Multimodality and Negotiation of Cape Flats Identity in Selected *Daily Voice* Front pages

Waseem Matthews

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Magister Artium in the Department of Linguistics, University of the Western Cape.

June 2009

UNIVERSITY of the
WESTERN CAPE

Supervisor: Professor Felix Banda
Key Words

Daily Voice
Frontpage
Headlines
Multimodality
Bilingual
Tabloid
Verbal Semiotics
Visual Semiotics
Cape Flats
Cape Coloured
Identity
Monolectal
Abstract
Multimodality and Negotiation of Cape Flats Identity in Selected *Daily Voice* Front pages

Waseem Matthews

MA thesis, Department of Linguistics, University of the Western Cape

This thesis explores the social semiotic relationship of visual and verbal signs of the *Daily Voice* tabloid as a way to show how the social context influences meaning of the signs used in its multimodal frontpages. The *Daily Voice* tabloid largely uses Kaapse English/Afrikaans as spoken by Coloureds on the Cape Flats on its frontpages rather than standard English or standard Afrikaans associated with White people. The study assumes that the meaning constructed by and through the verbal and visual signs on the *Daily Voice* frontpages is interdependent on the relationship the multimodal texts have with the largely Cape Flats readership. This study maintains the importance of the idea of the localisation of meaning in socio-cultural specific contexts throughout.

The *Daily Voice* frontpages adopt a colourful layout with bold headlines and images that exhibit features of multimodal representation. That is, a calculated melange of signs. In turn, this study explores the extent to which the texts on the frontpages exhibit speech forms, linguistic practices and cultural metaphors linked to Cape Coloureds. The main verbal text to be considered will be headlines on the frontpages. These features centralise this particular research as it provides the motivation to explore these constructions and how, collectively, they facilitate meaning-making by the audiences of the *Daily Voice*. That is, how the frontpage headlines (and subheadlines) reflect the discourse of the Cape Coloureds. Likewise, through multimodal discourse analysis, the frontpage images are investigated according to the different features that represent different levels of meaning or interpretation: the Given, the New, the Real, the Ideal, Salience, the Margin and the Centre (Kress and Van Leeuwen 1996/2006). However, following Xu’s (2007) sentiments about the perils of the universalisation tendencies in Western discourse analytical tools, an attempt is made in this study to localise and contextualise arguments to Cape Flats socio-cultural conditions. In this light, the thesis looks to show how the inadequacies of perceived universal frameworks such
as Myers-Scotton’s Matrix Language Framework (1993a) have when conducting bilingual discourse research.

Using notions of intertextuality, schema, framing, indexicality, information value, salience and language devices, the thesis identifies how the verbal and visual components construct the meaning-making options that are available to participants by exploring the intersemiotic relationships across the selected frontpages. The importance of schema or localised background knowledge is highlighted as it is this knowledge that helps to evaluate how and why the signs are framed or arranged as they are in the Daily Voice. Such understanding also indicates how intertextual references are made and successfully or unsuccessfully interpreted. Although Reah (2002) provides useful devices for analysing headlines, the thesis finds her framework limited in terms of bilingual discourse analysis. To answer the question as to how the readers evaluate the headlines, the thesis draws on the Appraisal theory developed through the research of Martin and Rose (2005) especially.

I conclude that Kress and Van Leeuwen’s (1996/2006) design could be extended beyond Westernised contexts and that marginalised discourses such as those unique to the Cape Flats are not static, but indeed dynamic. I also extend the appraisal theory by Martin and White (2005) to marginalised bilingual discourse and establish that Appraisal theory can be used to not only evaluate verbal discourse but also that visual discourse needs to be considered as a tool within the appraisal framework. I also conclude by suggesting a monolctal view of Kaapse English/Afrikaans discourse. That is, the meaning potential of Kaapse English/Afrikaans by Cape Flats speakers would be lost if perceived or analysed as emanating from two languages, (White) English and (White) Afrikaans. Therefore the conclusion is that the Daily Voice uses Kaapse English/Afrikaans as is used in Cape Flats socio-cultural contexts to construct meaning-making options across its frontpages.
Declaration

I declare that Multimodality and Negotiation of Cape Flats Identity in Selected Daily Voice Frontpages is my own work and that it has not been submitted as a report for any degree or examination in any other university, and that all the sources I have used or quoted have been indicated and acknowledged by complete references.

Waseem Matthews  
June 2009

Signed: ………………………
Acknowledgements

In the name of God Most gracious. Most merciful.

First and foremost I thank God Almighty for His infinite blessings and mercy. This thesis is dedicated to the memory of my beloved late mother, Farieda Matthews, who will forever be a huge influence and part of my life. I pray that the values you taught me never fade and that your loving smile forever warms my heart through good times and tumultuous struggles. May you be rewarded a place amongst the righteous in paradise, God willing.

I thank my dear father and aunt for their patience and understanding, as well as my brothers and extended family who have supported me throughout my academic career unconditionally.

I fondly remember my teacher and mentor, the late Natheem Weber, who saw potential in me and for whom I have learnt so much in the little time we spent together. I have missed you immensely, especially when nearing the completion of this thesis. May the Almighty grant you the best in the Hereafter.

I thank my supervisor Professor Felix Banda who has groomed me since my first year and has inspired, encouraged and guided me towards striving for academic excellence. Without your supervision Professor, I would certainly not have kept focus nor dared to challenge myself and others. I also thank Professor Banda for being both an academic and professional mentor. In a competitive and vibrant Linguistics environment, it is refreshing to feel that there is so much more to work towards and more importantly, people to look up to. I hope only to learn more from Professor Banda and other senior academics in our department.

To my friends and colleagues Ms Raushan Martin and Mr Quentin ‘Q’ Williams, thank you for the continuous motivation, encouragement and reminders that all this could bear fruition. May your endeavours always be successful and may you both be rewarded for your diligence. I am also grateful to Mrs Soraya Martin for her continuous motivation and encouragement. I thank her family who were always kind enough to ensure safe transport to and from university during the long days and nights of study.
# Contents

## Key Words

## Abstract

## Declaration

## Acknowledgements

## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>Background on Cape Flats</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Statement of Purpose</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1.1</td>
<td><em>Daily Voice</em> as a re-emergent media platform of Cape Coloured identity?</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Aims and objectives</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Research Questions</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Chapter Outline</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Literature Review</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Challenging the Motivations for the Markedness model</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Exploring the shortfalls of the Markedness Model</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>The feasibility of code-switching in dynamic social interactions</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Identity Options</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Bi/Multilingualism as social practice</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.1</td>
<td>Bi/Multilingualism as ideology</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.2</td>
<td>Bi/Multilingualism as linguistic resource</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Bi/Multilingual media discourse</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>Discourse and socio-cultural contexts</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>Discourse as Cultural Struggle</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>The notion of Cape Coloured Identity</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Multimodality as a Conceptual Tool of SFL</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Bilingual practices, performance and design on social identities</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Grammar of visual design</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.3 Intertextuality as a tool for analysis of texts 48
3.4 Framing 49
3.5 Information Value 51
3.5.1 Real and Ideal 52
3.5.2 Centre and Margin 53
3.5.3 Given and New 53
3.5.4 Salience 54

Chapter 4: Indexicality, Appraisal and Language Devices in Media 60
4.0 Introduction 60
4.1 Language as Indexical 60
4.2 The Appraisal Framework 63
4.3 Language Devices in Headlines 66

Chapter 5: Research Methodology and Design 71
5.0 Introduction 71
5.1 Text based/Discourse analysis 73
5.2 Secondary/ Desk Research 75
5.3 Data Collection 76
5.4 Data Analysis 76
5.5 Limitations of the study 76

Chapter 6: Data Analysis: Multimodal Discourse Analysis 78
6.0 Introduction 78
6.1 Choice of Stories 78
6.2 Information value 82
6.2.1 Sport as representation of the Ideal 82
6.2.2 Competitions as representation of the Ideal 84
6.2.3 Crime, child related crime and neglect as representation as the Ideal 85
6.2.4 Crime as representation of the Real 86
6.2.5 Najwa Petersen case as representation of the Ideal and Real 87
6.2.6 Child related crime and neglect as representation of the Real 90
6.3 The Real and the Ideal as spatial options for meaning-making 93
6.4 Centre and Margin 96
6.5 Given and New 96
6.6 Framing 99
6.7 Salience 102

Chapter 7: Visuals as tools for Appraisal 109
7.0 Introduction 109
7.1 Appraisal 109
7.2 Attitude 110
7.2.1 Affect 110
7.2.2 Judgement 111
7.2.3 Appreciation 112
7.3 Graduation 113
7.4 Appraisal as a tool to evaluate visuals 117
7.4.1 Sport visuals as Appraisal 117
7.4.2 Najwa Petersen visuals as Appraisal 118
7.4.3 Cape Flats crime visuals as Appraisal 119
7.4.4 Cape Flats children neglect and related crime visuals as Appraisal 120
7.5 Intertextuality as the language device 122
7.6 Monolectal Discourse 127

Chapter 8: Conclusion 133
8.0 Introduction 133
8.1 Towards an Alternative Discourse? 134
8.2 Readdressing the limitations 137

Bibliography 138
Appendices 145
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.0 Background on Cape Flats

The issue of language, and the infinite interrelated topics concerned with it, is a core component of South Africa’s history, present status and future. Some of South Africa’s most oppressive and most liberating events, processes and changes have been influenced by language. The role of language and periodic discourses has been important in many a struggle and transformation. These events include the resistance and oppression of the apartheid years; the inaugural 1994 democratic elections; the purgative Truth and Reconciliation Commission hearings to name but a few. There are of course numerous other key areas to acknowledge as the country deals with the consequences of previous challenges and simultaneously braves new challenges.

In a post apartheid era the Cape Coloured community is one of several ethnic groups that is in the process of re-defining its identity in an infantile democratic period. This group constitutes the principal inhabitants of an area commonly known as the Cape Flats. Many generations originate from the District Six region which is synonymous with the forced removals of the apartheid regime. The history of this diverse group that includes immigrants from places as far as “Europe, Asia, Australia, St Helena and the West Indies” (McCormick, 2002:1) as well as Khoi and more significantly the Netherlands, is essential towards understanding the current linguistic practices and context.

While listing linguistic profiles specific to various ethnicities in South Africa is difficult to ascertain, it is plausible to at least discuss a brief history of the Cape Coloured community. The discussion looks to give a general description of the Cape Coloured group and not a specific description of a particular Cape Coloured subgroup or speech community. Cape Coloureds are generally bilingual and function in Afrikaans and English. The influence of Dutch during Dutch colonisation is theorised to have given rise to Afrikaans in an already diverse community at the time (McCormick 2002). Although British rule introduced and established the prestige of English upon the colonised areas, political transformations in South Africa led to an Afrikaner based government in 1948. The apartheid era was ingrained and among the many political and social ramifications and realities, language became the
definitive denominator for many of the negative ideologies and practices, such as racism and discrimination. The Afrikaner government standardised a particular variety of Afrikaans thereby stigmatising other dialects as non-standard such as Kaapse Afrikaans (McCormick 2002). It is this variety that has been affixed to the social identity of Cape Coloured communities and its members.

The nature of Kaapse Afrikaans brings together underlying structures of at least two languages and more importantly, multiple identity options for speakers (Pavlenko and Blackledge 2006). In their discourse, Cape Flats dwellers can exhibit a hybrid identity encompassing both Afrikaans and English languages. Although English and Afrikaans are not necessarily the only languages used in the Cape Flats community, they are certainly the two most prominent languages used. However, Kaapse English/Afrikaans exhibits features of an independent code rather than a combination of English and Afrikaans. The issue of identity and whether there are different types of identity and how these types function in the Cape Coloured communities, is considered. Pavlenko and Blackledge (2006) discuss the concept of identity and kinds of identities and how discourses produced by a community allude to these. This thesis uses their work to draw on how the Cape Coloured populace and their discourses are reflected, maintained and/or transformed through the kinds of discourse used by the Daily Voice.

In this regard, how does the Daily Voice frontpages construct Cape Coloured discourse? To answer this research question, in addition to analysing the images and headlines of the frontpages, the study focuses on how Cape Coloured linguistic repertoire is used by the Daily Voice to construct and deconstruct Cape Coloured discourse to allude to the different identity options on the Cape Flats (cf. Pavlenko and Blackledge 2006).

During apartheid, a standardised Afrikaans was the politically dominant and oppressive language that signified the racial injustices prevalent at the time. Non-whites would show resistance and protests in many spheres of daily living. These included forming organisations/groups through theatre and through writing. The damaging effects of this traumatic regime were felt, and can be argued still are, on physical, emotional and
psychological fronts. McCormick notes that “the effects of economic realities and aspirations and of sociopolitical domination, resistance, and realignment” have been evident early on in areas such as District Six and those similar in demographic make-up (2002:4). And as language was central to the way the country was governed, it also reflected the feelings of the oppressed and oppressors. In this light, a variation of standard Afrikaans such as Kaapse Afrikaans may be indicative of another form of protest. It may be perceived as a resistance to conform and thereby identify with a language and an unjust political system. In support of this postulation McCormick states

Among those of the oppressed who were Afrikaans-speaking, ambivalence towards their language was common. In dissociating themselves from their oppressors, working-class coloured people emphasized existing differences between the dialect of Afrikaans which they spoke and the standard dialect they associated with white Afrikaans-speaking people (2002:3).

This resistance which sometimes took the form of the alteration of a language to make a statement and create a particular identity could be seen as a tool against White Afrikaans/Afrikaner domination under apartheid. Thus, despite any current, past or future stigmatisation of a variation like Kaapse Afrikaans, speakers themselves exude pride as the dialect shows group identity and reflects resistance to and remembrance of apartheid. This form of identity is underlined by Donaldson whose research focused on how Afrikaans is influenced by English. He states

Coloured Afrikaans was inaccessible to me as a non-native speaker of the language and as one virtually isolated from any contact with Coloureds due to the areas in which I have resided in South Africa, as well as in part to the constraints of apartheid (1991:15).

He continues to highlight that the degree to which English influenced Coloured Afrikaans outweighed the affects of English on the Afrikaans of Whites. These observations reinforce the notion of Coloured identity and the prestige members of this group have for all facets of their social distinctiveness.
Media institutions are targeting this Western Cape group through publishing various tabloids and often using the type of code-switching commonly practiced amongst the Cape Coloureds. Given that this audience uses presumed vernaculars (which in its own is a connotative laden word) of two politically dominant languages, there is potential growth for various media publications. However, the focus is on how the *Daily Voice* uses alternative forms of Afrikaans and English discourses (and sometimes Xhosa) to construct Cape Coloured discourse. Also, media institutions have seemingly noticed this gap and have started publishing in Kaapse English/Afrikaans as a means of capturing a Coloured readership, so to say. On the other hand, acknowledging this shortage in the media creates potential to fill this void and broaden the written media available to the community.

Adhikari (2005) investigates previous attempts in the Cape Coloured community to publish newspapers that sought to maintain their identity. Fittingly, Androutsopolous (2007) explores the emergence of minority ethnic languages or language varieties in various mass media platforms. Thus both authors argue the importance of acknowledging media publications by and for marginalised groups in research about discourse analysis. Adhikari’s (2005) explorations therefore fall in line with what Androutsopolous generalises across various media platforms to a specific group, namely Coloureds. Therefore, one of the initial aims of the *Daily Voice* when it came into being in March 2005 was to target a potential Coloured readership in an untapped market not just from a tabloid point of view but from a literacy angle (Glenn and Knaggs 2007).

1.1 Statement of Purpose

The problem to be explored relates to the social semiotic relationship of visual (or interchangeably referred to as images) and verbal texts in the *Daily Voice* tabloid. The social semiotic relationship refers to how the signs used in multimodal texts are influenced by the social context in order to be meaningful. The study assumes that the meaning constructed by and through the verbal and visual signs on the *Daily Voice* frontpages is interdependent on the relationship the multimodal texts have with the readership. The idea of the localisation of meaning in socio-cultural specific contexts is integral throughout this study.
The frontpages adopt a colourful layout with bold headlines and images that exhibit features of multimodal representation. That is, a calculated melange of signs. This study explores the extent to which the texts on the frontpages exhibit speech forms, linguistic practices and cultural metaphors linked to Cape Coloureds. The main text to be considered will be headlines. These features centralise this particular research as it provides the motivation to explore these constructions and how, collectively, they facilitate meaning-making by the audiences of the Daily Voice. That is, how the frontline headlines (and subheadlines) reflect the discourse, ideologies of the Cape Coloureds. Likewise, through multimodal discourse analysis, the frontpage images are investigated according to the different features that represent different levels of meaning or interpretation. Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006) discuss the triptychs in newspaper layouts in terms of the Given, the New, the Real, the Ideal, Salience, the Margin and the Centre. These terms will be discussed later. Suffice to say Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006) provide the tools to investigate how the multimodal Daily Voice frontpages construct or deconstruct Cape Coloured identities. However, following Xu’s (2007) sentiments about the perils of the universalisation tendencies in Western discourse analytical tools, an attempt is made in this study to localise and contextualise arguments to Cape Flats socio-cultural conditions.

In essence, this attempt to localise the study is what distinguishes this study from others done on the Cape Flats. In particular in its treatment of Kaapse as a possible code in its own right quite distinct from standard English and standard Afrikaans which are normally associated with the White population. It is through this distinctive nature that my study explores notions of how Daily Voice’s newsroom techniques and strategies are used to construct visual and verbal texts that have local resonance that avail meaning-making options by capitalising on the many linguistic and schematic resources unique to the Cape Flats.

1.1.1 Daily Voice as a re-emergent media platform of Cape Coloured identity?

In the history of Coloured driven newspapers, four publications need to be considered, albeit briefly. This is necessary to emphasise the socio-historic and socio-cultural dimensions of the
The four publications discussed by Adhikari (2005) are the *Torch* (1940s), *Cape Herald* (1960s), *Grassroots* (1980s) and *South* (late 1980s to early 1990s).

The *Torch* was a politically inspired publication that focused on issues such as

“protest against the Coloured Advisory Council, resistance to train apartheid, opposition to the City Council’s segregated housing schemes on the Cape Flats, the fight against the removal of Coloureds from the voter’s roll, the boycott of the van Riebeeck festival, the implementation of the Group Areas Act, and state repression of left-wing political activity” (cf Adhikari, 2005:104).

The *Cape Herald* was a White owned newspaper launched in the late 1960s and was targeted at Coloured readers only. It achieved some commercial success due to its perceived sensationalist approach but faded with the advent of television in the 1970s (2005:224).

*Grassroots* was launched in the 1980s and played a prominent leading role in Coloured rejectionism as a popular movement. It was not active in confronting issues of race or Colouredism although it was considered a Coloured newspaper throughout (2005:152).

According to Adhikari (2005:150), *South* was launched in 1987 and is the most recent newspaper pre-1994 to advocate Coloured identity, at least the most well-known of its kind. Its main aim was “to articulate the needs and aspiration of the oppressed and exploited in the Cape and in doing so serve the interests of the working class people”.

The initial motto of *South* was “You have the right to know” (2005:151) and it is best appreciated and understood in terms of the sociopolitical and socio-historic contexts as *South* pushed ‘struggle’ news during apartheid. *South* aimed to break “monopolistic control of the media by the government and a few large corporations” by claiming to be “the independent voice of the people of the Cape” (Adhikari 2005:150). The leftwing political newspaper dared to print what mainstream newspapers failed to print or chose not to print.

Although *South* was revamped in 1992 and changed its motto to “News for New Times” (Adhikari 2005:157), it eventually went into liquidation toward the end of 1994. First, *South* attempted to combine “serious political reporting with racier sex and crime stories” so as to appeal to both its “traditional readership” and the Coloured working-class (Adhikari 2005:157). According to Adhikari (2005:157) the newspaper then started to focus on issues
such as drug abuse at school level, child rape, family murders, sexual harassment in the workplace, the lifestyles of gang leaders, gang warfare, and even breast implants. However, these types of stories competed with popular protest, worker militancy and exploitation due to apartheid (2005:157). *South* failed to maintain commercial viability and soon started “focusing even more narrowly on the Coloured community”; this led to the paper eventually losing its capacity to keep afloat (2005:157).

The *Daily Voice* covers much of the same issues that *South* carried in its second phase. These include issues such as gangsterism, domestic abuse, drug and alcohol abuse, rape, child murders and a host of social ills. It covers community-based news that go beyond mere reports of incidences but include communal reactions to crimes as well as particular achievements by community members.

More than a decade after South Africa’s historic democratic transition the launch of the *Daily Voice* and *Die Son* continue the pattern of a ‘Coloured newspaper’ although the motivation/s and functions differ from their predecessors. *Grassroots* and *South* particularly were products of anti-apartheid struggle. With the democratic transformation, new struggles came to the fore and that perhaps led to their failure to be sustained. The *Daily Voice* and *Die Son* are post-apartheid publications that contend with issues consequent of pre-1994 socio-political conditions. Some of these issues are the centre of the current study.

This thesis is essentially about how the *Daily Voice* performs the different Cape Coloured identities as well as the newsroom techniques they use to draw on local cultural metaphors and schemata for communicative effect.

**1.2 Aims and objectives**

The general aim is to do a multimodal discourse analysis of a collection of frontpages of various editions of the *Daily Voice*. The following are specific objectives for the study:

1.2.1 To do a multimodal analysis of the various visual and verbal texts found on the frontpages to find out how the various components link together to generate meaning in the social context of the Cape Flats.
1.2.2 To investigate how a colourful layout, headlines and images are used to construct the ideal Cape Coloured audience on the frontpages specifically.

1.2.3 To explore how code-switching and culturally based metaphors are used as verbal signs and tools to capture the contexts of the Cape Coloured audience on the frontpages.

1.2.4 To analyse the composition of the multimodal frontpages in terms of the Given, the New, the Ideal, the Real, the Centre and the Margin and how these features create vectors to construct meaning (Kress and Van Leeuwen 1996/2006) relevant to the Cape Flats.

1.3 Research Questions

1.3.1 How do the elements of the visual and verbal text on the frontpages work together to capture the sociolinguistic, economic and political contexts of the Cape Flats?

1.3.2 How is language and visual imagery used in multimodal combinations to allude to Cape Coloured identity?

1.4 Chapter Outline

Chapter 1 provides background information regarding (a) a brief contextualisation of the Cape Coloured community and the sociolinguistic situation (b) a general background of Tabloidism in Cape Town as well as in South Africa. The aims and objectives of the study are discussed in this chapter. This section also discusses the rationale and difficulties or problems motivating the desire for the study.

Chapter 2 introduces the first of two literature review sections. This chapter addresses the short comings of Myers-Scotton’s MLF and Markedness models in bilingual discourse research. The predictability of perceived universal frameworks is critiqued and alternative research paradigms using the work of Auer, Meeuwis and Blommaert are highlighted. This section argues the need to view bilingual discourse on its own socio-contextual merit rather than using monolingually inspired ideologies to evaluate bilingual discourse. The views of Heller, Pavlenko and Blackledge regarding more socially based approaches to discourse are explored in order to unearth the essence of how contextualising the discourse used in the
Daily Voice within the Cape Flats displays the various linguistic resources whereupon the Daily Voice taps into. And in so doing, dialogically negotiate and shape Cape Coloured identity. Chapter 2 therefore challenges paradigms that dominate discourse research. This chapter uses approaches suggested by Xu (2007) to support more socio-culturally based methods that consider the cultural and situational status of a discourse. The literature thus foregrounds the need to use alternative but localised methods for bilingual discourse research.

Chapter 3 extends the literature review by addressing the notion of multimodality. Multimodality is explored in terms of how various types of signs collectively work toward constructing meaning and meaning-making options. To understand how these options are realised, this chapter looks toward the value each sign has in terms of its position within the text. Thus the localisation of multimodality within the field of Systemic Functional Linguistics is argued in this section. Kress and Van Leeuwen’s (1996/2006) proposal for a grammar of visual design is used to suggest the value different signs may have in terms of juxtaposition. Following this, the relationship of how signs influence each other within an interactive multimodal environment is addressed under the concept of indexicality. However, the importance of localised interpretation is strongly reiterated throughout this section to show how even multimodal interpretation cannot be fixed without considering the collective meaning multifarious signs have in particularly the Cape Flats.

Chapter 4 provides the analytical frameworks that are used in this study. The chapter draws on MDA and several other interconnected analytical frameworks. These include intertextuality, the importance of schema, framing, indexicality, information value, salience and language devices to name but a few. The chapter identifies how the verbal and visual components construct the meaning-making options that are available to participants by exploring the intersemiotic relationships at hand. The importance of schema or localised background knowledge is highlighted in the framework as it is this knowledge that helps to evaluate how and why the signs are framed or arranged as they are in the Daily Voice. Such understanding also indicates how intertextual references are made and successfully or unsuccessfully interpreted. This chapter also looks to find alternate interpretations of how
linguistic resources are used to construct headlines. Although Reah (2002) provides language devices for headline formulation, this chapter argues against her framework by pointing out how limited her work is in terms of bilingual discourse analysis. All in all this chapter looks to streamline several tools in order to evaluate how Cape Coloured identity is constructed through the *Daily Voice* frontpages.

Chapter 5 outlines the methods of data collection and data analysis. This is a literature based study and therefore there is no requirement for discussing participant observations, interviews or the like. The study is ethnomethodological in nature and will be based on a secondary/desk research approach in that existing *Daily Voice* publications are analysed within particular frameworks. The data collection methods are also expressed in this chapter.

The data analysis is also divided into two chapters. Chapter 6 deals with the multimodal discourse analysis of the semiotic relationship between visual and verbal texts based on juxtaposition and physical features and what potential meaning the layout of each frontpage constructs. This chapter analyses the framing techniques the *Daily Voice* uses and also draws on the visual design proposed by Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006). The key concepts of their design are addressed to analyse the data within these frameworks. Aspects such as the information value, framing and salience are used to analyse how juxtaposition of signs infer particular meanings. Thus the notion of localised indexicalisation is considered to account for the intersemiotic relationships of elements with multimodal *Daily Voice* texts. This chapter significantly illustrates how insufficient Myers-Scotton’s MLF and Markedness theories are when dealing with the data at hand. The use of appraisal as a more suitable framework than those of Myers-Scotton (1993a) is explored in this chapter.

In chapter 7 the data analysis is continued as this study refutes the language devices used in media headlines as are presented by Reah (2002) which in essence separates the notion of intertextuality from other language devices. In this light, the data is analysed using intertextuality as a tool to essentially show that culture specific schemata are integral toward the success of using bilingual discourse in media texts. This chapter sets out to establish that the *Daily Voice* uses linguistic resources that by virtue of hybridity do not fit into
predetermined analytic devices such as those purported by Reah (2002). And so, works toward agreeing with the arguments Xu (2007) uphold for context and cultural specific approaches to bilingual discourse analysis.

Chapter 8 looks to support a monolectal view for bilingual discourse analysis and refute Myers-Scotton’s monolingually biased hypotheses. This section addresses the implications of viewing all hybrid discourse as code-switching of two or more languages and so works to create awareness of viewing hybrid discourse practices as unique interactions independent of hegemonic tenets. The report is concluded by revisiting the limitations and I make suggestions for further research.
Chapter 2

Literature Review

2.0 Introduction

The study is based on four different kinds of literatures spread over two chapters. These pertain to (a) general code-switching and identity construction/deconstruction (negotiation), (b) localisation and contextualisation of discourse, (c) literature on Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) and Multimodal Discourse Analysis (MDA) and (d) features related to media analysis in the print media. The literature review is addressed in two parts. Chapter 2 starts with a critique of Myers-Scotton’s Markedness and MLF models. Her work is challenged in terms of its presumed universality and strong arguments regarding alternate means of evaluating (hybrid) discourse are made. The shortfalls of her models are identified with regard to the contextual nature of the Cape Coloured discourse at hand. The notion of code-switching as a product of mere alternating of separate languages is critiqued and more significantly, arguments for how Cape Coloured discourse should be viewed are stated. Auer, Meeuvis and Blommaert provide the tools needed to refute the proclamations made by Myers-Scotton that code-switching is a systematically predictable process. An alternative view and approach that goes a long way toward understanding the sociolinguistic dynamism of Cape Flats speech performances is presented. This chapter then explores the notion of bilingualism as a social practice and as ideology. Heller, Pavlenko and Blackledge especially, are used to show that such a social approach towards discourse and identity research is better suited to this type of research than approaches that limit and confine research to predictable one to one relationship between language use and identity. This section also establishes the current trends of bilingual media discourse with particular focus on hybrid discourses that have been previously marginalised. The social dynamics that maintain and progress hybrid discourses such as practiced by Cape Coloureds are explored in this section. More significantly awareness and recognition that marginalised discourses need to be assessed according to their own socio-cultural context as opposed to entrenched Western paradigms are strongly suggested in the latter parts of the literature review. Thus, an exploration of what indeed Cape Coloured identity is currently perceived as and perhaps what it could be classified as is addressed.
Chapter 3 expands the literature review by focusing on the notion of multimodality and multimodal texts. Communication in the modern era displays multimodal features and various technologies mean that people are able to regularly interact and share the same linguistic material thus localising it. Therefore, the meaning-making options of such multimodal content offer differing meaning-making options across a broad spectrum of diverse and unique cultures. Chapter 3 thus situates multimodality as being best understood if it is viewed in terms of its specific socio-cultural embeddedness within particular contexts. The SFL literature situates this context dependent interpretation of multimodality. Areas such as Appraisal and Visual Semiotics are also addressed here under the umbrella notion of multimodality.

Thus the literature works toward positioning hybrid discourses as sociolinguistic phenomena that require less rigidly perceived universal theories and instead, more socio-cultural and socio-historic criteria as tools of analysis that are sufficient to account for multimodal communicative means.

2.1 Challenging the Motivations for the Markedness model

Myers-Scotton (1993a) describes and theorises code-switching and provides a general overview. Myers-Scotton (1993b) offers definitions for code-switching that identify the various approaches to understanding code-switching. Here Myers-Scotton takes a deeper look into intrasentential code-switching which she refers to as switches that “occur within the same sentence, from single-morpheme to clause level” (1993a:4). She discusses the Matrix Language Frame Model (MLF). MLF is used to expound examination and explain the dynamics of intersentential code-switching. She also presents a theory known as the Markedness Model. This model explains the reasons speakers interchange between languages whilst communicating. Myers-Scotton (1993a, 1993b) highlights the reasons for the model and also provides the dimensions of such a model with regard to code-switching. The Markedness theory is supposed to identify code-switched patterns and reasons for any of these patterns in order to establish how identities are negotiated.
Myers-Scotton (1993a:73) proposes a markedness model that interprets that “speakers have a sense of markedness regarding available linguistic codes for any interaction, but choose their codes based on the persona and/or relation with others which they wish to have in place”. This model posits that bilingual speech practices are performed as a result of linguistic choices drawn from a pool of two (or more) autonomous codes. She further suggests that speakers are aware of the consequences that their marked or unmarked choices have. Generally, speakers choose to use unmarked choices as a less risky option. However, such conscious and deliberate choices of marked and unmarked bilingual speech suggest that each utterance or instance is an instance of selection. This view of bilingual speech is monolingually and monoculturally partial and too rigid to account for linguistic phenomena that do not conform to a principle that defines code-switching as the alternation of two languages systems.

