK, THINK AND LEARN”. I perused the remaining pictures and photographs on the walls of the foyer. They were a pictorial history of the school, showing educators and learners at various fundraising and sports events.

As I stood in the foyer, the general sense of order and the inviting atmosphere left a lasting impression. The floors were freshly polished; and the smell of brewing coffee titillated my senses.

A woman dressed in pink scuttled down the passage and disappeared into a room leading off the foyer. I heard her motherly talking to a learner. She was saying, “… come at break my love …” This gave me the impression that the staff (including the support staff) genuinely cared for the children they dealt with on a daily basis.

The principal, having just finished his discussion with the boys, turned to me and invited me to his office. He asked me to once again to explain what exactly I hoped to discover at his school. I explained the purpose of my visit as follows –

“... for the purpose of the study I am conducting, I am visiting your school to see democracy education in action. I hope to see how children at your school are not only educated to meet syllabus requirements, but how they are prepared for life. In other words, how through the education process your learners are prepared for living in a democracy as new as ours is. I hope to discover through
my interaction with your educator team and learners, what methods are employed to develop the values system of the learners and also see how these lessons are employed in the daily education cycle of your school ...”

4.3 EDUCATORS’ UNDERSTANDING OF THEIR ROLE

The source of the data was the interview transcripts. Some educators, however, found it difficult to explain their role and had difficulty in expressing themselves. It may be that they took their role for granted, or thought that, as the researcher is a teacher, it was a ‘given’ and that they need not expand on their role. Four themes were identified, namely:

- Educator as conscientizer
- Educator as role model
- Educator as collaborator with parents
- Role related concerns

The following quotations illustrate each of the above-mentioned themes:

(For the purpose of anonymity and convenience, I shall refer to the staff as E1, E2, E3 and SS1, SS2, SS3, etc.)

4.3.1 Educator as conscientizer

E1 ... *I think definitely when we go through our work, we'll talk about democracy, and any events that happen world wide that also has an influence not only on our country’s, but how our children perceive why certain things happen and when we had a change in government ...*

E2 ... *We can teach them about what their parents went through, what they fought for, why some of our leaders went to prison ...*

E3 ... *How it came that we have a democracy in our country and there was a battle fought, fought with some of our parents’ blood, people were tortured and died ...*
It seems that educators wanted to make learners aware of the history of the “old” South Africa, because they felt that it was important for learners to know about the past and perhaps because the old political system impacted greatly on them and the formation of their values. It could possibly be that educators from their own experience of the past know that children are now more aware of their rights and their freedom of speech to say what they think. Whereas in the past children were not allowed to speak their minds. It would have been considered as impolite or disrespectful towards elders. It seems that an awareness of the people’s roots and struggles in the past as well as opportunities that exist presently therefore activate in the educators greater sensitivity towards humanity and the society in which they live.

4.3.2 Educator as role model

E4  ... *We as educators I feel are here to instruct children. OK, you can be a role model ...*

E5  ... *We always speak about role models, who must be our role models, I feel ... like our priest, our politicians, our educators ... because they must all be role models*

E6  ... *because nowadays you get gangsters in our communities, they are being our children’s role models...*

Educators did not expand on exactly how they understood their role as the role model of the children in the school. They mainly perceived role models as external influences and it appeared as if they thought their own role as educators was to teach. It seems educators felt that children are exposed to so many outside factors like the media that because children want to be “in” with their peers they feel that the influence they have only operates in the school and not consistently in the community. People’s perceptions of educators have changed so that many children do not aspire to be like their educators. It could possibly be that educators feel that the value of their own roles as professionals has been undermined. I think many educators still have the confidence to be role models. They are still proud of their profession, but they definitely feel vulnerable.
4.3.3 Educator as collaborator with parents

E5 ... *Parents must be part of the learners’ education ... training here ... if we can maybe work on that ... I mean it would make this school even better than what it was ...*

E6 ... *We will have better learners if we have better interaction with parents ...*

E7 ... *We have some parents working well with the teachers and the school raising funds, but then you get some parents who just don’t care ...*

Educators saw their role as co-constructors of knowledge in conjunction with parents and acknowledged in this way that they needed the input of parents to work towards progress and success in an organisation like the school. Their responses also reflected the importance of parents as fundraisers. Schools are sometimes run on a shoestring budget and the SA Schools Act (RSA, 1996) assigned a new role to parents. Cooperation and collaboration with the school has the potential to be a powerful tool to bridge the gap between rich and poor within a school and develop a caring attitude and sensitivity towards each other. Educators also welcomed better parental involvement so that they can give input in the teaching and learning at school. Involvement of parents strengthens community development which helps people to understand and benefit children so that they grow up in a more supportive environment.

4.3.4 Role Related Concerns

E1 ... *I think we are doing too much and the parents are so used to it ...*

E2 ... *You don’t get support from parents, parents won’t come and watch their children participate in sports ... where if the mother is at home ... where she’ll at least watch the child and give her support in that way ...*
E3 ... parents do not show an interest in their children ... not only in extra mural activities but also where the child’s school work is concerned ...

E4 ... peer pressure is very alive here ... and the children lacking in their school work, don’t do homework, assignments and stuff like that ... because parents cannot help them ... they don’t have the resources ... will drop out of school ...

E5 ... the school is not in a predominant crime area but it’s got quite a lot of problems that influx into the area and affects the school ... there’s a lot of drugs in the area, alcohol abuse, sexual abuse ... I was speaking to some parent in the community and they say there was no concern ...

From what the educators say it appears that sometimes they are doing too much and the parents do not complement their “input”, meaning that parents could show more interest in what educators and learners do at school. It seems that the educators at this school care a great deal for their learners as they showed concern, and worried about the bad influences that might infiltrate from outside into the school. It seems as if parents are ignorant of the negative influences or that they might be in denial. Therefore the educators show their concern about breakdown in the community and how that might affect the school. The educators feel that the parents need to share the responsibility for moral development and values. Educators could discuss ways to improve relationships and change attitudes of parents towards a culture and ethos of caring to ensure that the services the school provides collectively and comprehensively meet the needs of the learners, their families and educators.

4.4 PRIORITIES AT THE SCHOOL IN TERMS OF VALUES AND VIRTUES

The values prioritised at this school, as expressed by educators (E), support staff (SS) and learners (L) were:
• Love, care and care of the environment
• Trust and loyalty
• Responsibility
• Respect
• Justice, fairness and human rights
• Decision making and choices

A fifth theme namely *Justice* was identified in the learner questionnaire and learner citizenship stories only.

