Work, women and welfare:
A critical gendered analysis of social development with special reference to income generation projects in the transition period in South Africa (1994 – 2001)

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor Philosophiae

in the Faculty of Arts

at the

University of the Western Cape

November 2013

by

Marie L. Minnaar-McDonald

Promotor: Professor Tamara Shefer, University of the Western Cape
Declaration

I declare that this dissertation, *Work, women and welfare: A critical gendered analysis of social development with special reference to income generation projects during the transition period in South Africa (1994 – 2001)*, is my own work, that it has not been submitted for any degree or examination to any other university, and that all the sources that I have used have been indicated and acknowledged by complete references.

Marie Minnaar-McDonald

Signed: 

Date: 2014-03-07
Abstract

Studies by feminists frequently investigate reasons why poverty reduction strategies involving income and work generation projects for poor women fail to deliver on set economic and social goals to provide jobs, income, education and skills training. Several reviews over a number of decades indicate a prevalence of welfare-oriented interventions that apparently contradict the intended transformative potential of economic empowerment, gender equality goals and anticipated outcomes included during the design of national policies and programmes. Different theoretical frameworks have, over time, been called upon to account for and have attempted to explain these shifts, changes and contradictions. Studies of women and work in developing countries in the 1970s and 1980s were mostly led by economists who commented on the perceived failure of policies and projects, and continued to investigate the cause of this anomaly. Given that the majority of these experiments combined both social and economic goals these policy findings were later viewed with skepticism leading to further probes about recurring failures, and the lack of progress to improve the status of poor women.

After decades of scientific research on gender inequality and a slow pace of change with regard to poor women’s economic status in developing countries, feminists revealed a disturbing finding: the lack of sound, ethical evaluation criteria and frameworks. This influenced a dramatic shift to alternative normative (value-based) approaches in which ethical and moral debates on development policy implementation flourished. Pointing to a general lack of empirical studies addressing policy implementation, arguments by these standpoint feminists proposed that policy and project implementation in different contexts lag far behind achievements in research and policy evidence. This assumption about the lack of integration of policy evidence with appropriate feminist theory, underpins my main motivation in this thesis. My intention is to apply a new feminist lens in order to examine the gendered nature of the historical period in which transitional policies in South Africa were implemented in the aftermath of authoritarian apartheid policies.

The current thesis argues for adoption of the political ethics of care (PEOC) as an appropriate normative feminist policy research approach providing excellent criteria for exploring the gendered dimensions of new social policies and programmes implemented during the first policy cycle of reform towards democratising South African society (also referred to as the transition 1994-2001). At the time of its conception, my investigation proceeded with the realisation that
many projects and programmes were evolving; and that contextual impact assessment criteria in
the field of gender and development policy remained an emerging new research terrain lacking
appropriate and critical gendered social indicators for monitoring, evaluation and theory
building. Most of the newly formulated policies included results of previous research recording
the historical role and socio-economic effects of apartheid policies. However, an urgent need
existed for new critical gender perspectives to address important post-apartheid issues of
vulnerable groups – such as women, youth, physically challenged and children – and arguing
for their full citizenship, including economic citizenship and integration into job creation. The
evolving policy relational structures that were embarked on during this reform, such as
democratic state-civil society partnerships, new democratic decision-making, dialogical
processes and policy service programmes, were in dire need of exploration and re-examination
using alternative and new feminist theoretical lenses.

This study explored the field of social policy implementation in the context of this transition
period. It investigated the phenomenon of income generation projects (IGPs), being a
development that was new to the South African professional social work disciplinary field.
Used as a key macroeconomic policy mechanism, IGPs were embedded in policy relational
structures (in the form of partnerships or consortiums) during the transition period. They
formed a key part of policy interventions in social development as prescribed by the White
Paper on Social Welfare (Department of Welfare, 1997b) having a dual purpose: to reduce
poverty and unemployment, and to promote gender-sensitive strategies.

The qualitative nature of the design used for this study is combined with a post-modernist and
post-structuralist, gendered case study approach drawing on programme evaluation research
techniques. Direct observation, documentary analysis, depth interviews and focus groups
sessions formed part of a comprehensive data-gathering research strategy used in different
micro-project and community settings in the Western Cape Province of South Africa. Three
broad research questions were pursued throughout this enquiry, addressing the following: the
extent to which income generation projects as proposed within the National Developmental
Policy Framework were addressing poverty and gender inequality in a satisfactory way; what
appropriate normative frameworks and concepts to study these existed; and whether the
PEOC could serve as an alternative framework; and how a user perspective could be
incorporated in public debates and policy-making.
A sample of four partnership project cases, targeting poor black women (and men) from three different community settings – being semi-rural, peri-urban and urban – as primary beneficiaries met the selection criteria for this longitudinal, in-depth study that drew on purposive and theoretical sampling approaches. All the projects or programmes included in the sample were engaged in job creation and social development work involving multiple stakeholders and partners. A significant part of the study focussed on the formation of partner relationships or consortiums between government, non-governmental organisations (NGOs), together with grassroots community-based self-help project participants (beneficiary) groups and individuals. Information and data collected were audio-taped, transcribed and analysed to assess the impact and social effects of newly implemented policy structures and processes on subjects. Alternative feminist theoretical and analytical approaches, being a care perspective that combined critical gender assessment methodologies and feminist ethics (political ethic of care) were applied to argue for more critical and appropriate, gendered research studies that could capture the important link between macroeconomic policies and evidence of unpaid care work embedded and performed within the development sector. By foregrounding the invisible unpaid care work performed by low intensity citizens in this sector, the state’s role and interaction as a development partner with NGOs and poor citizens in the implementation of social development policies that involved job creation and IGPs became apparent.

This thesis concludes by reiterating feminist proposals for a more inclusive notion of citizenship and calling for on-going studies to monitor perspectives on gender equality and work creation. More importantly, it suggests that PEOC could serve as an important research and analytical framework to document and integrate the right and access, by both men and women, to care, a critically important gender equality principle so often neglected in existing studies and scholarship.
Key words

- social development
- developmental social welfare
- policy implementation
- transition
- income-generation projects
- partnerships
- feminist research
- qualitative case study
- political ethic of care
Acknowledgements

Firstly, my sincere gratitude to the University of the Western Cape’s (UWC) Women and Gender Studies (WAGS) Programme for the opportunity for me to participate in the UNITWIN UWC/ Utrecht University Women Studies Staff Exchange Programme. The name of Rhoda Kadalie whom I worked with at the WAGS Programme, who played a big role advocating for and initiating capacity building for participating, co-founding members of staff, deserve mentioning. I was introduced to Professor Selma Sevenhuijsen, my mentor and initial long-distance supervisor during this exchange when the developmental stages for the larger study project were undertaken. Selma, thank you for introducing me to the Ethics of Care Framework and debates and for your unwavering support during challenging times. I also acknowledge the contributions of Professor Mieke Verloo from Nijmegen University (currently Radboud Universiteit Nijmegen), Netherlands, during the proposal development and pilot phase. Special thanks to Utrecht University and to the colleagues of the UWC Social Work Department, as well as the Trustees of the Erica Theron Scholarship Committee, for the scholarships awarded to me to initiate this project.

The UWC Senate and the Deputy Vice Chancellor’s Office deserve special thanks for research grants, teacher relief and additional finances that made the completion of this project possible.

Special tributes to Professor Tamara Shefer, my UWC supervisor and promoter, who provided me with the necessary guidance, direction and unwavering support to see this project through to completion of the final dissertation.

Thanks for research assistance from Ms Celeste Blaauw, who accompanied me to collect data in Beaufort West; for help with the reference list, Ms Lene Petersen and Dr Lillian Mitchell Kamalie (librarian); for assistance with an earlier draft, Mr E. Londt; and for editing the final dissertation, Ms Jill Sloan.

To my family: my loving sons, Dane and Kieran, I wish I could have given you more of the time that this project took. Thank you for your love, patience, tolerance, understanding and inspiration as well as the teasing – it kept me going. My three sisters, Rae, Carol, Suzette, as
well as Tony: thank you for all your encouragement, love and care, and support. To my extended family, all friends and comrades (at home and abroad), thank you for your patience, care, love and special spa treats to rejuvenate the spirits.

Special thanks to friends who became ‘family’ in the Netherlands: Toke Smolders and Joan Fischat who provided love, and friendship, accommodation and sustenance while I was on study visits away from my family in the early stages. Special thanks to all (too many to mention) who provided space and comfort to work when it was needed most.

To UWC colleagues (current Department of Social Work Staff Team as well as previous members of staff), students, and UWC alumni social workers (some of my ex-students) who believed in me and the relevance of my completing this project, you were patient throughout the agonizing stops and turns, and offered so many special favours. Special acknowledgement of a previous Head of Department, Professor Adam Small who advocated for greater awareness of important concepts such as ‘ethics’ and ‘care’ in Community and Health Science’s core curriculum debates and in leading the department’s contribution in this regard. To the current Dean and colleagues of the Faculty of Community and Health and to the staff at DVC office (Dr Vanessa Brown): thank you for all the encouragement and support.

To all the women, especially poor rural and urban black working class women, that I met, worked with and struggled alongside in various capacities during my life: thank you for the dialogue, for sharing your stories about your personal life, family, and work in income generating projects, and for teaching me your lessons of an ethic of care exercised with such humility and hope for social transformation. Womandla!

To the project participants (male and female, staff and beneficiaries) of all three communities: Mfuleni, Beaufort West and Philani, Khayelitsha: thank you for sharing.

Last, but not least, after my having travelled a long and difficult journey, I thank my Creator for showing me through Him all things are possible.
DEDICATION

In memory of:

my late parents,

John & Rachel;

my two brothers,

John & Willy,

and maternal uncle

William (Sr);

the late Rita Edwards,

friend, comrade and women’s rights activist;

the late Jean Swanson-Jacobs

ex-colleague, friend, comrade,

and the late Neil Mcdonald,

comrade and ex-husband.
# CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Title page</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Declaration</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keywords</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgements</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dedication</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contents</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronyms and abbreviations</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of tables</td>
<td>xvi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter One: Background – why an alternative feminist policy research approach?

1.1 Introduction                                | 1    |
1.2 Background: Locating the rationale for feminist theoretical policy study of gender transformation | 3    |
1.3 Citizenship and the political ethic of care as alternative feminist social work theoretical framework | 6    |
1.4 Global and local context for the study      | 11   |
1.5 Local South African context: Work, women and development social welfare during the transition | 17   |
1.6 The imperative for the current study        | 29   |
1.7 Overview of the thesis                      | 42   |

## Chapter Two: Feminist theories in gender and social development policy 45

2.1 Introduction                                | 45   |
2.2 Overview of feminist epistemology           | 45   |
2.3 Feminist post-modernism                     | 51   |
2.4 Postmodern positionality and situatedness   | 53   |
2.5 Promoting care ethics as a public social policy value | 63   |
2.6 Conclusion                                 | 70   |
Chapter Three: Feminist theory, gender and income generation projects

3.1 Introduction
3.2 Overview of IGPs, gender and social policy
3.3 Women in development (WID)
3.4 Women and development (WAD)
3.5 Gender and development (GAD)
3.6 Post-modern feminism (PMF)
3.7 Normative frameworks with respect to women, gender and development
3.8 Conclusion

Chapter Four: Researching policy implementation: A feminist, qualitative, multi-case design

4.1 Introduction and overview
4.2 Feminist inquiry as a key paradigm shift
4.3 Empirical policy studies: an alternative, normative, care ethics approach

Chapter Five: A qualitative, feminist, multi-case design research process and methodological procedure

5.1 Introduction
5.2 Problem statement and assumptions
5.3 Aims and objectives
5.4 Research settings and timeline
5.5 Participants
5.6 Sampling
5.7 Strategies and procedures for data collection
5.8 Case data analyses
5.9 Triangulation: Moving between within and CCA

Chapter Six: Caring social development: IGPs and partnerships in Mfuleni, Cape Town, Western Cape

6.1 Introduction
6.2 Historical context of projects in community settings 183
6.3 Partnership formation and gendered planning 187
6.4 IGP project development and implementation 190
6.5 Applying the PEOC approach 194
6.6 Conclusion 207

Chapter Seven: Caring social development: DSW in Beaufort West, Western Cape 211

7.1 Introduction 211
7.2 Historical context of the community setting 213
7.3 Partnership formation and gendered planning 219
7.4 IGP project development and implementation 222
7.5 Applying the PEOC approach 227
7.6 Conclusion 240

Chapter Eight: Developmental social welfare: Crossroads, Cape Town, Western Cape 242

8.1 Introduction 242
8.2 Historical context of the community setting 243
8.3 Partnership formation and gendered planning 245
8.4 Project development and implementation 248
8.5 Applying the political ethics of care approach 251
8.6 Conclusion 264

Chapter Nine: Conclusion 267

9.1 Introduction 267
9.2 Moving between within-case and cross-case analysis 275
9.3 Towards a Public EOC 291

References 295
Appendixes 329
**Acronyms and abbreviations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABET</td>
<td>Adult Basic Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACPHCC</td>
<td>Academic comprehensive primary health care centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFDC</td>
<td>Aid to Families with Dependent Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANC</td>
<td>African National Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATI</td>
<td>Appropriate Technology International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPFA</td>
<td>Beijing Platform for Action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCEA</td>
<td>Basic Conditions of Employment Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEE</td>
<td>Black economic empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBD</td>
<td>Central business district</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBE</td>
<td>Community-based education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBO</td>
<td>Community-based organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCA</td>
<td>Cross-case comparative analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCT</td>
<td>Conditional cash transfers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPHPE</td>
<td>Community Partnerships in Health Personnel Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSB</td>
<td>Child Support Benefit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil society organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DA</td>
<td>Democratic Alliance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DAWN</td>
<td>Development with Women for a New Era</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSW</td>
<td>Developmental social welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EOC</td>
<td>Political ethic of care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EOJ</td>
<td>Ethic of justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAO</td>
<td>Food and Agriculture Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET</td>
<td>Future education and training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAD</td>
<td>Gender and development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAF</td>
<td>Gender analysis framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCF</td>
<td>Gender classification framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNU</td>
<td>Government of National Unity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEAR</td>
<td>Growth Employment and Redistribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEM</td>
<td>Gender Equality Measure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross Domestic Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNP</td>
<td>Gross National Product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCSR</td>
<td>Gendered case study research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IGP</td>
<td>Income generation project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Integrated development planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDT</td>
<td>Independent Development Trust funds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IME</td>
<td>Industrial market economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IMF</td>
<td>International Monetary Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITDG</td>
<td>Intermediate Technology Development Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KAVO</td>
<td>Karoo Association for Preschool Development (Karoo Assosiasie vir Voorskoolse Ontwikkeling)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LDC</td>
<td>Less-developed countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metro</td>
<td>Metropolitan area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NQF</td>
<td>National Qualifications Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPO</td>
<td>Non-profit organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NNP</td>
<td>New National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAC</td>
<td>Pan Africanist Congress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAWC</td>
<td>Provincial Administration of the Western Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pentech</td>
<td>Peninsula Technikon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEOC</td>
<td>Political ethic of care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PHC</td>
<td>Primary healthcare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNC</td>
<td>Philani Nutrition Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRWORA</td>
<td>Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMF</td>
<td>Post-modern feminism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PMFT</td>
<td>Post-modern feminist theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RDP</td>
<td>Reconstruction and Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SABS</td>
<td>South African Board of Standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SADC</td>
<td>Southern African development countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANCO</td>
<td>South African National Civic Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANTA</td>
<td>South African Tuberculosis Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SETA</td>
<td>Sectoral education training authorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMG</td>
<td>State Maintenance Grant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMME</td>
<td>Small, medium and micro-enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TB</td>
<td>Tuberculosis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UIF</td>
<td>Unemployment Insurance Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UN</td>
<td>United Nations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIFEM</td>
<td>United Nations Development Fund for Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNRISD</td>
<td>United Nations Research Institute for Social Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>US</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UWC</td>
<td>University of the Western Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WAD</td>
<td>Women and development perspectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WB</td>
<td>World Bank</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCCPP</td>
<td>Western Cape Community Partnership Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WED</td>
<td>Women, environment and sustainable development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WID</td>
<td>Women in development perspectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WMSE</td>
<td>Women’s micro and small enterprise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTO</td>
<td>World Trade Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WPR</td>
<td>What’s the problem represented to be?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of tables

2.1 Black feminist theoretical propositions .................................................... 56
3.1 Review of scholarship on women, gender, care and development .................. 76
3.2 Different purposes and goals of GAFs ....................................................... 91
3.3 Summary seven post-modern guidelines for the study of WMSEs .................. 100
3.4 Nussbaum’s list of ten central human functional capabilities ......................... 108
4.1 EOC practical research questions ............................................................ 137
4.2 Six basic research steps for single case studies .......................................... 140
5.1 Longitudinal multi-case study process and timeline 1996 – 2012 ................. 156
5.2 Summary of participants for Case One – Mfuleni (1997) ............................ 158
5.3 Summary of participants for Case Two – Beaufort West (2000 – 2001) ......... 159
5.4 Summary of participants for Case Three - Crossroads (2000 – 2001) .......... 160
5.5 Sample of project cases ............................................................................ 163
6.1 Gender-specific income generation projects ............................................. 202
6.2 Pre-liminary findings and alternative feminist PEOC assumptions about IGPs .. 206
7.1 Negative issues about the project raised by project participants ................ 232
7.2 Personal views about necessary improvements to the project ..................... 233
9.1 Common policy issues ............................................................................. 268
9.2 World Bank analytical matrix ................................................................... 275
Chapter One: Background – why an alternative feminist policy research approach?

1.1 Introduction

South Africa today, especially with respect to the edges of difference – or what, more prosaically, we might call 'boundaries' – is a country still without a permanent constitution, a temporary 'government of national unity', enduring uncertainty about the ownership or access to land and housing, continuing debate about who qualifies as bonafide political actors (that is, whether chiefs and kings do or do not exist 'outside' of politics, and who qualifies as a citizen), uncertainty about virtually all levels of geographic boundary demarcation from provincial to neighborhood and household, and in which almost all identities – previously legislated and believed to be immutable – are suddenly open to threat and negotiation. Thus, the South African condition is more post-modern than it is post-colonial. (Thornton, 1996: 144)

The social, cultural, legal and political conditions that continue to shape the legacies of post-apartheid, post-colonial South African society during the first five-year democratic policy cycle, post-1994 and beyond, influencing the rationale for this study, are captured in the above excerpt which critically observes the indeterminate state of affairs that transpired. The uncertainties of this period were to become the embodiment of controversial political and economic analyses and public debates in mainstream social science discourse which amount to a field of study (Alexander, 2002: 43) named transitology. In his overview on debates that discussed the transformation and reforms from apartheid to democracy, Alexander (2002), like the analyses he re-examined, lacked references to gender or a critical gendered analysis (Chipkin, 2009; Goetz & Hassim, 2003; Hassim, 2006; Higgins, 2009). This trend was continued in the post-1994 state in society approach by Beall, Gelb & Hassim (2005: 1) who amongst others analysed and depicted the first decade of democracy as fragile stability. In their analysis and discussion of local conditions, they showed how state authority and capacity have been regenerated, from a position of severe weakness at the time of transition, to a situation where the state has substantial capabilities in exercising basic functions such as
policing, border control and taxation. But they concurred that in many other social areas, both stability and fragility increased ten years later. These changes were clearly demonstrated by prevailing macroeconomic conditions that were found to be both stabilising and destabilising with different sets of policies having different effects (Beall, Gelb & Hassim, 2005). Factors that they pointed out as contributing to this state of fragile-stability were single party dominance of politics, continued salience of race relations, black economic empowerment (BEE), militarism and corruption, all adding to the potential for destabilisation. In contrast, debates on stabilisation, gender relations, HIV/AIDS and issues pertaining to land reform have been limited (Beall, Gelb & Hassim, 2005).

The latter analysis is but one of many perspectives that formed part of a series of debates to which several others contributed (Chipkin, 2009; Pillay, 2009) Given the overall lack of gendered analysis and the limited references to the gendered dimensions, the latter omission in integrated critical gendered analysis is an area of feminist and social work policy study that this thesis seeks to address. As a newly liberated democracy with a liberal democratic dispensation, South Africa’s transition formed part of a generation of similar historical transitions that commenced in the late quarter of the twentieth Century that still continue on different continents (Alexander, 2002). Transitions of the former Eastern Europe, Soviet Union, Northern Ireland and developments in African countries such as Burundi and Rwanda are some examples (Alexander, 2002: 43; see also Rudebeck, 1992; and Wilson, Kanji, & Braathen, 2001).

South African feminist perspectives joined some of the mainstream social science discourses on the implications of the transition much later. They, too, adopted different disciplinary angles to research and discuss social and cultural issues (Budlender, 1996; Daymond, 1996; Hassim, 2005a; 2006; Goetz & Hassim, 2003; Gouws, 2005); but failed to provide a comprehensive historical feminist review of debates on the transition period (Alexander, 2013; Barchiesi, 2011); neglecting policy developments and implementation analyses, including analyses of the role of the state. Some perspectives did however begin to engage with mainstream interpretations on the basis of the role that gender played accessing rights of citizenship. The shift to discussions of notions of citizenship (Goetz & Hassim, 2003; Gouws, 2005) was viewed as a positive move to encapsulate an overarching conceptual framework, offering new possibilities and opportunities for more critical feminist scholarship to emerge. The need to assess and study gender inequalities and emerging social relations, apart from
political identities of women and gender in a contemporary changing democracy, became influenced by international feminist views. Hassim (2005a), for example, argued that the early transitional focus on citizenship influenced women’s further political strategies for greater inclusion and political participation (Hassim, 2005b). The nature of how the transition to democracy evolved was further perceived as impacting on further demands for greater equality, representation and access to power in policies and decision-making at all levels of society by different social, political and economic strata. The Bill of Human Rights became a vehicle to socially mobilise for citizenship rights mutually agreed to by all stakeholders irrespective of race, gender, or ethnicity and ability; and this transition opened up space for feminists and other vulnerable groups (poor women, disabled people, gay and lesbian groups) to articulate a broader agenda in striving for greater equality, justice and proper access to citizenship (Hassim, 2005b; Gouws, 2005).

It is within this larger feminist standpoint agenda, of interrogating the transition through a gendered lens that the goal and objectives of this thesis is located. Through the particular focus on social development, partnerships with state, and business oriented entrepreneurship programmes and projects for poor men and women in the period following 1994, this study contributes to contemporary policy debates on gender transformation, empowerment and women’s economic citizenship in the post-apartheid, post-conflict context of implementing democratic policies and practices. The discussion in this introductory chapter will seek to clarify the transitional context (global and local) of the study of gender and social development policies that emphasized income earning with a care component to address poverty and inequalities. A brief overview of this context, theoretical framework, goal, and objectives of the research questions, definition of key concepts and chapter outlines will be provided.

1.2 Background: Locating the rationale for feminist theoretical policy study of gender transformation

1.2.1 Researching economic citizenship, poverty and inequalities as gendered concerns

The fact that South African feminists joined international debates on the latter point is evident in their earlier overriding concern with political, rights-based citizenship issues which neglected deeper considerations and integration of both political and economic matters
(Melby, Ravn, & Carlsson-Wetterberg, 2008). In the case of poor black women, the assessment of juridical arguments (Gouws, 2005) and concerns with women’s political mobilization (Hassim, 2006), received far more in-depth attention than empirical research and analyses of women’s challenges in economic citizenship (Kessler-Harris, 2003: 159). In contrast, a related but alternative feminist discourse seeks to improve the balance between theories and practices of citizenship developed internationally. The need for integration between political, economic and social perspectives (Knijn & Kremer, 1997; Melby, Ravn & Carlsson-Wetterberg, 2008; Sevenhuijsen, 1998; Tronto, 1993) inspired my own interest to understand the notion of citizenship more critically as a lived experience. For example, Melby et al. (2008: 11) drew my attention to Kessler-Harris’s (2003) point about conventional notions of citizenship that fail to consider the gendered application of economic rights which are still inadequately addressed in South African studies. Notions of economic rights would, for example, include the civil right to work, meaning the right to follow the occupation of one’s choice and the social right to social security, but will ignore the importance of gender as a variable. The key issue of women’s economic citizenship or economic independence – and the latter’s connection with conceptualising gender and equality to enter current debates on concepts of citizenship and policy practices – are thus important for this thesis. The distinction between these two sets of economic rights (civil and the social) became increasingly controversial and contested in global policy debates and feminist perspectives (Nussbaum, 2000; Robinson, 1999) and provided impetus to document and clarify my own observations of the gaps in contemporary South African feminist discourse and understanding for this period. By drawing on Kessler-Harris’s (2003) emphasis on the complementarity between civil and social rights to advance critical debate on economic citizenship, I tend to agree with Melby et al. (2008: 12) that their gendered implications appear obvious. Kessler-Harris’s (2003: 159) statement about economic citizenship compels the enquiry: “Who gets what kinds of economic rights – whether civil or social?” It also compels the assumption that this notion rests on “… sometimes hidden, normative assumptions about who cares and who works …” (Kessler-Harris, 2003: 159, cited in Melby et al., 2008: 12), suggesting a much more complex, open-ended question to anyone interested in contextual social policy realities of Southern developing countries. Commenting on Kessler-Harris’s (2003) notion of economic citizenship – and in justifying the critical need to analyse the realisation of Scandinavian women’s economic citizenship – Melby et al. (2008) further states that she combined the right to work, in the occupation of one’s choice,
which also included childrearing and household maintenance, with the right to an income that is adequate for support of self and family (Lund, 2008).

The assumption about the latter combination of rights still serves as a hallmark of current social and economic policy debates at an international level. The realisation of women’s economic citizenship in relation to women’s empowerment and human dignity, which became critical issues for feminist debate towards the late twentieth century (Melby et al., 2008: 12) in all countries, thus continue as an important struggle for gender justice in the twenty-first century (United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD), 2005). Hence, to ensure that women become further integrated into communities of full citizenship in the context of relatively young democracies, the struggle for social and economic justice to achieve gender equality is ongoing, and South Africa is no exception. However, to explain historical anomalies in contemporary South African life, feminist debates suggested (Gouws, 2005: 29) that citizenship is much more than just a status or outcome but is rather a process (Lister, 1997). They elaborated further that the distinction between citizenship as status and citizenship as agency appeared blurred as the former, referring to citizens as rights-bearers, became more emphasized in discussions to engage in a developmental process of capacity building and debate. Agency was referred to as active participation in civil society formations. The notion of citizenship as process (Gouws, 2005; Lister, 1997; Siim, 2008) moved beyond the current boundaries of process. The notion of lived citizenship was understood as contextual and expressed in spaces and places (Siim, 2008: 151) as a way of life, demonstrating citizenship from below (Siim, 2008: 161) and opening new possibilities to recontextualise and reconsider new studies. The notion of lived citizenship was illustrated, discussed and challenged with reference to new empirical material generated by the context of globalization. However, the continued gender inequalities – present even in the ‘model’ citizenship of Scandinavian Nordic countries so often referred to in the literature – suggest a need for ongoing alternative investigations that can challenge previous perceptions.

---

1 See South Africa Debates on the historical Old State Maintenance Grant initiated to address Poor White Poverty, Lund, 2008
1.3 Citizenship and the political ethic of care as alternative feminist social work theoretical framework

As part of the imperative to develop a more critical lens on policy for women and poverty alleviation as identified above, the goal of this study is to apply Tronto’s political ethics of care (PEOC) approach to the study of social development, policy implementation and state and social relations during post-apartheid South Africa and the transition to democracy. The goal is to develop this approach not only as a practical and alternative way to think about citizenship (Fisher & Tronto, 1990; Tronto, 1993), but also as a research and analytical frame that will bring a more ethical and historical feminist analysis to South African social work policy understandings of the post-1994 reform period. The brief introductory discussion of PEOC seeks to clarify the approach in relation to the particular context that shaped the formation of new networking relations between state, civil society and community that set the scene for gender and social development/gender contract policies implemented to address inequalities, poverty reduction and care.

1.3.1 The political ethic of care and the South African White Paper for Social Welfare

Theories and frameworks exert a power over how we think, if we ignore this power then we are likely to misunderstand why our arguments seem ineffectual.

(Tronto, 1993:4)

Joan Tronto (1993:118) has stated an ethic of care refers to a “… moral disposition and a set of moral sensibilities, issues and practices that arise from taking seriously the fact that care as a value is a central aspect of human existence …” ² Against this background, Fisher and Tronto (1990) proposed that care be understood as an activity in which the understandings of needs become central (Sevenhuijsen, 1998). They defined care broadly as:

... a species activity that includes everything that we do to maintain, continue and repair our world so that we can live in it as well as possible. That world

---

includes our bodies, ourselves and our environment, all of which we seek to interweave in a complex, life-sustaining web. (Fisher & Tronto, 1990: 36)

In this approach, care is viewed as a continuous social process that is characterised by several phases or dimensions, each with a corresponding value or virtue. Caring about requires the recognition that care is necessary: there is a need that should be met. Caring about requires the moral quality of attentiveness of these needs. Caring for, once a need is recognized, addresses the problem of whom and how to meet that need. Caring for is an assumption of the value of commitment and responsibility for the meeting of the need. Taking care of, or caregiving, is the actual practice and work of caring. The corresponding value consists of competence. The person or group who do the caregiving may, or may not, be the same people who did the caring about or the caring for. Competence becomes a moral question since the ones who take responsibility have to see, together with the caregivers, whether or not the work is done well. The fourth phase, care receiving, requires that care receivers respond to the care received. Those engaged in caring will have to use this response to determine whether or not the care has been completed, whether more or different types of care are necessary, and so forth. Therefore, this phase of care raises the moral question of responsiveness.

Using the approach of an ethic of care, the process of care should be seen in a holistic manner and also from both the perspectives of caregivers and care receivers. Since care is understood as a political concept (Tronto, 1996b), integral to the process of human existence, it concerns not only privatized relations, but also social and political institutions, cultural values and practices. The ethic of care thus departs from the romanticized individualistic images of human nature that underpin neo-liberal policy programmes, and instead starts from normative notions of relationality and interdependence: the basic idea that humans are engaged in each other’s lives in a myriad of ways, interacting also with nature and the environment.

One of the key matters that concern this study is how policy and public programmes of developmental social welfare and related income-generating projects (IGPs) with a care component that had been implemented in terms of the national policy guidelines set out in the White Paper during the transition, would appear if critically analysed through this lens of care.
In this dissertation, it is argued that the ethics of care be considered as an appropriate normative and socially relevant feminist historical policy research approach to reinterpret and analyse social policy discourses that have shaped the social, political and economic constructions of gender, poverty and policy implementation during periods of transition as in the first five years (1994–99) of South Africa. This dissertation points to observations and discussions about gendered policy shifts from reconstruction and development to a globalized, macroeconomic, debt servicing and poverty reduction policy strategy that captured and socially constructed women as users or consumers to be targeted for special attention and policy interventions, and not as citizens. The lack of appropriate normative frameworks to monitor and record these implemented policies could be addressed with the application of the ethics of care frame as both a research and theoretical approach, as is done in this study.

Tronto (2006), a pioneer in the integrated social, political and economic perspectives on citizenship reminds us that “… care, the disposition and work of maintaining ourselves, is the deep and ignored background to citizenship …” (Tronto, 2006: 4). Her views reopened and led an old debate most relevant to conceptualise feminist study of this period. She asked who and what citizens are. Her discussion further introduced feminist ethics and the political ethic of care as an overarching key theoretical orientation which she and others (Brandsen, 2006; Sevenhuijsen, 1998) have offered as a new, alternative starting point to question the notion of citizenship in relation to gender and the equality discourse on social policies. By recasting questions of who and what citizens are in relation to questions about what they do, or how they practice citizenship, and how citizens relate, in these social practices, to the state (Knijn & Kremer, 1997; Sevenhuijsen, 1998; Tronto, 2006), sparked renewed interest in further discussions and observations about women, gender and care practices; and also about the relationship between caregiving and care receiving. Alternative feminist perspectives, following the feminist ethics framework and the political ethic of care lens, lifted and shifted this discourse further to observe that citizenship is first and foremost a relational social practice (Robinson, 2006; Sevenhuijsen, 1998). Based on this understanding, Brandsen (2006: 219), drawing on Young’s ideas about democracy as an inclusive, deliberative process (Young, 2000), elaborated on this further. For Brandsen (2006: 219), the idea of a deliberative democratic practice implies being more caring and transformative by accommodating human care and inter-dependence (Tronto, 1993) as key values for an alternative vision of life. To achieve deliberative democracy, several normative principles
(inclusion, political equality, reasonableness, publicity) are needed to shape and direct relationships to deliberate in a way that includes all parties. This principle of inclusion received special attention as it addressed the lack of effective opportunities to influence the thinking of others, even when citizens have access to procedures of decision making. Hence, exclusion takes place when only limited forms of political communication are allowed. Paraphrasing Young (2000), Brandsen (2006: 218) promotes that argument, with its emphases on “... becoming articulate, dispassionate and orderly in public debate ...” serves as a primary exclusionary mechanism in the practice of political communication. Following Young (2000), she maintains that not only are additional accounts of political communication needed to counter exclusion, but that “… the need for trust and respect (Sevenhuijsen, 1999), and moving across structural and cultural differences …” are also required (Brandsen, 2006: 218).

Reading and internalising these debates demands cautious self-reflection on actual citizen praxis and includes searching beyond the surface of non-gendered debates on South African transition to democracy. The question of how new transitional democracies, in particular the new democratic and developmental South African state, engaged its citizens, especially women citizens, in public and private spheres of policy development, planning, decision making and implementation post-1994, remained a vexed question that reverberated throughout my self-reflection process as a feminist social work academic. In order to carefully reflect, redefine and understand notions of citizenship, I realise that it is necessary to obtain a greater understanding of myself, or discovering my role as citizen: accounting for and explaining the deeper political, social and economic impact of gendered relations forged during a fraction of this important time period. This need for critical South African gender perspectives on citizenship has become obvious (Wilson, et al., 2001: 12). Some feminists, like Lister (1997: 2010), consider that constructions of citizenship based on participation in the public sphere, being economic participation or the lack of it in the labour market, remain important to social citizenship rights but continue to be inadequately conceptualised. Due to the unequal and sexist division of labour, the implications for women are widespread; as many women need to balance domestic and caring responsibilities in the home or private sphere with the income and earning opportunities in the public sphere (Razavi, 2007). While time is a necessary resource for citizenship (Wilson et al., 2001: 12), it is and remain a scarce commodity for poor women. In a global village, and the world of work, humanity is therefore “… a long way from equal citizenship rights for mothers, carers, and formal political systems
which are accessible to informal political groupings.” (Wilson, Kanji, & Braathen, 2001: 12). This ongoing need for a gendered comprehension of equality and caring citizenship practices strongly influenced my attempt to study and reinterpret the substance of political arguments about citizenship by South African feminists on this period (Gouws, 2005). Feminists, for example, argued that the dominant liberal rights discourse regards the engagement with the state and citizenship as the main vehicle through which individuals claim rights. I found this discourse in need of substantial, if not concrete empirical evidence to expose and understand the peculiar form and nature of current state formation, by showing who and what the current South African ‘democratic state’ is, and how this state engages its citizens, with particular focus on poor women citizens, through partner relations and decision-making processes. Newly created relational structures such as (partnerships or contracts/compacts) with civil society organisations (non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and community-based citizen groups) became important gendered stakeholders in building democracy. The observation by feminists such as Gouws (2005) that the rights discourse obscures the reality of political choice; and that this encourages, particularly women’s, passivity towards, and reliance on, the state, is an issue that is still widely debated on an international and national level (Rai & Lievesley, 1996; Waylen, 1996c; Wilson, Kanji, & Braathen, 2001). Whilst less was known about the changing identity of the current developmental and new democratic state system – see speculative debates on the evolving nature of the South African developmental state (Edigheji, 2010; Fine, 2010; Groenmeyer-Edigheji, 2006; Mkandawire, 2010; Triegaardt, 2011) – women were already being judged and criticised by their own gender for “… not claiming their rights or accessing the state ….” (Gouws, 2005: 9). Almost a decade into democracy, this trend was observed without adequate, concrete explanation and without exploration of why it occurs or how it may be challenged through social mobilization or dialogue to improve their conditions (Edwards, 1997). Gouws (2005) alluded to possible reasons why some policies failed or why women have not been receptive by pointing to underlying assumptions and to gender norms of the rights discourse that may have gone unaddressed (Gouws, 2005: 9) or became silenced; especially those about culture and, even more importantly, debates about care that involve interactions between all citizens (both women and men).
1.4 Global and local context for the study

International studies on income generation or work creation projects have over many decades investigated critical reasons why policies and programmes designed for poor women fail to deliver on set economic targets and social goals to create jobs, income, education and skills training aimed at improving their existing lower status in relation to men. A global review study (UNRISD, 2005) released a decade after the famous Fourth World Conference on Women in 1995, the Beijing Platform of Action Conference, reported on very limited improvements and changes to the position and status of women since calls – still so relevant to consider as this thesis progresses – were made. Findings of this important study isolated a number of social development policy issues by accounting more holistically for the alarming lack of progress to improve status of women. One of the key areas that they singled out for attention was the nature of the world of work and labour market reforms that were unable to fully account for the part women played in it. The timing of the release of the report was a deliberate reminder to policymakers of commitments and also to reawaken feminist researchers and scholars to continue questioning and debating the slow pace of global interventions and change. This gave impetus to many other scholars (Fennell & Arnot, 2008: 3) to renew arguments and questions on whether the expectations of the 2000-2015 Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) framework with regards to gender, especially the Dakar Declaration (2000), were even realistic in terms of the ten- to fifteen-year time frames adopted for outcomes and changes that are now in dispute.

At the beginning of an important epoch, the thrust for the comprehensive UNRISD special report, Gender equality: Striving for justice in an unequal world (UNRISD, 2005), acknowledged the inattentiveness of mainstream international public policy debates to social issues that affect the global majority of poor women; and also to gender equality and transformation matters. The social issues were listed in the following order: economic liberalisation, democratisation, governance reforms, identity and conflict (UNRISD, 2005: xv). The release of the report for global discussion coincided with the Beijing Plus Ten assessment requested by the United Nations (UN) General Assembly (2000). The latter provided terms of reference to set off the MDG’s framework and international public discussions. Given the plethora of post-Beijing studies, the significance of this document could be seen in the way it evoked the implications of neglecting backlogs on gender inequalities at the end of the twentieth century. By giving details of rising global policy
expectations five to six years into the twenty-first century, and by reigning in research and policy studies produced by more than sixty feminist scholars from various countries, it represented one of very few social studies that merged comparative international gender policy trends of developing and developed countries, opening spaces for new international policy research agendas that included care (Razavi, 2011). This validation exercise included a range of critical social policy issues that strengthened the intellectual integrity of the discipline of women and gender policy studies based in the West and outside of it. In these, post-1994 South African policy examples featured quite significantly (Hassim, 2005a; UNRISD, 2005) to illustrate how developing countries are shifting and reforming.

General findings reflected that women all over the globe still faced serious limits on a list of three important things that women lack: earned income, authority and power. Furthermore, despite some limited changes, a general theme encountered in the report was that of ongoing gender inequalities, and perceptions of differences and similarities in women’s access to the right to work. This could be contrasted with concerns raised by feminist scholarship of the previous decade which attempted to combine arguments about women with those about culture and development (Nussbaum & Glover, 1995). One specific observation of relevance to this study’s rationale of exploring alternative, more critical, gender-based analytical/explanatory frameworks was the argument about feminisation of poverty and the upward trend of a global, feminised labour market (UNRISD, 2005). The trend where women’s labour market participation rates were identified as on the rise appeared to have occurred alongside the increasing informalisation, or casualisation, of labour forces that have backfired in terms of more complex changes to care arrangements and social relations. All of these become disguised in societies that are undergoing social, political/legal and economic reforms. Marred by diversity, the intricate slow pace in changing social and gender relations called for contextual and in-depth time-specific gender-based studies, with alternative but appropriate conceptual and analytical frames of reference.

The challenge to embark on my own study project was inspired by other like-minded feminists who have posed several important care-related questions. Some (Fisher & Tronto, 1990; Hamington & Miller, 2006; Robinson, 1999; Sevenhuijzen, 1998; Tronto, 1993; 2006) were concerned with the increasing disconnect between societal efforts, or state policies, to manage markets, social relations and subject or citizens responses which set the tone for further international policy studies. Several of these (Razavi, 2007) refer to the complexity of
care ethics (Hamington & Miller, 2006), arguing for the need to challenge gender relations and notions of equality (Nussbaum, 2000; Razavi, 2007; Truong, 1997; 2000a; as manifested in international policies. The UNRISD (2005) publication, in raising awareness about an apparent convergence in male and female economic and labour force participation rates, posed the very important question of whether the rising economic participation by women signalled the disappearance of gender from the labour market. The report also sought answers as to how the rising female labour force participation rates would further affect the gendered division of unpaid domestic and care work (UNRISD, 2005: 67) and hence result in policy changes to address gender equality or inequalities in the early twenty-first century. This, however, raised further questions for more depth in empirical and historical investigations in different cultural contexts. The quest for greater understanding is a challenging task that has already begun with various international conferences taking place. But the case of South Africa should be approached carefully; by adopting a more ‘contextual constructivist’ approach (Bacchi, 1999) to research the historical impact of transitional policy planning and implementation strategies in specific situations and to uncover, monitor, evaluate and study women and gendered social relations in its entirety or as emerging. This stance formed the backdrop for my adoption of a care perspective which encompasses investigating public policies, structures and implementation processes instituted during a time of major reform and as experienced by poor women at grassroots community level. My search for insight into policies around work, women and welfare included some of the issues raised in relation to reforming labour markets both internationally and locally. Casale (2004) verified the presence of global trends in South African case data when she pointed to the dramatic increase in labour force participation by women. The study documented employment patterns and earnings of women for the period 1995-2001, which coincided with the conceptualisation of the topic of research for this project on income generation policy implementation during the transition from apartheid to democracy. A key finding, elaborated in the South African case below, suggested that males also increased their labour force participation rates at this time. It was found that the pace for males was slower than that of women who more closely reflected the global trend reported in the UNRISD (2005) report. Unlike other contexts, the historical rise in South African women’s overall participation rate during this first democratic policy implementation cycle resulted in different social effects, leading to questions about reasons for the further increase in their unemployment. This was especially true for poor, black African women. Given the country’s new affirmative action labour policies, and to explain the anomaly, Casale (2004) argued that only white women appeared to have been
beneficiaries. Poor, black women – the category consisting of African, Coloured and Indian women – remained concentrated in lowly skilled, poorly paid and insecure sectors of the economy (Seidman-Makgetla, 2004). This called for deeper investigation and explanations.

Three critical social policy concerns still dominate and influence the current international policy research agendas and debates relevant to developed and developing countries including South Africa. These concerns, explored more fully below, are:

- The global observations about gendered labour markets, and the different terms on which men and women continue to participate, as well as the paramount role that women play in unpaid domestic and care work in the so-called care economy.

- The ongoing global trend in labour markets of sexual division of labour by which males and females occupy different occupations in a horizontally segregated or segmented labour market.

- The status of slow changing gender relations. It suggests that women’s increasing workforce participation and low earnings may have repercussions on personal relations at work and in the home.

The first concern involves global observations about gendered labour markets, and the different terms on which men and women continue to participate, as well as the paramount role that women play in unpaid domestic and care work in the so-called care economy. In both developing and Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) or western ‘developed’ countries, the type of unpaid labour that women do, even in transitional/post-communist societies, was seen as stretching beyond crèches, hospitals or caring in private homes/households. Disregarding these activities (as most current economic statistical approaches do) would thus continue to penalise and weaken women’s status in broader society. The global call for socially relevant policies and research to improve work opportunities, target basic infrastructural services to ease women’s domestic and care burdens, and to encourage the fair distribution between male-female share of unpaid work, would thus be paramount (UNRISD, 2005).

The second concern involves the ongoing global trend in labour markets of sexual division of labour; by which males and females occupy different occupations in a horizontally segregated or segmented labour market. In many countries, including South African, such segmentation intersects with race and gender variables (Seidman-Makgetla, 2004). Women and men of the same and different races compete with each other. In South Africa, many black women remain at the bottom of a hierarchical ladder where they populate statistics with lower pay,
poorer working conditions and little advancement or vertical segregation (Seidman-Makgetla, 2004). Changing the global profile of women’s marginalisation required particular policy actions and interventions, most notably by states (UNRISD, 2005).

The third and final concern reiterates the status of slow changing gender relations. It suggests that women’s increasing workforce participation and low earnings may have repercussions on personal relations at work and in the home. Even though women’s earning power may provide personal freedom and address their economic security, or may reduce their dependence on male protection, this may not significantly alter care burdens or result in empowerment. Differential terms and participation rates were thus observed for different regions in the world. There was a rise in women’s participation in OECD countries, a decline in Eastern and Central European countries, lower rates in Middle East and North Africa and even more differentiated trends in other regions. A common thread running through data on all developing countries of Asia, Africa and Latin America was that women’s share of participation in the informal employment sector appeared much higher than the formal sector. This key trend formed the basis for further studies on the world of work for both developing and developed countries. Several earlier reviews of policies pointed to a predominance of welfarist interventions in the implementation of country approaches. This seemed to contradict the economic empowerment and gender equality goals and outcomes intended with the initial designs of policies and programmes of the 1980s (Buvinic, 1986). Many years of research delved into explaining contradictions that constantly reappeared in contemporary policies. Within studies on developing countries, leading perspectives by both male and female economists commented on the failure of policies and projects that combined both social and economic goals. These views dominated analyses in the 1980s and continued to do so in explaining this complex phenomenon in the 1990s (Buvinic, 1986; Elson, 1995; Kabeer, 1994); suggesting several factors that provided impetus for consideration in this thesis. Firstly, some selected policies and project characteristics define typical interventions for women bringing about social rather than production aims. Secondly, the latter characteristics reflect particular expertise in the welfare sector of women-based agencies/institutions that implement projects. Thirdly, the institutional choices of implementing agencies, and the more generalised preference for welfare actions, are determined by lower financial and social costs derived from implementing welfare instead of well founded economic policies for women in developing countries. After many decades of this kind of social and economic policy experimentation, the most disturbing finding, in theorising the causes for failures, was the
lack of progress in global improvements in women’s status, resulting in the normative turn and ethical approaches of more recent feminist policy research agendas.

Normative approaches combined a narrative approach with economic and political philosophical reasoning and argumentations to explain the lack of progress in gender equality, articulating and debating the need for and relevance of ethical/normative values and moral stand-taking principles (Nussbaum & Glover, 1995:2; Sen, 1995). Before this, Buvinic’s (1986) review of economic development policies identified the absence of sound project evaluation criteria, and the lack of policy implementation studies. The critical observation that policy and project implementations lag far behind achievements in theories, research and policy (Buvinic, 1986), was a key stimulus and motivation for my own longitudinal multi-project case design. It attempts to examine the gendered nature and historical social policy context of the transition from a fragmented apartheid policy system to democracy, in which new or transitional state policies were implemented to reform a complex bureaucratic system and battery of laws that lasted for nearly five decades. The exploration of women, gender and social developmental policies implemented during this first phase of democracy through the lens of care ethics was an investigative task performed with full realisation of three key factors. These are that many policies, programmes and projects were at the time still evolving; that social indicators to monitor and assess progress might be absent and in dire need of development; and that constructing contextually relevant gendered impact assessment criteria in the South African policy field of gender and development, although a burgeoning new research terrain for the social work discipline (Carolus, 2010), social policy analyses (Budlender & Lund, 2007; Hassim, 2010; Patel et al., 2008) and socio-political studies (Groenmeyer, 2011), would need ongoing and critical reviews (Razavi, 2007; 2012) in terms of ethical relevance. Whilst most of the newly formulated policies made references to the Reconstruction and Development Plan that took account of previous labour market studies and research, the policy actions and programmes developed according to the new White Paper on Social Welfare released by the National Department of Social Welfare in 1997, placed particular emphasis on the need to address social issues of vulnerable groups such as women, youth, physically challenged, and children; and argued for their integration into job creation, while lacking specific norms and standards for evaluation (Carolus, 2010). For example, it did not question the gender and care assumptions underlying its own work or the developmental social welfare norms embedded in the peculiar nature of evolving partnership relational structures, processes and programmes (Minnaar-Mcdonald, 1995).
The main aim of my study was thus to investigate and learn more about the social policy phenomenon of income-generating projects and the context of implementing income and work creation projects successfully. The link with care, used to popularise the South African model of a macroeconomic policy with the dual purposes of reducing poverty and unemployment by creating work opportunities, and of promoting a new gender sensitive developmental policy planning emphasis around the needs of vulnerable women and children, was a special interest.

1.5 Local South African context: work, women and developmental social welfare during the transition

At the end of 1993, the Interim Constitution for South Africa was finalized and a formal process for developing a regulatory framework for new policy development towards the transition to a new democratic dispensation was initiated.

This interim process was concluded when the first national election took place on 27 April 1994; with the African National Congress (ANC) party being formally voted in as the first democratic government, providing oversight of the finalisation of the South African Constitution and the Bill of Rights adopted in May 1996. At this time, the total South African population was estimated at 40.6 million. By 2001, the figure grew by 10.4 per cent to 44.8 million. By 2011, that figure had increased by 15.5 per cent to 51.77 million (SouthAfrica.Info [online]). According to the National Census, in 2011 Africans made up the 79 per cent of the population, Coloured and White groups 8.9 per cent of the total, Indians 2.5 per cent and other groups 0.5 per cent of the total. By 2011 51.3 per cent, or 26.281 million of the total population of 51.771 million was female; and 48.7 per cent, or 25.188 million was male, marking a clear gender profile.

The Western Cape Province, where all three project cases were located for the purpose of this study, is currently considered one of the fastest growing regions in terms of migration, accounting for 29 per cent of the total for the period 2006–2011. It currently accounts for 11.3 per cent of the total population of South Africa (SouthAfrica.Info [online]).

---

3 I do not necessarily agree with use of these apartheid social categories but these distinctive labels are still evident in Stats South Africa’s census documents to explain and keep up to date with needed policy actions to address historical legacies
After many years of struggle against inequalities, oppression and apartheid, the vision of the united, democratic, and non-racial and non-sexist society was a dream becoming a reality in April 1994 in terms of new policy formulations (Hirschowitz, Orkin, Rogerson, & Smith, 1994: 1). The realization that the political rights on their own would not be enough to secure prosperity; and that what was needed in addition was to develop the capabilities of all South African citizens to use their potential productively, was a sentiment shared by many who have written and reflected on economic and social developments during this important policy writing period (Barchiesi, 2011; Wilson et al., 2001).

Being a relatively young population, the statistics for different policy service sectors were challenging in 1994 when the new democracy was born. Adults aged 25 years and younger, for example, had on average received only 3.9 years of formal schooling (Hirschowitz et al., 1994; United Nations Development Programme, 1997), which implied that the average person that entered the South African labour market was semi- or functionally illiterate and would struggle very hard to find work in the formal sector of a country where the general trend was the shrinking of employment opportunities for a growing work force (Hirschowitz et al., 1994). In parallel was the growing trend of more people, including both men and women, attempting, in desperation, to create income and work opportunities by becoming self-employed.

Profiles conducted of South African women and gender relations for the purpose of the first country study presented in Beijing at the 1995 United Nations Development Programme’s Fourth World Conference on Women (Govender, Budlender, & Madlala, 1994), one year after the first national election in April 1994, were to become a strong rallying basis to influence and fund policies of the first ANC led, democratic government. Budlender’s publication (1996) on the Women’s Budget Initiative (WBI) suggested that women accounted for more than 50 per cent of the 41.5 million estimated population for this period. Their strength in numbers in relation to the total population according to these gendered profiles afforded them the status of representing the average South African citizen (Budlender, 1996). The significance of describing gender relations in South Africa in such terms highlighted the serious inequalities at this time. This had implications for fast tracking and improving resource allocations for women’s legal and socioeconomic status; and for different policy service sectors that were to be developed and implemented. According to South African feminists, women deserved far more serious historical investigation and redress than the
afterthought or special interest group status that was commonly conferred in subsequent coverage of policy development in the form of green and white papers and in research.