Myers-Scotton also identifies a markedness metric as being a key component of the markedness model. Briefly stated, this metric forms part of the inborn cognitive ability humans possess. This ability “enables speakers to assess all code choices as more or less unmarked or marked for the exchange type in which they occur” (Myers-Scotton 1993a:80). Even though this metric reinforces the presumed innate ability to understand marked and unmarked codes, the actual degree of competence to adequately interpret codes is gained and groomed through socialisation. In other words, it “is only developed in reference to a specific community through social experience in interactions there” and thus “one can speak of the markedness of a particular code choice only in reference to a specific speech event in a specific community” (1993a:80). However, this metric of markedness does not account for discourses that are monolctal in nature. Instead, all bilingual speech events are viewed as interactions between participants that take turns to draw knowledge from different languages for pre-empted social effect. Thus if English is viewed as the matrix language in a Daily Voice headline, the code-switched embedded item would be from Afrikaans and be measured as a marked instance. However, adopting a monolctal view of such hybrid speech forms would render a markedness metric obsolete as MLF only accounts for alternation of languages within predictable interactions rather than the use of alternative discourse in uniquely constructed contexts. In this light, markedness, if it exists in hybrid discourse, can
be determined only with re-adjusted or new contextually specific theoretical models. This study does not suggest what the alternative is but based on this critique; the markedness model suggested by Myers-Scotton is not comprehensive enough to account for the *Daily Voice* discourse.

Blommaert (in Eastman, 1992:68) claims that “any social group constructs its identity on the basis of the exclusivity of part of its speech repertoire”. This postulation disputes Myers-Scotton regarding elite closure which basically involves institutionalizing the linguistic pattern of the elite, either through official policy of informally established usage norms in order to limit access to socioeconomic mobility and political power to people who possess the requisite linguistic patterns (Eastman, 1992:65).

Blommaert therefore challenges Myers-Scotton’s monolingual notion that only institutionalised languages should be endorsed in higher functions such as print media. Instead, Blommaert’s observation supports the argument that the *Daily Voice* confronts the hegemonic status quo by using an alternative discourse that is void of dissecting any segment of bilingual speech into a ranking of linguistic importance. In other words, any arguments surrounding which language/code is the matrix and which is the embedded dissipate if the hybrid discourse is viewed as a monolectal practice.

Blommaert adds that code-switching is socially meaningful as a result of the social history of relations amongst group members and users of the shared linguistic repertoires. Therefore, the code-switching in the *Daily Voice* needs to be understood not just from a morpho-syntactic point of view, but as will be addressed further below, from socio-historic; socio-economic and sociopolitical angles as well.

### 2.2 Exploring the shortfalls of the Markedness Model

It is imperative to remain cognisant that the inclusion of Myers-Scotton serves to underline just how vital it is to adopt new social approaches to hybrid discourses rather than to blindly
assume that theories such as hers are universally applicable. Thus a multimodal discourse analysis of alternative discourse and identity construction is in fact the true essence of this undertaking and so the limitations of her approaches are realised through the analysis and critiques of her views. She discusses a markedness model that puts into effect the previously mentioned markedness metric. In essence there are three maxims namely, the unmarked-choice maxim; the marked-choice maxim and the exploratory-choice maxim. These maxims draw upon a negotiation principle that states:

Choose the form of your conversation such that it indexes the set of rights and obligations which you wish to be in force between speaker and addressee for the current exchange (1993a:113).

According to Myers-Scotton this maxim directs speakers to “Make your code choice the unmarked index of the unmarked RO set in talk exchanges when you wish to establish or affirm that RO set” (1993a:114). She defines an RO set as “an abstract construct, derived from situational factors, standing for the attitudes and expectations of participants towards one another” (1993a:85). Both sequential unmarked code-switching and code-switching as unmarked choice seem to depend on the nature of interaction between participants and how speakers choose codes to send messages, the choice receivers use to answer the original speakers and then in turn which code the secondary receivers choose to once again converse. With regard to sequential unmarked choices situational changes tend to change the RO of participants. In terms of code-switching as unmarked choice, it is common in bi/multilingual communities to use two languages in the same interaction or conversation. Myers-Scotton outlines the following four conditions that need to be adhered to for unmarked code-switching to occur (note that the term participants is used to adapt to the Daily Voice readership):

- Speakers or participants need to be bilingual peers of similar or equal socio-economic status.
- Speakers or participants need to show willingness to exhibit the dual membership features of a code-switched interaction.
• Speakers or participants need to positively assess “their own identities in this type of interaction the indexical values of the varieties used in the switching” and need not have proficiency in both languages.

• The level of proficiency speakers or participants possess is at this juncture an immeasurable variable as there exists no standard criteria (1993a:119).

These conditions treat code-switching as an instance of turn taking between participants and views participants as agents who are forced to shift between identities within a bilingual communicative event. If participants do not require proficiency in both languages as is aforementioned, why is there a necessity to share the same background and possess dual membership? Adopting a monolectal (single code) approach would nullify the necessity “to show willingness to exhibit the dual membership features of a code-switched interaction”. It will also squash the static notion of proclaiming that proficiency of two autonomous systems is required even though these proficiencies are in effect immeasurable due to the lack of “standard criteria”. Standard would entail some form of hegemonic universal theory that is in effect unable to even measure the predetermined ideologies that would inspire such decrees. Therefore, the lack of standard criteria cannot justify why proficiency of two languages is immeasurable, instead it highlights the superfluous nature of trying to pre-pack unique social performances to fit monolingually biased frameworks. Accepting the absence of “standard criteria” as reasons for immeasurability underlines such monolingual partiality. Myers-Scotton’s view does not view code-switching as a social practice, as a process within communicative events where people (from backgrounds that are not necessarily identical) interact and contextually negotiate and construct meaning. Therein lays the need for case-by-case analysis and interpretation of bilingual speech events.

Myers-Scotton contends that all motivations for marked code-switching can be explained under a general single reason which is “to negotiate a change in the expected social distance holding between participants, either increasing or decreasing it” (1993a:132). This single reason considers other motivations such as indicating anger or affectionate emotions as well as setting power relations and due to many contestations from other linguists the above-mentioned motivation is more general than completely all encompassing. The markedness
model thus assumes that code-switching can be intentional or unintentional and either way carries different pre-determined forms of motivation and meaning. That is, deliberate code-switching may signal power relations or participant exclusion/inclusion etc and vice-versa with regard to unintentional code-switching. This is problematic as measuring and exacting a participant’s intentions and her/his expectations as to how other participants should interpret the code-switching are immeasurable. Stroud contends that:

the problem of intention and meaning in code-switching is the problem of knowing to what extent the intentions and meanings that we assign to switches can in fact be said to be intended by a speaker or apprehended by his or her interlocutors (1992:131).

Thus categorised motivations may well give an idea of why code-switching would take place but measuring the level of the intentions is not possible especially if bilingual speech is dissected into constituents rather than be understood as a packaged practice.

2.3 The feasibility of code-switching in dynamic social interactions

Myers-Scotton identifies two types of code-switching, namely intersentential and intrasentential. She defines intersentential code-switching as “switches from one language to the other between sentences” whereas intrasentential code-switching is referred to as switches occurring within the exactly same sentence, from a single-morpheme to clause level” (1993a:4). However, some academics prefer the term code-mixing “to describe changes at the word level (e.g. when one word or a few words in a sentence change)” (Baker 2006:110). This is more or less the same as intrasentential and any instances resembling these concepts will be referred to as intrasentential. These observations regarding types of code-switching are monolingually based and identifiable in contexts that are predictable and used by participants with predictable performative linguistic traits.

This leads to a critique of Myers-Scotton’s RO sets (rights and obligations). She views RO sets as the schemata participants have regarding individual roles and expectations of what she sees as predictable and fixed structure of interactional events that generally occur. However, the situational factors she refers to do not accommodate the realities of interaction that
transpire in multicultural and multilingual societies. The nature of situations may differ and change as a result of a plethora of factors. Contexts are not and cannot be fixed or remain stagnant to accommodate such a theory because meaning can be constructed even when communicative events are distorted or meaning can be misconstrued within interactions where participants uphold the hierarchical positions that RO sets constitute. Also, Myers-Scotton’s arguments regarding RO sets present code-switching as the use of two institutionalised languages the choice of which is a function of how one language is positioned as more dominant than the other. This type of canonised thinking only serves to support the notion that monolingual competencies justify hierarchical and marginalised positioning of languages. Such ranking of importance is biased and deviates from how meaning is constructed contextually.

Pavlenko and Blackledge highlight their agreement with Auer (1995, 1998a) that analysing the macro-sociolinguistic aspects of various speech situations, the Daily Voice frontpages in this instance, “will never predict or determine patterns of code-switching and language choice” (2006:10). Auer raises the question of whether code-switching or code-mixing belongs to grammar or performance as well as where one language stops and another begins. He also poses whether the languages used in bilingual talk are the same as those used in monolingual talk (2007:337). These questions challenge morphosyntactic discourse analysis as well as the monolingual bias used to explore the area of bilingualism.

As a result Pavlenko and Blackledge prefer to adopt poststructuralist approaches in their studies. They explore how negotiation and construction of languages are achieved by exploring identities as performative actions where identity negotiation is embedded in discourse rather than rigidly fitted into pre-existing and contextually distanced criteria. The poststructuralist approach thus considers the socio-historically moulded bias, contestability, unsteadiness, and changeability of ways in which language ideologies and identities are connected to power relations and political arrangements in communities and societies. In accordance with this approach this study also provides a socio-historic context that provides both previous and current grounding of the target audience. In other words a brief history of
the Cape Coloured community is included in order to show how relevant a poststructuralist approach is towards this research undertaking.

Pavlenko and Blackledge add that

> any analysis of language practices needs to examine how conventions of language choice and use are created, maintained, and changed, to see how language ideologies legitimize and validate particular practices, and to understand real-world consequences these practices have in people’s lives (2006:12).

This citation validates the need to go beyond merely analysing code-switched practices but instead look toward how language choice and use is negotiated in various social, cultural and physical settings. Therefore Pavlenko and Blackledge endorse Heller’s (1992) claim that “code-switching needs to be examined not as a unique phenomenon but as a part of a series of linguistic practices that people use to realize their goals and to defy hegemony and domination” (2006:12). An outcome of this approach is the consideration for new identity options arising out of linguistic performances that undermine “dominant discourses of identity” (2006:12). Alternative code becomes a tool through which to explore how suppressed and marginalised groups and individuals negotiate identities in multilingual contexts. This contradicts Myers-Scotton’s views that assume code-switching as unique and inflexible alternation of autonomous language systems.

Auer (1998) argues that code-switching should be viewed as “(part of a) verbal action” that generates social and communicative meaning. The verbal texts provide several resource options to participants to engage in performative linguistic practices within socio-cultural specific contexts. This study therefore explores verbal and visual texts in the *Daily Voice* as they reflect and replicate familiar Cape Coloured discourse.

Code-switching as seen from more entrenched interactional or interpretive approaches is roughly viewed as linguistically systematic and predictable alternating of two (or more) codes. As this study is essentially ethnomethodological, the structure and the social and cultural embeddedness of code-switching are more significant. This type of approach also
acknowledges that code-switching is a process that is localised and context dependent especially as various scenarios within the same setting may involve diverse linguistic and identity negotiations. This study however, does not blindly accept the views of Auer and loosely reject that of Myers-Scotton. Instead, it critiques and refutes the notion as held by Myers-Scotton that code-switching is wholesomely defined as the mere mixing of separate autonomous codes, English and Afrikaans in this instance. Whilst the Daily Voice headlines can be categorised into two separate language systems and indeed it is possible to identify the linguistic origin of several morphemic units within a single lexical item, such dissection does not explain how culturally specific meaning is construed. Such observations therefore reinforce a notion that aspects of Daily Voice language use elevate Cape Coloured discourse to a single code rather than position these linguistic practices as the mixture of two codes. Viewing bilingual conversations or performances as systematic alternating of two codes means that the speech/written segments are treated in terms of its make up of two distinct languages. This type of monolingually biased analysis obscures understanding of the meaning-making processes involved.

Also, it would mean all speech involving bilingual speech would indeed be viewed as code-switching and hence only the nature or type of code-switching may be explored. Instead, it is more contentious maybe, but refreshingly critical to view different bilingual speech instances independent of presumed universal principles of discourse analysis research. And so Myers-Scotton’s postulations provide a platform from which to launch discussions supporting the views of Auer, Meeuwis and Blommaert in particular regarding code-switching.

Meeuwis and Blommaert counter that code-switching should be described as a “phenomenon emerging out of the alternation of linguistic material stemming from two (or more) closed, fixed languages or grammatical systems that are fully known to speakers who perform code-switching” (1998:76). Thus Myers-Scotton’s view that code-switching is the alternation of two languages or codes is questioned. Instead, Meeuwis and Blommaert argue that a monolectal view of code-switching be adopted (1998). Using a monolectal view permits researchers to view code-switched practices as an independent system that functions according to its individual structures and rules.
It also means that code-switching as a monol ect does not purport that those speakers who code-switch, are speakers of the languages (or codes) involved in the bilingual speech. In other words, *Daily Voice* readers who code-switch are not necessarily speakers of both standard English and standard Afrikaans. Viewing code-switching as “a combination of monolingual repertoires and competences” also does not specify or elaborate on the level of competence of all languages involved in a particular variety of code-switching (Meeuwis and Blommaert, 1998:80). Therefore, how competent would *Daily Voice* readers have to be in both standard English and standard Afrikaans? Given the quality of education of Cape Flats residents in both pre and post apartheid the area does not guarantee strong levels of competence in both these languages. Also, does a monolingual view of code-switching consider variations other than hegemonic standard varieties of English and Afrikaans?

Meeuwis and Blommaert (1998) declare that a monolectal view entails that code-switched speech practices can be varieties of their own and not be connected or governed by the complete knowledge of two separate languages. Thus code-switched speech may well be a language much like English, Afrikaans, isiXhosa etc. A monolectal view does not dismiss Myers-Scotton’s work entirely as her suggestions merely represent one approach toward using code-switching. Therefore tools such as MLF and the markedness model are not all encompassing and should be seen as exceptions rather than universal approaches to code-switching analysis.

Meeuwis and Blommaert (1998) also argue that code-switched forms may not be marked according to particular contexts and functions but may well be the default rule of speaking. Thus a monolectal view does not stipulate that each instance of code-switching is an indicator of markedness or construction of identity in a way that deliberately excludes or includes other participants. Such preconceived reasons for code-switching may well deter researchers with regard to how the code-switched speech is produced, interpreted and used as a social practice to facilitate exchange of meaning.

A monolectal view of code-switching in the *Daily Voice* goes a long way toward breaking down prejudices (covert or obvious) that impede discourse analysis research of hybrid
speech. Thus terms such as non-standard, standard and vernacular are inspired by biased monolingual and canonised colonial ideals that have been (and still are) used to explore discourses of socio-politically oppressed and marginalised communities. Sociolinguistic prejudices that proclaim competence of the politically standardised varieties of languages involved in code-switching fall flat if and when a monolectal approach is endorsed.

The title of Adhikari’s book “Not White Enough Not Black Enough” emphasises (perhaps indirectly) how linguistically, Cape Coloured speech practices have been viewed: not being English speaking enough and not being Afrikaans speaking enough. A monolectal approach, especially given South Africa’s political ghosts that still haunt the nation, does open potential avenues that may lead to defining what it means to be South African and indeed what it means to be Cape Coloured.

Pavlenko and Blackledge (2006) therefore show keen interest in highlighting previously marginalised hybrid identities and argue for a move away from essentialist constructions that have dominated discourse research. Their proposed framework combines a social constructionist focus and a poststructuralist focus and has five key features. These are:

- **Ideologies of language** which are based on a social constructionist view that discourses within particular languages provide the terms and other linguistic means that help negotiate and construct identities (Pavlenko and Blackledge 2006). This notion of exploring discourse in relation to location is also addressed by Scollon and Scollon (2003) in this study.
- **The notion that identities are embedded within power relations** is a feature that allows for the analysis of how discourse embedded within local and global relations of power that affect the lives of those who practice the discourse (Pavlenko and Blackledge 2006). This feature however, is not extensively explored in the data although it is used to address the relationship between the Daily Voice and its readers.
- **A third feature looks at the multiplicity and fragmentation of hybrid identities.** In other words, the relation between language and identities is more complex and
variable than the conventional rigidity that encouraged previous considerations for this relation. Pavlenko and Blackledge state

Poststructuralist inquiry highlights the fact that identities are constructed at the interstices of multiple axes, such as age, race, class, ethnicity, gender, generation, sexual orientation, geopolitical locale, institutional affiliation, on social status, whereby each aspect of identity redefines and modifies all others” (2006:16).

Hybridity is posited as the “third space” that results from fragmentation hence the necessity to steer away from rigid forms of recognition, acceptance and exploration of the roles of other variables. Exploring hybridity affords recognition to emerging identity options and linguistic repertoires that have previously been ignored (2006:16).

- The fourth feature addresses identities and imagination. Pavlenko and Blackledge (2006) emphasise the important role imagination plays in developing new identity options. New imagined communities are developed through new linguistic terms, literary narratives and visual art. These features provide new options of self-representation (2006). The *Daily Voice* adopts a multimodal approach through particular uses of colour and images. Likewise, although not part of this study, each edition of the *Daily Voice* carries a section titled “Rek Jou Bek” [(have your say/open your mouth/stretch your mouth, see figure 2.0) the word “Bek” is used to describe the mouth of an animal more often than that of a human, however it is commonly used on the Cape Flats] that creates a forum for readers to SMS their views on various local, national and global topics. More importantly, readers ‘discuss’ these issues with the *Daily Voice* and with each other, often replying to previously published SMSes from fellow readers or articles in the *Daily Voice*.

- The fifth feature refers to identity narratives. Pavlenko and Blackledge state “new narratives and images offer a way to impose an imaginary coherence on the experience of a dispersal and fragmentation, which is the history of all diasporas” (2006:19). The *Daily Voice* currently stirs the proverbial pot in the South African media fraternity with what many view as sensationalist use of images and cultural metaphors. The “diasporas” referred to above may well be likened to the heterogeneous make up of communities. Also, Cape Coloureds do not behave the
same way in all contexts; however texts construct them as a coherent group. In this light Pavlenko and Blackledge “view identities as social, discursive, and narrative options offered by a particular society in a specific time and place to which individuals appeal in an attempt to self name, to self-characterize, and to claim social spaces and social prerogatives” (2006:19). This component of the framework could be more suited to exploration of longer texts of the Daily Voice. However, the same ideals regarding discourse of particular groups in particular places at particular times still apply.

2.4 Identity Options
Pavlenko and Blackledge distinguish between continuous construction and performance of identities and the negotiation of identities when contested, but choose to focus on the latter. Similarly this study explores any contestation in the negotiation process. They identify three types of identity namely, imposed; assumed and negotiable (2006:21). Imposed identities are non-negotiable in a particular place and time. Assumed identities are accepted and not negotiable whereas negotiable identities are contested by groups and individuals.

Pavlenko and Blackledge postulate that code-switching (and the like) in bilingualism literature is not the only means of negotiating identities as the “invention and use of new linguistic varieties” are also other means of doing so (2006:23). The Daily Voice uses images in addition to alternative linguistic repertoires of Cape Coloureds as a new way to construct the newness and inventive nature of Cape Flats discourse. It can be argued that this is another way in which the different Cape Flats identities are constructed and negotiated. This is also in line with Pavlenko and Blackledge who argue that negotiating identities in multilingual contexts “is much more nuanced and allows for a more complex and rich understanding of particular negotiations” (2006:27).
2.5 Bi/Multilingualism as social practice

2.5.1 Bi/Multilingualism as ideology

Heller aims to steer perceptions of bilingualism “towards a more processual and materialist approach which privileges language as social practice, speakers as social actors and boundaries as products of social action” (2007:1). Thus languages and language uses are products of performative social functions rather than rigid hegemonic systems. Heller views bi/multilingualism as ‘social practice’ by stating that “understanding language as a set of ideologically-defined resources and practices constructs language as fundamentally social phenomenon” (2007:2). Thus focusing on speaker performances rather than on ideological views of autonomous linguistic systems challenges the need to explore language as whole systems. Heller adds that bi/multilingualism is also a linguistic resource which allows speakers to perform different identity options in various social contexts. Heller notes that:

The emergence of traces of different languages in the speech of individual bilinguals goes against the expectation that languages will neatly correspond to separate domains, and stay put where they are meant to stay put (2007:11).

Heller also views bilingual speakers “as social actors within social networks, engaged in the practice of making meaning, and those concerned with conversation, or discourse itself, as a site of meaning-making” (2007:12). What this entails is that people are engaged in interaction on a level where meaning is negotiated rather than fixed. It also means that standard mainstream newspapers are pitted against a tabloid like the Daily Voice which uses localised discourses. Such opposition of different ideologies highlights the cultural dynamism of discourse and the struggles non-Western discourses face in being acknowledged.

2.5.2 Bi/Multilingualism as linguistic resource

Auer (2007) explores the problems that still exist in analysing bi/multilingual data especially if theories pertaining to monolingual research are used as the basis for this type of analysis. Auer maintains that monolingual approaches are inadequate to determine the structures of bi/multilingual discourses. Bilingualism (and indeed code-switching) should not be seen as a form of double monolingualism where two (or more) individual linguistic systems merely mix as separate entities but be seen as a sociolinguistic phenomenon that merits an objective
approach to evaluate its dynamism. Simply, “ambiguous stretches of talk between language A and language B not only ‘happen’ but are made to happen by the speakers” (2007:326). This reiterates the aforementioned speaker centred approach or as Auer describes participant-oriented where the focus of bi/multilingual research should be on how, when, to whom, with whom and why speakers use language(s) as a resource in various socio-cultural contexts and not so much which linguistic systems speakers use.

Cape Coloureds do not simply choose to mix varieties of Afrikaans and English but instead their choices are drawn from the linguistic resources available to them in various contexts. Although Myers-Scotton (1993a) argues that code-switching is determined by participants involved in particular social and physical contexts, Auer (2007) argues that code-switching itself can simply be viewed as a stretch of bilingual talk or interaction. Based on Auer’s observations the ensuing analysis of the Daily Voice frontpages will reinforce “that the starting point of bilingual analyses can no longer be two languages, but rather a collection of discursive and linguistic practices used by bilingual speakers in a community, and based on certain grammatical/lexical/phonological feature constellations” (2007:337). Nevertheless, Myers-Scotton’s approaches and theories are explored to establish the degree of efficacy using biased-monolingual criteria to determine the value and function of hybrid bilingual discourse forms. This socio-cultural specificity is developed across time by bilingual speakers and in the case of Cape Coloureds their linguistic repertoires are consequent of the social contexts wherein this group reside.

2.6 Bi/Multilingual media discourse

The notions of hybrid discourse are now discussed in relation to media so as to contextualise how the Daily Voice achieves constructing Cape Coloured identity as seen from a sociolinguistic perspective. Jannis Androutsopolous (2007) attempts to bridge the gap between bilingualism and media discourse. Androutsopolous discusses how bilingualism currently functions in modern day mass media and the internet. In addressing linguistic resources in media discourse, Androutsopolous covers various media formats ranging from the film industry, music to advertising. These areas exhibit global bilingual or multilingual trends that are influencing both linguistic and media landscapes. As shall be evident below
his arguments resonate with those of Heller (2007) and Auer (2007) on bilingualism as a linguistic resource even in media discourse. He states “media discourse strengthen the impression that linguistic diversity is gaining an unprecedented visibility in the media landscapes of the late twentieth century and early twenty-first century” (2007:207). The media is traditionally linked to using monolingual forms of communication in ways that perpetuate the political ideals of nation-states and the elite. However, the “gradual shift in the sociolinguistic condition of a domain that has traditionally been dominated by the ideologies and practices of monolingualism” now allows previously marginalised linguistic varieties, and (ethnic) user groups of these languages, access to public spheres that were (and in many instances still are) monopolised by higher powers (Androutsopolous 2007:207). Music lyrics, films, television shows, mainstream/broadsheet and tabloid newspapers, commercial and community radio programmes, advertising, and the internet and to an extent, literature, globally show influences of cross linguistic mixing or code-switching. This is in line with Heller and Auer’s postulations that language use/choices do not neatly correspond with domains or rigid hegemonic systems. That is, minority languages are used in texts previously reserved for formalised ‘colonial’ languages.

The connection between notions of hybrid discourse and the media is supported by Androutsopolous who argues that bilingualism in the media is a social practice because there is a reliance on connecting with audiences’ schemata and previous texts and discourse that audiences have experienced. Androutsopolous seeks to advance

an understanding of bilingualism in the media as a set of processes by which institutional and vernacular media actors draw on linguistic resources from their own inheritance, their social environment and the wider semiotic flows they have access to in order to construct textures and voices that mediate and balance between immediate communicative exigencies, market expectations and loyalties to local and imagined communities (2007:225).

This citation captures key arguments including the importance of studying bilingual practices according to the relevant environments and conditions wherein these practices occur and the importance of media actors to understand the socio-cultural significance of the linguistic
resources available to them. It is only once Androutsopolous and Heller’s argument regarding bi/multilingualism as social practice is understood that a multimodal analysis containing hybrid linguistic elements can be undertaken.

Due to changing conditions of media production and reception, “the commercial media sector is customising its output for ever smaller target groups” and therefore “niche media emerge that exclusively address minority groups” (Androutsopolous 2007:208). Androutsopolous’ arguments are relevant to this study in that the Daily Voice exhibits the sociolinguistic functions as is generalised across his article regarding various mass media platforms. The Daily Voice also claims to represent an “ever smaller target group”. Given that “bilingual media discourse is a little-explored area in sociolinguistics and discourse studies” (2007:208), this study uses Androutsopolous’ observations and extends the salient features towards a specific mass media genre as well as a specific minority group. That is, linking the change and how it is both affected and effected by the sociolinguistic dynamics of a specific group, the Cape Coloured community. As Auer (2007) contends, the conversational use of hybrid discourse does not necessarily mean that the bilingual speech can be meaningfully categorised into two separate languages. Instead the meaning constructed and negotiated from bilingual speech is achieved through the hybrid nature of the alternative discourse rather than be achieved of conjoined meaning of two language systems.

Androutsopolous therefore argues that it is better

to examine the how and whys of the strategic selection, combination and transformation of linguistic resources in particular discursive spaces of mediated communication instead of comparing CS in the media to CS in face-to-face interaction (2007:209).

He adds that “understanding the nature of these spaces can help us comprehend how the media shape public images of bilingualism and how they might be used to challenge and alter these images” (2007:209).
Androuutsopolous provides a set of categories deemed suitable for the study of bilingual media. He discusses the following:

- Pertinent units of analysis.
- The distinction between societal and impersonal bilingualism.
- The impact of different media sectors on bilingual practices.
- Relevant media genres.
- Patterns of language contact in media language.
- The relationship of bilingual practices to the performance and design on social identities (2007:210).

This study, much like Androuutsopolous’ research, is limited to particular units of the *Daily Voice*. He states that his “approach to bilingualism in the mass media and on the internet focuses on manifest choices and juxtapositions of languages within units of text or talk that are delimited from other similar units in their particular context” (2007:210). Therefore, the frontpages are the chosen units and not the entire tabloid. There are two presuppositions that this study is faced with. Firstly, there are negative stereotypes regarding Cape Coloured discourse (or any minority group for that matter). This is often due to preconceived notions and prescribed and ascribed identities to Cape Flats people. Secondly, there are the negative perceptions of tabloids that exist in the media fraternity both nationally and internationally. Thus a tabloid that reflects Cape Coloured linguistic repertoires is almost inherently seen as loaded with negativities that need to be broken down in order to further sociolinguistic research and analysis without prejudice, as a way to come up with a comprehensive understanding of Cape Flats discourse and its people.

Androuutsopolous (2007) argues vehemently that exploring bilingualism in the media is hampered by preconceived attitudes that interpret hybrid language practices as impure sociolinguistic practices rather than viewing these as unique cultural speech forms.
Androuutsopolous states that minority language media offer monolingual output in the minority language (or dedicated slots for minority content), but languages remain separated. Any closer linguistic encounters that might occur are ignored. In fact, when code-switching, interference or
other language contact phenomena are mentioned at all, they are obstacles to ‘clean’
broadcast to be erased by editing, or potential agents of minority language decay”

Statements like this fail to adequately explore bilingualism within each literacy interaction of
the data. And in this way Androutsopolous highlights the importance to go beyond simply
viewing minority language media as substandard but rather to look at the performative nature
of the language/s used.

It is therefore important to recognise the two types of bilingualism that Androutsopolous
discusses, namely societal and impersonal bilingualism. Societal bilingualism is considered
to be “bilingual text and talk in the media” that in some way reflects “bilingual practices of
the society in which they are produced and consumed” (2007:211). For example, this refers
to how the Daily Voice uses speech patterns common to the Cape Flats. Thus the verbal and
visual text that are used in the Daily Voice should in relation to Androutsopolous, be in sync
to meanings these multimodal texts have within the community in which they are produced
and to which they are targeted. Impersonal bilingualism however, shows “a media use of
languages that are not anchored in the speech community but understood as belonging to
another society and culture” (2007:211). Thus an impersonal approach to bilingualism in the
media would entail using analytical methods common to other newspapers and indeed	abloids that are not contextualised within the Cape Flats. In other words, analysing the Daily
Voice using frontpage layout trends common to publications that are not aimed or embedded
within Cape Coloured culture, would de-contextualise the meaning-making and identity
negotiation processes. This in turn would leave an empty interpretation and misguided
assessment of just how the Daily Voice achieves its goals as a newspaper.

Androutsopolous also discusses the notion of minimal bilingualism being used in the media
discourse. He makes reference as to how audiences’ linguistic competence is perceived as
limited and that bilingual language use functions as a framing device. With reference to this
Androutsopolous (2007:214) cites Coupland (2003:167) as saying that “tiny amounts of a
second language are positioned at the margins of text and talk units, and thereby evoke social
identities and relationships associated with the minimally used language”. In other words,
bilingual or minority language code-switched elements are mere tokens. However, the ensuing analysis points toward a less straightforward summation of how code-switching is used in the Daily Voice. Likewise, the evocation of social identities is explored.

AndrouTsopoulous (2007) identifies three types of media sectors that form different relationships with respective audiences.

- The Public Sector which “conceive of their audience as citizens of the nation-state”. It functions in order to inform, entertain and educate the public (2007:211).
- The Commercial Sector which tend to “promote consumerism rather than focus on issues salient to public media” (2007:211).
- The Private Non-Commercial Sector which is “considered to be the emerging ‘third sector’ in that it offers a forum to social groups that have traditionally been excluded from the public sphere” (2007:211). This sector is a melange of public media where meaningful audience oriented content is used although “audiences are encouraged to participate actively” as a result of this “egalitarian” focus (2007:212).

However, the relationship between the various media sectors and the bilingual practices are more intricate and complex.

This brings the discussion to the nature of this study as a social-based approach which is more apt as the Daily Voice is analysed as a tabloid that reflects Cape Coloured linguistic repertoires. In so doing, Coloured discourse is performed in what can be considered a ‘third space’ (cf Bhabha 1994) as a form of counter hegemonic discourse. Pavlenko and Blackledge (2004) contend that:

For Bhabha, negotiation of identity for minority populations involves creating an in-between or liminal space of culture—a ‘third space’—in which the fixed identities of the traditional societal order do not hold sway, and hybrid identities can be performed and affirmed. Such a space is constituted temporally through the re-appropriation and transformation of cultural symbols, including language, which are made to mean in new ways (2004:96).
The *Daily Voice* is sold and advertised in many areas of Cape Town other than the Cape Flats. Even though it could be argued that the *Daily Voice* uses Cape Coloured discourse as a linguistic tool specifically and selectively to achieve commercial media goals across various public spheres and spaces it is only the Cape Coloured that will find it readily accessible in terms of understanding the discourse.