As explained in Chapter Three educators were more inclined to give their opinions informally. This information was captured in my journal but not recorded on audiotape. One educator commented that learners were much more open than she expected.

The following quotations illustrate each of the above-mentioned themes.

4.4.1 Love, care and care of the environment

E3 ... *it is actually a good thing and that will actually uplift him* again and then he feels loved, *like all the other children in the class* ...

E4 ... *I can vouch that we try our best for our children ... we've got children from Model C schools that the parents took out there and put them here* ...

E5 ... *because the school assists wherever they can, like they have excess fund raising* ...

The staff showed their love for the learners through a caring attitude. It is also portrayed in the confidence parents have in the school. It seems that the staff believed in a transforming and democratic school environment, at least in the Life
Orientation (LO) classes. It is evident that their school culture sustained feelings such as compassion, commitment and understanding. This notion of love and care extended to the wish for a partnership between the parents and school that will encourage the development of a holistic approach in education. For the purpose of anonymity, I shall refer to the support staff as SS1, SS2, SS3, etc. The following quotations reflect the views of the support staff to the above-mentioned themes:

SS 1 ... Die kleintjies kom kla, dan wys hulle vir my wie hulle goed gevat het. As ek nader kom dan gee hulle, dis miskien die grotes, die goed vir die kind terug wat hulle gevat het ...

SS 2 ... Ons ... ’n sekere tyd moet die hekke gesluit word ... maat almal kom nie dieselfde tyd ... jy gee die een eerste kans om in te kom, dan skree die ander weer ook vir jou ’wag ... wag ek kô ... daarom sal ek sê dis belangrik dat jy moet stiptelik wees...

SS 3 ... Ek gee mos die brood uit ... hulle kom dan gee ek vir hulle as hulle honger is ... die kind moet maar ’n broodjie huistoe vat ... soms is die ouers werkloos, sien ... en die kind kan mos nie help nie ...

SS 4 ... Die kinders het agter gespeel ... toe kap hy sy kop teen ’n klip en die juffrou moes die kind in haar motor vat vir stitches ...

The caring attitude which educators portrayed was echoed by the support staff in the manner that they spoke to the children and in stories of how educators take children to the day hospital and wait there for hours, giving of their time. It shows that the educators at this school are good role models and worthy to be followed although they were very modest about their role when I asked them, but the support staff recognize their esteem for people and children.

LQ 2 ... consider others, do everything with love ...

LQ 9 ... Helpful, caring, not aggressive ...
LQ 20  ... A person that is not rude, who has manners and who have a nice loving heart ...

LQ 12  ... Be good to others. Care for one another ...
LQ 5  ... To look after nature and the earth ...

LS 14  ... I would like to keep my country (clean). I will speak to people about the environment ...

This notion of care was also portrayed in the learner questionnaires (LQ) and learner citizenship stories (LS). It is evident that the learners at this school were told that it was important to develop and hold on to democratic values. Educators through their training (OBE) emphasise and encourage social knowledge and acceptance of diversity. It is evident that educators at this school want their learners to develop and have pride in their school and want children to know the difference between right or wrong and believe they are guiding children for life and its possibilities. It is evident that the educators set the tone by being “caring” and the learners are aware of it.

4.4.2 Trust and loyalty

With regard to “trust and loyalty” all those who participated appeared to value this highly. The participants believed in and encouraged trust and loyalty. Maybe this is because the staff is confident in what they do. It is evident that the educators are qualified and the Western Cape Education Department (WCED) has provided the necessary in-service training with regard to Outcomes-Based Education (OBE). They seemed to believe that they know how to deliver the curriculum. They have a vision to work towards positive outcomes where the school is concerned. Perhaps they believe in ensuring everyone’s personal values and norms are aligned with empathy, connection and trust in the school ethos. Learners appeared to value “trust and loyalty” highly. Only one educator transcript refers directly to trust. But many off the record remarks were made. For ethical reasons are not reported here.

E1  ... I leave the class and expect them to do certain things while I’m not there and they will be able to do it ...
... I got to be loyal, honest, trustworthy and dependable ...

LS 18 ... As a responsible citizen I should be loyal and always stick to my principles ...

LS 24 ... I have to be loyal to my friends and neighbours ...

LQ 1 ... As a responsible citizen I should be loyal ...

LQ 17 ... A responsible citizen should be honest, reliable and trustworthy ...

LQ 5 ... The Life Orientation teacher, teaches us to be loyal to others and yourself ...

The above theme was derived from commentary by educators and learners only. It is interesting to note that the support staff did not comment on it during their interviews. Considering their role within the school infrastructure, it might be that they did not consider it an important value to be prioritised. An essential element of trust is confidence. Perhaps the support staff put their confidence in the educators with regard to the aspect of teaching. Within the infrastructure of the school there are different service segments and these segments must learn to trust each other. This means that they assume “respect” is closely related to trust and loyalty and also feel strongly affiliated to what the school stands for. Another interesting point, is the language of the learners for example “I have to be …”, “I should be …”. This sounds like educators telling learners rather than that through teaching and learning children would want to be trustworthy and loyal. It could also be that in answering questions learners just expressed themselves in this manner.

4.4.3 Responsibility

Educators took responsibility for themselves and the school. It was revealed during the interviews, that they expect the learners and the parent community to exhibit the same attitude.

E1 ... communities need to take responsibility as well ... as a
teacher, you are responsible for teaching the children the curriculum ... have programmes like health ... maybe sitting together and share ideas, trying to make a difference by doing this or that ... we’ll welcome the support and the input of the community at large ...

E2 ... you need to think about values ... because we say charity begins at home ... and if there is misconduct and it happens regularly, we send a letter home to the parents because it is still their responsibility to talk to the children ...

SS 1 ... In die oggend is hulle al baie vroeg hier ... dit baat nie die kinders gaan nou hier buitekant staan nie en dis donker buitekant. So hulle moet maar inkom ... daarom is ons baie stiptelik ... ek sal saamstem jy moet vroeg by jou werk wees veral hier by die skool ...

Learner stories and questionnaires also reflected the importance of responsibilities. This is indicated by the following quotations selected from the learner stories (LS) and learner questionnaires (LQ)

LS 18 ... As a responsible citizen I should be caring, loving and sharing. I must be helpful and sharing. I must be helpful and take pride in my work ...