A typical example was the *White Paper on Social Welfare* (Department of Welfare, 1997) that was developed at this time. This policy formed the background to this research and investigation as it had a special chapter on women's welfare, whilst most of the detail in the document was not disaggregated in terms of gender statistics (Sevenhuijsen *et al.*, 2003). Considering that large numbers of women needed support and social assistance for survival in the aftermath of apartheid, the lack of gender mainstreaming in policy analyses was indeed a serious shortcoming. South African women, like all women of other countries both developed and developing, were not a homogenous group. Profiling them in terms of difference, as feminist studies of this time period recommended, would reflect their diversity in terms of class, race, gender and ability (Budlender, 1996; Budlender & Lund, 2007; Gouws, 2005; Hassim, 2006).

South African women have been, and continue to be, divided by a complex mix of inequalities and divisions. These rural, urban, race, class, gender, marital status, age, language, culture, disability and sexuality layers and differences represent the divisions within the broader South African society. The most authoritative attempt to capture the specific diversity of women's position within the transitional phase was a study for policy monitoring by the South African Women's Budget Initiative (WBI) (Budlender, 1996). While the idea for this initiative was historically based on the Australian WBI model, the South African project was accredited to the influence of ruling ANC, who held its 1994 policy conference with the theme, *Putting women on the agenda*. Pregs Govender, a Member of Parliament at the time, explained the proposed WBI as a joint partnership venture between gender activists within both the state and civil society. She stated it was “… the first serious South African attempt to examine the gender impact of key aspects of the total national budget.” (Govender, cited in Budlender, 1996: 4)

The first WBI study focused on four major sectors that impact on women’s lives, and possibly assists or undermines their well-being: welfare, education, housing and health. These selected sectors intersected with policy services coordinated by the National Departments of Labour, Trade and Industry and the Ministry of Reconstruction and Development that worked intersectorally, across different policy sectors. The WBI thus targeted the dissection of two cross-cutting themes, namely taxation and public sector employment. However, their
strategy of disaggregating the government’s 1996–1997 developmental budget, from a feminist and gender-based perspective of studying the policy assumptions with key feminist variables to profile the socioeconomic conditions of South African women during this reform period, displayed a general sense of ambiguity about variables such as class, and the continuities of the patriarchal nature of the state. The subsequent role and expectations of emerging developmental state policies during the transition would eventually be revealed through its roles of partner building and budget spending by the state (Budlender, 1996), as it dealt with economic resources and would in the final analysis be concerned with control or access and distribution issues that determine an individual’s power (Nussbaum, 2000; 1995a; 1995b). This somewhat ambiguous assumption is evident in the statement that “… it is largely class that determines the extent of that control ….” (Budlender, 1996: 36). In describing these divisions, Budlender’s (1996) analysis chose not to provide a clear breakdown of class and gender. She argued that class “… is always difficult to define in a simple quantifiable form, and in respect of women, there are added paradoxes ….” (Budlender, 1996: 36). This perceived ambiguity acknowledged the complexities involved in how race and gender, as categories, intersect with class issues and so still remain a major theoretical challenge, not only for South African feminist studies on policy (Budlender, 1996; Lund, 2007; Hassim, 2005a; Sevenhuijsen et al., 2006; Manicom, 2005) and state to society relations, but also for others (Hunter, 2003) who challenged the negative constructions of agency. Vasta (1991), an Australian feminist, validated my observation of this ambiguity by arguing that constructions of class, gender and ethnic subjectivities or identities are not analytically distinct, but are often constructed and defined within one another, in ambiguous ways, or sometimes constructed separately from each other. Gender relations and race relations cannot always be reduced to effects of class relations. Vasta (1991: 161) aptly demonstrated her rationale for this point in her study of gender, class and ethnic relations of Italian migrant women’s domestic work force experiences of a segmented Australian labour market, when she argued the phenomenon of working class racism cannot simply be explained by class issues alone, as functionalist Marxist argumentation does. Race and gender subjectivities can at times be constructed separately from class and at other times their articulation qualifies the very construction of class relations, opening up spaces for change.

It is my view that to be able to make a contribution to advance South African feminist studies in the field of policy implementation studies on this period, it becomes important to analyse “… how gender and race relations enter into the very construction of class relations and how
class relations enter into the very construction of race and gender relations…” in documented work (Vasta, 1991: 161). Moreover, constructions of these relations may present dominant instances which are not always class determined. This raises an important question of how South African feminists in general, and social work feminists interested in the history of democracy and social policy implementation in South African during the transition, should proceed with new social studies and research that involve these relational constructions, in order to advance progress and actions for mobilizing and changing patriarchal relations.

Intersectionality of gender, race and class categories are not simply categories or divisions which intersect and produce specific effects, but are also social identities and subjectivities that are constituted through historical experiences and political struggle, and through complex and contradictory sets of relations that Vasta (1991) reminds us about. She proposes that the relationships between gender, ethnic and class identities and meanings can only be analysed and recorded through various forms of action, through the conflicts, struggles and resistance of subordinate groups (Vasta 1991: 161) that contribute to the construction of identities and subjectivities (Barrett; 1980; Hunter, 2003). For Vasta (1991), this would mean allowing analytical primacy to issues related to patriarchy and class, building greater understanding and challenging global capitalist, neo-liberal policy appropriation of social life that obfuscate any notion of social change and human agency. These would include policy and research practices that analyse identities as well as subjectivities which are constituted at times separately and at times within each other. Social identities of citizens are constituted through historical experiences and political struggle and policy service struggles, through which such identities take on real historical existence; by being produced through complex and contradictory sets of relations, they are in constant need of ongoing analyses. But it is to the role played by existing institutions such as the state, civil society, pressure groups, partnerships, women’s groups and organisations in the shaping of such relations, that Vasta drew my attention. She stated,

_It is one of the facts of human existence that social institutions frequently perform different and conflicting functions: the oppression of women exists alongside and is reproduced by the same institution that acts as shelter against the hardships of class oppression._ (Vasta, 1991: 161)

Bearing in mind the new role of state partnerships that the democratic government carved out for itself, a topic of case studies, and given the issues of class, Budlender’s (1996) statement
seems suggestive about the flexible power that the new democratic state held in terms of controlling the policy direction of the government budget, social spending and distribution of resources. But the latter may have taken for granted and assumed too much from less powerful, marginalized working class groups that interact with the state and new class elites. Alternatively, it may have omitted to clearly articulate a feminist view on roles, responsibilities and obligations in the class nature of the developmental state around the facilitation and building of an active citizenry to dialogue with. It is the production of this kind of substantive evidence on the diverse state and societal structures and relations which this empirical study and thesis seek to advance.

Observations with regards to women’s work activities in the South African case (Govender et al., 1994; Valodia, cited in Budlender, 1996: 53) showed that women, and more especially black women, were particularly disadvantaged in terms of both employment and other income generating activities in the world of work. Apart from being continually discounted in official statistics of the economically active population or paid labour force, women were officially miscalculated, and misrepresented in terms of the unemployed (Budlender, 2002; Seidman-Makgetla, 2004) Govender et al., 1994). Their role was even obfuscated by official notions of the underemployed (UNIFEM, 2002). Black women working in agriculture as both seasonal and full-time workers were not adequately reflected as economically active; whilst unpaid domestic, child care work and other household duties such as food production, fetching wood and water especially within rural areas, and paid care work, were not considered productive or accounted as work of equal value to calculate towards the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) (UNIFEM, 2002). Statistics generated by the October Household Survey (OHS) (1994) on the economically active population for the period under study indicated a marked increase of 23 per cent since 1960 in the employment rate of women. But these figures remained essentially flawed (Valodia, 1996), demonstrating clear gendered patterns. Statistics on differentiated gendered access to paid work indicated a 56 per cent versus 44 per cent male to female split. Statistical observations of unemployment figures were doubly, if not triply gendered. In each of the population groups, unemployment rates were higher for women than for men, with African women, the largest group, having the highest figure of 50 per cent. The total number of women formally employed at this time was 3 754 285. Black women, making up 34 per cent of African women, were concentrated in lowly skilled, poorly paid jobs across a small range of sectors of the mainstream economy. Women, again mainly black African women, were employed in the trade and accommodation
sector (10.9 per cent out of 19 per cent). Of the 13.6 per cent employed in the manufacturing sector that is usually dominated by males, only 6-8 percent was ‘African’ women.

As noted, sectors such as agricultural and fisheries where women dominated were largely underreported and the presence of black women in all categories, where they were indeed active as seasonal and full-time farm and fishery workers at 28.4 per cent participation (Govender et al., 1994), was very poorly reported (Budlender, 1996). In terms of a breakdown by race and by those employed in different service categories, the data suggested an overwhelming presence of black women in the service sector with over 30 per cent of all African women being employed as domestic workers. Although African women workers were reported as dominating what was termed the survivalist or petty commodity sector, most of their activities were viewed as elementary or menial (Valodia, 1996).

The formal economy was perceived as totally skewed in favour of men, with white males dominating the higher income brackets while black women featured predominantly in the lower ranks of survivalist activities in the informal sector of the economy (Rogerson, 2001; Seidman-Makgetla, 2004). In terms of black groups, Africans represented an absolute majority of 80 per cent of the entire informal, survivalist or petty commodity sector of the economy and African women made up 60 per cent of this figure. More recent analyses of this sector during this period revealed that even within this sector, black women once again remained in a narrow range of lowly skilled and poorly paid activities (Valodia, 1996).

As with education, the interplay of race and gender wielded enormous influence in segmenting the South African labour market. The structural disposition of blacks, especially African women, and the critical challenges of the period to create employment, was thus important to capture. For example, images of new work creation activities recorded in the media at the time of conception of the study featured several new initiatives of income generation project activities like sewing, laundry and food garden projects that were started through partnerships between civil society organisations (NGOs and NPOs), and the state or corporate business organizations. Some won awards with criteria that remained a mystery in terms of how well concepts such as social development, sustainable jobs or gender were understood. The stereotypes and traditional sexist divisions of labour that were portrayed suggested particular meanings and notions of job creation, income generation, care practices and social development that continue to raise questions as to whether these developmental activities would materialize into sustainable, decent jobs. How they served gender
empowerment goals or would equip individuals with transferable marketable skills, was unclear.

What remained critical, from a feminist viewpoint, about the time period under investigation was the question about how these discourses were unable to observe, theorize and explain the persistent reproduction of continued gender inequalities that became visible in countless statistical trends about new employment activities, indicating unemployment and under-employment as the country and organisations mobilized to transform. Given the slow pace of change, the gender and social development orientation of social policies clearly needed deeper examination.

This need for a more critical gendered analysis of women, work and welfare issues provided impetus to design a study with a focus on contemporary changes to gender relations. Its aim was to investigate social policy phenomena such as income and work creation projects (IGPs) in order to determine their links with the overall development and care logic that have been used as a macroeconomic policy mechanism with a dual purpose, i.e. to reduce poverty and unemployment by creating work opportunities, and to promote gender sensitive developmental policy planning around the needs of women and children (WPSW, 1997).

1.5.1 The role of gender contracts and developmental state partnerships

Post 1994, South Africa adopted social development as the appropriate term to describe its macro social policy orientation. From this developmental social policy perspective (Patel, 2005; WPSW, 1997), the state assumed a particular partner role in order to facilitate its rights-based, pluralist partnership and centrally planned policy aimed at integrating social and economic development goals (Chapter 1). Although the WPSW (1997) made reference to a special chapter on women and children, poor and unemployed vulnerable persons were collectively targeted in discussion. At this time, in terms of welfare and social development needs, poor black women were not critically perceived as an oppressed group in their own right or from a feminist and gender mainstreaming perspective. Poor black women,\(^4\) formed part of other vulnerable citizens groups such as the youth, the disabled, refugees and asylum seekers. Throughout this period, from 1994 to 2001, the majority of black women remained trapped in very poor socioeconomic circumstances, participating on very different terms in

\(^4\) The reference to ‘black’ means all previously disenfranchised African, Coloured and Indian racial categories that are still referred to as such in current mainstream policy terms.
developmental programmes compared to men and white women in the economy and society (Govender et al., 1994; Taylor, 1997).

A decade later, Casale’s study of the South African labour market (Casale, 2004) in this transition period suggests a so-called feminization of the South African labour force, observing a rise in women’s participation rates. However, when critically interrogated and carefully analysed, this trend appeared essentially skewed as only white women were observed as having been the main beneficiaries. Contrary to the rest of the world, where the rise in female labour force participation resulted in a growing demand for women’s labour, this period in South Africa saw, on the contrary, a rise in unemployment for poor black women and an increase in unpaid labour as the majority of them participated in activities that fall outside the formal and informal labour markets (UNIFEM, 2002).

Four years into democracy, in 1999, the Department of Social Welfare changed its name to the Department of Social Development. As a result, developmental social welfare became the household policy term that redefined state welfare and distinguished policy shifts from fragmented apartheid social services to create integrated social safety net policy services (Kanji, 2001) during the first democratic five-year policy cycle (WPSW, 1997; Sevenhuijsen, et al., 2003; Sewpaul & Holscher, 2004). The adoption of these new policy understandings opened spaces for South African feminists to become engaged in international policy research on country case studies that adopted similar policies (Hassim, 2005a; Razavi, 2007). The aims of the latter were to be informed about the implementation effects of new policies and to understand the developmental state’s new, changing role. Hassim (2005a) presented a case study on the South African gendered welfare system and the emerging role of the democratic developmental state. She tracked the country’s contemporary status and policy practices in terms of the well known typology of welfare state regimes of liberal, social democratic, corporatist and state-socialist, and adding the South African developmental state as an additional fifth regime. While her attempt to initiate a feminist classification of the role of the South African ‘developmental state’ was refreshing, there was still minimal concrete empirical evidence based on citizen’s experiences or women’s voices as policy users engaging in relations, structures and processes with the state to illuminate and clarify this ‘new’ form of state. Without these important connections, the references and studies by feminist and non-feminist researchers to view and declare the South African state as ‘developmental’, remained speculative and contestable. For example Hassim (2005a)
compared the South African developmental state and its developmental social welfare system with Northern hemisphere welfare states, making several assumptions about its operationalisation in relation to gender and the welfare system relevant to this investigation, namely, that the developmental state, like the welfare state, is regulatory in nature. It ascribes meaning to the social category of gender and creates a normative or value-based lens through which needs are interpreted and considered worthy of attention to be addressed in policy services and programmes.

While Northern welfare states redefine the relationship between work and family, developmental states in the South operate in the context of informalisation of labour markets, redrawing boundaries between the responsibilities of state, community, families and individuals. For an in-depth discussion of this topic, see Razavi’s reference to the post-neoliberal social investment state and the ‘care diamond’, explaining the dynamics between the state, market, family and NGO in development policy implementation (Razazi, 2007).

Analyses of developmental states centred on the types of needs that should be prioritised; assessing the extent to which these needs satisfy the range of national and global fiscal and constraints or priorities.

Hassim (2003) joined several other feminists in concluding that less attention is paid to the ways in which the developmental state interprets needs, particularly the gendered nature of needs. She referred to South Africa as probably the developing world’s largest and most generous ‘welfare state’ (Bernstein, cited in Hassim, 2006: 3). The discussion did however not focus or capture evidence on how the state engaged poor women in communication and dialogue about their citizen needs.

South African social policies are underpinned by a strong formal commitment to gender equality and this presents a useful case study of the gendered nature of the emerging developmental status quo (Waylen, 1996c). The case study had the broad aims of understanding the concern about the impact of processes of democratisation on the structure and ideology of welfare institutions in post-apartheid transition; and also in examining how far the policy processes expanded women’s citizenship, especially economic citizenship, and access to rights guaranteed by the constitution. Questions about how democracy shifted boundaries, the emerging nature of state formation and the developmental state regulations, as well as how needs and entitlement have been conceptualised to expand women’s full
citizenship and access to their constitutional rights, became contentious issues in need of further substantiation and appropriate empirical research on implemented policies and programmes.

The fact that women participated in the previous liberation and anti-colonial struggles motivated South African feminist standpoint theorists and gender policy analysts to critically re-examine and reinterpret policy frameworks that claimed strong formal commitments to human rights and gender equality arguments based on justice (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003). Given the influence of the more recent United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and United Nations Research Institute on Social Development (UNRISD) international policy research agendas, South African feminist standpoint research attempted more critical evaluative and descriptive policy studies (Budlender, 2002; Lund & Budlender, 2009; Patel, 2005) to raise awareness about the social and gendered implications of reform policies. The prevailing transitional challenges as well as the country’s Constitution and Bill of Rights in all policy sector documents resulted in a plethora of publications and comparative studies, eliciting a myriad of debates including social, political and gendered analyses on various issues: citizenship, family, democracy, budget spending (Budlender, 1996; Gouws, 2005; Goetz & Hassim, 2003; Hassim, 2005a; Hassim, 2005b; Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; 2006; Waylen, 1996c).

This study was conceptualised at a time when the HIV/AIDS infection rate increased which, alongside the gendered vulnerabilities presented by the pandemic, had led to a rise in the need for caregiving. Greater risks were however faced by poor black women, both young and old (Shefer, 1999), further complicating meeting the growing needs for care across all age groups. This need was beginning to reach crisis proportions and, as many authors observed (Hassim, 2005a; Peacock & Weston, 2008; Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003), the HIV/AIDS pandemic imposed additional care burdens on already vulnerable women i.e. the primary caregivers. The fact that most of their unpaid care duties had to be done in the wake of very poor infrastructural services, and unmet basic human rights such as clean drinking water, energy and sanitation, and housing exacerbated the issue. These developments added to the triple burden of intensive self and family care, work and community care experienced by poor black women; and impacted further developments by pressure groups to respond to this crisis and assist in networking for awareness campaigns for gender justice by forming new NGOs addressing men’s needs to be conscientised (Peacock and Weston, 2008). Comparable
statistics for young black women, in terms of other chronic diseases such as TB; and social issues such as sexual harassment, rape, domestic violence and teenage pregnancies, completed the picture of a young democracy in a justice and caring crisis (Hassim, 2005a). The mortality rate for black women during this transition period stood at 29.4 per cent, more than double that of white women at 11.5 per cent (Hassim, 2005a).

The number of citizens formally employed in the regulated labour market compared to those active in the informal, more unregulated sector was common in most statistical analyses of the South African labour force of this period. Judging by the range of economic and non-economic feminist analysts who assessed the gendered nature of labour force participation for this period (Budlender, 1996; Casale, 2004; Groenmeyer, 2011; Hassim, 2010; Seidman-Makgetla, 2004; Taylor, 1997; Valodia, 1996), both groups of analysts concurred that women earned lower incomes, had higher unemployment and illiteracy rates and owned less assets than their male counterparts in all sectors. Poor black women, however, remained concentrated and trapped in the lowest skilled categories as well as the poorest paid jobs; a finding no different to global trends (UNRISD, 2005). Most authors agreed that African rural women remained the poorest group in 1997, with an estimated 65 per cent in African female-headed households compared to 54 per cent of African rural men in male-headed households (Budlender & Lund, 2007). In 2003, 96 per cent of all domestic workers were poor black women – African, Coloured and Indian women – with an average wage amounting to less than R1000 per month. However, as stated, the poorest category of citizens still remained African rural women because they did not have the same opportunities as their counterparts in urban settings.

With poverty and social conditions as a backdrop, global macroeconomic policies such as the Growth, Employment and Redistribution (GEAR) plan favoured by the World Bank, called for greater attention to social safety nets (Kanji, 2001), job creation and income generation activities. The assumption was that these measures could assist national states with policy mechanisms to address chronic unemployment. The combination of these welfare and work ethic (Tronto, 1996b) mechanisms was found relevant for experimentation with care ethics. These new policies were implemented through programme and service development at national, regional and micro, or local, levels. This was done through partnerships between

---

5 See also Patel, 2009; Seidman-Makgetla, 2004 for more details of the changing composition of SA households, including child-headed households.
state and local community groups for women, youth and the disabled; and with the dual purposes of reducing poverty and unemployment by shifting people off welfare into work programmes, and of promoting state initiated gender sensitive planning for unemployed poor women as mothers in need of work and educare for dependent children.

1.6 The imperative for the current study

With these national policy goals being set, a need emerged for empirical research to monitor and evaluate effectiveness in implementation and in reaching targets. Debates about developmental norms, standards and social indicators were, however, rare and were conducted through further policy developments post-2001 after the first five-year democratic policy cycle (Carolus, 2010; Sewpaul & Holscher, 2004; Department of Welfare, 1999). However, while the development of norms and standards for social indicators in all policy sectors is still a growing area in current policy research and debates, the inclusion of gender as a critical variable or dimension in the design of programme reviews and/or monitoring and evaluative studies remain a neglected concern, not only in practitioner approaches, but especially in academic teaching and research. The substantiation of feminist claims about the role of the state (including the developmental state)\(^6\), as well as the need to re-examine previously identified policy needs, were equal challenges for critical attention in ongoing research. All of these stimulated my interest in the policy area of developmental social welfare that make serious assumptions about work, care and poor women’s available labour time (UNIFEM, 2002; Cook & Razavi, 2012).

Unlike previous policy analysts (Mullagee \textit{et al.}, 2001), my argument in this thesis calls for a more critical, historical approach. The latter is based on four key assumptions:

- Firstly, as a South African in general and a feminist in particular, I assumed that we needed policy lessons to historically understand, contextualise, as well as theoretically link and explain the growing intensification and diversification of care and unpaid work (Sweetman, 1996) that accompany socioeconomic reform policies and notions of citizenship that remain unexplained.

- I further assumed that the market, in particular the formal and informal labour market, supported and sustained by what is currently perceived as the developmental state, failed the unemployed in general and poor black women in particular according to substantive evidence provided by contextual local gendered project case studies of

\(^6\) See Groenmeyer-Edigheji (2006)
policy experiments conducted within the welfare and development service sectors (Mullagee et al., 2001).

- Thirdly, I assumed that the social impact of development policy interventions and activities undertaken and implemented by a range of different developmental agents or actors through partnerships, with specific focus on ‘the role of the state’ as a developmental partner, should be thoroughly investigated in terms of how these constellations affected black women during the initial reform phase post-1994. The outcome of such investigation should deliver a critical evaluative study informing and publicly defending the rights of poor black women to active and full ‘citizenship’. This should be included in dialogues about public policy making in order to gain equal access for women to the mainstream economy and, more importantly, to advocate for men to become part of care practices and the care economy.

- Finally, I assumed that the dominance of ‘care work’ more especially unpaid care work, in which the majority of poor black women are currently involved and tied in, was in need of serious interrogation, justification, revalorisation and reconceptualisation in order to accommodate new general understandings of ‘work’ in social science, social work and social policy.

The Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP) which was the first National Policy Framework of the first democratically elected government in 1994 were charged to, in partnership with others (the private business sector, NGOs), create at least 300,000-400,000 jobs per year to address the massive structural unemployment crisis that the country faced at the time. The latter macro social policy goal and set target created great expectations for close cooperation and dialogue between all policy stakeholders including citizens in all the policy sectors. The broad goal and aim of this study was thus to explore deeper, and to investigate some of the policy responses that were perceived to become strategic in combatting poverty, inequality (including gender inequality) and unemployment. Since the latter policies coincided with different kinds of job creation projects implemented during the transitional phase in terms of the broad goals set by the state in terms of implementing the RDP, a more specific goal and focus of the study was to contribute to the area of scholarship and research into appropriate gender sensitive social and development indicators to begin to evaluate and understand the successes and failures of policy programmes/projects and partnerships designed to meet poor women's specific needs in the face of major economic restructuring that the country faced during this critical policy cycle or period. RDP Policy assumptions about 'basic needs' of the poor in general and poor black women in particular, I believed, have not been adequately challenged with appropriate evidence-based feminist research at this historical stage of implementation.
Further, studies by feminists frequently investigate reasons why poverty reduction strategies involving income and work generation projects for poor women fail to deliver on set economic and social goals to provide jobs, income, education and skills training. Several reviews over a number of decades covering postcolonial times indicated a prevalence of welfare-oriented interventions that apparently contradicted the intended transformative potential of economic empowerment, gender equality goals and anticipated policy outcomes in the design and planning of national policies and programmes. Different theoretical frameworks have, over time, been called upon to account for and explain these shifts, changes and contradictions. Studies of women and work in developing countries in the 1970s and 1980s were mostly led by economists who commented on the perceived failure of policies and projects, and feminists took on the challenge to continue to investigate the cause of these anomalies. Given that the majority of these experiments combined both social and economic goals these policy findings were later viewed with skepticism leading to further probes about recurring failures, and the lack of progress to improve the status of poor women.

After decades of scientific research on gender inequality and a slow pace of change with regard to poor women’s economic status in developing countries, feminists revealed a disturbing finding: the lack of sound, ethical evaluation criteria and frameworks. This influenced a dramatic shift to alternative normative (value-based) approaches in which ethical and moral debates on development policy implementation flourished. Pointing to a general lack of empirical studies addressing policy implementation, arguments by these standpoint feminists proposed that policy and project implementation in different contexts lag far behind achievements in research and policy evidence. This assumption about the lack of integration of policy evidence with appropriate feminist theory, underpins my main motivation in this thesis. My intention is to apply a new feminist lens in order to examine the gendered nature of the historical period in which transitional policies in South Africa were implemented in the aftermath of authoritarian apartheid policies.

The current thesis argues for adoption of the political ethics of care (PEOC) as an inappropriate normative feminist policy research approach providing excellent criteria for exploring the gendered dimensions of new social policies and programmes implemented during the first policy cycle of reform towards democratising South African society (also referred to as the transition 1994-2001).
As the reviewed literature and statistics showed (see previous discussion of SA population figures, as well as later Chapters Two and Three), Black South African women like the rest of women in the developing world (UNRSD, 2005) continue to be over-represented in the 'informal' sector or what became recently termed the ‘second economy’. Their income generating activities in the informal sector are of the most precarious; have the least resources; with little or no technology; and is still offered the lowest remuneration (Casale, 2004) while they continue to perform more than one task simultaneously (Sweetman, 1996; Budlender & Lund, 2007). In many instances this means caring for children while eking out a living trading on the street, or working as seasonal agricultural workers in the fields for subsistence and survival (Sweetman, 1996; Valodia in Budlender, 1996).

And as I will discuss in chapters to follow, while South African black women and poor black men generally continue to experience exclusion from the ‘formal’ world of paid work black women face specific constraints. They remain isolated, seemingly ‘illiterate’, ‘unskilled’ and ‘unorganised’, yet ‘inextricably linked through their ‘non-market’ production, reproduction and consumption, to macro-economic policy changes at national and international levels (Sweetman, 1996).

For the majority of South Africans working conditions and poor pay are often inadequate to secure healthy living. Given the lack of work and poorer salaries earned by women (Casale, 2004) this has a further impact on the quality of life that they are able to provide for families. Unpaid carework which is still largely women’s responsibility in SA, is therefore undoubtedly affected by what I assumed could be further increasing in ‘new’ and disguised forms of work.

Policy trends and debates on the meaning of ‘social development’ and especially new terms such as ‘developmental social welfare’ during the South Africa’s transition and led by the vision and mission of the Department of National Welfare (White Paper for Social Welfare; 1997) are similar to changes experienced by countries elsewhere. However without SA

---

7 see Valodia in Budlender, 1996

8 New Squatter Settlements, Homelessness and the number of women, men and children eking out a living on the streets of big cities and rural towns have become a common scene in the new democratic South Africa. The stereotypical ‘street child’ phenomenon is often stressed in relation to ‘breakdown of family ties’ where notions of ‘family’ is uncritically perceived as ‘single parent or women-headed’ (White Paper on Social Welfare, 1997). Women's new or disguised forms of work (e.g. care work; informal project work, self-employment, illegal sex work, drug activities etc.) are seldom interrogated alongside these.
research and gendered case studies on practical implemented programmes and services, feminist understandings of these notions I assumed will remain at a level of conceptual obscurity. The Preamble statement of the newly democratic national ‘developmental social welfare’ strategy that are currently (after twenty years of democracy) being revisited referred for example to a welfare system that could facilitate the development of ‘human capacity’ and ‘self-reliance’ within a caring and enabling socio-economic environment (White Paper for Social Welfare; 1997:05). The mission statement further referred to the need "to serve and build a self-reliant nation in partnership with all stakeholders through ‘an integrated social welfare system’ which maximises its existing potential, to achieve a system that is ‘equitable, sustainable, accessible, people-centred and developmental’ (White Paper for Social Welfare; 1997:05). These multiple meanings and understandings of the latter terms have been replete in mainstream research and studies that are still published in major journals.

Further to the broad scope of ideas on ‘developmental social welfare’ and ‘partnership’ relation building initiatives and implementation, more concrete national programmatic proposals followed. One of these was a job creation National Pilot "Flagship Programme" aimed at unemployed women with children less than five years. This programme was geared to facilitate and implement 20 Income Generation Projects at community level in all nine regions of the country. Its main focus was to combine economic opportunities and skills training for women to support them with care of their pre-school children. “Educare” and ‘early childhood development’ were apparently to feature alongside the ideas of ‘job creation’ and skills development.

Given this background the imperative to investigate and research the dominant policy idea of Income Generation Projects (IGPs), also known as Micro and Small- scale enterprises (MSEs), within the Welfare and Development sector in contemporary (post-Apartheid) South Africa, was my attempt to close the gap on the lack of feminist gender and micro-enterprise studies (see Budlender; 1995) for this period.

1.6.1 Research questions and methodology

The proposal for a larger historical multi-project case study design was to establish the link between policies that advocate sensitivity to gender, social development and work creation,

---

with welfare and care as variables. By researching this link I had hoped that the notion of "developmental social welfare" as assumed by 'gender and social development' policies and the idea of 'partnership' relation building with state in doing this, would become clear.

The research aims and questions which this project are concerned with are thus both conceptual and theoretical. Conceptually, policy guidelines as to what "developmental social welfare" entailed as I stated above, remained vague for most of the transitional phase. In social work policy studies most of the contemporary debates on this historical period are individual attempts to interpret the National White Paper and other policies with very little 'concrete evidence' and analytical case studies of how successful policy implementation worked. To this end the main aim of the study was to examine, through in-depth study, four Income Generation Projects in three community settings. One of the chosen sites received international donor funding while the rest were financially subsidised by the new democratically elected state and its National Department of Social Welfare in partnership with civil society organizations or 'agencies' within the Non-Government sectors.

*Three main research questions* for the investigation (discussed in Chapters 4 & 5) were framed in an open-ended way. For example to explore how income generation projects as proposed within the national developmental social welfare policy framework were proposing to address poverty and gender inequality. Secondly, to investigate if the political ethic of care framework (PEOC) could serve or provide an appropriate/ normative framework with guiding concepts to study these. And finally, exploring how this frame could serve as an alternative policy research frame to generate more critical gendered user perspectives that could produce socially inclusive public discussions and debates on policy making processes?

Emerging from the different sets of literatures that have been scanned and reviewed, eleven sub-questions and objectives were constructed for further scrutiny in the project cases selected for in-depth study. Chapter Five outlined these subquestions that constitute *three different clusters of sub-questions* aimed at conceptual understanding and social

---


11 Two South African journals e.g. Social Work Practice Journal and Social Work/ Maatskaplike werk accumulated a wealth of evidence in terms of this scholarly tradition. A meta-analysis of the latter is long overdue.
decontruction of the phenomenon of IGPs and partnerships (e.g. what is this policy phenomenon about?; how is it operating - is it different to other small-scale business/entrepreneurial projects?; how does implement skills training? does it reduce poverty? etc); exploring feminist understandings of gender, social development, and ‘empowerment’ (how is empowerment defined? by whom? are poor women included or excluded from mainstream economy?; finally, exploring deeper assumptions about gender and care in social development (how is unpaid care work understood in the policy that was implemented through these projects).

Confronted with these questions my in-depth exploration and study of the diversity of three partnership project community ‘experiments’ with ‘developmental social welfare’ cases during a particular policy implementation cycle and major period of policy reform (1994-2001), attempted to link key ideas that are reflected through policy implementation structures i.e. ‘new partnerships’; exposing the nature and extent of general work creation strategies by all policy actors: state (so-called developmental state), businesses, and development non-governmental organisations and groups that flourished in recent years. The point of my feminist orientation in approaching research on the matter suggests that as South African policy analysts we need first and foremost to historically understand as well as theoretically link and explain the growing intensification of care and unpaid work that accompany such policy strategies and projects (Sweetman, 1996).

The aim of the research was to gather multi-layered information involving different levels of project participation at all different levels of project operations (user/beneficiary level staff/fieldworker/coordinator level and managerial/director and governance levels) over a longer period of time (See Chapter Five Table 5.1 Longitudinal multi-case study process timeline 1996-2012 and Table 5.5 Sample of project cases): documentary (literature reviews, historical project data; interviews, focus groups etc). This were considered necessary for a holistic picture to with understanding different roles, functioning, and responsibilities of participants at different intervals of project planning, development, implementation, monitoring and evaluation) during the period of investigation. Methods of data collection that were employed and described (Chapter Four and Five) are documentary analysis, direct observation, in-depth interviews, focus group discussions and triangulation (comparative project case data)
Data analysis followed a three prong approach: constant comparative method (drawing on inductive methods as discussed by grounded theorists (Glaser and Strauss; 1967)); a more flexible developmental exploration of ‘projects’ and not ‘individuals’ as the unit of analysis building on the inductive beginning to a deductive process of deriving categories, coding data and developing preliminary findings (Chapter Five) or hypotheses and the dissertation writing and rewriting stages. The latter proceeded by searching for common themes in the project data and to craft and develop a ‘story’ or a narrative account / ‘project stories’ by intuitively applying the PEOC. Data collected from documents and interviews in the first pilot phase and later focus groups and interviews were audio taped, transcribed, coded, analysed and triangulated using a combination of the first, second and third approaches. The PEOC served as a coding frame to develop categories to examine patterns/themes that emerged the basis of analysis to develop and compare different ‘project narratives’ to validate and promote the use of the framework for further studies.

1.6.2 Limitations

The longitudinal design and unusual length of study correspond with Ragin’s (1994) suggestion that researchers gathering case data, do so for longer periods of time (namely, months, years or even decades). However, to defend the emerging independent longitudinal and historical multi-case study design and developmental stages of the research process (from pre-proposal, pilot data collection to formal research proposal, standardised data collection, analysis and report/thesis completion), the time, effort and resources that this contextual/social constructivist (Bacchi, 2009) approach took to finally document produce results, ‘contextualising’ partnership implementations and project lessons about gender and social developmental policies in ‘reforming’ previous authoritarian policies, and in initiating ‘new democratic policy development’, makes the design and the approach an expansive and expensive encounter that should best be undertaken as ‘cooperative’ enquiries involving an incremental snapshot team approach to research to yield quicker results. The fact that no research was previously done on any of the project sites prior to my visits to monitor or evaluate progress was significant to the constant changes and vulnerability of project participants whose daily lives and unpaid labour that are affected. Furthermore the fact that three of the four project cases faced closure due to funding challenges so ‘soon’ (2 years) after data was collected (1998 – Case 1; 2007/8 - Case 2) is a cause for general concern about policy practices by both state and civil society initiated ‘partnerships’. Such
experimentations with desparately poor resourced communities and citizens are still carried out. However, it is my view that comparative longitudinal contextual studies of policy experiments conducted within the welfare and development sectors in the South African could provide more substantive evidence about other existing resource driven policy examples. In the SA case the later implementation of the Expanded Public Works Programme (EPWP) which I believe benefitted from the state’s experimentation with Flagships, could very well contribute to further evidence on similar issues dealt with in this dissertation. These policy case examples may point analysts and feminist scholars further in the direction of deeper (more historical) investigations as to why 'the market' (in particular the formal labour market supported and sustained by the state) have been failing poor women, reproducing gendered inequalities and injustices over decades of industrial development (UNRSD, 2005) or why and where corruption happens.

1.6.3 Significance of the study

The value and social impact of doing feminist studies of development policy interventions and activities undertaken and implemented by a range of different 'development agents' lies in the inquiry through the PEOC lens to demonstrate how these actors and processes affected black women agency during an important historical policy reform process. I believe the latter could serve as lessons for other countries that are undergoing similar changes (Cook & Razavi, 2012). Two decades into democracy compared to many more in developed countries, makes South Africa a relatively young democracy. Documenting these initial policy cycles and implementation structures and processes warrants a critical longer term view which justifies the longitudinal approach. The main purpose was an investigation that aimed for a critical study that was also evaluative to be able to inform and publicly defend the rights of poor black women to be listened to as mature rights-bearing citizens, to dialogue with, and to be and feel included in current and future policy making structures and processes. The challenge for women is still to gain basic respect and secure ‘equal access’ to the "mainstream" economy. An ongoing struggle lies in broader education and emancipation of women and men, girls and boys, advocating for men to become part of an expanding ‘care economy’. The dominance of ‘unpaid care work” in which women are currently dominant thus need to be validated and reconceptualised to accommodate new understandings and meanings of ‘work’ or ‘job’ creation.
1.6.4 Definition of Terms

The definition of the following key terms have been identified as important to approach this policy study and deeper investigation:
Social development

The policy usage of the term ‘social development’ is viewed as an extension of the residual-institutional dichotomy in policy literature and within discussions of approaches to social welfare. Midgley (1995) views ‘social development’ as macro societal perspective on broader social processes and structures that is different from social philanthropy, social work and social administration views on ‘social welfare’. Midgley (1995: 25) for example defines ‘social development’ as ‘a process of planned social change designed to promote the well-being of the population as a whole in conjunction with a dynamic process of economic development’. In this sense it serves as an approach that promotes a ‘developmental’ perspective to social welfare.

Developmental social welfare (DSW)

Patel’s (2005: 119) refined Midgley’s definition of ‘social development’ from a post-apartheid, democratic South African perspective. She proposed five definitive features of South African social development that translate into ‘developmental social welfare’ (DSW). These features were accepted as a point of departure for deeper social investigation in this study. The first feature concerns the South African conception of DSW as rights-based promoting social justice and favouring the meeting of basic needs of the most vulnerable and disadvantaged. The second feature emphasises the interrelationship between economic and social development based on Midgley’s theory of the ‘developmental’ social welfare. The third concerns and place emphasis on democracy and participation involving both representative and participatory democracy. The fourth feature stresses social development partnerships based on welfare pluralism in which the state plays a leading role in development together with civil society and the private sector, and the final (fifth) feature points to bridging the micro/macro divide in theory and practice of social development. These five features constitute the nature of the South African policy approach to ‘social development’.

Policy implementation

Policy implementation is the process of moving an idea from concept to reality. It is the fourth phase in a policy cycle that consists of five main stages (issues identification and
agenda setting, policy formulation, policy adoption/planning, implementation and evaluation) and through which adopted policies are put into effect. Effective implementation involves three key elements (www.boundless.com) broadly categorized as organization (e.g. combination of materials, arrangements, activities and administrative arrangements), interpretation, and application. Effective organization entails that policies are implemented by the appropriate agencies (government and/or non-government agents) or structures that are developed for this purpose. Interpretation of policies means that legislative intent is translated into operating rules and guidelines. Application implies that the new policy or programmes are in coordination with ongoing operations. Policy implementation is very complex to achieve and most policies will either take a long time getting off the ground or not be implemented at all.

Transition

The concept ‘transition’ refers to a general political understanding of changes in societies from authoritarian to democratic policy dispensations. After years of authoritarian militaristic rule many regimes which neglected basic needs of their people are entering processes of ‘transition’ to democracy and ‘democratization’ which could create conditions for states to finally start caring for the poor and excluded. (Schuurman, 1993). SA is thus no exception. However, the periodisation of the first five-year policy cycle in post-1994 or Post-Apartheid South Africa (1994 being the first democratic election - transitional phase of 1994-1999) is based on the interim period granted for the National Constitution writing and implementation by the initial Government of National Unity (GNU) Agreement. The interim constitution, apart from all the other mechanisms that needed to be put in place for the transition (Chapter 9 Institutions i.e. Truth and Reconciliation Commission, The Human Rights Commission, The Gender Commission etc) made provisions for elections to be held every five years. 1999 was the year of the first general election after GNU/ANC rule. This was also the year when the first local government elections were held in terms of the New Constitution. Since the final constitution was formally adopted on 8 May 1996, the ‘transitional period will for the purpose of this study be subdivided into two phases: Interim Constitutional Phase; November 1993-May 1996 (Adoption of New Constitution was on 8 May 1996) and the period following this (June 1996 – to current Constitutional Democratic Phase) of relevance to the study.
Income generating project

Income generating project is a special form of multi service project or programme with a skills development/training and credit component that targets only women or men or both genders (Hillhorst & Oppenhoort, 1992).

Partnership

Clause 17 of The White Paper on Social Welfare (Department of Welfare, 1997b) defines partnership by stating welfare policies and programme will be developed and promoted in partnerships with organizations in civil society, the private sector and government. Clause 37 refers to collaboration between different policy sectors stating: ‘mechanisms will be designed to facilitate inter-sectoral policy formulation, planning, monitoring, and evaluation, coordination and the definition of the functions and responsibilities. The development of joint national and provincial strategies were to be embarked upon as a matter of urgency in relation to particular social programmes;

Feminist research

Feminist research are guided by ethical principles that seek to contribute to women’s emancipation and liberation through producing knowledge to be used by women themselves to change their living conditions. The methods of producing this knowledge should not be oppressive or unethical and should try to continually develop the feminist critical perspective that questions both the dominant mainstream (male-dominated) patriarchal intellectual enterprise as well as reflecting on its own development as a scientific paradigm (See discussion in Chapters Four and Five).

Qualitative case study

Qualitative case studies draws on single case design (qualitative approach) explained in Chapter Five. In this thesis gendered case studies refer to case studies conducted with groups of men or groups of women only, ensuring that the ‘group’ situation and the issue of ‘gender’ are critically analysed taking into account the structural nature of gendered relations that can be challenged (for change) through research designs.

Political ethic of care
The political ethic of care (PEOC) assumes care as ‘a complex process that ultimately reflects structures of power, economic order, the separation of public and private life and our notions of autonomy and equality. Since contemporary views are limited by the initial assumptions made about the context of care, they cannot arrive at a political understanding’ (Tronto, 1996b: 142). Such understanding needs to be interpreted in the context of actions as care is practice-based, hence a social practice (Sevenhuijsen, 1998).

1.7 Overview of the thesis

Chapter One has sketched the transitional background to the research. It clarified the context, assumptions and main concerns from a critical gendered analysis, introducing the argument about why the political ethics of care approach is relevant and necessary as a conceptual or empirical research and evaluative framework to be used to appraise the democratic period that shaped the developmental policy implementation context within which this gendered study took place. The discussion presented an argument for a feminist perspective and provided an historical analysis reinterpreting social policy assumptions and discourses on the transitional period that shaped the socio-political and economic context of the first five years of democratic government in South Africa, from 1994–1999. The introduction observes the gendered policy shifts from gender neutral, during the apartheid era, to gender sensitive during democratic reconstruction and development. It also notes the shift to a globalized macroeconomic debt servicing and poverty reduction policy framework that constructed women as passive users or consumers of policy services to be targeted for special attention; a social construction that needed in-depth study.

The following is a brief synopsis of the chapters following this thesis, intended as a reader guide.

Chapter Two explores the relevance of feminist theory and approaches to gender and social development in terms of two major sets of international perspectives arguably neglected in South African policy discussions i.e. post-modernist and post-colonial feminist standpoint theories, to facilitate this study. The discussion and review of these theories set the background against which alternative, normative approaches to social policy emerged in developing countries, including South Africa. By restudying theories about women, gender and difference, I provided a brief overview of scholarly views and trends in arguments, outlining the broad scope of different international perspectives within feminist thinking from
different historical periods, with special reference to ethics of care. This discussion then used the lens of care to invite feminist and mainstream African and South African readers to rethink South African feminist perspectives on gender and social development policy for this period, using this perspective to reopen a healthy and constructive debate about power, gender relations and change.

**Chapter Three** draws further on feminist ethics of care as a lens to provide a theoretical overview and critical review of trends in the literature on the phenomenon of income generation projects and women’s work in the context of social development. The historical nature, current definitions and changing policy context of the phenomenon of IGPs are provided as a basis for reflecting and appreciating the fluid and complex meaning of the term; one which has shifted with time to embrace recent post-modernist notions of entrepreneurship such as women’s small, micro and medium entrepreneurships (WSMMEs) and social entrepreneurship. The policy notion of social development that seeks to integrate human development with growth and development in order to reduce poverty and inequality is critically re-examined to point out how underlying norms and values of care and justice are juxtaposed in relation to self-reliance and autonomy.

**Chapters Four and Five** describe the feminist qualitative research methodology that is adopted through an ethics of care orientation in the multi-case project design. Research procedures over different phases, sampling techniques, data collection and analysis methods are explained. Ethical dilemmas and the constraints of the study are discussed. The value of a gendered qualitative multi-case-oriented contextual longitudinal approach to social development policy implementation in different local settings is presented to demonstrate the application of the ethics of care as an empirical research approach.

**Chapters Six, Seven and Eight** present the findings of the community-based case studies of four organisational, or partnership poverty alleviation projects, using the lens of the political ethic of care framework. These projects are the two gender specific projects in Mfuleni (sewing project for females and brick making project for males); the Beaufort West Developmental Social Welfare Flagship Project of a vegetable garden; and the Crossroads Developmental Social Welfare Flagship project for screenprinting.

**Chapter Nine** concludes the discussion of case findings with a synthesis of the policy implementation dynamics based on the three empirical chapters, reflecting on the ethics of
care framework as a research approach to debate gender, state and societies in transition. It further presents a critical discussion on the policy lessons learnt through the application of the political ethic of care approach, arguing for a more caring, gender-sensitive democracy. It also integrates certain strengths and weaknesses of the care framework, and proposes a way forward by making recommendations for the use of the political ethic of care as a workable, theoretical and analytical framework for monitoring and evaluating future social policies.
Chapter Two: Feminist theories in gender and social development policy

2.1 Introduction

This chapter provides an overview of selected feminist theories and positions that have influenced debates on gender and social development policy in South Africa. These dominant perspectives need to be understood in order to appreciate the feminist political ethics of care perspective that now competes for space within this forum.

Post-modernist and post-colonial feminist theories, including those that draw on the ethics of care, are critical theoretical advances within developmental discourses; but they have not received their rightful place in global feminist perspectives about public policy or within South African policy discourse. The omission, or neglect, of these perspectives is a tradition that is further perpetuated in post-1994, mainstream South African social science and policy studies that claimed to have addressed the issues of poor black women for this period. I will use the political ethics of care (PEOC) perspective, combined with the contribution and insights of these two major gendered perspectives to policy implementation, to substantiate the argument for why an alternative, normative political ethics of care approach is needed, for a more critical, gender lens to study citizens lived experiences, or lived citizenship (Siim, 2008: 155) in post-1994 South Africa.

My discussion will outline the main assumptions of feminist perspectives on post-modernist and post-colonial theories as they relate to and have informed more recent gender and development policy debates. Finally, I devote special attention to more recent normative approaches, within which the broader ethics of care (EOC) approach is located, and conclude with a summary of key issues discussed further in Chapter Three.
2.2 Overview of feminist epistemology

Sandra Harding (1986) distinguished three main strands of feminist theoretical approaches: feminist empiricism, feminist standpoint and feminist post-modernism. These are intimately associated with feminist epistemology, or theories of knowledge, which became a standard reference point when discussing current theories and debates on women, gender and development policy (Braidotti, Charkiewcz, Häusler, & Wieringa, 1994; Truong, 1997; 2000a; Truong, 2000b). Post-colonial feminist perspectives on this topic have more recently branched out of post-modernism.

Findings and conclusions reached by early feminist studies suggested that all women across the globe share the same experiences and concerns, which many post-colonial and post-modern scholars argued have been articulated through the lens of white, heterosexual, middle class women. In this theory-building project, feminist empiricists argued that most scientific discourse is influenced by the perspectives and socio-political experiences of white, Western, men living in patriarchal societies; and that the voices of natural, as well as social scientists, are mostly male and sexist. However, their critiques of mainstream science assumed the existence of a homogenous, universal woman; a position which Mohanty (1991: 51) deconstructed in a well-received seminal book, *Under western eyes*, arguing:

*Any discussion of the intellectual and political construction of third world feminisms must address itself to two simultaneous projects: the internal critique of hegemonic Western feminisms, and the formulation of autonomous, geographically, historically and culturally grounded feminist concerns and strategies. The first project is one of dismantling; the second, one of building and constructing.* (Mohanty, 1991:51)

This leading statement inspired many new research initiatives and led to serious questioning of knowledge and processes of creating new knowledge within feminist debates (Mohanty *et al.*, 1991). In summarising the essence of these debates – amongst second-wave feminist scholars who later attempted to synthesise some of the critiques of science within the context of women, gender and sustainable development – Braidotti *et al.* (1994: 34) referred to three critical questions shaping more recent feminist epistemology. These are, in order:

- Who can be knower?
• What are the processes that determine and legitimate the practice and act of knowing?
• What can be known?

Moreover, what factors affect the establishment of adequate objects of knowledge? The argument was advanced that the epistemological assumptions underlying these questions had deep political implications. The last two decades of feminist scholarship have been devoted to intense critical scrutiny, and to in-depth methodological and theoretical rethinking; which has led to what is now commonly referred to as the metadiscursive or epistemological turn promoting self-reflexive analysis in feminist studies (Braidotti et al., 1994: 35). This critical analysis, self-reflection and rethinking of basic feminist notions by feminists themselves became central to the progression of ongoing theory development. Chapters Four and Five further discuss ongoing feminist research methodology.

The project of theory building, as noted, did not escape debates on women, gender and development policy and the criticisms of knowledge production in this field. A book by Schuurman (1993), entitled Beyond the impasse – new directions in development theory, reflected on the lost decade of the 1980s for developing countries, coining and explaining the term ‘impasse’ in development theory. He suggested that gender studies showed a dialectical relationship to development impasse theory by consistently criticizing the invisibility of women drawing on these Marxist, structuralist meta-theories. By constantly looking for a structuralist approach, feminist theory and especially those drawing on socialist feminism, were alleged to have similarly moved into a crisis that sparked off an endeavour to embrace the study of pluralism and diversity among women (Schuurman, 1993: 21). And although this observation was made by a mainstream male author in the early 1990s, his assessment of new theoretical directions for development theory developing globally over this time, such as in ‘the lost decade of the 1980s’, reinforced similar counter-arguments made by several post-colonial and post-structuralist feminists in their rethinking of the dominant influence of Western feminist theories and scholarship (Braidotti et al., 1994; Marchand & Parpart, 1995; Mohanty et al., 1991; Townsend, 1993). The widespread influence of these latter critiques are well illustrated in the content, form and process of how South African critical feminist debates began to set the tone for later feminist social scientific perspectives on the transitional post-1994 period. Daymond’s editorial collection, South African feminisms writing theory and criticism 1990–94 (1996), one of the first feminist editorial collections, reopened this theoretical debate to interrogate both anti- and post-apartheid feminist theorizing anew. It
appraised some of the new directions and challenges posed by post-colonial, post-modern and post-structuralist perspectives calling on scholars to adequately represent and enrich the discourse on the historical development of South African feminisms (Daymond, 1996). By taking on board the issues of difference and diversity, South African feminist literary scholars led the way to begin an important journey to record and argue for the diversity of experiences and transitional concerns; in which feminist criticisms of the lack of changing gender relations and limited gender equality would become central theoretical points to account for in further social scientific research. Following the lead of international post-colonial and post-modern critiques of western feminisms this angle of South African feminist scholarship drew attention to the invisibility of local voices that was at the same time led by powerful white women academic voices accused of a dominant ‘eurocentric’ view from above. South African feminists were clearly not alone or unique in being scrutinized in this way, as several studies on developing countries researching and writing on the status and position of women in general and, especially women in Islamic countries (Komter, 1991) were subjected to similar critiques with the same rigour. By the late 1980s, the field of study referred to as feminist epistemologies, or theories of knowledge, became clearly distinguishable in terms of the three mentioned streams of feminist empiricism, feminist standpoint and feminist post-modernism (Braidotti et al., 1994; Harding, 1986).