Bhatt (2008) investigates how Hindi is used in English newspapers in India, largely to establish that code-switching creates a discursive third space. This notion of third space is developed by Bhabha (1994) and refers to how hybrid discourse creates a liminal space where participants negotiate their identities as social acts through ever evolving community practices. Effectively, it can be argued that the ‘third space’ utilised by papers such as the *Daily Voice*, becomes the space for the marginalised. Effectively the ‘third space’ becomes the space for the marginalised.

Bhatt states that “the potential incommensurability of differently located identities is accommodated in the third space” (2008:178). The *Daily Voice* offers the marginalised Cape Coloureds voice and agency. The *Daily Voice* acts as a new form through which localised Cape Coloured culture and (re)positions this group’s collective identity within a liminal space. Thus the combination of a local discourse and a relatively young tabloid work toward constructing new meanings in a social environment where identities are continually negotiated not just because of interaction but also because South Africans themselves are in the process of re-shaping a near nation like identity.

The *Daily Voice* connects traditions and localised ideologies about the world with newer global ideologies and this process gives rise to new understandings of agency which in turn avails new identity options. In other words, linguistic hybridity coupled with modern approaches to multimodal text representation allows for changing social practices of literacy, and acts as a catalyst toward identity (re)positioning between people. Shared spaces and broader communal practices lead to the facilitation of different social identities and meaning-making.
Similar to Bhatt’s focus this study also establishes (a) the emergence of an alternative socio-ideological awareness, (b) an alternative means of negotiating and exploring local practices and an almost global Cape Coloured identity and (c) the monolectal dynamism of Cape Coloured discourse as one role player in transforming the linguistic and media landscape of the Western Cape and South African media industry.

Thus the notion of third space does not constrain the ethnomethodological explorations of hybrid discourse to rigidly pre-selected and dominant paradigms but instead moves towards changing non-localised frameworks by providing more options. This statement is inspired by much of what Xu (2007) advocates in his efforts for embracing context specific discourse analysis. People and their discourses cannot be defined by others who merely look in but as Xu (2007) reiterates, people should indeed be part of the process that defines and forms their respective discourses according to their specific situation. In this way there is a convergence of the global and local perspectives. It is argued in this study that Cape Coloured discourse hybridity is thus a third space code and the Daily Voice serves as a medium that attempts to immerse a hybrid identity within a modern multicultural context of the Cape Flats. In this regard the socio-historic context of Cape Coloured discourse is what inspires the content of leading stories and issues undertaken in the Daily Voice.

2.7 Discourse and socio-cultural contexts

In analysing identity negotiation on the Cape Flats, it is necessary to localise and contextualise the Daily Voice discourse. Xu (2007) argues how Western paradigms are not universally sufficient or applicable to all contexts. Xu does not subscribe to Western dominant ideologies and encourages a culturalist direction in discourse research going “beyond the a-culturalist and binary tradition and explore human discourses as dialectic wholes” (2007:3). Xu’s main aim is to establish that human discourses in the contemporary world are sites of cultural contest to all persons. That is, human discourses are saturated with power and history and therefore diversified, dynamic and competing. Because of this, new, locally grounded and globally minded perspectives and techniques must be reconstructed in order to make proper sense of culturally different, “other” discourses, especially those of hitherto neglected, marginalized,
repressed, non-Western/Third-/Fourth-World groups and the communities, on the one hand, and on the other hand, to help promote new discourses of cultural cohesion and progress (2007:3).

Xu (2007) also seeks to (a) undermine existing discourses of domination and exclusion, (b) help reclaim identities and experiences of the already disadvantaged and marginalised, (c) identify and advocate positive discourses of harmony and (d) create new discourses of cultural solidarity and prosperity.

In his work Discourse as Cultural Struggle Xu (2007) considers (a) larger cultural-intellectual context and the practical international situation that will show deeper and broader significance of the present endeavour, and (b) outline general theoretical and methodological frameworks that will prepare the way for various kinds of culturalist discourse studies to follow. Xu states that discourse is unduly based on “integration, standardization, and universality of theories, methods, and research questions” (2007:4). This rigid approach furthers the “cultural interests of knowledge and information control and ultimately cultural power and domination” (2007:4). Xu stresses the importance for both Western and non-Western academics to reshape the moulds of Westernised theoretical frameworks and research methodologies that claim universal efficiency and instead seek to “reconstruct cultural-intellectual heritages” according to particular contexts. In this way, a “global discourse of academic hegemony” starts to break down and previously marginalised groups may develop resources to “maintain their own identity or make their voices heard” (2007:5). And so Xu estimates that “repression of culturally different communities and their discourse,” will diminish (2007:5). Therefore Xu is consistent in his argument that “the discourses of non-Western, Third and Fourth World countries must not be ignored any longer or still seen from traditional, culturally singular perspectives” (2007:5). This is critical to fully appreciate not only the Daily Voice discourse but the Cape identities and cultures from which it draws inspiration.
2.8 Discourse as Cultural Struggle
Xu discusses the following four points to highlight the non-universality of theories of discourse:

- Firstly, the understanding of discourse as a concept varies and therefore the idea of discourse cannot claim universality based solely on Western interpretation.

- Secondly, Xu adds that there is “diversity of discourses with different or even mutually exclusive contents by different groups and communities in contemporary culture” (2007:7). Xu also states that discourses may well be restricted to certain communities and so exclude others or deny access to these discourses to non-members of particular communities (2007:7).

- Thirdly, the reality that competing or opposing discourses about “the same or similar topic” exist and so perceived universal theoretical frameworks may lead to bias in terms of interpretation between ‘competing’ discourses (2007:7).

- “Fourthly, there is a historical dimension to the cultural diversity and struggle of human discourses” (2007:7). Xu postulates that according to Foucaultian thought, human discourses evolve through time “thus, if our present and past discourses have been characterized by cultural prejudice, division and domination, and the peoples from the non-Western, non-white, Third Worlds silenced, repressed, and alienated” then academics of discourse should look to promote the reconstruction, rediscovery and nurture of new cultural discourses (2007:7).

Xu identifies five salient culturalist strategies when addressing discourse research. Firstly, researchers should draw upon culturally different ways of knowing and respect other ways of knowing. Secondly, researchers should ground theory in a particular cultural and historical context. Researchers of discourse as dialectic wholes of texts and historical and cultural relations should “guard against universalizing tendencies” but instead accommodate different cultural perspectives (2007:9). Thirdly, researchers should “not confine themselves to pre-determined, perennial or popular research agendas but commit cultural concerns of the moment” (2007:9). In other words, contemporary and fresh discourses as that represented by
the *Daily Voice* should be recognised and evaluated on its own sociolinguistic merit. In this way researchers give voice to culturally marginalised discourses in and through discourse research. Fourthly, researchers should not rely on any pre-determined, fixed and universal methodologies but contextualise their methods that are appropriate to the socio-cultural, socio-historic and objectives relevant to particular studies (2007). Fifthly, researchers should avoid replicating dominant and repressive forms of language as much as possible. Instead, researchers should use a form of academic discourse that is egalitarian, inclusive, critical and culturally pluralistic (2007:10).

Xu’s (2007) arguments underscore the importance of reflexivity in discourse analysis as a way to understand the full implications of contestations in discourse. The notion of Cape Coloured identity and discourse practices are themselves sites of struggle. McCormick provides discussions regarding code-switching in an historic area, District Six, where the interchangeable use of English and Afrikaans was indicative of the discourse practices of a mixed community dominated by Cape Coloureds (1995/2002). Having collected data in the District Six remnant area across a period spanning nearly two decades dating from the 1980s, McCormick explores the language use in this settlement. Against the backdrop of a socio-political contextualisation, the author explores the types of languages used, or dialects thereof, and how these variations are valued by the participants of the study. These variations include standard and non-standard versions of Afrikaans and English. McCormick uses the term “vernacular” to refer to the non-standard variations of the languages (1995:199). These participants of course are seen as samples of Cape Coloured discourse practices and through McCormick’s interviews they evaluate their own use of and attitudes toward the language variations. McCormick’s work gives an historic account of the development of Kaapse Afrikaans and is linked to the study in this way. However, the term “vernacular” has negative connotations in post colonial times, as this elevates colonial languages over indigenous languages and speakers. The same can be said about the terms standard and non-standard languages as the level of ‘standard’ is almost ubiquitously understood in relation to colonial conventions. Thus Cape Coloured linguistic practices do not ascribe to standardised ‘White’ Afrikaans (or English). And neither do Cape Coloured speech forms exhibit a mere mixing of standardised White Afrikaans and English but instead act as a quintessence of Cape Coloured
culture and identity. Westernised terminologies marginalise hybrid discourses such as used in the *Daily Voice*. Therefore, the code-switched elements, if seen as the mere mixing of English and Afrikaans, is complicated if the verbal text itself is viewed in terms of which language is considered the main and which is the subordinate. In this regard code-switching on the Cape Flats is more than what is depicted in McCormick (2002) who herself claims that it is certainly not merely about choices between ‘standard’ and non-standard of Afrikaans or English.

During the apartheid era, as well as post-apartheid, the struggle to define a Coloured identity has been underscored. Often, this ethnic group has been labelled as ‘not White enough and not Black enough’. Adhikari’s (2005) book, with the same title, moves toward challenging this seemingly uncontested label. In relation to Xu’s (2007) arguments, Coloured identity has for long periods been defined and confined to Westernised paradigms. However, in contestation of this postulation Adhikari looks to establish the role of Coloured people in the making of their own identity as this is a trademark previously ignored throughout research, literature and ideologies based on Coloureds. Adhikari uses the term “Colouredness” several times and attempts “to contribute a more nuanced understanding of the manner in which Colouredness functioned as a social identity from the time the South African state was formed in 1910 to the present” (2005:xii).

The main aim of Adhikari’s book is to show that Coloured identity is better understood “as having remained essentially stable throughout” the period of apartheid (2005:xii). Hence, this stability or continuity based in deep cultural socio-historic contexts supports the notion that Colouredness developed as a social identity:

This stability was derived from a central core of enduring characteristics rooted in the historical experience and social situation of the Coloured community that regulated the way in which Colouredness functioned as a social identity under white domination (2005:xii).

Therefore despite several periods of change and transition in the history of the Republic (South Africa) Adhikari claims that at the onset of democracy in 1994, Coloured identity
maintained its core fundamentals. Some of the political and social changes Adhikari mentions include the rise of a radical movement in Coloured politics during the 1930s; the Black Consciousness period during the 1970s and the transition between the end of apartheid and the new dispensation (Adhikari 2005). Adhikari discusses four possibilities motivating why and how the stability of Colouredness was maintained. Firstly, the Coloured “desire to assimilate into the dominant society” has been a key feature highlighting their drive for acknowledgement of “their worth as individuals and citizens and acceptance as equals or partners by whites (2005:8)”.

Secondly, Coloured people served “as a residual category into which smaller groups that did not fit into either the whites or the Africans were placed” (2005:14). Therefore, the hybrid characteristic of Coloured identity resided largely due to the categorisation of groups such as Griquas, Malays, Namas, Indians and Rehoboth Basters under the racial identity of Coloureds (2005:14).

A third factor is their continued resistance toward the many negative associations attached to Coloured identity and their language of choice, Kaapse Afrikaans, which often displays features of their rich heritage. Ironically, the demoralising constructions of this group, may well have fuelled Coloured determination not to be negatively judged. Some of the negative associations include “immorality, sexual promiscuity, illegitimacy, impurity and untrustworthiness” (Adhikari 2005:14). Adhikari adds vulgar behaviour, alcohol and drug abuse, criminality, gangsterism to the list of negative propensities (2005:14). The Daily Voice frontpages, as is explored in the data analysis, covers topics related to many if not all the items listed above. The original Daily Voice slogan was “Sex, Scandal, Skinner, Sport” (“Skinner” refers to gossip but not just celebrity gossip). Interestingly promiscuity is a key feature of each Daily Voice edition to date as can be seen from the image of topless female models on every page 3 of each edition.

The fourth consideration is the marginality of Coloureds as a group. Adhikari states that Coloureds were highly opportunistic to reinforce their status of relative privilege largely because of their having limited freedom and choices for social and political action. In fact,
“the marginality of the Coloured community meant that it had little choice in the matter of accepting an inferior social status to whites or the second-class citizenship imposed on it by the state” (2005:18). This means that Coloureds simply had to be content to accept their perceived racial and social inferiority in terms of the political context outlined by apartheid. Content of course does not mean happy to accept an inferior status but instead refers to the political constraints and power relations between Coloureds (and other non-Whites) and White supremacists during South Africa’s undemocratic years.

2.9 The notion of Cape Coloured Identity

Adhikari identifies two types of approaches when defining Coloured identity or identities of ethnic minority groups in general. The first type is called the essentialist approach which is based on dominant Western paradigms that state “racial hybridity is considered the essence of Colouredness” (2005:34). The second is known as the instrumentalist approach which considers Coloured identity as “an artificial concept imposed by the white supremacist state and ruling groups on a weak and vulnerable sector of the population” (2005:34).

Both these approaches are dismissed by Adhikari in like fashion to Xu (2007) as essentialist and instrumentalist approaches propagate the exclusion of Coloureds (or ethnic minorities) from a socially dominant perspective about discourse and human value in general.

Thus, Adhikari (2005), Pavlenko and Blackledge (2006) and Xu (2007) encourage a social constructionist approach as the effective means, which addresses constructions of minority identities. Thus Adhikari uses this approach to analyse the role Coloured’s play in making, sustaining and transforming their identity. Adhikari states “by its very nature, social identity is largely and in the first instance the product of its bearers and can no more be imposed on people by the state or ruling groups then it can spring automatically from miscegenation or their racial constitution” (2005:36).

Thus Western styled approaches may not necessarily be adequate when exploring identities of minority groups. Therefore one may view social identity as “cultural in nature in that it is part of learned behaviour and [but] is moulded by social experience and social interaction”
(Adhikari 2005:36). In other words, identities should not be assumed a priori, but should be seen as performative and emerging from discourse (Banda 2005).

Moreover, given the forced removals and segregation of citizens along racial demarcations, it is obvious that those who define Coloured identity will lack veracity and exactitude in their assessment if they have not experienced what it is to be Coloured. Thus Adhikari’s extensive pursuit toward identifying the role of Coloureds in forming Coloured identity. Adhikari therefore is critical of the essentialist and instrumentalist approaches “for their tendency to accept Coloured identity as given and to portray it as fixed” (2005:35).

Adhikari proposes that Coloured identity “needs to be expressed in new forms” because of the racial identity of the previous dispensation. Adhikari stresses that much like the apartheid years, Coloureds are left ambling through the grey areas of a country in transition where White supremacy is handing over the baton of political and economic dominance to their ‘opposites’. Thus, Adhikari argues that:

There is a fear that Coloured interest and needs will be overlooked within any broadly South Africanist or non-racial approach. Indeed for many, the marginalization of Coloured people in the new South Africa is already a reality” (2005:185).

Therefore, Adhikari acknowledges that there are various platforms through which Coloureds are seeking to express their identity and with relevance to this study, the Daily Voice is seemingly one such avenue of expression. As is demonstrated in this study, this use of multilingual linguistic resources, cultural metaphors, Cape community stories is one way the Daily Voice asserts the Coloured identity options.

Summary
This chapter starts with a discussion of Myers-Scotton’s MLF and Markedness models. These models are critiqued because of their rigidity that do not aptly suit linguistic practices that are performed outside of the predictable boundaries set forth by these types of frameworks. The discussion uses the work of Auer, Meeuwis and Blommaert to highlight the monolectal nature of Cape Coloured discourse and how the shortfalls of Myers-Scotton’s
work regarding code-switching can in fact be overcome simply through dropping hegemonic propensities with contextually specific approaches. The importance of acknowledging the embedded features of discourse allow more options in determining how and when various discourse practices function within the relevant societies. Thus the social approaches endorsed by Heller, Pavlenko and Blackledge are discussed in earnest to establish just how contextualising the discourse used in the *Daily Voice* within the Cape Flats offers more options in understanding how the *Daily Voice* is able to draw on a wider spectrum of linguistic resources. Drawing on these linguistic resources shows how the *Daily Voice* constructs and negotiates Cape Coloured identity. This approach also highlights how the *Daily Voice* undermines hegemony through using counter-hegemonic discourse in their reporting. Therefore it will be demonstrated that this type of social approach leads to the recognition of Cape Flats discourse as monolectal that frees up fixed perceptions that view bilingual speech patterns as predictable rather than performative actions. It will be shown how the performative nature of bilingual discourse extends communicative events beyond mere interaction but in essence, creates a third space wherein new ways of bilingual practices take place. Understanding the dynamism of how this space is created and how new ways of meaning-making are achieved cannot be attained under biased monolingual ideologies of what bilingualism and bilingual discourse entail. Chapter 2 therefore establishes the shortfalls of such biased perceptual fixity and provides support for contextually specific approaches that put into effect the work of Xu (2007) who strongly encourages more socio-culturally based methods. The literature thus establishes the importance of recognising the potential for alternative approaches to specific bilingual discourse practice research.
Chapter 3
Multimodality as a Conceptual Tool of SFL

3.0 Introduction
In this chapter I define multimodality and which aspects of this concept are applicable to this thesis. I discuss multimodality as a viable tool to explore the intersemiotic relationship of signs appearing across the selected *Daily Voice* frontpages. More significantly, I situate multimodality in the area of Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL) largely to foreground the localised context of the study argued in chapter 2 (cf. Xu 2007). I provide descriptions for Kress and Van Leeuwen’s (1996/2006) grammar of visual design which plays a key role in the analysis of a contextualised Cape Flats *Daily Voice* newspaper. The features of this visual design include a description and contextualisation of their theories regarding information value, framing and salience.

3.1 Bilingual practices, performance and design on social identities
Before exploring Multimodal Discourse Analysis (MDA) it is better to understand the three SFL metafunctions that are associated with MDA. In an era where the global village enjoys contraction that advances cultural hybridity on many social levels, the modes of communication become blurred, fused and even co-dependent. Modality is measured across a continuum ranging from low modality to high modality. In textual analysis, modality markers signal the reliability, usuality and/or obligation of the intended meaning. Multimodal refers to the mixed composition and representation of written, visual and even audio modes of communication. In an era where information is readily available in many forms, common products such as posters, newspapers, advertisements, brochures, textbooks amongst a host of other means of communication, are formulated using more than just a single medium. Therefore with regard to this study, print communication is no longer solely comprised of written items as the main meaning-making tool but instead various types of print media use diverse juxtaposition methods to push particular views. Thus visual images and verbal texts interact and herein lay the richness and complexities which encoders and decoders of messages need to consider, grasp and aptly interpret. Verbal texts are complex because of potential hybridity, code-switching, jargon, grammaticality, variety etc. Verbal and visual texts are complex because of factors such as size, positioning, colour etc. Collectively the
multimodal features relate and construct meaning. Thus multimodality is concerned with the nature of the relationship between semiotic systems or modes. The multimodal nature of many forms of communication especially the media in this case, inspire research into the intersemiotic relationships that construct meaning-making options. Using multimodality is thus one avenue that allows such exploration and coupled with fresh impartial views regarding bilingual discourses, the opportunity to investigate how the sociolinguistic and media landscapes (within particular locales) evolve through such exciting and innovative times is presented. Multimodality in this study encompasses several concepts that holistically contribute to the eventual findings of this dissertation. Whilst multimodality roughly refers to the variety of modes used in a single instance of communication, this research requires a more refined understanding. Instead, it is the relationship between the various modes and how the meaning-making options that they collectively construct are achieved. In this case of the *Daily Voice* the multimodalities include verbal text and visual text. However, these two semiotic systems are further categorised into evaluative categories such as colour, colour modulation, size and location to name but a few features. Establishing the nature of the intersemiotic relationship is complex and more significantly, contextually specific. Multimodality cannot be a rigid tool with which to explore texts or situations, where multifarious modes are used to create meaning. In this light the importance of understanding the nature of how different signs interact, the levels upon and conditions under which they interact, as well as the socio-cultural meanings they collectively construct is essential.

This situates multimodality in the area of SFL where Eggins states “that in order to understand how people use language we need to consider both the context of the situation and the context of culture” (1994:30). The notion of context can be expressed on two levels, register and genre. Register refers more to how language use is influenced by the situation at hand, thus the term context of situation. The context of situation in this study depends on the register used in the news stories presented on the frontpages of the *Daily Voice* and it is obvious that with the exception of a Monday edition, each edition of the tabloid refers to very recent and fresh events. There are three register variables that each defines the nature of any communicative situation. These are: field (refers to topic or focus of the situation), tenor (refers to the roles in power relations) and mode (refers to the role of language and the
amount of feedback). In this light the news covered across the Daily Voice frontpages can be described in terms of the register to exact the context of the situation. The written mode of the multimodal text is such that it takes a written or published form but in essence presents a conversational effect. The field would depend on the nature of the news story or the competition. However, generically the field of the stories are localised to the Cape Flats or to stories affecting members of the Cape Coloured community. In terms of tenor, the Daily Voice as a newspaper would adopt a more powerful interpersonal relationship with its audience. However, the social involvement of the community with regard to the content and economic success of the Daily Voice would suggest that in certain situations the active readership would dominate at some level as it is the community that sends ‘tip-offs’ about certain news stories and ultimately act as primary sources of the stories published. This means the role structure is reversed (cf. Eggins and Slade 1997). Thus all three variables are localised and unique across each instance of communication and would necessitate contextually specific analysis.

The context of culture is a lot less exact as it is difficult to precisely say who reads the Daily Voice. However, in this study the context of culture refers more to whether or not the target audience as well as any person reading a copy of Daily Voice, understands the language used to report the news. This brings in the notion of genre which in effect refers to the means of achieving goals in various recognisable social contexts through language use. Achieving these social goals is based on knowledge of what the expectations are in particular contexts. Thus a developed culture of how and when language can be used to accomplish desired outcomes or negotiations in similar contexts.

The Daily Voice is not following a tabloid genre per se, but in effect creating a new genre where the public themselves influence the shape of interdiscursivity of local areas. It will be demonstrated that the Daily Voice sets its own agendas and parameters through its counter-hegemonic interdiscursivity or blending of discourse types and genres. Ideological perspectives, as discussed by Eggins (1994) are influential in every act irrespective of what the genre involved or indeed the register of the situation. Thus any biases or preconceived feelings and schemata play key roles in both levels of contexts. Peoples’ expectations of each
other and of the situation influence the language use and vice versa. Therefore, the nature of studies such as this one must be contextualised on both levels at each instance of analysis and more significantly, the analysis itself cannot be exempt from drawing in the situational and cultural relativity of the data. Language use and social relations constructed by the *Daily Voice* needs to be analysed as such in terms of the conditions whereupon these linguistic choices and social actions are made rather than be subjected to predetermined frameworks and analytical tools that are biased on both situational and cultural levels.

The role players are the *Daily Voice*, its readers and the persons or institutions presented across the data. Mere decoding is not sufficient but interpretation and understanding of the indexical and emotional aspects of the language use, as well as the appropriateness of the language use is integral. Understanding both types of contexts therefore affects the role players involved in that

- The *Daily Voice* includes those who are able to interpret both contexts and excludes those who are unable to grasp the intended meaning.
- Readers feel included or excluded from the communicative interaction between the *Daily Voice* and its audience.
- Readers agree or disagree with the constructions and/or deconstructions of those presented as newsmakers across the data.
- The newsmakers are constructed or deconstructed by both the *Daily Voice* and the readers (and others who engage in discussion about the news) either in the same light or with differing views.

The acknowledgement of the role context plays in this study is realised through intertextuality and the many off shoots thereof. Intertextuality is understood as being the propensity to refer to existing phrases, texts, customs and knowledge that are culturally specific. It refers to already existing knowledge often used in communication (such as headlines) to indicate repetition, ambiguity, contrast or comparison, among other things, for example with current events reported in the news. This device requires participants familiar with the words or phrases used and the expectations of how meaning is negotiated in order to
be effective. Intertextuality can be a key tool to show how discourse used, develops from previous experiences and how it is understood. Both levels of context, situation and culture, include intertextual references. Thus it will be demonstrated how the *Daily Voice* feeds on the context of culture through intertextuality and framing to draw on cultural metaphors and local discourses in their stories.

### 3.2 Grammar of visual design

Having established what intertextuality entails, these semiotic signs are constructed based on the intertextual properties each possesses. To account for multimodal texts and their analyses, Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006) have suggested a grammar of visual design that serves as a tool to evaluate properties and meaning-making options visuals have within a text. Thus there are tools to evaluate elements according to their physical location/s within a text, their colour and degree of saturation, their size, the level of modality amongst a host of other criteria. Simply put, Kress and Van Leeuwen suggest a framework that offers evaluation matching the grammatical, syntactic and semantic features of verbal text to accompanying visuals. They determine information regarding each element of a multimodal text and allow analyses of the intersemiotic relationships that exist, and how elements combine to construct collective meaning. Although this system is based on Western ways of ‘reading’ it does provide the tools to further multimodal research and more importantly, explores the textual organisation of both visual and verbal relationships in hybrid discourses. Moreover, Kress and Van Leeuwen are first to admit that their design is not universally applicable.

This shows the importance to localise and contextualise discourse analysis (cf. Xu 2007), we shall take it as axiomatic that MDA as is currently constructed is not universally applicable. Thus it has to be adapted to suit the local conditions. It is within this spirit that the following exposition of MDA and other tools of analyses discussed below should be seen.

Auer (2007) argues strongly that monolingual bias blocks objective discourse analysis research of bi/multilingual speech forms. Heller (2007:8) extends his views by stating that he “argues that code-switching data can best be accounted for by understanding it as embedded in interaction” and that “the argument is that the nature of code-switching is linked to
(possibly also universal) dimensions of the regulation of conversation, the nature of which is best captured by some form of ethnomethodologically-inspired conversation analysis” (2007:8) Thus, as this thesis continuously suggests the Daily Voice’s attempts to sound naturally Coloured, the newspaper assumes a conversational and performative linguistic function.

A Multimodal Discourse Analysis of the Daily Voice is the main frame for analysis. Martin and Rose (2003/2007) provide tools with which to analyse discourses. They offer platforms and models from which to launch various forms of analyses for researchers seeking to establish the mechanisms of meaning-making of different text genres. Martin and Rose’s (2007) work on MDA provide a platform from which to explore the linguistic and multimodal composition and presentation of the Daily Voice frontpages. Understanding how the linguistic relevance of the verbal texts especially, is crucial toward the final multimodal analysis, as it is these culture specific verbal texts that drive the socially embedded meaning and determine the options available for audience interpretation. It is also vital to acknowledge that an emerging area of study such as MDA to date provides very little guidelines other than those based on analysing data according to Western ideologies and thus data collected in non-Western social contexts may be well assessed according to inefficient or inappropriate criteria.

3.3 Intertextuality as a tool for analysis of texts

A key theme to this thesis is the awareness of analysing data according to its socio-cultural dependency. As will be addressed in the data analysis, certain words and phrases need to be explained and understood in their local context. Often there are challenges that affect adequate interpretations and translations given the socio-cultural underpinnings of the data. The concept of intertextuality is therefore essential to appreciate the analysis of the language use across the Daily Voice frontpages. Johnstone (2008) situates intertextuality as referring to the different ways texts and prior texts are connected to each other. In this regard, how the texts in the Daily Voice relate to those already known by Cape Flats readers. This concept of reference to prior text is better understood using Johnstone’s heuristic that in part relates discourse as being influenced by previous discourse. Fairclough (1992) claims that in some
instances texts may mimic or quote other texts. Texts may also be worded in ways that presuppose other and prior texts. Intertextuality is one tool that the media uses to tap into shared socioeconomic, cultural, political, etc., knowledge.

Intertextuality is understood as being the propensity to refer to existing phrases, texts, customs and knowledge that are culturally specific. Headline writers, as is explored at a later stage, use intertextuality as one of several tools to tap into the schema of readers. Headlines refer to titles of famous novels or phrases of literature, well-known quotes and even historical events. Thus, certain phrases used like “Jou Ma Se Hoes” (Your Mother’s Cough) are very difficult to explain in terms of the true cultural significance such phrases have. The linguistic resources available to the *Daily Voice* means that intertextual references transcend not only monolingual boundaries by virtue of tapping into a hybrid Cape Coloured discourse, but indeed transcend into a larger pool of socio-cultural and socio-historic resources and identities. And it is the use of intertextuality that allows this freedom (bar media censorship and publishing regulatory laws) to draw on various social tenets for commercial gains.

Intertextuality also draws on more than references to existing verbal texts but also uses images to capitalise on what readers already know. As is discussed below, Kress and Van Leeuwen (2006) attribute information value in terms of its position within a layout. Thus information that readers are considered to already have, whether texts or images, should be located in positions that demarcate the existence of relevant knowledge of these texts or images. In like fashion, the use of both verbal texts and images (of well-known Cape Town socialites or personalities) function more effectively because readers are familiar with these agents and their respective histories.

### 3.4 Framing

The notion of framing is related to that of intertextuality. It refers to how components are arranged on a page but also the schemata or background knowledge of what is being written or visualised. Goffman defines framing as the principles of organisation that “define the meaning and significance of social events” (Lemert and Branaman 1997). Thus framing includes constructing an activity or event; in this case the images and verbal texts in such a
way that it leads participants into what the bracketed activity means. Meaning and interpretation therefore relies on framing. However, framing itself is restricted to particular social structures and organisations which in essence depend on the level of schema all participants have within given contexts.

The significance of analysing framing helps to contextualise and emphasise the importance of explorations regarding the Given, New, Ideal and Real. Framing is usually indicated “by actual frames, by white space between elements, by discontinuities of colour” (Kress and Van Leeuwen, 2006:204). Thereby, joining, linking or separating elements on the frontpage. In these multimodal frontpages, framing divides or joins visual and verbal elements, which on their own, are realised differently and possess different properties. They further contend that “the term framing indicates that elements of a composition can either be given separate identities, or represented as belonging together” (2001:147).

Framing can thus affect how the public understands and interprets information, which issues are discussed and how, as well as how the public formulates opinions. Framing therefore influences perceptions of an issue and public opinion. Newspaper layout and composition therefore becomes a site of ideological representation that depending on the awareness of readers, may well construct identities of and for readers.

Therefore the interrelated nature of a multimodal text is moulded through framing and other features such as colour, image size, modality of image and verbal text, camera angle among others, needs to be wholesomely understood and analysed.

In terms of framing and intertextuality, Martin and Rose (2003/2007) provide different sets of tools for analysis. These are the analyses of ideational patterns, interpersonal patterns, explorations of the relationship between images and accompanying texts as well as textual organisation within images and layouts. Whilst using these tools, they critically break down the composition of visual images so as to indicate just how the images work in terms of constructing meaning and even opinion. Their discussion incorporates work done by Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006), in particular with regard to textual organisation. They also
address interpersonal meanings constructed through and by images. This allows for the analysis of both verbal and visual text by determining the information value, framing dynamics and salience of elements. They also argue that colour itself index modality of and in images in a similar grading system where verbal modality is determined. The cultural specificity of colour interpretation as it relates to framing is discussed below. Suffice to say that these tools are used throughout the data analysis most often via various tabulations.

Framing also concerns exploration of textual organisation and image-text relations in terms of where (how and why) images and verbal texts are positioned in a particular type of layout. In other words, the relationship between verbal texts and the accompanying images needs to be determined as the two types of signs may have supplementary, complementary or even contradicting connections. Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006) show us the way images and verbal texts are juxtaposed. This allows for the analysis of the modal and appraised features of images by discussing issues of salience, information value, framing, colour saturation and size especially. Let us consider some of the design features of textual organisation terms used in this study.