LS 16 ... One day when I grow up I would like to be known as a responsible person. A civilised community care for each other and their culture. We as responsible people should not go to war. We have duties and responsibilities ...

LS 2 ... Every citizen has the responsibility to keep the country clean. Every child has the responsibility to go to school. As a responsible citizen I will stop crime in this country like rape, murder and stealing. Every parent have (has) the responsibility to have a job, buy food and to pay the rent ...
LQ 20 ... A good citizen should be a spokes person for the community, have a good attitude and be responsible ...

LQ 28 ... I should be a responsible person with a positive attitude towards my country ... a good citizen ...

LQ 7 ... A responsible person is supportive and caring ...

The success of a school depends on how well it is managed. This is not easy given the changing and different values people bring with them to the workplace. In a school everyone involved ought to demonstrate responsibility and initiative as education always takes place in a social context and this context is inherently value laden. Responsibility is very important to educators regarding their learners, but they also expressed a strong sense of accountability for delivering the curriculum. This seemed to be their first priority.

4.4.4 Respect

The support staff highlighted “respect” as the most important value. The learners also mentioned respect and this correlates with what the support staff had said. It is interesting to note that educators at this school did not mention “respect”. Instead there appeared to be a focus on “A high standard of teaching”.

E6 ... I would say we place the school on a high level and we must Maintain that high standard of education and of teaching here....

SS 1 ... We all have our different opinions of things and again it comes down to respect for one another ....

SS 2 ... Die kinders wys vir my respek ... Nee, die kinders is ‘n bietjie bang vir my ... Een ding van hulle, hulle luister vir my ...

SS 3 ... the attitude of the colleagues ... respect for one another, if you are not going to appreciate ... listen to reason and sort things out in wherever there was a problem ...

SS 4... ja, dit is belangrik dat ons vir mekaar respek het, die kinders
Learner stories also reflected the importance of respect. It is illustrated in the following learner stories and questionnaire quotations.

**LS 15** ... *I think all citizens are equal, although some are poor, People must respect each other. People need citizenship. We got to school to be taught the right thing, people have schools they need to be a good society ...*

**LS 7** ... *I think a responsible citizen should have respect for people.*

**LS 11** ... *I have been taught about obedience and disobedience. I always follow the rules when it comes to home, school and environment ...*

**LQ 1** ... *You must be a good and respectful person ...*

**LQ 7** ... *I must be respectful and proud ...*

**LQ 9** ... *I must not be nosy (noisy), I should not mock, or backchat my parents or teachers if I have self respect ...*

**LQ 16** ... *You must also have respect for yourself and others ...*

**LQ 10** ... *I respect all the people in our country ...rich people, poor People*

**LQ 4** ... *My teacher want us to listen to her and be good ...*

**LQ 6** ... *You must have respect for your parents ...*

Once again the learners commented a fair deal about “respect”. In this school it is surely marked as the most important priority to be nurtured. The learners often linked respect, self-respect and obedience. Sometimes people think obedience is a sign of respect, but I wonder if it is always the case. At this school respect was also closely linked to pride. It was noticeable in the way educators and learners spoke
about their school. They mentioned the general appearance, of the gardens, their sports fields and extra-mural activities in comparison to other schools in the vicinity.

### 4.4.5 Justice, fairness and human rights

The above-mentioned theme was primarily identified in the data from the learner questionnaire (LQ) and the learner citizenship stories (LS). It seems that the educators in this school involved with younger learners are strongly influenced by Piagetian views since they did not refer to rights. This notion of development through stages is mentioned in Chapter two. A substantial number of quotations are cited because this reflects the diverse views of the grade 7 learners

LQ 18 *Citizens should have rights ...*

LQ 25 *The poor must know their rights ...*

LQ 22 *All citizens have civil rights and have the right to say no to vandalism ...*

LQ 21 *I think all South African citizens should be treated fairly and equal. Everyone has legal rights ...*

LS 19 *I have the right to vote. I must be responsible (and) help people. I must give them food and clothes. I must be proud about (of) myself ... We must be fair to each other. We must have rules in the house ...*

LS 2 *I will stop crime(s) in the country, like rape, stealing and murder. Every citizen has the responsibility to keep our country clean. Every child has a responsibility to get a good education and the right to be loved and cared for. Every parent have the
duty to have a job to (so that they can) buy food and pay the rent ...

LS 16 ...One day when I grow up, I want to be a responsible citizen. I have a right to education. We have to be employed by the government. We have rights, we have to do duties and have responsibilities. We must be more loyal because we have the right to freedom ...

LS 29 ... Citizenship is when you are fair towards people. You must be an example for the community. You must be responsible and help where you can. There must be rules and laws, because some people don't listen to you ... Then the citizens will be a good community. And there must be power and justice and morals ...

LS 7 ... All people have rights such as to be able to vote, education and duties etc. I think all citizens should be treated fairly even old and poor people. I think South African citizens should have rules, without them there would be chaos ...

4.4.6 Decision-making and choices

In addition to school priorities, learner stories and learner questionnaires reflected a sixth theme, namely: Decision making, choices and values. It is illustrated by the following selected quotations:

LQ 31 ... Everyone has values. Do not steal, lie and cheat ...

LQ 28 ...To be a positive person and a good citizen ...

LQ 24 ... They teach me values because they learn (teach) me (how) to solve problems ...

LS 22 ... I have a right to make choices and I have a choice to (Choose) the right path or the wrong path ...
... My values (are) to be a responsible citizen. I (have) got
(the) right to obey the rules and the law. I must make good
choices in life. I must take pride in my country ...

This theme was only identified and expanded on by the learners in their citizenship
stories and questionnaires. I think currently moral education is framed around the
new democratic order in South Africa. Educators are showing more “respect” to
learners than in the past because of the new laws governing education in the country
at present. My experience is that educators teach automatically, to some extent
educators are trying to be Piagetian to allow learners to develop through peer
interaction, but I think that educators nowadays tell learners they have choices, but
also the responsibility to shoulder the consequences of those choices. It is just that
with the new focus on human rights educators do not want to be implicated. It is
impossible for me to say something categorical about the motives of the specific
educators at Civitas Primary, therefore I can only gesture here at the guiding motifs
with regard to cognitive development and personal responsibility. It is clear that the
educators teach the children about democracy and citizenship and try to make the
learners aware of what is expected of a good citizen. They believe that it is
important to nurture values and virtues imprinted in children. I believe that via what
the learners say, educators are doing a good job in some respects and that the
children at this school are well-informed about their rights. It remains an open
question if they will continue to display their knowledge and attitudes only for now,
or build on it for the future as this is very important for the progression and well-
being of the nation.