In their search for alternatives to Western scientific male dominant views, where the Enlightened European way implicitly promotes an uncritical universalized view as the only valid way to achieve truth, feminist standpoint, post-modern, post-structural and post-colonial theorists began to challenge the stereotypes in feminist theorizing. They mooted that these views were indifferent to the existence of other cultures, as well as to the science and knowledge produced there, frequently in very emancipatory ways (Braidotti et al., 1994; Harding, 1986; Mohanty, 1991).

By critically engaging the unmediated truth claims of feminist empiricist notions, feminist standpoint theory presented counterarguments proposing: that knowledge is always mediated by the individual’s position and identity according to race, class and gender that intersect, in any particular socio-economic formation, at any given point in time or context. While not rejecting the notion of truth altogether, feminist standpoint theory makes it explicit that certain social positions, or ideologies, such as those held by the oppressors, produce, over time, a distortion in views on realities. This critical, self-reflective reasoning by feminists
resulted in a radical rethink of fundamental feminist empiricist notions. Concepts such as women, sex and gender were rigourously scrutinised. Debating these accepted notions became more central to the advancement of further discussions about new theorizing. See my reference further down to trends in scholarship on women, gender and development; see also my further elaboration on feminist research methodology in chapters Four and Five. By the late 1980s and early 1990s, the field of women and gender studies, with the emphasis on self-reflexive analysis as a key principle of feminist practice (Harding, 1986; Stanley & Wise, 1990), regarded this as the meta-discursive phase (Braidotti et al., 1994). This important trend became distinguishable in the aforementioned three streams of feminist theories of knowledge.

Feminist standpoint theorists believe that, in order to achieve valid knowledge and critical understanding of the world, researchers can and should overcome, or at least counter, ideological biases when representing the ‘other’, such as those occupying social positions of the oppressed and marginalised. Not overcoming ideological biases subscribes to a world view and a privileged position of the pursuit of knowledge in its own right; a stance that may exclude most women due to the oppression suffered by them. The contribution of feminist standpoint theory to the debate about subjugated knowledge production lies in its emphasis on the positionality, or location, of an observer, or researcher; and what political effect this has on what he or she sees, or observes, especially regarding the privileged nature of his or her view from below.

Several feminists (Harding, 1986; Sachs, 1996) have argued that women’s standpoint is a central concept in feminist standpoint theories about knowledge production. Scholarship and research that declares this position assumes that women share a common set of lived social experiences (Kitzinger, 2004; Olesen, 1994). The nature and effects of patriarchal societies are continually exposed; not only through implemented social policies in which subordination and oppression by men continue to predominate but also where responsibility for the sick, disabled and childcare is unequally shared. Furthermore, the continued inequality of work experiences and the lack of access to paid work in the labour market provide them with standpoints and world views different to men. Much of the scholarship by feminists on the subject of women’s standpoints must, however, still be incorporated into mainstream social scientific studies, policy and theory that continues to marginalize them (UNRISD, 2005). Yet, they argued, women are clearly not a homogenous group; and rural poor women and non-
Western colonized groups, including women all over the globe were the most marginalized (Braidotti et al., 1994; Harding, 1986; Nussbaum, 1995a; 1995b; Sachs, 1996).

In terms of work and women, feminist standpoint theorists have consistently critiqued their own body of research as too urban-focused, inattentive to rural and poor working class women’s views and, despite theoretical advances, still lacking in the adequate understanding of the full contexts of women’s daily lives (Afshar, 1996; Sachs, 1996; Waylen, 1996a). Studies on women’s work in sub-Saharan Africa and in many other regions of the world continue their research focus to theorize the important interrelationship between women’s productive and reproductive labour (Sachs, 1996; Sweetman, 1996; Razavi, 2007; 2011; Young, 1993). Many agree that in developing societies, women’s labour time contributes over 80 per cent to food production, in addition to all their other duties to fulfil subsistence needs, such as child care, collecting firewood, cooking and cleaning. Outcomes of this ongoing agenda strengthen continued arguments for integrating and balancing the so-called public versus private split that separate private, i.e. home, domestic, personal, unpaid and paid care or work, dilemmas and issues of women’s lives (Budlender, 2002; Razavi, 2007; Truong, 2000a) from public issues such as political participation, and formal, paid work participation in both the formal and informal labour market. Consistent calls for scholarship and research to pay equal attention to this artificial separation remains ongoing (Hamington & Miller, 2006) and also influenced my own entry into policy research with the aim of influencing this agenda.

To advance the call for more research to integrate the public and private spheres in practical studies and theoretical scholarship, important first steps were considered necessary to correct imbalances in previous research. On the topic of women and work, Sachs (1996) referred to the three important areas of research work, or studies, being undertaken by feminist standpoint theorists as follows:

- **Studies about the degree and intensity of women’s work performed in all spheres and policy sectors (UNRISD, 2005).**

- **Studies about the contribution of women’s time and labour inputs, traditionally invisible in terms of value attached to macro economies. These created an intensive research agenda for investigating a more adequate definition, with attempts to redefine the notion of work and labour to be more inclusive of paid and unpaid work, including care work (Esplen, 2009; UNIFEM, 2002).**
Studies that in the light of changing world economic trends resulted from economic restructuring and globalization documenting new challenges for further research and studies tracked trends in the work patterns of women, especially changes with regards to care work that were continually identified (Razavi, 2007; 2011).

Feminists further pointed out that women as a social group participated far more than normally assumed in farm work and agricultural activities (Maliwichi, 1994; Sachs, 1996); something that is still not clearly visible in statistics. Although documentation of such work activities is an important first step, this was not sufficient to change gender relations and improve their lives (Dzodzi & Dede-Esi, 2009; Thomas-Emeagwali, 1995; UNRISD, 2005).

In general, the feminist standpoint theory position recorded women and work issues by emphasizing three sets of common experiences and claiming that they justified arguments for a worldview different to that of men. These sets of common experiences are:

- Women’s general subordination to men
- Women’s major responsibility for both housework and child care
- Women’s fewer and unequal opportunities in accessing the formal labour market with lack of equal access and equity as well as lower levels of literacy, education and participation.

Claims for feminist epistemological specificity have been further challenged. Standpoint feminists argued that their perspective accounted for the progressive development within feminist scholarship and for moving the debate beyond the impasse; as this was a politically engaged approach originating from the perspective of the social experiences of the subjugated sex or gender (Robinson, 1999).

2.3 Feminist post-modernism

Robinson (1999: 21) argued that the idea of a distinctly universal feminine standpoint, with the aim of arriving at a less partial, less distorted understanding of social relations, became contested. Some feminists responded that claiming the idea of an authentic feminist standpoint still appeared too firmly rooted in distinctly masculine modes of being in the world, promoting yet another universalizing project.
Unlike the two previous theoretical positions of feminist empiricism and feminist standpoint theory, post-modern feminist ideas reject the notion of a truth about reality and rather delve deeper in their critique of mainstream science. Following Harraway (1999), Braidotti et al. (1994) and Harding (1986), by using positionality or situatedness of each observer situated, or positioned, in a particular social, historical and political context, post-modern feminist theory challenges all knowledge perspectives on claims of impartiality and truth. By assuming the different conditions that shape or construct realities, post-modernism, espoused by feminists, questions the idea of a unitary consciousness of the human species. Knowledge is assumed as socially constructed, an invention or imposition of form on the world instead of as a discovery (Braidotti et al., 1994; Harraway, 1999).

Feminist post-modernist perspectives stress plurality and difference, treating universal knowledge claims about existence, nature and the power of reason with suspicion and scepticism. Some post-modern feminist arguments became more critical of others, arguing that the reference to women’s standpoint, although distinct from men, is not necessarily emancipatory (Barritteau, 1995). Others, such as black feminist thought, favoured a more specific outsiders-from-within feminist stance. This, they claimed, could produce a distinctive analysis that acknowledged the intersection of race, class and gender categories. Black feminist thought was explained as adding another dimension and consisted of “… ideas produced by black women that clarify a standpoint of and for black women …” (Hill-Collins, 1991: 37). Key themes constituting the thrust of this strand of feminist standpoint which enriched new research and knowledge production appraise the meaning of self-definition and self-valuation; the interlocking, intersecting nature of race, class and gender oppression; and the importance of Afro-American culture (Brewer, 1994; Fonow & Cook, 1991; Hill Collins, 1991).

Post-modern feminist theory, although acknowledging the social construction of knowledge and believing in its potential to be transformed into a more truthful representation of social life, remained controversial in terms of the questions it raised about women and gender. Additionally, how post-modern feminist theory contributes to the possibilities of changing gender relations and to feminist struggle in the world remains unanswered. The latter theoretical assumption about changing gender relations is closely connected to the socialist feminist and the radical feminist positions, two versions of feminist standpoint theory. In discussions and responses on development, different feminist schools of thought debated
seriously why a woman’s standpoint was not always a feminist standpoint. For more detail on post-modern feminist arguments on this topic, see Barriteau in Marchand and Parpart (1995) and Braidotti et al. (1994).

2.4 Post-modern positionality and situatedness

2.4.1 Post-modern positionality and situatedness

The debate between feminist and womanist standpoints sparked a radical rethink and questioning of what was termed the privileged feminist standpoint. These further theoretical insights developed at an international level (Braidotti et al., 1994; Sachs, 1996). However, Haraway’s contribution to the debate explicitly states that there is no single feminist standpoint as too many dimensions had to be considered to understand women’s position. She argued that women’s knowledge should be seen as embedded, situated and embodied. She also called for a politics and epistemologies of location by positioning and situating knowledge where partiality and not universality is the condition of being heard and listened to in order make rational knowledge claims (Haraway, 1999; Sachs, 1996, pp. 12–13).

In applying this post-modern position to new knowledge creation, these claims would be “…on people’s lives, the view from a body, always a complex, contradictory, structuring and structured body, versus the view from above, from nowhere, from simplicity …” (Haraway, 1999: 181; Sachs, 1996). Haraway’s post-modern stance warned feminists against the views of powerful, dominant groups claiming to see from above, from nowhere or from unlocatable positions (Haraway, 1991:195; Sachs, 1996). She insisted that all knowledge was partial, or embodied, and that feminists did not need to make rational knowledge claims (Haraway, 1991:195; 1999:181; Sachs, 1996). Haraway’s insights thus ignited a debate on recognition and appreciation, stating that there may be good reasons to trust the knowledge claims of the subjugated, but cautioned against the danger of romanticizing and uncritically accepting the views of the less powerful (Haraway, 1991; 1999; Sachs, 1996).

By accepting these cautionary observations, notions of situated knowledge and positionality (Haraway, 1999:181) raised new questions for the study of gender, power relations and marginalized groups of women which others took forward in further studies such as the study on rural women (Sachs, 1996) and by including topics that involved paid and unpaid care
work (Cook & Razavi, 2012). These ideas, I will argue, have relevance in exploring the integration of social, political and economic issues that affect the notion of citizenship and South African poor women targeted by social policies implemented to reduce poverty during the transition to democracy. They may also help to guide my search for answers to questions about the situated knowledge possessed by local women perceived as the subjugated other in the South African, post-1994 policy implementation context.

Following Haraway (1999), marginalized women’s knowledge is situated in their particular localities or communities, in their daily activities or in the cultural settings from which their situated perspectives flow, being their connectedness to the environment, their work in subsistence activities, the relation between their productive and reproductive realms and the patriarchal nature of their families (Sachs, 1996). For post-modern feminists, the experiences of the subjugated provide specific angles of vision. They offer partial perspectives, resulting in perspectives different to the dominant standpoints, including dominant feminist standpoints. This helps to show not only the different but also the multiple ways of knowing (Haraway, 1991; 1999).

My reflection on feminist deliberations and discussions of the shift from a women’s standpoint to a situated knowledge view¹² (are important in order to contextualize, analyse and understand the historical nature, form and issues of South African feminist debates of the post-1994 transition and the democratic period within in which my study falls (Daymond, 1996; Goetz & Hassim, 2003; Gouws, 2005; Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; 2006). The women’s standpoint view (Lewis, 1996), a central concept and basic tenet of South African feminist arguments enriching political debates on general, mainstream policy issues and social change during and after the transition to democracy, cannot escape the feminist post-modern, post-structuralist question as to whether it was emancipatory or not. Moreover, although embracing diversity and difference, it certainly did not adequately integrate post-colonial, political and economic arguments about citizenship (Gouws, 2005; Hassim, 2006; Lewis, 1996).

The idea of partiality and embeddedness is a recurring theme within influences by post-modern and post-structuralist arguments on policy and change. It is one that I hope to explore in the context of the politics of policy reform and policy practices in South Africa. For

¹² For more detailed discussion, see Braidotti et al., 1996; Sachs, 1996.
example in literary critiques of scholarship, Ryan’s observation (Ryan, 1996) regarding post-modernism and feminist writing on South Africa at the time of reform, is noted as an entry point to later debates on citizenship and citizen’s participation in democratic society (Gouws, 2005). In 1996, two years after democracy Ryan (1996: 31) noted that the South African feminist today is placed in a dilemma which situates her in the post-modern enterprise. This observation resonates strongly with some unresolved dilemmas I encountered in later debates on South African gender and development policy and practice. The challenge Ryan (1996) posed for future research and deeper theoretical investigation by South African feminist viewpoints is anchored in her statement about the continuance of conservative forces within and outside the academy; in which labels that exclude the marginalized were still used. This exclusionary practice needed to be exposed. The way Ryan phrased her question, “How then can a feminist retain commitment to the cause of feminism, on the one hand, and to the reality of the political situation in South Africa on the other?” (1996: 31) is of special interest. The question’s implicit assumption suggested that the two issues, feminist cause and polity, are mutually exclusive. The second problem, claimed as equally relevant to her first assumption, is posed as a further question: “When post-modernism denies the possibility of the coherent, individual self, how is it possible, as a feminist post-modernist, to write about the real historical female subject in South Africa?” This question captures two central theoretical dilemmas, both of which this study seeks to highlight, and which are addressed in contemporary feminist discourse relevant to my project. These are the integration of public and private spheres; and the need to integrate women’s political and economic participation into policy implementation research.

Ryan’s problematisation, and her call for the contextualisation of the post-modern idea of the individual self, resonated well with international feminist standpoints as it called for a South African feminist dialogue receptive to the assumed multiplicity and fragmentation amongst feminisms. She further proposed “… a stringent interrogation of different feminist discourses, post-colonialism and cultural materialism …” by inviting South African feminists writing during or about this period not to continue the fight, but to rather learn to live with its contradictions (Ryan, 1996: 33). That Ryan (1996) wrote from a literary perspective and addressed feminists within the academy, further suggests that women use their positions to change the reading and other practices. She cites Parry, stating:
We will have to pay attention to the conditions of production which govern the writing, or lack of it, by black women in South Africa. We will have to acknowledge that South African literature is shaped as much by exclusion and silence as it is by inclusion and voice. We will have to investigate the silence and try to find ways to empower the black subaltern to speak. We must create a space so that the colonized can be written back into history. Then, and only then, can we begin talking. (Parry, cited in Daymond, 1996: 34)

2.4.2 Post-modern intersectionality and difference

The postmodern feminist theoretical ideas that Ryan referred to have been viewed by others, such as Flax in 1990, as a kind of philosophical scepticism referring to the deconstruction of ideas about truth, knowledge, power, self and language characterising Western thinking since the Enlightenment. In acknowledging the multiple forms of oppression and intersectionality within class, race, ethnicity, age, ability and sexual orientation experienced by women, as feminist post-modern views do, the notion of a single feminist standpoint was further complicated. Issues raised by post-modernism become even more complex in scholarly debates on policies and their effectiveness, integrating theory and practice, as was seen in later ethical debates (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; Tronto, 1993; 1996b).

Post-modern feminist theory argues that we speak with multiple voices and subjectivities in which no particular vantage point can be more privileged than another (Barritteau, 1995; Haraway, 1999; Sachs, 1996). With reference to the need for local, subjugated knowledge from multiple sources to guide policy actions, post-modern feminist theory, as espoused by third world feminists, promised to offer valuable lessons for women and for policy theories of development (Barritteau, 1995; Marchand & Parpart, 1995; Mohanty, 1991; Waylen, 1996d). It questioned the modernist assumptions of third world development and argued for different voices of multiple users/actors of policies, such as policy stakeholders, implementers, and beneficiaries, to be heard. These theoretical assumptions appealed to all who were interested in the position of marginalized groups, especially those who research the conditions of gender in third world politics (Waylen, 1996b) in rural women, in agriculture and in the environment (Braidotti et al., 1994; Sachs, 1996). But the wholesale turn to post-modernism and the notion of fractured identities left many others sceptical of joining the largely male dominated post-modern discourse as it appeared to “… pull the rug out from under feminist and socialist struggles ….” (Sachs, 1996: 19) Those who argued for the recognition of differences did this
in order not to privilege powerful white, Western feminist ideas (Mohanty, 1999; Sachs, 1996). Others warned against a total slide into relativism that may preclude political action, central to the feminist theory-building project. On this point, Sachs (1996) argued that the greatest political danger was a post-modern emphasis on difference and diversity embedded in policies, but devoid of understanding, and/or analysing power and oppression, or having political agendas.

To overcome the potential depoliticising possibilities of post-modernism and to address issues of diversity and difference, theoretical work and contributions by black feminist theorists, post-structuralists and third world, or post-colonial feminists appear, in addition to post-modernism, in my view to be more relevant in enriching current South African feminist social work and social policy debates. Calls by Mohanty (1991; 1999) arguing strongly against Western feminists colonizing the voices of third world women, for example, galvanized concerned scholars to produce more research allowing women to speak as active subjects participating in struggles for change. While this undertaking is far more complex, the call for more theoretical work in this direction was echoed by several scholars (Braidotti et al., 1994; Marchand & Parpart, 1995; Sachs, 1996). The appeal for marginalized groups and their representatives to add and amplify their voices and perspectives to the ongoing feminist discourse in a dialogical way can and will enable subjects to speak for themselves, in solidarity with others. These calls are regularly made in research forums and discussions. In doing so, they recognised that differences do not negate connections amongst women and that common strategies exist to act for change (Barritteau, 1995; Sachs, 1996; Truong, 2000a). In a recent article, Barritteau (2006) reiterated previous commentary about the fact that Black feminist theorizing made critical contributions to feminist epistemology that advocate for agency, action and change that are still not adequately reflected in mainstream feminism and critiques. Their contributions continue to be silenced, even in policy studies on developing countries like South Africa, and can be summarised into nine theoretical themes or areas displayed in Table 2.1 below.

### Table 2.1: Black feminist theoretical propositions

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Rejects an undifferentiated notion of sisterhood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Prioritizes and problematises race as a social relation, complicated by the social relations of gender, class, age and ability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Changes feminist methodologies and requires new methodological approaches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Provides a new theoretical foundation, as reinterpreted through 2 and 3 above, shaped by women’s lived experiences and by their multiple subjectivities or oppressions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Provides for the concepts of multiple jeopardizes, multiple consciousness and multiple identities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Simultaneously problematises public and private spheres</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Locates analysis in political economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Deconstructs patriarchal relations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Places race at the centre, thereby altering the basic concepts of home, family and sexuality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### 2.4.3 Post-modern ideas on women’s agency and their power to resist

The third strand of the feminist standpoint and post-modern theories discernible as influential in later developments in scholarship on women and work, and from which we, as South African feminists can learn, relates to women’s ability to act and resist through multiple ways. Through conscious studies, feminist studies identified and appreciate several vantage points held by different groups of women regarding their individual and collective abilities to act. In so doing, they see not only the different forms of oppression, but also that women’s oppression, in any given situation, remains incomplete: women find different ways to resist, even passively, that should be documented, researched and analysed using an alternative lense. Within a context of limited options, feminists cautioned against blanket portrayals of women as passive, helpless victims, as recipients of racial or sexual abuse, or of services especially accounts that omit their potential for creativity, agency or action (Gouws, 2005). For, as Felski (1989) and Sachs (1996) remind us, social structures not only constrain but also enable. They serve thus not simply as barriers to action but as “… preconditions for possibility of meaningful choices to engage in action ….” (Felski, 1989: 220).

The forms of resistance women engage in, such as food riots in developing countries, become reconfigured as more than just organised struggle as they bring researchers into contact with
the daily lives, activities and livelihoods that shape women’s opportunities for resisting oppression. Their acts “… may take many different forms that are often unseen, or invisible, and underappreciated for the snowballing and collective effects on their ordinary lives …. “ (Sachs, 1996: 27). Understanding women’s potential to contribute to change through their own strategies and networks may move one to look beyond the formal public spheres and to search outside the political realm and in alternative spaces (Sachs; 1996: 27; Vasta, 1991). As I hope to show in my empirical evidence, politics normally contrasts with economics or personal issues and may even shield economic and personal issues from political contestation (Fraser, 1991) in such a way that “… women’s private and market concerns become only marginally legitimate as political issues …. “ (Fraser, 1991: 146; Sachs, 1996). The challenge remains for women to contest the boundaries of what is political (Hamington & Miller, 2006; Sevenhuijsen et al., 2006; Tronto, 1993) and/or what is economic; as oppression remains rooted in personal, private conditions of family, marriage, sexuality, motherhood (Sachs, 1996; Truong, 2000a) and care (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003). The challenge for a contemporary review of South African theoretical approaches is to assess whether feminists have succeeded in theorizing these approaches as integrated and not separate spheres; and to propose a way forward with new theory building.

These three themes (positionality and difference, intersectionality, and agency/power to resist) together constitute a framework for feminist standpoint theorists to study women’s experiences of policies from a given situation and specific context, or period, in history. Their contributions to the implementation of policy are explored to identify new trends that could be used to sharpen the lens for a more critical gendered view. The shortcoming of having a narrow range of issues and perspectives reported on, using the feminist standpoint position, will be reviewed by the quality of the responses (see Table 2.1 above), by the call to integrate the public and the private spheres and by political and economic analysis in terms of gender. The view of gender as a fundamental, organising principle of patriarchal society; and the argument that social relations of all kinds are structured by hierarchically determined differences in the social positions of men and women, require further elaboration, analysis and understanding. This will address the shortcoming of limited application to few specific sectors, the overemphasis on the public, political sphere at the expense of economy of care; and also issues associated with the private sphere.
When these theories were applied to South African studies, the commonalities and differences across sectors and among different groups of women, such as urban versus rural and employed versus unemployed, become blurred in favour of shared experiences of oppression among women in general (Casale, 2004; Goetz & Hassim, 2003; Gouws, 2005). The latter views outlined a radical feminist approach to women’s political representation and participation in policies. However, the lack of available empirical evidence of the actual economic citizenship position of women; and also the stark differences between rich and poor women, are cause for concern and remain a theoretical challenge for solid integrated analysis for this period. Current approaches for this period, relying on feminist standpoint positions, focused their research on making the lives of South African women more visible, viewing them not so much as variables but as living beings. While this was a more positive approach; it was done in a way that created an image of women as being more passive than active. This calls for a more rigorous exploration to arrive at an analytical approach to expose the conflicts and contradictions of different interests groups coexisting alongside each other during the transition; a historical analysis that can facilitate the need for more dialogue and for increased, social democracy.

2.4.4 Feminist post-colonialism

As scholarly disciplines, feminist theoretical discourse and post-colonial theory share some important complementary ideas (The Imperial Archive: Key Concepts in Post Colonial Studies [Online]). There are two important ways in which these two fields overlap in the area of policy. Firstly, both are predominantly political and historical and concern themselves with documenting struggles against oppression and injustice. Secondly, both typically

... reject the established hierarchical, patriarchal system, dominated by the hegemonic white male; vehemently challenging the supposed supremacy of masculine power and authority ...

(The Imperial Archive: Key Concepts in Post Colonial Studies [Online])

In order to explain this interconnection further, imperialism is viewed by both disciplines as a global system of oppression that, like patriarchy, assume a phallocentric, supremacist ideology subjugating and dominating its subjects. In a sense the oppressed woman, so assumed by feminism, is equated with the colonized subject. Exponents of post-colonialism react against colonialism and colonial patterns of thought by integrating alternative
structuralist understandings of both the political and economic systems, and thought patterns, which, they argue, are still perpetuated in scientific ideas and scholarship (The Imperial Archive: Key Concepts in Post Colonial Studies [Online]).

Feminists, however, reject colonialism of a sexist nature. In most writings on the ex-colonies, women and indigenous groups were both unfairly treated via stereotypical scholarly documentation and research. Post-colonial studies by both feminists and non-feminists have strongly reacted to this research by both questioning its validity and by being committed to, and engaged in, alternative ways of theorizing. Waylen (1996d: 50) challenged all overtly negative or simplistic views about the impact of colonialism on gender relations in the African context. In discussing gender in the third world, she stressed the complexity of colonial experiences unable to be fully appreciated without an adequate starting point which would examine varying characteristics of pre-colonial societies. Her view on new starting points contrasts with feminist economist Moghadam’s view (2007). She insisted rather on clarifying the gendered world, systems theoretical approach as an appropriate starting point for feminists from which to understand the world as an integrated whole and to critically appraise modern, post-colonial uneven development. For example, the notion of a global economy is clarified as gendered, hence being “… an asymmetrical social relationship of power between women and men, based on perceived sex differences and an ideology regarding their roles, rights, and value as workers, owners, citizens and parents …” (Moghadam, 2007: 136). In this way, the gendered world economic system is:

\[ \text{... [an] increasingly integrated and interdependent system(s) of capital-labour flows across regions, through between states and through transnational corporations and international financial institutions in the form of capital investments, technology transfer, financial exchanges and increased trade, as well as various forms of the deployment of labour, by which global accumulation takes place. The regions across and within which capital accumulation may be understood in terms of geographic units. (Moghadam, 2007: 136)} \]

According to Moghadam (2007) then, to understand uneven development and unequal power relations, feminists need to appraise the process of global capital accumulation flows across geographic units or regions such as, Latin America, sub-Saharan Africa, Southeast And North America; and in terms of income levels (high, middle, and low-income countries), or stages
of industrialisation (developing, industrializing countries- Southern hemisphere and developed or post-industrial countries- the North, or in terms of economic zones of the world system (core, periphery, and semi-periphery) (Moghadam, 2007:136).

By questioning structuralist assumptions about women’s oppression, especially in post-colonial contexts, feminists have rethought Western feminist theorizing. They pointed to the implicit and invisible whiteness of Western feminisms, illuminating the complex and fractured ways in which gender and sexuality are at the core of such theorizing about nationalisms, colonialisms and racisms. This kind of thinking and not only the policies and structures of policymaking continue to exclude or marginalise poor third world women as subjects and citizens, that is central to understand the recurring politics of war and military intervention. Post-colonial feminist theorists like Rai (1996) questioned Western-centred feminist theorizing of the state, arguing that it is important to take into account particular features of the post-colonial states that affect women’s living experiences in third world countries.

By taking post-colonial, post-structuralist feminist theoretical perspectives and positions into account, new questions are posed about contemporary transitional societies. Foundational feminist concepts like women, gender and the male/female duality of femininity and masculinity, received renewed attention assuming new meanings. A common question, constantly reframed, is the extent to which such concepts are universally applicable. A further question that is often raised is whether problematisations or new attempts at theorising these concepts reveal or obscure contextual realities. Post-colonial feminist theorizing invites one to thoroughly and constantly rethink some of the well-known conceptualizations. By decentring the centre (Harding, 1987; Haraway, 1999; Narayan, 1995), they proposed new departure points, to start grasping the self and the world. These new influences resulted in post-colonial feminist thinking that merges different strands of thought in new and unexpected ways. Recent examples are the creative ways in which these perspectives adopted alternative, normative approaches such as the feminist ethic of care arguments to interrogate mainstream, post-colonial theories about alternative, normative development.
2.5 Promoting care ethics as a public social policy value

The Ethics of Care (EOC) is an alternative feminist normative (value-based) approach that is rooted in moral philosophy and social science debates on aspects of moral reasoning. Since the 1980s, female scholars, both feminist and non-feminist, have formed part of two grouping of academics. These groups – the moral philosophers and the social scientists – researched, debated and engaged each other on the issue of morality, making several normative or value based claims later known as the EOC debates.

When, in the early 1980s, feminists entered the discourse on the topic of moral reasoning, their voices did not receive much attention within the dominant philosophical reasoning of Kantian Ethics. But when feminists directed their approach to reinterpret moral philosophy, this resulted in a specialized field of interest called feminist ethics, also referred to as EOC (Clement, 1996; Robinson, 1999). The origins of this branch of moral philosophy, as well as the growing increase in literature on morality and gender, proliferated in the discipline of moral and social psychology.

Feminist standpoint theorists like Carol Gilligan (1995) and Nancy Chodorow (1978) used empirical research to argue that girls and women tend to interpret moral problems differently to boys and men. Others, such as Noddings (1995) and Ruddick (1989), explored the EOC further adding that mothering and child rearing or nurturing, being traditionally female practices, implicitly demonstrate women’s distinctive morality. Hence, the feminist morality of caring regards people as interdependent rather than independent; and this school of thought proposes that the field of ethics addresses the issue of caring and empathy as issues of relationship between people – connectedness – rather than addressing the primarily rational decisions of autonomous disconnected, disembodied moral agents (Clement, 1996; Robinson, 1999). Some theorists started to use the term feminist ethics as synonymous with EOC. Others, influenced by post-modernists, post-structuralists and post-colonialists, disagreed, stating that there was no single feminist moral theory or single feminist standpoint on morality. The general position that was left open to question at this time was if it is agreed that a feminist ethics of care should be open to a plurality of perspectives how should this impasse move forward. This question implied a realisation that there is a need for an epistemology that is both critical and constructive to open spaces for new inclusive ways of knowing and questioning morality, to enhance communication, dialogue and a new
understanding of democratic forms of collective action (Sevenhuijsen, 1998). Fisher and Tronto (1990) and later Tronto (1993; 1996a; 1996b; 2006) shifted this understanding of morality arguing for a new starting point altogether. They presented their political ethic of care approach, which should be distinguished from the EOC, claiming that the EOC was not privatised, phenomenological, nor solely relational (Tronto, 2006). This position was different to those of Noddings (1995), Ruddick (1989) and Gilligan (1995). It claimed that while care can and does occur in families, among mothers and children and in relations among caregivers and care receivers, it should be more broadly understood as a public value (Tronto, 2006; Clement, 1996; Brandsen, 2006), a political concept, an ethic and as a process of human existence. As such, it should include concerns about social institutions, political institutions, culture, values and the self (Tronto, 1996b).

Several feminists from different disciplines have since entered the latter debate by agreeing or disagreeing with the positions above; and by adding different dimensions from the fields of social development (Cook & Razavi, 2012; Razavi, 2007; 2011; Truong, 2000a; 1997), international relations, international development (Robinson, 1999), social work (Featherstone, 2010; Brandsen, 2006), geography and gendered spatial relations (Raghuram, 2009).

By the 1990s, the debate between feminist ethicists broadened to include multiple disciplines and strands. Distinctions were made between different versions of the EOC due to its role in challenging or contributing to women’s oppression. In weaving these strands of thought together and in drawing on these different critiques, Clement (1996) and Robinson (1999) argued it was worthwhile pursuing a new approach to review these debates. They felt that the traditional relationship between care and justice – or the ethic of care (EOC) and the ethic of justice (EOJ) – that had been kept separate, needed to be challenged through more in-depth review and discussion. Following this call for review, moral ethical reasoning continued with renewed energy to seek some integration of the care/justice divide. Several authors claimed that each of these ethics was important, but focused too singularly on human relationships to the exclusion of the other. For example, both are fundamental as they feature two basic dimensions of human relations, the vertical and the horizontal. The EOJ represents questions of equality and inequality and the EOC is associated with attachment and detachment. Both provide sets of questions that can arise in any given context.
Three key feminist theoretical positions emergent in the integration debate on care and justice are reviewed by Clement (1996) and Robinson (1999). These positions seem to replicate earlier dissonance between feminist empiricist, standpoint and post-modern views on topics ranging from morality, to relations of distance, to social development.

In ethical reasoning on morality, the feminine approach, which examined the implications of women’s distinctive morality, attempted to move the EOC from the margins into the centre of moral theory and political debate. This was done in order to advance the discourse; as the prevailing dominant EOJ and rights based arguments about autonomy – or self-reliance – were perceived to be dangerous and illusory. The individualism of standard male-defined approaches to morality was therefore exchanged with a feminist standpoint discourse emphasising values such as interdependence and maintenance of relationships. Feminist standpoint theory challenged the conventional assumptions about relations between relative strangers in male-oriented public spheres as morally paradigmatic. The focus on the private realm, on relations between family and friends, was associated with the more personal and private, female-oriented sphere. Abstract universalism, associated with the EOJ, was compared to contextualism, evident in the EOC. Given that traditional male approaches dismissed women as having a distinctive moral orientation, the feminist standpoint perspectives concluded that it was important to provide the EOC with the credit it deserved and to acknowledge it via valid critiques of the shortcomings of the EOJ.

The critical questions raised in the empirical research by Gilligan and others, to which many other feminists responded in a second debate, questioned whether the EOC was indeed a woman’s ethic; whether the voices that she, Gillian (1987), had heard were not echoes of pre-existing stereotypes that girls and women already accepted, gone unchallenged (Clement, 1996; Clement, 1996: 3). References to mothers and to the nurturance of children as evidence of women’s morality were also challenged with false universal and rational claims, a male norm opposed by feminists. The false universality and essentialist charges connected these counter-feminist critiques with recent post-modern, post-structuralist and post-colonial critiques about the need to represent differences in race, class and culture in argumentation and studies (Narayan, 1995).

Several others (Tronto, 1993; Clement, 1996; Robinson, 1999; Sevenhuijsen, 1998) responded to a much broader question arguing for the adequacy of the EOC as a moral theory irrespective of who used it. As Clement stated:
... this does not mean gender is irrelevant to my study of EOC. Even if many women do not use the EOC, this ethic undeniably captures a widely held view of what women are or ought to be. The EOC is socially coded as a feminine ethic, while the EOJ is socially coded as masculine. (Clement, 1996: 3)

Clement found it unnecessary to make false generalization claims regarding the EOC.

Critiques of standpoint feminists attributed such false universal claims to a lack of historical accounts. They alluded, “No particular women’s experience can uniquely generate groundings for the visions and politics that will emancipate all women from gender hierarchies” (Nicholson, cited in Robinson, 1999: 21).

A second approach to the EOC and EOJ debate refers to the assimilation of EOC to the EOJ perspective; meaning that moral philosophical arguments by feminists taking this approach emphasised the distinction between gender and ethics. Clement (1996) challenged the assimilation of EOC into EOJ explaining the position or perspective in terms of the appeal to ‘moral reasoning’. For example feminist standpoint theory adopting the stance argued that the sexism of earlier historical philosophers about women should be distinguished from the substance of their ideas about morality and moral questions. Hence, by strictly focussing on moral issues, the debates about EOC and EOJ become clearly exposed as

... contemporary versions of familiar moral debates such as the Kant/Hume debate over roles of reason and sentiment in morality.... and even if most moral philosophers have little to say about care issues, their moral theories generally allow for the ethic of care ... (Clement, 1996:4)

Their main concern was, instead of veering off into new theoretical approaches, feminists needed

... to examine the ethics of justice more carefully to see whether and how they can accommodate care concerns. (Clement, 1996:4)

Drawing on Kantian moral theory and the fundamental value of ‘autonomy’ (self-reliance) that embraced some level of communitarianism (Robinson, 1999:73), Clement (1996:4) deconstructed the idea of the EOC and EOJ as complimentary approaches. While the latter have had some appeal in certain circles of debate, the idea that the ‘ethic of justice’ is more
appropriate for public deliberations while care is the proper ethic for interactions with friends and family did not. Following this argument the assumption that ‘the ethic of care need not be rejected but neither is it important development of in moral theory’ (Clement, 1996:4) required further discussions which followed in subsequent studies and theorising. (Robinson, 1999).

Calls for the assimilation of care by justice have been seriously challenged. In advancing the argument that a public application of the EOC is possible, Clement (1996) maintained that assimilating care into justice cannot give it equal status. This can only be done by interpreting care through the justice perspective; something which may devalue and marginalize it. (Clement, 1996). Drawing on Okin (1989:15) who writes :’the best theorising about justice is not good enough if it does not, or cannot readily be adapted to, include women and their points of view as fully as men and their points of view’, (Clement, 1996:5) maintained the purpose of her defense of the ethic of care perspective as a moral value was clearly positioned, to assess the ethic on its own terms ‘rather than from the perspective of another approach’The third approach to the EOC refers to it as a perspective where feminists, although acknowledging that the world could be a better place if everyone used the framework EOC, suggested that the debate was not about intrinsic values but rather about the importance of social context (Clement, 1996). Four arguments were raised in the critique of following this approach.

The first argument maintained that the EOC itself implied the retraditionalisation of stereotypes of women used to rationalize their continued oppression and subordination. The second argument suggested that the EOC is less a creation of women than an unjust demand upon women as it requires of them to continue to take care of men and their needs and interests at the expense of themselves as women, and of their own interests. In this privatised notion and understanding, the EOC compromises the autonomy of women as caregivers and is thus inconsistent with feminist goals. The third argument refers to the restriction of EOC ideas to personal contexts, resulting in its inability to address macro large scale public or social issues like for instance social development or public welfare. The EOC thus provides no political resources to challenge women’s continued oppression. In essence, this viewpoint believed that the EOC still reinforced women’s subordinate status, even while claiming it was inseparable from women’s oppression, and even if its celebration may have made women feel better about assigned roles (Clement, 1996). Given the increasing awareness about social
context, this debate raised an important critical question having further implications on how the care/justice debate on justice and care changed direction to embrace a more relational approach. A question raised by Clement in her own study, before this direction change, was, “Is the EOC helpful or harmful to women?” She claimed that instead of simply accepting or rejecting the EOC, the quality of the different versions of it should be explored. This led her to explore two contested features of EOC; namely autonomy as an individualistic attribute; and the status of the EOC as being a personal ethic. Critics such as Robinson (1999) elaborated on the differences between feminists’ understanding of the relationship between justice and care. She maintained that few would suggest that the EOC could replace or eclipse the moral problems the EOJ sought to focus on. Hence, the idea of justice was not morally expendable in the immediate global social, economic and political international, relational context.

Robinson made three points about how social context and the relational turn in feminist ethical and moral reasoning changed the way EOC theorists approached gender justice at an international level (Razavi, 2007; UNRISD, 2005). These are that:

*It is the particular type of justice thinking that is normally contrasted with care thinking, starting from the belief that the best way to ensure justice is to respect the autonomy and individual rights of persons through the application of generalizable rules and principles.*

*It maintains that individuals as moral legislators should have a degree of emotional independence in the sense of being able to distance themselves from their personal affections and interests when making political decisions.*

*It is the capacity for rationally autonomous moral agency that makes a being and persons matter morally.* (Robinson, 1999: 25)

For Robinson, these points suggested a Kantian view on justice ethics that respected

*... each individual’s equal, basic human rights – the rights that protect the defining capacity of persons – and especially respects the fundamental right of each person to live her life as she sees fit ....* (Robinson, 1999: 25)
For her, it was not the idea of justice; rather it was the idea of individualist, atomistic ontology, where the liberal impartialist view of persons was generalized rather than concrete, with a concomitant reliance on abstract moral principles that should be corrected by the care perspective (Tronto, 1996b).

By arguing for a relational approach, Robinson (1999: 26) joins Tronto (1993; 1996a; 1996b; 2006) and others (Sevenhuijsen, 1998; Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003) in proposing an EOC that could be enriched with notions of self-esteem and respect. An ethics of care approach including these values would be one in which care and justice will no longer be fixed in a dichotomous relationship, but would rather begin a new kind of moral thinking. I agree that this approach could be helpful in the review and study of the South Africa transitional context. Following Tronto (1993; 1996b), Robinson further suggests that this new thinking assumes a strong sense of self, something that coexists with valuing human attachment. The focus on abstract, impersonal, distant relations such as top-down macro policy reasoning, could be replaced with a focus on real, concrete, particular relations such as the human social relations of interdependence. This shows feminists that we can do better if we remind ourselves that thinking about justice and care takes place in response to the existence of injustice in the world; and that this should occupy our attention as a priority item (Robinson, 1999).

By using the language of moral and political theory, we may find differences in the reasoning about care and justice. This does not mean, however, that from a political ethic of care perspective, we can neither deplore injustice nor respond to it (Robinson, 1999). Given the intensity of human suffering and the growing poverty levels in the world today, no serious study of international ethics, including international relations and international social development, can ignore injustices in general, and gender injustices in particular (UNRISD, 2005). For, as Robinson (1999: 27) aptly argues, we must seriously question the need and possibility of delivering theories of justice. We must also seriously study and consider “...how all moral agents can learn to care about the needs of real others, and how healthy social relations, both within and between communities, might be best maintained and promoted.” (Robinson, 1999: 27). In the context of my own research study, which was directed at income generation activities initiated as partnership projects and in relations with NGOs, this statement clearly raises questions about the nature of states and organisations as moral agents both learning to be caregivers – concerned with needs of all citizens, including the
interactions between caregivers and care receivers – and addressing social policy service issues in appropriate relational ways.

2.6 Conclusion

Recent studies – by feminists from different disciplinary perspectives – on a number of related concepts and issues such as gender, social welfare, poverty alleviation, structural adjustment, social development and human development, were during the transition period, largely omitted from mainstream South African policy debates on unemployment, poverty and the reduction of inequalities (Maganya, 1996; May, 2001; Patel, 2005; Wilson et al., 2001). This warrants deeper interrogation. Some publications make passing references to gender; others at best appear gender aware. Policy documents such as the Green and White Papers included definitions of gender in their glossary of terms or else discussed women and gender in relation to policies within the document itself (e.g. White Paper on Social Welfare, Department of Welfare, 1997b). This was, however, done without much qualification of theoretical understandings. Kabeer (1994) refers to this practice as symbolic recognition or pigeonholing gender issues. She writes:

*The strength, resilience and sheer obstinacy of mainstream ways of thinking have meant that accommodation of women’s issues has often been achieved through a process of pigeonholing. General textbooks may include a chapter on women, perhaps even a speaker at a plenary session; development projects may have a checklist to ensure that women’s concerns have been taken into account; government department’s [may] set up a women’s desk. Nevertheless, it is generally symbolic recognition, unsupported by material resources or political commitment.* (Kabeer, 1994: xi–xii)

Internationally, many mainstream development studies scholars acknowledge that a feminist body of scholarship in gender and social policy does exist (Midgley, 1995; Nederveen Pieterse, 2001; Schuurman, 1993). But too few male scholars seriously incorporate these significant scientific insights. Mainstream and male dominated debates and, in some cases, disciplinary journals on South African policy are not exempted from the criticism of Kabeer (1994) and others (UNRISD, 2005) that current methodologies serve the interests of a privileged few, helping to reproduce skewed development practices and global injustices.
(Fort, Danner, & Young, in Young & Dickerson, 1994; Braidotti et al., 1996; Kabeer, 1994) of past decades to continue the path of distorted development (Midgley, 1995). By reversing the hierarchy of knowledge production to advantage poor women (Kabeer, 1994; Samarasinghe, in Young & Dickerson, 1994); and drawing on care ethics, as I along with others (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2006; Tronto, 2006) argue, policy makers are offered a new approach, or public ethic of care, that can help re-align policy goals more fruitfully in order to target and benefit real beneficiaries of policies.

To arrive at a more inclusive approach (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003); and in order to understand and learn about the gendered policies of the early 1990s transition in South Africa, my thesis invites current thinkers on policy implementation to take into account previously excluded feminist voices – those who had documented grass roots experiences of social development globally. Taking on board the alternative feminist standpoint theories of black feminists, post-colonial and other social theorists meant that their relevance and significance to challenge mainstream theoretical assumptions, was recognised. Their knowledge contribution is significant and could help uncover some of the interconnected problems that have, for the transition period under investigation, until now have been obscured by the perpetual compartmentalized into fractured modes of policy analyses (Kabeer, 1994; Tronto, 1993).

Explaining the social effects of macro pro-poor policies – those aimed at reducing poverty and improving women’s status – has been a major task of previous feminist studies, particularly with those projects claiming to assist local poor women with work and income generation at community and project level.

The next chapter discusses the theoretical insights of feminist standpoint theories in shaping the historical policy trends, the shifts that occurred and how these influenced the South African transitional phase.
Chapter Three: Feminist theory, gender and income generation projects

3.1 Introduction

This chapter presents a selective overview and theoretical discussion of the policy phenomenon of Income Generation Projects hereafter referred to as IGPs. I use feminist theory and the lens of a political ethics of care perspective to locate the transformative potential of the phenomenon within significant social policy debates traced over the decades since the 1950s. The social, political and economic effects of implemented gender and developmental policies, as they developed to incorporate IGPs as value-based policy mechanisms, are reviewed with special focus on the UN’s input to improve gender equality and the status of women. Assumptions about gender, gender relations, empowerment, and the nature of work creation (i.e. the relationship between production and reproduction; the relationship between paid and unpaid work and labour time; and issues closely linked to income generation aspects of policy actions), are explored in the discussion.

I present the argument that, in order to enrich and amplify the well-researched consumer voice (Johnson, 1994; Rapp et al., 1994) of disempowered citizens (i.e. marginalized groups of poor women affected by neo-liberal, macro, growth-led policies), an alternative feminist theoretical approach, through the feminist political ethic of care, can add value to existing critiques (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2006), and dialogues between justice and care inspired debates (Hassim, 2010) on developmental social welfare policy implementation as to how it affected lived citizenship (Siim, 2008, p. 155) in South Africa. My discussion – of the political ethic of care as an alternative theoretical lens – starts from the premise that developmental policy actions in the form of projects, programmes or services are visible through authoritative modes of caring. These modes of caring, assigned specific social meanings in the policy language about paid and unpaid work, and sexual difference, needing deeper exploration of concepts, issues, and assumptions about policy structures (e.g. partnerships) and processes constituted in multiple ways. A variety of gendered assumptions – representing the social
practices of care – needed to be investigated, reinterpreted and represented in terms of the design and impact of the transitional policies of 1994 to 2001. The effect of these has been documented in recently commissioned country studies (Budlender & Lund, 2007; Hassim, 2005a; Hassim, 2005b; Patel et al., 2008), under the auspices of international policy institutions such as the UNDP and UNRISD. There is a need for careful, specific historical investigation of the leading values before and during the transition (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; Sevenhuijsen, 1998) as part of building the democratic dispensation, a task that is important to fulfil with review through new lenses.

3.2 Overview of IGPs, gender and social policy

The references – mainstream and feminist – consulted on the topic of IGPs and gender for developing and developed countries, reveal a proliferation of related, but confusing, terminology. More recently, in the 1980s and 1990s, IGPs were broadly linked to social economic safety net policy approaches (i.e. non-contributory transfer programmes to protect the poor, or vulnerable groups, from falling below a certain poverty level) as in the case of World Bank macro poverty reduction policies (Kanji, 2001). In a recent update on the issue of gender and social policies that incorporates IGPs, Cook and Razavi (2012) drew attention to the latest trend in some middle-income countries, including South Africa, experimenting with care-related policies, such as including specific features of conditional cash transfers (CCTs). They proposed different questions about how the outcomes of such policies challenge gender inequalities. While acknowledging that there is a range of policies that can provide social protection, they caution that not all have a transformative empowering agenda, particularly not from a gender perspective or in focusing on the importance of care and women’s unpaid work in the economy.

Some of these implemented policies are perceived as innovative social assistance programmes (Cook & Razavi, 2012: 21); or as enabling social protection interventions (Cook & Razavi, 2012: 22) needing deeper analyses. Most of these new policy initiatives should be assessed in terms of five critical issues relating to how women are positioned within any of these policy programmes. The first issue is how women are viewed: as contributors with claims or benefits; as citizens with entitlements; as consumers; as providers of unpaid reproductive/community labour; or as maternal caregivers, mothers or dependents (Cook & Razavi, 2012). To answer these questions for the South African, post-apartheid, transition
policies, requires sourcing of many historical details about previous post-colonial policy trends. That these are missing from South African feminist studies, explains my own interest in filling this gap.

The issue of gender and IGPs – with emphasis on conditional cash transfers – has been closely associated both with broader economic and social policy efforts to address the global unemployment crises; and with political, economic and social strategies for the creation of work and employment.

In the past, IGPs were allocated to categories of the project/programme services undertaken within different sectors of the national economy and aimed at various groups of individuals: women, men, youth and the disabled. If they are undertaken as part of social policy services, IGPs can be implemented in many ways: with the help of bureaucrats/officials as part of government extension programmes; facilitated/coordinated by field workers as in the case of non-governmental organisation (NGO) ventures (Goetz, 1996); community/group cooperative-based job creation initiatives (Sweetman, 1996); as self-employment initiatives by individuals (Sweetman, 1996); or as sub-contracting ventures by corporate companies to save labour costs (Sachs, 1996). These IGPs may also be referred to as survivalist enterprises (Rogerson, 2001); micro enterprises; small-scale enterprises; medium-scale enterprises; home-based industries; workfare programs in the United States (US); home-based care work; home help services; food-for-work programmes; informal/voluntary (i.e. unpaid) care work; income generation and literacy skills development; strengthening livelihood skills; gambling; illegal drug dealing; and sex work. Endless as the list is, the most difficult task, given the various cultural contexts, is to assess and establish the scope and monetary value of overall contributions to economies and human development (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993; Dignard & Havet, 1995).

In post-1994 South Africa, these IGP permutations coexisted within the formal and informal sectors of the economy. Almost every possible policy document produced during the transitional phase referred to the need for more work creation initiatives to resemble this. The IGP, as a policy phenomenon, was still relatively under-researched at the time. New policy makers, however, seemed to have an almost blind faith in it, which raised critical questions about complex implementation dynamics in the very different historical and cultural circumstances of the transition period. Their expectations included that small, medium and micro-enterprise (SMME) development would do the following: eradicate poverty; produce
social relief (i.e. income, social protection and care to the poor – especially poor black women and children); absorb labour; stimulate and grow the transitional economy. The legacy of a racially polarized, patriarchal society and increasing economic and social inequalities and vulnerabilities, called for deeper investigation. South African reviews – both of past policies and of the ideas that informed key policies at the time – ignored the extensive work by post-colonial theorists of previous decades, especially those from the African continent. Led by expert local and international, World Bank-influenced economists, these new understandings relied too much on economic interpretations without clarifying the underlying value assumptions. The need to harness SMMEs was further emphasized in strategic policy documents (Valodia, 1996; WPA, 1995; WPSW, 1997) as an integral part of an overall macro-economic growth strategy and directed at three important goals:

- To address the structural unemployment crisis;
- To assist poor black women who were over-represented, overcrowding the survivalist end of the lowest paid activities and dismally under-represented in the formal paid sector; and
- To follow the international globalisation trends of building a strong, export-led growth focus.

These hopes were pushed even further with a more recent controversial government policy initiative that attempted to link the latter goals to an alternative Black Economic Empowerment (BEE) ideal anticipating the achievement of long-term sustainable, integrated socio-economic development; and of growth goals/targets that intersected with race and gender (BEE Act 53, 2003) to address equality and redistribution.