3.5 Information Value

Information value refers to the position a visual element holds within a larger textual composition. Basically this refers to the location of the visual element within or across a quadrant realised through vertical and horizontal axes. Therefore, visuals can be arranged in polarized or centralized forms, as set forth by Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006). Consequently, they argue that the position a visual element holds, establishes its value and importance within, especially a larger textual composition. In this instance it refers to the information value within multimodal texts. This position also establishes relationships amongst various elements and contributes to the construction of particular intended or derived meanings. The following are key terms which provide more detailed locations of the compositional quadrant and thus describe the information value assigned to those areas. They include the Real, Ideal, Given, New, Centre and Margin (2006:209). In brief, with regard to newspaper frontpages, the Given refers to polarized elements found on the left side of a newspaper. The left side is everything left of the Centre of the composition. Contrastingly,
the right side of the Centre is known as the New. As the names suggest, the left side represents given or known information, whereas newer more fresh information is located to the right of the Centre. In simple terms the Ideal and Real are elements respectively polarized above and below a centred composition where the Real is considered more practical, unassuming information and the Ideal refers to more idealised information. According to Kress and Van Leeuwen the Given and the New, as well as the Ideal and the Real, are respectively, “not identical or near-identical to the corresponding” elements. That is, the left-sided Given is dissimilar to the right-sided New and the top-sided Ideal is unlike the bottom-sided Real (2006:209).

These reading paths refer to how newspapers are read according to a Western perspective as reading and writing from left to right is not the only method used universally. Following Xu’s (2007) postulation about the importance of localising discourse analysis, the ensuing analysis will seek to first categorise the visual elements into the respective locations where its information value can thereafter be established. The analysis will also take into consideration that some of the readers of the Daily Voice only have elementary formal Western education and thus may not possess formal competency levels of both English and Afrikaans as two separate autonomous systems.

3.5.1 Real and Ideal
Another tool that relates to framing refers to the Real and the Ideal which represents the vertical axis of a multimodal text. The Ideal and the Real are two concepts that Kress and Van Leeuwen state have less of a connection than components of the horizontal axis. They state that

the upper section tends to make some kind of emotive appeal and to show us ‘what might be’; the lower section tends to be more informative and practical, showing us ‘what is’. A sharp dividing line may separate the two, although, at a less conspicuous level, there may also be connective elements (2006: 186).

In Westernised spheres the top-sided Ideal is thus reserved for reporting on what could or should be. Often the promise of an idyllic situation or lifestyle is propagated in this section. The bottom-sided Real reflects the current state or nature of the society. The Real provides
information that is unpretentious and more factual. These two sections therefore are considered by Kress and Van Leeuwen (2006) as vastly different and separate with latent possibilities of interconnectivity. Using these tools to analyse the *Daily Voice* frontpages will help establish whether or not their suggestions are universally applicable.

### 3.5.2 Centre and Margin

Kress and Van Leeuwen describe the Centre as element/s that are “presented as the nucleus of the information to which all other elements are in some sense subservient” (2006:196). These “subservient” elements refer to those that appear in the margin/s of a text. They add “the Margins are these ancillary, dependent elements. In many cases the Margins are identical or at least very similar to each other, so that there is no sense of a division between Given and New and/or Ideal and Real elements among them” (2006:196). The multimodal nature of the data complicates analysing the Centre of each frontpage. Therefore the Centre will not be addressed as centralising the most important information is not that prominent in Westernised layouts.

### 3.5.3 Given and New

Another useful tool from Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006) relates to Given and New information. The Given and the New constitute another set of comparative and contrasting values. Elements positioned in the Given quadrant (to the left of the Centre) can be considered the familiar or known information whereas the New can be considered the contested, undecided, newer information polarized to the right of the Centre. These value locations are measured across a horizontal axis and as they are separated, so to say, by the Centre, the boundary between the two is not explicit. At the very least though, the distinction is not as explicit as the division between the Ideal and the Real. Therefore, detailing each figure in terms of the horizontal-based information value is too complicated. Instead, figures allowing more tangible and empirical observations will be selected to further the analysis of the Given and New visual elements. Using the Given and the New concepts, links across various editions of the selected *Daily Voice* data can be made.
3.5.4 Salience

Salience refers to how visual and verbal texts differ in terms of the degree of attention they draw depending on features such as colour contrast, size, positioning and tonal contrast. This relates that the higher the degree of these features visual and verbal texts exhibit, the stronger the salience of a particular element will be. Martin and Rose (2007) discuss the varying relationships between text and images. They state:

Salience may be indicated by a number factors including size, colour intensity or the strength of vectors, as well as centre-margin, left-right, top-down positions (2007:327).

They continue by exploring the nature of the relationship between images and verbal text. “Images and texts can restate, specify or summarize each other (elaborating), they can be added to each other (extending), or explain or follow each other in time (enhancing)”. In addition images and texts may be explicitly or subtly separated. Both images and texts encroach or imbricate each other’s boundaries (2007:327).

Therefore, the following questions stand out: (a) which type of elements are more salient? And (b) do the patterns of saliency adhere to or flout the conventions and findings set out by researchers like Kress, Van Leeuwen, Martin and Rose? Both questions pose challenges due to the intricacy of the data. The multimodal frontpages are ‘busy’ as there are several eye catching elements including various types of images, news texts, colours and advertisements. Therefore there are several salient elements exhibited on each frontpage. There is competition not just between verbal texts and images but also between the same types of elements, that is, images compete with other images and verbal texts compete with other verbal texts for higher degrees of saliency. Although the idea of compete is used to construct the activity between elements, one could also suggest using terms like compare, support, reinforce etc depending on the angle of exploration.

Iedema (2003) discusses the notions of Multimodality and Resemiotization. He looks at the relationship between visual and verbal components in multi-semiotic texts. The nature of this relationship is argued to be transforming into a platform where visual and verbal components influence each other. This argument looks specifically at multimodal texts and
the verbal-visual relationship is prominently exhibited on the *Daily Voice* frontpages. Much like Martin and Rose (2007) describe the different degrees of the relationship between the visual and verbal, Iedema works toward moving away from entrenched paradigms regarding the role of either type of sign. Iedema states that

the trend towards a multimodal appreciation of meaning-making centres around two issues: first, the de-centring of language as favoured meaning-making; and second, the re-visiting and blurring of the traditional boundaries between and roles allocated to language, image, page layout, document design, and so on (2003:33).

He continues:

This blurring of boundaries among the different semiotic dimensions of representation has been linked, on the one hand, to changes in our ‘semiotic landscape’, and, on the other hand, to analysts’ realization that our human predisposition towards multimodal meaning-making, and our own multi-semiotic development or ontogenesis, requires attention to more than one semiotic than just language-in-use (2003:33).

Iedema also argues that multifarious cultural and social discourses are populating the semiotic landscape with the use of various other forms of communication and that multimodality “is about recognizing that language is not at all at the centre of all communication” (2003:39). These diverse cultural and social discourses are as Androutsopolous (2007) argues influencing the media discourse landscape.

These measuring scales are called modality markers and include:

a) Colour Saturation: where higher or fuller saturation equates higher levels of modality and lower saturation (lowest being black and white) relates to lower modality or truth value.

b) Colour Differentiation: Described as “a scale running from a maximally diversified range of colours to monochrome” (160:2006). This differentiation refers to the type of focus that is how sharp or how soft the focus of an image is. The sharper the focus the higher the modality and the softer the focus of an
image is, the lower the modality. The softness level is usually heightened to idealise a concept or image as is common practice in advertisements.

c) Colour Modulation: This refers to the varying degrees of colour (particular shades or one colour). Described as “a scale running from fully modulated colour, with, for example, the use of many different shades of red, to plain, unmodulated colour” (166:2007). Therefore, images of lower modality are more abstract; more unmodulated and have higher reduction or absence of colour. Conversely, modality increases when colour modulation increases.

As the world transforms technologically, people seek a fusion of simplistic lifestyles that still maintain the latest trends. Trends ranging from digital photography to using a mobile cellular phone for personal and business purposes, to the convergence of many technological and communicative devices, to healthier eating, fitness and living habits. Fitness and relaxation routines like yoga, pilates, Chinese styled feng shui homes and a host of alternate types of healing, living and social choices. One key factor is the use of colour and how colour schemes improve the energy in one’s surroundings. And while the old adage states that a picture tells a thousand words, the colours used might determine the description. Subconsciously colour influences or affects moods and reactions. People react calmly or disapprovingly to colours in many facets of life, from the clothes we wear, to the colour of our cars, to the colour of each room in our homes, to the colour of our and others’ homes etc. The list might be endless but the effects colours have are more or less the same. The following is one version of a Westernised interpretation of the psychology of different colours prominently used in the data.

Red: The most emotionally intense colour, red stimulates a faster heartbeat and breathing. It is a marker of power, vitality and ambition. However, it is associated with anger and might create danger, impatient environments as well as discomfort and irritability.

Black: Considered having a comforting, protective and even mysterious effect however, it is also associated with silence, authority and power, aloofness and villainy.
Yellow: This colour is an attention getter and is seen as an optimistic colour. However people lose their tempers more often in yellow rooms. It is a very difficult colour for the eye to take in and can therefore be overpowering if overused. It does enhance concentration and speeds up metabolism.

Blue: Seemingly has the opposite reaction to red. Blue is seen as a peaceful, tranquil colour triggering the body to produce calming chemicals.

White: Considered to represent purity and peace and unclutteredness.

Orange: Connotes joy, release of emotions, alleviates feelings of self-pity, low self-worth, renews interest in life by lifting spirits and acts as an antidepressant.

Purple: The colour of royalty, purple connotes luxury, wealth, and sophistication. Also exudes creativity and inspiration.

(www.geocities.com and www.infoplease.com)

However, it is important to note that “individual colours, or colour combinations have different meanings for different people and therefore no universal symbolism should be attached to any of the colours” (Martin and Rose 2007:5). As Martin and Rose further contend, colours are culturally and contextually interpretive; the mixture of reds, oranges, yellows, whites etc in the Daily Voice may not be interpreted in terms of their individual significance, but more perhaps in terms of the collective use of colour. And so, fixed universal symbolism attached to particular colours should not be applied to colour interpretation (2007). Cape Coloureds have a long history with regard to colourful representations of themselves as a people as well as in relation to their physical adornments. Each year on January 2nd, Cape Town enjoys a minstrel parade as a celebration dating back to the era of slavery in South Africa. The tradition started as a holiday for slaves dating as far back as 1823. In purgatory fashion, processions of slaves “claimed control of the streets and used satire against those who controlled them for the rest of the year” (McCormick, 2002:63). The Cape minstrel carnival, known also as coons or Kaapse Klopse, dress up in shockingly bright colourful carnival gear with matching umbrellas, with many white painted faces, and in their uniformed troupes jovially parade through historic areas and streets of the Central Business District of Cape Town, historic District Six streets and particular Cape Flats areas. The Cape Minstrels, as they are now internationally known, rather than coons that has
a derogatory racial tinge in Western circles as it is a reminder of racial minstrelsy of black Americans. The term coons though still holds its own meaning to those of the Cape and affectionately the term Klopse is still maintained as it originates from the concept of clubs (social, sports etc). Community members entertain huge masses through dancing, playing musical instruments, whistling, singing and sporting the brightest fusions of colours from neon green and yellow designs to more subdued combinations of red, white and blue. Although many Cape Coloureds may distance themselves from a ‘coon culture’ the sheer history, charismatic ethos and ritual processes involved, maintains cultural practices, negotiates transforming identities and enhances social interaction beyond the Cape Flats and so across various cultures and age categories. The event has gained recognition as a tourist attraction during Cape Town’s summer festive season. More importantly, such annual communal festivities provide the Daily Voice with a resource that transcends the linguistic aspect of discourse.

This leads to asking what makes the Daily Voice the Daily Voice. Is it the colourful nature of the newspaper both in terms of colour composition and actual content? Is it the monolectal code practiced by Cape Coloureds that provides the Daily Voice with uninhibited linguistic resources? Is it the type of news stories covered that indeed encourages the public to contribute? Is it the intertextual references to deeply rooted cultural schemata that presumably perpetuate the communal affixations of a Daily Voice hype? And conversely, positions such forms of bilingual media as threatening and inferior journalism rather than fresh hybrid media options to primordial colonialist ideologies. The answers lay in addressing the following question: How is Cape Coloured discourse generated by the Daily Voice?

The manner in which language is used as linguistic resource is critical in analysing multimodal texts. The generation of hybrid texts as is found in multilingual contexts is much more complex than is found in monolingual contexts. It could also be argued that its interpretation is much more creative and requires more skill than that in monolingual and monocultural contexts.
Summary
This chapter established the need to use multimodality, under the broader area of SFL, as the main tool for this study. The collective constructions of the multimodal Daily Voice frontpages are thus brought together as a result of a system that suggests particular features and localised meanings that signs have in terms of their composition and location within the multimodal representation. This is where I motivated the use of Kress and Van Leeuwen’s (1996/2006) grammar of visual design which allows me to evaluate both verbal and visual signs according to localised Cape Flats meaning-making features. I argued that Kress and Van Leeuwen’s (2006) key concepts that are used to analyse multimodal texts entails looking at the information value of texts in terms of the Given, the New, the Ideal, the Real, Centre and Margin. I also link the notions of framing and salience to the Cape Flats for the purposes of this study.

Chapter 3 situates the analytic tools of this study in an SFL framework. A description of multimodality, the notion of localisation of multimodality and how communication is multifarious in nature in such an advanced technological and informational era are discussed in this chapter. The common use of verbal and visual modes in a fused interconnected manner does require contextualisation. This context dependent feature essentially embeds multimodality within SFL studies. This chapter also explores the notion of a visual grammar as is set forth by Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006). The textual organisation of both verbal and visual signs can be analysed in terms of the qualities each sign has in terms of its nature, location and interconnectedness with other signs of the same type or other. In other words, different signs have information value, salience and framing features on the Daily Voice frontpages. Thus, it is argued that multimodal texts must be interpreted in terms of their compositions within this particular localised Cape Flats setting. Herein lay the meaning-making potential each multimodal text possesses. Chapter 3 explores the meaning-making options in terms of how the verbal and visual texts index each other to establish local meaning.
Chapter 4
Indexicality, Appraisal and Language Devices in Media

4.0 Introduction
In chapter 4 I will explore how language in the *Daily Voice* is used to index the localised context of the tabloid to the Cape Flats. I will also discuss, through the work of Scollon and Scollon (2003) how visuals also index in like fashion to the verbal signs. In essence, this leads to exploring the intersemiotic relationship between verbal and visual signs and how they construct a Cape Flats audience. In this chapter I also introduce the appraisal framework which is a tool of SFL. I will establish the salient features of appraisal that will show the intersemiotic relationship between verbal and visual signs are appraised to heighten the effect of intertextual references used in the *Daily Voice*. This chapter will also address the language devices used to formulate headlines.

4.1 Language as Indexical
Indexicality of multimodality can be realised through both verbal and visual text. In terms of verbal text there are several techniques used in verbal as well as non-verbal forms of communication. Scollon and Scollon state that “demonstrative and deictic adverbials are focused on the socio-cultural conception of the spaces we live in. In contrast to these, personal pronouns index the people with whom we are speaking” (2003:36). Thus semiotic signs that display properties as is suggested by Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006) are not only understood in terms of individual intertextual references but are collectively meaningful as a result of surrounding semiotic signs. This leads to exploring the area of Geosemiotics discussed by Scollon and Scollon who define it as “the study of the meaning systems by which language is located in the material world” (2003: x). The location of where images and text appear influences the meaning these signs potentially hold. Scollon and Scollon look to present a system for analysing code preference when there are two or more languages or codes used in a picture, a system for the analysis of inscription. They argue that discourses hold value in terms of the participants and location contextualising the discourse. Language (in verbal and non-verbal forms) therefore, is a tool used to index the world. They look at various multimodal texts and state that “participants in a picture not only exhibit narrative or conceptual relationships among themselves as we have seen above, but they also establish
relationships with viewers of the image, and this is our main interest here” (2003:96). Thus a Geosemiotic analysis uncovers how different modes of text indexes and is indexed by surrounding text of the same or differing mode. In this study this relates to how verbal text indexes other verbal text and visual text as well as how visual text influences verbal text and other visual text. This interrelatedness may well be achieved through intertextual references to previous discourse or cultural expectations.

Scollon and Scollon (2003) argue that despite conventional beliefs that there are three types of signs, namely iconic, symbolic and indexical; all signs index meaning in some way or form. Indexicality therefore is defined as the property of language that makes meaning as a result of where it is in the world (2003:25).

A geosemiotic analysis of the data is relevant in that the research deals with the construction or deconstruction of identity within a particular location, predominantly the Cape Flats. A geosemiotic analysis therefore aids support for either the construction or deconstruction of Cape Coloured identity. Scollon and Scollon (2003) argue that language indexes meaning of/in/by the world and thereby creates and/or alters discourses. Given that print media publications engage with readers through written text and images and not face-to-face or other non-verbal forms of communication, indexicality is therefore realised through the use of particular words in relation to any accompanying images.

Scollon and Scollon (2003:31) identify four key systems of indexicality namely

- Demonstratives (‘this’, ‘that’)
- Deictic Adverbials (‘here’, ‘now’, ‘there’, ‘then’)
- Personal Pronouns (‘I’, ‘you’, ‘we’, ‘he’, ‘she’ etc)
- Tense (past, present and future tenses are indexed via free and inflectional morphemes)

In face-to-face conversation (or other media forms where communicative participants are able see one another such as television, webcams, video conferencing, video recordings etc) demonstratives are usually used with the aid of physical pointing gestures. Likewise deictic
adverbials such as ‘there’ or ‘here’ may also be reinforced via pointing gestures. Personal pronouns may also be realised and reinforced through the same action of pointing.

In addition, they contend that visual images also index various communicative interactions. Whilst verbal signs realise indexicality through the aforementioned systems, images also index meaning and other signs in various ways. Scollon and Scollon thus fall back on Kress and Van Leeuwen’s (1996/2006) grammar of visual design abovementioned. Geosemiosis can thus be based in visual semiotic approaches. Kress and Van Leeuwen offer tools for analysing the interaction between participants, modality, composition, participant representation to name a few and so using these frameworks in conjunction with Geosemiosis, allows for socio-spatial discourse to be explored. By using Kress and Van Leeuwen’s framework, Scollon and Scollon are able to show how indexicalisation in multisemiotic/multimodal texts and interactions take place in very specific geographic locales.

In addition, identifying how multimodal text index meaning also highlights the participants and how they perform during the negotiation of meaning of such multimodal text. In this light Scollon and Scollon (2003) introduce the principle of dialogicality which describes all signs as working in aggregate. This principle basically purports that discourse is indexed by the signs that are used within the discourse. In this manner, once signs are placed in particular spaces or in a particular order, they are not isolated from any other signs (or discourses) in the surrounding environment. Thus indexicalisation refers to how all signs, irrespective of how and where they are placed, influence each other and this ultimately constructs the nature of the negotiation of meaning.

Therefore, pointing gestures in connection with demonstratives and deictic adverbials index meaning within physical contexts whereas personal pronouns index meaning and social relations between people who interact with each other. Scollon and Scollon add “personal pronouns such the English ‘I’, ‘you’, ‘he’ index the world of people and social relationships through which we move much like the demonstratives index the physical spaces in which we
live” (2003:36). Tense adverbials such as ‘now’ and ‘then’ index time and along with the socio-cultural context construct when and how an utterance is meant to be understood.

The systems of indexicality also embody attitudes and positions towards a particular text. In other words, indexicality can be associated with SFL’s notion of appraisal, itself an aspect of the interpersonal metafunction (tenor) described above. Appraisal is thus applicable to both written and oral texts in that it provides analytic tools with which to examine how language is used to negotiate and position participants within any given context by using interpersonal mechanisms in the communicative practice (Martin and White 2005).

4.2 The Appraisal Framework

The Appraisal framework is another tool used in this study. Situated in SFL this tool can be used to analyse how participants position themselves, their feelings, thoughts and ideals subjectively. Determining subjectivity is also embedded within the intertextual significance of any interpersonal construction. According to Bock, the area of appraisal is still evolving and is thus “a fairly new area of study” (2008:74). As illustrated in Chapter 3, attitude and graduation are the resources of choice.

Appraisal can be divided into three interacting areas namely attitude, engagement and graduation. All three are concerned with situating discourse on an interpersonal level. Attitude refers to evaluating feelings and emotions. Engagement focuses on how options are realised through discourse. Graduation, which is the preferred mode for this study, looks at how feelings are graded or amplified through use of language viewed from an interpersonal level. Attitude and graduation are the preferred tools used to identify the amplification techniques used in the Daily Voice to not only highlight how emotion is evoked but also to illustrate how such evaluation can indeed be achieved through recognising the monolectal nature of the discourse use. In effect, the scope of this study does not allow exploration across all three interacting areas. In terms of engagement it is at least worth noting that the nature of the gatekeeping role that the Daily Voice holds does position the tabloid in a superordinate position to its readers, even though this authority is reversed when it comes to considering the contributions that the public makes toward the content of the Daily Voice.
However, as will be exemplified in the data analysis, attitude highlights the intertextual echoes that resonate through the text and images used in the *Daily Voice*. In this way, the dimensions of attitude are used to show how appraisal identifies the lexical content that draws on the intertextual and cultural schemata of *Daily Voice* readers to allude to and construct meaning options. Thus the purpose of exploring attitude is to highlight the importance of cultural background and localisation. Graduation however, is explored to show how these cultural connections are intensified or indeed simmered down. Graduation is used to identify how in this study in particular, the *Daily Voice* turns up the volume or turns up the heat when particular cultural schemata are tapped into.

According to Martin and White (2005) graduation can be used across two axes of gradability, namely force and focus. Force refers to scaling in terms of intensity and amount whereas focus refers to exact and prototypical grading. Force encapsulates evaluations of intensity in terms of qualities, processes and even verbal modalities and this is referred to as intensification. Evaluations of amount that apply to entities are referred to as quantification. This force operates as a scaling mechanism to evaluate the degree of intensification and quantification. In terms of focus, graduation aims to reconstrue non-scalable categories into evaluative structures. The discourse used in the *Daily Voice* is as argued earlier, monolectal in nature. Thus addressing how Cape Coloured discourse is used to amplify constructions cannot be achieved by singling out monolingually perceived code-switched items. Instead, amplification and other appraisal modes should be wholesomely viewed in terms of how meaning is constructed contextually. Thus amplification, as will be displayed in the data analysis chapter, will not necessarily be realised through the use of particular lexical items but instead an approach seeking to establish how headlines (subheadlines) holistically amplify (or reduce) the constructions.

As much as appraisal aids in developing the interpersonal constructions of semantic discourse, applying this system in its entirety is far too magnanimous for this particular study. However, using attitude and graduation albeit on a moderate scale does provide the opportunity to analyse how the intertextual references in the *Daily Voice* are achieved and amplified or reduced to achieve desired the effect.
The purpose of using attitude and its three subdivisions namely, affect, judgement and appreciation, serve to show how the *Daily Voice* uses the linguistic resources available to frame the signs in the multimodal text in such a way that the content taps into the cultural schemata of the readers and the audience in general. These observations serve not only to underline that the *Daily Voice* uses the knowledge to attract and maintain its target market but in essence shows how important it is to domesticate or localise discourse research techniques. Failing to understand how the *Daily Voice* reaches its audience would lead to unsuccessful explorations into how the *Daily Voice* constructs its audience and the meaning-making options that are availed to them. Bock underlines the importance of localisation by stating that “SFL is a theory about language as a social process. It takes the approach that the focus of linguistic study should be text in context” (2008:59). She continues to highlight that the rather youthful area of appraisal is complex, and in this study especially where dealing with a single autonomous language system poses enough challenges. However, the *Daily Voice* uses a hybrid discourse that in itself is stigmatised and is used in a tabloid which also is criticised for its validity as a journalistic genre. Thus the *Daily Voice*’s reliance on using intertextual references positions the notion of intertextuality as a vital cog in the framework of appraisal when dealing more specifically, with the discourse practices of the Cape Flats.

Identifying lexical items that intensify or quantify other lexical items within a multimodal text allows one to evaluate the subjectivity of a conceptual whole. In other words, one or two words that spark intertextual connections may amplify the qualities of an entity but when viewed as a conceptual whole, a better understanding of the intertextual references and construction of discourse can be contextualised. The conceptual whole does not only refer to what is constructed (and how) by the verbal text, but having addressed the contextually specific multimodal dynamics of a text, the intersemiotic relationship at hand is also included. Simply put, whilst graduation is analysed in terms of verbal constituents, the relationship these verbal constituents have with other verbal and visual components is what forms the conceptual whole. This study cannot accommodate analysis of each type of graduation that is force and focus, as the multimodal nature means that it is too arduous a task. However, graduation as a resource of interpersonal amplification will be used to show
how the intertextual references identified through attitude are switched on and off by the units of intensification.

It is this kind of localised analyses that sets this study apart from other studies on media such as Reah’s (2002) which is reviewed below.

### 4.3 Language Devices in Headlines

The nature of media publications normalise carefully planned and deliberate headline structures. Thus there should be evaluation mechanisms in place to assess just how headlines operate. Reah says headlines are unique texts that function within “a range of restrictions that limit the freedom of the writer”. These restrictions include newspaper layout, typeface size and the number of words (2002:13). Reah (2002) proposes four levels of language devices used to analyse headlines namely word and meaning; intertextuality; phonology and loaded words. It should be noted that Reah’s discusses the devices from a monolingual perspective and does not account for multilanguage headlines found in the *Daily Voice*. The below mentioned categories from Reah are defined and challenged so as to question any presumed universality of these devices.

1. **Intertextuality:** Reah (2002) argues that reference to existing schemata regarding cultural knowledge of films; art, science, education etc are drawn upon in certain headlines. However, as will be shown in this study, in terms of Intertextuality, mere knowledge of English and Afrikaans does not guarantee that a reader is able to draw from the cultural meanings that are drawn from the discourse used by the *Daily Voice*. Also, competency in English and Afrikaans (irrespective of the degree) cannot ensure that a reader will make intertextual and indeed interdiscursive connections across the various headlines and other textual forms. Or indeed be able to identify with or dissociate with any ideologies constructed through such language use. Are these texts borrowed from Cape Coloured speech patterns? What meaning do they construct or deconstruct? As discussed above one needs cultural schemata on Cape Flats happenings and living.
2. Word and meaning: According to Reah (2002) the second level uses word combinations that purposefully create potential ambiguity. Homophones (words identical in sound), polysemes (several words with closely related meaning) and homonyms (several unrelated meanings) are the types of words used in headlines. In bilingual headlines this device suggests that speakers/readers need to have (immeasurable) knowledge and performance of individual autonomous systems in order to avoid confusion and understand ambiguous headlines. Therefore, are there any words in the headlines that are typical of Cape Coloured discourse? Do they have the same meaning as is used on the Cape Flats? And can one argue that readers require knowledge of both (or all) languages displayed in the headlines? Homophones, polysemes and homonyms work across two or more languages making the analysis and interpretation more complicated than one would expect in purely monolingual contexts.

3. Phonology: Reah (2002) also discusses the third level, known as phonology, which focuses on the awareness of sound by readers. Often rhyming, repetition or alliteration of sound segments are used to create an aural effect. With regard to the phonology category, mere knowledge of English and Afrikaans as separate autonomous linguistic systems does not necessarily equip a reader with the schema required to enunciate, interpret and understand headlines. It would be interesting to explore how the Daily Voice uses the knowledge of Cape Coloured discourse to create word play and typical sounds of the Cape Flats.

4. Loaded words: The fourth level refers to the use of loaded words in headlines. According to Reah (2002) words with heavy or strong connotations are used to attract readers. Often the words used boost or support the newsworthiness of a news report. Therefore, using synonyms of the chosen words in loaded headlines could simmer down the effect of the original headline. The loaded words category is contentious as Reah’s work is based on loaded or heavily connotative words as items of monolingual speech forms. This mechanism falls short with regard to the use of bilingual and hybrid discourse forms such as Cape Flats linguistic practices.
Thus it might appear as if all hybrid discourse is loaded which clearly is not the case. Code-switching as a mix of two languages raises questions of which words of which languages are loaded and why, as well as according to who. Code-switching viewed as a singular form of a localised and socially constructed code thus positions and values various lexical items and syntactic constructions based on specific contexts and cultures of interlocutors. Thus loaded terms or views are culturally based and culture specific and if words in headlines are interpreted based on their meanings within the system of their respective language groups, meaning-making as a socially constructed process is affected. Distorted and dismembered meanings void of cultural significance would be the result if headlines are viewed and assessed according to which lexical items are derived from English and which from Afrikaans. There is thus the need to recognise changing landscapes of bilingualism in the media and the need to formulate, adapt, or unearth alternative language devices or frameworks to accommodate discourses as is used in the *Daily Voice* frontpages. With regard to the word and meaning category provided by Reah (2002), the polysemic and ambiguous nature particular words and terms have in one language may offer different meanings. Therefore, mixing two languages heightens the possibility for misunderstanding that each language offers and further complicates any interpretation if words resemble exact forms from the other language. In simpler terms the English possessive pronoun “my” resembles the Afrikaans possessive pronoun “my” [mej]. In this instance the words mean the same but it may not always be the case.

Therefore, how does a reader know when from a phonological standpoint, the lexical item (or parts of it) is sounded as an English word and when as an Afrikaans word? How are morphological constructions and inflections of words such as “gesuip, pa’s, Hoes” etc determined? How, from a syntactic perspective does one determine which phrase structure rules are followed across such unpredictable constructions? How then from a semantic standpoint is meaning derived given the conditions and connotative and denotative features such words may have? Establishing answers to these questions can no longer be sought using the deeply rooted ideological premises which have inspired the Eurocentric canons of
discourse research especially with regard to hybrid speech forms. Analysis cannot be based on monolingual paradigms that interpret hybrid discourses as products of systematic mixing of two (or more) autonomous languages such as English and Afrikaans in this instance. This study therefore is indeed an exploration of bilingualism in the media but not an exploration of bilingualism in the media based on monolingual tenets that have for too long been used to define hybrid forms as stigmatised, stereotyped and premeditated mixing of two or more separate linguistic codes.

This leads to questioning the validity and relevance of the term ‘loaded words’ in the case of the Daily Voice as well as the techniques used by the Daily Voice to amplify the contextual meaning attached to particular lexical items.

**Summary**

The analytical frameworks I used are several yet interconnected due to the nature of the data. A multimodal Daily Voice frontpage needs to be analysed in numerous terms some of which include indexicalisation, appraisal and language devices. MDA as the main tool of analysis encapsulates and situates the other frameworks within the field of SFL. MDA provides the platform from which to assess the intersemiotic relationships of co-occurring signs within a single text. MDA’s viability thrives given the nature of and conditions under which people communicate across various contexts in this age of information. Multitextual organisation in the Daily Voice cannot be analysed if the contents of the tabloid frontpages are treated as independent and isolated meaning makers. Thus MDA is essential not just as a tool that helps to identify verbal and visual components but also the relationship these texts have with each other and how this relationship constructs the meaning-making options that are available to participants.

Although MDA helps define intersemiotic relationships, the intertextual nature of all signs that are used is important to consider. Each sign holds some degree of intertextual significance and thus cultural, social, educational schemata (amongst several other forms of knowledge) are either catapulted into the negotiation of meaning or born out of the multimodal construction. In other words the level of intertextual understanding affects
interpretation whether or not participants are familiar with the meaning-making context or not. This interpretation and understanding of the *Daily Voice* texts is dependent on framing techniques used as well as the collective schemata of the readers.