In addition to “respect” learners commented a great deal about “fairness, justice and
rights”. It seems at this school there is a great emphasis on rights. Often learners
learn about certain issues for the first time in school. They may not understand
words the way adults do. Possible examples are when the learners seemed to
confuse rights responsibilities and duties. The learners made remarks such as (LQ 17)
“I must be respectful” or “I should not mock …” (LQ 9). If children are not
stimulated at home, or not given a chance to think or debate about the desirable
values and virtues necessary for citizenship then they will accept any fact that makes
sense to them. It could be that children are ego-centric and only think in terms of
themselves and everything centres still very much around him/herself. The objective
here would be to help children to be less self-centred ‘Kohlberg’s’ (stage 1) and more other-centred, which involves holding a broader, more understanding view of others ‘Kohlberg’s’ (stage 2). In this school it is apparent that learners have been influenced by the new teaching strategy of OBE and been sensitised towards democratic values. I however did not uncover any evidence of educators talking to children about some of the tensions between rights and responsibilities that they must feel themselves at times.

4.5 PRACTICES IN THE SCHOOL

In addition to school priorities, four themes regarding practices emerged from educators themselves. The following themes regarding practices were identified and considered to be important namely:

- Rewards and praise
- Relationships
- Holistic development
- Involvement of the community

4.5.1 Rewards and praise

E 3 ... *I feel, that if the child knows, that the teacher can trust him that in itself is a kind of reward ...*

E 1 ... *usually when children or learners do something good, I as a teacher will praise him, I think some of my colleagues also ...*

E 5 ... *At a primary school ... you should send kids to do ... run an errand for you, go to the principal, take this to the office ... I feel that, that is a kind of reward ...*

E 6 ... *I feel that learners should be rewarded for something well done ...*

E 7 ... *We give the good ones a sweet or something for doing something well ...*

The educators thought praise and rewards were important ways of influencing the learners. They also believed that this would develop the learners’ self-esteem.
Rewards are not always given in material form. One educator mentioned “trust” is in itself a reward for the child, meaning it improves the moral behaviour of learners. Educators had to revert to other forms of discipline with the abolishment of corporal punishment in South African schools. This led them to apply alternative methods. Therefore in this study educators spoke about rewards and praise and the fact that children are rewarded is a step in the right direction. Educators in the past were used to authoritarian discipline and this led to a strong preference for the use of corporal punishment as a behaviour control mechanism in the schools. Moving towards the positive is a step forward, but it is possibly not far enough. Educators could develop children’s understanding so that they are not shaped by rewards, but that children should be good because they want to be good of themselves.

4.5.2 Relationship Building

E 2 ... *if we talk to the parent ... they say the children are well mannered ...*

E 4 ... *We motivate our children ... we try our best for the kids here ...*

E 7 ... *We go the extra mile for our kids ... this is also how we build relationships with the children ...*

E 1 ... *we will have better learners if we have better interaction with the parents ...*

The educators are very committed. They motivate their learners. They also go the extra mile for their learners. The parents too have good regard for the school. Parents say the children at their school are well-mannered. The educators believe that they could develop better cooperation, understanding and improved interaction with parents and thereby making the school more attractive to the parents so that maybe all the parents will respond and share actively and meaningfully in the school life. The challenge for schools, educators and the principal is to gain the enthusiasm, trust and commitment of all involved in the education process. One cannot today organise and manage alone within a tightly defined system of production like gathering school-fees, fundraising efforts and sponsorships from big firms. What is required of leadership is the skill to build sound relationships and
create work environments that will encourage the trust and loyalty that will carry the school from strength to strength.

4.5.3 Holistic Development

E 1 ... Parents put their children in here ... they take them out of other schools because we have a variety like cultural, we have music, computer, Xhosa, we have ballet as well ... they place the school on a high level I would say ... we maintain that high level of education and teaching here ...

E 2 ... if we talk to the parents or teachers from the other schools and we hear what’s going on in other schools, then I think I’m proud to be here in this school –

E 3 ... Maybe if you look at for instance all these new schools that are coming up with different ideas ... some are good, especially the ones that ... they tend to try and develop the whole child or whole individual ...

All the educators in the study expressed the need to develop a more child centred approach. In developing the child holistically the school offers a variety of cultural and academic subjects to cater for the holistic development of the learner. The service integration at the school is based on holistic goals that include physical, social and psychological dimensions. Educators explore ways of implementing mechanisms and are prompted to gather information and seek areas of consensus about issues of moral and citizenship development, because these issues are worth exploring with the parents and the learners. It has the potential to add to the richness of the intellectual and moral life of the school. Furthermore it also gives educators practice in concrete skills that may translate to the classroom. Ryan and Lickona (1987); Lickona (1991) suggest that character education is a developmental process that requires knowledge, effort and practice along with support, example and encouragement.

4.5.4 Involvement of the Community
... Definitely, we’ve got a lot of support of the parents and we even got a functions committee that help whenever there’s a function on at school ...

... we go to the shops in the community and ask for donations ...
they sponsor and I think it is important that our children know about this ... this is also how we build relationships ...

... communities need to take responsibility as well ... you know for too long we’ve been citizens that have begged what is our government doing? ...

Educators admit that the parent community gives its support and help with fundraising. The wider community also plays a role in this regard. There seems to be a good working relationship between the school and the outside community. The educators welcome community involvement and make the learners aware of the good relationship and support that the school receives from the outside world. The school understands and maintains a view of shared responsibility in order to grow and expand. It seems that educators want the moral support of the community as well as money since the school is a non-profit organisation in most cases. There was some informal evidence noted in my journal that they want to work on issues such as discussion of a shared set of values. Perhaps this will improve the standard and understanding that the educators have of collaboration. If the school can embrace shared ownership, everyone will feel responsible for meeting objectives and executing the vision of the school. This might be the message that learners receive when they express themselves in “... I must be loyal and proud ...” Educators thought community development was important, to develop the understanding and responsibility which can only benefit the children and improve the quality of education.