To comprehend the complexity of IGPs as a social and economic policy phenomenon, I argue it is necessary to review and place it in the particular context (i.e. transition) and form (i.e. CCT) (Cook & Razavi, 2012) in which it became popular as a new way to address poor black women’s socioeconomic needs. The broad economic and growth-oriented policy assumptions accompanying SMME development were linked to an urban-biased developmental policy strategy aimed at eradicating poverty and at reducing inequality. This dual growth strategy (Rogerson, 2001) needed to be interrogated and investigated from a feminist perspective to provide empirical evidence of its underlying gendered assumptions; and also link this with understandings of IGPs and CCTs. Rogerson (2001: 355), who studied national post-apartheid urban policies to improve the poor’s access to productive income, throws further light on this argument when he observed that the SMME sector of the economy was not a
homogeneous entity. Drawing on earlier feminist analyses (Horn, 1995), he argued that the South Africa economy was, from the outset, segmented as three layers intimately linked to gender, race and class. He agrees with Budlender (1994) in concluding that the first layer consisted of survivalist enterprises, with black women dominating at this lower end of the informal economy; the second layer exemplified the growth-oriented micro-enterprises; and the third, more formal SMME sector, is constituted of established white-owned, male-dominated enterprises (Rogerson, 2001: 355). This segmentation analysis made no further reference to women’s reproductive, unpaid labour and/or the presence or existence of other illegal work (e.g. sex work, gambling etc).

Investigating definitions of and types of IGPs that emerged as policy responses is thus crucial for any further study of work, gender and social development policy. For this purpose, a wider search for understanding beyond South African studies was necessary. To assist with this complex task, three questions were formulated:

- How successful were IGPs (i.e. social safety nets) in creating sustainable jobs for marginalized groups, especially poor women?
- If successful, how, where and why were discrimination and gender stereotypes (i.e. sexism) in the division of labour perpetuated in policies?
- How could these observations help to explain post-apartheid policy initiatives such as the developmental social welfare and gendered social development policies and programmes initiated and implemented during the period under study?

In my review, I identified five broad scholarly trends on work, women, gender and care in developmental policies. These are classified into period of dominance, trends/categories/features, and author in Table 3.1 below. The five broad scholarly trends will be discussed by strengths and weaknesses, substantiating my argument for the necessity of a more historical normative approach: one combining post-colonial feminist theory and the political/feminist ethic of care.
Table 3.1: Review of scholarship on women, gender, care and development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Features</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Post-colonial</td>
<td>Women in development perspectives (WID)</td>
<td>Liberal feminist critique of mainstream economic perspectives; Trend is still dominant in some cultural contexts</td>
<td>Buvinic (1986); Tinker (1990); Lyon (1991); Hillhorst and Oppenoorth (1992); Moser (1993); Maliwichi (1994); Kabeer (1994)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1950’s–1970’s</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975–1985</td>
<td>Women and development perspectives (WAD)</td>
<td>Structuralist perspectives; Radical critiques of the inadequacies of WID and also of earlier GAD approaches</td>
<td>Rathgeber (1990); Rathgeber (1995); Young (1993); Kabeer (1994)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985–1995</td>
<td>Gender and development (GAD); Women, environment and sustainable development (WED); Post-modern perspectives</td>
<td>Redefining gender as a relational concept</td>
<td>Baud and de Bruijne (1993); Carr (1993); Townsend (1993); Dignard and Havet (1995); Braidotti et al. (1994); Marchand and Parpart (1995); Carr, Chen and Jbabvala (1996)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990–2006</td>
<td>Political ethic of care approach</td>
<td>Originally developed in relation to critiques of West-centred social policies and to advance the role of citizenship in welfare states</td>
<td>Fisher and Tronto (1990); Tronto (1993; 1996a; 1996b; 2006); Truong (1996; 2000a; 2000b); Sevenhuijsen (1998); Sevenhuijsen et al. (2003; 2006)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Inherent in the trends displayed above were distinctive approaches holding further assumptions about income generation activities. When studying definitions of IGPs – in relation to official policies that promoted the income generation component of the social safety-net concept – five key observations can be made:

- Firstly, after five official United Nations decades of development post-1975, there was still no agreement on the following: the definition and scope of IGPs; and whether development planning and policy interventions using IGPs to address poverty were having the desired effects, such as in generating sustainable jobs or income, or in reaching women as the target users or beneficiary (participant) groups (Buvinic, 1986; Cook & Razavi, 2012; Creevey, 1996; Dignard & Havet, 1995; Kanji, 2001; Razavi, 2007; UNRISD, 2005).

- Secondly, a parallel notion of micro or small-scale enterprise development strategies gained credence (Baud & De Bruijne, 1993; Creevey, 1996; Dignard & Havet, 1995; Rogerson; 2001) and surpassed the use of the income generation project (IGP) notion in more recent literature.

- Thirdly, just like the previous IGP concept, the notion of micro-enterprises and entrepreneurship also generated multiple understandings and meanings, warranting new empirical investigations (Dignard & Havet, 1995).

- Fourthly, the application of the IGP as an entrepreneurial business notion is now fully integrated within the scope of current research on social policies that strive to improve efficiency and effectiveness of previous policies and current development practices throughout the developing world (UNRISD, 2005).

- Fifthly, the fact that critical, gendered evaluation and monitoring of implemented policy programmes and projects (e.g. examining of successes and failures to learn from mistakes) are still not commonly found in many studies (Buvinic, 1986; Danziger, 2003; Kabeer, 1994; Moser, 1993; Nussbaum, 1995a; 1995b; 2000; Truong, 2000a) suggests a continued gap between policy theories, practices and research (Buvinic, 1986; Oxenham, 2002 et al).

- As late as 1993, the Operations Evaluations Department (OED), World Bank (WB) commented on similar deficiencies of its own database, especially with regards to gendered evaluation and monitoring of IGPs in developing countries. A study (Oxenham, 2002 et al) motivating for including adult education and literacy training as a norm cited the following sentiment:


After 30 years of lending, the Bank still knows little about the impact of its education projects on output measures such as quality, access and internal efficiency, let alone, development. The main problem is at project level. Staff appraisal reports seldom make adequate provision for gathering and using such information, and frequently project goals are not stated in clear, monitorable terms.

(IBRD-OED, 1993 cited in Oxenham et al, 2002: 12)

The ambiguity about the efficacy of IGPs, as expressed in the above quotation, contrasts starkly with findings of studies on similar initiatives in the US during the 1990s. At the same time, safety nets were popularised by the WB in its policy guidance, as it did with South Africa in the early 1990s. Some American feminist authors (Rose, 1995: 172), writing on similar initiatives in the US, noted the negative effects that Clinton’s ‘End welfare as we know it’ slogan and campaign had on national welfare programmes with income earning, education, skills or job training components. By the early 1990s, these workfare programmes became a mandatory part of the American welfare and social assistance landscape. As a result, the Aid to Families with Dependent Children (AFDC) policy encouraged recipients – mostly single mothers with dependent children – to find regular employment in these programmes in order to enable financial sustainability. Debates on this US policy shifted away from studying the merits of different employment creation programmes/schemes experimenting with a variety of content driven by work ethic (i.e. skills training plus wages; and care components) (Rose, 1995: 135). They rather focused on concerns about how to get recipients off welfare and into wage labour and the labour market. This resulted in internationally conservative and negative public sentiments towards aid or welfare. In the US, black Afro-American women (Brewer, 1994) were the main recipients. As commentators on policy reform for this period in the US reported, discussions were not about the reduction of poverty but rather about the following: the reduction of dependency; making work pay; and making low-wage labour a more rational choice for all of the working poor (Rose, 1995: 173; see also Tronto’s 1996 critique of the work ethic).

Welfare-to-work programmes, or workfare programmes as they are commonly referred to in the US, are state subsidised programmes designed as part of a larger public policy effort to encourage recipients of social assistance to find regular employment in the formal labour market; and to become financially self-sufficient. The more successful implemented public work programmes provided job training, education, job placement and day care to assist participants to secure employment. Danziger (2003: 65) explains the term workfare as a range
of alternative job creation efforts experimented with for a period of over two decades before they became mandatory, via legislation, in the form of the Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation (PRWORA) Act of 1996. Unlike previous programmes and laws, this act set a maximum five year lifetime cap on income maintenance for beneficiaries. The implementation of this act led to a major national debate about how well the introduction of such job creation work ethic policies by state addressed the need for services to help the poor remain above the poverty level (Danziger, 2003: 66; Rose, 1995).

This debate on public assistance and income maintenance has dominated policy discussions in the US and has also surfaced in many international discussions – in both developed and developing countries – on contemporary welfare reforms. Globalisation, together with the influence of the US in Brettonwood institutions (such as the World Bank, the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the World Trade Organisation (WTO) have resulted in a powerful influence over ideas contained in the latter policy. It still forms the basis of many policy debates in transitional societies, such as in new European countries from the previous Eastern Block; in changing welfare states; and in other transitional developing countries in Africa, Asia and Latin America. These debates are ongoing as many countries grapple with new policy directions and trends set by international reformers (UNRISD, 2005).

South Africa, a developing country and relatively late entrant to the international policy arena of welfare policy reforms, did not escape the powerful influence of these debates in the late 1990s. Policy concepts, adopted in South Africa as part of democratic reforms, were thus no exception.

As previously noted, debates seeking to address gender and poverty reduction continued throughout the United Nations’ Development Decades to the current post Beijing Plus Ten Period (UNRISD, 2005). Some of the issues characterising the Beijing Platform for Action debates are still vigorously pursued in research and studies, both by feminists – internationally, in Western and Southern countries – and also by policy researchers across the African continent. Reviewing literature on feminist perspectives of development policies and IGPs reveals that in developed (Redclift & Sinclair, 1991; Sainsbury, 1994) and developing countries (Baud & De Bruijne, 1993) alike, ideas and concepts such as gender, women, work and care consistently reappeared as interrelated themes/topics. This was also the case for discussions and studies on contemporary South African social policy (Budlender, 1994; 1996;
2000; 2002; Green, 2012; Hirschowitz, Orkin, Rogerson, & Smith, 1994; Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; WPSW, 1997).

Drawing on the previous periodisations of gender and development policy trends/initiatives globally (Table 3.1), my engagement in the following section will be structured as a theoretical overview sketching the different trends in how feminists covered selected issues in debates on the topic of work, women and development/poverty reduction policies that set income generation as a goal.

### 3.3 Women in development (WID)

WID is a development policy approach/discourse that attracted great international attention from scholars in issues and questions raised in their critiques of mainstream international development policy and debates in the early 1970s. This scholarship sparked a reaction in some feminists. They objected to discourse that tended to divide and stereotype third world women as different/distinct from Western women; and branched off into different streams of thought perceived to obscure commonalities in global gender injustices. WID was perceived as a development policy discourse, constructed by Western feminist standpoints; and refashioned and deconstructed by others from a third world and post-colonial perspective. Historically, the origin of this trend of feminist analysis can be traced to a Washington-based WID group set up within the Society for International Development, whose activities led to an amendment to the US Foreign Assistance Act of 1973 (Elson, 1995). In terms of the latter, the US Agency for International Development (USAID) was called upon to implement its foreign funding to pay special attention to those programmes, projects and activities that intended integration of women into the national economies of foreign countries, thus improving their status (Elson 1995: 292; Tinker, 1990).

By 1974, the first female Assistant Secretary-General of the UN succeeded in getting the General Assembly to pass a resolution that would usher in a new era in feminist policy discourse for decades to come. The resolution held an historic First UN International Women’s Conference in 1975; and formally launched the International Women’s Year in the area of development, both of which were widely reported on in subsequent feminist literature (Braidotti et al., 1994; Elson, 1995; Kabeer, 1994; Moser, 1989; Tinker, 1990). Prior to this historical conference, a first international preparatory seminar, attended by policymakers, researchers and advocates of greater equality for women in development, set the agenda for
later international research and policy discussions for the period. Several key questions, intimately associated with WID studies, emanated to influence WID policy perspectives. These questions were: “Why do development programmes fail to reach women? How does this failure contribute to wastage of human potential that stems from this? Why are women’s contributions to economic and social growth continuously ignored?” (Elson, 1995: 262)

Prior to this, in the 1950s and 1960s, women’s participation in development was primarily perceived in terms of their economic roles in reproduction (e.g. as home makers, bearers and care takers of children) and as house wives, invisible in terms of their actual physical presence and in contributions to production (Braidotti et al., 1994). Boserup’s influential book, *Women’s role in economic development* (1970), was to become a standard reference text for feminist authors interested in the theme of women’s integration into development. Their references to this text drew attention to women’s work in productive sectors of developing economies of the time. One of the key findings was that the introduction of modern, industrial technologies in agriculture and elsewhere benefitted men more than women, leaving women worse off in both role and status in relation to men. This conclusion led to many studies investigating the phenomenon of reproduction of inequality through a new sexual division of tasks (Braidotti et al., 1994). Two additional classic authors later added their voices to the discourse on women’s role in development for this post-1970 period. Tinker’s (1976) *Adverse impact of development on women* and Rogers’s (1980) *Domestication of women: Discrimination in developing societies*, as reviewed by Kabeer (1994: 20), suggested more similarities. Several factors – declining terms of international trade; falling commodity prices; and lower remuneration of men’s labour – led to women taking on the burdens of feeding their families and producing subsistence food for their households, while still using very traditional and basic, outdated cultivation methods on deteriorating land unsuitable for cash crops (Braidotti et al., 1994). Feminists documented growing tensions and dynamics of oppressive relations persisting between men and women. They observed the ongoing tensions within households, often leading to domestic violence, over the ownership of land, over capital, and over farming/cultivating practices and concluded that there were very few benefits accruing to women as a result of economic development. An important theme in the latter argumentation was the need for greater equity in relations between men and women, meaning that an equal share of men and women within rural households was needed (Braidotti et al., 1994). These initial findings were instrumental in establishing the first wave of official WID scholarships and in establishing the advocacy
that became the official voice within international agencies of development (Kabeer, 1994; Young, 1993).

Tinker (1990) distinguished three categories of social actors that facilitated the growth in the WID policy discourse of this time: researchers and scholars who conducted studies of both a practical and theoretical nature on request of formal development institutions (e.g. UN agencies, donors, NGOs and governments); advocates who lobbied powerful policy makers for women’s more equal and successful inclusion; and male and female practitioners working within their different agencies, doing or implementing policy mandates (Kabeer, 1994: 12; Tinker, 1990). Voices of grassroots beneficiaries were notably absent in this dialogue and discourse.

The WID approach emerged as a project and programme approach that attempted to redirect public expenditures to improve women’s effectiveness as producers for the market (Elson, 1995: 263). Some authors (Kabeer, 1994; Moser, 1989; 1993) observed that as implemented policy, the WID approach dovetailed neatly with the international development strategies, for example the World Bank’s Redistribution with Growth strategy and the International Labour Organization (ILO)’s Basic Needs strategy. For example, Moser (1989; 1993) categorised the WID as an anti-poverty approach emphasising poor women in the South as a key target group, while Tinker (1990) linked it with Basic Needs concerns (Elson, 1995: 264; Kabeer, 1994).

As a dominant feminist standpoint, the WID policy discourse of this time has been located within liberal feminist theory that was based on the premise of a rational individual seeking, almost invariably, his or her own self interests, free from social encumbrances such as children, family and community (Young, 1993: 129). Five features of WID policies, closely associated with this liberal tradition are the following:

- They ascribed women’s unequal status and social position to the sexual division of labour (SDOL).
- They lobbied for women’s greater access to a wider range of occupations.
- They lobbied for greater decision-making powers within this wider range of occupations.
- They aimed to integrate women into mainstream economic, political and social life.
- They mobilized for law and institutional reforms as well as attitudinal changes.
Women who lacked qualifications had to be persuaded and aided to obtain these at the highest levels, equal to men. Hence the argument, women can do everything men do, equally well (Young, 1993: 129) became the norm.

WID thus attempted to integrate women into the mainstream development process by taking the existing social and economic structures for granted. In an effort to move the debate beyond the impasse of the WID era, Kabeer (1994: 11–39) offered an extensive review of the liberal and sex-role theoretical underpinnings of the discourse. Drawing on structural and other perspectives, she argued that the WID approach represents the model of the atomized, self-interested individual who remains core in the liberal world view. Liberal values inform many of the mainstream paradigms of social sciences and play a critical role in policy design and practices. Kabeer’s review exposed the influences of liberal neo-classic economic theory, modernization theory and liberal market models of economic growth on the liberal feminist paradigm. WID perspectives were also analysed for the many pitfalls that they shared with the broader, liberal world view. The perspective is shaped by a notion of equality that draws extensively on the liberal, philosophical belief that, despite differences of culture and class, there is a universal and fundamental argument for equality between human beings (Kabeer, 1994: 27). For Kabeer, WID scholarship was clearly grounded in irrational prejudice and sex-role stereotypes at a time when a theory of male power and conflicting gender interests was badly needed (Kabeer, 1994: 38).

The most popularly quoted empirical research on IGPs during the WID phase was on projects that failed their promise of creating jobs and generating income. Buvinic (1986), in a comparative study, was one of many authors who investigated the phenomenon after the first WID decade (1975–85). She is often cited for her attempt to explain why large numbers of public projects designed for poor women in third world countries resulted in welfare rather than production-oriented outcomes. In doing so, she defined IGPs by distinguishing them from welfare projects. From an economic development viewpoint, welfare projects were viewed negatively. These were often designed to deliver information, education and in some cases free hand outs – of money, food or technology – to poor women in their roles as home makers, reproducers and child-rearers. Examples were maternal and child health, hygiene and nutrition projects; home economic projects; and home-based appropriate technology projects (Buvinic, 1986: 653). Given this welfarist notion, IGP designs were portrayed more positively as those projects teaching income-generating skills or upgrading them when
women already have them; as providing resources needed to use the skills in production of marketable goods and services (Buvinic, 1986: 653).

Buvinic’s observations suggested that most projects initiated in developing countries during this period, had clear economic objectives but that these often resulted in welfare actions during implementation. Buvinic wrote post the 1975–1985 period – after the first UN WID decade – and cast welfare as a negative variable in a forceful argument enjoining that project misbehaviours and the predominance of welfare interventions could be explained by three factors. These factors are:

• Firstly, certain project characteristics define the typical intervention for women and bring about social rather than production aims.

• Secondly, the characteristics reflect particular welfare expertise of women-based agencies/institutions that implement these projects.

• Thirdly, the institutional choices of women-based implementing agencies, and the more generalized preference for welfare action, were determined by lower financial and social costs derived from implementing welfare, instead of economic based policies for women.

(Buvinic, 1986: 655)

A further key observation pointed to the absence of sound project evaluation criteria, with remarkably few implementation studies achieved after 10 years of development experience (Buvinic, 1986). Like mainstream studies (Midgley, 1995; Nederveen Pieterse, 2001), Buvinic’s observation – that development policy actions for project implementation lagged far behind achievements in research and policy – is still relevant today. Most policies included results of research; and stressed the importance of the role of women as producers and their integration into economic policy and programmes (Buvinic, 1986; Young, 1993). They, however, explain neither the peculiar nature, nor the continued welfare orientation, of subsequent interventions.

The search for answers to explain the contradictions between economic-based intentions and welfare-oriented implementations of projects continued unabated and was to become a major focus for more studies by feminists in the late 1980s and throughout the 1990s. The results and reviews of these studies are still applicable; similar findings and mistakes seem to be evident in more recent observations of the late 1990s and new millennium (Kanji, 2001; UNRISD, 2005).
Almost a decade after Buvinic (1986), a study by Hilhorst and Oppenoorth (1992) made further observations in about the form and style of IGP trends in policy and developments. They recorded a further dimension, redefining IGPs as special form of multiple service programmes having a financial/credit component targeting only women (Hilhorst & Oppenoorth, 1992: 55). This new emphasis on the financial/credit aspects to be added, suggested progress for women in reaching resources and access to credit. But, like Buvinic, they reiterated that continued use of welfare techniques in implementing IGPs, effectively impeded sustainable economic development (Hilhorst & Oppenoorth, 1992: 55).

In questioning the sustainability of IGPs, these studies recorded three common problems. Firstly, while IGPs attempt to create genuine income or employment opportunities, they rely heavily on subsidies from external donors such as the government or NGOs. Secondly, wages earned by participants are divorced from both the real worth of their labour and the value of their production. Activities such as food-for-work, street cleaning schemes and subsidized crafts production work have, according to Hilhorst and Oppenoorth (1992: 55), little intrinsic value as they argue that women are receiving welfare payments, not wages, in exchange for their labour. They argued it would be more honest and cost effective to provide cash handouts or transfers rather than mislead participants to think they are involved in economically viable occupations (Hilhorst & Oppenoorth, 1992: 55).

Given that so many of such projects collapse and fail, the third common problem refers to the tendency of governmental and NGO agencies to use economic ventures as an entry point to work with particular groups of people. Such programmes serve then to facilitate contact and to gain the trust of women. Income generation becomes a secondary objective, causing tension and dissatisfaction when promised economic improvements are not delivered. These misguided approaches may also cause confusion over programme goals and may also result in participants losing confidence in income generation and entrepreneurship. Even worse is the possible reinforcement of the popular perception that women are poor at business (Hilhorst & Oppenoorth, 1992, pp. 55–56).

In a study of development initiatives around IGPs for women carried out in post-independent Zimbabwe during 1983–84, Lyon (1991) also confirmed the findings of Buvinic (1986). After independence, IGPs became the fashion in post-independence Zimbabwe. They often diverted women from vital, political struggle to gain more access to, and control over, the mainstream economy. Women continued to be restricted to a narrow range of women's
issues; and this prevented them from participating in decision-making at local, district and national level (Lyon, 1991:182). Small-scale IGPs were criticized for not providing the context for debating wider socio-economic and political issues; and in so doing, for making women vulnerable and open to manipulation by unscrupulous politicians (Lyon, 1991: 182). Sex/gender discrimination continued unabated by government institutions, such as at the Grain Marketing Board. Women continued to be sidelined by the issuing of membership cards to men only. Some of the social effects described relate to the fact that structural impoverishment of communal lands severely diminished the potential for surplus production in rural Zimbabwe (Lyon, 1991). Of significance to this discussion and to the African context was the fact that the continued sexual division of labour placed the burden of subsistence food production squarely on women, while alternative wage employment in the modern (industrial) economy, continued to be the prerogative of men. Culture (e.g. men's customary right to women's earnings) and tradition, argued Lyon, have yet to be adequately challenged to address the continued gendered division of labour (Lyon, 1991; see also Nussbaum, 1995a; 1995b; 2000 writing on women, culture and development in the Asian context). Lyon (1991) thus reiterated the necessity for women to define their own needs to achieve self-reliance and autonomy.

Maliwichi (1994), in a later doctoral study on Malawi, reviewed literature on IGPs in relation to rural/agricultural programmes from an adult education perspective. She, too, summarised factors that influenced the successes and failures of women groups in their quest for self-help and in income generation initiatives. Four main success factors playing a role were recorded: self-help and cooperation; the type of income generation activity selected; the use of support services; and the design of the project. However, five common failure factors were also identified, namely lack of access to financial resources and access to funding/credit; lack of group cohesion; lack of institutional support; lack of skills to engage in profitable economic activity; and finally, low literacy levels (Maliwichi, 1994). These factors confirmed many of the previous critiques of IGPs provided by other authors.

IGPs promoted in the name of social development was clearly not without problems. The nature, difficulties and problems experienced in implementing development policy interventions during the post-colonial period continue unabated to the present day Africa (Kanji, 2001; Lyon, 1991; Maliwichi, 1994; UNRISD, 2005). The long-term viability and effectiveness of IGPs to combat the roots of inequality, poverty and women's subordination
stayed as contentious issues that feminists continue to investigate in many debates on policy interventions, both for both developing and developed countries.

These feminist scholars admit that a start, at the micro level, was for women to organize and work together to address their problems; and to raise incomes through IGPs (Buvinic, 1986; Lyon, 1991). But to assume that the benefits of social development automatically accrue towards the poor and women, through participation in social development and income generating schemes, as most development policy makers and organisations do, is problematic, if not a myth. Their findings further suggested that serious study, close monitoring and critical evaluations of development interventions as well as new theories are constantly needed if it is to benefit the poor and especially women (Lyon, 1991; Nussbaum, 2000; Truong, 2000a).

3.4 Women and development (WAD)

The second trend identified, the Women and Development (WAD) perspective, was first articulated by Rathgeber (1995) to distinguish an alternative, different approach to WID (Kabeer, 1994). The WAD approach reacted vehemently to the dominant influence and shortcomings of the liberal feminist WID approach, not only as an analytical tool but also as a programmatic/policy approach. Kabeer (1994: 43), coined the term ‘critical-conflict worldview’ to adequately describe and explain the oppositional stance of the WAD perspective and to distinguish the approach from WID ideas. Rooted in structural and historical materialist Marxist perspectives, the form of analysis that the WAD approach espoused, focused more on the historical inequalities between industrial market economies (IMEs) and less-developed countries (LDCs) within the development process, arguing the capitalist nature of development – or modern industrial development – is itself the major overall determinant of women’s poverty, marginalization and inequality (Young, 1993). By drawing together the influence of materialist neo-Marxism and feminism, this dissenting approach argued for a socialist feminist position, and stressed the need to track the structural basis of exploitation. Following these critiques feminist advocates for alternative development through international platforms like DAWN (Development with Women for a New Era), established and argued for new networks to lobby on behalf of women from the south (Braidotti et al., 1994: 81; Young, 1993). They encouraged others to join forces to challenge West-centred economic development approaches such as WID which had reached
an impasse in theoretical perspectives and analyses of change (Schuurman, 1993: 1) for the period. In order to develop a new, more critical understanding of sex and gender, alternative Marxist categories of analysis were deconstructed by feminists to critique and expose the shortcomings of earlier WID discourses. Topics researched by these scholars included the following: the impact of structural adjustment policies and the debt crisis on women (Sparr, 1994; Thomas-Emeagwali, 1995; Vickers, 1991); critiques of the women’s movement in various countries; the effects of militarism; and the environmental crises that impacted on developing countries and silenced in economic debates. The latter informed the growing radical theoretical and practical stances. This view argued that,

Unless and until there is a more equal international economic system (set in motion through redistribution of global resources from IMEs to the LDCs), there can be no real development and change. (Young, 1993: 134)

Traditional Marxist analysis – of women’s oppression and the sex-blindness of Marxist categories – was reinvented to enrich this body of feminist scholarship; and to develop and extend the neo-Marxian and structuralist notion of social relations (Kabeer, 1994: 65). The idea of the production of objects and commodities (i.e. commodification) was thus reworked to construct a notion and appreciation of gender relations that accommodated a stronger argument that the production and care of the human body and human life (i.e. procreation, child care, care of the sick and elderly), along with the daily reproduction of labour power is part of theorizing the relations of everyday life and its interconnections with the re/production in the changing local and world economy (Kabeer, 1994: 65). The use of gender relations as a category of analysis in this way shifted the focus away from the earlier WID-exclusive approach on women that had tended to imply that problems and solutions were confined to women; towards one that argued for a focus on social relations. In this way, the analysis was extended from women and men, as isolable categories, to broader interconnecting relationships through which women were positioned as a subordinate group in the division of resources and responsibilities, attributes, capabilities, power and privilege. For, as Kabeer (1994: 65) argued, “Treating gender as one aspect of social relations [is not] the only form of inequality in the lives of women and men .... while gender is never absent, it is never present in a pure form.” Gender relations were always interwoven, intersecting with other social inequalities such as class, race and ability. It had “… to be analysed through a holistic framework if concrete conditions of life for different groups of women and men are to be
understood.” (Kabeer, 1994: 65). As a different feminist standpoint, WAD, as discussed by Kabeer, is particularly noted for two main contributions: the new understanding of gender and gender relations; and the further understanding that differences were socially constructed. She writes:

While a concern with the making of gender identities may appear far removed from the concerns of development policymakers and activists, it is in fact a critical starting point as it helps to challenge the notion that women and men are somehow naturally suited to certain tasks and priorities. (Kabeer, 1994: 65)

A second point about WAD and its approach to gender was that it promoted the interpretation of gender relations frameworks as a more pragmatic, transformative, structural approach – a more nuanced view of official policy-making institutions – because it drew attention to rules, relations, and practices through which institutions are constituted (Kabeer, 1994: 67). Moreover, it acknowledged that, while these institutions do involve class and gender privilege, they ...

... do not automatically represent a uniform set of interests; capitalism, racism, patriarchy and under-development may be inter-dependent, but they are not the same. Their contradictory pressures within the agencies create spaces for feminist agendas. (Kabeer, 1994: 65)14

The WAD critique of WID prepared the way for the more vocal and influential Gender and Development (GAD) perspective, also known as the gender technocratic, gender expert or gender specialized approach (Truong, 2000a).

3.5 Gender and development (GAD)

Following the structuralist perspectives of the WAD approach, a more critical post-structuralist notion of gender that questioned the very nature of development emerged. Their

14 For a parallel discourse, see Braidotti et al., 1994 on women, the environment and sustainable development; Kabeer 1994; Rathgeber, 1995; Young, 1993.
radical feminist analyses of gender relations exposed the perpetuation of social and economic inequalities by the structures and relationships that were reproduced between IMEs and LDCs. Studies using these analyses further exposed the following issues: relations between men and women; issues of gender (i.e. male-bias) in planning and policy development; and issues of violence that impacted on implementation; that had further marginalized women (Elson, 1995; Young, 1993). Their criticisms laid the basis for later theorizing on both gender and inequalities; and power relations exposed in earlier work on development policy implementation (Goetz, 1996; Kabeer, 1994; Moser; 1993). Further feminist critiques categorized different policy approaches during the WID era in terms of three approaches: welfare, anti-poverty and equity (Elson, 1995; Moser, 1991) and added two more, efficiency and empowerment, giving a total of five approaches (Kabeer, 1994; Moser, 1993). Each of these was not applied in any chronological order; neither were they perceived as mutually exclusive but rather as policy responses that reflected distinct sets of imperatives in different cultural and country contexts.

This third broad trend of scholarship, following on from the WID and WAD critical stance of the 1980s and early 1990s, played a particular influential role in shaping new South African gender and development policies. Given that South African women parliamentarians and feminist NGOs were well represented at the UN led international gatherings in Copenhagen (Global Social Development Summit) and Beijing (Fourth Women and Development Summit) in 1995, one year after the Country’s liberation in 1994, allowed for interaction and dialogue clearly influencing and being influenced with new policy ideas (see Govender, Budlender and Madlala 1994). The GAD body of scholarship referred to earlier (Braidotti et al., 1994; Kabeer, 1994; Young, 1993), elaborated on the more critical tradition of WAD. The GAD approach, further popularized at these fora, attempts to both reconceptualise gender and gender relations and to mainstream gender in all policy sectors of society. This resulted in what Alvarez called a gender industry of toolkits and mainstreaming technologies (Alvarez, 1999). Building on the structural analysis developed by earlier scholars – the subject of discussion above – GAD theorists took some elements of the structuralist WAD discourse further to join feminists contesting the continuing WID, neo-liberal approach for its wavering tendency to reproduce unequal gender relations. By combining feminist analysis of patriarchy with Marxist material analysis of social change (Young, 1993), some scholars (Mohanty, 1991; Shiva, cited in Braidotti et al., 1994:111) continued the debate for alternative development. They produced new development technologies and analyses to
critically engage with policies, both at planning and implementation level in developing and developed countries (Verloo & Roggeband, 1996). The interrogation of the concepts such as sex and gender; gender relations; gender analysis; and gender mainstreaming continued in gender and development studies (Braidotti et al., 1994; Kabeer, 1994; Marchand & Parpart, 1995; March, Smyth, & Mukhopadhyay, 1999).

GAD was later critiqued for its ongoing neo-liberal stance. While it aimed at the full equality of women, it did so within a framework of economic development and gender expertise supporting World Bank and UN Food Agriculture Organizational policies (FAO). Many others started or continued to train development experts in gender literacy and gender relations frameworks; and in tools for gender mainstreaming that would account for women’s concerns on all societal levels and fields of organisation. Backed by international donors, many stakeholders (e.g. development organisations, government and NGO field staff) received compulsory training in gender analysis, gender planning approaches (Braidotti et al., 1994: 82; March et al., 1999); and in gender auditing via the ILO training course.

There has been no shortage of gender analysis frameworks (GAFs) (Verloo & Roggeband, 1996) or of gender classification frameworks (GCFs), especially not with regards to the policy field of study (Kabeer, 1994; March et al., 1999; Moser, 1989; 1993; Truong, 2000a; Verloo & Roggeband, 1996). March et al. (1999: 26) concurred that GAFs were designed for different purposes and that these ranged from carrying out initial research, planning, monitoring and intervention to evaluating what development policies achieved. Four categories of GAF frameworks were identified and classified in the work of March, Smyth, & Mukhopadhyay, (1999). These are listed in Table 3.2 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Context analysis</th>
<th>Gives one a way of thinking about the context that shapes the relationship and dynamics of any situation or group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Visualisation and planning</td>
<td>Provide tools with a way of representing key points in a simple manner to aid decision-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communications</td>
<td>Provide tools to help share information, train people or sensitise them to gender issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring and evaluation</td>
<td>Provide tools that can highlight the strengths and weaknesses of a particular development intervention</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Source: March, Smyth and Mukhopadhyay, 1999: 26–27]
Since some GAFs were designed for use in particular contexts (e.g. relief service provision in emergency, refugee or conflict situations), assessing the suitability of frameworks was stressed as a key consideration. March et al. (1999: 26–27) further suggested three important questions supporting their arguments about choice and about assessing the appropriateness of GAF in relation to work environments:

- Does the framework relate to actions or interventions by practitioners?
- What will people’s (i.e. individuals and organisations of different cultures) reactions be to the use of the chosen gender framework?
- What would be potential limitations of the chosen framework and how would practitioners take these into account and compensate for these in analyses?

Recent research into the emergent gender technocracy suggests a growing concern about the decline in activism normally accompanying that kind of development work, with fewer contestatory activities taking place. In Latin America, a region where an increasing trend of feminist NGO-isation was observed, feminist writers (Alvarez, 1999) raised awareness of a growing chasm between autonomous feminist activists and gender professionals. The latter, being gender expert-led institutionalised mainstreaming approaches, endorsed by both local state gender machineries and international donors, became a concern to feminist movements. In the context of the shifting terrain of local and global gender politics, Alvarez further observed a trend in organizational building in Latin America that was different to the 1990s. There was a boom in more formal, institutionalised feminist organisations specialising in gender project execution, policy assessments and social service delivery. Projects shifted away from feminist activities such as popular education, social mobilization and the empowerment of poor and working class women. The norm changed rather to policy-focused service activities such as issue-based specialisations; and the concentration of resources among the more technically minded, trans-nationalised and professionalised NGOs within the feminist field, leading to a phenomenon she termed ‘NGO-ization’ (Alvarez, 1999). Many argued that this organisational trend in social development and social policy practices, although based on the Latin American region, might be noticeable globally in Africa and Asia albeit in piecemeal form.

Empirical research and GAD studies on IGPs began to focus more on gender relations; but in a way not critical of the notion of gender. Baud & de Bruijne’s (1993) study is one of a few attempting to link a gender perspective to small-scale industries in developing countries; with
a special focus on women’s employment outside of large-scale factory production in the 1990s. They posed specific economic questions using a gender lens to gather more information about higher employment and the wider distribution of production in the development process. Three key issues were raised: the role of small-scale industrial units in the development process; the changing gendered division of labour in such industries; and the ways in which women combined employment with their reproductive tasks and community roles (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993: 3). The policy lessons learned from development programmes directed at women in such industries in the informal sector was a major goal of the study (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993: 3). Research shifted during the 1990s from defining IGPs to refining gender terminology and assumptions about small-scale and micro-industries as it was these industries that allowed for women’s paid employment (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993: 5; Tezsler, in Baud & de Bruijne, 1993). By refocusing the concepts of gender and women’s employment in broader terms interrelated with women’s reproductive activities, the study confronted further conceptual questions of how to distinguish between small-scale enterprises and micro-industries. Apart from entrepreneurial activities relating to the economic scale of operations (e.g. number of workers employed), the first aspect clarified by the authors was to begin to identify and distinguish the type of labour employed. Four types of labour categories predominated in small-scale and micro-industries that included women. These were: short-term wage work; casual wage work; disguised wage work; and unpaid family work. A second aspect considered the incidence of unpaid work in these industries. A last aspect related to the technology inputs used (i.e. traditional or modern). The study shed particular light on three categories of micro-enterprises where women were actively involved: individual or self-employed; group self-employed; and home-based enterprises (Tezsler, in Baud & de Bruijne, 1993: 5). Small-scale enterprises were further classified into those economic activities using traditional, hand driven, switching over to modern technologies; and those starting out with modern technology.

By investigating the role of small-scale production units in the development policy process, these authors proposed that, in general, the large-scale industrial development of the 1950s–1990s did not lead to an integrated industrial structure, capable of providing employment for a major share of a country’s domestic population, except under specific circumstances. They did not specify what those circumstances should be. But what became evident from their observations was that small-scale production units appeared to stay and become more permanent, not necessarily substituting large scale industrial units (Bangura, 1992; Creevey,
Given the large numbers of unemployed and the labour intensive nature of most small-scale production units and micro-enterprises, these entities appear to serve an important, complementary labour supply function for large-scale production units. But its role in modern economies and society differs with the phase of industrial development. Two further observations were made:

For higher- and middle-income groups in newly industrializing countries (e.g. Korea, Taiwan), small modern enterprises were considered important and micro-enterprises based on traditional technologies tended to die out.

Larger small-scale enterprises tended to redirect their growth towards national and international markets (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993: 7; Creevey, 1996). The views of Baud & De Bruijne (1993) suggested that in low-income countries, small industries using traditional or modernizing types of technologies formed the backbone for industrial development; but that in countries with an important agricultural sector (White Paper on National Strategy for the Development and Promotion of Small Business in South Africa, 1995; Valodia, cited in Budlender, 1996), the latter should serve as a growth area for rural small-scale enterprises (Baud & De Bruijne, 1993: 7; Creevey, 1996).

Considering the arguments about the potential for growth and the scope for development of this area, the gendered aspects of existing employment policies became important for monitoring. The findings indicate that at a global level, women’s participation in industry increased, but gendered differences in segmentation of labour markets became extensive. While women’s access to the agro-industrial sector was considerably great (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993; Sachs, 1996), access to small-scale industrial sectors was less open than for men (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993; Carr, cited in Baud & de Bruijne, 1993; Sachs, 1996).

In the labour production processes, women and men are usually recruited for different operations. Gender segregation of wage levels and workloads existed and continued to exist. In most societies, new innovations and changing technology (e.g. computerization) affected work organisation and production, directly affecting small-scale enterprises and women’s employment patterns. When jobs and skills become more complex, there is a tendency to phase women out first and when these are simplified, women tend to be recruited more extensively (Sweetman, 1996). The external effects which feminist writers (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993) observed relate to extensive linkages that exist between large and small-scale enterprises.
enterprises (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993; Sachs, 1996). When new technologies are introduced, large companies tend to outsource or subcontract production and use more, cheaper casualised or flexible labour and place emphasis on hiring women (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993; Sachs, 1996; Sweetman, 1996). Women thus acquire different types of job skills; and in a manner and on terms different to men.

In a study on women and small-scale industries in Africa, Carr (1993) reported on the 1989 regional discussion of women’s enterprises using the country papers of all small-scale support agencies in the Southern African Development Community (SADC) region. In terms of characteristics and constraints, these studies observed four trends for African initiatives: women's enterprises tended to be confined to the micro end of small-scale; the vast majority of women were sole proprietors who seldom employed hired labour; a significant number of women were members of income-generating groups, participating in these on a part-time basis.

One of the most depressing features relevant to my review is the extent to which activities were confined to a limited range of traditional women's economic activities (Carr, 1993: 110), reinforcing a stereotypical sexual division of labour.

### 3.5.1 Gender and empowerment as key themes in GAD

Two important, comparative country studies are worth mentioning on the topic of gender and empowerment in the 1990s. One was on economic empowerment (Carr, Chen & Jhabvala, 1996) and the other on change and impact of micro-enterprise projects (Creevey, 1996). Both were supported by UNIFEM (United National Development Fund for Women). Both studies were published after the Fourth World Conference on Women in September 1995 in which the Beijing Platform for Action (BPFA) Declaration was adopted. The general sentiment expressed in both publications was that, despite progress in terms of inequalities between men and women over the past three decades, some major obstacles remained with serious consequences for the well-being of all people. Women’s empowerment and women’s full participation on the basis of equality in all spheres of society were fundamental for the achievement of equality, development and peace (Heyzer, cited in Carr, Chen & Jhabvala, 1996: ix). Based on the south-east Asian experiences, the first study (Carr, Chen & Jhabvala, 1996) was not just about poverty. It also explored the ways in which NGOs, women’s organisations and women’s village/community groups attempted to seek joint solutions to
resolve these. By trying to understand the linkages – between women’s lack of power in decision making at all levels; and the continued poverty experienced by women, their families and communities – the study concluded that there was a need for a broader perspective on empowerment addressing at least four concerns: it must contextualize the empowerment as an everyday lived reality; it must adopt a notion of empowerment that move beyond the false dichotomy of economic versus political processes, between individual versus collective power; it must motivate for understanding empowerment as something that offer concrete strategies for addressing everyday structural issues; and finally, it must move beyond the perspectives of outsiders to include the views of grassroots women.

In the second study, Creevey (1996) evaluated the impacts experienced by women as a result of eight small, micro-enterprises located in Asia, Africa and Latin America respectively. Projects in countries such as Peru, Honduras, Guatemala, Bangladesh, India, Thailand, Ghana and Tanzania formed part of this cross-country study on micro-enterprises. This comparative analyses surveyed the impact of different strategies by three major international donors: UNIFEM; the Intermediate Technology Development Group (ITDG); and the Appropriate Technology International (ATI). All three donors had a multi-faceted approach to development projects in general; and to small and micro-enterprises in particular (Creevey, 1996). They sponsored a wide range of programmes in which different strategies were followed by different agencies in the different countries. A primary aim was the need to support women as a target group. UNIFEM alone had, as a basic mission, the promotion of the economic, social and legal/political goals of interventions. ITDG, a donor based in the United Kingdom (UK), had the reputation for a focus on developing /dissemination of technologies. On the other hand, ATI, a US-based donor, was known for their business support that used technology as a support tool.

The outcome of this comparative study produced principle points to guide projects aimed at poor women to succeed in the area of enterprise development in the following period. These are that:

- Projects needed to be multifaceted.
- In order to have greater impact, projects should undertake mobilisation training.
- There was also a need for consciousness raising (i.e. the training of women in groups and not only in group organisation or management skills).
• The introduction of new or modified technologies should be embedded in a larger package including at least management training, marketing assistance and access to credit.

• A useful approach may be the use the knowledge of what women or families learned – as documented in the case studies of successful projects aimed at men – to build on these positive experiences and plan their own.

• Project plans must include raising awareness of probable costs to participants (e.g. time spent, work load, less family care time).

• The extent to which women experience increasing decision-making power may vary according to both the environment and whether there is a level of acceptance of women’s independent economic roles; but an increase in family status (i.e. respect and importance) must result.

• Given all the previous factors, projects should have significant impacts on incomes, assets, use of time and decision-making power; and on general outlook of women who participate in them.

3.6 Post-modern feminism (PMF)

A fourth body of scholarship that was broadly informed by post-modernist/post-structuralist feminist perspectives begun to emerge in development and policy theory. It was directed at transforming poor women’s lives (Braidotti et al., 1994; Barriteau, cited in Marchand & Parpart, 1995; Marchand & Parpart 1995); and also in reaction to modernist WID and certain structuralist WAD and GAD views. Essentially they challenged the universal grand narratives of the liberals and structuralists. Drawing on the mainstream post-modern debates on alternative development (Nederveen Pieterse, 2001; Schuurman, 1993), feminists identified developmental perspectives as a discourse of power and coined a term, ‘developmentalism’, that needed to be deconstructed from a feminist viewpoint (Braidotti et al., 1994: 17). Marchand and Parpart (1995)’s foundational discussion of feminism, post-modernism and development has since become a classic theme in women, gender and development studies. In rethinking some of these concepts, post-modern views in the latter editorial collection (Marchand & Parpart, 1995) resonated with ideas of mainstream scholars (Schuurman, 1993) on similar topics. As an example, they argued that debates within feminism (i.e. critiques of modernity and Western hegemony; the focus on difference and identity; the emphasis on the relationship between language and power; the attention to subjugated knowledge(s); and the deconstruction of colonial and post-colonial representations of the South as the dependent other)
have much to offer feminists involved with development work, whether they be activists, scholars or practitioners. Marchand and Parpart argued for a more critical, flexible adoption of post-modern feminist thoughts and ideas in order to provide what they called a more sensitive and transformative approach to the development of women in the South and the North (Marchand & Parpart, 1995). Their discussions raised new issues and debates within the context of GAD in the mid-1990s, moving critiques beyond binary colonial/neo-colonial discourse and representation (Barritteau in Marchand & Parpart, 1995). Several authors argued for the contextualisation of the colonial/neo-colonial discourse. They stressed the need to acknowledge diversity, in both scope and breath; the positionality of authors, from the North or the South, in engaging in these arguments; and called for an interrogation of all representations of the poor and the vulnerable (Marchand & Parpart, 1995).

Moreover, the idea was suggested that it was a crucial at the time – the end of twentieth century and the beginning of a new era, when global restructuring and environmental degradation were challenging the traditional realm – to deconstruct development policy discourse.

One of the stronger appeals of post-modern feminist theory (PMFT) in the study of policies is that they promote the idea that previously subjugated, oppressed people and their voices be heard along with other more powerful actors to observe and analyse the power and relational dynamics. Three key issues (Marchand & Parpart; 1995) remained that the PMFT needed to resolve, both in order to continue to exist and in order to increase its relevance to GAD. They were the following:

- Questions on the issues of theory and practice; and on providing a basis from which to make moral judgements.
- Examples to distinguish between good and bad in ethical dilemmas.
- How to make its discourse more accessible to an audience wider than the existing academic audience (Marchand & Parpart, 1995).

Apart from reiterating the revaluation of women's contribution throughout the decades of development through a more critical gender lens, PMFT acknowledged the relative silence of feminist standpoint theory on normative, ethical and philosophical issues; with gender and development studies being no exception (Braidotti et al., 1994: 116). It did, however, engage GAD on sustainable development, women and the environment, and care. But, in their critiques of GAD, PMFT did not move beyond a critical theoretical reinterpretation of
structuralists’ views on current development issues; nor have any new forms of social movement or activism developed following these analyses. Aspects and issues – already raised by structuralist feminists and post-colonial theorists and institutionalised as gender mainstreaming in policies – were reinterpreted by PMFT who assumed a ‘hegemony examining and re-examining forms of power relations between women and women that appeared disguised or left intact, shifting to less emancipatory and unsustainable methods of mobilising (Braidotti et al., 1994).

3.6.1 Women in micro-enterprise development

Post-modern perspectives on IGPs are scant in the literature (Barritteau, 1995). However, their views shifted the debate from gender and micro enterprises (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993) to a more nuanced, gender specific, women in micro and small-scale enterprise development (WMSE) discourse. These views appreciated the function and diversity of women’s micro and small-scale enterprises. By deconstructing all the variables (i.e. women, micro, small-scale and enterprise), Dignard and Havet’s book, Women in Micro and Small-Scale Enterprise Development (Dignard & Havet, 1995: 7), responded to the dearth of knowledge on the subject. They examined the pervasive multi-dimensionality of the phenomenon and questioned many previous definitive approaches. Their debates acknowledged that women’s activity engaging in such enterprises showed potential; but that a broader and new social paradigm was necessary to understand it (Dignard & Havet, 1995: 9).

Post-modern feminists all agreed that IGPs are still under-researched. They, however, view the diversity, complexity and idiosyncratic nature of the phenomenon as a strength and not necessarily a weakness. Their views were cautious about a definitive approach, arguing that circumscribing the phenomenon would be an onerous or even hopeless. They view WMSE as a sensitizing concept. To assist with research and policy assessment for further progress with knowledge production, Dignard and Havet (1995) chose to emphasize three important functions that could serve such an agenda. Each of these pertains to a different social dimension. These are minimal conditions/criteria for a project to be considered a WMSE: “Firstly, economic activities of the enterprise have to contribute in a significant way to household income; secondly, some degree of women's empowerment must be achieved and thirdly, women's status and personal freedom must be achieved.” (Dignard & Havet, 1995: 5–6). Their book documented several case studies from different contexts (i.e. Asia, Latin America, Africa and the post-industrial countries), focusing on different aspects of the
debate. Given the wide scope of the research that was covered, a cluster of seven overlapping points were proposed as guidelines for further studies. These are summarised in Table 3.3 below.

Table 3.3: Summary seven post-modern guidelines for the study of WMSEs

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1</strong></td>
<td>WMSEs are not necessarily inferior to the formal sector but are rather functional enterprises. Studies should identify differences to the formal sector rather than overidentifying shortcomings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2</strong></td>
<td>The basic needs orientation of poor women is important and is not gender neutral. It allows for the influences of women’s life cycle and/or women’s changing world view.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3</strong></td>
<td>Although the non-traditional work syndrome is contentious, and for fear of more stress that new technology may bring on overburdened individuals, WMSE need not necessarily avoid women’s traditional types of work: sewing, child care, food preparation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4</strong></td>
<td>A WMSE is more than the sum of many activities of its members. Due to hidden role of exploitation and unpaid family labour, a pro-leader bias could stereotype single entrepreneurial leaders; and should be avoided to acknowledge diversity of situations and the ‘social’ nature of WMSE.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5</strong></td>
<td>WMSEs show ideosyncracy and diversity in subsistence strategies that is observable at two levels: economic activities vary widely among and within enterprises i.e. work and time organization of production processes. The patterns of their daily lives are not circumscribed by economic productive activities only but include social reproductive elements akin to ‘informal’ enterprises.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6</strong></td>
<td>WMSE are a legitimate area of research for highlighting problems with policy development and programmes. There is a continuum between MSEs for women as different to men presenting grey areas calling for ongoing study; Possible growth in WMSE may directly impact household basic needs, especially those of children.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>7</strong></td>
<td>WMSEs are necessary and functional to the same degree for women in both rural and urban areas. By viewing them negatively, as part of the ‘informal economic sector’ produce an unwarranted urban bias stereotyping WMSEs as an urban slum phenomenon, thereby denying their potential as a solution to rural women’s survival problems.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Source: Dignard and Havet, 1995: 7–11]

Together, the seven points explicate the multidimensionality and complexity of WMSEs relating to women daily lives that may be challenging: where roles and priorities are difficult but not excluding continuity. The latter should however not be viewed as a series of dualities or binaries such as traditional/non-traditional, formal/informal, and productive/reproductive.
Three central themes emerged, namely, social contextual issues; cases studies of country experiences across three continents; and specific social issues intended to broaden women’s access to resources (i.e. credit, technology and training). In the same vein as previous authors (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993), some authors simply distinguished between individual and group initiatives. A Sri Lankan case study by Perera (1995: 110), however, went a step further and classified individually self-initiated enterprises into four types:

- Informal women traders and vendors;
- Home-based women entrepreneurs;
- Women in small-scale businesses who operate outside of their homes in rented spaces; and
- Women conducting larger operations with semi-formal working conditions.

A Costa Rican study (Barahona, 1995) further argued that WMSEs consist essentially of a survival strategy – a means of subsistence rather than an entrepreneurial concern. Barahona (1995) explains her view, stating that the wide variety of activities subsumed under the term obscures it in scholarly debates. This may contribute to further ambiguity in policies and programmes that are designed to assist women. For her the problem is often intensified by the avoidance of explicit definitions. Whenever definitions are attempted, she argued that they narrowly deal with economistic and quantitative details (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993; Creevey, 1996). Instead of overstressing entrepreneurial and economic concerns, a solution to this problem may be to view WMSEs as a means to enhance the socioeconomic conditions of the women involved in their activities (Barahona, 1995: 146), and not as an end in themselves. These theorists argued that any definition of the concept must include variables other than strictly quantitative ones in order to capture women's most pressing subsistence needs; needs that validated their need for assistance.