The language devices proposed by Reah (2002) used to analyse the verbal headlines are explored and more importantly, critiqued for its monolingual bias. I use this approach to test whether or not language devices are really applicable to discourses that do not conform to the stringent tenets Reah proposes in framework. Reah’s categories include intertextuality, word and meaning, phonology and loaded words. I also addressed the feasibility of analysing the data in terms of these categories.

This chapter shows how identities and interpersonal relationships constructed through indexicalisation is realised through appraisal. The attitude and graduation modes of appraisal are explored as it is these levels of the interpersonal system that draws on cultural schemata and elevates the emotion of the constructed meaning on the *Daily Voice* frontpages. The two components of appraisal are used to identify how the *Daily Voice* delves the cultural schemata through intertextual references. Attitude identifies these intertextual references and graduation highlights the techniques used to amplify the intertextual references. In essence graduation is a tool used to identify the mere mechanical or functional attributes of a text that turns up the intensity levels based on the intertextual references that are used.
Chapter 5
Research Methodology and Design

5.0 Introduction
The study will be a form of qualitative research based on textual analysis. This chapter details the research paradigm, sample design and sample size, data collection, the data collection process as well as the limitations and problems encountered. The largely qualitative approach means that the research is mostly interpretive in nature and the data is explored within a very relevant social setting. That is the Cape Town-based and Cape Flats-targeting Daily Voice is investigated within the social and geographical locations wherein which it is inspired, produced, distributed and sold.

A qualitative approach allows for a philosophical exploration of hybrid discourses as both social phenomena and as practice. More importantly, it allows for a theoretical and empirical approach. This particular research is unique in many ways. Firstly, it deals with the Daily Voice which is (a) a tabloid in a young South African tabloid market and (b) a tabloid that targets a marginalised Cape Coloured audience in ways that affect the media landscape of South African journalism as well as bi/multilingual discourse analysis research. Secondly, the multimodal nature of the data is approached in such a way that evaluates this newspaper as more than a mere combination of visual and verbal texts but takes into account the cultural and historical significance of the (multi) textual organisation. A study of this descriptive nature is therefore chosen as multimodal discourse analysis in a relatively new-fangled area.

According to Denzin and Lincoln:

Qualitative research is multi method in focus involving an interpretive, naturalistic approach to its subject matter. This means that qualitative researchers study things in their natural setting, attempting to make sense or interpret phenomena in terms of meanings people bring to them. Qualitative research involves the studied use and collection of a variety of empirical materials-case study, personal experience, introspective, life story, interview, observational, historical, interactional, and visual texts-that describe routine and problematic moments and meaning in individuals' lives (1994: 2).
Thus multi method here entails establishing the techniques and tools the *Daily Voice* uses to construct meaning for its audience as well as the “meanings people bring” towards interpreting the stories presented on the frontpages. The natural ethos that the *Daily Voice* emits draws on the historical, personal experience and interactional factors especially, as is aforementioned. The multimodal composition allows for a semiotic approach which helps to interpret possible meanings of various constructions with an awareness of the socio-cultural and socio-historical contexts of where these meanings are inspired, produced and understood.

Similarly, Creswell describes qualitative research as a “priori approach to research grounded in philosophical assumptions, mainly interpretative and naturalistic approach, and on the multiple sources of information and narrative approaches available to the researcher” (1998:14). In addition, Patton states that “qualitative methods permit the evaluator to study selected issues, cases, or events in depth and detail. He continues by stating that “the fact that data collection is not constrained by predetermined categories of analysis contributes to the depth and detail of qualitative data” (1987:9). This approach therefore allows for the selection of frontpages only and more significantly given the sociolinguistic essence of this study, a qualitative analysis allows the opportunity to “capture the richness of people’s experiences in their own terms” as Patton suggests (1987:10).

The qualitative approach will be supplemented by a limited quantitative analysis of some design features of the *Daily Voice*. Patton defines quantitative approaches as using standardised methods “that fit diverse various opinions and experiences into predetermined response categories” (1987:9). He adds that quantitative methods are advantageous in that they measure “the reactions of a great many people to a limited set of questions, thus facilitating comparison and statistical aggregation of the data” (1987:9). Although there are a few statistics provided in the data this study shows more evidences of qualitative approaches than quantitative.

Patton raises two key questions that help researchers in deciding when to use qualitative methods. He asks “What are the functions that come together to make this program what it is?” and “What are the strengths and weaknesses of the program?” (1987:23). Although the term “program” is non-applicable to this study these questions are restructured in this thesis.
to identify the functions that come together to make the Daily Voice what it is and to identify the strengths and weaknesses of the *Daily Voice* (as a tabloid targeting Cape Coloureds).

5.1 Text based/Discourse analysis

Discourse analysis (and critical discourse analysis) is usually described as the analysis of language in relation to its structure, meaning, changeability and even acquisition. Descriptions such as this are deeply rooted in largely Western paradigms which often assume universal applicability as to what discourse is and how it should be assessed. The notions of language as socially mediated and as social practice, are strongly upheld by scholars who argue different dimensions of (critical) discourse analysis. These socially based ideas causally link language use and performance to context. However, the meaning discourses allow become contextually bound so much so that the manner in which meaning and meaningful options are framed is intertextual in nature. In this light, the assumed universality of various discourse analysis approaches becomes problematic.

Xu (2005:5) states that “universally applicable methods or forms of analysis become impossible” largely because the idea of discourse as socially constituted and because of the difficulty of forming an all encompassing definition. Given the link between discourse and context, Xu (2005, 2007) introduces a cultural approach to discourse (CAD) whereby no established model is considered universal but instead, a culturalist approach that views discourse from a global-and-local perspective.

The design and methodology of this study has been influenced by text based/discourse analysis studies (cf. Johnstone 2008, Martin and Rose 2003/2007, Xu 2005 and 2007, Kress and Van Leeuwen 1996/2006). Discourse analysis allows one to explore what and how people draw on their schema about language, about their emotions regarding social issues, their literacy and aural practices, about each other and a host of other aspects. Thus the focus discourse analysis affords moves away from focusing on language as a system abstract of its sociolinguistic functions.
Although there are numerous descriptions for discourse analysis, Johnstone’s fresh approach considers it as an “open-ended heuristic, a research method consisting of a set of topics to consider in connection with any instance of discourse” (2008:xiv). Discourse analysis in this study is less concerned with dividing the constituents of language but rather asks questions regarding issues of identity construction and/or deconstruction, as well as analysing how meaning is socially and culturally negotiated.

Discourse analysis has many uses and given that this method is multi and interdisciplinary friendly, it is impossible to identify all its functions even solely within the area of linguistics. However, discourse analysis allows this study to explore how condensed texts such as headlines may allude to and construct Cape Coloured identity. Discourse analysis also allows investigation as to how meaning can be constructed through segmented verbal texts across the *Daily Voice* frontpages. Another function that discourse analysis plays in this study is to show how cohesive texts use familiar Cape Coloured speech patterns to draw on culturally cased background knowledge of readers. A result of this leaves questions regarding the validity of monolingually biased notions of what language is and how discourse should be researched.

There are several claims to design and methodology in discourse analysis ranging from Fairclough’s discoursal approach (1995), Van Dijk’s cognitive approach (1985, 1990), Wodak’s socio-historical approach (1996), Blommaert’s ideological approach (2005), Xu’s cultural approach (2005, 2007) and Kress and Van Leeuwen’s MDA (1996/2006). What is common to all these approaches is that they propose a multidisciplinary design and methodology in studying discourse. It is in this light that the study combines some of the above approaches and SFL.

For instance the study uses MDA to analyse the *Daily Voice* frontpages in order to answer questions such as why the layout composition is the way it is? Why are certain chunks of information only in one language or why is it bilingual in nature? What would happen if the juxtaposition were to be rearranged? I use aspects of SFL to determine how the texts in the data add to construction (or deconstruction) of *Daily Voice* discourse. Given that the *Daily
Voice is a tabloid, identifying the target audience, the socio-cultural context and the roles of all involved in the mass communication process is important. Xu’s (2007) is informative in this regard. Although this study does not employ interviews with producers and receivers of meaning in the Daily Voice, motivations and possible meanings of multimodal text can be strongly argued.

5.2 Secondary/Desk Research

In essence the methodology is called secondary/desk research which refers to analysing data that already exists obtained from sources without having to do field work of any sort. Primary research is based on direct observations collected for a specific purpose. These observations usually take the form of face-to-face, telephonic or video conference styled interviews, through questionnaires and even focus groups. There are thus more potential costs involved in this type of research as researchers may pay participants, incur equipment, travel and accommodation expenses etc. Secondary/desk research is a lot more cost and time effective enabling larger amounts of data to be collected at a more rapid pace than primary observations. Secondary/desk is considered summarised descriptions, evaluations and/or analyses based on primary sources (www.sigmasurveys.co.za). In other words the researcher does not have an eye-witness account and instead (re)analyses published or unpublished data. With reference to this study, prominent sources include the literature found in library books and journals, internet articles and e-journals as well as the Daily Voice itself. Desk research in the media industry is often more market related in that viewer or readership figures are more sought after to establish leisure, educational or financial trends etc. However, as this study links the media industry and the construction of bilingual discourse identities, a text based research design is the preferred option that this study adopts (Martin and Rose 2007). Interviews and questionnaires with Daily Voice editorial staff and readers would entail a more primary research approach. Given the newness and scope of this particular dissertation such methodologies that require field work are better suited to larger undertakings that would use more primary sources. More significantly, the multimodal discourse analysis used in this study requires more attention as to how semiotic signs interact to negotiate meaning and construct identity options within a specific socio-cultural context rather than to elicit responses from the participants who engage with the text at hand.
5.3 Data Collection
Copies of the *Daily Voice* frontpages have been physically collected through purchasing the publication continuously for a period of 15 consecutive working days. The decision to use 15 consecutive working days is to explore the variety, or lack thereof, the publication uses with regard to frontpage presentation. Also, the *Daily Voice* is printed Mondays to Fridays and is readily accessible for purchase. Secondary sources of data such as books, journal articles, e-journals and the internet are used to form the core of the literature in this study.

5.4 Data Analysis
The data is analysed using the various kinds of tools aforementioned with a particular focus on using multimodal discourse analysis approach (Martin and Rose 2007; Kress and Van Leeuwen’s 1996/2006). The data is analysed using the frameworks outlined in chapter 4. More specifically, the analysis is based within the area of SFL by using MDA. The tenets of a multimodal approach thus includes the relationship types between the visual and verbal signs of the *Daily Voice* as suggested by Martin and Rose (2007), Kress and Van Leeuwen’s (1996/2006) grammar of visual design to assess positional value of all signs and exploring the indexicalisation of signs in relation to other co-occurring signs. MDA includes analysing the data by looking at framing techniques and the intertextual references on the *Daily Voice* audience’s socio-cultural knowledge. These tenets allow for the analysis of the data in terms of what the verbal and visual signs mean or the meaning they offer within a very localised Cape Flats context. The bilingual discourse is thus analysed through its localised significance and evidence as to how and why misconceptions of Cape Coloured linguistic practices as purely code-switching is presented by virtue of analysis. Therefore the data analysis will focus on the following features: Real, Ideal, Given, New, Colour Codes, Salience, Framing, Intertextuality, Indexicalisation, Appraisal, Language Devices etc.

5.5 Limitations of the study
The study is based on a Western Cape tabloid the *Daily Voice* and the data is limited to just 15 consecutive daily editions. The study is limited to the frontpages of the tabloid as there are several verbal and visual elements presented but sometimes some stories continue to the
inside pages. In this regard, in some cases I follow the stories into the inside pages. The exploration of the verbal text focuses on the frontpage headlines as these are considered the main verbal signs used to attract readers and relay meaning. The frontpages are the main and initial expected starting point of interaction between the multimodal text and reader.

**Summary**

In this chapter I outlined the research methods used for this study. I focus on doing a discourse analysis by using a secondary/desk research approach, allowing me to analyse the intersemiotic relationship between verbal and visual signs within the broader area of SFL. The cultural approach to analysing the *Daily Voice* is drawn from the work of Xu (2007) discussed above.
Chapter 6
Data Analysis: Multimodal Discourse Analysis

6.0 Introduction
The chapter demonstrates how the Daily Voice uses the verbal and visual signs to contextualise the stories in Cape Coloured socio-cultural contexts. This multimodal analysis begins with a focus on the visual aspect of the study rather than the verbal. This is deliberate in that the current hype surrounding studies of visual literacy brings much excitement to various semiotic and linguistic studies. The collected frontpages display a range of compositions, although there are several patterns that occur throughout. Therefore I will analyse the visual in terms of the Information Value, Framing, Salience, Intertextuality, Indexicality, Language Devices and Appraisal. The analysis of Indexicalisation, Appraisal and Language devices is taken up in the next chapter.

6.1 Choice of Stories
One of the ways that the Daily Voice localises the paper is through their choices of stories. The types of stories on the frontpages are exclusively based on what happens on the Cape Flats or are linked to the Cape Flats. The Daily Voice frontpages cover stories that are common to the Cape Flats and relevant to the community members. Thus the newsworthiness of their stories is localised rather than popularised. In other words, celebrities are not celebrities per se but at most, local politically, religiously, judicially, sportingly and communally famed persons or groups. Therefore ward councillors, religious leaders, school teachers and principals, police officials and gang members are some of the main newsmakers. Negligent parents, abusive and murderous spouses and children, drug addicts, sex offenders, hard-core and imprudent criminals among others are also the newsmakers. Events that are reported on are largely frequent and calamitous on a local and personalised level. Whilst other media report on how events impact masses, the Daily Voice focuses on senseless (gang) murders, rape and other sexually motivated crimes, damage to homes due to fires, burglary and turbulent weather conditions, poor housing and sanitary municipal services, missing children and many social ills and trends that may affect individuals, small groups and/or the broader community. The stories are generated for, by and consistently within the Cape Flats community rather than purchased from news agencies as is the case for most mainstream
media publications. Thus content is socio-culturally embedded and the socio-cultural embeddedness inspires the content. This symbiotic relationship between cultural context and content is multimodally achieved visually through the use of highly saturated colourful images and colourful typographic features of verbal text and of course the verbal text itself in the form of the linguistic resource options available to the Daily Voice. This study identifies four techniques the Daily Voice uses to appeal to its audience.

The first is focused on the angle that the Daily Voice uses to draw its target audience from an economic standpoint. A largely working class community, the Cape Flats has a large number of unemployed and poor residents. Thus the continuous plugging of the “ONLY R2” (now R2.50) tag that appears on each edition, highlights the low cost and affordability. In this way the local stories that are selected are sold at a very affordable price as the Daily Voice does not only target an untapped market but promotes its marketability through the low cost. In so doing, the instant cash prize competitions and involvement strategies discussed further on form part of a marketing approach that proves effective because of the contextualised nature of the Daily Voice to the Cape Flats.

The second technique is the focus on crime related stories that happen on the Cape Flats. Although crime is normalised on the Cape Flats the Daily Voice heightens the affect crime has on the general members of this community. There are several instances where victims and accused/perpetrators of crime are ‘iconised’ not only through innovative framing devices, camera angles and word choices, but also by representing and developing the frontpage stories in more depth in the rest of the newspaper. Children photographed in ‘demanding’ (Kress and van Leeuwen 2006) mugshots with a black strip covering their eyes (for anonymity purposes), are often constructed as victims of abuse, neglect and parental homicide. Murdered persons, sometimes shown with their severed limbs, are portrayed as victims of either random acts of killing or victims of gang related activity on the Cape Flats. The families of those portrayed as victimised are often visually and verbally constructed in ways that elicit sympathetic responses from the Daily Voice audience. In this regard, accused/perpetrators of these crimes are visually and verbally positioned as recipients of communal disdain and anger.
A third technique used by the *Daily Voice* is the emphasis placed on sport. Springbok rugby and the English football premier league are major sporting attractions on the Cape Flats. The glamour and appeal of international sport focuses on football played in Europe and the United Kingdom especially. Rugby is a sport that holds much tradition on the Cape Flats. Even though opportunities to play top brass rugby during apartheid were non-existent to limited for Cape Coloureds, there remained massive support for the Western Province (WP) rugby team which represented this province. This support still exists today for WP although the national team, the Springboks, do not enjoy complete support from Cape Flats locals, especially the older generations. Due to the apartheid boycott of South African rugby there is a love-hate relationship for the Springbok rugby team as Cape Coloured families are often divided in their support of the Springboks and other international teams especially the New Zealand (All Blacks) teams. Thus many rivalries exist between especially older and younger generations on the Cape Flats during the annual Tri-nations tournament between South Africa, New Zealand and Australia. This rivalry is also present in the Super 14 tournament which is earmarked as the premier regional rugby tournament (in the southern hemisphere). Regional teams from the tri-nations endure more than three months of high action rugby and many New Zealand teams have supporters on the Cape Flats who do not support the local Western Cape team, the Stormers.

This type of sporting rivalry is extended to supporters of various Barclays English Premier League (EPL) teams. There is huge support for Manchester United Football Club (MUFC), Liverpool Football Club (LFC), Arsenal and to a lesser extent Chelsea Football Club (CFC) as well as a few other English teams. The rich tradition for English or British football dates back to the years where British professionals trained local South African clubs to an age where local players such as Quinton Fortune, Shaun Bartlett and Bennidict McCarthy applied and in McCarthy’s case, currently applies, their trade in the EPL. Other European teams such as Spain’s Barcelona and Real Madrid and Italy’s AC Milan, Inter Milan and Juventues enjoy some support as well. For those who follow the EPL, the rivalry between MUFC and LFC in particular dates back many years. Whilst not as fierce as the rivalries in England, the support for these international teams exceeds the hype that is afforded to local football teams.
such as Ajax Cape Town and Santos. Although South Africa’s traditional rivalry is undoubtedly between the Orlando Pirates and Kaizer Chiefs football teams, their popularity is stronger amongst Black supporters. Glenn and Knaggs (2008:118) argue that to be a fan of one of the major EPL teams is “to inhabit, by extension, a realm of high social capital and achievement”. This explains the glamour of supporting these teams based outside of South Africa.

The fourth technique is one that creates direct involvement between the Daily Voice and the public and in many ways draws together the previous techniques discussed above. The Daily Voice connects to its audience by directly appealing to them to submit stories. By using tags such as “Do You Have A Story” and “Call Our News Desk”, which are located in the bottom quadrants, the public is prompted to contribute local Cape Flats stories to the paper. In this way the Cape Flats community is given agency and adds to the composition of the Daily Voice. These stories reported by the community have several consequences. Firstly, the Daily Voice reports stories that are rooted within the community and therefore not dependent on elite persons or organisations as newsmakers. Thus the Cape Flats community members are news sources and newsmakers of the very stories that the Daily Voice aims at them. Secondly, agency of the community means that the Daily Voice carries issue-based stories (not only on the frontpages) elsewhere in the paper. Daily features such as the “Rek Jou Bek” section allows the Daily Voice audience to engage with each other, discussing, debating, solving, and raising issues that affect them. This feature requires people to SMS their views on the very issues mentioned above that include crime and sport as well as entertainment, views about events or persons. This leads to the third consequence where as a result of the community contributing to the news content and the social forum created by “Rek Jou Bek”, the Daily Voice creates characters and icons out of these stories. In other words, villains and victims of abuse and neglect such as the mother and child depicted in figure 1.12, have their hecklers and sympathisers. People show support or disapproval of persons, events and issues that are all relevant and localised to the Cape Flats. The Daily Voice has also created its very own caped Cape Flats superhero (refer to figure 2.1) known as Captain Voice Power. This Cape Flats hero attends local galas or social fundraisers, gives alms to the needy and even has his own SMS line and postal address for any community-based outreach requests to be sent.
his way. The effect of this means that anyone or group that he helps, is newsworthy for the *Daily Voice.*

### 6.2 Information value

Related to the strategies of choosing stories is Information value. Information value refers to the value an element holds because of its position in a text. This section analyses the effect of juxtaposing various stories in their respective locations on the frontpages. Diagram1.0 shows the quadrants that refer to the information value suggested by Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006).

![Diagram1.0](image)

#### 6.2.1 Sport as representation of the Ideal

It is not surprising then that the Ideal that is the top half of the text of figure1.0, has images of football players of various top English Premier League teams, as well as a Springbok rugby player at the 2007 Rugby World Cup with the headline “Bokke’s Island Dream”. Positioning the football and rugby in Q1 and Q2 glamourises these sports and appeals to Cape Flats residents who are passionate about the teams and the two sporting codes. The passion referred to here is underlined by the “15 pages of Mania sport” included in this particular Monday morning edition where the word “Manía” highlights how important sport is on the Cape Flats. Figure 1.3 has an image of Wayne Rooney (of MUFC) in Q2 with the text “Wayne’s scoring again” as if to suggest that he has not scored a goal in a while. The fact that the player scored appeals to the many MUFC supporters but the subheading “Wayne’s scoring again” does infer to supporters of other teams that Rooney has been below par for sometime.
Figure 1.5 again idealises the “15 pages of Mania Sport” with all of Q1 and Q2 composed of references to the Springbok quarterfinal game against Fiji. The headline “Fiji en Klaar” not only refers to the slender Springbok victory over Fiji but indeed refers to figure 1.0’s depiction of “Bokke’s Island Dream”. Fiji, being a Pacific Island nation was the “Bokke’s Island Dream” opponents. Significantly, there is a play on a familiar Cape Coloured phrase, “finish and klaar”, basically meaning done and dusted, which has been adopted by the rest of South Africa. In a way, a localised saying has evolved into a more global (or at least national) coinage. There are two images from that game with Springbok hero Bryan Habana positioned in Q2. Habana is one of South Africa’s most famous and influential sports personalities and is internationally known for his rugby talents. Thus he is glamourised much like Wayne Rooney and other EPL players. Rugby is a much loved sport on the Cape Flats and it is the elite of the rugby world (Springboks and Habana) that are idealised. Significantly also is the fact that the two rugby images of figure 1.5 are taken from a World Cup match which happens to be the first such tournament that the Daily Voice has been able to report on as the 2003 version took place before the Daily Voice launch.

Figure 1.10 also has an image from the 2007 Rugby World Cup and shows a dejected French player (Sebastian Chabal) after his team was eliminated from the tournament. The headline “French Kiss Cup Goodbye” is supplemented by the “And 14 Pages of Mania Sport”. Thus the fact that the host nation France was kicked out of the tournament is not all that the Daily Voice offers for in fact there are 14 pages of other sports news. However, the Daily Voice plays on the saying kiss it good bye/ kiss your chances good bye, by referring to “French Kiss” as both reference to the French losing out on their chances to win a home-based tournament and the well known physical French kissing style. Figure 1.13 shows an image of Habana in Q1 in conjunction with the promotion of a competition to win Springbok rugby jerseys. The inclusion of Habana works with the idealised concept of winning “official” jerseys that will leave you dressed in a kit just like Habana. This idea is reinforced by the accompanying female dressed in a Springbok jersey in Q2. In this way the audience is brought closer to the tournament played abroad in France.
6.2.2 Competitions as representation of the Ideal

The *Daily Voice* idealises wealth and glamour through promoting various competitions and cash prizes in Q1 and Q2. The target market is considered poor to working class hence the promise of financial incentives does construct the socio-economic identity of Cape Flats residents. The *Daily Voice* competitions that idealise wealth and instant prize or cash injections are presented in the top sided Ideal as well as the bottom margins of the Real. Figures 1.4; 1.9; 1.13; 1.14 show these promotions of the promise of what could be inside those particular editions of the *Daily Voice*. These competitions are largely aimed at those of lower socio-economic statuses and so a rich status is idealised. The *Daily Voice* however, does not use the elite icons such as Habana or Rooney to promote these competitions directly, instead the use of local Cape Flats ‘personalities’ is preferred. Figure 1.4 shows Captain Voice Power and a Cape Coloured female holding cash notes to promote instant prizes and the *Daily Voice* card game that has a R400 000 jackpot. The same female is pictured in Q2 of figure 1.9. This constructs the lay person as standing every chance of winning prizes and/or money. Figure 1.13 shows a car competition in Q2 of the Ideal section. In this instance, an American car brand, Chevrolet, is promoted as a prize. Cars, especially modified cars with eclectic colours and expensive sound systems are popular on the Cape Flats and this competition offers an expensive R400 000 car as a prize. Figure 1.13 promotes the chance to win six Springbok rugby jerseys in the Ideal section. This links with the previous analysis of sport as a draw card for rugby loving Cape Flats residents. Here, an image of Habana is used along with the image of an attractive Cape Coloured female dressed in a female styled Springbok jersey. The idea of “official” jerseys is made official by the image of Habana and the local female is used to draw sex appeal as well highlight that it is not just men who love rugby on the Cape Flats. In the following edition, figure 1.14 the female appears in Q2 without an image of Habana. In this instance, the jerseys are already established as official and here the female promotes the jersey competition, a free poster and the cash competition as an established ‘competition girl’. All these strategies home in on trying to change the socio-economic status of the Cape Flats residents by showing how local characters and the lay person is able to win cash instantly. It should be noted that the title *Daily Voice* and the continuous accompanying verbal text (the slogan, cost and edition date) are constant throughout the data and forms part of the Ideal. This constructs Cape Flats
residents as being able to afford a newspaper that is “Only R2”, which could lead to instant financial success. All this explains why these features appear in the Ideal sections of the Daily Voice. Interestingly, all data except figures 1.0; 1.9; 1.12; 1.14 idealise the prospect of winning R400 000 offer the chance of winning through the numbers game card competition. However, there are 10 out of 15 frontpages (66.67%) that promote the “Get Your R400 000 Voice Skrik Vir Niks Numbers Inside” in the margins of Q3 and Q4 in the Real sections.

6.2.3 Crime, child related crime and neglect as representation as the Ideal

Besides the competitions and idealised sporting events, the Ideal section also contains several crime related reports. In figure 1.3 the headline “Blood on Cops’ Hands: Slapgat Police Work Breeds Mob Justice”, constructs the police as sloppy and unreliable. Given the level of crime on the Cape Flats, the police are ideally expected to serve the community and maintain order and justice. However, this idealised notion of safety is tainted by the construction of clumsy/”slapgat” police being the cause of vigilantism. Communities do not expect to blame police for being the root to crime and violence and indeed death as is depicted in the image of the bloodied lifeless corpse. However, the notion of mob justice acts as an outcry against the level of crime but also, against the sloppy police work on the Cape Flats. The accompanying image intensifies the accusation of police having blood on their hands as the beaten and bloodied corpse lays helplessly cringed to the ground [See Appraisal section 7.1].

Figure 1.7 shows an image in Q1 of a man holding a child. Police are blamed for having led the child’s mother to her death. Yet again, this is not an ideal situation of expectation for a crime ridden Cape Flats community. These two depictions (figures 1.3 and 1.7) reinforce a communal feeling across the Cape Flats that police do not do enough to curb and cure the crime levels as well as the nature of the crime. The story framed in Q2 of figure 1.7 also focuses on another non-ideal situation on the Cape Flats especially. Parents and caregivers who neglect their children are unsavoury features of the Cape Flats and indeed any community. The image of a seven year old girl holding two younger siblings and being forced to care for them as a result of drunken neglectful parents is not a situation that one expects. Their identities are protected because they are minors but the fact that their parents neglected them because of excessive alcohol consumption is disturbing. The two stories in
figure 1.7’s Q1 and Q2 position traditional caregivers and protectors (parents and police) as incompetent, guilty and neglectful of their parental and societal duties. The theme of victimised children is further reinforced in the Real sections of several frontpages.

McCormick (2002), Adhikari (2005) and other commentators have characterised the Cape Flats as crime infested. Frontpages are normally filled with images and headlines to do with crime in the Real quadrants. Given the increased reports of child related crime on the Cape Flats this section addresses child neglect as one theme and general crime as another.

6.2.4 Crime as representation of the Real

Therefore, in figure 1.0 the Real is represented by the image of the deceased man in his red taxi, as well as the smaller inset photograph of his wife. He was a victim of a random act of violence. The story was not followed up in subsequent editions. The framing of the bloodied husband leaning grotesquely and the inset of his crestfallen wife is suggestive of appraisal using visuals. From a visual aspect, the inset photograph of the man and his daughter of figure1.1 is considered the Real, as well as, the darkened and blurred background on which the headline is superimposed.

Figures 1.5; 1.6 and 1.8 also all contain crime reports of fatal stabbings and/or shootings on the Cape Flats. Figure 1.5 has a headline “No Fear” as the fatal stabbing of a Cape Flats took place metres away from a local police station. The fearlessness of the perpetrator/s is underlined by the location of the incident. Killing someone is one thing but to do so basically on the doorstep of a police station speaks volumes of the conditions on the Cape Flats. The centre image shows the opened chest wounds of the corpse. The caption describes the victim as being “butchered”. The accompanying images indicate the police being “too late” and more significantly situates the killing outside the police station by using an image of the station. The nature of the killing is intensified by the verbal text “No Fear” as well as the image of the mutilated corpse. The subheading describes the victim as a “Flats man” to draw the audience and construct that this type of crime is directly affecting the Cape Flats community. Subtly, there is another stab at the police force who are described as “slapgat” and incompetent in other editions of the Daily Voice closely dated to the report in figure 1.5.
Poor police work has so far led to vigilantism, the death of a mother, the stabbing of a Cape Flats resident just metres away from a local police station and in figure 1.6 the inability to prevent four shootings.

In figure 1.6 the Cape Flats is described as resembling a “war zone” in the mini-report located in Q4. Again the emphasis is to highlight that crime is rife and that crime varies in degrees of brutality and fatality. Interestingly, the image of a thief involved in one of the four pre-noon shootings, shows a covered corpse as opposed to the many images of uncovered corpses. In this light the argument is that when innocent Cape Flats people are gruesomely killed or murdered, then the images are explicit depicting bloodied, lifeless bodies to evoke emotional responses from the audience. *Daily Voice* readers are less likely to sympathise with criminals than they are with lay persons. Figure 1.8 shows the corpse of a pregnant woman and her unborn child who were killed for a pair of earrings. The meaningless murder by two gunmen is expressed by the verbal and visual signs. Verbally, the words “Varke,” “heavily pregnant”, “brutally gunned down” and “execution” heighten the emotions of such a crime. The words “Flats mom” and “gangland” situate the crime on the Cape Flats as gang activity is deeply rooted in this community. The bloodied corpse, similar to the cab driver in figure 1.0, is centralised on the frontpage. The effect of positioning the image in the region of Real section hits home to *Daily Voice* readers that these types of senseless crimes do take place and that even unborn children are victimised.

### 6.2.5 Najwa Petersen case as representation of the Ideal and Real

There was a time when the Cape Flats was gripped by the story of Najwa Petersen and the details surrounding the murder of her famed husband, Taliep Petersen. During the week of 1 October 2007, the *Daily Voice* carried a story on Najwa Petersen and her family. There were insinuations that her family (the Dirk family) were involved in illegal diamond smuggling. Thus it is not surprising that figure 1.1 shows a photograph of a wreckage of a crashed vehicle in which Najwa’s father died in the Ideal position. Najwa is already iconised during previous *Daily Voice* discourse as her continuous appearances in the newspaper dating back to the killing of her late husband, well-known local and international musical and theatre composer Taliep Petersen, in December 2006 (see figure 2.2 for a witness account of
Petersen’s murder). Taliep was infamous for productions such as “District Six”, “Poison”, “Ghoema” and “Kat and the Kings” which toured internationally as well. The troublesome nature of Najwa and Taliep’s nuptial was reported on by the *Daily Voice* months before his murder. From the murder, the suspicion of her involvement to her arrest (during data collection) and now as the convicted mastermind of the murder, Najwa’s case has been duly covered by the *Daily Voice* in an almost soap opera style of reporting often referring to stories as “The Najwa Files” (see figure 2.2). Through frontpage representations of her court cases and prison lifestyle to the clashes between her supporters and those baying for her conviction carried out in “Rek Jou Bek”, the families of Taliep (Petersen family), Najwa (Dirk family) and the co-accused have been built up in almost feud like fashion. Several stories in the *Daily Voice* would report face-offs between families and supporters of both Taliep and Najwa especially outside the many court proceedings. Thus Najwa and Taliep are constructed as local Cape Flats personalities or celebrities and even in his death his name still carries newsworthiness.