4.6 SUMMARY

The responses of educators, support staff and learners contributed to the various themes that emerged. In the light of what I said in this chapter, the main points were
educators’ understanding of their roles, priorities in terms of values and virtues and practices at the school.

With regard to educators’ understanding of their role the educators saw themselves as information providers and role models but acknowledged that they could not be the only role models. Educators felt that all others role players in the education process need to be brought on board for successful moral development.

The main priorities for the educators at this school were love, care, care of the environment, trust, loyalty, responsibility, respect and justice. Educators said it is very important to nurture values and virtues in children. The learners at this school were also aware of these priorities. They mentioned them on several occasions as reflected in the learner questionnaire and stories.

With regard to the practices that were employed in this study educators felt it was important to teach children values, but in collaboration with the parents and that there should be rewards for good behaviour. In addition the educators felt that there should be community development that will enhance social upliftment. However, the educators were not sure how democracy education would benefit the community but they thought democracy education was necessary and that it will have a positive influence on everyone. Although in the South African context it was still a very sensitive issue. They hoped that citizenship education would develop a better understanding of political issues and develop responsibility which can only benefit the children.

Chapter five will discuss the findings, and link them to previous research related to democracy and moral and citizenship education.
CHAPTER FIVE

DISCUSSION, LIMITATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1 INTRODUCTION

In this chapter I will discuss the findings and link them to previous research related to democracy and citizenship education. Thereafter the limitations of the study will be briefly discussed, followed by some recommendations. The aim of the study was to explore the understanding and mediation of the virtues associated with citizenship of a democracy at one primary school in the Western Cape. The following questions guided this particular study:

- How do educators understand their role with regard to instilling values?
- Which values and virtues do they prioritize?
- What practices do they employ to promote democracy and citizenship education?

5.2 EDUCATORS’ UNDERSTANDING OF THEIR ROLE

With regard to the mediation of virtues, educators saw themselves as conscientizers, role models and collaborators with parents. They also had some role-related concerns. As conscientizers, educators felt it was important for the learners to know what happened in the past, as they had been a part of the struggle for democracy. They expressed themselves strongly in struggle language, so that the learners might get a feeling or understanding of what apartheid entailed as they, the learners are part of a new dispensation, where children are taught and made aware of their rights. Educators might feel that learners have to understand how the fight for democracy affected and played a role in their lives. I think that for some educators this notion is more important than for others as there are some very young educators and the younger parents also were not part of or experienced the “struggle” in the same way. This is possibly the significance of their understanding. I assume that to remember the past is important to understand their present situation. It may be a means to plan the way forward. It could also mean that educators underestimate what learners already know, or that educators do not take the trouble to explore in-depth what learners are capable of.
5.2.1 Educators as role models

The educators at this school see themselves as individual role models. They think it is important to model correct and desirable traits such as respect, loyalty, love and care. They also realise that they need the input of parents to help them shape the learners’ development. Educators cannot be regarded as the only role models because most of the learners’ time is spent at home. There is also an inter-related role association between school and the home, which parents and teachers have to understand. At school modelling, good behaviour is portrayed in the manner the classroom is managed, and the adherence to rules. It also depends on the educators’ attitude to authority and what they expect from their learners. It stands to reason then, that the same democratic principles, if they apply at school, should be modelled and applied at home. The finding that educators think of themselves as moral role models is consistent with the findings of Garrod (1993) and Wellington (2000). This seems to be typical of education internationally. The same was also found to be true of South African educators (Green 2004 a).

5.2.2 Educators as collaborators with parents

As collaborators with parents the educators in this study acknowledged that they cannot take responsibility for learning and development of learners upon themselves. The educators are possibly of the opinion that children who are exposed to good role models will tend to produce similar patterns of behaviour later in life. Since South Africa is a democracy many changes occurred, for example changing syllabi, changing approaches to teaching and changing approaches to school management and governance. These changes meant that educators are constantly faced with new challenges. They also have to adjust to new circumstances, which is very stressful, therefore they need to collaborate with parents. They state that any endeavour on their part would only be successful if they have the support of the parent community. This seems to make sense that educators should push for parental involvement as stated in recent education policy documents in South Africa (Education White Paper 6, DOE, 2001; Schools Act, RSA, 1996).
5.2.3 Educators’ role related concerns

Educators mentioned some social and academic concerns related to their role. They were worried that gangsterism, drug-abuse, child-abuse, poverty and crime present in the community might affect the discipline in the school. It was as if things happening outside school worried them so much that they were not sure if the old ways of doing things at the school could continue. All these factors could undermine the educators’ authority. The academic concerns were mainly about the lack of interest and support that some parents showed in their children with regard to their education. Another concern that educators had was that too much was expected of them. This might indicate a fear of “burn out” or even a feeling of powerlessness on the part of the educators.

5.3 PRIORITIES AT THE SCHOOL IN TERMS OF VIRTUES AND VALUES

At this school, the following themes emerged as priorities for educators, support staff and learners:

- Love and care;
- Trust and loyalty;
- Responsibility;
- Respect and justice.

These are similar to the priorities identified in studies referred to in Chapter two. The educators in the study by Green (2004b) also prioritised responsibility, set goals, make plans and to persist, but they also mentioned debate, and to be generous as well as taking citizenship seriously.

5.3.1 Love and care

With regard to love and care, staff and learners said it was a priority and my observation confirmed this. The staff showed their love for the learners through a caring attitude. This was echoed by the support staff in the manner they spoke to the children and the stories told of how educators take children to the day hospital and
wait there for hours, giving of their time. It is also portrayed in the confidence parents have in the staff, when they send their children to school by mini-bus taxi and other public transport, knowing that there will be somebody at the school they can trust to take care of their child. Or that someone will be there to allow a learner onto the school premises while it might be dark on a winter’s morning long before school starts. There is also evidence of care when teachers show their concern. They keep open communication between parents and the school. This includes regular SGB (School Governing Body) meetings, home/class visits and other circulars to parents. Evidence of order and good behaviour, is visible in the way the prefect team helps and reports to educators on the happenings during intervals. The prefects perform their duties meticulously and carry their badges with pride. This is consistent with the findings of Lickona (1976); Kohlberg (1981); Spiecker and Straughan (1988).

5.3.2 Trust and loyalty

All those who participated appeared to value trust and loyalty highly. This is perhaps because the school created the opportunity and encouraged trust and loyalty. It is noteworthy that learners used terms like “my teacher, teaches us to be loyal to others and yourself.” Evidence of trust is also portrayed in the following quotation by an educator at the school.