Barahona’s (1995) description – of a Costa Rican self-employment programme initiated by an urban-based national NGO – offered a definition of micro-enterprises. It consisted of five main features listed as follows:

*Productive activities, generating an income, that satisfy women entrepreneurs’ perceived subsistence needs; generated income must at least satisfy 50 per cent of these needs; economic activities are carried out using technology that is either domestic or very simple; its production process is not complex, has
important craft components and frequently happens in the women’s own home, related to domestic activities and experiences; marketing is essentially local, limited to the immediate neighbourhood or at most their cities. (Barahona, 1995: 146)

The latter views starkly contrasts with those held by Barriteau (1995: 144) who drew on PMFT to research the same issue. Her research on the experiences of 32 female entrepreneurs in Barbados in the Caribbean; and her post-modern analysis of development policy process pointed out that both liberal and socialist feminist theory showed shortcomings in dealing with subordination as experienced by this category of self-employed workers. Many of the economic activities of the group of entrepreneurial women that she studied were devalued and excluded because they differed from the stereotypical model of low income women. In support of this, she called for deconstruction of the image of woman as only a working class victim. This, she argues, would require that feminist analysis avoid making a virtue out of oppression (Barriteau, 1995: 144).

PMFT views the female entrepreneur as another category of woman both subject to and resisting differing kinds of subordination. In order to address such theoretical stereotypes, PMFT is proposed as a useful theoretical framework to explore development policy and practice as it may enable development planners to recognise that class relations alone do not produce exploitation. While PMFT neither denies nor reifies oppression, it did claim that it was useful in exposing multiple contested locations of relations that dominate women's lives (Barriteau, 1995: 144).

### 3.7 Normative frameworks with respect to women, gender and development

In order to answer post-modernist calls – for better integration of the theory and practice of policies for the need for moral arguments about good and bad policies; and for more accessible theoretical discussions – a new feminist policy approach, aimed at monitoring progress in the advancing women’s status, has seen the light. This time the interrelationships between women, culture and human development were highlighted in relation to a quality of life, value-based monitoring perspective. By reacting to the post-modern feminist critiques of universalistic grand narratives (i.e. the structuralist and socialist feminist positions), and to
counter arguments of creeping moral relativism, critiques against post-modern perspectives mounted. This resulted in a fifth trend i.e. alternative, normativist development policy scholarship (Braidotti et al., 1994: 108) that attempted to address some moral and ethical dilemmas.

3.7.1 Human capabilities: Women and human development (HC-WAHD)

The views of Amartya Sen on normative values such as freedom, justice, equality including gender equality to which he claims all individuals are entitled were developed as an important set of theoretical statements on the ‘human development perspective’ in policy research and public choice theory. Many previous ideas on human development became refined in his reiteration that development does not start with goods but people; the definition of human capabilities and vision of capability expansion perceiving human life as a set of ‘doings’ and ‘beings’ that take place through ‘functioning of the human being’ are well known as the ‘human capability approach’ in public policy discourse (Sen, Nussbaum, Truong). The notion of Quality of Life placed in a causal relationship with capability to function, that is closely connected to two dimensions: well-being (good health, education) and agency (mobility and self-respect) became central to understand this normative perspective. But although Sen’s work tended to be sensitive to gender, feminist standpoint theorists responded to the limitations in his arguments in favour of gender equality that are relevant to this study. Truong (1997:12) alluded to two critical areas which place the later work on ‘women and human development’ by Nussbaum (1995a; 1995b; 2000) in perspective. The male conception of the productive economy as primary motor, and reproductive and care economy as the derivative of nature, and the silence about sexuality and the body politics as a critical domain of power between men and women (Nussbaum, 1995a; 1995b). Nussbaum’s feminist perspective (1995a; 1995b) of Sen’s ideas, resulted in a contemporary feminist approach to human capabilities. Explaining the background to this cooperation with Sen, Nussbaum (1995a:4) wrote: “… our work grew out of the work, linking philosophy and economics, that produced the 1993 volume The Quality of Life”. This work influenced the approach adopted by the 1993 United Nations Human Development Report. Motivated by concerns to answer post-modern and post-structuralist critics who challenged grand narratives of ‘universalism’, this project of an alternative normative moral philosophical discourse on public policy and
development ethics opened space for debates that concerned itself with two critical issues: women’s life quality and its relation to men, and the question about cultural relativism and universalism, justifying a ‘critical universalist’ normative approach that aimed to be sensitive to history and to tradition (Nussbaum, 1995a:04).

Nussbaum’s ideas were further refined in her book ‘Woman and Human Development- The Capabilities Approach’ (Nussbaum, 2000). The WAHD approach promoted a ‘political philosophical’ attempt to defend the need for basic, universal justice inspired normative perspective. In defence of her political liberalism, she did not enter the care/justice debate but motivated for a fresh starting point disclosing her opposition to relativist postmodern accounts:

*My proposal is frankly universalist and ‘essentialist’. That is, it asks us to focus on what is common to all, rather than on differences although, as we shall see, it does not neglect these.* (Nussbaum and Glover, 1995b:63)

By taking a clear stand on gender equality and linking human capabilities and the WAHD approach with political rights, Nussbaum joined Sen (1996) arguing the language of capabilities need the language of rights:

*... political rights are important not only for the fulfillment of needs but they are crucial also for the formulation of needs. And this idea relates in the end, to the respect we owe to each other as fellow human beings.* (Nussbaum, 2000:96)

Based on justice based ‘basic constitutional principles’, the Woman and Human Development approach argued that the latter values (gender equality and political rights-freedom and justice) be respected and implemented by governments of all nations.

South African development policy reform debates, post-1994 (May, 2000), adopted Sen’s human capabilities approach to articulate its rights-based, pro-poor, growth with equity policy ideas to alleviate poverty and inequality (May, 2000). Feminist perspectives such as Nussbaum’s woman and human development human capabilities approach – here understood as an approach that focuses on what people are actually able to do and to be – did not feature as such during this initial transitional period (Nussbaum, 2000: 5; Sen cited in Nussbaum & Glover, 1995: 259-273). South African policy reform debates, post-1994 (May, 2000) for
example adopted Sen’s human capabilities approach to articulate its rights-based, pro-poor, growth with equity policy ideas to alleviate poverty and inequality (May, 2000). The questions of how society at large and how reform policies dealt with women and human capabilities, including women’s right to employment and work, would have been far more important in the assessment of progress in policy implementation (Hassim, 2010) had this been the case.

The facts and figures on gendered inequalities highlighted in the UNDP Human Development Reports of 1993–1994 cited by Nussbaum to illustrate her approach display a global profile of the continued unequal social and political circumstances giving women unequal human capabilities; leading to them not being treated with dignity, or as human beings deserving respect from laws and institutions, nor as persons in their own right, but rather as instruments for ends of others – as reproducers, caregivers, sexual outlets or as agents of a family’s general prosperity (Nussbaum, 1995a: 3–5; 2000). Nussbaum’s argument about taking the latter universal position as a point of departure thus proposed that international political and economic thought informing state policies and planning should be feminist, with attention given to special problems that women in most countries face due to their gender. She went further to emphasise that without an understanding of these, general issues of poverty and development could not be confronted well (Nussbaum, 2000: 2).

What was claimed to be new in Nussbaum’s approach – at this juncture at the beginning of the twenty-first century – was the incorporation of a different perspective on human capabilities that sought to raise critical gender awareness that poverty alone does not cause women to die in greater numbers; but that where there is scarcity, custom and culture frequently decree both who gets to eat what food there is, as well as who is taken to the doctor. For Nussbaum customs were recognised as being an important cause of women’s misery and death (Nussbaum, 1995a: 3). For those, interested in ethics or questions of justice, who would have become aware of women’s poor human development status (UNDP, 1993–97), the relationship between culture and justice would be an important consideration (Nussbaum, 2000; 1995a).

A key undertaking in Nussbaum’s advocacy for a new alternative, normative, policy evaluative approach was the recognition of further interdisciplinary work that needed to be done as a theoretical, more philosophical and more political, inquiry to start a new dialogue about the social and other effects of policies (Nussbaum, 1995a).
Her intentional positioning of philosophy and economics led an inter-disciplinary approach advocating critical universality in the study of women’s functioning within developing countries. She claimed that this approach should not be insensitive to history and to tradition. Key to this would be the need to answer the various objections made by post-modernists against universalistic accounts. Her argument was that the theory of human capability is compatible with that of cultural relativism; and that proper criteria of ethical choice can be identified. (Nussbaum, 1995a: 4). Elaborating on Sen’s human capabilities approach in quality of life studies, the first question reiterated by Nussbaum was “What are the people of a country in question able to do and to be?” (Nussbaum, 2000: 5; Sen, 1990). This departed from broad economic and abstract indicators like Gross National Product (GNP). To measure quality of life, the human capability approach pose a set of direct questions about the capability of human functioning and flourishing; and look at the distribution of resources and opportunities (i.e. ascertaining how all groups in a population of a country are functioning and comparing groups to one another). Starting at this level assumes that public policies hold choices and preferences – goals and priorities – some of which are not reliable indicators to measure quality of life as they may distort oppression and deprivation. The human capability approach further maintains that resources (e.g. money, skills and other ability factors) have no intrinsic value other than to promote human functioning. This should direct planners and policy makers to ask questions about differing needs individuals may have for resources should they reach an equal level of functioning.

It was thus in the area of measuring quality of life that the human capability approach is claimed to have made a significant contribution. It took a moral stand in two ways: it identified specific, critical areas of human functioning that public policies must incorporate (e.g. planning); and it raised the issue of gender equality as a critical priority when assessing contemporary policy development at international and country levels. Most importantly, it argued that the unequal functioning of women in all spheres of society was a worldwide problem; and so remained a universalistic non-relative needing further theoretical development and policy attention for change (Nussbaum, 1995a:5). In her later publication she expanded on the women and human development approach and proposing a firm feminist stance to human capabilities. In this she departed from the abstractions of economists and philosophers to embed her feminist thoughts and ideas about justice by appraising the concrete realities of poor women’s daily struggles through narratives and examples from two Indian women. In this book, Nussbaum (2000) appeals for a new kind of feminism – one that
is genuinely international – and argues for an ethical underpinning to all thought about development planning and public policy. Her theme of feminism and international development foregrounded the issues of development and sex inequalities Nussbaum (2000) arguing that women lacked support for most of the fundamental functions of a human life: they were less well-nourished and less healthy than men; and more vulnerable to physical violence or sexual abuse. To validate this point, she cited international statistical evidence referring to the Gender Equality Measure (GEM) developed from the Human Development Report (1997); illustrating that the GEM include criteria such as life expectancy, wealth and education that encompass an overarching measure. Nussbaum further commented on the UNDP programme that suggested there was no country in the world treating women as equals to men. Developing countries presented more urgent gender inequality problems, strongly correlating with poverty, that cause acute failure of central human capabilities Nussbaum (2000).

This global systems scenario called for an alternative feminist version of the human capabilities approach (i.e. women and human development); one that would be particularly attentive to the special problems faced by women because of their sex. Her main aim was to develop a feminist philosophical argument and an account of basic constitutional human rights principles that should be respected and implemented by governments of all nations as a bare minimum of what respect for human dignity requires:

Feminist philosophy has frequently been sceptical of universal normative approaches. I shall argue that it is possible to describe a framework for such a feminist practice of philosophy that is strongly universalist, committed to cross-cultural norms of justice, equality, and rights, and at the same time sensitive to local particularity, and to the many ways in which circumstances shape not only options but also beliefs and preferences.....feminist philosophy should increasingly focus on urgent needs and interests of women in the developing world, whose concrete material and social contexts must be well understood, in dialogue with them, before adequate recommendations for improvements can be made.....(it) will have to add new topics to its agenda if it is to approach the developing world in a productive way... hunger, and nutrition, literacy, land rights, the right to seek employment outside the home, child marriage, and child labor. (Nussbaum, 2000:7)
A basic list of central capabilities linked to her idea of political liberalism was developed as part of her main argument to promote and support this feminist philosophical approach. She claimed the list should be used to develop consensus among groups who may differ in conceptions of the good. Her defence of this list of capabilities is that it be pursued for “… each and every person, treating each as an end and none as a mere tool of the ends of others…” (Nussbaum, 2000:5). She further proposed that a stance be adopted where the principle of a person’s capability is based on the principle of a person as an end in itself. The approach promised to make a difference to women’s lives as it used the idea of threshold level of each capability and promoted this as an ethical standard below which true human functioning would not be possible for citizens. The social goal was to ensure that citizens – and especially women – move above this capacity threshold. The list of ten capabilities is displayed in Table 3.4 below.

Table 3.4: Nussbaum’s list of ten central human functional capabilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Life</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>- Live a normal length life.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Not dying prematurely.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Not having one’s life so reduced as to be not worth living.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Bodily health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Good health, including reproductive health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Adequately nourished.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Adequate shelter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Bodily integrity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Able to enjoy freedom of movement from place to place.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Bodily boundaries treated as sovereign i.e. secure against all assault including sexual assault, child sexual abuse and domestic violence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Opportunities for sexual satisfaction and for choice in matters of reproduction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Senses, imagination and thought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Able to use the senses, to imagine, think and reason in a truly humane way, informed and cultivated by adequate education including, but not limited to, literacy, basic mathematical and scientific training.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Able to use imagination and thought in relation to experiences to produce self-expressive works and events (e.g. religious, literary, musical) of one’s choice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Able to use one’s mind in ways protected by the guarantees of freedom of expression for political and artistic speech.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Freedom to participate in religion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Able to search for ultimate meaning in life in one’s own way.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Able to experience pleasure and to avoid unnecessary pain.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Emotions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Able to have attachments to things and people outside ourselves, to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| love those who love and care for us, to grieve at their absence  
- Not having one’s emotional development blighted by overwhelming fear and anxiety, or by traumatic events of abuse or neglect. Supporting this capability means supporting forms of human association that can be shown to be crucial in their development. |  |
| 6 | Practical reason  
- Being able to form a conception of the good and to engage in critical reflection about the planning of one’s life. This involves the protection of liberty of conscience. |  |
| 7 | Affiliation  
- Ability to live with and in relation to others; to recognize and show concern for other human beings; to engage in various forms of social interaction; to imagine the situation of another and to have compassion for that situation; to have the capability for justice and also friendships. Protecting this capability means protecting institutions that constitute and nourish such affiliation; and also protecting freedom to assemble and to political speech.  
- Having the social basis of self-respect and non-humiliation; being able to be treated as dignified being whose worth is equal to that of others. This entails, at a minimum, protections against discrimination on the basis of race, sex, sexual orientation, religion, caste, ethnicity, or national origin.  
- In work, the ability to work as a human being, exercising and entering practical reason, and entering into meaningful relations of mutual recognition with other workers. |  |
| 8 | Other species  
- Able to live with concern for, and in relation to, other species, plants and the natural world. |  |
| 9 | Play  
- Able to laugh, play and enjoy the recreational activities. |  |
| 10 | Control over one’s environment  
- Political: Being able to participate effectively in political choices that govern one life, having the right of political participation, protections of free speech and free associations.  
- Material: able to hold property – both land and movable goods – not just formally, but in terms of real opportunity; having property rights on an equal basis with others; having the right to seek employment on an equal basis with others; having freedom from unwarranted search and seizure. |  |


Nussbaum explains: ‘the list is, emphatically, a list of separate components’ that ‘all are of central importance and all are distinct in quality’ (Nussbaum, 2000:81). The items on the list are related to one another in many complex ways. She used the compelling example that one of the most effective ways of promoting women’s control over their environment and their effective right to political participation is to promote literacy and education. She claims that women’s right to seek employment outside the home (Nussbaum, 2000) has exit options that help women to protect, for example, their bodily integrity. The basic argument from which the women and human development capability approach originates is the political arena. It
further proposes that not all actual human abilities exert a moral claim, but that these ten basic human abilities together exert a moral claim and should be developed. Central to this proposition is the Nussbaum’s assertion that:

*Human beings are creatures that, given the right educational and material support, can become fully capable of all these human functions.... they [human beings] are creatures with certain lower level capabilities (called basic capabilities) to perform the functions in question.* (Nussbaum, 2000:83)

A human capability perspective thus reasons that, when these ten basic capabilities are deprived of the nourishment that would transform them into high-level capabilities, they are in themselves fruitless (Nussbaum, 2000).

She further identified and explained three different types of capabilities in the human capabilities approach: basic, internal and combined capabilities. To illustrate them, she argued: “Citizens of non-democratic regimes have internal, but not combined, capability to exercise thought and speech in accordance with their conscience.” (Nussbaum, 2000: 85). A child reared in an environment without freedom of speech or religion does not develop the same degree of political and religious capability as a child who is raised in an environment that does protect these liberties. The central human functional capabilities list is thus a set of combined capabilities (Nussbaum, 2000: 84).

She drew on the rights-based arguments of Rawlsian liberalism, referring to it as liberal pluralism – to argue for a citizen’s right to choose his or her own conception of the good. This led to analysis of the important relationship between functioning and capability (Nussbaum, 2000). Nussbaum believed that, as both the capability approach and also the list of capabilities attached so great a value to practical reason where adult citizens were concerned, capability and not functioning were both appropriate tactical political goals. But functioning, not simply capability, is in her view what makes a life fully human. If there were no functioning, no matter what the opportunity, one could not applaud it. For political purposes, Nussbaum’s proposal argues for a basic list of capabilities, reasoning “… as citizens must be left free to determine their own course after that.” (Nussbaum, 2000: 87). Her motivation is simply to respect people and their choices (Nussbaum, 2000: 88, Robinson, 1999). The capabilities approach, espoused by Sen and Nussbaum, is therefore explained as
being close to Rawl’s notion of primary goods; and the list of capabilities is constructed and positioned as a long list of opportunities for functioning (Nussbaum, 2000: 88)\(^{15}\).

A strong case is thus made for why the language and approach of human capabilities still need the language of rights (Clement, 1996): Nussbaum claimed that they both continued to play important roles in the public policy discourse, despite the critiques (Nussbaum, 2000). By defending justice as a universal value and by including women’s right to hold property, to work and seek work on an equal basis with others – as advocated by this capability approach – WAHD undoubtedly raised questions about care as a human value. The omission of care as an issue in her propositions sparked another serious debate on justice and care issues to which Nussbaum conceded that, as a value, care is more complicated. She answered her critics as follows:

\textit{The problem of care is a complicated logistical problem for any society. It is also, most empathetically, an ethical problem, a problem that must be addressed not only with resourceful policy thinking, but also with the best normative thinking that we can muster.} (Nussbaum, 2002: 31)

As she alluded, the first step is, to recognise care as an ethical problem, “an acute problem of justice” (Nussbaum, 2002:34). Furthermore, as a feminist she admits: ‘... we will only work out good strategies to solve it if we first map out clearly the goals toward which we want policy to work, and offer sound normative reasoning supporting our choice of goals...” (Nussbaum, 2002: 34)\(^{16}\). Regarding the issue of long term care and social justice, she proposed that, “In the international development world, the simple language of economic efficiency must give way to a more complex, reflective language of full human development.” (Nussbaum, 2002: 34)

For Nussbaum, a just society would be one that offered all citizens – regardless of birth, race or sex or disability – minimally decent life chances in areas such as health, education, employment and political participation. Both caregivers and those for whom they care should

\(^{15}\) For South African studies that applied the HC and WAHD approach see Sawyer (2007), ‘The application of Sen’s Capability approach to selected women in Khayelitsha’. A mini-thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the Masters of Arts degree in Development studies (Institute for Social Development ), University of the Western Cape (UWC). See also Amollo (2011), ‘Women’s Socio-Economic Rights in the context of Hiv and Aids in South Africa: Thematic focus on Health, Housing, Property and Freedom from Violence”. A doctoral thesis submitted in the Faculty of Law, UWC.

\(^{16}\) See also Clement (1996).
be given these opportunities on the basis of equality with other citizens; and both should resultantly have decent life chances in these areas, with no group being treated as second class citizens (Nussbaum, 2002: 34). Implicit in her understanding are the goals of basic life chances and equality; and also the principle of self respect for all citizens. She claims that, while these are highly generalised goals, they are also critical for considering care.

3.7.2 Feminist political ethic of care

The feminist political ethic of care, developed by Tronto (1993; 1996a; 1996b), similarly positions itself as an alternative normative approach to social policy. Unlike the human capabilities approach to development, and as the standpoint debate between care and justice discussed in Chapter 2 demonstrates, it acknowledges justice as important; but seeks to develop care and justice as parallel public values to be integrated with each other. My theoretical approach – to the study of social policy and social development policy implementation – follows the ideas of the following: Clement (1996); Held (1995); Sevenhuijsen (1998); Sevenhuijsen et al. (2003; 2006); Tronto (1993); Tronto and Fisher (1990). As outlined in Chapters One and Two, they suggest that the notion of care should be viewed as a new starting point for feminists interested in social policy; and not only as an acute problem of justice (Nussbaum, 2002). It is not just the complicated, logistical problem that Nussbaum claimed in her writings; but is rather a central, most basic aspect of human existence (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003: 314; Tronto, 1996b), deserving priority attention as a public value and an ethic. Placing care centrally; viewing it as a political concept and a basic human value; and positioning it as key goal for countries striving towards a caring society, as was the case with South African developmental policies (WPSW, 1997), means that societal efforts (i.e. people, actors, institutional structureless and policy services) striving to achieve this integration become important to monitor (WPSW, 1997; Developmental Social Welfare Services, 1999) through empirical research from the feminist political ethic of care perspective.

3.8 Conclusion

The main goal of this discussion was to use the care perspective and feminist ethics as an overall framework to present a broad overview, tracing five trends in the feminist literature on gender and development policy debates (WID, WAD, GAD, Post-modern and Alternative
Feminist Normativist debates) on developing societies, and within which to locate discussions of the policy phenomena of income generation projects and women’s work aspects. The background to current changes in social policy definitions of ‘IGPs’ and the changing global and national development policy research context that affect the construction and valuing of women, gender equality and work (including the policy phenomenon of IGPs), formed the basis for reflecting and appreciating ongoing debates to make sense of new international perspectives and complex diverse meanings of these terms that tend to shape local policies and implementation or contextual realities. The policy notion of ‘social’ development that seeks to combine and integrate human development with growth and equity to reduce poverty and inequality, a policy route that South Africa embarked on, call for critical re-examination to better understand the underlying norms and competing values of ‘care’, ‘justice’, ‘self-reliance’ and autonomy.

Based on this, I will argue that policy actions (i.e. programmes, projects and services) and research frameworks developed – striving for a caring and just society – should be critically assessed and monitored for assumptions and claims. To do this I focus on South African social policy and its public application of the ‘ care logic’ as proposed in the conceptualisation of social development public policy and in the proposed human development model that assumed a human capability perspective (May, 2000; Nussbaum, 2002; Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; Tronto, 1996b). Collection of social, economic and demographic data to monitor the extent and nature of assumed changes should thus be prioritised to include care data; and not only focusing on ensuring that the reduction of poverty and inequality is managed on a sustainable basis (May, 2001). It should also incorporate a critical, gendered perspective (Lund, 2007) that should provide careful judgement (Sevenhuijsen, 1998) and develop normative criteria, robust enough for current day South Africa.

When comparing the theoretical insights of the abovementioned trends/views with mainstream South African transitional views on the topic of IGPs, the latter displayed similar shifts in terminology and trends but no appreciation of the valuable contributions by feminist standpoint views were evident. Micro-enterprise activities were, for example, viewed as legitimate forms of self-employment that could enable the entrepreneur to generate an income and overcome poverty. These arguments were evident in the views of a major research study.
that influenced important policy writing during the transition. For Hirschowitz et al. (1994: 7):

... micro-enterprise activities are seen here as part of an entrepreneurial stairway, progressing from survival businesses, through to those with potential to grow and those that are expanding with the possibility of becoming formal. Then are small and medium enterprises as further steps on the stairway, extending all the way to large corporate. Such a stairway rather than a continuum is envisaged.

Following this line of thought, special policy considerations were given to appreciate the existence of small and medium enterprises and the support that would be needed as additional assistance to climb the steps on this stairway towards building and expanding even larger corporations; something that appeared to have failed by 2003, almost ten years later, when BEE became popular. Four assumptions informed this simplistic view:

- Firstly, that developing the micro-enterprise sector could not take place in isolation of socio-political and economic development (e.g. improving quality of life, health, education, mass literacy levels); that ways to stimulate growth and reconstruction and development to overcome past legacies had to consider this sector; and also that, if adequately promoted and supported, the sector had the possibility to create viable businesses and employment opportunities in addition to those in formal sector (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993) where there was a continued demand for human resources with skills relevant to each industry.

- Secondly, that it was an acknowledged understanding that illiterate and semi-literate workers would continue to struggle finding formal employment even if economic conditions improved; and that all indications pointed to the need to find feasible alternatives to formal employment; but that income generation through self-employment in this sector was only one form of alternative to formal employment.

- Thirdly, that employment creation and development of the micro-enterprise sector could be brought together as part of a single strategy through: large, community, needs-based, labour intensive, public works programmes; on-the-job skills’ training (Danziger, 2003); and an education element that trained knowledge and skills for the micro-enterprise sector.

- Finally, the micro-sector, according to Hirschowitz et al. (1994), consisted of a vast range of activities that are very different in terms of constraints.

By size and scope, businesses identified for transitional policy study were classified into three types: survival businesses; those with potential to grow; and expanding businesses. Seven
different types of business activities were identified for this purpose (i.e. trade; food preparation; manufacturing; repair services; other services; food production for subsistence purposes; and building and construction) were recorded (Hirschowitz et al. (1994). In terms of this early classification, care services (i.e. child care, pre-schools, after-school care, welfare and development projects, home-based care work) mostly undertaken by women; and projects run by NGOs, with their many million hours of unpaid, volunteer labour, were spuriously absent and were to be documented in later studies (Lund & Budlender, 2009).

This chapter has investigated the phenomenon of IGPs by reviewing the literature on women and work that was undertaken in the context of implemented developmental policies and research on conducted on the phenomenon in post-colonial developing countries over the last few decades. The definitions that have been investigated clearly show important changes over time. These had implications for how transitional societies, such as in South Africa with the new democratic dispensation post apartheid, experimented with their own gendered developmental social policies. As observed in these studies, the complex nature of the phenomenon informed the basis for my exploration and reflections on the fluid meaning of the term IGP. This definition I understand as shifting back and forth and, in the case of South African policy reforms, embraced the contemporary international and global use of a more acceptable, freer market gender-neutral business notion of entrepreneurship and micro-enterprise development.

To learn more about these terms, this study investigates the macro social policy implementation context that impacted on the the micro (i.e. local community, project, or service) level. As such, the idea that WMSEs could be treated as a sensitising concept without extensive prior specification of attributes or benchmarks (Dignard & Havet, 1995: 5), had specific appeal for exploring these policy development structures and processes that affected their lives. I argue if the concept of WMSE is approached in this open-minded way it may provide new and further insight into the empirical evidence on policy innovations. Investigating the notion of social development (i.e. the development policy that seeks to integrate human development into an overall growth and development strategy) in the South African context, was a novel undertaking with no preconceived ideas and very little business administration knowledge. In post-apartheid South Africa, social development policy as represented by the White Paper on Social Development (WPSW, 1997), and implemented by professionally trained social workers, became a strategic sector to initiate and experiment
with gender sensitive ‘small-scale enterprise development’ (IGPs). Supported by the National Treasury, the National Department of Social Development embraced the mechanism of IGPs as a key delivery vehicle to assist with job creation and poverty reduction. By analysing the values and terms used during the post-separate development policy period, it can be seen that new initiatives such as developmental social welfare – a concept to be discussed later – embraced gendered social development policy. This I argue should be critically examined to see how underlying values of care and justice are juxtaposed in the long journey to self-reliance and autonomy.
Chapter 4: Researching policy implementation: A feminist, qualitative, multi-case study design

4.1 Introduction and overview

The design of research studies specifies a researcher’s plan and methodological procedures for collection, analysis and interpretation of data to answer particular questions posed within the scope of an investigation. A social scientific research strategy, whether feminist or not, pairs primary research goals, objectives and methods; finds ways of linking ideas with evidence; and synthesizes and produces representations or constructions of those aspects of social life that are being investigated (Kitzinger, 2004; Olesen, 1994; Ragin, 1994).

The design of all research projects positions, the investigator/researcher, as an important actor who determines how the process of investigation evolves; and how researchers interact with subjects to collect and make sense of data (Ragin, 1994). Being a feminist with multiple intersecting social identities (namely, as a Black middle-class woman, an academic/teacher/researcher/social work practitioner, a mother and an activist) myself, this level of intersubjectivity influenced my approach to the research subjects; to being equally conscious of their multiple identities. Having to negotiate all these different social identities in my feminist inquiry substantiates my reason for adopting a qualitative and gendered, multi-case study approach. Feminist and critical researchers agree that there is no single, pure or correct way of doing research (Olesen, 1994; Patton, 1990) investigating social policies targeting Black, unemployed women for job creation, income generation and social welfare. In social science research, the adopted methodology may consist of multiple, possibly even competing, goals when different strategies are combined (Ragin, 1994: 33). This resulted in the multi-case study approach adopted in this particular study.

This chapter explains the feminist, qualitative, multi-case study design based on the PEOC analytical frame that I used to investigate and contextualise the historical effects of social developmental policies aimed at poverty, gender, inequality and care during the transition. To gain a more integrated understanding of new policy implementation structures such as partnership relations, interactive processes between multiple users, with special regard to the
views of beneficiaries, are included in the construction of the multi-case design. My discussion of the design will argue that feminist inquiry and also feminist PEOC are important when conducting empirical research on social reform policies seeking to address poverty reduction and gender inequalities. Chapter 5 deals with the concomitant methodological procedures followed in operationalising this design.

### 4.2 Feminist inquiry as a key paradigm shift

Feminist social scientists have, since the mid-1960s, initiated critical debates reinterpreting both the history of and practice of mainstream science; and the continued male-dominated texts and scientific discourses. Before this, the American physicist, historian and philosopher of science, Kuhn, demystified the absolutist, pure truth of scientific claims. His seminal book, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, published in 1962, seriously challenged universal knowledge claims and questioned contemporary conceptions of science. This started a scientific crusade to reframe important questions, critiques and debates on the development, progress and the success of western science (Kuhn, 1962); one that feminists started to deconstruct. Science was perceived as a paradigm that was shifting (Kuhn, 1970: 170); and this opened the space to argue and promote feminist inquiries as a key paradigm shift (Cook & Fonow, 1990; Fonow & Cook, 1991). For, just as McCarl Nielsen (1990: 18) had argued, in drawing on his defence to resolve scientific anomalies or a scientific revolution, Kuhn saw scientific data or observations in terms of three important assumptions that led to a post-empiricist crisis of knowledge production, opening space for feminist standpoints in post-empiricist scientific research. He stated:

> Observations are theory-laden, meaning scientists view data in terms of their relevance to theories; that theories are paradigm-laden therefore expositions are grounded in worldviews, and finally, paradigms are culture bound as worldviews including ideas about human nature vary historically across cultures.

(McCarl Nielsen, 1990: 18)

Placing these debates in historical perspective sparked a seminal discussion; and the ongoing debates raised further questions about the assumed homogenous notion of science, scientific discourse and scientific practices.
These debates, along with his idea of successive scientific paradigms, led scholars to adopt a more fluid understanding paradigm as a concept (McCarl Nielsen, 1990: 21). A scientific paradigm, as defined by Kuhn, assumed a new meaning. It was described as a constellation of beliefs, values and techniques shared by members of a given scientific community; or as “… concrete puzzle solutions that are like schema, used as models to complete the full development of a particular theory …” (Kuhn, 1962: 175; McCarl Nielsen, 1990: 2). By identifying the need to analyse scientific paradigms as guides to theory developing historically over time, McCarl Nielsen argues – and I agree – that Kuhn opened spaces for the more critical, radical responses of later debates in science and feminism.

Feminist scholarly contribution to the debate on scientific discourse was thus an important advancement. They compared the impacts of the Kuhnian thinking on philosophical scientific discourse with feminist scholarship by challenging the growing crisis of knowledge and continued their critiques of male bias in research and knowledge production in all disciplines, including the social and natural sciences. Several scholars have suggested that the importance of feminist scholarship, through feminist inquiries, lies in its contribution of new arguments on contemporary, epistemological crises. Many substantiated the ongoing claim that feminist inquiry is a key paradigm shift (Fonow & Cook, 1991; Haraway, 1999; Harding, 1986; 1992; Kitzinger, 2004; McCarl Nielsen, 1990; Olesen, 1994).

Feminist contributions are no exception to scientific debates; they continue to challenge and act as a powerful lobby across disciplines by participating and scrutinising contemporary, post-colonial and post-modern, mainstream, western, male-dominated social and natural scientific discussions. Most of these emerged in reaction to the perpetual, sexist bias within mainstream science, finding new ways to expose male-domination in the process of doing research and knowledge production. Harding (1986), however, emphasises that feminists were not the only group to scrutinise and reinterpret western science. Struggles against racism, against colonialism, against capitalism and against homophobia (and also movements (namely, the counter cultural movements of the 1960s, contemporary ecological movements and anti-militaristic social movements), all produced critical analyses of the uses and abuses of science that still enrich the critical stance of feminist analyses (Harding, 1986; 1987).

Feminist inquiry holds the status of being one of the key paradigm shifts of the late twentieth century. For studies that adopted this orientation it became increasingly important to question and raise awareness about ongoing gendered divisions of labour and gender injustices in
academic research/scholarship, as well as all spheres of patriarchal society (McCarl Nielsen, 1990). Feminist scholars drew on a variety of key insights to persistently challenge the low priority given to women and to the transformation of gender relations, with its related issues and concerns, not only in political agendas of social movements, but also in the responses of government and in implemented policies.

Their writing in the early stages of second wave feminist scholarship (Fonow & Cook, 1991; Harding, 1986; Maynard & Purvis, 1994), viewed the topic of feminist research as an exciting, emergent and potentially revolutionary academic sub-discipline – as a scientific paradigm shift (McCarl Nielsen, 1990: 1) that remained controversial due to past, recent and ongoing epistemological claims (Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002). One of the many editorial collections produced on feminist research, epistemology and methodology in the 1990s suggested that the development and growth of women’s and gender studies, new academic discipline, was a useful example; that provides new meaning to the abstract notion of a paradigmatic shift (McCarl Nielsen, 1990). It was argued that feminists were able to draw on a wider body of emerging theories and knowledge (Fonow & Cook, 1991; Harding, 1986; Maynard & Purvis, 1994). By illustrating the concrete realities of women’s lives and lived research, feminists could concretely and confidently argue the extent to which women’s and gender studies constituted this shift (Fonow & Cook, 1991).

From the late 1970s throughout to the end of the 1990s, proponents of feminism and also those pursuing social scientific research, continued the debates and attempts to connect ways of scholarship and activism together; and in order to promote the project of feminist theory building.

One of the core features of the last four decades (namely, the 1960s, 1970s, 1980s and 1990s), is the shifting of boundaries into new disciplines. But debates about the definition of feminist research remained a key feature in discussions – as a part of social renewal and in theories about research. In summarising peculiar trends found in this body of research scholarship for the 1970s to 1980s’ period, Stanley and Wise (1990) observed three key assumptions about feminist research discourse which still dominate today:

- Firstly, feminist research is research carried out by women who are feminist, focusing on other women.
- Secondly, there is a perceived, observed distinction between quantitative methods (namely, as male-centred) and qualitative methods (namely, as female-centred).
Thirdly, feminist research is overtly political in its purpose, committed to work towards changing women’s lives.

(Stanley & Wise, 1990: 266)

Feminist empirical studies that professed an innovative, qualitative, feminist academic mode (Stanley & Wise, 1990) proliferated since the United Nations (UN) declared its first women’s decade for the period 1975 to 1985. While some applied a variety of research techniques to demonstrate this new approach, most of the techniques and strategies had been used elsewhere for purposes not explicitly feminist. Their innovative character was motivated not only in their formulation, but also in their actual application (Fonow & Cook, 1991; McCarl Nielsen, 1990). The uniqueness of research studies using innovative data collection techniques (photography, videotaping, the triangulation of methods, linguistic techniques, textual analysis, refined quantitative approaches, collaborative strategies, the use of the situation at hand, and the use of mixed methods) was observed in the way epistemological, methodological and ontological concerns coincided, giving a specific focus to sex and gender relations (Kitzinger, 2004; Olesen, 1994).

4.2.1 The Influence of post-modernism on feminist policy research

The 1990s, coming after the first UN decade for women in development, pushed the boundaries for feminist participants in social science research discourses to new heights. Due to the strong influence of mainstream post-modernist and post-colonial theorists, social science debates on development, including those on women’s and gender perspectives, was reaching an impasse (Schuurman, 1993). This was something the new theoretical influences attempted to address. In the late 1980s and early 1990s, non-feminists, feminists and mainstream scientists all intensified debate about the meaning of serious epistemological research and about methodology. Feminists moved beyond the standpoint debates but also became sceptical of post-modernism/post-structuralism.

In policy studies coming out after Harding’s (1986) study that distinguished between empiricist, feminist standpoint and post-modernism/post-structuralist viewpoints (reviewed in Chapter 2), some feminists explored social constructionist theory as a framework to build on. They reappraised feminist critical approaches in terms of the commonalities of these approaches – and how they complemented each other – instead of only analysing their differences in analyses. Bacchi’s ‘What’s the problem represented to be?’ (WPR) (Bacchi, 1999; 2009) approach to policy studies falls within the social constructivist tradition in
sociology of knowledge, a sub-branch of social constructionist theory dealing specifically with the social construction of social problems (Bacchi, 1999; 2009). The importance of this theoretical stance in social science debates is in the role it assigns individual actors, including researchers. Emphasis is placed on the meanings that individuals (namely, researchers) assign through the acts of interpretation rather than standing outside of such individual analyses. With reference to policy research, post-structuralist social constructionism applied by feminists like Bacchi (1999, 2009), attempted to redefine discourse as a practice that has material effects requiring attention to the interactive relationship between discursive and non-discursive factors.

In the process of doing research, following Bacchi’s argument, policies are no longer only viewed as responses to existing conditions and problems; but are also perceived as discourses about both problems and solutions (Bacchi, 1999; 2009). With reference to all discursive practices, the objects of study in the Bacchian sense therefore feature as problematisations that would have material effects that become evident in the implementation. This may be done when developing policy frameworks or when implementing planning of policies or programmes. An example was the discursive analysis of South African policy, drawing on Bacchi but using the PEOC (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2006). The effects and analyses of discourse thus refer not only to ideas or ways of talking, but to practices with material consequences (Bacchi, 1999). To develop new understandings of implemented policies by focusing on interpretations of social issues, feminists emphasised the importance of deconstruction, discourse and discourse analysis (namely, deconstructing language, concepts and categories employed to frame, describe and analyse). In using this approach, feminist post-structuralists claimed that targets of policy (namely, beneficiaries, or users) are perceived as not independent of the way they are spoken about, represented in political debate or represented in policy proposals, documents and texts (Bacchi, 1999; 2009). Feminists who attempted to strengthen and advance new epistemological claims, acknowledged differences, emphasising the importance of context by spelling out three factors impacting on the contextual nature of problems: location – region or country; institution – organisation; and history – time or period. Bacchi (1999) referred to her own post-modern/post-structuralist feminist ideas as a contextual constructivist approach. Her WPR deconstructive approach challenged the widely acclaimed problem solving paradigm (Bacchi s, 2010:1); arguing for an approach that pays more specific attention to who controls the enunciative position (namely, the voice) in order to assess who gets to make claims of the problem and who succeeds in being heard (Bacchi,
Drawing on Foucault’s ideas of problematisations, Bacchi’s (2010) WPR approach became widely publicised through scholarly research and studies.\textsuperscript{17}

### 4.2.2 Defining conceptual categories: gender, gender relations and difference in research on developmental contexts?

During this period, feminist scholars identified, problematised and sifted out conceptual issues within the scope and topic of feminist research methodology, confronting the associated epistemological claims anew. Questions about identity, gender and differences in constructing women – within feminism’s own theory and knowledge construction project – became very common. While many social scientists continued to utilise the category gender in a simplistic way, post-modern feminists, who were influenced by many different strands and disciplines (namely, the psychoanalytic theories of Freud, the deconstructive theories of Lacan and Derrida, the French feminists Kristiva and Irigaray, Black feminists and those with post-colonial perspectives), elaborated on these new meanings in terms by researching difference. Researching these new meanings was also about indicating how gender relations had, or had not, changed (Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002).

The debate about whether to research women or gender, as argued in Chapter 2, did not escape women and gender studies in developing countries. Waylen (1996d: 6), on the theme of gender in third world historical and political context, acknowledged the contribution of post-modernism in providing examples of how the shift in analytical categories came about, influencing post-colonial studies on gender, anti-colonial struggles, democracy and development. By promoting this problematisation of gender in line with contemporary scholarly views, she too pointed out the many diverse characteristics, such as notions of sex and sexuality in discussions considering the uncritical notions that appeared natural, universal and unchanging (Waylen, 1996d: 6).

Given these new theoretical influences, reconceptualisations and new studies were needed. These reflected the need to shift to the analysis of gendered subjectivities (Butler & Scott, cited in Waylen, 1996d: 9); a shift towards the study of social identities, in which subjects are perceived, critically reviewing how masculinity and femininity are constructed in each

individual subject, rather than seeing gender simply as a set of roles into which people are socialised (Butler & Scott, cited in Waylen, 1996d: 9).

As argued in Chapter 2, although interests in notions of identity and constructions of subject identities in literature/texts and research publications have increased in subsequent policy debates, much of the renewed interest in gender inequalities and changing gender relations was due to feminist theory and research. Subsequent investigations, by post-modern and post-colonial feminist scholars of different disciplines and political persuasions, have as argued before, come to perceive gender relations as essentially relations of inequality, power, and subordination (Kabeer, 1994; Mohanty, 1991; Sachs, 1996; Waylen, 1996d), affecting the designs of disabling global policies (UNRISD, 2005: 8). Following Waylen, post-modern argumentations have advanced new understandings that the fracturing of the Cartesian unitary human subject, of the self so beloved by rational enlightenment thought, was increasingly replaced by notions of multiple subject identities and by notions of difference, plurality, and multiplicity (Waylen, 1996d: 9).

During late modernity, identity was perceived as much more complex and as a combination of different elements such as class, race, gender and sexuality (Butler & Scott, cited in Waylen, 1996d: 9). The theorising about gendered subjectivities therefore had to shift its focus to recognise a plurality of identities existing in one single subject (Waylen, 1996d: 9), allowing for greater awareness and recognition of diversity and differences between women within different contexts. Scott (cited in Waylen, 1996d: 9) further stressed the necessity of seeing how subject identities are constructed through experience and discourse, without essentialising them. She states: “Subjects identities are created through agency, and this agency is created through situations and statuses conferred upon them.” (Scott, cited in Waylen, 1996d: 9)

Questions about the real feminist methodology (Cook & Fonow, 1990) – capturing the essence of debates in the late 1980s – continued into the 1990s, with continued attention to epistemology and methodology through the integrating of feminist theory and practice, resulting in this being a core theme in most feminist theoretical work produced in social science disciplines at this time (Cook & Fonow 1990; Fonow & Cook, 1991; Maynard & Purvis, 1994; McCarl Nielsen, 1990; Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002). Although highlighting new aspects in the nature and general features of this discourse, most scholars were cautious about foreclosing debate on defining meanings of feminist research and methodology.
Instead, they argued for a non-definitive, open-ended, integrated theory building approach that would develop a theory of feminist methodology as well as its practice. Several authors favoured an approach that involved linkages between how research is done and how it is analysed rather than focusing on one or the other in isolation (Fonow & Cook, 1991:71; Harding, 1986).

To avoid suppressing the likelihood of discovering liberating alternatives, Cook and Fonow (1990:71) further asserted: knowledge should not be limited solely to what exists at present, but should also try to include literature that could help the process of exploring potential applications and paths of development of the concept (Cook & Fonow, 1990: 71; Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002). The notion of a more fluid feminist orientation in research and methodology resonates with my own attempt to design this exploratory investigation of policy implementation at a critical time of reform.

The theme of agency is an important one when reviewing more recent (postmodernist/poststructuralist) feminist debates about research practice and methodology. This line of argumentation called for practical research and understandings to demonstrate reflexivity and awareness of the intersection of race, class and gender as simultaneous oppressive forces. The practical manifestations of this; and also, agency when combined with the positionality of the researcher were considered important when implementing the research process (Maynard & Purvis, 1994; Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002). A plethora of studies applying discursive analyses to policy-making and analysing its effects using intersectionality theory, drew attention to post-structuralism and to the ideas of Foucault on agency. Hunter (2003) referred to Williams and Popay’s (1999) emphasis on the significance given to the discursive context in which policies are made and implemented. But although she finds the notion of discourse useful for bridging understanding of dynamics between an individual’s identity and subjectivity, the individual’s capacity for action, and the existence and nature of policy provisions, provoked critical concerns about some of the inadequacies of post-structuralist discursive accounts of identity. For example, Hunter (2003: 322) argued that current emphases on discursive contexts of policy formulations continued an:

... unacknowledged misconception concerning the asociality of those involved in policymaking whereby their principle role is perceived as the maintenance of the status quo in terms of social policy responses to welfare constituencies.
For Hunter (2003), rectifying the false dichotomy between policy makers and policy users might be avoided by exploring the notion of relational identity emphasizing more the social connections and differentiation as principles of social relationships. Exploring relational identities of welfare professionals, according to Hunter (2003), requires that analysts study and examine ways in which they construct relationships; and erect boundaries and separations between themselves and others. This may include both colleagues and service users (Hunter, 2003: 339).

### 4.2.3 Feminist orientation and associated principles

To introduce the discussion of feminist principles that I followed in my own research study, I highlight five key epistemological principles, emerging out of this recent body of feminist scholarship on methodology, that are still relevant and applicable to studies claiming the use of feminist orientation inquiries. These principles, all of which influenced my design, are the following:

- The importance of continuously and reflexively attending to the significance of gender and gender asymmetry as a basic feature of all social life including the conduct of research;
- The centrality of consciousness-raising as a specific methodological tool, in addition to being a general orientation, or way of seeing;
- The need to challenge the norm of objectivity, which assumes that the subject and object of research can be separated from one another, and that personal, or grounded, experiences are unscientific;
- The concern with ethical implications of feminist research; and the recognition of the potential exploitation of women as objects of knowledge; and
- The emphasis on the empowerment of women and transformation of patriarchal social institutions through research (Fonow & Cook, 1991; Cook & Fonow, 1990).

Given that most social science researchers conduct studies impacting on the lives of ordinary people, feminists claim that researchers face the daunting challenge of intervening in people’s lives when undertaking research tasks. Most mainstream social researchers refer to ethical issues as the thoughts, dilemmas and conflicts that arise about the way in which studies are conducted (Neuman, 1997). Feminists further stress that this consciousness should also include the process for accounting and documenting the research (Edwards & Mauthner, 2002). Ethics, as stated by most feminists, begin with the individual (namely, the me) as a
gendered being. As such, all researchers are obliged to reflect before, during and after conducting a study; to appraise research questions, actions; and to consult their consciences (Neuman, 1997: 443). For feminists, gender and gender relations should not be discounted in the process. For most researchers, addressing ethical dilemmas mean striking a balance between two important values: on the one hand, the pursuit of scientific knowledge; and on the other, considering the rights of those being studied (Neuman, 1997: 443). However, for feminists, ethical principles are deeply embedded in the type of study and kind of research that they engage in. It is therefore imperative that the above-mentioned key epistemological principles drive their concerns about transformation, social change and theory building.

My interest in the historical context of the transition period; and in policy implementation structures, relations and processes, became deeply associated with an ethical concern about how these impacted on poor people’s well-being and social lives. For me, how to investigate policy actions gained the same importance as what was effective and beneficial to one of the most marginalised groups in post-apartheid South African society, poor, Black unemployed women. The majority of poor women were over-represented in the service sector of welfare and social development. But this was clearly devalued and often not counted as contributing to the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) or goods and services produced by the country (Chapter 1). In addition, most of the IGPs launched by the state, for which these poor, Black women were being recruited, fell outside of the mainstream, formal and informal, economic, capitalist market relations of production. Whilst GDP is used as a key economic indicator to calculate economic growth or value, the contributions of such unpaid activities within this sector are seldom calculated (Budlender, 2002). The value of these programmes (namely, the IGPs) continues to remain invisible, locked in a care economy (Razavi, 2007:7) needing to be studied and revalued, in terms of ongoing research (Budlender, 2002; Budlender & Lund, 2007; Razavi, 2007).

The basic intention of my study, situated within this historical period, has to be judged against the potential costs to society. These can be seen by observing the following: the continued disempowerment of poor women via their under-employment; women’s feelings of being devalued; and women’s loss of worth, dignity and self-esteem in the context of democratic freedoms and basic rights enshrined in our constitution. Against this background, the reasons why poor women were still expected to volunteer for IGP work within the social development sector needed to be explored. New or disguised forms of unpaid cheap labour
also needed to be exposed through feminist theorising and through revaluing feminist work contributions.

4.2.4 Feminist ethical dilemmas in context – South African transitional challenges

My feminist ethical stance, one of paying attention to the invisible role of poor women in new policy development, is vindicated by the fact that, in most circumstances, ethical research depends on the integrity of the individual researcher and his or her values:

*If values are to be taken seriously, they cannot be laid aside but must instead be guides to actions ... they determine who will be investigated, for what purpose and in whose service.*

(Sagarin, cited in Neuman, 1997: 443; Edwards & Mauthner, 2002)

In order to maintain a level of truthfulness and balance, I refer to four feminist ethical principles (namely, reflexivity, understanding difference, reciprocity and negotiating) for informed consent and for ensuring confidentiality, as elaborated in the discussion below.

I considered these principles important in the process of charting a different course for investigating policy implementation in an economically devalued sector within a new historical context.

**Reflexivity in the process of doing research**

Critical self-reflection in the process of doing research refers to thought processes about the interactive relational roles assumed by the individual researcher. This is an ethical and social practice that has a long tradition in social science research. To a feminist, this kind of reflexivity refers to sense-making of the explicit social location of the researcher as gendered person, by acknowledging the interplay of power between the researcher and the subjects in the research process. This open acknowledgement of power reveals the intrinsic nature of the researcher’s relationship to the researched, exposing the connection between politics, ethics and epistemology in an intricate way; and this advances the feminist practice of critical self-reflection (namely, reflexivity) as a particular scientific tradition. It also advances the process of doing social research.
Reflexivity as a feminist practice is, thus, achieved not only by the critical self-reflection on my own multiple identities and roles as a researcher; but also by reflecting on the historical context, the dynamics of the research setting; and on my relationships with informants (namely, participants). Feminists acknowledged that they were gendered and thus affected by the intersectionality of this gendering: they saw themselves as women, or men, working in a gendered and relational context that shapes how we experience social realities; and that this in turn dialectically), affects the production of research, knowledge and new learning experiences (Cook & Fonow, 1990; Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002).

Several scholars (Fonow & Cook, 1991; Harding, 1986; Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002; Stanley & Wise, 1990) acknowledge reflexivity as a principle of good feminist research practice, while some agree that it serves as an invitation for other voices to challenge the researcher’s knowledge claims and conceptions of power. Others argue that the practice of critical consciousness and reflexivity should also be judged against the limits of the researcher’s knowledge; and that roles were also played by a variety of other factors, namely: culture, experience, personal skills, the ability to empathise, political openness, and by silences and exclusions (Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002: 119).

4.2.5 Understanding difference: the intersectionality of class, race and gender

Following in the traditions of critical reflection, feminists recently responded to post-modernist notions and critiques of their own methodological problems by re-examining the tradition of telling better stories of gendered lives across people’s differences (Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002)\(^{18}\). These reflections opened up debate within feminist research scholarship that is still ongoing. Some authors proposed that, in order to understand and transform unjust gender relations, gender’s intersection with other unjust power relations, such as race and class, also needed to be considered (Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002).

Those scholars claiming to do feminist research were challenged to judge and qualify different representations of reality; to clear the critical choices they faced in performing feminist research practice. Some claimed that their choices and decisions led to a variety of methodologies in which the politics of difference surfaced. They were confronted with conflicting perceptions of gender and difference in the interactive relationship between

\(^{18}\) See discussion of Nussbaum’s ‘critical universality’ in Chapter 2
researcher and the researched (namely, between women) (Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002). More reflective debates followed on the privileged role of the researcher in relation to the politics and power relations of representing others. Critics within feminist circles sought to address this gap by arguing for a fresh look at how gender intersects with race and class; and by stressing the need to understand how this intersection affected power relations between the researcher and the researched.