In this light, figure 1.8 shows an image of Najwa in Q2 (with her regularly seen head scarf and sunglasses/spectacles). With the exception of the images in figures 1.8 and 1.13 all the camera angles of Najwa are side view angles, which is significant as this type of angle frames her as she is not framed in a demand posture (see 7.4.2 for further details). Her depiction as a devout Muslim woman wearing a head scarf and the dark sunglasses making her look rather eerie at the same time adds to the iconic nature of how Najwa is constructed, especially since there are 8 images of her with 6 (75%) being side view and just 2 (25%) being face on. The reason for positioning her as idealised is reinforced by the subheadline “Fan turns on widow”. This positions her as an icon or celebrity and more significantly, positions a particular Cape Flats resident as fanatical. Figure 1.11 has a headline “Liar Exposed in Najwa Case” with an inset image of Taliep in Q1 and an image of her in Q2. The use of “Liar” and “Exposed” suggests scandal and gossip in the ideal section. Before the “Ons Skrik Vir Niks” slogan, the *Daily Voice* slogan read “Sex, Scandal, Skinner, Sport” where “Skinner” means gossip. This insinuates that gossip is common and likeable amongst Cape Flats residents.
Interestingly, stories of Najwa are also positioned in Q3 and Q4 as part of the Real. Figure 1.1 constructs Najwa’s feelings regarding her impermissibility to attend her father’s funeral, which by Islamic law should take place within 24 hours of death. The car wreckage of her father Sulaiman Dirk’s accident is positioned in the Ideal. Thus it is her emotions that are real, actual and the consequences thereof are depicted in the images of her father and the wrecked car. The inset image of a happier Sulaiman and Najwa contrasts the “Hell” constructed in the headline. This story takes on a different angle in the following edition. Figure 1.2 sees Najwa facing off with one of her co-accused, regarding the issue of ‘time-off’ to attend a funeral as her imprisoned co-accused was denied the chance to attend his father’s funeral the previous week. The report states that she paid her way out to attend her father’s funeral (depicted inset in Q3). The reference to Robert Kiyosaki’s book *Rich Dad Poor Dad* contrasts the difference in financial pull both Najwa and her co-accused have in this situation. The shady nature of her family business is already established in the previous edition’s report of Sulaiman’s death, and the quick turnaround of permissibility to attend the funeral is constructed as a result of financial clout and persuasion. This is typified by the subheadline “Najwa buys day off jail for pa’s funeral”. This contrast of fortunes positions the Cape Flats community as questioning why money can buy one convict a day off for a funeral and not the other. Suddenly, “Najwa’s Hell” is not seen as precarious as the day before. Instead, her family name, history and business dealings are rooted in her being positioned as benefiting from having a “Rich Dad”.

The shady Dirk reputation is further reinforced in figure 1.4 where it is reported that Najwa plans to soil Taliep’s family name. The headline “Najwa’s Dirty Tricks” along with a side on image of her appear in the Real Q3 and Q4. This story again pits the two families against each other as it is reported that Najwa looks to expose Taliep’s family secrets. This type of story, coupled with the courtroom fracases and exchanges in “Rek Jou Bek”, draws on the rivalry that has already been constructed within the community. In contrast, figure 1.9 alludes to Najwa’s possible innocence as police were yet to find a murder weapon at that stage. Similarly, figure 1.13 positions Najwa’s friend, Waleed Ajouhaar, as her “knight in shining armour” if she was granted bail and released. This positions her as a proverbial damsel in distress and from this, the community within the space of three weeks have been exposed to
stories about Najwa relating to the death of her father, her release from jail for the funeral and the role her family’s wealth played in her release, her tactics to expose Taliep’s family, claims of her innocence and her possible saviour all positioned in the Real. The effect of this is that these are the issues that are the salient talking points (at that time) on the Cape Flats.

6.2.6 Child related crime and neglect as representation of the Real
The increase in child neglect incidences and child related crime on the Cape Flats are issues that have been highly prioritised by the *Daily Voice* during its short existence. During the 4 years of publication the *Daily Voice* has done in depth reporting of cases of missing and abducted children, child neglect, child murders and related issues. One case in point is the extensive coverage of the death of baby Jordan Leigh Norton since June 2005. Within months of its launch, the *Daily Voice* reported extensively on the first known contract killing of a baby. In like fashion to the hype around Najwa Petersen’s case, the *Daily Voice* reported on what became known as the Baby Jordan case in as much detail, if not more, than any other publication. The eventual life sentencing of the woman found guilty of orchestrating the murder, Dina Rodrigues, ended more than two and a half years of a gripping reporting style by the *Daily Voice*. (Refer to figure 2.3 for sample coverage of Rodrigues.) During that period the *Daily Voice* reported on the thorough and lengthy police investigation, the horrific details of the calculated murder, the proceedings and reactions both inside and outside of the courtroom, Dina’s prison life style, the life styles of Baby Jordan’s family, the public reactions and views of those who packed the courtroom galleries, the Norton family’s colour coordinated dress codes on courtroom days and even the increase of sales for a nearby vendor who profited from the crowds who attended on courtroom days. Basically, in more than two years of in depth step by step reporting, the *Daily Voice* used countless angles to cover the murder, investigation, trial and sentencing of this incident. The mix included genres of hard news reporting, gossip, entertainment and more soft news stories connected (or connected by the *Daily Voice*) to the Baby Jordan case. All this provides evidence that through this reporting a particular discourse was formed, be it a Baby Jordan case discourse or a Dina discourse. Ordinary citizens became celebrities in the form of the Norton family, especially Jordan’s mother Natasha Norton where even her new “outjie” (boyfriend) at the time is mentioned as well her sleeping patterns months after Jordan’s murder. (see figures 2.3 and
Dina became known as the *Baby Killer* and the discourse of hitmen and child contract killings became localised to the Cape Flats. The community became enthralled and involved and support for both the Rodrigues and Norton families was evident in the *Daily Voice* reports throughout this period. Thus, since its inception the *Daily Voice* has carried the theme of not just reporting on child related crime, but invoking such raw emotions and emotional affixtures from the community so much so that “Rek Jou Bek” also acts as a communal catharsis for their audiences to vent anger and sorrow at the misfortune that befalls many children on the Cape Flats.

There have been several other ‘notable’ cases of child abuse, neglect or crime. It is not surprising then that in figure 1.7 the *Daily Voice* carries a story about “two Flats moms” who brutally and inhumanely kill their babies. The lead paragraph in Q4 identifies as local Cape Flats women. Both these women are referred to as the “Baby Killers”, which taps into the schema *Daily Voice* readers have regarding Dina Rodrigues’ labelling as the “Baby Killer”. An image of one of the murdered babies is also located in the Real quadrants. The smaller inset image is significant as it is juxtaposed alongside a larger image of one of the accused. In this light, the size of the images correspond with the fact that fully the grown mother cruelly ended the life of her own child. The words “little angels” also intensify the reality of such a crime. The entire frontpage of figure 1.7 deals with stories about children and in all instances caregivers are responsible for inflicting pain, neglect and indeed death on the children.

In this light, figure 1.10 positions the Real section as everything that appears below the “*Daily Voice* Exclusive” tag. In this example a woman is killed. However, it is the plight of the now orphaned boy that is constructed as the focal point. The story is yet again localised to the Cape Flats as the woman is identified as a “Flats mother”. The image of the “little boy” works with the verbal text as he looks lost without his mother. It also works well with the construction of the boy waking up to find his mother dead as the headline states. The anecdotal headline really stresses that fatalities as a result of crime do not merely add to statistics but that children are victims and sufferers of such heinous acts as in this case, just for R400.
Figure 1.11 also deals with children being hurt and killed although in this instance the story positioned in the Real involves a juvenile perpetrator. The 13 year old boy responsible for driving the truck into a group of children has his face blurred in the image to protect his identity. The *Daily Voice* does not shy away from showing photographs of deceased or injured children. Evidence of this statement is that images of children (missing, abandoned, killed or injured) appear on 7 out of 15 (46.67%) frontpages excluding figure 1.8 that has a murdered “heavily pregnant” woman.

All the victimised children across the data are juxtaposed either with those who wronged them or with those comforting them and acting as caregivers. In the Real of figure 1.12 however, the “cute little girl” dumped by her mother is juxtaposed along side an S.O.S. type request in the form of the “Help Me Find My Mom” headline. This is significant as it is the reality of the situation hence the positioning in the Real. The story related to this headline (page 5 of 17 October 2007 edition, see figure 2.5) tells of how the girl, dubbed Christie, was found abandoned, hungry, dirty and fatigued. At this point the details of her abandonment were not known and the related report quotes the investigating officer as saying that “any mother who abandons her child will be locked up” but that the conditions are unknown as the mother may have been attacked or robbed. People with any knowledge of the mother’s whereabouts are requested to contact the investigating officer on the given telephone number. The editorial in this edition also deals with Christie’s case and those similar as the *Daily Voice* condemns irresponsible parenting skills. The editorial on page 6 states “the story of the tiny girl on today’s front page is enough to bring a tear to anyone’s eye” (see figure 2.6). Indeed the image of the girl on the frontpage does make her look poor, destitute and abandoned. Both verbal and visual signs construct a plea for help on behalf of the child.

This detailed discussion of this particular news report is essential in order to analyse the extension of the story two days later in figure 1.14. In this instance, the reason for Christie’s abandonment is revealed. The mother’s drunken stupor was the reason for her dumping her child. A smaller version of Christie, which appeared in figure 1.12, is used alongside an image of her mother. The 2 year old child’s real name is Annelise and even though the mother’s drunken stupor was the root of this neglect, Annelise’s photograph is used to
heighten the anger and shock towards the mother as well as draw attention to the girl’s misfortune. The same image used in figure 1.12 evoked teary eyed responses, however, now that the details for her neglect surfaced in figure 1.14 the juxtapositioning of the headline “Dronk Verdriet” and the two images intensifying the anger and sadness from *Daily Voice* audience and more significantly, highlights the realities of just how careless alcohol induced parents are on the Cape Flats.

The theme of child related crimes and neglect is expanded in both the Real and Ideal sections. The same can be said for the various stories regarding the various competition tags, the Najwa Petersen case, the ineptness of the local Cape Flats police force and other crime related issues. In this way, the clear cut distinctions described by Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006) between Real and Ideal do not correlate as the *Daily Voice* uses both sections to push or construct the same ideologies regarding troublesome child related issues on the Cape Flats.

6.3 The Real and the Ideal as spatial options for meaning-making

It is evident from the arguments so far that what constitutes the Real and the Ideal are not fixed and predetermined. Usually it is expected that the Real relates to more practical, unassuming information. The Real is expected to report on facts and the *Daily Voice* conforms to the expectation in this respect. However, the opinion, evaluation and ideological construction and deconstruction expected in the Ideal quadrants are not only presented in Q1 and Q2 but also in the Real quadrants through the emotional use of colour, visual and verbal texts. There seems to be many similarities between the Real and Ideal across all the data. So much so that:

These stories are actual happenings and not so much idealised concepts. However, Kress and Van Leeuwen’s interpretation for the Ideal is presented in Q1 and Q2 but also in the bottom margins of Q3 and Q4. Therefore, there are frequent resemblances between the Ideal and the Real. Having explored the indexicality of language and images across the data as well as a brief abridgment of how the appraisal framework outlines the role of emotional amplification in language, it becomes easier to identify how the Real and Ideal influence each other.
multimodally. Using the same colour saturation, the same imagery, camera angles and the same type of emotional language, the Real of what is happening on the Cape Flats is idealised.

This study suggests that there is very little difference and therefore the explorations of Kress and Van Leeuwen’s triptych is flexed when considering the multimodal composition of the *Daily Voice* frontpages. The “Exclusive” labels and the red background potentially link the Real and the Ideal and link the lack of difference between the two sections. These labels also connect the same use of colour, the same type of emotional language and the same types of news stories. Also, it is possible to establish that there is an interrelated correlation between the Real and the Ideal and this may well add to the construction or deconstruction of Cape Coloured linguistic repertoires and identity. This study also adds that the Real and Ideal are not two autonomous sections restricted to particular content, instead the *Daily Voice* uses both spaces as desired in order to accommodate the meaning-making options they avail for their audience.

In summary, the following table shows that all the headlines and visuals are linked to the Cape Flats socio-cultural context.

Table 1.0 indicates the Ideal and Real elements of the collected data. The data is analysed in chronological order.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Edition Date</th>
<th>Ideal Element/s</th>
<th>Real Element/s</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.0</td>
<td>01-10-07</td>
<td>Images of football players and rugby player.</td>
<td>Images of deceased man in a taxi and the inset image of his wife.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.1</td>
<td>02-10-07</td>
<td>Images of two men and wrecked vehicle.</td>
<td>Inset image of father and daughter, blurred and darkened background visual.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.2</td>
<td>03-10-07</td>
<td>Images of man ‘performing’ act of ablution and transvestite sales cashier.</td>
<td>Images of man and woman either side of major headline, two inset images of a funeral and the relevant deceased.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.3</td>
<td>04-10-07</td>
<td>Image of football player, policeman and bloodied deceased corpse.</td>
<td>Oxygen-masked women and inset image of one of the victims.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.4</td>
<td>05-10-07</td>
<td>Image of the ‘competition girl’, costumed</td>
<td>Image of woman with brick wall background,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>08-10-07</td>
<td>Both images depicting rugby players</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>09-10-07</td>
<td>Image of current Cape Town mayor, the poison bottles image and the image of the man linked to the poison bottles.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>10-10-07</td>
<td>Two separate images of (a) a man with a child and (b) censored image of a 7 year old child and two younger children.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>11-10-07</td>
<td>A close up image of a woman’s face.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>12-10-07</td>
<td>Image of ‘competition girl’, a woman promoting a particular competition.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>15-10-07</td>
<td>Image of French rugby player</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>16-10-07</td>
<td>Separate images of alleged murderer and her murdered husband.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>17-10-07</td>
<td>Image of a father and his son (identity hidden). As well as a car competition advertisement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>18-10-07</td>
<td>Image of a rugby player and a ‘competition girl’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>19-10-07</td>
<td>Image of ‘competition girl’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.4 Centre and Margin

As discussed earlier, the socio-economic status of the Cape Flats residents is highlighted by the many competitions offered by the Daily Voice. The Daily Voice localises the competitions by giving them prominence in what Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006) call either the Centre or the Margin. It is not surprising that 10 out of 15 editions (66.67%) have “GET YOUR R400 000 VOICE SKRIK VIR NIKS NUMBERS INSIDE” labels at the bottom end of the frontpage, 1 “CALL OUR NEWSDESK ON 021 4884087 ” label, 1 “GET YOUR NEW NUMBERS” label and 3 “DO YOU HAVE A STORY? SMS 32832” labels. Although there are images positioned in the top right hand corner of several frontpages, these labels are distinctive as they are positioned in the bottom Margin of each respective frontpage on which they occur. The information given in each of the 4 types of labels is addressed elsewhere.

6.5 Given and New

Similar to the Real and Ideal, the Given and the New are not fixed or predetermined. However the name of the publication, Daily Voice; including the slogan, “ONS SKRIK VIR NIKS” (roughly translated as we don’t fear anything/we are not scared of anything), the cost and the publication date are fixed throughout the data and are positioned in the top left hand corner reading towards the Centre. In other words, it is permanently part of the Given. The other content regardless of the information value can be located in either the Given or the New.

For example, the image of a Springbok rugby player in figure 1.0 (1 October 2007) is part of the New and is published before the relevant fixture. An image of that particular game appears on the left side and right side of figure 1.5 (8 October 2007) as a known fact the Monday after the weekend game. There is also a headline “Fiji and Klaar (done/completed)” which is linked to accompanying images as well as the “Bokke’s Island Dream” headline in figure 1.0. “Bokke” refers to the nickname of the Springbok rugby team. Therefore, the link between the two representations of the same or similar news event, that is prior and post occurrence, is spread across several days, largely due to non-publishing days over that particular weekend. More significantly, the two images of the Springbok rugby game on
figure 1.5 positioned in Q1 and Q2 respectively cannot be accurately described as Given or New as neither possesses features that would make them strictly Given or New. Both images are from the same game and significantly, Habana, who is a known personality, is in Q2. In terms of Kress and Van Leeuwen’s criteria this situates Habana in the New, but there is nothing novel about the information value his image has in its right-sided position.

Similarly, using Kress and Van Leeuwen’s theories the image of Sulaiman Dirk in Q1 of figure 1.1 and his crushed car would be interpreted as the Given and New respectively. However, even if it was argued that Dirk is already known in the community and that the fatal car crash is newer information, this does not explain why a smaller image of Dirk and Najwa is located in Q4. This image of the father and daughter is an old photograph positioned in the New. The same can be said about the following day’s edition, figure 1.2, where Najwa and a co-accused face-off on the frontpage. Najwa is positioned on the right in Q4 as the New, as opposed to her co-accused positioned as the Given. The public knows both characters yet there are 7 out of the 8 (87.5%) frontpages dealing with stories about Najwa that position her as the New in either Q2 or Q4 and just 1 (14%) positions her in the Given. This shows that even though there are instances where the *Daily Voice* frontpage layouts conform to Kress and Van Leeuwen’s information value criteria, there is enough evidence to prove that their layout conventions are not fixed or predetermined. This flexing or deviance from Kress and Van Leeuwen’s theories however does not devalue the meaning and meaning-making constructions. The table below situates all the elements of the frontpages into Given and New as is suggested by Kress and Van Leeuwen.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Edition Date</th>
<th>Given Element/s = Q3</th>
<th>New Element/s = Q4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.0</td>
<td>01-10-07</td>
<td>HL- “A Call Before Dying”</td>
<td>Images of a deceased man in a taxi and the inset image of his wife. Sub-headline overlap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.1</td>
<td>02-10-07</td>
<td>HL- “Najwa’s Hell”</td>
<td>Inset image of father and daughter, blurred and darkened background visual. Part of the headline runs across Q3 and Q4.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.2</td>
<td>03-10-07</td>
<td>Image of an accused, inset of a funeral, slight overlap of main headline “Rich Dad Poor Dad” and sub-headlines.</td>
<td>Images of woman and an inset image of her deceased father. Sub-headline overlap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.3</td>
<td>04-10-07</td>
<td>“Jou Ma Se Hoes” Headline and sub-headline and inset image with relevant article.</td>
<td>Image of oxygen-masked women. Main and sub-headline overlap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.4</td>
<td>05-10-07</td>
<td>3 images of a missing girl, a victim of a factory gas leak and a rugby player.</td>
<td>Image of a woman with a brick wall background, and an inset image of the father of the man she allegedly killed/ordered to kill. Overlap of headline across Q3 and Q4.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.5</td>
<td>08-10-07</td>
<td>Images of a woman and a man located above and below the relevant article respectively.</td>
<td>The central image of a corpse and a headline and sub-headline overlapping Q3 and Q4 and an accompanying inset image.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.6</td>
<td>09-10-07</td>
<td>HL- “Flats Under Fire”.</td>
<td>The long-shot angled photo of a covered corpse and two other images either side of the lead article.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.7</td>
<td>10-10-07</td>
<td>HL- “The Baby Killers” and sub-headline.</td>
<td>Photograph of an alleged child killer, slight headline and sub-headline overlap and relating article in a text box.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.8</td>
<td>11-10-07</td>
<td>Part of large centralised image and centralised headline.</td>
<td>A large long-shot image of a murdered pregnant woman is centralised with her boyfriend pictured in Q4 in a separate smaller image with a relative article. Sub-headline overlap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.9</td>
<td>12-10-07</td>
<td>HL- “Najwa: You’ll Never Nail Me” and sub-headline.</td>
<td>Image of two women with the focus on the one on the left side and her murdered husband in the inset with an article. Slight headline overlap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.10</td>
<td>15-10-07</td>
<td>HL- “This little boy woke up to find his mommy KILLED for just R400” and sub-headline in upper casing.</td>
<td>Image of toddler and an inset image of his murdered mother. Sub-headline overlap.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.11</td>
<td>16-10-07</td>
<td>3 Smaller images of 3 children. 1 is injured, 1 deceased and 1 is an alleged culprit (identity hidden). Plus HL- “Kiddie Crusher”.</td>
<td>And an image of a caregiver with an injured child and a relative article. Slight headline overlap and portion of centralised image hiding an alleged culprit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fig 1.12</td>
<td>17-10-07</td>
<td>HL- “Help Me Find My Mom”.</td>
<td>An image of a young child and overlap of...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1.1 attempts to categorise the elements into Q3 and Q4. However, as aforementioned, exploration across the horizontal axis is more intricate as the boundaries between elements and quadrants are not always tangible or easily identified. Table 1.1 identifies several instances of overlap and whilst Kress and Van Leeuwen suggest that divisions are thus realised either through visible demarcations or conceptual wholes or ideas, the meaning-making processes may well suggest alternative interpretive measures in this context. In other words, although they argue that elements are either linked or separately identified from each other, the possibility exists that the multimodal frontpages are meant to be read as a collective whole. However, this brings the concept of framing to the fore.

6.6 Framing

As discussed earlier, framing relates to intertextuality and how schemata or background knowledge is used to localise the stories. In order to evaluate how framing helps to construct meaning it is important to go beyond looking at the position of elements as is suggested by Kress and Van Leeuwen. Instead framing is based on the interpretation of the visual and verbal semiotics that are dependent on the cultural schemata of the *Daily Voice* audience. Thus framing includes constructing an activity or event, in this case the images and verbal texts in the *Daily Voice*, in such a way that leads participants into what the bracketed activity means. Meaning and interpretation therefore relies on framing. However, framing itself is restricted to particular social structures and organisations, which in essence depend on the level of schemata all participants have within given contexts.
Using Kress and Van Leeuwen’s tools it can be said that “Daily Voice Exclusive” is found on 10 out of 15 frontpages (66.67%) seemingly separating Ideal and Real and 1 edition says “Daily Voice Picture Exclusive”. Of this, 13 frontpages (86.67%) have a solid white line spacing dividing components. The white spacing separating the Daily Voice logo and the image of a deceased man and his wrecked vehicle can in this instance be seen as not necessarily separating the Ideal and the Real of figure 1.1. Instead, that barrier is visually emphasised by the uneven white lines surrounding the underlined text “Taliep’s widow won’t be at dad’s funeral” written in white against a red background. This kind of analysis only shows that the texts in the white line frames are related. However, it does not tell us about the nature of the relationship and this is where the Daily Voice relies on the schemata of its audience. For example, the full impact of the juxtapositioning of the image of Sulaiman Dirk and the mangled car underlined by the text reading “Taliep’s widow won’t be at dad’s funeral”, can only be appreciated by somebody with Cape Flats socio-cultural knowledge. In particular the knowledge that Sulaiman Dirk who also happens to be Najwa’s father is also a shady business character.

Similarly, Kress and Van Leeuwen may say that figure 1.6 exhibits the same qualities in that a solid (although thinner) white spacing creates a division, the sub-headline “Four shootouts…and that’s before lunch” also has a red background. However, incorporating Goffman’s view of framing (cf. Lemert and Branaman 1997) as a schematic interpretation that creates a context for understanding information, the knowledge of the Cape Flats’ notoriety with regard to gang-related and random exchanges of gun fire comes to the fore in such constructions. The headline “Flats Under Fire” is not just phonologically salient but localises the shootings and more significantly, taps into the schemata of those who know that several simultaneous shooting incidences within the space of a few hours is not uncommon to the Cape Flats.

Based solely on Kress and Van Leeuwen’s views of framing, figure 1.8 does not have a solid white spacing and instead uses the red background surrounded above and below by uneven white spacing. The underlined white text reads “Heavily pregnant Flats mom is brutally gunned down in a gangland execution”. In this instance the red coloured component with
text, acts as not necessarily a more obvious division but as the only division between the Ideal and the Real. The pattern that is exhibited when using the red colour and text combination is that the text is underlined in each case. The importance of not mere mechanical analysis that looks only at clear physical demarcations of framing, allows better understanding of the meaning-making options and processes. In this light, figure 1.8 is powerfully framed as the various signs interact to construct feelings of disdain and sadness especially. The headlines, “Heavily pregnant Flats mom is brutally gunned down in a gangland execution” and “Varke” taps into the knowledge of the Cape Flats as a gang infested area. Along with this is knowledge of the history of violence on the Cape Flats. The words “Flats” and “gangland” localise this story and so too does the word “Varke” for in a community that is accustomed to violence and criminal behaviour; labelling people as “Varke” speaks volumes of the severity of the crimes committed and emphasises the emotional outcries against such crimes. In this instance it is the nature of the senseless killing of an innocent and pregnant Flats woman as if she was embroiled in a gang battle with her murderers that are embedded within this multimodal composition.

Similarly, figure 1.12 reflects the device whereby the colour red overshadows the conventional white space marker and forms a background to the Sub-headline “Heartless Ma (mother) dumps this cute little girl”. However, a more meaning-based approach to framing would suggest that the verbal aspects of this frontpage have a dual effect. In the first instance, the subheadline uses the words “Heartless ma” where knowledge of the word “ma” on the Cape Flats as a term of endearment not just to one’s own mother but indeed any older female, helps to create a contrast with the main headline. Basically, the subheadline constructs the “ma” who is a traditional caregiver as heartless yet the main headline appeals to the community to help the girl in Q4, Annelise, to find this callous mother. In this way sympathy for the child and anger towards the mother are constructed simultaneously, thus framing this particular story in a very emotional way. This type of analysis cannot be achieved if the role of schemata in framing techniques is not considered.

Figure 1.10 however, is the only frontpage that does not have either a solid white spacing or a red coloured background and text serving as a separating device. There is however, a “Daily
Voice Exclusive” label positioned in such a way that it seems to divide the Ideal and the Real of figure 1.10. The pattern of underlined white text is still evident in Q3 if this label is taken as a boundary. In the other 9 instances where this label or the “Daily Voice Picture Exclusive” label is found, it appears centrally superimposed over the solid white spacing dividing the components, as is indicated in table 1.0, into the Ideal and the Real. The little boy in figure 1.10 similar to the image of the murdered pregnant woman in figure 1.8 is framed in such a way so as to express strong emotions and indeed evoke these emotions from the community. Yet again, the boy’s mother is described as a “Flats mother” and although her murderers are not called “Varke” the words “for just R400” as well as the saddened image of the boy work in like fashion to a lead story of a murdered pregnant mother in figure 1.8 to elicit emotional responses from the Daily Voice audience.

It is possible to deduce that the Daily Voice flouts the conventions of what the Ideal and the Real, in Western terms, are considered to uphold as there are several instances that indicate a mismatch between Kress and Van Leeuwen’s information value criteria and the interpretation of the data. Not so much in terms of position or location, as in Ideal is top-sided and the Real below, but in terms of the belief that these concepts are dissimilar. As previously quoted, Kress and Van Leeuwen refer to the Ideal as “not identical or near-identical to the corresponding bottom element” (2006:209). The same can be said regarding the notions of the Given and the New as being restricted to known or unknown information respectively. There is enough evidence provided above to state that the Daily Voice is unpredictable in its spatial distribution and allocation of information. An argument therefore arises as to whether the Daily Voice flexes the findings of two key innovators, in Kress and Van Leeuwen, of the area of visual and multimodal analysis. It is in this regard that we move to consider phenomena that may reinforce this notion. Thus, the third system of composition is salience.

6.7 Salience

One of the most salient features of the Daily Voice is the use of colour. The colour codes however, do not necessarily relate to the Western interpretation. Exploring the logo the word “Daily” is always in white and “Voice” is consistently yellow in colour. The white can therefore, from a more Westernised perspective, represent the cleanliness or purity of each
day, basically that each day starts off with a clean slate. The yellow coloured “Voice” grabs the attention of readers and accentuates the ideologies of the paper. If the paper aims to represent or identify with a group then the target audience would be drawn to a very optimistic outspoken colour. However, the colours of the name *Daily Voice* merely add to the eclectic and lively mixture of colours throughout the publication, which is also a feature of Cape Flats dress code.

Features of the slogan, the cost and the date make use of different colours. The slogan “Ons Skrik Vir Niks” is a dark red. In Western terms, red is an indication of power, perhaps fearlessness in this case where any story is gettable no matter the danger involved. Violence, crime and social injustices are rife on the Cape Flats and communities are angered by these vices. In this line of thinking then, the red of “Ons Skrik Vir Niks” relates to the danger and anger faced when unearthing community-based stories. The cost of R2 (2 Rands) is in an eye-catching yellow perhaps to heighten the affordability of the publication and an empowering red as a background colour. In other words, buying the cheaply priced *Daily Voice* empowers readers through fearless community relevant investigative journalism. However, the *Daily Voice* is not a newspaper that purports Western discourses but instead is localised on the Cape Flats and in this way the significance of colour needs to be related to the community at hand. As is stated prior, colour is a key feature in the construction of Cape Coloured identity. Colour fusions that may in Western terms be considered complicated, unconventional and mismatched are more naturally accepted amongst a community where bright and eccentric colour blends are part of historic and huge annual celebrations in the form of the minstrel parades especially.

Thus despite the “Exclusive” labels that are in white text and perhaps seen as adding to the verisimilitude of the exclusivity of the stories and the ambiguous red background that either reinforces a powerful exclusive or suggests the danger involved with regard to the in-depth investigation to get the stories, these type of analyses use a Westernised interpretation of colour use and modality.
Competitions usually appear across Q1 and Q2 in the Ideal segment and in the bottom margins of Q3 and Q4. The hook lines, such as “Get Your R400 000 Numbers Inside” is in orange, the background colour is purple and the repetition of “Daily Voice Vir Niks” (for free/for nothing) is a mixture of colours with clear distinctions. In Western terms orange suggests joy and release of free flowing emotions and likewise would winning R400 000 be a joyous release. The purple background would thus connote royalty or wealth and thus work well with winning the prize money. Again, this mixture of purple and orange is very eclectic but very common across the Cape Coloured community in terms of the minstrel parades. The very busy looking frontpages at times have promotions and competitions using yellow instead of purple and orange. Again this cannot be viewed using Westernised ideals as the yellow could be viewed as an energetic but temperamental colour. However, yellow is just another bright eye-catching colour that is commonly used in minstrel uniforms. Interestingly, in terms of Real and Ideal, the purple colour appears mostly as a backdrop colour to cash prize amounts advertised in the Real bottom margin; however there are a few instances where it is the colour where on which the cost (R2) is advertised in the Ideal quadrants. There are 4 such instances, 3 of which show competitions being advertised promising that any reader could win big with the free competition card inside. Some catch phrases include: “THERE COULD BE R400 000 INSIDE THIS PAPER”, “WIN INSTANT CASH PRIZES” and “WIN BIG CASH TODAY”. So in effect there are sporadic instances where instant wealth is promised through reinforcing the same promise in both the Ideal quadrants (Q1 and Q2) as well as the bottom margin of the Real.