“... I leave the class and expect the learners to do certain things while I’m not there and they will be able to do it …”

As a priority trust and loyalty is very important. This is a very important issue to be addressed especially in a place like a school where everything works together for the common good of the school community and all the roleplayers. Seeking personal interest can sometimes cause self-centeredness which is not conducive to moral and democratic development, in the way that South Africa is now. If a staff does not value trust amongst each other or are not loyal and committed to educational principles it can lead to degeneration of our feelings for others and even giving in to injustice. Lickona (1991) explains that the concept of democracy has been twisted by a laissez-faire liberalism of the last century, causing individuals to think of democracy as a private and personal possession. In the South African context this
individualistic view of life is in contrast to communal life, a lifestyle traditionally dominant among the African people. In spite of this contrast, individualism is on the increase and manifests itself in the loss of respect for adults, greed, dishonesty and poor work ethics (DOE and SABC, 2000). This sense of loss of respect could be what prompts investigation into moral and citizenship education.

5.3.3 Responsibility

All those who participated appeared to emphasise responsibility greatly. The staff took responsibility for the school and mentioned that this point depends on teamwork. They spoke to learners about responsibility. Responsibility and ownership need time and have to be cultivated. Responsibility grows from the intention to have collaboration and to have the best of the best from people. This is sometimes easier said than done because people with different expertise cannot just be put together and expected to collaborate unconditionally. Personal responsibility is about people’s action and choices, therefore educators have to own their role in a team to experience success and growth.

5.3.4 Respect

All those who participated appeared to value respect highly. This is perhaps because respect is one of the pillars on which relationships are built. The staff emphasised respect because they recognise diversity in the school. Respect begins with building respectful relationships and not controlling others or forcing them to change. A cornerstone of respect is accepting people for who they are. The staff and learners expressed this notion differently. The support staff highlighted respect as the most important value to be nurtured. The way the learners react depends greatly on the foundation laid at home and reinforced in the school. The learners focussed on various aspects regarding “respect” namely: equality, to listen to the teacher, to be good, show it to your parents, to follow rules at home and at school.

5.3.5 Justice

Educators, via active teaching of rights, think that this value is important. It is noteworthy that learners too thought “justice” was extremely important via what
they said. It appeared to be influenced by the Christian tradition in the school and probably also by the emphasis on rights in the Constitution. I am not sure though, whether children are taught to think about responsibilities that go with rights. Sometimes it seems as if children are not made aware of the universal principle, that there are consequences for decisions we make in life. Understanding justice has to do with the value system of a person. The new and democratic approach to management of classroom respects the rights of learners. Children are exposed to the media and other programmes where the emphasis is on children’s rights. This may have become a norm for children. Therefore the learners focussed on “justice” per se but learners may have to develop and change their understanding of how they ought to behave in a truly democratic way of life.

5.4 PRACTICES IN THE SCHOOL

It was difficult to establish the practices of educators. Some educators indicated that they were there to “instruct” children (E4). It appeared that they had to answer to the principal, the school and the WCED according to the curriculum and that was all they felt they had time for. Yet they felt they had to be role models. The educators could not easily separate their practices with regard to the nurturing of virtues from their other professional identities. Their main strategies to nurture the virtues and values they thought important were through the example they set, and by developing well-balanced children who know right from wrong (holistic development) and by positive reinforcement. The educators’ sense that parents might not always agree with their beliefs may also have influenced them. Therefore the school needs to develop a vocabulary and understanding with regard to the expression of their needs and views regarding moral development. With regard to positive reinforcement (praise and rewards) educators felt rewards should be given for good behaviour. Sometimes these rewards were not given in the form of tangible things, for example an educator would send a child on an errand to the principal’s office. I wonder whether this was done to increase internal motivation or if educators at this school believed that rewards will enhance and develop a good self-esteem. These practices are similar to those identified by Green (2004b). In both cases educators appeared to rely primarily on role modelling and direct instruction.
5.5 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

Given that this was a case study, it created some limitations. The following points can be regarded as limitations to the study.

- The study focussed only on one primary school and the findings are not generalisable to all educators and all learners.

- Besides the literature I only drew on the insights of certain educators, support staff and learners and I did not involve the parent community.

- The topic was interesting yet very complex and the participants were at times unable to express themselves clearly. For example one response was “it is difficult” and yet another “I need to think”.

- My role as a researcher might at times have been overshadowed by my own views and experience as an educator.

- I also had very little experience in conducting interviews and therefore did not probe the participants to disclose more information so that the research findings could maybe have had different answers and results.

- The study investigated the educators’ understanding and not their actual behaviour.

Merriam (2001) argues that in studies of this nature the educator’s response could be politically or morally rooted. Consequently, educators are inclined to give socially acceptable answers. It is thus difficult to ascertain whether the results of this study are a true reflection of educators’ understanding.

Though efforts were made to validate the findings, there remains a degree to which one cannot be absolutely sure that one has measured the view that one sets out to measure.
5.6 PERSONAL LEARNINGS

I have learnt how to conduct research, thereby developed the necessary skills, knowledge and attitudes to be effective in practice. Acquiring a holistic understanding of research enabled me to engage confidently and constructively with the participants during the process. I learnt to collect and interpret data and gained insight into other people’s thinking. I learned to discipline and refine my thoughts, sharpen and refine my perceptions and gained understanding of my own practices. I have learnt to persevere with my studies. In itself it was very rewarding. The literature and empirical research have given me new insights and practical experience. I learnt to reflect and to look critically at myself and identify the aspects that I wish to improve.

5.7 RECOMMENDATIONS

If the findings reflect the reality of this school it would be desirable to:

- Encourage more reflection and conversation amongst the staff and the parent community with regard to moral and citizenship education.

- Create a booklet/handbook which provides programmes and activities for moral and citizenship education to be provided to educators and learners for classroom use.

- Initiate a writing workshop in the community using the learners’ LS and LQ as introduction to open up discussion and democratic citizenship.

- Host an art exhibition after training workshops as a joint effort of learners and educators to expose South African people to citizenship values.

- Establish forums with people from the wider community and other schools in their vicinity. This opens opportunity for all the role players to participate in a truly democratic forum of interaction where people share ideas and form
strong partnerships with the school. It has the potential to be a powerful tool in nation building.