Patricia Hill Collins (1991: 35), well-known for drawing attention to the contributions of Black feminist thought to social scientific debates, argued that Black women have long occupied marginal positions in the academy. As such, their marginal status could be identified as outsider within status; something that may provide useful insights to those who situate themselves in terms of a special standpoint on self, family, and society (Hill Collins, 1991: 35). Black feminist thought was thus defined as ideas produced by Black women: as ideas that clarified a standpoint of and for Black women (Hill Collins, 1991: 37). This working definition of the feminist standpoint, with its three key, interrelated themes redefining the Black feminist standpoint, is one that I find relevant and important to this study. These key themes are:

Firstly, as a standpoint, the definition does not separate the structure and thematic content of Black feminist thought from historical conditions that shapes the lives of its producers. It suggests that while Black feminist thought may be recorded by others, it is produced by Black women.

Secondly, the position adopted is that Black women have a unique perspective on their experiences. This would result in some commonalities of perceptions shared by Black women as a group.

Thirdly, while the lived realities of Black women may produce these commonalities, diversity of class, region, age and sexual orientation and abilities in shaping individual Black women’s lives results in different expressions of these common themes. The definition further assumes that while a Black women’s standpoint exist, its contours may not be clear to Black women themselves.

There is therefore a necessity for Black female intellectuals to produce facts and theories about the Black female experience clarifying Black women’s standpoint for Black women (Hill Collins, 1991: 37). The following three key themes were collectively explored and
suggested as constituting a distinctive standpoint on existing sociological paradigms: the meaning of self-definition and self-evaluation; the interlocking nature of race, gender and class oppression; and the importance of redefining culture by Black women. As a concept, the simultaneity of oppression is still at the crux of Black feminist understanding of political realities, remaining one of the most significant ideological contributions of Black feminist thought to feminist and scientific discourse (Barritteau, 2006; Brewer, 1993; Hill Collins, 1991: 41; James & Busia, 1993).

Similarly, others could thus also benefit from new learning, by placing greater trust in the creative potential of their own personal and cultural biographies. More recent feminist debates responded by confronting the politics of difference, arguing that people do not necessarily agree on how to express their differences as their lives hold contradictions. As women, we may have emotional ties to men (e.g. as fathers, brothers, partners, kin, sons, friends) and we are different to other women in some ways (namely, by our sexual preferences, our class positions, ethnicity, able-bodiedness, nationality or religion). Given these contradictions, Ramazanoglu and Holland agreed that expressions of diversity of women’s political interests, especially the diversity of previously silenced and marginalised voices, led to debates focusing more on what divides women rather than on what they had in common; and that this in turn led to increasing political fragmentation (Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002) and further post-feminist deconstruction.

As a feminist researcher, I became concerned with two specific aspects, namely, the implications of exclusionary practices when doing research; and the power of researchers to choose their commonalities with their subjects; and how these and differences are represented. Arguably, by making these power relations clear and explicit, the uncomfortable problems – those about conceptualising and managing the contentious power relationship between the researcher and the researched – are addressed (Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002: 107). Recently, feminist discussions on representing others focused not only on difference but also on how to recognise and take account of the privileges and power of the interacting feminist researcher. As stated by Ramazanoglu & Holland (2002: 112):

*Just as men have found it difficult to see the parts they play in gender subordination through unthinking discourses and practices of masculinity, feminist researchers have found it hard to take their privileges personally.*
4.2.6 Reciprocity and the relationship between researcher and the researched

In qualitative research, as with feminist inquiries (Kitzinger, 2004; Olesen, 1994), the researcher becomes the instrument (Patton, 1990: 14). In the process of doing the actual investigation and research, the ability to multi-task and to manage difficult, interrelated roles simultaneously (e.g. communicating and interacting with different subjects, including beneficiaries and policy implementers) by reaching out to different layers of project staff (namely, field staff and management), became critical for me. This coincided with a time when most projects were experiencing financial difficulties. In discussing the aspects of project context impacting on data collection, Carlson’s (1994) reference to organisational setting as a critical factor, having additional implications for doing qualitative research, became relevant. As my study progressed from the pilot phase; and as data collection moved from the first, to the second and third case, this fact became increasingly evident. The salience of organisational policies and programmes, in the wake of a rapidly changing political and economic reform climate, influenced my decision to explore the actual pre-existing group collective, or project community relational context, as significant for data collection. Carlson’s point that the very nature of the research affects both the setting and those who interact in it, despite efforts by the researcher to be as unobtrusive as possible (Carlson, 1994: 359), resonated with my own experiences. In this regard, I was as feminist researcher, deeply impressed and encouraged with the responsiveness of the multiple stakeholders (namely, staff, managers and participants) and, more importantly, with the beneficiaries’ trust to share personal life stories, project and relational experiences, and by their volunteering information.

The issue of self-reflexivity, in particular reciprocity and the reciprocal influences of contact and conduct, interaction and analysis of the research process, became pertinent, during the study, to my own personal growth and development as a researcher. Features of the qualitative research process that greatly assisted my navigation of this complex journey are trust, flexibility and openness to new learning; and also the ability to interpret and analyse data throughout the collection process.

On the topic of roles, authors (Patton, 1990; Smaling, 1990) agreed that the level of skill required by the researcher; and also the roles to be adopted in the research process, greatly
impact on the type of data that become available (Patton, 1990; Smaling, 1990; Smith & Glass, 1987). I found that my background (namely, as an experienced, professional social work practitioner; as a teacher, or academic; as a gender activist; and as a mother) assisted me with the repertoire of complex, interpersonal and political, problem-solving skills required to stay motivated, focused and attentive in my long-term study.

Past experiences all helped to sustain my commitment to finishing the difficult project process in order to produce a nuanced, critical and theoretically informed ethical study. These included my experiences with the following: mobilising and organising groups (namely, local working and middle class civic members, women’s community groups, social workers and academics); participating in the formulation and development of the first democratic welfare policy document (WPSW, 1997); teaching in the fields of social policy, poverty and women and gender studies; and practicing social community work and organisation building over many years. These have not been without complex interruptions that contributed to the attempt to view the world from a different standpoint, albeit with asymmetrical reciprocity (Edwards & Mauthner, 2002: discussion of Young, 1997). Due to the power of interpretation held by the researcher, I have had to accept that there may be aspects of participants’ positions that I will not fully understand; and also that I should open myself to more dialogue, listening, growth, learning and the sharing of similar and different experiences. Holland and Ramazanoglu (1994) confirm that the process of interpretation can be skilled, creative and intuitive; but that researchers cannot know for sure whether their connections and meanings can be justified; and nor can researcher know what epistemological, ethical and political effects may follow.

Sevenhuijsen’s (1998) contribution and elaboration of the ethics of care to overcome shortcomings in some other perspectives, including those of post-modernism, is poignant as she argued being with, and for, the other is not sufficient ground for formulating the ethical stance. This, she felt, may not necessarily capture relations of dependency, connection (Edwards & Mauthner, 2002; Sevenhuijsen, 1998) or trust (Sevenhuijsen, 1999). Three key points, extracted by Edwards and Mauthner (2002:27), illustrate how Sevenhuijsen argued in defence of an EOC contribution that is relevant to conducting research, thereby implying that ethics involves different moral concepts (namely, responsibilities and relationships), rather than over-emphasising justice-inspired rules and rights, a debate I referred to in Chapter 2. Ethics are also bound to concrete contextual situations or dilemmas instead of being formal
and abstract. The ethics of care – or care ethics – are claimed as a moral and social practice rather than as a set of principle rules that can simply be followed. A question summing up the above discussion is the EOC’s question about how to deal with trust, dependency, responsibility, and vulnerability, as part of human and social relations, in doing research (Sevenhuijsen, 1998; 1999).

More recent research investigations entering critical public debates and policy discussions on gender and care in South Africa (Budlender & Lund, 2007; Hassim, 2005; 2010; Lund, 2007; Lund & Budlender, 2009; Patel, 2005; Patel et al., 2008), stimulated my further interest to record the gap in empirical study and feminist historical reinterpretation; and in the documentation of policy processes for this significant reform period.

### 4.2.7 Informed consent and confidentiality

The ethical principle of negotiating and obtaining informed consent from subjects declaring themselves willing participants in the research process, is a convention that all social researchers must adhere to. I obtained written, ethical clearance from the Higher Degrees Committee of the Faculty of Arts at the University of the Western Cape (UWC). I also obtained permission from the Western Cape Community Partnership Project (WCCPP), a board that I served on, for access to do research on the Mfuleni Projects. The Directorate of Provincial Administration of the Western Cape (PAWC) Social Services and its project managers granted me further permission: to enter the research sites in Beaufort West and in Philani Crossroads/Khayelitsha, in the Western Cape.

All projects sites were visited before the research encounter and all participants in my research project (namely, beneficiaries, project staff and managers) were verbally approached with a general informed consent statement that contained full disclosure of my research intentions. Subjects were provided with information about my role as researcher; my expectations of the experience; and of their right to refuse to be part of the process. Participation in research and the disclosure of experiences was voluntary; all informants understood their right to discontinue their involvement, should they so choose.

Due to the policy nature of the study, respondents were guaranteed anonymity and confidentiality in the use of their information for policy research purposes. They were made aware that the outcomes of the research; and its findings would be made available through publications that would be shared to promote more informed policy-making. Respondents
were also assured that disclosure of sensitive, incriminating information about incidents that involved others (by personally naming and identifying people, practices and issues), as raised by beneficiaries in focus groups, would be dealt with sensitively and discreetly so as not to jeopardise the confidentiality guaranteed in their contracts (Appendix 1).

4.3 Empirical policy studies: an alternative, normative, care ethics approach

Having clarified my feminist orientation; and also the philosophical underpinnings of what feminist inquiry entails for the ethical principles of research, I position my investigation – of income generation policies and projects during the transition to democracy – as a pragmatic explorative multi-case design in qualitative policy implementation research. The study is intended to target vulnerable welfare recipients in one of the most contested public spaces (namely, the welfare and social development policy sector), where Black women’s unpaid labour through volunteering free labour time is relatively invisible to researchers and especially to economists (UNIFEM, 2002).

My previous experience, participating in the development process of an historic new policy document (WPSW, 1997), informed my observation that the welfare and the development service sectors at that time were seen as incubators for poor, Black women’s gendered, lived experiences; and that these were competing for attention with other historically marginalised groups (namely, poor, vulnerable rural people; poor, marginalised children; poor, unemployed Black males; poor White males/females; disabled people; the youth; and gays and lesbians). Given the pre-existing segmented and racialised dual labour market, newly developed social and economic policies acknowledged the fluid boundaries between formal and informal sectors of the economy. They, however, remained oblivious to the growing care economy; and to Black women’s overall changing needs as adult citizens, notwithstanding the HIV/AIDS pandemic. Their needs for basic literacy, numeracy and education as adult citizens; and also their triple burden of unpaid care work, were not adequately addressed (Budlender, 1996) and were ignored by this sector in policy content and programmatic assumptions. These social issues remained a daunting task for feminists and social workers to explore through ongoing research (Lund, 2007).
As an example, several chapters of the WPSW (1997) target the previously disenfranchised, vulnerable, marginalised groups, making special reference to poor unemployed Black women (namely, including the categories of African, Coloured and Indian). However, new social policies that prescribed organisational partnership relations for local project service delivery approaches, introduced the idea of norms and standards (Department of Welfare, 1999). This stimulated my interest and influenced my choice to investigate new IGP structures and processes (for example, State partnership initiatives manifesting in gender contracts within national flagship pilot policy programmes. Given that these were initiatives, intended to build care and development partnerships in this policy sector, the assumptions about gender and relational ways of working were implicit. This reform period clearly created an ideal opportunity to introduce new norms and ideas about policy implementation and research. In my view, the PEOC, as pursued here, offers an alternative empirical research and analytical framework to monitor the progress of implemented policies over this important period. Hence, in the absence of a credible feminist historical and contextual approach, my thesis argues for the adoption of the PEOC framework as an appropriate, ethical approach.

4.3.1 Feminist political ethics of care As previously discussed (Chapter 1-3), Joan Tronto (1993), an American political scientist, explained and developed the notion of care ethics as an alternative way of rethinking fundamental philosophical and political questions. As a practical demonstration of the use of this framework, she introduced it as an analytical framework for debating public and macro questions in welfare policy. While I am conscious of the cultural and organisational (namely, western post-industrial) policy context in which her ideas developed (namely, the influence of America on global, macro policy strategies, such as in the cases of the World Bank, the IMF and the WTO, in affecting non-aligned developing countries) her contribution was deemed important and relevant to the context of my decision to adopt this approach in this study (Robinson, 1999). Tronto, for example, applied the PEOC framework to the welfare policy sector for three important reasons (Tronto, 1996a:1-26):

- Firstly, in the US – like in South Africa – public welfare, as a sector, clearly exposed the ideological tensions of the country’s most recent public choices and also influenced social reforms.

---

Secondly, Tronto wanted to distinguish her particular view on EOC by referring to the PEOC as an ethic about relationships in a deprivatised context. Tronto claimed that, unless an EOC addressed the broader questions of public policy and choices; and also the issues of otherness and desert, it could never stand as a serious counterpoint to justice-based, human rights moral theories.

Thirdly, she proposed that public welfare policy clarify for feminists how questions that are central to care analyses (namely, those of power, privilege and otherness), can be deprivatised to shift our focus in public analyses. Combined with feminist research methodological principles, these broad conceptual guidelines provided by the EOC shaped my own feminist orientation and understanding of formulating the goals, objectives and questions for the multi-case study design that emerged.

Following this, Edwards and Mauthner applied feminist ethics to empirical research, postulating nine broad questions to be used as practical guidelines to illustrate the viability of a feminist EOC approach (Edwards & Mauthner, 2002). These questions formed the philosophical and theoretical foundations for this qualitative multi-case study. They are listed in the table that follows:

Table 4.1: EOC practical research questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Who are the people involved in, and affected by, the ethical dilemma(s) raised in the research?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>What is the context for the dilemma(s) in terms of the specific topic of the research and the issues it raises, personally and socially, for those involved?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>What are the specific social and personal locations of the people involved in relation to each other?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>What are the needs involved; and how are they interrelated?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Who am I identifying with; who am I posing as other; and why?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>What is the balance of personal and social power between those involved?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>How will those involved understand our actions; and are these in balance with our judgment about our own practice?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>How can we best communicate the ethical dilemmas to those involved – give them room to raise their views?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>How will our actions affect relationships between the people involved?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Source: Edwards and Mauthner (2002: 14)]

To validate my application of this EOC frame as research approach; and to investigate, explain or report successes and failures of new policies, I draw on Ragin, who identified four
basic building blocks to explain the social research process: ideas, analytic frames, evidence and images (Ragin, 1994). These building blocks validate my proposal to draw on Fisher and Tronto’s approaches; and specifically Tronto’s PEOC approach (Fisher and Tronto, 1990; Tronto, 1993; 1996a; 1996b), as a useful overall theoretical frame to design, study, systemise, code, record, analyse and synthesise the mass of case evidence produced in this longitudinal, empirical study. As mentioned, the dialogue between theory and evidence helps researchers to make sense of, to extend, to revise and to test theoretical ideas. A substantial part of the dialogical process, being the interaction between ideas and evidence, is thus devoted to coding and analysis (namely, dissecting phenomena into different components); to viewing ideas and evidence in relation to the collective whole that they form (Ragin, 1994).

Analytic frames are fundamental in all forms of social research as they constitute our ways of seeing. According to Ragin (1994), analytic frames define a category of phenomena, providing conceptual tools for differentiating phenomena within data categories. As an example, in my study, categories of data signifying issues of care and development work embedded in IGPs would become important to capture relational dynamics. Analytic frames therefore articulate ideas about concepts. In this study, these are the social issues of gender and IGPs; and of social development, or care work mediated through local projects. The caring practices of women and their unpaid labour time are both embedded in the study’s project work and practices involving participants. I thus assume that women have to be specifically questioned about daily routines, domestic and care work. With this intention, the feminist EOC approach appealed as a potential new way to frame questions, interpret, analyse, report and present existing case evidence on implemented policies and processes.

However, while the analyses of social phenomena form a key part of the dialogue, it is not the only part. An analysis or study can only be perceived as complete when things are put in perspective. Hence, it is important to synthesise evidence; to make sense of data by forming evidence-based images of the research subject (Ragin, 1994:56). Developing representations is a commonly used practice in qualitative and case study research; it is associated with analytical frames and data analysis. Representations of social life emerge from the powerful interplay between analytical frames, derived from ideas or theory, and images, derived from evidence. Ragin (1994:56) further explains that analytical frames could be used to both classify and characterise phenomena. Analytical framing thus consists of two main components:
• Framing by case: used when a researcher uses concepts to classify the actual phenomena being studied. For example, by answering the broad question of what the case is about.

• Framing by aspect: used when concepts are part of cases, in order to characterise these cases. For example, gender sensitivity.

These two ways of framing cases constitute two conversations in the dialogue between theoretical ideas and actual evidence in within-case analysis (Ragin, 1994: 65). Sometimes the analytical frame exists before the research begins, thereby structuring most aspects of the research. A frame may also be articulated during the course of the research (Ragin, 1994). This was the case for my study, where the EOC was used as framework to investigate and code individual case data; and to compare multiple cases alleging to have incorporated care and social development.

4.3.1 Feminist and gendered case studies

My multi-case study design was strongly influenced by gendered case study research (GCSR); and with a more recent trend in feminist qualitative approaches to policy research – post-modern feminist concerns over differences, such as the intersectionality of race, class and gender. Within the broad field of developmental policy, this strand of research focuses on women, gender, gender relations and development policy studies in southern developing countries. This approach concentrates specifically on the broad area of social relations, with specific reference to the social relationships between men and women. Gendered case studies cited by Sithole-Fundire, Zhou, Larsson and Schlyter (1995: 10), adopted a single case design approach and emphasised that gendered case studies should be conducted on groups of men or on groups of women only, providing that the group’ situation was analysed critically within a structural gendered relationship (Mapetla & Schlyter, 2009; Sithole-Fundire, et al., 1995: 10). The comparison of single case designs to study gender contracts – or spaces between men and women (Sithole-Fundire, et al., 1995: 35) – examines, in depth, certain representations of the many features of a select group of cases over an extended timeframe; and uses critical feminist theoretical perspectives and gendered analyses to record results.

In contemporary, western policy studies, alternative critical feminist perspectives have, however, become more influential in the social science disciplines of sociology, social psychology and political studies. The social work discipline has also seen some theoretical advances. Post-structuralist/post-modernist feminist theories form part of more recent social
science attempts to analyse and critique the social effects of policy sectors, especially in
Australia (Bacchi, 1999; 2009). Bacchi’s version of post-structuralism, together with
contextual constructivism – the term used to highlight specific social issues relating to gender
and women (sexual harassment, childcare and youth), signified new directions (Bacchi, 2009;
Lister, 2010). Bacchi’s (1999) WPR policy analysis approach drew on post-modern/post-
structural theory and on discourse analysis falling within the scope of the feminist, social
constructivist tradition, guiding a number of recent policy studies that challenge gender and
policy issues (Eggebø 2010; Hermann, 2002).

My own research approach seeks to reconstruct representations of gender, of gendered
income, and of public assistance policy programmes. This is done by drawing on a
combination of ideas from all three strands of feminist thought applied to contemporary
policy studies: post-modernism, post-structuralism and post-colonialism. These
representations are based on scientific data attempting to understand how macro policies
conceptualised during the historical, legal, policy reform period under study (namely, the first
five year policy cycle after the 1994-2001 period) were translated into actual, local social
relations through the micro-organisational, structural partnership relations and community-
based projects implemented.

In order to provide a more holistic historical account of what appears as a macro/micro divide
in earlier representations, I hope to present an alternative gendered policy learning and
research approach. To initiate this, I draw on Soy (1997) to outline six basic research steps
associated with single case design that both guided my first explorative pilot phase (Smith &
Glass, 1987); and that determined the finalisation of my design for the longitudinal,
qualitative, multi-case outlook and approach. The six research steps are shown in Table 4.2
that follows.

Table 4.2: Six basic research steps for single case studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step 1</th>
<th>Determine and define the research questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Step 2</td>
<td>Select the cases and determine the data gathering and analysis techniques</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 3</td>
<td>Prepare for collection of data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 4</td>
<td>Collect data in the field</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 5</td>
<td>Evaluate and analyse the data</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3.2 Positionality

Post-modern, post-structuralist and post-colonial feminist theoretical arguments led me to become more conscious of the multiple social identities that I, as a researcher, consist of. I am an educated, privileged, Black, professional, middle-class South African woman. In addition to that, whilst I was in the process of designing and executing this research project, I experienced a legal divorce and became a single parent, responsible for two young, teenaged sons. At the same time, I was working as a social work educator (namely, an academic) full time, as a practitioner/researcher, as a gender activist, and as citizen with multiple challenges.

By having studied and lived abroad for a period in my adult life, I am aware of being advantaged. However, I have had other less advantaged experiences that intersected with gender, race and class subjugation. I have experienced exploitation within the male-dominated, institutional workplace and in the personal sphere; experiences of that overlapped with those of the research subjects. Although I am perceived as privileged in terms of class and also race – as I am of mixed descent in the South African historical context, my representation of a constituency of Black, female academics at an historically Black South African university intersected with some of the experiences of the research subjects (Mies, 1991). Black, female academics’ marginalisation and disempowered status ranks lower in the hierarchy of higher educational institutions, nationally and internationally; as supported by South African statistics. Their conspicuous absence from academic leadership positions, scholarly research programmes and published academic books and journals are all disempowering factors and shortcomings. I consciously carried these into the research relationship that I entered into with less educated and less privileged, but equally less empowered, Black female citizens.

As I have mentioned, the complexities of this plurality of identities, and also of the intersections of social divisions, were variously discussed in feminist debates over time. My experience was that my initial analysis of advantages for emancipatory projects proved to be somewhat naïve; and that this led to further difficulties and complexities as the study
progressed. These encounters confirmed the position statement, “Taking account of difference in research practice is a sensitive contested, personal and often a painful process.” (Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002: 120) The problems encountered in research when taking difference into account, are not resolved only by methodological rules; but rather,

... the human agency of the researcher remains a critical moral action in interpreting and representing differences ... [if we are conscious of our] socially constituted [moral selves].

(Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002:111)

The way in which we, as researchers and humans, contribute to and negotiate our relationships; and perceive power, difference and othering, has definite implications for the authenticity of the study; and for our experiences in accounting for this knowledge (Ramazanoglu & Holland, 2002:113).

4.3.3 Research design: longitudinal, qualitative multi-case study

Having studied the global trends in policy literature and research over some decades, my investigation of gender and social policies claiming to reduce poverty experienced by Black women in democratic South Africa was conceptualised with a more specific purpose: to explore, understand and explain new trends in monitoring the impact of policies and programmes.

Given this explorative emphasis, the qualitative case study research approach claimed as appropriate for hypothesis testing (Patton, 1987; Yin, 1984; 2003) in policy studies (Barkley, 2006; Neuman, 1997; Ragin, 1994), held great promise in the design phase of my own feminist qualitative approach.

Qualitative case study research treats cases as units of research that can be divided into individuals, groups, organisations, movements, events or geographic communities (Neuman, 1997: 29). In policy research qualitative case studies, assist researchers to connect the micro-level actions of individuals and groups to the macro-level, large scale social structures or processes of policies (Vaughan, cited in Neuman, 1997: 30).

To this end, given the structural nature of poverty and the historical legacies of apartheid, the explicit connection of using micro cases in research was of great interest to me. It presented
an opportunity to enter the public debates advocating for appropriate feminist monitoring; and for evaluative studies of implemented poverty reduction and reform policies. This need for early assessment and monitoring concurs with Patton (1987) and Dean (cited in Alcock et al., 1998: 318). They recommend the use of micro cases to document and study the social and relational effects of social policy. This logic is also endorsed by Walton (Neuman 1997: 30), who motivates that cases demonstrate causal links about how social forces shape and produce results in particular settings (Walton, cited in Neuman, 1997: 30; Ragin, 1994). These causal links with social forces also raise questions about boundaries and how to define the characteristics of each case, which in turn, could help with new thinking and theory building (Walton, cited in Neuman, 1997: 30).

In conclusion, my multi-case study design is located within a feminist paradigm and a PEOC as a methodological framework. It is longitudinal and concurs with Ragin’s (1994) suggestion that researchers gathering case data, do so for longer periods of time (namely, months, years or decades).

For pragmatic reasons, for in-depth investigation and for comparison, several authors agree that qualitative case designs work best with a smaller number of cases (Neuman, 1997; Ragin, 1994; Yin, 2003). The single case design is thus the format that I have selected as a unit of analysis for IGPs that were started as partnership projects and for conducting my research. The execution of the research process and methodological procedures will be dealt with in Chapter 5.
Chapter Five: A qualitative, feminist, multi-case design, research process and methodological procedure

5.1 Introduction

Having located my multi-case study design within a feminist paradigm and within the PEOC methodological framework, this chapter provides a description of and a reflection on the research process of this study. I present my discussion of the social scientific research process as follows: major research questions; problem statements and assumptions; aims and objectives; research settings; participants; sampling; strategies and procedures for data collection; case data analyses; and, conclusion.

The three major research questions that were developed to guide the study are:

- Are IGPs, as proposed within the national DSW policy framework, addressing poverty and gender inequality in a satisfying way?

- What are the appropriate, normative frameworks, or values and guiding concepts to study these?

- How can a critical, gendered user perspective contribute to public discussions and policymaking?

5.2 Problem statement and assumptions

Post 1994, South Africa adopted ‘social development’ as the appropriate term to describe its macro social policy orientation. From this developmental social policy perspective (Patel, 2005; WPSW, 1997), the State assumed a particular role to facilitate its rights-based, pluralist, partnership; and policy approach which aimed to centrally plan and integrate social and economic development goals (see chapter 1). Although the WPSW (1997) made reference to a special chapter on women and children, poor and unemployed vulnerable persons were collectively targeted. At the time and from a feminist perspective, poor Black women were not critically perceived as an oppressed group of their own for welfare and social development needs. Poor Black women (namely, the previously disenfranchised
African, Coloured and Indian racialised categories still referred to in current mainstream policy terms) formed part of other vulnerable citizens’ groups (the youth, the disabled, refugees and asylum seekers). Throughout this transitional policy reform period from 1994 to 2001, poor Black women continued to remain trapped in very poor socio-economic circumstances; and they participated in the economy and in society very differently to men and other White women (Budlender, 1997; Govender, Budlender & Madlala 1994; Taylor, 1997).

A decade later, by 2004, Casale’s (2004) study of the South African labour market for this transition period referred to earlier suggest a feminisation of the South African labour force from observing women’s increased participation rates. However, when critically interrogated and carefully analysed, this trend appeared essentially skewed for the reason that the main beneficiaries were in fact White women. Contrary to the rest of the world where the rise in female labour force participation resulted in a growing demand for women’s labour, the main research finding for this period in South Africa saw, on the contrary, a rise in unemployment for poor Black women; and an increase in unpaid labour, with the majority of them participating in activities falling outside both the formal and informal labour markets (UNIFEM, 2002).

In 1999, the Department of Social Welfare changed its name to the Department of Social Development. As a result, ‘DSW’ became the dominant policy term used when redefining State welfare. This was seen in the distinguished policy shifts of the first democratic five-year policy cycle, where policy shifted from fragmented, apartheid social services to integrated, social safety net policy services (Kanji, 2001; Sevenhuijisen et al., 2003; Sewpaul & Holscher, 2004; WPSW, 1997). The adoption of these new policy understandings prompted South African feminists to become engaged in international policy research, specifically on country case studies adopting similar policies (Budlender, 2002; Hassim, 2005b; Razavi, 2011; 2007). Their aims were to inform themselves about new policy directions and to understand the state’s new and changing role. Budlender (1996) conducted commissioned research for Unifem (2002) while Hassim (2005a) presented a draft country case study on South African gendered welfare and attempted a feminist re-interpretation of the role of the ruling government as a developmental state; in it. She tracked its status and practices as an additional fifth regime, expanding a former classification of four welfare state regimes (namely, liberal, social democratic, corporatist and state-socialist). With no concrete
empirical evidence based on women’s voices as policy users, the reference made by South African feminist and non-feminist researchers to declare the South African State as a ‘developmental state’, remained contestable. By comparing the South African developmental state and its DSW system with other welfare states, several assumptions, relevant to this research, emerged:

- The developmental state, as is case with the welfare state, is regulatory in nature.

- The developmental state ascribes meaning to the social category of gender and creates a normative value through which needs are interpreted and considered worthy of attention to be addressed in policy services and programmes.

- While northern welfare states redefine the relationship between work and family, developmental states in the south, operating in the context of informalisation of labour markets, redraw the boundaries between the responsibilities of state, community, families and individuals (Razavi, 2007).

- Analyses of developmental states centred on the types of needs that should be prioritised, assessing the extent to which these needs satisfy the range of national, fiscal and global priorities.

- Hassim joined several feminists, whose ideas I explored in chapters Two and Three above, in concluding that less attention is paid to the ways in which the developmental state interprets needs, particularly the gendered nature of needs. Citing Bernstein, she referred to South Africa as probably the developing world’s largest and most generous welfare state (Bernstein, cited in Hassim, 2005a: 3).

South African social policies are underpinned by a strong, formal commitment to gender equality that presents a useful case study of the gendered nature of the emerging developmental status quo (Waylen, 2005). The concern about the impact of processes of democratisation on the structure and ideology of welfare institutions in post-apartheid transition, together with the need to study the extent to which the policy processes expanded women’s citizenship and access to rights guaranteed by the constitution, is deeply shared in the aim of my own research. Questions about how democracy shifted both boundaries and the nature of State regulations; as well as how the needs and entitlement have been conceptualised to expand women’s full citizenship; and in order to access to their constitutional rights, became contentious issues in need of further substantiation and appropriate empirical research on implemented policies and programmes.

20 The reference to South Africa as a developmental welfare state also appeared later (Hassim, 2010).
The fact that women participated in the previous liberation and anti-colonial struggles, motivated South Africa feminist standpoint theorists and gender policy analysts to critically re-examine and reinterpret policy frameworks that claimed strong formal commitments to justice-based human rights and gender equality arguments (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003). Given the influence of the more recent UNDP and UNRISD international policy research agendas, South Africa feminist standpoint research attempted more critical, evaluative and descriptive policy studies (Budlender, 2002; Lund & Budlender, 2009; Hassim, 2010; Patel, 2005) to raise awareness about the social and gendered implications of reform policies. The prevailing transitional challenges, as well as the country’s Constitution and Bill of Rights in all policy sector documents, resulted in a plethora of publications and comparative studies that elicited a myriad of debates, including social, political and gendered analyses on various issues (Budlender, 1996; Goetz & Hassim, 2003; Gouws, 2005; Hassim, 2005a; Hassim, 2005b; Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; 2006; Waylen, 2005).

This study, conceptualised at a time when the HIV/AIDS infection rate had almost doubled (Amollo, 2011), added the gendered vulnerabilities presented by the pandemic. The greater risks faced by poor Black women, both young and old (Shefer, 1999; Amollo; 2011), complicated the growing need for care for all age groups. This critical need was already reaching crisis proportions. As many authors (Hassim, 2005a; 2005b; Peacock & Weston, 2008; Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003) observed, the HIV/AIDS pandemic imposed additional care burdens on already vulnerable women, the primary caregivers; and the fact that most of women’s unpaid care duties were performed in the wake of very poor infrastructural services, and also with unmet basic human rights (clean drinking water, energy and basic sanitation), exacerbated the issue. This, added to the triple burden of poor Black women (namely, self and family care, work, and community care), and led to a wake-up call by some concerned groups to form new NGOs that would respond to this crisis; to address the need for greater solidarity in awareness campaigns for gender justice where men could be conscientised into joining women and gender-based NGOs and networks (Peacock & Weston, 2008). Comparable statistics for young Black women, by other chronic diseases (such as tuberculosis); and by social issues (sexual harassment, rape, domestic violence and teenage pregnancies), completed the picture of a young democracy in a justice and caring crisis (Hassim, 2005a; Hassim, 2005b; 2010). The mortality rate of Black women during the
transition period was 29.4 per cent, double that of White women whose mortality rate was 11.5 per cent (Hassim, 2005a; Hassim, 2005b).

The number of citizens formally employed in the regulated labour market compared to those active in the informal, more unregulated sector, was common in most statistical analyses of the South Africa labour force of this period. Judging by the range of economic and non-economic analysts (Budlender, 1996; Casale, 2004; Hassim, 2005a; Hassim, 2005b; Seidman-Makgetla, 2004; Taylor, 1997; Valodia, 1996) assessing the gendered nature of labour force participation and challenges, all concurred that women earned lower incomes; had higher unemployment and illiteracy rates; and owned less assets than their male counterparts in all sectors. Poor Black women, however, remained concentrated in the lowest skilled and poorest paying jobs; a finding no different to global trends (UNRISD, 2005). Most authors agreed that African rural women, remained the poorest group in 1997 – the date of legislation of the first democratic WPSW – with an estimated 65 per cent of women in African rural female-headed households, compared to 54 per cent of men in African rural male-headed households falling into this category (Budlender & Lund, 2007; Hassim, 2005a; Hassim, 2005b; Patel, 2005). In 2003, 96 per cent of all domestic workers were poor Black women (namely, African, Coloured and Indian women) earning under R1000 per month. However, the poorest category of citizens still remained African rural women as they did not have the same opportunities as their urban counterparts.

With these poverty and social conditions as background, global macro-economic policies, such as Growth Employment and Redistribution (GEAR) which was favoured by the World Bank, called for greater attention to social safety nets (Kanji, 2001), and to job creation and income generation activities. The assumption was that these measures could assist national states with policy mechanisms to address chronic unemployment. The combination of these welfare and work ethic (Tronto, 1996a; 1996b) mechanisms was found to be relevant in experimentation with care ethics. These new policies were implemented through programme development at national, regional and micro, or local, levels; and in partnerships between State and local community groups (namely, women, the youth and the disabled), with a dual purpose: poverty and unemployment reduction via shifting people off welfare into work programmes; and the promotion of State initiated gender sensitive planning for unemployed poor women, often mothers in need of work and educare for dependent children.
With national goals being set, the need for empirical research to monitor and evaluate effectiveness in implementation and reaching target populations, became almost self-evident. Debates about developmental norms, standards and social indicators were, however, absent and were conducted through further policy development (Developmental Social Welfare Services, 1999; Carolus, 2010; Sewpaul & Holscher, 2004). The substantiation of previous feminist claims to re-examine previously identified policy needs were equal challenges that needed attention. All of these assumptions about work, women, gender, care and poor women’s available labour time (UNIFEM, 2002), stimulated my own interest in the policy area of work, women and DSW.

Unlike previous policy analysts (Mullagee, Nyman, Budlender, & Newman, 2001), my argument, to provide a more critical historical approach, was based on four key assumptions:

- Firstly, as a South African in general and a feminist in particular, I assumed that we needed to historically understand, contextualise and also theoretically link and explain the growing intensification and diversification of care and unpaid work (Sweetman, 1996) that accompanies socio-economic reforms.

- Secondly, I assumed that the market – in particular the formal and informal labour market supported and sustained by the developmental State – failed the unemployed in general, and poor Black women in particular; according to substantive evidence provided by contextual local gendered case studies of policy experiments conducted within the welfare and development service sectors (Mullagee et al., 2001).

- Thirdly, I assumed that the social impact of development policy interventions and activities undertaken and implemented by a range of different development agents through partnerships; and, more particularly, the role of the State as a developmental partner, will be investigated in terms of how these constellations affected Black women during the initial reform phase, post 1994. This investigation aims to produce a critical evaluative study that will inform and publicly defend the rights of poor Black women to be listened to, included in dialogues about policymaking, and to gain equal access to the mainstream economy. More importantly it advocates for men to become part of care practices and the care economy.

- Finally, I assumed that the dominance of care work in which the majority of poor Black women are currently involved and trapped needed serious interrogation, justification, revalorisation and reconceptualisation in order to accommodate new understandings in social science, social work and social policy.
5.3 Aims and Objectives

As stated in the introduction my research aims and objectives respond to the perceived gaps and dearth of evidence-based research by feminists on the transitional period post-1994; and are therefore both empirical and conceptual. Policy guidelines as to what DSW entails, remained unspecified and rather vague. Most current mainstream and feminist analyses on the transition (namely, the post 1994 to 2001 period) interpreted policies and implementation context with very little concrete empirical evidence on programmes or policy services or adequate feminist understanding to substantiate poor women’s agency and citizenship (Goetz & Hassim, 2003; Gouws, 2005).

As a moral agent and partner in social development, the role of the post-apartheid, democratic developmental state (Triegaardt, 2011), as well as the partner roles played by NGOs, remained arbitrary in feminist analyses. Few analytical case studies demonstrate how successfully or unsuccessfully these policy innovations were (Patel, 2005; Lund, 2008) in changing gender relations. Studies by Ally (2010) and Groenmeyer (2011) are more recent feminist research studies that combined critical feminist empirical studies with practical analyses of Black women’s paid work; but they have not integrated the broader historical reform context and contributions by postcolonial feminists to understand women and work as social policy issues within the context of historical transitions and reforms (Afshar, 1996; Rai & Lievesley, 1996; Waylen, 1996d). They broached the subject of Black women’s lived citizenship – with its double exploitation in the continued burden of unequal gender divisions in work and care – but do not explicate the role and governance of the democratic state in terms of new partner relations with civil society. To contribute to this new body of critical feminist re-examinations, the first aim of my longitudinal multi-case design was to ground a feminist, qualitative, gendered case investigation of three State and organisational partnerships that undertook IGPs in local community-based settings during this period. By introducing the PEOC approach (Fisher & Tronto, 1990; Tronto, 1993) as an empirical research and analytical frame in policy studies, my second aim was to explore a more historical feminist analysis of the period under study.

The State was a partner in all three of the cases that I studied. One of the three chosen sites had minimal involvement by State and received international donor funding. The other two sites were fully funded and financially subsidised by the National State Treasury. For these
two sites, the National Departments of Social Welfare/Social Development and Health acted, at national and also regional level, as main co-partners together with the NGOs and women citizens.

These policy experiments implied a combination of the work and care ethics (Tronto, 1996a; 1996b). This led to the third aim of my study: to explore and understand the nature of newly promoted DSW, whilst acknowledging their close connection to social safety nets (social security) and to IGPs combining gender and work creation with educare policy experiments.

In line with these aims, the objectives that I considered important to my selection of the project cases are as follows:

- To ascertain the range of skills offered by IGPs;
- To ascertain whether partnerships offered effective labour absorption strategies (WPSW, 1997); opportunities to the unemployed; and to poor Black women in particular;
- To ascertain whether race, gender, class, ability and age played a role in the design and implementation of projects;
- To determine how, and from whose perspective, empowerment was defined; and whether social and economic empowerment took place in order to meet the need for full integration into different sectors of the whole South African economy. Also, to determine how the proposed skills training and empowerment components challenged the status quo and the gendered division of labour in the mainstream formal economy where Black women were excluded?
- To determine any assumptions these projects made about care; with special reference to the extent to which these assumptions were gendered.

5.4 Research settings and timeline

My broader study was conducted in three communities, namely:

- Mfuleni: an urban township, 35 kilometres from Cape Town’s central business district (CBD);
- Beaufort West: a semi-rural town, 600 kilometres from Cape Town; and
- Crossroads: an informal settlement, 25 kilometres from Cape Town CBD).

The Mfuleni project site was initially launched as a pilot case study. It was set up to conduct further research on IGP cases implemented and facilitated by community partnership initiatives in both urban and rural South African townships, where poor Black women live.
and work. The opportunity to get involved became available through my engagement with a university/community/State partnership initiative where I participated as a board member. This, together with being a gender activist, an academic and a social work teacher, as well as being a university representative in this partnership structure, enabled me to obtain permission to conduct my research. The main purpose of my research activities was to formulate and refine the research problem statement; to develop the research questions; to establish the focus; and to delimit the scope for further study.

Yin (1989) describes the purpose of pilot studies as a final step to prepare for data collection in case study research. A pilot case may be chosen for study before venturing into the selection of final cases to study. He mentions three criteria relevant to selecting the site: convenience, geographical location and access to an unusual amount of documents and data.

Yin (1989) draws a distinction between pilot and pre-test cases. A pilot case is considered more formative, or developmental; it assists the investigator to develop relevant questions. A pre-test case provides the opportunity of a more formal rehearsal of the case study process. The information generated by the study is used parallel to the ongoing review of relevant literature. Yin’s (1989) views on this contrast with Neuman (2007: 280); he documents the three main factors for the selection of a study site as richness of data, familiarity and suitability. With the Mfuleni project, I was optimistic of the potential richness of the data; I was familiar with the community through previous visits and interaction with board members; and the site was reasonably accessible.

In 1996, the Mfuleni project micro pilot case study was initiated to explore both the assumptions about partnerships; and how IGPs were constructed and implemented. I had taught a post-graduate course on women and work in the women and gender studies area; and so my observations were purely descriptive and attempted to capture some practical features and dynamics – those that would further knowledge about how to implement social development policies through organisations or partnerships adopting a project delivery approach to address job creation. Some features of interest to this study were the dynamic nature of the IGP, the community setting, the subsidising organisation and the project participants. The intersection of these features with gender, race and class, was taken into account for data collection.
The Mfuleni project site that initially started out as a pilot study on IGPs became my first project case; and it is discussed in Chapter 6. The fieldwork for this study started in 1997 as part of the proposal development for the larger study. It thus coincided with the initial policy formulations during the transitional period from apartheid to democracy; one that was characterised by major policy shifts and by minimal gendered policy research and study. Policy documents developed during this period articulated a strong emphasis on the RDP by including RDP goals and also new constitutional changes. They culminated in a number of sectoral Green and White Papers from the Departments of Health, Welfare, Housing, Education, Water and Forestry. Due to the economic crisis and also due to the growing need to provide employment to the population, job creation and income generation initiatives were placed high on the priority lists of government, NGOs and corporates. As mentioned, the Mfuleni site was the first case that was investigated and, being the pilot phase, two gender-specific IGPs — a brick making project for males and a sewing-project for females — were purposively selected. The implementation of these projects was facilitated by the Western Cape Community Partnership Project (WCCPP), a partnership formation between higher education institutions, community health forums and citizens.

This pilot phase followed the standpoint of the targeted project community (namely, participants and beneficiaries, in this case previously unemployed women and men) and explored four different participant views on partnership formation and project implementation. The key informants were staff and management, who represented the involvement of human resources at different levels of project functioning; and one male and one female participant from the projects. My primary concern at the early stage was to explore the local community context and gender implications of organisational policy goals in relation to participants’ project experiences. The goal was to understand IGPs within an organizational context, the implementation process, and the role of new policy structures (namely, partnership relations) that were manifested in contemporary policy service delivery.

The evolving research process therefore assumed that the collection of data and its analysis were interwoven processes (Gilgun, 1994; Ragin, 1994) that corresponded closely with grounded theory approaches to qualitative case study research. Data analysis and ethical considerations were activities that continued throughout the pilot case inquiry. Grounded theory methods enabled me to make sense of data through coding, content analysis and assessment; and through the establishing the nature and quality of collected data. These
activities helped to validate the appropriateness of my role as a feminist researcher while observing the emerging research process of the case study. It also helped to identify the important effect of the group and community context on project data; something that impacted on my planning and changed the strategy for future data collection. The methodology of grounded theory further assisted to scan for emerging concepts related to my project scope; one that specified income generation policies, programmes and partnerships as significant components.

My first step in planning for further data collection was to systemise the conversion of the mass of data into a manageable format (deciding on transcripts for interviews, writing up the memos, field notes and minutes). I used the constant comparative method to develop codes for specific variables to gain understanding of the conceptual issues and themes (Gilgun, 1994:140; Glaser & Strauss, 1967; Strauss & Corbin, 1990). The constant comparative method associated with grounded theory follows a process of developing categories, concepts and broader themes inductively from data; and by then testing these constantly by returning to the data to assess their fitness and appropriateness (Gilgun, 1994: 120).

For the pilot phase involved two gender-specific projects – one for men and one for women, both implemented by the same organisation, I reviewed a limited sample of four transcripts, scrutinising the questions asked and responses received through a process of open coding (Strauss and Corbin, 1990: 61) to produce the provisional concepts that matched all the interviews. Open coding is the process of breaking down, examining, conceptualising and categorising data (Corbin, 1990: 61); and of sourcing adequate procedures to compare the meaning of each response with related responses until the properties or characteristics of the concept become evident and saturated and no new ideas emerge (Mizrahi & Abramson, 1994:140). Preliminary data categories and findings were extrapolated and contrasted with descriptions in the preliminary literature review. Emerging data categories, patterns or themes that related to concepts found in the PEOC perspective formed the basis for my later decision to change the pilot data collecting instrument. I adapted the structured nature of the interviewing schedule to a general, standardised topic list with broad themes that were suitable for interviews with all project participants (namely, staff and beneficiaries).

At this point, the sample case served to validate initial assumptions about the unit of analysis (namely, the community and organisational partnership context of project settings) and also the selected target groups of project participants (see chapter 6 of this thesis). Given the time
constraints, studying the Mfuleni case further assisted to realign the focus of the adopted approach to research the voices of beneficiaries’ perspectives (Kitzinger, 2004). Through this reorientation, I reconsidered my initial data collection strategy of conducting in-depth interviews, by combining them with the focus groups of the next round of cases before the individual in-depth interviews. This gave subjects, mostly disempowered poor women, the opportunity to voice their concerns as a group collective; and these helped to structure the questions and themes I would raise in follow-up interviews with staff. I assumed this process would provide valuable insights for the dynamics of the policy research process, in terms of not only who to speak with, but also in terms of when to speak to users of services; and thereby standardise my data collection strategy and research questions, resulting in a more productive data collection for the second and third cases.

By the end of the data analysis phase of this pilot study, in 1997, the White Paper on Social Welfare (Department of Welfare, 1997b) was legislated and the National Government had already planned and implemented a new policy initiative (namely, the National Department of Social Welfare (NDSW)’s National Flagship Demonstration Programme: Developmental Programmes for Unemployed Women with Children Under Five ). These policy projects were constructed with particular gender awareness; and they constituted 20 projects across all nine provinces, with all project having to be launched by the Department of Social Welfare during the 1997-1998 fiscal year. The programme received wide publicity and was to become a major State policy initiative, using poverty relief funds over the next four financial years, to illustrate the state’s commitment to promoting the global idea of DSW (Midgley, 1996).

The implementation of the initiative was later accompanied by a national call, inviting civil society to a national dialogue with the Department of Social Welfare at a policy conference in October 1998, entitled Developmental Social Welfare Services – A southern African solution national policy conference. The symposium was used as a platform to present the preliminary findings of my pilot study that later became the first project case, discussed in Chapter 6. The preliminary findings of this conference provided further opportunities for direct observations of the newly established, state-initiated, flagship, income generation partnership of the Bekkersdal community in Gauteng. This visit was organised by the Gauteng Provincial Department of Social Development; and it formed part of the conference field visitation programme of the new policy initiatives and social partnerships (namely, that the national Department of Social Welfare was engaging with) showcasing the new policy direction of the
democratic government. The preliminary results of my first project case included a review – of existing literature on similar policies and projects in different international contexts, as discussed in Chapters 3 and 4; and my conference presentation formed part of a panel that stimulated lively debate on the successes and failures of IGPs in certain of these contexts. This debate and also the fact that the state’s national partnership demonstration programme was in an early stage of evolution, directly influenced both my follow-up research design; and also my decision to redefine the research scope and questions to address the national DSW programme within a regional, Western Cape, context.

For these reasons, I purposively selected the two Flagship Projects (namely, one in Beaufort West and one in Philani, Crossroads) (see chapters 7, 8 of this thesis), as documented in Chapter 8). The newly designed, pro-poor, DSW policy programmes laid claim to a unique, gender-sensitive developmental approach; and stimulated my feminist curiosity to explore how the national process of partnered relationship with State involvement evolved at community project level. Thus, the DSW initiatives, through Flagship Projects initiated in two community settings, became an obvious choice for further case selection and sampling.

After concluding the pilot phase and publishing the preliminary results of the pilot case, the next phase involved extensive changes to my multi-case design of the study; and to strategies for data collection and analysis over the following years 1999 – 2001. Table 5.1 below outlines the process and the timeline of research activities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Steps</th>
<th>Research activity</th>
<th>Output</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1.    | Define the research questions | 1995 – 1997:  
  - Conceptualised the pre-proposal using constructivism and naturalistic case inquiry methods as guidelines; problem formulation; outline of the research questions; negotiation of access; data collection; data analysis; data validation; preliminary findings; reporting; and exiting |
| 2.    | Select cases and determine data gathering and analysis techniques | 1997 – 1998: Finalised research proposal and focus  
  - 1997 – 1998: Developed the pilot study, Case One, purposive sampling (namely, direct observations, in-depth interviews); theory and data analysis; preliminary findings; policy conference presentation in October 1998 |
### 3. Plan for the collection of data

- Case One: April – May 1997; October 1998
- Case Two and Three: June – October 1999; January – May 2000

### 4. Collect data in the field

- Case One: June – July 1997
- Case Two: June – December 2000

### 5. Evaluate and analyse the data

- Case One: July 1997 – 2000
- Case Two: July 2000 – 2003
- Cross-case analyses: 2004; 2010; 2011

### 6. Prepare and write the report

- 1998: Draft pilot case study report; literature review; preliminary findings before selecting second case
- 2004: First full draft research report
- 2010 – 2011: First and second draft of dissertation
- 2012: Third draft of dissertation

[Source: Soy, 1997]

## 5.5 Participants

The population of the study was concerned with multilevel project participants (namely, beneficiaries, fieldworkers, project co-ordinating staff and managers) who participated in the new policy structures; with those who interacted with new policies, programmes and development project services at this time. Initial data collection started with a preliminary proposal in 1996, two years after the new democratic dispensation. Initially, four different development institutional settings were identified for informal conversations and
consultation; and to gain access to participants in potential research sites. These ranged from the State (namely, local and provincial) to the parastate; and from the voluntary and non-profit sector to the corporate sectors, within the broad field of welfare and development. As partnership initiatives between the new democratic State and other stakeholders referred to in newly drafted social policy legislation (WPSW, 1997) were new and evolving, very little information and research existed as to how these new relationships, structures and processes were formed, implemented and replicated at community and project levels. Information on IGPs from a social work perspective, linking them with partnership, was virtually non-existent (Green, 2012; Minnaar-Mcdonald, 1995).

In my view, from a gendered social work and feminist perspective, an investigation into these new ways of working; and into the social relations that were forged with the initiative by the democratic State to build partnerships enhancing the newly conceptualised project social service delivery approach, were exciting. Given my interest to understand and explore how macro social policy was implemented at local grassroots community levels, I was concerned with collecting data: at multiple levels and intervals; from the different policy-making partner institutions (namely, the state, civil society and NGOs); from project staff or participants (namely, directors, managers, administrators and fieldworkers); and from beneficiaries (namely, women and men). Pre-encounter meetings held in April 1996, between me, as researcher, and potential stakeholders (namely, PAWC and parastatal Kagiso Trust) preceded the conceptualisation of the broader study. My main motivation was to test their understandings of the new policy expectations of working in partnership with each other, as civil society organisations CSO, with the new democratic government. My key focus in the informal conversations was to establish whether there was a need for research on the IGPs. These informal discussions solicited inspiring participatory support for my study; and so encouraged me to proceed with my preliminary proposal (Minnaar-Mcdonald, 1997); and with the formal letters requesting permission to do the research.