Headlines are largely white coloured texts. There are however 13 instances where headlines located in Q1 and Q2 are yellow in colour. The 13 yellow coloured headlines (including the competition promotions) appear in the Ideal quadrants. Headlines appearing in Q3 and Q4 tend to be white in colour whilst some texts in the bottom margined Real quadrants are yellow. Again there are visual similarities between the idealised top and bottom margined Real quadrants are yellow. And more importantly, the use of yellow rather than white as is evidenced by the data, highlights the different colour code interpretation at hand in the *Daily Voice* as a media publication. In fact, using Westernised colour codes to interpret the *Daily Voice* would create a situation where analysis of each element would in effect deter from interpreting how the
colour use constructs meaning within the Cape Coloured community. Also, such non-localised approaches will overshadow the point that whether it’s the Real or the Ideal the colour melange is ubiquitous. Thus, in opposition to Kress and Van Leeuwen (2006) the two quadrants certainly do resemble each other in both verbal, visual and colour elements.

Subheadlines usually appear as white coloured text either against a darkened background or a red coloured background. The red backgrounds usually refer to bloodied events, shocking acts or grievous crime report as in “Heartless ma dumps this cute little girl”, “Four shootouts…and that’s before lunch” and “Heavily pregnant Flats mom is brutally gunned down in gangland execution”. The red in these and similar instances could evoke strong emotions of anger, disdain and shock therefore exhibiting a degree of high modality but also the colour red is popular in many attention grabbing public communiqué on the Cape Flats.

Framing is in white with the varying widths and evenness of the lines. The white however, prevents the clutter of colours, images and text. The many unpatterned and unpredictable uses and combinations of colours throughout the data to suggest that the white framing separates and simultaneously accentuates the mosaic colour vitality displayed and prevent a colour splatter. Even the Klopse outfits are designed to showcase shocking and subdued combinations that may well transgress Western colour code blends, but remain stylish and expected. Whilst 2nd January Klopse photographs may add colour to more broadsheet newspapers, the same photographs would be normal appearing in an already colourful Daily Voice publication.

The size of the images is a key factor to consider. The larger an image, the more impact it is expected to have. With reference to aforementioned discussions, images can be located throughout the four quadrants therefore their information value is discernible. Smaller images therefore hold less information value and are by default less salient than larger images. However, size cannot solely account for importance or level of value an image is constructed to have. Reason being that throughout a publication images vary in size and are not sequentially presented from smallest to largest or vice versa. In other words, despite an image’s size being a marker for newsworthiness, not all frontpage images are large or larger.
than those images appearing across the rest of a publication. This observation therefore relates to the fickle and flexible nature of layout and more specifically, that images alone do not and cannot account for the construction and deconstruction of meaning as well as always be the most salient element especially if the degree of image size is a marker of saliency. Thus, context and composition is essential to construction and deconstruction of meaning.

Analysing the saliency of multimodal texts is perhaps a lot more intricate and complicated than is suggested by the literature. Moreover, taking Martin and Rose’s (2007) description of the possible relationship dynamics of visual texts into account, might be an overextension analysing the multi-semiotic relationship using all the possibilities suggested. However, salience is also about how images and texts restate, elaborate, enhance and/or extend each other in order to construct or deconstruct meaning. Yuen cites Wee in O’Halloran’s *Multimodal Discourse Analysis*, “Compared to text with a single semiotic code, the meaning potential of multi-semiotic texts is greatly expanded. Hence, meaning creation becomes an interactive, dynamic and symbiotic process” (163:2004).

Based on this, images and text are both functional irrespective of the nature of their relationship. Whilst images can be analysed in terms of the aforementioned criteria, that is size, colour saturation etc verbal texts are analysed differently. Newspaper frontpage texts largely consist of headlines and/or subheadlines although occasionally summarised lead stories are presented. These concise stories usually refer readers to the relevant pages within the newspaper where the story is more detailed. Other text include captions, advertisements, slogans and/or requests or invitations by the newspaper urging contributions or tip offs by the public. Already there are many considerations as headlines (and subheadlines) adopt certain structures or devices to be successful. Advertising uses a different type of language device as well. The *Daily Voice* also positions the readers to engage with the text.

However, patterns or themes across the text used (and images) provide insight into the negotiation of salience. Given the melange of colour saturation and the verbal text across the data, it is better to view salience in terms of context of situation and context of culture wherein the multimodal text function. Instead of providing a sample of loaded English words
that in Western terms would index high levels of saliency, it is more productive to locate saliency within the SFL framework. Therefore terms such as “Killer, murder, gunned, gangland, murder, brutally, deadly, crusher, killed, sins, heartless, dumps, funeral” as well as “Dop, slapgat, Dronk Verdriet, gesuip, slamse, ou, Jou Ma Se Hoes, Varke” should be viewed in terms of how surrounding signs index them. The cohesion and referencing that structure each Daily Voice edition needs to be considered as the marker of saliency. Salience is difficult to assess according to colour because of the colourful nature of the Daily Voice and the saliency of verbal text is difficult to rank because how are monolectal items deemed more salient than other monolectal items? The samples revolve around issues of gruesome crime, alcoholism and alcohol and profanities. In terms of images, one could argue that the sex topic is presented not so much in the verbal texts but through the ‘competition’ girls and the sexiness or attractiveness of large sums of cash prize money.

In this light, salience is not so much which colours are brighter or which images are larger. It is not about which words are more shocking because what is meant by shocking if the discourse in the Daily Voice reflects the discourse used on the Cape Flats? Instead salience is about whether or not the Daily Voice constructs reality of the Cape Flats. The multimodal nature of text is shaped by the tabloid layout and contextualised through the content. In this way, it is important to establish whether the various indexical devices and framing are used to construct reality or an idealised reality. Whilst the social embeddedness of the Daily Voice is a key feature that is evident in the way the public contribute to the paper, how these local stories are constructed is not as simple as reflecting the stories and social issues as they unfold. Herein lays the degree of salience, as what stands out more depends on what the Daily Voice constructs as being more salient. Salience should not only be based on the reactions readers have to the frontpages. Who would not flinch at images of a destitute child in figure 1.12 or bloodied corpses in figures 1.0, 1.3, 1.5, and 1.8? Who would not be excited at the prospect of winning cash prizes promoted in almost every frontpage in the data?

Salience is thus realised in the Daily Voice according to the thematic constructions that are most likely to get people talking rather than gawking. An example of this is how the Daily Voice follows up the story about the death of a (then) murder suspect’s father in figure 1.1
with the news of her allegedly paying authorities off to attend his funeral published in the following edition (figure 1.2). Another example, is the how the *Daily Voice* covers the story of the dumped girl in figure 1.12 and two editions later reveals that the reason she was dumped is because of her drunken mother pictured in figure 1.14. Likewise, the public engage in such conversations of ‘hot’ or salient topics. What would be considered shock value in other publications may well not be shocking in the *Daily Voice* as topics of the reported events are almost normalised. Crime, violence, child abductions, drug abuse etc are constructed as normalised but the off shoots are that the public engage in more literacy practices (reading, visual or written), engage in more conversations regarding the published news stories and engage in garnering momentum of the issues reported in the *Daily Voice* by texting messages to the “Rek Jou Bek” section earlier mentioned. These messages are often aimed at other readers as a show of agreement, acknowledgement, defiance and disagreement rather than aimed at criticising or embracing the *Daily Voice* reports.

**Summary**

In this chapter I analysed the data using MDA. The importance of the local Cape Flats context was reinforced throughout the chapter. I achieved this localisation largely through motivating the choice of stories appearing in the *Daily Voice*. This was followed by localising specific Cape Flats themes in the *Daily Voice*, namely sport, crime and child neglect, in terms of Kress and Van Leeuwen’s (1996/2006) information value, framing and salience. In this way I showed how the social involvement strategies used by the *Daily Voice* constructed its audience by shaping the meanings of various news reports. The information value features of visual and verbal components are not merely divided into different quadrants; instead I argue how the juxtapositioning of elements into respective quadrants frame the ideal Cape Flats audience. I also show how important it is to understand intertextuality as embedded within schemata and how this knowledge is framed to create particular localised meaning-making options to *Daily Voice* readers.
Chapter 7

Visuals as tools for Appraisal

7.0 Introduction

In addition to my arguments regarding how verbal signs are appraised across the *Daily Voice* frontpages, the multimodal nature of these texts necessitates the need for analysis of visuals as well. In this light I contend that the newsroom techniques used to draw on familiar Cape Flats linguistic practices and knowledge are extended to the use of accompanying visual semiotics to intensify the effect of these verbal schematic references. Roberts (1992) identifies schema as knowledge of “accumulated cultural and social knowledge and structured experiences” that participants bring to any communicative event (1992:7). This schematic referencing, as Roberts states, refers to knowledge of the Cape Flats gained “through growing up, living and working in particular cultures and through routine social contacts at personal and institutional levels” (1992:7). In this light, below, the verbal appraisal of the *Daily Voice* is analysed to illustrate the use of schematic and intertextual references to appeal to the audience. It is important to remain cognisant of the monolectal approach (cf. Auer, Meeuwis and Blommaert) to bilingual discourse practices used by the *Daily Voice*. In this way, appraisal of a hybrid discourse will not merely focus on what many may see as mere code-switching, but instead as appraisal of a default monolectal discourse. Throughout this chapter the importance of how schematic and intertextual references are used to appraise meaning across *Daily Voice* frontpages is inextricably linked to how the newspaper taps into audience socio-cultural knowledge on both a lexical and visual level. In this chapter I show how such appraised schematic references are framed to achieve particular meaning-making options relative to the Cape Flats.

7.1 Appraisal

Capturing the emotion, attitudes and judgements inherent in the *Daily Voice* stories is an arduous task. However, the appraisal framework offers the tools to analyse the data. The scope of the thesis does not allow a full-fledged Appraisal analysis of the *Daily Voice*. However, appraising only sample data is feasible to enable a better understanding of the techniques used by the *Daily Voice* to localise the stories as well as the importance of localised discourse analysis. Some of the techniques have already been discussed in the
previous chapter. Of the three major appraisal categories attitude and graduation are chosen to briefly skim the manner in which language/s construct emotion.

7.2 Attitude

The Daily Voice uses techniques to not only localise the news, but also to intensify the effect and affect of the emotions of their readers. One such way to achieve this is through the sub-category of appraisal known as attitude. According to Martin and White (2005), attitude is divided into three sub-categories: Affect, Judgement and Appreciation.

7.2.1 Affect

The techniques used by the Daily Voice positions itself and its readers as appraisers of the events and newsmakers covered in the (frontpage) stories (Martin and White 2005). Basically, the localised Cape Flats stories are framed in a way that shows how the Daily Voice and more specifically its audience, feels about the appraised persons, events and things in the stories. The sub-category used in such instances is known as affect which, generally refers to the positive and/or negative emotional responses within a communicative event. In Figure 1.3 the headline “Jou Ma Se Hoes” shows negative emotion of anger and frustration towards the gas leak victims’ plight or positive emotion if viewed jovially among in-group members of the Cape Coloured community. The emotion is based on the understanding of the term “Jou Ma Se Hoes” and the cultural references this phrase alludes to, which in this case is based on common verbal profanities on the Cape Flats (see section 7.5). Thus without knowledge of which cultural saying exactly “Jou Ma Se Hoes” plays on, the affect that it will have on a reader will be minimal due to lack of schematic connections and understanding.

The headline in figure 1.8 “Varke”, which means pigs, shows negative emotion of anger and disgust towards the appraised perpetrators. Only people who are familiar with what has to transpire for a person/s or group to be labelled “Varke” will truly grasp the emotion this headline along with its connecting highly saturated visual image, suggest. More importantly, the emotions felt by the Daily Voice are powerfully captured by the use of a very culturally rich term such as “Varke”, which holds such emotion on the Cape Flats despite the area being normalised toward all levels of violence.
7.2.2 Judgement

The second sub-category of attitude is judgement, which refers to the positive or negative evaluation of human behaviour in terms of a particular set of institutionalised conventions. Through the use of judgement techniques, the *Daily Voice* is able to frame what its readers think about the actions and behaviour of the Cape Flats locals who are newsmakers in the stories that are reported. Bock (2008:79) states that judgement “may be personal judgements of admiration and criticism, or moral judgements of praise or condemnation”. Therefore, the *Daily Voice* is able to frame events and persons (and their actions) so that their audience is able to pass judgement. In this way, people who transgress the grounds of societal normality and morality are judged by the very community that is affected by such transgressions.

The headline “Jou Ma Se Hoes” in figure 1.3 alludes to a judgement of the situation and perhaps of those who caused the leak or were neglectful in preventing the gas leak. In this way, the management or owners of the faulty factory are judged for their lack of maintenance that may well have prevented the gas leak that affected local Cape Flats factory workers.

The headline “Slapgat” in figure 1.3 reads as a judgment on the quality of the police and their inability to perform effectively. The expectations of what the quality of police work should be create a contrast to the reality of their work in this instance. Thus the cultural expectations that police on the Cape Flats are unreliable are highlighted and they are judged in accordance with their laxity. In this manner, the police’s credibility as an effective security force is judged.

In figure 1.8 “Varke” is a judgement of the perpetrators if the headline is meant to index that ‘those who did this are varke/pigs’. Again as is aforementioned, perpetrators of an act that is deemed severe enough for them to be labelled “Varke” is socially determined. Thus a community such as the Cape Flats where criminal acts of various degrees are habitually committed is still able to project disdain towards crimes that over step the expectations of the community itself. In other words, the woman killed in this story was pregnant, thus her maternal state and the manner of her execution sparked the emotional outcry of “Varke”.
Thus the word “Varke” goes a long way toward encapsulating and capturing the communal emotions and judgment of the immoral social behaviour that led to such a grotesque killing.

In figure 1.14 “Dronk Verdriet” is a judgement of the mother’s regret and not really the mother’s regret for her misdemeanour. If it is viewed from her perspective it would be categorised under affect, instead she is the appraised because the *Daily Voice* is the appraiser (and so are the readers).

“Dronk Verdriet” is also a judgment on the mother; it is more than labelling someone as drunk but more as being in a drunken stupor and therefore her character and moral behaviour as mother, caregiver and human are negatively constructed. Audiences require the necessary schemata and frame to understand “Dronk Verdriet” as a state wherein one’s drunkenness leads to the bearing of one’s inner problems. However, this example is further explained under graduation.

### 7.2.3 Appreciation

The third sub-category of attitude is appreciation, which is concerned with the evaluation of various things and things people make, their performances or even natural phenomena. It is difficult to always distinguish between affect and appreciation as items of appreciation “are derived from or make reference to values of affect” (Bock 2008:81). Thus it is problematic to avoid an overlap between appraisal in terms of appreciation and in terms of affect. However, Eggins and Slade (1997:126) suggest that to identify items of appreciation, it is best to ask “What do/did you think of that”, which in essence, is connected to other questions the *Daily Voice* frontpages frames that ask probe audiences to answer how they feel about the stories and how would they judge the events, persons and things covered in the stories.

Therefore, in figure 1.3 the word “Slapgat” alludes to an indirect appreciation for “Mob Justice” after the judgment of the inept police force is foregrounded in this subheadline. The headline “Police Led This Kid’s Mom To Her Death” in figure 1.7 shows a negative appreciation for the fact that the police led a child’s mother to her death. Such performances
by the custodians of judicial law are frowned upon and even here there is an overlap with the tool of judgement as well, where police behaviour is deemed unacceptable.

The headline in figure 1.8 “Varke” shows appreciation or lack thereof for the state of the community and type and level of crime is shown. Whilst crime is rife and almost normalised on the Cape Flats, such events where a “heavily pregnant” mother is killed spark emotional outcries by a community and indeed the Daily Voice. The fact that the woman is identified as a “Flats mom” localises the murder but more importantly heightens the ethos in the community of ‘one of ours’ was killed. Thus the term “Varke”, much like the woman being identified as a “Flats mom”, is very much a term that has its own culturally domesticated meaning and value.

In this way, the stories discussed under appreciation illustrate how the compositional framing shapes the reaction of the Daily Voice audience. The framing of these frontpages leaves Daily Voice audience aghast and with a desire to express their appreciation or more likely, lack of appreciation for police ineptness and the degree to which criminals stoop on the Cape Flats.

Attitude is thus expressed largely through its dependence on schematic references that dig into the cultural schemata of Daily Voice readers. Schema then is an important tool of appraisal and based on merely the analysis of the different modes of attitude, the intricate yet versatile role intertextuality plays in the appraised analysis of the Daily Voice verbal texts is highlighted. More importantly, it is the manner in which these schematic references are framed that intensifies the emotions of the Daily Voice audience within the context of the Cape Flats.

**7.3 Graduation**

The second system of appraisal used in this thesis is graduation. This tool is used “for turning the volume up or down” by using words (and visuals cf. 7.4) to intensify or reduce the meanings made available (Martin and Rose 2007:42) so much so that a grading scale can be used to measure the increase or decrease in amplification. It is important to note that
graduation merely intensifies the already appraised elements based schematic references. Graduation is realised as follows in a sample of headlines:

Therefore, the *Daily Voice* uses degree words and deictic references to intensify the emotions of its audience. For example, figure 1.2 has a headline that reads “Cashier Vrou is really an Ou”. The word “really” amplifies the reaction readers may have when looking at this headline with the accompanying image. The fact that a cashier looks and dresses as a woman and probably at first glance to many seems to be a woman is actually a man. The “really” tag insinuates and air of *seriously? She’s a man?* The words “Vrou” and “Ou” have in their own right particular cultural interpretations. A “Vrou” (woman) constructs a particular image and when contrasted with the image of “Ou” (man/macho man) the word “really” heightens the contrast and shock or surprise readers are expected to have.

In like fashion, the headline “Police Led This Kid’s Mom To Her Death” in figure 1.7 accompanied by an image of the child and a male figure (presumably his father) uses a deictic reference. The focus upon inspection is less to do with the police having led a woman to her death because the phrase “This Kid’s” heightens the emotion readers might feel for the woman’s death. The frontpage is not only framed as a mere inference of a woman having died because of the police but a technique used to draw sympathy from readers and subtly have a stab at the police as being responsible for leaving a child motherless. Also, based on Scollon and Scollon’s (2003) work on indexicalisation, the word “This” creates a sense of here and now and more importantly brings the emotion to the face of the readers. Police are socially expected to uphold the law and protect and one does not expect the police to lead someone to their death much less the mother of a child like the boy in the image. Therefore, the schematic expectation is for police not to be inept although the *Daily Voice* often reports such police incompetence on the Cape Flats. On the same frontpage, the lead story constructs two mothers as “killers”. The villainous construction of “The Baby Killers” who “murder their little angels” is amplified by the words “Baby” and “their little angels”. The innocence of children is suggested by the use of “Baby” and “angels”. The degree of innocence is sharpened by the use of the adjective “little” and the gravity of the mothers’ criminal acts is heightened by the possessive pronoun “Their”. Thus collectively, the headline is laden with
constructions of what these mothers are and the way the children are portrayed evokes more emotion from readers but conversely angers the public toward such motherly behaviour.

The *Daily Voice* also uses adverbs to amplify particular headlines even though stories about issues such as crime, child neglect and police ineptness are regularly reported. The headline in figure 1.8 reads as “Heavily pregnant Flats mom is brutally gunned down in gangland execution”. The word “Heavily” augments the advanced stage of the murdered woman’s pregnancy and “brutally” amplifies the manner in which she was killed. The intensifying nature of these words is effective in that it works with the accompanying image of the maimed corpse. Thus the amplification is multimodally achieved and not solely through the use of words. The brutality of the crime is maximised through the visual image. The bloodied woman’s body is visible unlike the covered corpse of figure 1.6. The visible image links with the woman being described as “Heavily pregnant”. This is where the aforementioned intersemiotic relationships are integral towards understanding how amplification is achieved. Thus multimodally, disdain and anger towards perpetrators, sadness and empathy for the mother and unborn child are all constructed through both the visual and verbal text. Also, there are framing or schematic inferences to “Flats” and “gangland”. These words tap into the schemata of readers who know what generally and historically happens on the Cape Flats and plays on the presupposition of the Cape Flats as a gang ridden area for many a decade. Thus the positioning of the perpetrators as “Varke” holds more than just contempt for that single act of murder, but indeed the emotion of a community although accustomed to violence but ill content with such violations.

There are instances where the *Daily Voice* uses anecdotal headlines such as in figure 1.10 which reads as “This little boy woke up to find his mommy KILLED for just R400”. In this way, the *Daily Voice* shows its versatility with regard to using the available local Cape Flats linguistic resources to intensify particular meanings. Here again the indexicalisation between visual and verbal signs is evident. Superficially, it is easy to identify the word “KILLED” as the amplified element. However, just as in figure 1.7, “This little” is used to draw attention to children as victims and sufferers of events. The mother on this frontpage was killed but it is the visual of the boy coupled with the tag “This little boy” that amplifies the message. The
word “little” may well suggest petite, meek and small but the contextual understanding of how this item works in relation to its surrounding sign is essential. Also in this headline the word “just” quantifies the cost of the woman’s life. By inferring “just R400” feelings of disgust are constructed. Not that any amount would indeed justify such a murder but the miniscule monetary value to which the mother’s life was equated to is amplified.

Figure 1.12 again involves the imagery of a neglected or suffering child. Both the image of the child and the subheadline “Heartless ma dumps this cute little girl” work toward constructing particular meaning-making options. More importantly sympathy towards the child is amplified and likewise, discontent towards the mother is suggested. The word “ma” is an affectionate term of endearment on the Cape Flats especially. Someone who is a “ma” is not necessarily one’s mother but could refer to any older female or care-giving female whether it is a relative, a friend, a well known community member or even a stranger. Either way, a “ma” is someone who is respected, loved and expected to protect you from harm. However, this child’s “ma” is neglectful. The “HELP ME FIND MY MOM” headlines as well as the subheadline segment “this cute little girl” work with the image of the girl to construct her voice as well as portray her and her mother in different ways.

The final frontpage, figure 1.14 states “Mom was so gesuip she forgot her own baby”. This subheadline is intertextual on at least two levels as it refers to two editions prior and the term “Dronk Verdriet”, which may be seen as an amplification of a drunken state. However, the term itself forms part of common Cape Flats discourse. Instead the phrase “so gesuip” heightens the level of drunken stupor that this woman was in because of the reference to her dumping her own child in figure 1.12. The word “gesuip” is best understood if readers are able to draw on the cultural meaning/s attached to the term. If a reader does not fully grasp what “gesuip” means, the meaning of the amplified term “so gesuip” will be lost. “So” intensifies the state of this mother’s drunkeness. In this way, the woman is set up to receive communal anger at her poor parental and humane behaviour. The image of the little girl acts as an intertextual reference to the same image used prior and is juxtaposed beside an image of her neglectful mother. This positioning amplifies communal anger at the mother and the sympathy for the child.
The role of graduation as a tool of appraisal in this study underlines how the intertextual references that require appropriate schemata is framed by the *Daily Voice*. It is not easy to simply do an appraisal of a hybrid discourse if the discourse itself is defined in terms of narrow ideologies of what discourse entails. Viewing the language used by the *Daily Voice* as code-switching in monolingual terms would heavily deter from identifying the relevance of schemata in appraisal as a tool of analysis. Also, such monolingual bias may lead to simply analysing all code-switched elements as the appraised elements which firstly may not always be the case and secondly, may well hide the importance and existence of the elements that intensify the meaning of the text. Other forms of analysis may focus on individual words but what needs to be maintained is that general expletives of criminal and ill social behaviour are normalised by the *Daily Voice*. It is the collective pulling together of signs in these multimodal constructions that best create meaning-making options and construct identities.

### 7.4 Appraisal as a tool to evaluate visuals

This study suggests that the *Daily Voice* uses appraisal techniques to intensify meaning on both the verbal and visual semiotic levels. Whilst appraisal theory is itself still very much in an infancy stage in academia, appraisal of hybrid discourse is even younger much less the appraisal analysis of the visuals connected to the hybrid discourse of the *Daily Voice*. In this section I demonstrate how visuals heighten the emotional reactions of the *Daily Voice* target audience based on news stories and familiar Cape Flats discourse patterns. There are instances where the angle, size, positioning and colour saturation of the images intensify the meaning more than in other instances. For ease of exploring this notion of visual appraisal I categorise the visuals into those relating to the *Daily Voice’s* representation of (a) sport, (b) the Najwa Petersen case, (c) crime on the Cape Flats and (d) stories relating to children on the Cape Flats.

#### 7.4.1 Sport visuals as Appraisal

The importance of sport discussed in 6.1 is heightened by both verbal and visual appraisal techniques. Figure 1.0 shows medium distance shots of the EPL players and the Springbok rugby player. The same can be said of the Wayne Rooney visual in figure 1.3. The two
visuals of the Springbok rugby players in figure 1.5 are also medium shots and likewise the visual of French rugby player, Chabal in figure 1.10. The effects of these images are that they work with the verbal text to construct particular meanings. For example, there is just 1 player representing each of the “big three” EPL teams to emphasise that each team scored just a single goal in their respective fixtures. Likewise, figure 1.5 shows action pictures of Springbok players looking very engaged in a tense match to reinforce the headline that they scraped through to the semi-final stage. Also, figure 1.10 shows Chabal looking very dejected following France’s exit from the tournament as is suggested by the headline “French Kiss Cup Goodbye”. The closeness of all these images suggests a close social distance between the audience and the persons and events being reported.

7.4.2 Najwa Petersen visuals as Appraisal

The hype surrounding the Najwa Petersen case (cf 6.2.5) was duly captured by the Daily Voice reports. The Daily Voice generated a Najwa Petersen discourse through the various genres of news stories from in-depth hard news reports to more feature styled reporting. It is not just the use of lexical elements that contributed to the Najwa Petersen discourse but visuals also became synonymous with the case. Images of Najwa Petersen are consistent throughout the 8 times she appears across the data. The images are consistent in that they all show Najwa wearing a traditional Muslim head scarf to suggest her adherence to the Islamic female dress code as well as spectacles or sunglasses that look dark and almost eerie. With the exception of figure 1.1 Najwa’s facial expressions are serious and even emotionless especially with the accompanying eyewear. And even this single image is used as a contrast to the headline and lead story. Basically, the image of her and her father in Q4 of figure 1.1 has the caption “Happier Days” juxtaposed below her father’s mangled car and beside the headline “Najwa’s Hell”. This eeriness is reinforced as 5 of the 8 (62.5%) images are side-view angles which construct a negative image of Najwa as she seems sly, villainous, secretive and dodgy. However, only 2 (25%) are direct face-on images (figures 1.8 and 1.13) and in this way there is a low percentage of demand shots that ask little of the audience. In contrast, images of children are more direct and front viewed (see section 7.4.4). Figure 1.9 is a slightly side-view angled shot. In this way, any article or story about Najwa, irrespective of the content, is amplified by such images that Daily Voice audiences have become used to. An
almost Najwa-look is created through the consistent use of same or similar images of her which adds to the Daily Voice iconising techniques referred to previously.

Thus any negative constructions of Najwa are reinforced by the consistent use of such images and contrasted, as in figure 1.1, when the images show Najwa smiling, crying, without headgear or eyewear etc. Figure 1.4 illustrates reinforcement of a negative construction as a shady looking Najwa is juxtaposed alongside the headline “Najwa’s Dirty Tricks”. A more face-on view, an image of Najwa smiling or even her without eyewear may well have turned down the effect of her being constructed as a trickster. In figure 1.9 Najwa’s familiar stern facial expression reinforces the headline “Najwa: You’ll Never Nail Me” as she looks rather defiant and determined in this image.

7.4.3 Cape Flats crime visuals as Appraisal

Daily Voice frontpages amplify and evoke the emotional responses from the community through the use of verbal and visual semiotic features even though crime on the Cape Flats is rife and even normalised. The face down crestfallen looking widow of the murdered cab driver in figure 1.0 is gripping in that the bloodied medium to long shot angle of her husband’s head down lifeless body are in sync. Both husband and wife are looking down although he is dead and she is saddened and dejected. Together these images certainly increase the emotion in this depiction as without the image of her husband, the effect of the woman’s body language would not be strongly felt. And vice versa, her image adds a spousal identity to the cab driver as not just someone who was brutally killed, but as a murdered husband survived by his wife.

Q1 and Q2 of figure 1.3 uses a medium to long distance shot not just to show the entire image of the deceased man but to reinforce the headline “Blood on Cops’ Hands” as the blood stained ground on which the body is strewn touches the relevant headline. It could be argued that the verbal reinforces the amplified visual, but this study is too limited to explore the intersemiotic relationships in terms of how appraisal of different modes of signs influences each other in depth. Nevertheless, it is noteworthy to acknowledge that the choices made in which visuals are used, do indeed amplify or decrease the emotion elicited by the Daily Voice audience.
Figure 1.5 also uses a medium shot of a corpse to heighten the emotion involved when looking at the image in relation to the report. The caption reads “BUTCHERED: The victim” and the effect of this is the image shows a bloodied open chest that looks like it has been decimated with a sharp object. The accompanying article in Q4 confirms that it was a stabbing incident. The left-sided inset image with the caption, “TOO LATE: Police arrive to remove the corpse” could have been the main image, however, it would have simmered down the effect of being “BUTCHERED” and having “NO FEAR” as the accompanying verbal text states. In this way the gravity of the killing as well as the fearlessness at hand that saw a “Flats man killed on cops’ door” as stated by the headline, are amplified.

In this regard, the verbal amplification of figure 1.8 discussed in 7.3 is possibly effective largely due to the choice of the image. There are several features of this image that if changed, would lessen the impact that the multimodal frontpage has. For example, a smaller, less colour saturated image with the corpse covered (as is in the Real of figure 1.5) would decrease the effect that the chosen image has on the *Daily Voice* audience. Instead, the headline “Varke” in conjunction with the image, both heighten the intensity of figure 1.8.

### 7.4.4 Cape Flats children neglect and related crime visuals as Appraisal

The *Daily Voice* intensifies their use of verbal and visuals signs to report on child neglect and abuse stories on the Cape Flats. These reports of the victimisation of innocent children is shocking enough in its written form, however, the dynamics on how the *Daily Voice* uses visuals to further drill home this construction of innocent and victimised children is tantamount to the lexical appraisal analysis. All the images of children are positioned in such a way so as to construct sympathy for the children amongst the *Daily Voice* audience. Figure 1.7 has three separate stories all related to children. However, the image in Q1 shows a child being held looking as if he longs for his mother who was led to her death by the police. In Q2, the blurred identities of the three children emphasises the effects their abandonment by their parents. Thus both images turn up the heat in terms of the expected anger the *Daily Voice* audience aims at the police and parents respectively. Both images are also structured in a way that draws sympathy for the children. The more shocking story in Q3 and Q4 shows an inset image of one of the murdered babies alongside an image of one of the murderer mothers. Both images appear not to be of the best quality and the difference in size of the
child’s image compared to the mother’s illustrates just how tiny and young this particular child was when killed. Hence this interpretation is tangible especially as the headline reads “Baby ‘Killers’”.

In contrast to section 7.4.2, the images of children on the *Daily Voice* frontpages are more demanding than those of Najwa Petersen. The images of the children are direct and angled face on and contrary to the sly and villainous constructions of Najwa Petersen, children are innocently constructed. In this way, the images appeal to the audience and demands the audience to react as sympathisers and empathisers of the children featured on the *Daily Voice* frontpages. In this light, the effect of the little boy’s image in figure 1.10 is that he looks very sad, lost and destitute. More significantly, he resembles what children generally look like when they wake up wanting and yearning to see their mother. Similarly, figure 1.11 has an image in Q4 with an injured child being comforted by an older caregiver. Again this choice of image spikes the intensity of the reactions that the *Daily Voice* audience may have. Bearing in mind that the culprit for this tragedy that killed two children and injured another pair is himself a minor, evident by his blurred photograph, the incident was accidental rather than premeditated as is other reported child tragedies.