5.8 SUGGESTIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

Further studies should be done, and need to be conducted using bigger samples. There could possibly be a comparative study between secondary and primary schoolchildren and educators for the purpose of cross-context and cross age comparison. The results might then be more generalisable than the present study. It citizenship education is to be successful, democratic principles need to be fostered at home and in school. Since parents have been given a formal role in school governance, it is imperative that more research be done on parents - their understanding and attitude towards democratic citizenship education and its use in schools as a moral strategy.

5.9 CONCLUSION

The study highlighted the educators’ understanding of their role, the priorities that they deemed important and the practices they employed to promote in their learners the values and virtues fit for citizens of a democratic society. The study suggests that there is a need for educators to think about and engage in conversations about the practice of democracy and citizenship education they wish to engage in with children and young people at school. Spiritual and moral values cannot be denied, as they are the motivating factors behind people’s choice of behaviour and conduct. I agree with Oser (1986) who states that the school could be a place where virtues can be developed and educators contribute towards building democratic values. The school is the ideal place for transfer of norms (minimalist view) and for the development of thoughtfulness (maximalist view).

It is hoped that this study has not only helped to shed more light on issues that can affect the values and associated virtues that a particular school wished to nurture; but that it will help to open up opportunities for further research with parents, other schools and role players of the WCED.
“... habits of living are altered with startling abruptness and thoroughness ... that this evolution should not affect education ... is inconceivable.”

(Dewey, 1900: 5-6)
REFERENCES


Department of Education (DoE) (1999) Call to Action Statement by Professor Kader Asmal, Minister of Education. Pretoria. DoE.


Appendix 1

68 – 25th Avenue
ELSIES RIVER
7490

January 2003

Attention: Mr. Peter Present

Western Cape Education Department
Private Bag X 9114
CAPE TOWN
8000

Dear Sir

Permission to Conduct Educational Research

I am a primary school with 25 years experience. I am currently undertaking my M.Ed. at the University of the Western Cape. To complete this degree candidates are required to submit a thesis on a topic related to teaching practices.

The topic I have selected is ‘Teaching for Democratic Citizenship’. My interest in the topic was sparked not only by the political developments of our country – the fact that we are one of the newest democracies in the world and have one of the most liberal constitutions but also by the undertaking from the Department of Education to encourage the development of democratic and responsible citizens who have a shared vision.

The curriculum has been altered to encourage learners to be a part of the decision making process through involvement and participation – this, in my view, is the core emphasis of Democracy Education; which in essence is geared at the empowerment of everyone involved in the education process. Schools and Educators therefore play an important role in working towards democratic goals. Educators aside from covering the required syllabus are also endeavouring to instil moral and cognitive virtues in young children. The crux of my thesis will be an investigation of how exactly educators go about the process of Democracy Education. This study is a follow-up of the work conducted by Professor L. Green in 2002.
It is for this reason that I seek your permission to conduct investigative research at one of the following schools:

- Ellerton Primary School – Three Anchor Bay
- Sunray Primary School – Delft South
- Tembani Primary – Langa
- Belhar Primary School – Belhar
- Edward Primary School – Elsies River
- Pinelands Primary – Pinelands
- Bellville Moravian Primary – Bellville South
- Injongo Primary – Khayelitsha

This schools listed have been selected on the merit of their respective socio-economic make-up.

It is envisaged that the research will be conducted for a one-week period in the first or second term of 2003. The research process will involve individual interviews with:
- The School-Manager;
- Selected Educators;
- Administrative Staff, as well as Support Staff. Furthermore a simple questionnaire will be compiled to be completed by Grade 7 learners. Lastly the following documents will be examined:
  - The School Mission Statement
  - The School Rules
  - Minutes of the School Governing Body meeting for the past three years

The interviews/discussions with the teaching and non-teaching staff, as well as the questionnaires to be completed by the learners will take approximately 20 minutes.

It is my hope that the outline meets with your approval, should you however have any queries please do not hesitate to contact me.

Yours sincerely

Miss. M.J. Absolom

Tel: 021 934 1015 (W)
Fax: 021 934 0440 (W)
RESEARCH PROPOSAL: TEACHING FOR DEMOCRATIC CITIZENSHIP; A CASE STUDY OF ONE PRIMARY SCHOOL IN THE WESTERN CAPE.

Your application to conduct the above-mentioned research in schools in the Western Cape has been approved subject to the following conditions:

1. Principals, educators and learners are under no obligation to assist you in your investigation.
2. Principals, educators, learners and schools should not be identifiable in any way from the results of the investigation.
3. You make all the arrangements concerning your investigation.
4. Educators’ programmes are not to be interrupted.
5. The investigation is to be conducted from February 2003 to 28th June 2003.
6. Should you wish to extend the period of your survey at the school(s), please contact Dr R. Cornelian at the contact numbers above quoting the reference number.
7. A photocopy of this letter is submitted to the principal of the school where the intended research is to be conducted.
8. Your research will be limited to the list of schools submitted to the Department of Education.
9. A brief summary of the content, findings and recommendations is provided to the Director: Education Research.
10. The Department receives a copy of the completed report/dissertation/thesis addressed to:

The Director: Education Research
Western Cape Education Department
Private Bag 9114
CAPE TOWN
8000

We wish you success in your research.

Kind regards.

HEAD: EDUCATION
DATE: 2003-06-12
Appendix 3

Dear Sir

I am an M.Ed student at the University of the Western Cape. My research topic is:

“Teaching for Democratic Citizenship a case study in one primary school in the Western Cape”

The topic of my thesis demands that I have interviews with all the stakeholders/role players in the school.

Interview Questions:

1. Do you provide regular practice in reasoned discussion? What happens at this school, with learners and educators?
   How do the learners and educators feel about this or react to it?

2. Do you invite role models to share ideas with learners and educators?
   Do you encourage this and do you think it is important?

3. Is there evidence of rewards for responsible behaviour, careful judgement, motivation and punctuality?

4. How do people in the local community respond to the school – Do they support the school and in what way how?

5. What difficulties do you experience in the school and community regarding disposition of citizenship and values?

6. Is there anything else that you think would be useful for me to know?

Interviews with:

1. Principal
2. Secretary
3. Caretaker/Tea lady
4. Foundation Phase Teacher
   Intermediate Phase Teacher
   Senior Phase Teacher
   Learning Support Teacher
5. School Governing Body Members
6. Look at Mission Statement
7. Look at minutes of SGB meetings of the past 3 years
8. Questionnaire for grade 7 learners
Interviews are done in the school’s first language.