Information in the tables below shows information about the participants in the case studies. A total of 31 participants from three community settings responded, at various intervals of data collection, over the period of study.
Table 5.2: Summary of participants for Case One – Mfuleni (1997)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Position within project</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Home language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Participant in sewing group</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>Xhosa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Participant in brick making group</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>Xhosa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Project co-ordinator (namely, a paid staff member)</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>Xhosa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Project manager (namely, a paid staff member)</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total N = 4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5.3: Summary of participants for Case Two – Beaufort West (2000 – 2001)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Position within project</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Home language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>Xhosa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>Xhosa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Xhosa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Drop-out (namely, a former participant)</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Drop-out (namely, a former participant)</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Afrikaans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Position within project</td>
<td>Name of group</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Mpumalanga</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Mpumalanga</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Mpumalanga</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Mpumalanga</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Siyazama</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Siyazama</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Siyazama</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Siyazama</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Phambili</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Participant</td>
<td>Phambili</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Field worker (namely, paid Philani staff member)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Project manager (namely, paid Philani staff member)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total N = 12

Table 5.4: Summary of participants for Case Three - Crossroads (2000 – 2001)
5.6 Sampling

My sampling approach at the beginning of the project was purposive. As my project explored IGPs as they were conceptualised and used in new policy documents during the reform context, I targeted such projects. Special employment projects that satisfied descriptions of job creation and of IGPs; and catering for unemployed or under-employed women and men, were selected from different institutional settings featuring partner relations and included as project cases (namely, the unit of analysis). The broad preliminary criteria used are the following:

- National development NGO agencies with a diverse, mainly international, donor funding base; having been in existence for about five to fifteen years; and having implemented IGPs or micro-enterprises for rural or urban women and men;
- National, conventional voluntary welfare organisations, reliant on government aid, who were undertaking IGPs;
- Post 1994 job creation projects associated with the RDP and with policy implemented by national, provincial or local government, who had high percentages of previously unemployed participants, both women and men;
- Special employment IGPs; or micro-enterprises that were established along RDP partnership lines and supported by the local corporate sector.

My reasons for developing these broad four criteria were twofold. Firstly, to begin to circumscribe the target population; and to understand the unit of analysis of partnership project cases in spatially defined community contexts, implemented within a set time period (post-1994). And, secondly, to define the initial scope of the project. This needed the critical investigation of assumptions about social development, welfare, care, work creation, empowerment, skills development, income generation; and also of the role of women and gender in development.

While starting with a sample or pilot case that was purposively selected, my overall sampling approach resonated more closely with the theoretical sampling approach recommended for grounded theory generation (Gilgun, 1994; Glaser & Strauss, 1967:45-60; Ragin, 1994:99-101; Strauss & Corbin, 1990:17). In theoretical sampling, successive cases are chosen if they are likely to advance the development of findings. The selection and type of case, to begin with, depends on the research question.
In my pilot phase, I was more concerned about the nature of IGPs. To develop this understanding, I posed the following questions:

- What is this [policy phenomenon] a case of?
- How is the operation addressing poverty reduction and gender?

This led to several sub-questions:

- What are IGPs?
- Are they the same as micro-enterprises, small-scale enterprises and micro-industries?
- Are they work-fare (namely, welfare-to-work) programmes or self-help strategies?
- What variety or range of skills did they offer?
- Did Developmental Social Welfare Flagship Projects deliver on their goals of new job creation projects and of implementing effective labour absorption strategies for the unemployed, with particular focus on poor women?
- Did IGPs lead to effective strategies for empowering Black women and by including them in the formal, paid labour force?
- Did race, gender, class, ability or age play a role in the design of projects?
- How was empowerment defined, and from whose perspective? Would it be considered social and economic empowerment to fulfil the need for integration into different sectors of the whole South African economy?
- How did the proposed training and empowerment components challenge the status quo and the gendered division of labour in the formal economy where Black women were largely excluded?
- What assumptions, if any, did these projects make about care; and to what extent was this gendered?
- How could the EOC framework be used?

Overall, my questions expressed an overt interest in dialogue. I was interested in listening to participants and users directly by the projects; those traditionally afforded minimal opportunity of accessing their citizen’s rights to State their needs and views. The sub-questions above emerged after reviewing the literature that I considered important for delineating the scope of my deeper investigation.

The sub-questions clearly marked the complexity of my initial exploration, suggesting a diverse range of issues that I was about to confront because my focus in the pilot phase was
not yet clearly defined. The reality of theoretical sampling, as I learned through the developmental phase, is that, researchers continue to choose cases either very similar or very different to the first case study until they find no new information. They may, however, never reach absolute theoretical saturation. My findings after the first project case were thus preliminary and open-ended; and open to the possibilities that the following case would challenge the existing constructs. If following the approach of grounded theorists, one can, however, reach a point where you are reasonably confident that you know enough to warrant no further selection of new cases (Gilgun, 1994: 117; Mizrahi & Abramson, 1994). The findings produced using this sampling approach is called pattern theory; also described as hypotheses arranged horizontally. Pattern theories are context specific and can be used to account for dominant and rare patterns (Gilgun, 1994). My selection of successive cases (Case Two and Case Three) defined my scope to DSW and its link with partnerships, IGPs and the educare component; and concurred with the above theoretical sampling process. Overall, this scope was narrowed to an in-depth examination of three participating community case settings, namely:

- The Beaufort West Vegetable Garden project, a Developmental Social Welfare Flagship project for women in a semi-rural setting;
- The Mfuleni brick laying project for men and the Mfuleni sewing project for women in an urban or peri-urban setting;
- The Philani Screen-printing project, a Developmental Social Welfare Flagship project for women in Khayelitsha and Crossroads, an urban or peri-urban setting.

All three projects were established through partnerships prescribed by new WPSW (1997), that is, those between NGOs, NPOs, community-based organisations (CBOs), government and local citizens. They shared several common features in terms participating partners, organisational policy goals, type of project, time established, location, type of production activity, budget, number of participants, and income or savings generation. These features are displayed in the table below.

### Table 5.5: Sample of project cases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implementing organisation</th>
<th>Case One</th>
<th>Case Two</th>
<th>Case Three</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Implementing organisation</strong></td>
<td>The WCCPP, with the Mfuleni Community Health Forum and community self-help</td>
<td>The state (namely, PAWC Social Services Department and the Beaufort West local government), the RDP</td>
<td>The Philani Nutrition Centre, the state (namely, PAWC Social Services Department) and local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partners</td>
<td>Forum, NGOs and local women</td>
<td>women from Crossroads and Khayelitsha</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher education institutions, State and community groups, individual unemployed women and men</td>
<td>The state (namely, provincial and local government, NGOs, community groups and individual women</td>
<td>The State (namely, PAWC Health Department), NGOs, community groups and individual women</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy</td>
<td>Partnership-building and gender-specific community development</td>
<td>Partnerships and gendered DSW; as one of two regional Flagship Projects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goals</td>
<td>To develop a model for health personnel in the Education and Development Health Service; Community development; and Self-reliance.</td>
<td>To pilot National Flagship Policy as an RDP initiative in a semi-rural context; To provide and facilitate employment and skills' development opportunities for women and their children younger than six years; To break the cycle of disadvantage and poverty; and To reduce these women's potential dependency on the State.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Type of project</td>
<td>Community-based brick making project for men; Masibonisani Sewing Group Project for women</td>
<td>Community-based vegetable garden, Agricultural Production Flagship Project Masakhe Group.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Location
Urban township; Mfuleni, Western Cape; 35 kilometres from Cape Town CBD
Semi-rural; Beaufort West, Western Cape; 600 kilometres from Cape Town CBD
Peri-urban informal settlements
Crossroads/Khayelitsha, Western Cape; 25 kilometres from Cape Town CBD

Production activities at time of study
Brick making; Garment production
Primary activities:
Vegetable and lucerne cultivation;
Poultry and egg farming;
Bee farming
Secondary Activities:
Production of hand-painted and screen-printed fabric, paper and beading work

Number of participants at the time of study
Brick making: 5 males; Sewing: 8 females
10 males
Phambili: 10 females;
Mphumalanga: 12 females;
Siyazama: 11 females;
Total: 33

Size of budget
< R50 000 per annum per group
> R50 000 per annum
> R50 000 per annum

Savings component
None
Minimal
30% of all sales

All three production related project establishments experimented with the new State policy emphasis on partnerships; and all were trying to meet the requirements by establishing community-based IGPs, targeting unemployed small groups of grass roots women and men to become users or beneficiaries. In terms of focus, the women who participated in the State initiated Flagship Programme (namely, Cases Two and Three of this study) were mothers of children under six years of age, receiving some public assistance in the form of grants (the Child Support Benefit at R140 per month per child). If they were 60 years old or older, they received a pension (namely, approximately R900 per month) in addition to stipends or
income earned from these projects. All projects received donor funds sponsored by government (namely, national, provincial, local or international); by local donors, such as businesses; or by aid organisations. In addition, all met the above criteria for inclusion in my in-depth study; one that later combined purposive with theoretical sampling approaches.

I, therefore, do not claim to have studied the whole spectrum of income generation activities within the public sector and the informal economic sector. Due to the local historical context and political peculiarities of the Western Cape region of South Africa – with the Western Cape currently being the only region where the African National Congress (ANC) is not in power – I am not able to generalise these conditions for the whole of South Africa. I restricted the study to an in-depth analysis of projects initiated in the Western Cape Province during the period from 1994 to 1996; with some projects continuing until 2001. This period coincided with the first five-year policy cycle, the early transition to democracy. At the time of field data collection, the ruling ANC political party shared power, in a coalition arrangement in the Government of National Unity (GNU), with the former rulers, the New National Party (NNP). This coalition arrangement dissolved by 1999 with the first Local Government elections. By 2010, 16 years later, the ruling ANC party had, in the Western Cape, lost substantial votes and seats within the provincial legislature; and it had changed places with the Democratic Alliance (DA), a new coalition opposition liberal political party, that assumed power in this region.

5.7 Strategies and procedures for data collection

Data collection in this multi-case study was implemented in different phases of the study. My first phase, from June to December 1996, drew on Smith and Glass’s (1987) constructivist approach outlining the seven steps that naturalistic enquiries should use in preliminary proposals and plans for data collection, namely: problem formulation; outlining the preliminary research questions; entree and access; data collection; data analysis; confirmation; report and exit.

In the absence of a formal project committee in the first setting, I obtained permission from the governance board to conduct interviews with key informants – project beneficiaries, project leaders and field staff. These interviews were arranged with the help of the project directors or project managers.
Four in-depth interviews were conducted with five persons during May and June 1997. I also performed documentary analyses of policy documents that I had access to as a board member of WCCPP (namely, board minutes, annual reports, business planning documents and research theses) (Chapter 6). The people identified for interviewing were closely associated with IGPs affiliated to the WCCPP in Mfuleni. Two of the five interviewed were employed by WCCPP and three were project participants, or beneficiaries. These interviews took one hour each and were conducted in conversational style based on a structured set of questions (Appendix 2). The interviews proceeded against a background of rampant unemployment, migration and continued economic hardships for most Blacks – especially poor Black women – during the transitional, post-election period in the democratic South Africa.

Two of the main languages spoken in the Mfuleni community were isiXhosa and Afrikaans. However, most of the project participants had a working knowledge of English. Interviews and focus groups were conducted in English, which was a second or third language for all participants.

As mentioned previously, special consideration was given to include different layers of project participants – management, staff, fieldworkers and project beneficiaries – in the sample selection. A key assumption was that gender might influence the participation in the different layers (Goetz, 1996). In the second case study, informants from the beneficiary participant groups were identified for focus group discussions. Within these, participating members having leadership qualities were identified for further in-depth interviews.

To develop a holistic picture of each case, five methods of data collection were employed during all three partnership settings: 5.7.1 Documentary analysis

Key project documents – news clips, television programmes, letters, annual reports and minutes of meetings – were read and analysed. These documents were deconstructed to understand and contextualise gendered policies for this period; and to understand the implications they had on the cases under study. Data on policy planning, implementation and processes was collected at different intervals of implementation.

5.7.2 Direct observation

Direct observation strategies were also used to collect data pertaining to the organisational culture of each participating project. Workshops, project meetings organised by policy-
making State officials, project management meetings and co-ordinating meetings were attended to observe the dynamics and interaction between beneficiary groups, partner organisation staff and State stakeholders. This information was essential to understanding the context within which projects existed. It was thus integral to the study. Comprehensive field notes, diaries and research memos were maintained. These focused specific attention on the direct field observations of the project communities in both the rural and urban spatial arrangements; and on the social relations, including gender relations, of the everyday lives of people involved in the projects. Profiles of the partnership formation process that impacted on the settings in which the projects were operationalised, were also important; and were facilitated by this process. The use of participant observation strategies was challenging: I was constantly confronted with the dilemma of being both an insider and an outsider; as the researcher is simultaneously a member of the group she or he is studying, as well as being the researcher doing the study (Babbie & Mouton, 2001: 292; Jorgensen, 1989). Using this strategy has the advantage of providing the researcher with the opportunity of being on the scene of the action (Babbie & Mouton, 2001; Jorgensen, 1989). This was particularly true when I attended project committee meetings as researcher or practitioner social worker, where I asked clarification questions about decisions or actions taken.

5.7.3 In-depth interviews

In-depth interviews were conducted with project participants in a conversational manner in each of the project cases. The first case started off with participant and direct observations, documents and four in-depth interviews. It used a pilot instrument having different sets of open-ended, structured questions for individual participants and organisational representatives (Appendix 1). Key informants included male and female representatives from beneficiary groups, field staff and policymaking managers.

The second and third case settings used a much more condensed interview schedule, or standardised topic list (Appendix 3), combined with personal questionnaires 21(De Vos et al., 2011)(Appendix 4) and focus group questions (Appendix 5), and supplemented with direct observations and policy documents. Respondents closely associated with IGPs (namely, direct beneficiaries, leaders, staff members and project managers), acted as key informants.

---

21 Due to multicase study design I did not use the ‘questionnaires’ as a data set in the way ‘mixed method designs’ discussed by De Vos, et al. (2011) would use them. Identifying particulars (family structure and functioning) relevant for ‘personal profiles’ of group members were extrapolated.
In-depth interviews lasted for one hour. These were recorded in audio. Where necessary, interpreters were called upon during interviews to translate some of the main questions into isiXhosa. Responses in isiXhosa were translated into English.

5.7.4 Focus group discussions

Focus group discussions serve both as a self-contained, qualitative research method and also as a technique that can be used to supplement other methods (Morgan, 1997a). As a self-contained method, they have been used to study new areas of research and to explore well-known research questions; thus giving voice to participants own perspectives. Focus groups, however, require greater attention to the role of the researcher in moderating discussions. My social work academic, interpersonal and facilitation skills as a group worker assisted to a great extent in this role.

In the second and third project, focus group discussions of two hours’ duration were conducted together with structured questionnaires collecting biographical details. To elicit more data, focus group discussions were later complemented by exploring the standardised topics through in-depth interviews conducted with key informants (namely, participant group leaders, field staff, managers and dropouts (Case Two).

5.7.5 Triangulation

Due to the range of different techniques adopted for the collection of the data; and because all research methods have particular kinds of errors, data was verified in each of the different phases of the study by cross-checking through triangulation (Belcher in Sherman & Reid, 1994: 129).

5.8 Case data analyses

In case studies, analysing data involves an iterative, spiralling or cyclical process starting with very general observations and becoming more specific (Creswell, 1998; Ragin, 1994). Data analysis may proceed informally during direct observations and when conducting interviews. It can also be started during the processes of memo writing, transcribing and reading texts should recurring data categories, themes and patterns emerge.

When recording data and available texts, necessary coding procedures, as discussed earlier, are required to reduce the mass of data. This sifting process calls for meticulous
disaggregation and may include the use of data matrices, tables and figures (Miles & Huberman, 1994). In multiple case studies, different cases may represent different findings, for example, the degree of success or failure of the project. Data may also be interpreted by drawing on a variety of ideological lenses, such as the positivist, post-positivist, post-structuralist and feminist lenses.

In order to study the impact and social effects of newly implemented partnership policy structures and processes on subjects, (for example, interacting caregivers and care receivers), I recorded interviews in audio and transcribed the collected data and information. The design of a data matrix, using feminist theory and the PEOC as lenses to code data, was seriously contemplated to capture this information. Tronto and Fisher’s (1990) Political ethic of care theoretical framework (also Tronto, 1996a; 1996b) assisted me in the construction of this data matrix (Appendix 6) for filtering and analysing the data within cases. In the process, normative, value-based, feminist arguments were formed to interpret and establish, or code, important themes linking Molyneux (1985:233)\(^\text{22}\) distinction of strategic and practical gender needs/interests and policy implementation dilemmas, and Frazer ‘s (1989:145) ideas about ‘the politics of needs interpretation’ to ethical theory and the EOC. In so doing, I join others (Brandsen, 2006; Fisher & Tronto, 1990; Edwards & Mauthner, 2002) in promoting a wider application of the PEOC approach; that it be used not only for policy textual analysis (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; 2006), but also as an ethical, empirical research framework (Edwards & Mauthner, 2002) to capture and analyse policy implementation data. To justify why this care logic is relevant and appropriate, I draw attention to the link between gender, care and social developmental concepts in statements about national policy goals during the South African reform context. In the National Policy Guidelines for Implementation of Flagship Projects (1995: 2), the overall aim of the developmental welfare demonstration projects, initiated by the state’s Flagship Pilot Programme that targeted unemployed women in partnership with other stakeholders, was “… to facilitate educational and employment opportunities for women and their children to break the cycle of disadvantage and poverty and reduce their potential dependency on the State”. Four social goals are linked to this broad aim, namely: educational opportunities for women enabling them to provide for the basic needs of their families; development of skills and capacity to enhance social functioning;

provision of social services, in the form of life skills training, to families; and finally the provision of developmentally appropriate educare for children under five, in order to increase their chances of achieving and learning, and based on the principle of inclusiveness (National Policy Guidelines for Implementation of Flagship Projects, 1995: 2).

As caring forms part of the care and development continuum, it was thus included in the democratic state’s social policy process (Developmental Social Welfare Services, 1999; WPSW, 1997); and these goals could to be corroborated with historical and contextual evidence. Arguably, the integrated and interactive phases of the care framework could be viewed as a transactional relationship between caregivers (namely, partnership relational structures or formations) and care receivers (namely, poor women or men) who engage and interact in this caring social policy process (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; 2006; Tronto, 1996b).

In this instance, my multi-case study refers to the empirical, policy implementation realities of evolving caring social processes after 1994; at a time when gender, care and social development policies became popularised and almost mandatory. When applying the care perspective to social policy (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; Tronto, 1996a; Tronto 1996b), the phases of care are: caring about (namely, paying attention to our world in such a way that we focus on continuity, on maintenance and on repairing of our world or environment); taking care of (namely, incorporating the responsibilities taken for actions to keep our world going); caregiving (namely, referring to concrete tasks and hands-on work for maintenance or repair); and care receiving (namely, involving responses to the caregiving process from those receiving caregiving). Hence, the caring process may be directed towards things or towards living beings, such as humans and animals (Fisher & Toronto, 1990). In this instance, I researched caring practices in relation to poor citizens and structures, within a specific policy implementation context (namely, that of partnership and project delivery), at a particular time (namely, the post-apartheid historical reform period).

In order to historicise, contextualise and capture the logic of care as espoused in the preamble of the WPSW (1997), the research process and data matrix illustrated below applied the PEOC as a filter to reduce the mass of data into a manageable form in order to examine, re-examine and redefine social development policy data in terms of its own care logic, caring structures and processes.

Figure 5.1: Matrix for data analysis
Several questions, developed by Toronto (1996b; 1993) and Fisher and Toronto (1990), regarding their conceptualisation of the PEOC and the caring process, were captured in the Matrix (Appendix 6) in order to explore and understand the social impact of policies. Detail is provided on these in the next section below. **5.8.1 Context**

- How are needs perceived in the contextual realm to help define and shape the nature of the caring process?
- What forms of power and privilege reside in the perceived care process?
- What are related factors likely to threaten change in current forms of care?
- What construction of otherness, or difference, contributes to our understanding of these questions?

**5.8.2 Caring about: Attentiveness**

- What care was perceived as necessary by caregivers, as opposed to care recipients?
- What types of care existed?
- Who, in the view of caregivers and care recipients, articulated the nature of needs?
- Who decided which problems must be addressed?
- How should problems be addressed?
- When should problems be addressed?
5.8.3 Taking care of: Responsibility

- Who, in the view of caregivers and care recipients, should be responsible for meeting existing care needs?

- How, in the view of caregivers and care recipients, can and should such responsibility be assigned?

- Why should such responsibility be assigned?

5.8.4 Caregiving: Competence

- Who are the actual caregivers?

- How well can and do they perform their work?

- What conflicts existed between caregivers and their care receivers, or between caregivers?

- What resources do caregivers need in order to care competently?

5.8.5 Care receiving: Responsiveness

- How do care receivers respond to the care that they are given?

- How well does the existing care process meet their needs?

- If care receivers’ needs conflict with one another, who resolves these conflicts?

5.8.6 Conflict and integration of care phases

- What conflicts exist to disrupt integrated and complete care?

- How far apart are caregivers and care receivers?

- How distant are those who hold responsibility from those who give care?

- How is claiming to care about a particular problem connected with assuming responsibility for it; and to paying genuine attention to its outcome as a caring process?

- What conflicts, between those who care about, care for and give care and those who primarily receive care, emerge? Tronto (1996b: 1-26)

5.9 Triangulation: Moving between within and CCA

All research methods are perceived as having particular kinds of errors; and each is considered to have a particular bias. Confirmation of the emerging hypotheses and categories
of themes is a necessary and important step to control error, especially in naturalistic research. By looking across methods and perspectives by triangulation, one is able to minimise some error. The activity of triangulation is, simply defined, the development of multiple sources of data collection to verify information received from respondents (Belcher, cited in Sherman & Reid, 1994: 129). I applied this principle at all times by constantly considering the quality of data generated within each case. The ongoing process of triangulation – by cross-checking inconsistencies in different data sets (for example, questionnaire responses, focus group responses, in-depth interviews, policy documents, minutes of meetings and annual reports) – ensured coherence. Denzin (Cited in Cohen & Manion, 1980: 211) identified six types of triangulation that I found useful for this study:

- Time triangulation;
- Space triangulation;
- Combined levels of triangulation;
- Theoretical triangulation;
- Investigator triangulation; and
- Methodological triangulation.

In order to link triangulation to a more educational orientation, Cohen and Manion (1980:211 listed five instances where it is appropriate:

- When a more holistic view of educational outcomes is sought;
- When complex phenomena require elucidation;
- When different methods of intervention are to be evaluated;
- When a controversial aspect of education – in this case, the social development through adult education, skills training, and income generation – needs to be evaluated more fully; and
- When an established approach yields a limited and frequently distorted picture.

All these instances resonate with my approach to triangulate data in the course of this policy research process.

The fact that my study employed a mixed method and also a multi-layered case data collection strategy meant that it required a varied and combined triangulation strategy. This need was indirectly answered by the chosen sampling approach. I found Ragin’s (1994)
exposition of the relationship between theoretical sampling and triangulation useful when justifying the procedures followed in my own approach. He explained triangulation as a way of using independent pieces of information in order to better understand something only partially known or understood. Theoretical sampling is considered a powerful technique for building analytical frames (Ragin, 1994: 100). Since multiple data sources are relied upon in theoretical sampling, data triangulation was embedded in my general, multi-layered strategy of data collection.

After the first test case, I selected empirical evidence from two additional community developmental settings (namely, one semi-rural, state-initiated vegetable garden project and one urban, informal settlement project) very different to the first (namely, an NGO-driven partnership, generally better resourced in terms of staff, generating more income, and with a better organisational infrastructure). Both of the additional cases displayed very similar organisational challenges to the first case.

5.9.1 Trustworthiness

By triangulating and comparing the three cases, along the continuum of context, time, space, actors, resources and theories (Denzin, cited in Cohen & Manion, 1980: 211), I was able to assess the validity and generalizability of findings from each of the cases and projects (Ragin, 1994: 100).

Through theoretical sampling, relevant concepts could be selected for careful investigation. This led to the identification of patterns of interaction among concepts and to the uncovering of several themes regarding the phenomenon of IGPs; information that could be investigated in subsequent cases.

The final phase of the research process involved an extensive attempt to validate and triangulate the adopted feminist ethical analytical framework by comparing within case and cross-case patterns or themes.

5.9.2 Within case analysis

Within case analysis (namely, detailed write-ups of each case or site), often consists of purely narrative descriptions. These are central to the generation of insights; they help researchers to manage the early stages of analysis of the mass of data that they generate. No standard
formula exists for analysing data at this early stage. Analytical techniques, all procedural steps to intimately familiarise the researcher with the stand-alone entity of the case, that may assist in describing data are: longitudinal graphs, transcripts, tabular displays combined with graphs and sequence analysis to present longitudinal data.

In my own study, transcripts for each project case were produced. The aim of within case analyses was to arrive at patterns in sequences of data collected, at the unique patterns of each case (Eisenhardt, 1989), before generalising across cases. This step of within case analysis provides richer familiarity with each case; and this assist with cross-case comparison.

5.9.3 Cross-case comparative analysis (CCA)

CCA has been described as synonymous with the search for cross-case patterns in data analysis of case study research. It is preceded by doing within case analysis; and it is driven by the perception that people are poor processors of information which may lead them to assume premature, false, wrong or biased conclusions too early. Eisenhardt (1989) mentioned several different reasons for this: limited unsubstantiated data; being overly influenced by vividness, by the dominant elite, or more powerful voices and responses; ignoring basic statistics; and unduly dropping disconfirming evidence (Eisenhardt, 1989: 540). When the purpose of the research is to build, test or try new theory based on case studies, CCA is viewed as pivotal to the overall multiple-case study design and research process. However, it is also regarded one of the most difficult tasks as it is the least codified, resulting in it often not being discussed in case study research.

The key, to sound cross-case comparison that counters bias, is to look at the data in many divergent ways (Eisenhardt, 1989). Four tactics that I used in my study are:

- Identifying data categories, or dimensions, by the constant comparative method and detecting within-group patterns coupled with intergroup differences. This was used in Case One, which was based in Mfuleni (see chapter 6).

- Selecting or identify pairs of cases, listing similarities and differences between each pair. In my study, Case Two, based in Beaufort West, and Case Three, based in Philani were paired (see chapters 6, 8 of this thesis) to detect subtle similarities and differences between them (see Chapter 9 of this thesis). Finally, group cases into threes or fours for comparison. I did this with the two gender-specific male and female IGPs in Mfuleni (see chapter 6 of this thesis), the Beaufort West IGP Flagship
(see chapter 7 of this thesis), and the Philani IGP Flagship (see chapter 8 of this thesis).

- Dividing data into different data sources, such as into policy-related documents; transcripts of interviews; transcripts of focus groups; direct observations in field notes; memos; journals; workshops; and the profiles of participating groups.

Cross-case combing, or the triangulation of multiple data sources, is a tactic that is used to force investigators to go beyond initial impressions by using diverse lenses on data. This improves the accuracy and the fit of theory with data, as well as enhancing opportunity for new findings.

Given the purpose of theory-building from case data and the intent of shaping hypotheses (Corbin & Strauss, 1990; Eisenhardt, 1989; Ragin, 1994), my straddling between within-case analysis and, in the final phase of the process, cross-case analysis, was found to be a highly repetitive, systematic process. It produced relationships, as is common in case-oriented research.

An important last step was the need to systematically compare the emergent analytical frame (namely, PEOC frame) with evidence generated from each project in order to assess the extent to which the theory fitted with case data. The CCA protocol dictates that researchers drawing on this analytical approach compare theory and data iteratively; and with the aim of ensuring that the theory closely fits the data. A close fit is important for building good theory because it takes advantage of the new insights, possible from the data; and so yields an empirically valid theory (Eisenhardt, 1989: 541).

CCA is reported as enabling case study researchers to delineate the combination of factors that may or may not have contributed to outcomes of the case. The objective is to construct explanations as to why each case is either different or the same as others using sense making (namely, the articulation of old or new concepts, hypotheses or theories emerging from original case data). Drawing on the CCA theories of Ragin (1997), Eckstein (2002) and Flyvbjerg (2001, 2006), Khan and Van Wynsberghe’s (2008) ideas on the topic concur with previous writings by Eisenhardt (1989) and Yin (2003) when they argued that CCA can help researchers to understand how relationships may exist between discrete cases; and that this comparison can generate knowledge to test theory.

In terms of being relevant to recommend changes to policy, CCA allows one to compare cases from one or more settings, communities or groups (Khan & VanWynsberghe, 2008); or
even from differing time periods. When used for building or testing theory, some specific steps have been suggested as necessary for shaping hypotheses. These are:

- The sharpening of constructs: a two part process, consisting of redefining constructs and of building evidence measuring the construct in each case, through constant comparison between data and construct; so that accumulating evidence, from diverse sources, converges on a single, well-defined construct.

- Verification: this allows for emerging relationships between constructs to fit with evidence in each case. This is similar to traditional hypothesis testing, except that each hypothesis is examined or analysed for each case rather than for aggregated cases. The underlying logic is referred to as replication logic. In contrast to theoretical sampling as used in traditional hypothesis testing, replication logic is considered relevant in cases confirming emergent relationships as they can enhance the validity of patterns or relationships (see chapters 6, 7, 8 of this thesis). Cases that do not match or that disconfirm patterns provide opportunities to refine and extend the theory. Qualitative data is then considered useful; as a tool to help understand the dynamics about emerging relations by answering questions about why events are happening.

If using CCA to build theories and shape of hypotheses, the strength and consistency of relationships within and between cases must carefully be assessed. One should also look at the evidence and procedures when findings are presented in order to apply their own minds. Khan and VanWyysberghc (2008) went further, by stating that the CCA assists one to learn both from and with cases. The capacity to learn could be enhanced by drawing on four learning theories that validate learning from cases as creative knowledge producers about case study methods:

- Ausubel, Novak and Hanesian’s (1978) cognitive theory of meaningful learning;

- Kolodner’s (1993) case-based reasoning;

- Flyvbjerg’s (2001; 2006) notions of developing expertise from cases; and

- Donmoyer’s (1990) theory of vicarious learning by case knowledge.

All of these are approaches discussed in relation to this learning process (Khan & VanWyysberghc, 2008). By tying learning to CCA, this comparative experience was made an empowering act. The investigator helps to access the personal experiences of others; and to extend these for further application in research. Four advantages accrue to researchers using CCA in this empowering way:

- Case content is made available in easy and accessible forms.
• The practice provides for clustering and representation in visual displays, allowing for comparison by the investigator and others.

• Cases are compared using a method that either focuses on the case or on variables, depending on the goals of the study.

• Findings of the case and the cross-case comparisons are shared with others.

(Khan & VanWynsberghe, 2008:9)

The arguments for the validity and reliability of CCA, as made in the final phase of my study, have not been without controversy. While some authors assess the strengths of CCA as contributing to theory building, others were less optimistic. Some of the tensions in discussions (Eisenhardt, 1989) relate to prior debates within epistemology. These distinguished between deeply contextualised and particularistic case knowledge; and the particular tension that existed between the idiographic (namely, qualitative) and nomothetic (namely, quantitative) research traditions (Khan & VanWynsberghe, 2008). To resolve this dilemma, Khan and VanWynsberghe (2008) remind researchers using case studies to recall the original goal of case studies within CCA (namely, for further illustration, concept and hypothesis development, prediction and emphatic portrayal).

In sum, generalisability appears to be a key issue confronting researchers undertaking case studies using CCA. But, as Khan and VanWynberghe (2008:10) argued,

... it is far easier, and more epistemologically sound, simply to give up on the idea of generalisation. If generalisation is accepted, they should be indeterminate, relative, and time and context bound.

Alternative concepts later emerged in research relating to comparability and translatability. They recommended case study researchers explore multiple forms of generalisation (namely, idiographic, analogical, analytic and naturalistic); and that these should serve as alternatives to invoke rationalisations for researchers to do CCA. Three additional, practical concerns should also be considered: preserving the essence of cases; not stripping context from cases; and selecting appropriate cases to compare.

My multi-case design, with its application of PEOC theory; and its cross-case analysis, in a phased research approach, exploring and comparing the effects of IGPs (namely, as
representations of gender, care and social development policies during a significant reform period), attempted to address all three concerns.
Chapter Six: Caring social development: IGPs and partnerships in Mfuleni, Cape Town, Western Cape

“We were sitting at home and doing nothing.”

6.1 Introduction

The goal of this empirical chapter is to reveal the potential uses or limitations of the PEOC frame and of the matrix I designed based on this to assist with the within case analysis of data collected through multiple sources (namely, in-depth interviews, documentary studies and participant observations), as discussed in the previous methodological chapters. This will help contextualise the project narrative in a particular time. The process of coding data to contextualise and answer specific questions raised by the PEOC approach was, for me, a key challenge.

The project context was set in a policy environment where community health forums and new health partnerships formed the basis of new community-based health structures, as encouraged by the White Paper for the Transformation of the Health System in South Africa (1997). This was achieved by local government engaging in partnership formations, with citizens and civil society and with State health personnel at local community-based clinics, to promote comprehensive primary health care and health service development. Similar to RDP and community policy forums, community health forums were constituted of representatives of the new state, of civil society organisations within communities (e.g. political parties, civic structures, social work services, CBOs, NGOs, business, schools, faith-based organisations and the transport sector). Representatives serving on these forums were democratically elected for a term of one year in office. The community health forum performed the task of a local health governance structure, in partnership with the State and local clinics, to facilitate citizens’ access to equitable and integrated health care. The local, community-based structure fitted in with the state’s idea of a district health systems model (White Paper for the Transformation of the Health System in South Africa, 1997); a model providing for service
delivery by local government, as well as citizens’ buy-in for the changes. The Mfuleni Community Health Forum, an ANC-dominated forum, was constituted in this way; and was instrumental in facilitating local civic and residents’ understanding.

Civil society organisational initiatives, such as the WCCPP, entered the scene at strategically the right time, investing in skills training and capacity building for the implementation of this new service model. The WCCPP is one of seven South African community partnerships, in health personnel education, sponsored by the W.K. Kellogg Foundation. Like its international counterparts, the vision of its local community partnerships was the promotion of improved health status in disadvantaged communities, through developing a model of health personnel education that is community-based (W.K. Kellogg Foundation Report on Achievements of WCCPP, 2000). In 1991, UWC was one of 13 applicants selected to develop proposals to be funded as partnerships. The Peninsula Technikon\(^{23}\) had been unsuccessful in their first application and was instructed to join UWC in initiating a joint proposal: one including the two academic institutions, various provincial public health service providers (Local and Provincial Government) and three communities (namely, Mfuleni, Belhar and Tafelsig/Mitchells Plain). The partnership development was a very slow process and only progressed to full operationalisation in between 1994 and 1999 (Andrews, 2004).

6.2 Historical context of projects in community settings

‘Mfuleni’ is a Xhosa word meaning by the river (Skinner, Rendall & Andrews, 1997). In 1996, when data collection for the study took place, Mfuleni was, by post-apartheid definitions, a relatively young urban African township; one that was established in 1976 during the apartheid years. In separate development/apartheid policy terms, Mfuleni served the interests of the ruling class as a transit camp for resident, urban, working class community members who had been forcibly removed, by apartheid’s Pass and Group Areas Laws, from the adjacent White and Coloured residential areas of Somerset West, Waterkloof and Eerste River. Most of the initial residents were squatting, male contract workers who migrated into the Western Cape Province from different parts of the country, especially from the Eastern Cape (Amoateng, 1997). The settlement developed, from consisting mostly of corrugated iron

\(^{23}\) Peninsula Technicon was later renamed ‘ Cape Town University of Technology ’ (CPUT).
shacks buried in river sands and hidden behind clustered bushes, to being a more integrated township (Skinner et al., 1997) with several amenities.

Most of the migrant families, who were supposed to be temporarily sheltered in transit to Khayelitsha, resisted this move and won the right to live and settle in Mfuleni. By 1997, when data for this case study was collected, the township’s population had grown to an estimated figure of more than 30 000 residents (Amoateng, 1997). Given this phenomenal growth since the 1970s, the majority of the resident population lived in three types of accommodation: formal brick housing structures, more common in the older part of Mfuleni; hostels, both private and municipal-owned); and informal, corrugated iron, shack dwellings. Despite its current township status, Mfuleni witnessed a rapid growth of more corrugated iron, shack dwellings due to increasing urban migration.

More recent community studies attributed this rapid growth to four factors: a growing birth rate; the abolition of apartheid influx controls; internal urban migration from poverty-stricken, previously Bantustan areas; and internal urban migration of people who fled the political violence of other overcrowded township areas on the Cape Flats before the new democratic dispensation (Amoateng, 1997).

6.2.1 Physical infrastructure, location and spatial dynamics

In most townships created by apartheid, these ‘locations’ are situated on the outskirts of the CBD. This is the case with Mfuleni, situated 30 kilometres from the Cape Town CBD. At the time of this study (1997), the area formed part of the former Kuilsriver Magisterial District, an area now called the Oostenberg Municipality. Most of Mfuleni’s main roads are tarred; and residents rely on the mini-bus taxis as a main source of transport in and out of the area (Skinner et al., 1997). Since there is no railway line, locals have to travel seven kilometres to the nearest train station. During the apartheid years, Mfuleni had its own race-based Town Council to oversee segregated provision of basic infrastructural services such as housing, street cleaning and sewage. In 1997, the Cape Metropolitan Council was contracted to provide water and refuse removal. With major restructuring at local government (namely, municipal) level after 1994, and especially during the period 1998 to 2001, Mfuleni, like many other former Black African urban townships, was seriously affected and challenged in terms of being able to provide basic infrastructure (namely, tarred roads, adequate schools
and public facilities); and also in the delivery of basic services (namely, clean, piped drinking water and sanitation) to all citizens.

Initially, as part of post-1994 local governmental reforms, the Cape Town metropolitan area (Metro) was divided into six municipalities, each with a Cape Town Metro administrative system, as follows: Cape Town Central, Tygerberg, South Peninsula, Blaauwberg, Oostenberg and Helderberg. By 2000, these municipal areas were merged to form the ‘unicity’, a single metropolitan area formed of several Cape Town areas grouped together. For a short while, Mfuleni resided under the Tygerberg City Council. Mfuleni is close to Khayelitsha, an informal settlement with many formal town features like modern, commercial shopping facilities with predominantly South African residents racially categorised as Black African. Very few ‘coloured’ residents live there. It is also located adjacent to the relatively new residential area of Malibu, in Blue Downs; an area previously earmarked for lower to middle-income Coloured residents.

Mfuleni is currently described a suburb of the Blue Downs area that forms part of the restructured Oostenberg sub-region now including the former Kuilsriver Magisterial District. From the City of Cape Town’s spatial planning point of view, and as a sub-region, this area is currently targeted for planned socio-economic developments to improve transportation and the building of public schools (Skinner et al., 1997; Cape Town [online]).

### 6.2.2 Civil society organisations

Unlike most other recently resettled communities, Mfuleni appeared to have been slightly better endowed with a range of civil society organisations and resources. These accompanied its growth as a town, cutting across all spheres (namely, education in the form of informal and formal crèches and preschools, and intermediary schools; various small business initiatives; a local primary healthcare centre; welfare structures and NGOs; recreation and sport facilities; a library; community hall; churches; and political parties) providing a range of essential social and recreational services.

Several additional civic structures (namely, the Mfuleni Community Police Forum, the Taxi Association, the Sports Council, the RDP Forum, the Business Association, the Health Forum and the Mfuleni branch of the New Women’s Movement), reflected the level of community relationship building and solidarity that existed around health, development and social relations at the time. In terms of this study, the Mfuleni Community Health Forum, together
with the WCCPP and South African Tuberculosis Association (SANTA), formed a close alliance to address critical primary healthcare issues in the community.

The WCCPP was established as a community-based civic body to facilitate the reconstruction and development process of local needs identification; and to steer the health and community development process.

6.2.3 Special needs and problems experienced by the community

The establishment of the Mfuleni Community Health Forum (1994), together with external help, resulted in a greater awareness of community health issues such as the purification of water, sanitation and other common public health needs; and these received more public attention. With the promotion of the Primary Health Care (PHC) approach, community health workers were recruited and employed by WCCPP and they, together with formally trained health professionals, delivered an invaluable service by educating people about basic primary health care. Access to clean, piped drinking water was improved, with both communal and private taps being installed. Evidence of progress in public health issues was noted in a declining infant mortality rate. In 1995, only four per cent of newborn babies in Mfuleni did not celebrate their first birthdays (Amoateng, 1997:5).

Despite this, the most common poverty-related illness in the community, as in most other townships on the Cape Flats, was still tuberculosis (TB). This killer, yet curable, disease was more prevalent in the informal settlement due to overcrowding, lack of infrastructure, and due to damp experienced during the harsh Cape winter conditions. High blood pressure (namely, hypertension) and diabetes were also on the increase.

Whilst crime had not been as serious problem as in other, bigger and more established townships, there was a growing trend of physical assaults over weekends in the prior months; as well as shocking incidents of child sexual abuse, rape and domestic violence that led to awareness campaigns and to the establishment of the Mfuleni Women’s Group.

Mfuleni is a relatively isolated and poor community with literally no economic resources to meet the employment needs of its residents. Like many other urban Black and Coloured townships on the Cape Flats, the most outstanding feature of this community was its high unemployment rate. Hence the community concern about the two projects to address unemployment.
6.3 Partnership formation and gendered planning

As a teacher of social and community work, a gender activist, a researcher and a Black female academic, I served as a WCCPP board member and represented UWC ‘s interests as a higher education partner involved in community outreach to build partnerships with other stakeholders.. At the time of my study, the academic sector was in the process of overseeing the establishment of a formal governance structure destined to manage partner relationships forged with the state (provincial and local health authorities) and communities (namely Mfuleni, Belhar and Tafelsig/Mitchells Plain). My experiences as a WCCPP board member afforded me the opportunity to study, reflect and review the roles and responsibilities of all actors (namely, civil society and state) involved in these stakeholder relations (namely, partnerships) charged with augmenting and implementing organisational partnership policies on community development.

In terms of the Mufuleni site, the WCCPP was spearheading the project building process. It was part of a broader, national network of seven South African community partnership projects affiliated to the South African arm of Community Partnerships in Health Personnel Education (CPHPE); and so managed to secure sponsorship for five years from an international donor, the US-based W.K. Kellogg Foundation that had networks all over the world (Andrews, 2004).

The WCCPP, as an organizational building initiative, was well supported by leading higher educational institutions (namely, both UWC and Peninsula Technikon were academic partners), as well as by local, community-based, political party formations. The ruling ANC and also the Pan Africanist Congress (PAC) were well-represented on the community health forum structures of all three community partners (namely, Mfuleni, Belhar and Tafelsig/Mitchells Plain).

Linked to its international counterparts, the vision and role of the W.K. Kellogg Foundation – who funded projects at this critical time of policy reform – were regionally expressed as “…promoting health care and health status of disadvantaged communities through the development of a community-based model of health personnel education …” (WCCPP, cited in Andrews, 2004: 41).
The vast experiences of such an international network, I assumed, would influence the monitoring of local organisational partnership practices in terms of progress and outcomes. Large funding proposals, such as for these local country studies, would, I also assumed, be scrutinised by international experts and donors for current ideas and concepts.

The execution of the WCCPP vision in the Western Cape, however, dates back to 1991. Higher education institutions (namely UWC, and later, Peninsula Technikon (Pentech)), joined the partner initiative with various government stakeholders (that is, State public health service providers and provincial and local government) and also the civic health formations of the three communities (namely, Mfuleni, Belhar and Tafelsig (Mitchells Plain)). Their aim was to plan and build an ambitious, intra-institutional partnership structure for changing health education that included sustainable environmental health education issues. The process of partnership development was slow to take off; and only reached full operationalisation during the 1994 to 1999 period (Andrews, 2004). After an expansive period and process of organisation building (Andrews, 2004), community needs identification and proposal development (1991-93), the WCCPP had, by 1994, prior to the White Paper on Health, set out to address five primary goals:

- To strengthen and structure the partnership between communities, educational institutions and health service providers;
- To strengthen the community-base of the health services through the provision of reorientation programmes for the health service and academic personnel, and capacity building programmes for community members;
- To co-ordinate and facilitate the implementation of interdisciplinary community-based education (CBE) for the UWC and Pentech in Mfuleni, Belhar and Tafelsig/Mitchells Plain;
- To establish model academic comprehensive primary health care centres (ACPHCCs) in Mfuleni, Belhar and Tafelsig/Mitchells Plain; and, lastly,
- To support and facilitate sustainable community development activities and programmes to improve health in Mfuleni, Belhar and Tafelsig/Mitchells Plain (Andrews, 2004).

These five goals were to be pursued in three interrelated programme areas: health personnel education and development; health service development; and community development. The implementation of community development in Mfuleni referred specifically to IGPs and
programmes based on identified community needs, as well as to the improvement of community health development structures (Andrews, 2004).

The WCCPP assumed overall financial responsibility on behalf of the donor: it accepted full organisational responsibility for the disbursement of funding and the way in which the implementation of community projects were functionally operationalised. This organisational caregiving responsibility – of overseeing attempts to satisfy the needs assessed by the community-based structures – raised questions about the overall nature of partnership power relations and its institutional role(s) as a policy service provider and change agent. The partners in this case were quite diverse, consisting of two local institutions of higher learning, the state, community members, and a concentration of professional practitioners. This diversity created unequal power relations that intersected with gender, race and class variables. There were educated, resourceful professionals (namely, academics and practitioners), highly politicised community activists (namely, the Community Health Forum), and the less politically conscious, chronically unemployed project service users (namely, the targeted project beneficiaries), all interacting in this process. The result was dissent about the allocation of financial resources for projects, stemming from decisions supposedly made in consultation with the health forum that was not always aware of the participants’ changing needs. This placed the organisational partner relational model, with its policy emphasis on self reliance to achieve sustainable community development activities through gender specific IGPs, under severe pressure to perform.

The WCCPP was assisted with its gender planning by the local community health forum. Their partnership project work as a caregiving agency – to a care receiving, previously disadvantaged project community – undertook very gender-specific IGPs, thereby placing the organisational understandings of gender and community development directly under the spotlight. Two gender-specific IGPs, one each for men and women, were implemented to address unemployment/poverty.

The partnership ability factors (Fisher & Tronto, 1990), such as time, material resources, knowledge and skill to manage their own social and community development practices through gender-specific IGPs, were placed under the spotlight in this investigation. Limitations of time at the end of the funding cycle in 1999; the biased organisational culture; unequal power relations; and the inability of different partners, especially disadvantaged communities, to cope with the implementation of projects without adequate infrastructure and
assistance, left critical questions about the organisational and partnership policy model that was applied. I argue that the features of the model of partnership that was implemented deserve more critical study.

6.4 IGP project development and implementation

The overall goal of the WCCPP was to develop a community-based approach to improve health in all three communities (Mfuleni, Belhar and Tafelsig/Mitchells Plain). This focus placed undue organisational, social and financial responsibilities on existing vulnerable community-based relational structures that still had to identify and meet their own needs as well. These structures had to decide and prioritise their own basic needs in the absence of other support; and make decisions on how to achieve sustainable development for themselves. They had to do this alongside having to deliver on the healthcare project goals and services facilitated by the WCCPP, an external, donor-driven organisation set up for a limited five-year period. From a community development, process-oriented theoretical perspective (Kirst-Ashman & Hull, 1997), several tensions developed between broader long-term project goals (see above) and short-term time-bound donor related objectives. These tensions exposed an uncritical, ill-informed, short-term, task-centred (Lombard, 1992), health and gendered community development policy path. Backed by supposedly progressive higher education and State partners, as well as international stakeholders in health and development, this policy and project development approach contradicted previous internationally acclaimed research and project studies critiquing similar gender-based approaches (Kabeer, 1994; Moser, 1991; 1995).

The broad community development objective specific to the Mfuleni community was, as stated in the proposals relevant to my research study:

... to implement an income-generating project by July 1995; to develop sewing and brick making skills in at least forty unemployed, which are income-generating. (WCCPP Budget Proposal, 1995)

The need to generate sustainable income, although integral to the establishment of the male and female projects to address unemployment was not ranked as a primary goal, but appeared very low down in the organisational positioning of its five main partnership goals. The
implication of this lower ranking of community development activities was further validated by the small budgetary allocations for community development.

Further objectives specified in the budgetary provisions of organisational documents were concerned with the need to establish a community-based health committee to oversee the two gender specific IGPs (namely, the sewing project for women and the brick making project for men). Electing democratic community health structures in which members from different political affiliations could participate, was however totally underestimated. While achieving this kind of constituency representation was stressed as necessary and important for community development initiatives of all three communities (namely, Mfuleni, Belhar and Tafelsig/Mitchells Plain (Andrews, 2004), establishing democratic representative health forums or committees, took most of the project cycle time allocated for the execution of partnership goals. The next step in the process of organisational development – to develop and execute community development objectives – was thus crucially linked to the need for consensus in establishing formal project management committees and to providing general, as well as specific, training for these task groups. This initiative proved increasingly complex and never materialised.

Having traced the background ideas and types of community development IGPs identified as needs by the participating groups, I will discern and reflect more critically on the practical and strategic needs, problems and complexities of community structures, programmes; and on the relational processes that I encountered in my in-depth study of partnership and social development.

The Sewing Project for women had nine objectives:

- Conducting practical sewing training workshops for those who could not sew;
- Strengthening the skills through advanced training of those who could sew;
- Developing business and marketing skills to strengthen the cooperative;
- Establishing a formal management structure;
- Conducting training for the management structure;
- Providing general and specific training for the committee (e.g. on financial skills and roles);
- Maintaining equipment;
• Providing sufficient security measures; and

• Facilitating learning opportunities for students from UWC and Pentech to run support groups for women.

In contrast to these, the Brick Making Project for men had seven objectives:

• To facilitate the joint venture partnership between Hill, Kaplan and Scott Engineers, a private business; the Mfuleni Town Council; and the Western Cape Training and Cape Town Job Creation centres;

• To supply bricks for the building of toilets in informal settlements;

• To provide ongoing training in business and marketing skills;

• To establish a formal management structure;

• To provide general and specific training for the management committee;

• To develop the group into a cooperative that will be self-sustainable; and

• To purchase and service equipment as needed.

Although called IGPs, none of these two projects (WCCPP Budget Proposal, 1995) articulated business plans with clear goals and objectives, nor did they set targets for income to be generated over this period. The money budgeted for the Sewing and Brick Making Projects, R 23 250 and R 23 785 respectively, was from donations. This was much less than what was spent on other goal activities; and also different to the actual amounts donated that were stated as R 9 380 for the Sewing Project, and R35 400 for the Brick Making Project, respectively. The reason for this discrepancy was that brick making cost a lot more to set up initially.

Capacity building for the implementation of community development tasks was also to be done through training the participants of these two projects in basic sewing and brick making; and in business management skills. Although capacity building was listed as one of the key activities of the initial phase of partnership development, it proved not to be in line with the above-mentioned objectives, as evident in project documents (W.K. Kellogg Foundation, 2000).

The WCCPP facilitated the setting up of the Masibonisane (namely, meaning, show each other) Sewing Group that was to recruit, train and empower women to generate income to relieve poverty. They recruited two women from the community, one of whom was already
involved in a home-based sewing venture, and provided them with advanced training in business management skills. These women, in turn, had to train others in sewing skills. Approximately one hundred women were trained in the project (W.K. Kellogg Foundation, 2000). Capital was donated for ten electronic sewing machines and an over-locker machine. Trainees were requested to pay a R50 membership fee to cover the cost of material and accessories. The group was given working space and their activities involved pattern-making, design, cutting, stitching and operating the electronic machines. No significant marketing of products was done in a formal business sense; and participants were expected to wait for payment until their produce had been sold.