Annelise, the abandoned girl dubbed “Christie” by the police appears in figures 1.12 and 1.14. In the 17 October 2007 edition, is aptly constructed as a destitute, poor and hungry little girl. The words “dumps” and “cute little girl” add to her construction as vulnerable and deserted. Juxtaposed next to the plea for help in the form of “Help Me Find My Mom”, the collective effect elevates the degree of sympathy, shock and even ire towards this type of neglect on the Cape Flats. Changing the size of the photograph of Annelise to say, the size that appears in figure 1.14 would reduce the reaction, even though the nature of this abandonment is very serious and disheartening. In this regard it is understandable that the size of the image in figure 1.14 is smaller as the image appeared two editions prior and the new focus is on the reason for the abandonment reported in figure 1.12. The verbal appraisal of the 19 October 2007 edition is already established above; thus in terms of the visual focus, the core of the reactions from figure 1.12 are maintained by using the same photograph of Annelise, and juxtaposed next to a small image of her drunken mother, who needless to say has a facial expression suggesting regret or drunkenness, augments the anger and disgust.
towards her atrocious and inhumane maternal behaviour. The fury aimed at her is more explosive especially if those who read this frontpage have knowledge of two editions prior where the investigating officer is quoted as saying that authorities have not ruled out the possibility that Annelise may have been abandoned due to her mother being in danger, harmed or worse. That small window of grace that the *Daily Voice*, the police and the community may have had for the mother is duly shut with the collective heightening of behaviour as distasteful beyond forgiveness.

This section, 7.4, establishes that whilst using Martin and Rose (2003/2007) as well as Martin and White’s (2005) appraisal framework to analyse hybrid discourse is difficult, the *Daily Voice* shows that appraisal of the visual semiotics of multimodal texts is a feasible and important consideration to extend. Appraisal can thus be used as a tool on both the verbal and visual levels.

**7.5 Intertextuality as the language device**

I now illustrate the role of intertextuality (in conjunction with the notions of schema and framing) as a resource used in headline construction. Reah’s (2002) suggested language devices are monolingually biased. More significantly, she has identified four distinct categories, namely intertextuality, word and meaning, phonology and loaded words. I question the wisdom of such distinctions. Intertextuality does in fact bring together all of Reah’s language devices by forming the base of these categories. Quite simply, these devices cannot be interpreted without some form of intertextual referencing. Schematic reference to cultural discourse especially realises such functions that Reah proposes as unique independent devices. Thus, separating intertextuality from the other categories is pointless for the polysemic nature of words used in the *Daily Voice* is understood because of the words from part of familiar Cape Flats discourse. In figure 1.2 for example, the word “Water” can be considered a homonym in that it refers to the same entity in both English and Afrikaans. However, in this instance it plays on two issues: the lack of water and the social labelling of Muslims who practice their faith lackadaisically. The knowledge a reader needs to interpret what “Water” refers to and the double meaning attached to the headline “We’re no water slamse” is constructed through cultural transmission and hence, draws on intertextual
reference to a particular schema. Thus, Reah’s word and meaning category cannot be separated from intertextuality.

In order to understand the phonological and morphological techniques used in the *Daily Voice* headlines, readers need the necessary schemata of Cape Flats linguistic practices. Thus the rhyming effect of the headline “Cashier Vrou is really an Ou” in figure 1.2 is successful only if the reader has the knowledge of how to enunciate and understand the phonological constituents of lexical items. Readers who lack this type of knowledge will not understand the intended and unintended meanings even if they are able to enunciate correctly. The previous example of “water” is ideal in this instance as well. Knowledge of when to enunciate the word as *water* in Afrikaans [və:tə] rather than *water* in English [wɔtə] is not based on which is the matrix language and which the embedded. Thus, there exists a schematic reference to discourse on the Cape Flats, which in effect questions Reah’s postulation that phonology and intertextuality are two separate linguistic devices.

The headline “Jou Ma Se Hoes” in figure 1.3 either indexes anger or is used with humorous effect. Basically, a gas leak at a factory led to workers being evacuated from the building and needing oxygen treatment after many were left coughing. The term “Jou Ma Se Hoes” is taken from a common term “Jou Ma Se” (your mother’s) that is used to insult angrily or depending on the context, as a joke. However, the word “Hoes” also plays on a very vulgar term, ‘Poes’, which refers to the female productive organ, the vagina. The ‘street value’ of the term “Jou Ma Se” is flexible depending on the social context in that it could be viewed as derogatory or as jovial. However, the fact that “Hoes” and ‘Poes’ (the P-word) are minimal pairs in that they merely differ according to the replacement of the /p/ with the /h/ in the word “Hoes”, means that the headline not only plays off a common phrase but also feeds off the connotations of the term “Jou Ma Se” and the absence of the /p/ sound. Therefore, if the headline is viewed as a profanity it (a) uses a common and very vulgar term that may well be the strongest insult to any Cape Coloured and (b) the word “Hoes” plays on the absence of /p/ and also provides an apt description of the context, that is that people were left coughing because of the gas leak. Therefore, intertextuality is used as a device but plays on a common phrase that holds strong negative connotations.
In figure 1.14 the term “Dronk Verdriet” can be linked to the term “dop” as after heavy alcohol consumption people tend to bare matters of the heart or regret. Therefore, the mother who dumped her child whilst in a drunken state forgot she had a child. Two editions prior (figure 1.12) the daughter was an abandoned child, but in this edition the truth surfaces regarding the mother’s drunken state and sudden realisation of her actions hence the term “DRONK VERDRIET” (drunken sorrow/regret). Hence this headline refers to an earlier report two days prior as well as draws on the cultural knowledge of what “DRONK VERDRIET” entails.

The *Daily Voice* uses schema of words, phrases and sayings commonly practiced on the Cape Flats strategically frames these verbal texts to create a local flavour. This ensuing analysis figures 1.6 and 1.8, illustrates how the *Daily Voice* frames these local Cape Flats cultural sayings. In figure 1.6 the word “Dop” creates an image of heavy, sorrowful consumption of cheap alcoholic beverages, and is practically a more compact and potent 3-letter word apt for the type of words used in headlines. Likewise the word “vuil” carries cultural connotations of an entity, act, behaviour trait or person that is more than dirty but poisonous to either societal or moral fibres or in practical terms, to the homeostasis of any being. This highlights the references to built up schemata and how such references are framed to avail particular meanings.

The word “TIK” in the headline “ZILLE ON TIK ‘N PERLY LINK” refers to a sore point to many across the Cape Flats community due to its severe effects on households and lifestyles. The drug is readily available and has/is problematic and at the core of many social ills. Thus the nature of the word “TIK” carries with it a cultural history riddled with parental and spousal anger, heartache, violence because of the drug’s availability, the ineffective societal approaches toward stopping and destroying the drug trade rather than merely ‘dealing’ with it and of course the lack of governmental support and action toward eradicating the drugs from the streets. Here again the word “TIK” and the communal emotions that are attached to the drug and its abuse, is based on the discourse that has highlighted just how problematic the
drug currently is. In this way, the *Daily Voice* makes strong connections to the pains Cape Flats residents have experienced (and still do) regarding the TIK drug.

In figure 1.8 the word “Varke” is directly translated as ‘pigs’. However, the emotion driving someone to label another or a group of people is very difficult to put in words (cf 7.2). The headline “Varke” indexes anger toward several aspects. These include:

- Severe disgust, derision, anger, shock and disapproval towards the slaying of a pregnant woman.
- The same anger toward the manner of execution.
- The same emotion is aired toward the perpetrators, as well as the fact that such acts occur and therefore the disdain is directed at the murder and the infuriation that the level of crime has reached such a low point.

Analysis of the word “Varke” is endless, thus showing just how difficult it is to capture emotions and reactions projected by the *Daily Voice* hence a multimodal discourse analysis is more beneficial than mere textual analysis. However, it is evident that when someone yells “VARKE” it is more than a reference to the farm animal’s behaviour but points out the severity of the crime so much so that a community familiar with high crime levels have reached a point where one word encapsulates an elevated degree of their anger. Therefore the knowledge of this culturally rich term is essential especially since the word “Varke” is framed with a powerful image in a way that looks to intensify the emotions of the *Daily Voice* audience.

I view Reah’s (2002) notion of loaded words as biased because it is a fixed predetermined categorisation directed at one language. And in the case of bilingual language use, a monolingual view of code-switching would interpret embedded words as loaded and view matrix language words as loaded in terms of hegemonic discourse. Instead, I state that speakers of particular discourses negotiate the connotative and denotative meaning certain words, phrases and ideals possess within a particular context. Words and terms such as “Jou Ma Se Hoes”, “Dronk Verdriet”, “Dop”, ”Tik”, “Varke”, “Vuil”, “gesuip”, “shootout”, “murder”, “killed” etc may well fall into Reah’s loaded words category but in essence should
be evaluated according to the function these words have in the construction of available meaning options that are based on local cultural schemata as well as in how such meanings are framed for targeted recipients.

The type of words cited above is common to the discourse used in the *Daily Voice*. As such, the concepts these words/phrases allude to are regular and normalised on the Cape Flats. Can normalised forms of discourse then still be loaded? The answer is most likely no as tools such as appraisal help to identify which attitudes and amplification techniques are used to evoke emotional responses from readers by using familiar discourses.

Reah’s (2002) four language devices are antiquated if viewed as four separate entities in the analysis of bilingual language use in media publication such as the *Daily Voice*. Instead the appeal and hybridity of headlines are better explored in terms of intertextuality is based in schematic references and how these manifestations are constructed to allude to particular meanings and appeal to a Cape Flats audience. Simply viewing the bilingual headlines and subheadlines as combinations of two languages will distract from how meaning is constructed and negotiated and ignore the intertextual dimensions of the meaning-making process. Thus mere analysis of morpho-syntactic constructions of bilingual language use as viewed from monolingual perspectives would be insufficient. Instead looking at what is constructed, how it is constructed and what is derived from the constructions will identify how meaning is negotiated as well as how meanings are framed for specific purposes. Thus Reah’s (2002) language devices could be altered to address issues such as:

- Whether or not there any words in the headlines that are typical of Cape Coloured discourse and whether or not the words the *Daily Voice* use have the same meaning as is used on the Cape Flats.

- Whether the bilingual texts are borrowed from Cape Coloured speech patterns and the meanings these (borrowed) texts construct or deconstruct. Support for saying that these texts are indeed borrowed from Cape Coloured speech patterns is realised through the emphasis throughout about the importance of context both in terms of
culture, situation and the participants involved. The references to Eggins (1994/2004) as well as Scollon and Scollon’s (2003) argument about the importance of discourse in relation to physical and socio-cultural space also provide support. And more significantly, Xu’s (2007) emphasis for the need for academic acknowledgement of hybrid linguistic forms in discourse research.

- Whether or not the *Daily Voice* uses different languages in the Cape Coloured repertoire to create word play and typical sounds of Cape Coloured discourse. There are elements that are effectively used in a manner that both reflect Cape Coloured discourse as well as act to elevate this discourse to its own code rather than as a hybrid fusion of two languages. Thus falling in line with the argument of bilingual discourse as default languages made by Auer (1998), Meeuwis and Blommaert (1998).

- How does the *Daily Voice* use culturally rich words to construct or deconstruct Cape Coloured identity? Using Cape Coloured discourse potentially invokes powerful emotions due to cultural undertones, values and understanding in an easily accessible media publication influences the projected images of whomever or whatever is presented. Thus, the influence of such familiar Cape Coloured terms is effective beyond the literacy practice of reading an article as people empirically tend to engage in other speech interactions discussing, debating and arguing the emotions invoked by the *Daily Voice* and the underlying issues such as the degree and state of social ills. The *Daily Voice* thus uses words and phrases that capture an almost local Cape Flats ‘flavour’ with the desired effect.

### 7.6 Monolectal Discourse

Similarly there is evidence to support Auer’s (1998) view of code-switching as being monolectal. As shown above, the hybridity of Cape Coloured discourse is fuelled by the socio-cultural schemata and spatial locales where users interact. The *Daily Voice* uses catchy headlines that may seem untidy to non-members and/or speakers of this discourse. Likewise, any researchers who share Myers-Scotton’s ideologies would view such headlines as code-
switching and therefore analyse these texts as such instances using tools such as the MLF. In this respect the texts are analysed according to the rules of the source languages. However, this section argues that mere decoding of lexical items into two separate languages does not account for how meaning and interpretation is constructed and neither does it explain how readers would negotiate the difference between English and Afrikaans lexical items within a single headline. Or indeed whether or not such distinction exists in the case of Cape Coloured discourse. Therefore, I argue that there is evidence that Kaapse should be analysed as a single code with its own set of rules and meaning. Additionally, some lexemes no longer ascribe to the meanings of standard English and standard Afrikaans. In essence then, these words are no longer associated with the meanings white speakers and the mainstream newspapers would give them.

I now present the following in support of my argument that the Daily Voice uses lexemes that carry different meaning within the socio-cultural context of the Cape Flats. This breakdown shows how meaning can be lost if the language the Daily Voice uses is viewed as a combination of English and Afrikaans. Whether the source (matrix) language is English or Afrikaans becomes irrelevant as meaning-making depends on how people on the Cape Flats have developed and use the combined elements from English and Afrikaans as a unique code as just one linguistic resource. In this way I provide evidence of how the Daily Voice uses some lexemes in ways that mainstream newspapers do not. Essentially, this means the Daily Voice uses words and sentence forms that are not found in mainstream newspapers that use standard English and standard Afrikaans. For example, the headline “Bokke’s Island Dream” [bokəz] in figure 1.0 shows a morphemic construction that would not appear in a mainstream newspaper. The possessive inflectional morpheme –’s attached to “Bokke” would not appear as a unit in standard Afrikaans or standard English. Instead a term such as Bokke se Island Dream or Bok Island Dream would be used. Similarly the term “pa’s” [pəz] in figure 1.2 is more likely to be pa se (father’s) in other newspapers simply because “pa’s” does not conform to standard Afrikaans or standard English possessive pronoun constructions.

Also, the headline “We’re no water slamse” in figure 1.2, uses the term “water slamse” [wɔtə slʌmsə], which on the Cape Flats refers to Muslims who half heartedly practice their faith.
However, using standard English or standard Afrikaans the headline could interpret as *we’re no water Muslims*, which does not capture the cultural meaning as well as the clever word play on the word “water”. The story refers to the lack of water supply to particular Muslim residents on the Cape Flats and hence they are unable to perform obligatory ablution cleansing rituals before each of their five daily prayers. Also, the pronunciation of “water” as [wAʈə] and not in standard English, can only be distinguished by a person that knows when to identify this term of “water slamse” and the correct pronunciation thereof. In this way the *Daily Voice* uses lexemes and sentences that are not only familiar and distinct to the Cape Flats but also, non-existent in mainstream newspapers. Another example of how the *Daily Voice* uses a unique Cape Flats cultural saying in its headlines is the text “Jou Ma Se Hoes” in figure 1.3. This term plays on a common Cape Flats insult (see section 7.5) and if interpreted using both standard English and standard Afrikaans would be read as *Your mother’s cough*. In this way, the meaning of the term “Jou Ma Se Hoes” and the schematic cultural references is totally lost and so the impact the headline has fizzes out.

Similarly the headline “Varke” in figure 1.8 which means pigs is unlikely to feature in mainstream newspapers. However the *Daily Voice* uses such a term as it is commonly used on the Cape Flats. Similarly, the name of the column found in each edition of the *Daily Voice* (see section 2.3) is “Rek Jou Bek”, which in itself would not feature as a form of standard Afrikaans much less appear in newspapers that use only standard Afrikaans. The term “Rek Jou Bek” roughly relates as *stretch your (animalistic) mouth* in standard English. However, for the *Daily Voice* this term is more about describing how people on the Cape Flats express themselves. And the *Daily Voice* provides this platform for this expression in the form of the “Rek Jou Bek” column. Another common word on the Cape Flats is the term “outjie” as is found in figure 2.3 in the headline “Jordan’s mom brings her new outjie to court”. “Outjie” is commonly used on the Cape Flats to refer to a boyfriend as opposed to the standard Afrikaans word *kêrel* [kɐɾəl].

In this light I provide evidence that Kaapse English/Afrikaans cannot be analysed in terms of standard English and/or standard Afrikaans as meaning of the lexemes could be lost in terms of its socio-cultural relevance. This study aimed to explore the semiotic relationship between
visual and verbal texts and how multimodally, Cape Coloured identity is constructed or deconstructed. Based on Martin and Rose’s (2007:327) explanation of semiotic relationships it is deduced that the *Daily Voice* shows features of all four conditions. There are instances where the verbal text reinforce, supplement and/or complement the meaning constructed (deconstructed) by the visual elements. The reverse is also applicable as various instances show the dominance, subordinance, equivalence or reinforcement of visual elements in relation to verbal elements.

The verbal texts have been analysed in terms of the code-switched dynamics as well as the manner in which they exhibit conventional language devices (as discussed by Reah 2002). Also, analysing the appraisal of code-switched elements pointed out how cultural ideologies are expressed through linguistic repertoires. Both verbal and visual texts were analysed in terms of their salience, information value and framing. The initial separate analysis allowed the individual meaning-making potential of both the verbal and visual to be identified. This study established how each type of sign indexed the other to create meaning multimodally. Also, these multimodal compositions of the *Daily Voice* frontpages contextualised and positioned the potential attitudes toward the social issues covered in the news or competition content.

**Summary**

In this chapter I extended the analysis in terms of how the *Daily Voice* is able to draw on a rich supply of Cape Flats linguistic resources that may well not be appreciated using a monolingual approach to (multimodal) discourse analysis. I demonstrated my arguments for localised approaches to discourse research by highlighting the importance of how the *Daily Voice* frames schematic references using particular newsroom devices, one of which includes intertextual connections. More significantly, I showed that the developing area of appraisal need not be fixed to one particular ideology but instead be used as a flexible tool to multimodally analyse hybrid discourses such as those familiar used by the *Daily Voice*. In this way I showed how verbal and visual elements on the *Daily Voice* frontpages intensify the emotional appeal to a target audience. I also suggest that intertextuality is an important concept to incorporate in the appraisal analysis of the hybrid discourse used in typical *Daily*
Voice (frontpage) news stories on both a verbal and visual level. I showed how the Daily Voice uses framing techniques to draw on their audience’s Cape Flats schema through schematic references that are often intertextual. I also show how Reah’s (2002) language devices are incorrectly separated as indeed signs used on the Daily Voice frontpages act as schematic references dependent on socio-cultural knowledge of the Cape Flats. Thus, I used intertextuality to refute the language devices presented by Reah (2002) in order to accommodate the array of linguistic resources of Cape Flats discourse used in the Daily Voice and in so doing, I argued for hybrid bilingual language to be viewed as monolectal. In this way, hegemonic ideals are countered by virtue of domesticated or localised research analysis of a socio-cultural specific discourse. Several extracts of data are analysed in detail to show how meaning-making is centred on the nature of the contexts of culture and situation.

More significantly, these observations reinforce the work of Xu (2007) who encourages more context dependent studies rather than use perceived universal frameworks that do not (wholly) accommodate bilingual discourse of non-Western communities.

I also argue that appraisal is used to amplify the reactions and emotions of the Daily Voice audience as the newspaper uses stories located on the Cape Flats to appeal to its readers. I establish that the appraisal system suggested by Martin and Rose (2003/2007) and Martin and White (2005) can be used to evaluate how verbal and visual signs are used to intensify audience emotional responses. In this light, I argued that visuals can be used as tools of appraisal but in doing that, it uses schema and framing devices that draw on intertextual references. In view of this I show how the verbal and visual appraisal of the Daily Voice data is analysed.

Another key argument I extend in this chapter is based on viewing the linguistic practices on the Cape Flats in terms of their meaning-making potential within a specific socio-cultural context and not as universally predictable. I argue that a monolectal view is more fruitful to address bilingual discourse research of this nature. More importantly, I support my views by dissecting the bilingual speech prominently used on the Cape Flats featured on the Daily Voice frontpages. I break selected lexical items into the various inflectional morphemes
attached to the root words. Through this I show how such formulations are difficult to understand in terms of monolingual approaches to bilingual discourse. In this way I show how a monolectal view is more advantageous than using perceived universal frameworks such as the MLF when doing bilingual discourse research as the formulations of words unique to the Cape Flats may well be understood in terms of the rules of a single socio-culturally specific code.
Chapter 8 Conclusion

8.0 Introduction

I answered the first research question regarding how the visual and verbal texts on the frontpages work together to capture the sociolinguistic, economic and political contexts of the Cape Flats by illustrating the complex and unpredictable juxtaposition of these elements and how they index meaning to and from each other. Sociolinguistically, the code-switching practices associated with Cape Flats linguistic repertoires have been identified in the *Daily Voice*, as well as the structured patterning of Cape Coloured code-switching. The markedness nature of the code-switching thus works two fold: (a) the premeditated nature of headline (subheadline) writing shows that the *Daily Voice* actually positions the idea that the code-switching used on the frontpages mimics the linguistic practices of their target audience and (b) *Daily Voice* readers either feel as if the tabloid’s discourse reflects and maintains their own speech patterns or feel that the *Daily Voice* makes clear attempts to ‘sound’ Coloured especially as the entire publication does not necessarily use the language formulations found on the frontpages.

With regard to the second, I have established how the verbal and visual elements on the *Daily Voice* frontpages contextualise the Cape Flats in a much deeper rooted manner than what may be visible. For instance, the code-switched verbal texts maintain or reflect (or attempts to reflect) the linguistic repertoires of Cape Flats inhabitants. Likewise, the images index the realities of living on the Cape Flats. For instance, most of the headlines are about crime. Some might argue that this is a result of the strategic political racial segregation of the past. Secondly, the majority of the newsmakers are from the Cape Flats itself, for instance Najwa Petersen’s and Dina Rodrigues’ are cases in point. In other words, the images index where the stories take place, who are involved as newsmakers and what takes place. The ‘what’ concerns the various degrees of crime that have stigmatised this minority group for many a decade and the deeply rooted political undertones of these highly colour saturated tabloid-style images are reminiscent of the Kaapse Klopse which subconsciously reminds Cape Flats residents why they are Cape Flats residents.
Considering the apartheid legacy, the low incomes and poverty on the Cape Flats, the contextualisation of the Cape Flats is also achieved through the verbal text advertising the low cost (R2 at the time of data collection) as well as the idealised promise of instant wealth in the many *Daily Voice* competitions. From a media perspective bad news makes good news but now it is fearless (“Ons Skrik Vir Niks”) and *cheap*.

The second research question of how language and visual imagery are used in multimodal combinations to allude to Cape Coloured identity has been answered in part above. The complex multimodal nature accommodates various symbiotic relationships between the language/s and images used because of the linguistic and visual resource options available to the *Daily Voice*.

In this light the recognition of Cape Coloured discourse as monolectal rather than as a composite of two autonomous languages is essential. This recognition dare not be invalidated by applying theory and analytical tools that are designed for monolingual discourse research. Instead, the design of adaptable and/or newer models should not be detached from the socio-cultural contexts where they are meant to be used but be localised. Such design would encompass guidelines that perhaps explain why and how meaning is socially constructed and negotiated without prejudice to the hybridity of alternative discourse.

**8.1 Towards An Alternative Discourse?**

The findings to this study indicate that the Western paradigms and frameworks regarding bilingual discourse research and visual communication are efficient but not necessarily sufficient to objectively analyse hybrid discourses. Although the work of Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006); Myers-Scotton (1993a); Iedema (2003); Martin and Rose (2003/2007) and Pavlenko and Blackledge (2006) provide tools to further the aims of this study, there are instances where the respective frameworks do not rigidly accommodate the data analysis. Although it is possible to suggest that non-Western discourses and conventions merely flout Western paradigms, it must be considered that the flouting might not be case of flexing Western conventions but in fact, an indication of the lack of presence or recognition for non-Western analytical frameworks. This argument is supported by Xu’s (2007) call for
academics to break the chains of perceived and entrenched claims of the ‘inherent’ universality of Western ideologies, frameworks and research methodologies, especially in the exploration of marginalised ethnic discourses.

In order to motivate the importance of contextualising the analysis of the data used, I questioned the universality of several approaches commonly used in bilingual discourse and identity research. I not only critiqued the work of Myers-Scotton (1993a) and Reah (2002) but also provided alternative approaches and motivations to analyse my data. For example, some aspects of marginalised discourse could be classified as ‘loaded’ in Reah’s (2002) or Western terminology when they are an important meaning-making component when analysed from a local context viewpoint. I contextualised the grammar of visual design developed by Kress and Van Leeuwen (1996/2006) to a specific socio-cultural context, a point which they highlight. In this light I showed how the tenets of their design could be extended beyond Westernised contexts and that marginalised discourses such as those unique to the Cape Flats, are not inefficient, but indeed dynamic. I also extended the developing appraisal theory by Martin and White (2005) to show how both marginalised discourse and visual semiotics need to be considered within the appraisal framework.

Appraisal is a developing area of study and its applicability across various socio-cultural contexts is thus still under development. On the other hand code-switching is established though I question its applicability in the multilingual context of the Cape Flats. Thus I establish two key findings through my analysis. The first, establishes the need to consider the approach toward bilingual talk especially hybrid varieties. Thus one’s notion of code-switching influences the analysis of verbal appraisal. If code-switching is viewed as mere alternation of two languages then appraisal will most likely focus on embedded items within bilingual talk as emanating from separate linguistic systems. In this regard English and Afrikaans and thereby miss the socio-cultural meanings embedded in Kaapse English/Afrikaans. However, a monolectal approach offers different avenues of analysis as can be seen in chapters 6 and 7. In this light, I showed how a monolectal approach to bilingual discourse allows the Daily Voice to use several linguistic resources unique to the Cape Flats.
This highlights my second key finding that shows how the use of normalised and recognised Cape Flats speech patterns elevate the use of appraisal to a new level not just in terms of bilingual discourse but in terms of visual appraisal. That is, visual appraisal as a tool to augment the emotions of *Daily Voice* audiences. I thus extend Martin and White’s (2005) developing appraisal theory (cf also Martin and Rose 2003/2007) beyond the appraisal of verbal discourse to include visual texts. However, in this conceptualisation in multilingual contexts, appraisal goes beyond appraising single autonomous language systems to appraising the type of bilingual talk that is used on the Cape Flats as a code in its own right.

Therefore, in this thesis I argued strongly for a paradigm shift away from viewing bilingual discourse in terms of monolingually based ideologies. Instead I argued for discourses such as Kaapse English/Afrikaans to be considered as codes in their own right. In this light, a monolectal view allowed me to do a multimodal discourse analysis of the selected data without being confined to interpreting verbal text in terms of predictable and premeditated theories of bilingual discourse. Instead, an unbiased approach allowed me to view how the *Daily Voice* is able to tap into a pool of diverse linguistic resources in its various frontpage constructions. And in this way I show how a social approach to bilingualism within the media can be used to evaluate the negotiation on Cape Flats identity.

I also showed how the localisation of Kress and Van Leeuwen’s (1996/2006) notions of visual design can be used to do a multimodal discourse analysis of unique texts such as the *Daily Voice* frontpages. I also extended their notion of framing beyond aspects of mere spacing to the consideration of how Cape Flats schemata are used to frame meaning.

In my thesis I also explored a very young area of the appraisal theory as set forth by Martin and White (2005). Not only do I localise appraisal theory by analysing marginalised bilingual discourse to show how the *Daily Voice* constructs Cape Flats identity, I further their theory towards looking at how visuals are used as appraisal to capture the *Daily Voice* audience. This observation I believe elevates an under researched area of appraisal to newer heights. My explorations of appraisal theory in terms of marginalised bilingual discourse and visuals emanates from my decision to localise my study.
8.2 Readdressing the limitations

The interpretive nature of the study does leave room for further exploration. The main challenge was to draw together several areas that are characteristically multifarious. Having to identify speech patterns that include code-switching, investigating multimodal discourse analysis of hybrid linguistic practices and visuals as well as addressing the dynamics of emerging media discourses, requires careful focus to stitch the threads of major areas of linguistics (SFL—which is indirectly argued through the continuous emphasis on socio-cultural and contextually constructed meaning, MDA, Bilingualism in media discourse and identity negotiation in multilingual contexts). The mere scraping of the appraisal framework due to the limitations of this study, relates that a lot of the emotional essence captured by the code-switching used is absent. The approach to code-switching influences the use of appraisal significantly, for a monolingual biased approach would mean that embedded elements are appraised. A more monolectal approach would, as is exemplified in this thesis, draw on different techniques for the use of appraisal. However, it is important to note that appraisal itself, along with bilingual practices in ethnic minority media discourse as well as poststructuralist approaches are all relatively young research areas. Hence, any recognised frameworks for exploring all these areas may well have not been readied for analysing the data of this study.

The limitations of this thesis meant I needed to establish a very specific socio-cultural context, the Cape Flats, in order to achieve a multimodal discourse analysis of the selected Daily Voice frontpages. It needs to be recognised that only the frontpages were analysed. The rest of the Daily Voice publication is not presented in the same manner and therefore from the perspectives of MDA, bilingualism in media discourse, identity negotiation and media news layout, different approaches and considerations will be needed. The arguments regarding the construction and negotiation of identities will differ or be extended as the rest of the Daily Voice poses different challenges. I recommend further investigation into bilingual discourse appraisal and visual appraisal (of the media) in a separate study.
Bibliography


Journals

Websites
New Mondi Shanduka Newspaper category.
http://www.bizcommunity.com/Article/196/90/19467.html
(Accessed Thursday 13th December 2007)

(Accessed Thursday 25th October 2007)

http://www.mondishanduka.co.za
(Accessed Thursday 13th December 2007)
(Accessed Thursday 25th October 2007)

Van Der Walt, J (2005) Tabloid fever hits Cape Town: Press 'DAILY VOICE', South Africa
http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_qn4158/is_20050530/ai_n14647402
(Accessed by Thursday 25th October 2007)

www.geocities.com/iiii_velvet_un
(Accessed 19 August 2008)

www.hsrcpress.ac.za,
(Accessed by Thursday 24th October 2007)

www.infoplease.com/spot/colours1.html
(Accessed 19 August 2008)

www.sigmasurveys.co.za/primary-secondary-data/
(Accessed 4 March 2009)
Figure 1.3
Figure 1.7
Figure 1.8

Heavily pregnant Flats mom is brutally gunned down in a gangland execution

Figure 1.9

Najwa: you'll never nail me

Talief's widow says cops have no proof
Figure 1.14
The cheque's
in your mail

Figure 2.0

Figure 2.1

grow your business

become a Cell C vendor or distributor and watch your profits grow

Cell C is giving you an excellent opportunity to expand your business by selling Cell C prepaid products and earning ongoing revenue.

Become part of this once-in-a-lifetime business venture. Join us for the Cell C Seckhona Club new business venture presentations.

City

Venue

Date

Bloemfontein

Southdowns Hotel

11 September

Nelisibeng

Northern Hotel

13 September

Kimberley

Krabbenkop Hotel

13 September

Delville

Delville Hotel

13 September

For more details about your specific event, please contact your nearest Cell C representative.

Banking details:

- Bank: Nedbank
- Account name: Cell C Financial Services
- Account number: 146-0119-9591
- Branch: Seckhona

Please present proof of payment with your name, telephone number, and address, if applicable. (For example, a telephone number and address is provided for each Cell C representative.)
Poor Taliep looked like a little lamb tied up on the ground.
Figure 2.5

Figure 2.6