Thanking You

M.J. Absolom  
Persal Number 50256855  
Contact Numbers: 021 933 6414 (H) 021 934 1015 (W) 021 934 0040 (F)
Appendix 4

QUESTIONNAIRE

NAME: ..............................................

SCHOOL: ..............................................

GRADE: ..............  DATE: .........................

1. How did you feel when I placed you into groups at the beginning of the lesson?
   ........................................................................................................................................

2. Would you say I was democratic or not? Explain your answer.
   ........................................................................................................................................

3. Was it different than what you normally experience in class? Yes No

4. How did you feel when you had to discuss attitudes, responsibility, citizenship etc. in small groups? Explain your answer.
   ........................................................................................................................................

5. What do you think the characteristics of a good citizen should be? List some:
   ........................................................................................................................................

6. Do you think you teacher/school teaches your values? Explain.
   ........................................................................................................................................

7. What sort of person does your teacher want you to be? Explain your answer.
   ........................................................................................................................................

8. Did you enjoy working in this way? Yes No

9. Would you like to continue in this way? Give a reason for your answer.
   ........................................................................................................................................
Responsible Citizenship in Action

Read this excerpt from a newspaper article and answer the questions below.

- Mr Kay, a young man in his late 20’s walking to his neighbourhood grocery, becomes witness to a mugging. He sees two men grab a woman’s purse and run up the street he is walking down. Mr. Kay chases after them, grabs and holds them, gets the woman’s purse back, ties their hands behind their backs, and brings them to the police.

1. What is the action or attitude described that exhibits responsible citizenship?

__________________________________________________________________________

2. Do you think Mr. Kay should have taken the law into his own hands or instead called the police to catch the muggers? Explain your reason.

__________________________________________________________________________

In the back of the book. Find the definition of vigilante. ________________________________

3. What are the rewards for this man? What are the risks?

__________________________________________________________________________

4. In which of the circumstances listed below could you see yourself doing this act of citizenship?

Only if I …

- were forced
- were to receive a big reward
- knew for sure I would not get hurt
- would do this no matter what

5. What set of values are demonstrated by this citizen’s actions?

__________________________________________________________________________

6. What values do you have that help you to be a responsible citizenship? What values do you need to develop? Examples are honesty and respect for other.

__________________________________________________________________________

To be responsible citizen, I must remember

__________________________________________________________________________
Write Your Own Story

Write a story. Include each of the following words somewhere in the story. Use the glossary in the back of your book to find the meaning of each word.

citizen            civil            civil defense            civil war
citizenship         civilian         civil liberty         civil service
civic               civilize         civil rights

Read your story to your classmates. Make a booklet of your citizenship stories.
Appendix 7

Interview question transcripts.

**Interviewer:** Is there evidence of rewards for responsible behaviour, careful judgment, motivation, punctuality, honesty at the school?

**E5:** I would say uhm … they must be rewarded uhm … mainly uhm … like … I would if I give you an example. Like for a naughty learner … like I would say uhm … that you give him something to do and he does it well. You give him that chance in life and then you reward him for that.

**E6:** Uhm … rewards. OK. Usually when … uh … children of learners do something good uh … I as a teacher will praise him. I think some of my colleagues also. Uhm … usually this is a primary school. Uhm … you will <<unclear>> send those kids like to do uhm … run an errand for you, go to the principal, take this and … I feel that that is a kind reward, because that child immediately feels that he is responsible, or that the teacher can trust him. And this how we also build a very good relationship with the children <<noise of aeroplane>> and that guys who don’t perform so well or don’t listen so well to you in class gives behavioural problems. Uhm …

**E7:** I personally don’t think the rewards system works all the time.

**SS3:** Uh … I would say if the children should get into trouble, Mr. Moralia will also … always listen to reason and discuss wherever there was a problem arising, where does it come from, where is it going to, and we normally sort it out in the office. And there’s definitely rewards. Mr. Moralia praise them and give them a pat on the back and things like that.
E8: Although we’ve tried it in the beginning by giving the good ones a sweet or giving them something for doing … little star of something like that. The star system I think works still [OK], because the kids are very excited to get a star. They do good work. Or even if they’re good in class and things like that. But where it comes to the handing out of sweets or something … It’s a novelty that wears off. [Yes] The children eventually are not interested [OK] You’ll find the same student maybe that will be interested in that sweet, but you’re trying to get the naughty one to do good. You’ll that they’re not interested, you know [OK]. So the sweet system is not … Even, even the star system I would say is just for that handful again. [OK] That ones. The others, if they’re not interested in, they are not going to do anything about it. They are just gonna let this go [unclear]

**Interviewer:** Do you see yourself as a role model or do you invite other role models to share ideas with educators and learners?

E1: Uhm … normally if they invite role models, it’s for the whole school, not specifically the gr. 1’s and uhm … mostly because like children learn from others more and they open up, they’re more free because you’re with them every day and I would say they’re not scared, but they’re not so free with you because they know your ways and needs and what you expect of them [unclear] and with a role model it is different. And as I said they see you and hear you every day. Somebody from out [noise] … [silence] sorry … somebody from outside like uhm … a role model, they’re more spontaneous and [words fade, unclear] And the educators as well. Sometimes they can’t reach the children and then they invite somebody to the school to bring over certain things and a role model is there for that.
E2: The school. Yes, I uhm … would say I would fully agree with that, because we need role models uhm … for the future also and for our country.

Interviewer: How do people in the local community respond to the school and what difficulties do you experience in the school and the community regarding the disposition of values?

E4: Wait No, I need to, I need to think about it. I need to think about it.

OK. I would say the community really, they … they … they place the school on a high level, I would say. And the standard also … we must maintain that standard here of education and of teaching also. So they really we have a high level and standard and high standard of teaching here. Issue of values. Yes, they do, they value like, I mean, all the stuff that we’re doing here for the children uhm … no man … I would say no, we don’t have a, we don’t, we don’t actually have a problem with that or the value also, how they value our school also. So uh … but the … they … we do have a … the level that we, the stan- … we must maintain that high standard of teaching here.

SS4: Definitely, we’ve got a lot of support of the parents and we even got a function’s committee that help the educators with whenever there’s a function at school, and … We get quite good support from the parents. And even their, their response whenever Mr. Moralia summons them, if there’s a problem arising at school with the learners, the parents is there to come sort the thing out.