In the brick making project, approximately fourteen men were trained, but only six were employed by the WCCPP and provided with the necessary equipment, material and a shed as workspace. They secured a contract with LTA Construction to deliver 40 000 bricks per month for local use to upgrade single-dwelling hostels. However, they were unable to fulfil their commitment to the contract; and so participants were forced to sell to the public, and were expected to wait and see whether their products would be sold before they could receive any remuneration.

My investigation corroborated the organisational policy goals and objectives as articulated in project documents and donor evaluation reports; and against the narratives of the subjects, male and female beneficiaries and staff. These narratives were obtained through interviewing a purposive sample of four key informants (namely, respondents). The interviews focused on how the need for income-generating activities and projects (namely, sewing for women and brick making for men) were decided upon (namely, the project history and recruitment); and provided key insights into the critical, contextual realities of these project communities. Based on gender and community development theory (Leavitt, 2003), my analysis of the organisational partner initiatives (namely, those supporting and facilitating sustainable, replicable community development activities and programmes), presented a very different picture to the available documented evidence (Andrews, 2004). By using the lens of PEOC I construct a holistic representation of the complexities involved in policy implementation in gender planning.

What became clear in my investigation of participants positions within this project is the fact both male and female subjects perceived their role and functioning differently due to their holding different hierarchical power roles within the project; and that this resulted in conflict.
and in the isolation of the more powerful voices (namely, the WCCPP project manager and fieldworker. I elaborate further on this in my application of the EOC frame in the discussion that follows.

6.5 Applying the PEOC approach

The investigation of implemented IGP policies; and the Mfuleni partnership policy structure and social relations process that unfolded within, and between, different phases of community development process and products, was a significant policy experience to record, given my background as a board member and the researcher. My study of IGPs took account of different histories and perspectives of multiple stakeholders involved in the policy implementation process that evolved in Mfuleni. The practice realities and the complexities of the unequal power relations were observed and became exposed through individuals and through the local partnership process and structures responsible for executing decisions and policy actions.

Fisher and Tronto (1990) introduced four components of the care perspective with corresponding principles to assist with evaluating good care. These served as an important guiding principle to reread and analyse the aforementioned case data. As such, it will be discussed as a prelude to further discussions of cases. My analytical task considered, and integrated into different phases in my study, all four components of the caring process as described by Fisher and Tronto (1990), namely: caring about, or attentiveness; taking care of, or responsibility; caregiving, or competency; and care receiving, or responsiveness.

6.5.1 Attentiveness (caring about)

Caring about presupposes the value of attentiveness (Fisher & Tronto, 1990). In terms of attentiveness, care is validated as a need that has to be met. Caring about thus requires the moral quality of being attentive to the needs of others. Questions flowing from this moral principle are:

- What needs for care exist?
- How are needs perceived?
- Who determines what a need is? And,
- How is a need defined?
In the case of Mfuleni, the WCCPP was a socially constructed partnership relationship – between the community, academics, the city and the State – that identified community development needs; and the need to address poverty, unemployment and job creation through gender-specific IGPs. My participation as a WCCPP board member granted me insider knowledge (Jorgensen, 1989) about partnership relationship building. Based on my review of IGP literature (see chapter 3 of this thesis), I concluded that the preliminary within-case analysis of pilot case findings proved the obvious; that the gender specific relations and IGPs I elected to investigate in this partnership formation did not generate the income or the created sustainable jobs they set out to do. They also did not address inequalities in power relations or gender inequality. As such, they seemed to validate most of the trends discussed by feminists in their research on the topic (see chapter 3 of this thesis).

I observed the gender specificity of the WCCPP organisational strategy of, with the approval of the Mfuleni Health Forum, running separate initiatives for the men and women. This practise reinforced a traditional sexual division of labour in terms of income generation activities for men (namely, brick making) and women (namely, sewing) in the Mfuleni community relational context. New partnership structures and partnership building initiatives thus inadvertently continued to conform to conservative patriarchal traditions. In my view, new partner or stakeholder relations and hierarchies led to policy processes and products that were supposed to defy old ways. However, because their organisational policy initiatives typically reinforced stereotypes by implementing separate income activities for men and women (Carr, 1993), this led me to question assumptions about changes in gender relations.

The stereotypical, sexist division of IGPs (namely, brick making for men and sewing for women), concurred with certain of the findings by Carr (1993) and Lyon (1991) in their research on trends in IGPs in Africa. The small size of the budgets allocated; and the low priority ranking – in comparison to the overall health education organisational goals – both contributed to further contradict the vision and mission of the WCCPP (namely, to successfully link health and development with community development); and also concurred with certain of Carr (1993) and Lyon’s (1991) findings. My findings about WCCPP IGPs were that they failed to develop adequate project leadership structures to empower locals; or to generate sustainable income or create decent jobs in the name of community development: this was quite different and contrary to the experiences documented and described in some other evaluative research studies on the same projects (Andrews, 2004; W.K. Kellogg
Foundation, 2000). It would appear that the views of the beneficiaries were not adequately captured or represented in the summative evaluative report that concluded the project. Another very interesting finding was the fact that the participants (namely, staff and beneficiaries), who were active at the time that the projects were in operation and investigated for this study, were not the same individuals who identified the needs during earlier times. This important issue was not even identified or discussed in existing studies.

6.5.2 Responsibility (taking care of)

According to Fisher and Tronto (1990), when needs are identified by the actors (namely, government, local participants or NGOs) and attempts are made to meet them, the problem of what needs exist and how they are met, arises. Taking care of that implies the value of responsibility and assumes that there are actors who will take responsibility for meeting the need.

The four different respondents – were closely connected to past and current experiences of involvement with partnership relationship building and political decision-making processes – were interviewed on how the current project process originated and operated; and their responses. It became apparent that the existing project beneficiaries, at different levels in the hierarchy of decision making, had no knowledge of the project history of partnership building. They had joined the project much later, when recruitment for income generation activities was done. The existing participants were also not the same individuals who initially participated in the earlier planning stages and needs identification of the project. The present care receiving project beneficiaries had particular expectations (namely, to successfully implement the project for empowerment, skills development and income); and they felt alienated from the decision-making processes, especially from financial decisions that impacted on the project. Their voices became more explicit when asked about their reasons for joining the project, with individual responses ranging from wanting to establish a more formal working group (for example, individual women sewing on their own, coming together as a collective); to learning new skills (namely, marketing, pricing and sales); to increasing their current income.

When the leader of the women’s sewing group was asked about how she was recruited, she said:
We were sitting at home and doing nothing and we came here to talk to T... [a fieldworker] about what we can we do, so he talked about CPP [Community Partnership Project].... We were not working. (Female leader of Sewing Group, Respondent 1)

When I probed the view of ‘doing nothing’, she made the following statement:

*I was sewing at my house on my own and we talked to other people to make a group.*” (Female leader of Sewing Group, Respondent 1)

In contrast, the response by male subjects of the brick making project, on the same topic, revealed the following:

*Well, T... [a fieldworker] invited me, they were already in the project and he invited me to come and join them.* (Male leader of the Brick Making Project, Respondent 2)

When asked how they selected specific work activities, it appeared that sewing was already an existing activity done by individual women at their homes, while brick making was a new activity identified by the need to supply bricks to the local contractors involved with housing construction in the community.

The income-generating activities of these projects were undertaken with the support of WCCPP’s paid project staff. However, the broader organisational aims and objectives, and its link to health educational development, were not clearly translated to the current participants. Only one (namely, the male fieldworker and a member of staff) out of the four respondents could explain the historical background of IGPs; and how the selection of activities (namely, brick making and sewing), came about in line with the broader WCCPP aim of partnership building. This male fieldworker, a local activist, had the responsibility of coordinating the projects. He was recruited to become part of the initial partnership team that undertook the needs identification and the gender specific project planning process. He vividly recalled the history and partnership relations building process. He remembered how representatives of the community (Community Health Forum), together with faculty-based staff members and students from the Faculty of Community and Health Sciences at UWC, negotiated the donor-funded (namely, W.K. Kellogg Foundation) CPP idea of working with communities to assess their needs.
The current beneficiaries and also the acting project manager, lacked knowledge about the history of the partnership; about the community development goals; and about the past consultation and decision-making processes. This greatly impacted on their progress towards becoming vibrant self reliant entities, as voiced by the statements below:

*I don’t necessarily know the history of the project... I don’t know how they [referring to the group in the Mfuleni community] decided on sewing as an activity... I mean, I think it is basically the people in Mfuleni that said they need a sewing group.* (Female Project Operation Manager, Respondent 3)

*Okay, first there was the interview. At that time, I was also the Health Forum member. I was then informed by my... organisation, South African Communist Party. What happened was, at that time, Professor Edith Vries, came to Mfuleni, to speak to the Health Forum about the idea of the partnership. We could not speak for the people of Mfuleni. We then agreed to do a survey with the help of students from UWC. People from Mfuleni, especially ANC activists, assisted students with the survey. That is where the decision about the needs of the people comes from.*

(Male fieldworker, Respondent 4)

In the case of these two projects, a male fieldworker was assigned direct responsibility to co-ordinate the projects. There was a female manager tasked with supervising his functioning in support of the project; and tasked with spending the WCCPP budget allocations. Both had little experience or training in running either a co-operative or a business. Although academic partners were involved in the partnership formation and were represented at board level, no commerce students from these institutions were recruited or placed within these projects to support the management of these groups. Yet, one of the key goals of the WCCPP (2004), at the time of conceptualising the business proposal was:

*To co-ordinate and facilitate the implementation of interdisciplinary, community-based education (CBE) for the University of the Western Cape (UWC) and Peninsula Technikon (Pentech) in Mfuleni, Belhar and Tafelsig/Mitchells Plain.*

(Andrews, 2004: 42)
Although both groups were informed that financial assistance would be short-term, and that projects would have to become self-reliant within a five-year period, projects took a long time to get off the ground and faced extremely difficult conditions which were not resolved by access to project support staff.

Participants’ perceptions on the ownership of the projects; and in the role of the implementing agency staff of WCCPP, appeared to have created a problem of ownership of these IGP initiatives. A wait and see approach developed regarding the CPP, fostered by the organisational approach. Despite the presence of a full-time, salaried fieldworker, neither of the projects was able to establish a project management structure or committee, a structure that could have been an important vehicle to secure sustainability of the initiatives. As a consequence, financial responsibility was shifted to the community self-help groups, without adequate preparation and training.

6.5.3 Competency (caregiving)

Caregiving is linked to the value of competence. It refers to the actual practice and work of caring by caregivers in relation to care receivers; hence the integration of the thinking and doing of care as a practice (Fisher & Tronto, 1990). In this view, the person, people or group providing caregiving, may not be the same people or institutions who cared about the need (namely, for care), in the first instance. However, since they are responsible for the actual physical work of caring, there is a moral question about whether or not care work is done well. The issue of competence becomes a serious moral question.

Without the assessment of management skills (namely, a skills audit of leadership and entrepreneurial acumen; accounting skills; economics; income generation; marketing and appropriate planning), these projects were destined to fail the objective to develop communities and individuals.

Perceptions by participants with regards to availability of resources, such as financial resources as per the project budget, revealed a lack of access to information; and also a lack of understanding of budgetary planning processes. There was also the problem of role confusion in of the transparency and accountability of WCCPP staff.

WCCPP, as an affiliate of a national and global NGO network of policy implementers, collectively helped to shape and influence the new South Africa transitional legislative scope;
and also the rules and procedures for funding of health development projects (White Paper on Health, 1994). Their roles as a partnership and an NGO were manifested in the intermediary tasks and responsibilities that project staff performed; they assumed powerful hierarchical caregiving roles as the project implementation processes progressed. However, staff of WCCPP lacked the experience, skills and, at times, the capacity to manage policy. That this was experienced, not only in terms of gender consciousness (namely, with uncritical gender and development initiatives), but also in the specialised area of IGPs, was clearly evident in the different experiences of project activities failing to deliver on project objectives, especially on jobs and income. In narrating her limited knowledge of the project’s origins, the female project manager, a qualified social worker, tells of a lack of organisational preparedness to learn to care competently; and of the need for more in-depth study in the specialised area of the role of partners in their policy approaches:

These projects were conceived as income-generating but it was not made clear as to whether it was meant to be a co-operative or whether it was going to be run along business lines. So, with the introduction of the RDP, and, you know, the expectations of business plans, everybody comes and says that’s the way to go. But once again, within the project we lack the capacity. I mean, I have worked in a co-operative before, but it is not my area of expertise, and so basically, I come in to do a common-sense thing. So we get people, I mean, part of the problem is that fieldworkers, their role changed from what was envisioned. Initially, it was one of interfacing with community, getting community on board – the partnership process. And the way we – as management – want fieldworkers to work is much more as a co-co-ordinator, to facilitate development in projects. And what we find, to a large extent, is they lack both the skills and ability to actually do that.

(Female Project Manager, Respondent 3)

With reference to the work needed in the Mfuleni gender-specific, sex-segregated IGPs, the management perception of the competencies and role of the male fieldworker, as co-ordinator, is even more poignant:

So you see T...'s [the fieldworker] job is to organise training for the sewing group. That is both on a technical side – basic sewing and advanced sewing – and to facilitate and contract people to come and do training. He does not have...
the ability to actually see where this is going; how things fit together, how to move forward and how we need to implement these things that people need to have learned by now. And once again, maybe it is about expecting too much from people. (Female Project Manager, Respondent 3)

In assessing the competencies of the agency and resources further, several shortcomings of the project operations became evident. There was a lack of ownership in participants; of adequate resources; of clarity of purpose; of solidarity; of focus on aims and objectives in planning; of time management; of consensus in understanding project goals; and of regular feedback and communication.

The failure to deliver on the key goal of income; together with the sacrifices made by beneficiaries and staff to showcase projects to visitors and donors, were only evaluated in a summative assessment four years later (W.K. Kellog Foundation, 2000). Several claims in the evaluation report\(^{24}\) contrasted sharply with my own findings of this case study. For example, with regards to empowerment, the final report listed the successful implementation of the community projects as part of “… major achievements of the process of partnership building between academics, the health services sector and communities” (W.K. Kellogg Foundation, 2000: 38). These achievements remained questionable as very few academics and researchers engaged with the main constituency (namely, beneficiaries and community members) of the partnership process. At the time of my study, in 1996 – 1997, there was no research or formal, independent monitoring and evaluation, other than the annual project reports by WCCPP staff, to assist with the study. A doctoral study by Andrews (Andrews, 2004) also did not refer to adequate monitoring and evaluation practices or to the above report.

6.5.4 **Responsiveness (care receiving)**

*To be successful, a development project must come at the right time, in the right place and be right for the people for whom it is intended. Too often the view from above, where the project planner or manager sits, fails to comprehend the historical, geographical and social context of a project that may stand in the way of project objectives.* (Salmen, 1987: 72)

According to Fisher and Tronto (1990), care receiving also involves the principle of responsiveness. This value does not assume that the care process is over after caregiving. It takes into account that the object, person or group that received the care will respond to the practice of caring. For as Tronto argues (Fisher and Tronto, 1990), those engaged in the act of caring will have to use that response to determine whether or not care has been completed; smf whether more or different types of care are necessary. Therefore, care receiving raises the moral question of responsiveness.

Given the complexity of the process, actors and relations involved, care as a practice presupposes preconditions of caring activity; ability factors specific to each phase of the process. The most critical of these are time, material resources, knowledge and skill. The balance between them depends on the actors involved over time. And just as the phases of care do not necessarily fit together, ability factors may contradict as well as complement one another. Hence caregivers, usually professionals, may have many skills but no time in which to apply them; and those who really care may have the knowledge, but none of the needed resources. Apart from fragmenting the process and phases of care, these imbalances may result in ineffective and destructive trends in caring activities (Fisher & Tronto, 1990: 41). But, as been suggested, the cause lies not in the patterns of fragmentation and in the imbalances; but rather in the social arrangements (namely, social relations that are clearly gendered) that create them (Fisher & Tronto, 1990: 41). This is why it is imperative to pay attention to the views of both caregivers and care recipients. How each of these actors perceive and interpret needs; and also the mandate given to care in relation to those participating or receiving care, thus becomes imperative.

My study of social relations within and between the different phases of the projects thus took account of different narratives (namely, documents, histories and her-stories, the perspectives of multiple actors or stakeholders involved); as well the practice realities and complexities of the implemented process of health and development, as espoused by the WCCPP and by the Health Policies.

A considerable amount of time and effort was invested in financial and human resources to set up the projects during their three years of operation. The Mfuleni projects had a full-time, salaried, male fieldworker who was responsible for liaison between the two production groups, the local health forum, the female partnership project manager and project staff. Although one of the key project goals was to set up project structures, both groups failed to
either establish formal project committees or appropriate accounting and business management procedures. Marketing and advertising of the production groups and their produce was particularly lacking. While the brick making project generated sustainable income for its few members for a short period at the time of the pilot study, they experienced financial difficulties soon after due to the withdrawal of donor funds. Despite the time and money invested in equipment and sewing skills training, the sewing group did not appear sustainable; but was still functioning against all odds. Problems such as absenteeism and dropouts occurred, due to childcare and family responsibilities. As with the brick making project, there was a high turnover and a limited numbers of participants. This, in turn, affected production as new members first had to be trained. Fewer women seemed committed to trying to survive as a group. Several of those that had received training, had veered off, apparently to start their own individual home-based sewing initiatives. With the funds exhausted at the end of 1999, both the sewing and the brick making groups were left on their own. While other social service projects of the WCCPP were adopted by new funders, the community development, job creation, income generation activities were abandoned and left without any co-operative or project management structures.

The current case study clearly demonstrated the need to clarify understandings of the concept of IGPs as project descriptions; and also the lack of clear distinctions within current social policy discussions due to conceptual confusion.

On the topic of responsiveness to care received by organisational partners or caregivers, the PEOC frame poses several questions corroborating the available evidence. They are:

- How do care receivers (namely, men and women beneficiaries) respond to social development and IGPs, and to care that they were given?
- How well has the care process, as exists through these projects, met their needs?
- If meeting some of their needs conflicted with one another, who resolved these conflicts?

These questions inspired me to find responses which were partially answered by issues raised in conversations with project participants; women and men who were users of the services offered by the projects. These responses are summarised in the Table 6.2 below. In discussion of these, I compared the female and the male projects to uncover a biased, gendered approach to planning and design (Buvinic, 1986; Elson, 1995; Moser, 1993); and also to elicit support for feminist arguments – those about the different terms on which men and women participate.
in development – by which the importance of unpaid care work, and its contribution to development, (Young, 1993) are explained. The Table 6.1 below sets out the categories of data collected for both groups. The same five categories of issues emerged for both women’s and men’s groups, namely project-related, group-related, donor role clarification, membership problems and project needs. The specific issues under membership problems and project needs displayed in Table 6.1 differed between the two groups.

Table 6.1: Gender-specific income generation projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Issue</th>
<th>Sewing Project for women</th>
<th>Brick Making Project for men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Origin</td>
<td>• Origin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Groups</td>
<td>• formation</td>
<td>• formation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• functioning</td>
<td>• recruitment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donor organisation</td>
<td>• role</td>
<td>• role</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Membership problems</td>
<td>• absenteeism (dropouts)</td>
<td>• small scale of operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• interpersonal conflict</td>
<td>• constraints affecting supply, or income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• group dynamics/leadership</td>
<td>• capacity of technology and labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• training and retraining</td>
<td>• resources (for example, electricity, water)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• technology</td>
<td>• leadership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• collective self-help initiatives</td>
<td>• decision-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• variety &amp; complexity of training needs and skills required</td>
<td>• division of labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• division of labour</td>
<td>• budgeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• lack of resources</td>
<td>• financial accounting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• caring responsibilities</td>
<td>• business administration skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• project space problems</td>
<td>• quality control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• literacy and numeracy</td>
<td>• culture, age and gender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• financial accountability</td>
<td>• income and salaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• misunderstanding of project goals</td>
<td>• authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• conflict between work and care</td>
<td>• communication</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


A considerable amount of time and effort was invested in financial and human efforts to set up the two community-based projects in Mfuleni during the period 1994-1999. Like the projects in two other communities, these projects had a full-time male fieldworker. The fieldworker was responsible for liaison between: project groups, the local health forum, the female partnership project manager and project staff. Although one of the key project goals was to set up project structures, both groups failed to establish formal project steering committees. Appropriate project management practices (for example, accounting, business management, marketing, advertising and pricing) and skills were particularly lacking. The brick making project initially generated more income for its few members and appeared potentially more sustainable. However, the sewing group, despite the time and money invested in equipment and sewing skills training, appeared less sustainable. Many members paid a membership fee; but the problems of absenteeism and dropouts, due to childcare and family responsibilities, resulted in a high turn-over rate with dwindling numbers of women participating. This in turn affected production as new members had to first be trained in sewing skills. Few women could cope with trying to survive as a group with limited income. Due to slow start-up process and lack of sales, several of those that received training dropped out to start their own individual home-based sewing initiatives, working alone as entrepreneurs. With the funds exhausted at the end of 1998, both the sewing and the brick making group were left to survive without organisational support, on their own.
Research findings further indicate that unemployment and the need for income to survive appeared as the main motive for initiating these groups. However, the triple burdens of partnership building (namely, accessing resources, motivating community members, and developing skills); survival, often without any income; and the establishment of successful business operations, coupled with the lack of adequate education and numeracy and literacy skills, placed too much stress on already overburdened individuals having dependent families (Buvinic, 1986; Moser, 1993). Many of the women were single parents with little other income and support. Some had recently migrated to the city to look for work. Most were caring for children with no financial support.

Given these observations, following Kabeer (1994), I argue, that the implementation of the national policy goals held in the White Papers on Reconstruction and Development, Health and Social Welfare, reflected in IGP processes, manifested institutional rules and procedures (Kabeer, 1994). These transmitted multi-level user experiences, dependent on the different standpoints of subjects (namely, implementing organisations, managers, fieldwork personnel and participants); needed deeper investigation, using a care perspective (Goetz, 1996; Tronto, 1993), to understand and explain the perpetuation of gender, race and class injustices (Goetz, 1996; Kabeer, 1994); stereotypes; and relations and subjectivities (Hunter, 2003).

Individual interviews, and personal profiles of previously unemployed men and women, revealed that they were differently positioned to project staff. They had diverse views about the original community development and income-generating aims of the implementing organisations. Subjects’ information and stories about themselves (namely, their positions within the project, previous work history, familial and caring responsibilities, and time volunteered for the project); and about the role and functioning of internationally funded organisational projects, revealed a distinct lack of power and influence in decisions affecting their livelihoods (Hunter, 2003; Lyon, 1991).

It became clear in my study that the business development needs of the women’s sewing project were not noted as a special feature, as was the case with the male project. Unlike in the women’s sewing project, the men’s brick making project did not note care work and responsibilities as a factor influencing male members in their functioning as partners with WCCPP.
The study found that, while women had a lack of time, capacity, expertise, competencies and resources to guide the implementing process, they, in contrast to the men, participated in different types of projects and often the less successful ones. This gendered and sexist division of labour corroborates evidence of many previous research studies done on this phenomenon (Buvinic, 1986; Lyon, 1991; Maliwichi, 1994). With dependants to care for, female participants found it even harder to survive without additional income support. Both groups experienced a high turnover of labour and high dropout rates due to the lack of sustainable income in the start-up and initial project maintenance and training phase. After some skills training, the sewing group lost several members who started their own home-based sewing activities. The views of these dropouts could possibly be followed up, but may not be very different. Given the valuable project time invested by project leaders in basic skills (e.g. basic sewing and pattern making) losing trained members through this dropping out phenomenon, meant losing potential producers of income. The dropout rate clearly interfered with production and other business activities (namely, quality control, marketing and selling), affecting the income, entrepreneurial and financial potential of projects (Adams, 1997; De Vries, 1997).

6.6 Conclusion

The brick making project appeared initially more successful, but also failed to deliver sustainable income after a period. This project was more overtly assisted by the male fieldworker and also it received marketing assistance in tendering for the supply of bricks to a local housing project. In contrast, the women’s sewing project was subject to a dismissive organisational approach and did not receive similar services, revealing the peculiar gender or sexist biases at play. Neither of the projects ultimately achieved success in establishing a formal project management structures or project committees. However, the brick making project, although small in terms of the number of beneficiaries, was, at the time of the study, far more operational in terms of demand and supply factors and the marketing of their products. Observations of gender-specific IGPs; and of the internal gender dynamics in implementing partnership organisational procedures and project practices, allowed me to formulate eight hypotheses about gender-based projects that I draw on in the further two case studies. Table 6.2.
Table 6.2: Preliminary findings and alternative feminist PEOC assumptions about IGPs

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Income Projects implemented in different settings (namely, urban and rural communities) by different agents (namely, community groups, government and non-government), with similar or different gender groups, may reflect important gendered relational dynamics which should be challenged through critical care-based analyses and ongoing monitoring and research (Tronto, 1993; Kabeer, 1994).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Beneficiaries or project participants, especially poor women, are open to manipulation by professionals and project staff and by gender-insensitive strategies: they have unrealistic expectations about activities to be undertaken and about income to be generated, with regards to unpaid labour, volunteering time and volunteering efforts invested in poorly planned projects, where the choice of activities remains limited (Moser, 1995).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The variety of skills selected for training in micro projects remain narrow and minimal (Carr, 1993).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Due to the lack of adequate assessment, skills training continue to be perceived in isolation from the general needs in other sectors. It is costly, in time and effort alike, when it needs to be judged against the historical neglect of women’s developmental and adult education needs (see chapter 3 of this thesis).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Beneficiaries, especially women with dependents, barely survive without additional support – whether social security or other – while being trained (see chapter 3 of this thesis).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Products, training opportunities and skills selected for project activities need to be guided by proper, gender sensitive, feasibility studies having the appreciation of the link to both the informal and formal sectors of the economy (Creevey, 1996).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Empowerment goals need critical reorientation to include the need for literacy and numeracy (namely, economic literacy and citizenship roles), placing emphasis on men and women’s productive, and also their reproductive, roles and care responsibilities (see chapter 3 of this thesis).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Existing inequalities, strategic gender needs, such as literacy and numeracy; and sex stereotyping, or gender relations, and care arrangements were not challenged effectively in organisational efforts (Kabeer, 1994).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Literature reviewed in Chapter Three

Based on these observations, I argue that the development and welfare policy sector needed far more capacity, expertise and budget to be able to care competently; and to effectively and
successfully drive the process of human resource management, and to facilitate social development through skills development and income generation activities such as micro-enterprises.

In the absence of these resources, the sector faced serious challenges for future partnership relations and change. These were integral to transitional policies, and also for the recruitment of potential new partners. New policy implementation strategies needed to be co-ordinated with far more rigor to include an informed critical, historical understanding of community development and of gender and difference. They also needed an integrated policy approach of obtaining assistance from other sectors (namely, adult basic education, basic literacy and numeracy; labour, trade and industry; agriculture; health; and the corporate sector) to assist with feasibility studies and with linkage between the informal and formal economic sectors (Hirschowitz et al., 1994).

Given this lack of input skills training was done without any prior assessment of individual potential, or of knowledge of the economists’ staircase idea to link skills training in the survivalist sector with that of the informal and formal sectors (Hirschowitz et al., 1994), the ability of both female and male participants to compete in the open, formal labour market, was left unexplored. This led to further disadvantages and to the disempowerment of Black women, as the projects were not carefully monitored or evaluated at different stages or intervals. Also, making bricks and sewing were mostly labour-intensive activities using old technology (namely, hand operated brick making machines and sewing machines). This affected productivity and output (Baud & de Bruijne, 1993) and also helped to perpetuate the lack of renewal and the modernising of skills. Project activities did not provide enough resources (namely, time, human resources and capital) and scope to build capacity; and to produce goods to compete effectively in the formal, modern, waged sectors of the informal and formal economy. As the South African labour market continued to expand, it remain segregated by race and gender – being dominated by Whites and men in the skilled sectors (see Chapters 3, 4 of this thesis) – policy interventions, such as IGPs, with skills training components for poor women and men, needed to be critically interrogated.

The transitional gendered policy context, as analysed and discussed, and the community context described, clearly impacted on the operation of the projects and overall organisational policy implementation process. Analysing individual narratives on the phenomenon of IGPs revealed multi-layered participant experiences. These were congruent with the standpoints
and hierarchical positions within the projects; and with the organisational setting at different stages of the project’s history, functionality and implementation – something often overlooked in documented evaluation studies and research. Together, these multiple experiences wove a pattern – a rich texture (Salmen, 1987: 79) – reflecting social differences in the relations and intersections of gender, race and class; differences not fore grounded by policymakers and donors performing their caretaking tasks at a distance.
Chapter Seven: Caring social development: DSW in Beaufort West, Western Cape

“We get told we are the boss but we are not....”

7.1 Introduction

This chapter presents a discussion of the findings of the second case, the Beaufort West Community Vegetable Garden, an IGP based on the state’s new policy of DSW. As earlier described, the National Flagship Programme was an extension of new social policies introduced into the South African policy arena, based on the White Paper on Social Welfare (Department of Welfare, 1997b). The flagship programme – for unemployed women with children under five years old – was initiated in each of the nine provinces. The programme was gender sensitive and was used as a demonstration pilot project for DSW (Mullagee et al., 2001). Given its experimental nature, the National Flagship Programme served as the example of how a South African social safety net approach to social security could integrate economic productivist (namely, IGP) ideas to showcase DSW.

The community health promotion and developmental focus of the Mfuleni project was supported by the Health Development’s approach to IGPs. However, the agricultural nature of Community Vegetable Garden IGP’s implementation into the community, involved PAWC Social Services, a different State department, and the local government in Beaufort West as the leading partners; and community-based NGOs and poor women at grassroots community level as co-partners. The state’s social understanding and interpretation of gender, in negotiating these contracts for planning and project delivery, were to become evident, but controversial, through services delivered in these projects. I assumed that policy implementation, partnership structures and processes would have consequences for how gender, gender relations and practices of care (namely, educare) were interpreted, transmitted and shaped in the name of social development. The PEOC analytical frame allows for informative questions, thereby capturing and coding critical information and data to further explore and understand the policy development and implementation processes. I argue that
this serves as a basis for new ways of monitoring and evaluating public policies promoting gender and social development. The type of questions that the EOC suggests for the study of public policy is not framed as a methodism, but rather as an interesting, alternative, way to apply our philosophical abilities to questions of social policy and to a public EOC (Brandsen, 2006).

Gender and development policy implementation, as will be reported through the findings, is understood to be the deliberate policy actions – social practices – by actors and public institutions promoting policy changes that addressed the legacy of residual, unequal apartheid discriminatory policies. New institutional processes and structures, such as partnerships (WPSW, 1997) and consortiums (National Department of Social Welfare (NDSW), Policy Guidelines for Implementation of Flagship Project, 1996:1-9), that were involved in implementing these reform ideas to achieve social development, were exposed to the public eye as different stakeholders, participating in these forums, adopted competing definitions and understandings of partnerships, gender and social development strategies. I will evidence these in my presentation and discussion of case data.

The narrative of the Beaufort West Community Vegetable Garden Project, a project that experimented with agricultural technologies, is grounded in a regional, semi-rural context; and this impacted on the partnership history of the project. A summary of the latter relationship-building process includes references to the dynamics of project development, and of partner relations, as being policy service development activities facilitated by the state. Five integral factors became exposed through this investigation: by carefully observing the power relations through social and spatial planning dynamics; by understanding the historical background to the idea of a agriculturally inspired vegetable garden to generate income; by relating this historical background to how quickly the policy idea of social development (Midgley, 1995) was adopted; and by listening to local ideas on job creation, uncovered the authentic local need for a community vegetable garden project.

The designs of the National Flagship Programme, of the Beaufort West Community Vegetable Garden Project, of IGPs, and of flagship policy, were a joint experiment of the National Department of Economic Affairs and the National Department of Social Welfare (NDSW); and formed part of the National State Treasury Department’s concept of poverty relief and job creation. They indicated the state’s new orientation towards social safety net policy (namely, poverty relief) and DSW redistributive needs discourse (Tronto, 1996b).
With the 1997 – 1998 name change to the National Department of Social Development, from the National Department of Social Welfare, notions of social development and DSW became increasingly blurred and interchangeably used (Mullagee et al., 2001; Department of Social Development, 2000).

The gender-sensitive central policy planning approach by the State emphasised social partnerships (WPSW, 1997) and consortiums; and also the empowerment of poor women via skills development and income generation activities to address poverty and unemployment (Department of Social Development, 2000). This appeared, in my view, similar and also different from the previous setting (see chapter 6 of this thesis). By using thematic analysis and a coding strategy drawing on Tronto’s view of care as process, I unpack some of the features how new gender contracts and social partnership formations manifested with the State as the lead partner. The volatile context of policy restructuring, with its cutbacks resulting in tensions in projects – in implementing project activities, in mutual communication and in deliberations with poor citizens as a target group – will be outlined, applying the PEOC lens to understand gendered policy case study.

7.2 Historical context of the community setting

Beaufort West is a semi-rural town located in the Central Karoo Region of the Western Cape Province in South Africa. It is 400 kilometres from the Cape Town, situated on the N1 National Road that passes through Bloemfontein, in the Free State Province, and continues on to Johannesburg, in the Gauteng Province. Beaufort West was the first town to be established in the Central Karoo area. It is the largest town in this arid region, and is commonly known as the capital of the Karoo. The Central Karoo region is a sparsely populated and is known as a semi-desert area.

The town was founded in 1818 and was initially named Beaufort after Henry Somerset, the fifth Duke of Beaufort, the father of Lord Charles Henry Somerset, then governor of the Cape Colony. The town was renamed Beaufort West in 1869 to avoid confusion with Port Beaufort, a town also in the Western Cape, as well as Fort Beaufort, a town in the Eastern Cape. Beaufort West became the first municipality (namely, the Beaufort West Local

---

Municipality) in South Africa on 3 February 1837. It holds the country’s first town hall and is one of eight major districts in the Western Cape (Beaufort West Municipality, 2011).

Agriculture and tourism are the leading sectors of this regional Karoo economy. Merino sheep farming, angora goat farming, small cattle ranching and meat production are the major agricultural and economic activities and form the backbone of local farming and production activities. The Beaufort West district is the largest wool-producing area in South Africa. Its meat production is the second largest contributor to the region’s economy.

The N1 National Road divides the town in two. Another main road, the R61 from Aberdeen, also meets here. South of Beaufort West is the R89, a road that connects to the N1 and serves as another major route connecting it with the two central towns of the Southern Cape, Oudtshoorn and George. The main railway line north, to the provinces of the Free State and Gauteng, crosses through the western part of this Beaufort West. The Gamka and Kuils rivers flow in a southerly direction through the older part of the town, while the Beaufort West dam forms part of the north-eastern border. The town is situated at the southern end of the Nuweveld Mountain Range. Offshoots of these mountains form a spectacular gorge affecting the river flows and main traffic routes.

The policy significance of the town is, however, more relevant to this study. Beaufort West serves as an administrative, business and educational centre for surrounding smaller rural ‘dorpies’ – or towns – and farms. Together with its location on the N1 to Johannesburg, its geographic location makes it a main overnight destination for professional and business practitioners, for tourists and for private transport operators. Currently, its public transport connections, linked to its retail and related services, are considered the foundation for much of its recent spatial development and economic growth. Due to the network of many support services; and due to its popular status as a halfway stopover between Cape Town, Bloemfontein and Johannesburg, Beaufort West is also informally known as the truck town of this region.

Other factors that placed Beaufort West and the region on the map – both nationally and internationally – are: ecology, as geologically the area is well-known for its semi-desert, arid

---

conditions and the uniqueness of plant life; and location, as the Central Karoo Nature Reserve is on its doorstep (IDPs, 2006/07; 2010.)

In the Western Cape, Beaufort West, due to its conservative racist political past, is still one of the ruling ANC party’s strongest Black electoral constituencies. In 2000, at the time of one interval of data collection, the town was chosen as the rural site where the then ANC President, Thabo Mbeki, launched its first national local government election speech. This event placed the spotlight on developments in the region. After five years of GNU rule and the implementation of Local Government Transitional Act No. 209 of 1993, very little data and information was available on community and social studies of the town and surrounding areas. Due to the historical legacies of apartheid-styled, fragmented social engineering, updated information and community-based social audits would only become available later (namely, after the 1999 local government elections). Then, attention was given to amend the old legislation through the use of Integrated Development Plans (IDPs). IDPs used conscious resource allocations and budgeting processes to address the critical need to accelerate basic infrastructural service delivery in distant urban and rural local communities. Such interventions were made possible through the implementation of further legislation, such as the Intergovernment Relations and the Municipal Systems Acts in 2000.

### 7.2.1 Demographics, physical infrastructure, location and spatial dynamics

Historically, the system of separate development within the apartheid regime, with and its battery of legal laws, affected land use and settlement patterns of local groups. Race-based town planning and land development were integral strategies to secure the best available land for the benefit of White prosperity. While different rural and urban towns implemented standard apartheid local government policies with similar oppressive land use practices, different racial and ethnic groups (namely, Africans, Coloureds and Indians) were affected differently. Some were favoured more by their class, professional status and positions, such as government employees with subsidies for land and housing. As a region, the Western Cape was known as a Coloured preferential settlement area as Coloureds were favoured above Indians and Africans in local apartheid town planning and housing policies. The White farming community was, however, more privileged and was particularly favoured in the Great Karoo region. They owned vast tracts of fertile land for agricultural, residential and commercial use. Due to the history of colonialism and more recent apartheid legacies, the
population statistics of Beaufort West depict the prevalence of racially skewed population distribution trends of most semi-rural, post-apartheid, Western Cape towns.

At the time of study (1996 – 2001), the Beaufort West Municipality had a population of 37107 people in 8993 households (Stats South Africa, 2001). The racial composition of the town was 15.8 per cent Black African; 73.2 per cent Coloured; 12 per cent Indian or Asian; and 10.88 per cent White (ibid, 2001). The average household size was 4.13 persons, with 13.7 per cent of all households consisting of individuals or single persons, with the dominant age group being younger citizens (ibid, 2001). The age breakdown was as follows:

- 32.1 per cent under the age of 15;
- 18.5 per cent from 15 to 24;
- 27.9 per cent from 25 to 44;
- 15.8 per cent from 45 to 64; and
- 5.6 per cent 65 years of age or older (ibid, 2001).

The average age of an individuals living in this town was 24 years; and for every 100 females there were 92.4 (ibid, 2001) males. For every 100 females aged 18 and over, there were 86.4 males (ibid, 2001).

With the language breakdown, Afrikaans was by far the primary language in Beaufort West, with 84.8 per cent of residents speaking the language at home; while 1.0 per cent spoke English; 13.7 per cent spoke isiXhosa; and 2 per cent spoke other languages (ibid, 2001). The religion practiced by most residents of the town was Christianity (94.7 per cent); while 3.8 per cent had no religion; and 0.1 per cent subscribed to the Muslim faith (ibid, 2001).

A substantial percentage of the young population, 14.7 per cent of residents aged 20 and over, was illiterate and received no schooling (ibid, 2001). Given developmental needs, this was a significant proportion; as only 20.5 per cent had received primary schooling, but only 8.6 per cent had completed primary school (ibid, 2001). About a third of the population, 33.4 per cent, attended secondary schools, but only 17.5 per cent completed this level of education (ibid, 2001). Some form of post-matric education was only attempted by 5.3 per cent of the young population (ibid, 2001). Overall, 22.8 per cent of all residents of Beaufort West had completed high school (ibid, 2001).
46.4 per cent of the housing units had access to telephones or cell phones inside dwellings; 47.0 per cent had access to a telephone nearby; and 6.6 per cent had access far away or had no access. 90.8 per cent of households had either flushing or chemical toilets (ibid, 2001). 85.7 per cent had refuse removed by the local municipality at least once a week; and 0.3 per cent had no rubbish removal service. 60.8 per cent had running water inside their dwellings; 94.1 per cent had running water on their properties; and 99.4 per cent had access to running water (ibid, 2001).

66.5 per cent of households used electricity for cooking; 57.8 per cent for heating; and 87.2 per cent for lighting (ibid, 2001). 74.7 per cent of households had access to a radio; while 65.7 per cent had access to a television; 6.3 per cent owned a computer; 62.3 per cent had a refrigerator; and 22.3 per cent had a cell phone (ibid, 2001). Overall, the town, despite being located in a drought stricken area, was relatively well-serviced in basic infrastructure.

In 1992, the local municipality commissioned a study on land use patterns and income (Moss, 1992). This report informed the structural planning for most of the policy decisions on interim spatial development needs in the town; and also assessed the town planning requirements of the interim local government arrangements, and the urban development, or renewal, strategy for the period after 1999.

Geographically, the report observed that 75 per cent of the local population of eligible voters was concentrated in 25 per cent of the town by land distribution. This figure confirmed the historical influence of apartheid policies on the town, especially in the racially skewed settlement arrangements. For example, the Black population experienced the largest growth rate in settlements and birth rate; and therefore in land, or spatial requirements, suffered the greatest due to arguments of limited availability of land (Moss, 1992). The report did not mention the population growth figures, which was surprising; as these figures were meant to be used when determining factor when future land needs; and in determining land use patterns in spatial and integrated planning for towns. Also, with the backdrop of emerging national consciousness about the impact of HIV/AIDS, the report also made no mention of this as a possible factor that may influence projections of social and hospital care, including palliative care. Land use for residential, community, facilities, business, industrial, and State purposes – while indicating stark differences and glaring inequalities in infrastructural services, such as schools, sport and recreation facilities, businesses, social welfare services and transport facilities – reflected the race and gender bias of the apartheid development
legacies. These were not adequately addressed in the report, within the context of an integrated sustainable rural town development strategy.

In studying the historical spatial dynamics of the consultant’s documents, the lack of gender, race and class analysis of continuing inequalities, in recommendations for land use patterns by the local population, appeared to have influenced the perpetuation of old practices. The current land was selectively subdivided into seven zones, with land being recommended for zones separated by gender and by race; and also class neutral zones. Again, there was no mention of the gross inequalities and largely race-based approach of past locality development. The location of the zones was not, for instance, explained in terms of the distance from the central business area; an area where Whites were settled and still dominated the commercial activities, due to the Group Areas Acts. These apartheid legacies continue to inflate the realities of daily living costs (for example, travelling) for the majority of unemployed and employed Black people in Beaufort West as in the rest of the country.

7.2.2 Special needs and problems experienced by the community

With the progression of time post-1994, as evidenced in the different phases of data collection, and against the backdrop of transitional policy developments, Beaufort West battled with a high rate of TB and a growing number of HIV/AIDS infections (Beaufort West Municipality, 2011). Estimations and reported health indicators suggested that Beaufort West appeared to be positively addressing the problems of managing and curing TB; as the Municipality reported a 74 per cent success rate against a national target of 85 per cent. The explanation for not achieving the national target was given as being due to a dependency on social grants by patients who feared losing their grants if they were cured. While statistics for HIV/AIDS suggests a decline in infection rates in recent years, the mortality rate paints a different picture. Due to the relatively low population figure, however, the patient to nurse ratio for the town, at 31 patients to one nurse, is better than the national target of 34 patients to one nurse (Beaufort West Municipality, 2011).

Social problems commonly experienced in Beaufort West town were reported as: substance (namely, alcohol) abuse; illegal shebeens; money lending; early school dropouts; literacy; teenage pregnancies; and domestic violence. The town battled to cope with a growing crime

27 See Beaufort West Municipal IDPs and Reviews for a more recent analysis of the later years 2006-2010
and unemployment rate. House burglaries were very high up on the list of current crimes. Other crimes found to be on the rise were: theft of a vehicle; robbery and shop-lifting; violence and crimes associated with drug abuse and drug dealing; child molestations; and rape.

Due to increasing unemployment and poverty, poor literacy and low wages for those employed, over 30 per cent of the local population was dependent on social grants. These facts help to understand the associated problems of debt and money lending that is an increasing reality for most poor communities. As a result of historical gender imbalances, the contemporary unemployment rate of women was still reported as being higher; and very few women held any significant positions of influence in local leadership (Beaufort West Municipality, 2011), whether political or in other public spheres.

The need for social and local economic development through greater investment in educational opportunities – those addressing the needs for literacy, job creation, sport and recreational development – has more recently been documented; and has been reprioritised as a key intervention strategy (Beaufort West Municipality, 2011).

7.3 Partnership formation and gendered planning

The Beaufort West Vegetable Garden Flagship Project operated in the semi-rural, Central Karoo area. The National Welfare Department and the PAWC Social Service Department had called for proposals on flagship projects, in line with the Green Paper on Social Welfare (1996). These proposals had to follow the broad philosophy of intersectoral collaboration and partnership with different stakeholders.

An old community idea for potential income generation activities was revived and carried forward by the Karoo Association for Preschool Development (KAVO) into the call for proposals by local developmental organisations. KAVO was a Black, community self-help initiative that started with preschool teacher training in 1992. The area of operation for this association was between the surrounding towns of Laingsburg, Richmond, Kenhardt and Klaarstroom, in the rural districts of the Beaufort West Municipal district of Western Cape. Two courses, Educare Level 1 and Committee and Leadership Training, were offered in three languages: English, Afrikaans and Xhosa. A business plan accompanied the proposal which, with help from KAVO, was submitted and approved. KAVO was represented, along with
other local organisations, on the local RDP forum and, as such, received money from the first allocation of government poverty relief funding intended to implement the national policy concept of ‘flagship’ programmes. According to one of the key informants (an environmental health officer), acting as chairperson of the project steering committee, this money served to re-initiate the old idea, culminating in the project development and planning phase of the town’s new Flagship Project (Male, Acting Chairperson, Participant No.13).  

The original idea of a community vegetable garden project was historically mooted by health officials of the previous dispensation. For the 1992–1993 period, their main concern was addressing the link identified between poverty, malnutrition and TB. The idea was for patients at the community clinic to be recruited to cultivate vegetables to eat, with the aim of thereby improving their own health by better nutrition. The proposed plan was not for mass production for sale at markets, but rather for the small-scale production and alleviation of patients’ malnutrition. Land at one of the clinics was contemplated as a base for the project in 1993, but the soil quality found not suitable for the cultivation of vegetables. The planning process was stalled during the democratic election after 1994; and during the interim, transitional local government, restructuring period (Male, Acting Chairperson, Participant No.13).

The idea resurfaced when the new, democratically elected government came into power. It was put forward as a viable option in the national job creation call as an IGP aimed at benefitting unemployed women and their children of less than five years old. The project was finally launched on 23 November 1996 by the Western Cape Minister of Health and Welfare, Minister Ebrahim Rasool; two years after the ANC-ruled GNU came into power. The Western Cape was, at the time, the only non-ANC province, being governed by the NNP.

The role of partnership initiatives was made public, open to be observed and discussed. On this project, the partners were the NGO KAVO; and the dominant partner, the local RDP committee, which represented a broad spectrum of local organisations and multi-political party interests, including official representation from local government and from the different provincial government sectors of health, welfare, agriculture, land affairs and labour.

---

28 See Table 5.3 Chapter 4 (p. 156)
A key undertaking of this particular state-led partnership was to work towards establishing the new project, with input from local women. This social partnership model was informed by the national guidelines (NDSW, Policy Guidelines for Implementation of Flagship Project: Developmental Programme for Unemployed Women with Children under Five Years, 1996) in the recruitment process. The need for the project was noted as creating job opportunities to help unemployed Black women sustain them and their children, or families, by way of an efficient and productive community vegetable garden (PAWC, 1997: 1).

A project steering committee was formed to oversee the flagship planning, development and implementation processes. Like the RDP forum, it represented a broad range of interests: NGOs, political parties and sectoral interests. Direct representation ranged from the RDP forum to preschools, primary schools and secondary schools; churches; a housewives’ league; local government and municipality officials; health officials (namely, dieticians, nursing, clinic and local hospital staff); and local social workers. However, at the time of the study, this had dwindled to a more restricted representation of local government officials and one representative from a civil society organisation (South African Union of House Wives League, Respondent 14). The steering committee held quarterly meetings. From the establishment to the planning stages of the partnership, the nature of the project activities (namely, agriculture and cultivation) called for the involvement and input of different local government departments (namely, the agriculture, labour, city engineering and social work services). Officials from all these departments were co-opted onto the steering committee in different roles and functions related to the activities of project development. Many factors had to be contemplated by them in this multi-faceted planning task.

Beaufort West is situated in a semi-rural sheep farming area. As a result, shops, hotels, restaurants, self-catering accommodation, and also the public sector, were reliant on the supply of fresh produce (namely, fruit and vegetables) from George, a town situated about 300 kilometres away. Vegetables and fruit are important for good nutrition; but were very expensive for the preschool NPO centres who fed children from poor socio-economic conditions on a daily basis. By growing fresh vegetables, the identified project was expected to render a much needed service to the local community of preschools, the local hospital, public school hostels, community soup kitchens, as well as to the general public via the local Beaufort West market (PAWC, 2000). Women recruited to cultivate the vegetables would learn to sell experientially; by being directly involved in selling their produce on a rotational
basis. Skills training in other areas, such as in new production methods, accounting skills, business skills, administration and pricing, would also be provided.

A percentage of the profits would be deposited as savings to ensure financial sustainability, while the rest of the proceeds would be divided equally, as income, amongst the women. The target group would earn a small honorarium as an incentive; and this would be decreased, or stopped, as they generated income through the sale of their produce. Preschool education (namely, educare), was envisaged as an important need for children under six years; and it would be made available as a service, to support the recruited women who were also mothers of dependent children. This care need for children under six years would be provided for by establishing a mobile crèche at the project site (PAWC, 1998).

7.4 IGP project development and implementation

In 1995, six criteria were proposed for the implementation of a National Flagship Programme on DSW in the provinces as follows:

- It had to be intersectoral, with links to other national programmes, in order to pool resources and maximise impact.
- It had to be high profile, be visible and marketable.
- It had to reflect new priorities, emphasising preventative and developmental aspects.
- It had to present a low risk of failure and utilise existing infrastructure and human resource capacity in the government and private sector.
- It had to draw linkages between social security and welfare service priorities; and
- It had to tap into existing community-based programmes and, where these did not exist, develop new structures (NDSW, Policy Guidelines for Implementation of Flagship Project: Developmental Programme for Unemployed Women with Children under Five Years, 1996:8) By 1996, these six criteria influenced the clarification of four broad goals used in negotiation at a national workshop, with provincial representatives, during February 1996, namely:
  - To increase the educational and training opportunities of women so that they can provide for the basic needs of their families;
  - To develop the skills and capacity of women, to enhance their overall functioning;
  - To ensure that these women’s families received social services that supported and enhanced the programme’s aim of life skills; and
To provide children under five with developmentally appropriate education aimed at increasing their chances of achieving and learning; and based on the principles of inclusiveness.

The Department of Land Affairs made a two-hectare stretch of land available for the project; while the Department of Agriculture assessed the income potential. The land was located on the outskirts of the town, on the road as one enters town from the N1 from Cape Town.

One of the most important challenges that the project committee faced was the scarcity of water; and the proposed water reticulation idea of recycling and purifying sewage water, as a sustainable source of irrigation, still needed to be explored. Due to the 1993 study revealing soil problems; and also because the quality of the reticulated sewage water was not known, the project steering committee requested more information on the suitability, of both soil and water, for the cultivation of vegetables. This was channelled through the Department of Agriculture for feasibility studies. The outcome of these feasibility studies highlighted several factors; factors that would later impede on the pace of project development and on the eventual outcome of the implementation process. The results of the feasibility studies, however, were only made available to the project planning committee 12 months after the project had already started (PAWC, 1997). The sewage water reticulation was scientifically proven to be unsuitable for the cultivation of vegetables for human consumption (PAWC, 1996; 1997; 1998; 1999; 2000), as the water would not have been purified sufficiently. The soil was assessed as arid, semi-desert quality that would require extensive preparation for the cultivation of vegetables; and would ultimately yield much less than expected. Initially the project proposed to provide opportunities for 90 women. This number had to be reduced, to 30 – 40 participants (PAWC, 1996; 1997; 1998; 1999; 2000), as a result of the feasibility studies. The business plan also had to be revisited; but a target income for participants was not set during planning.

As the project development phase unfolded, allegations of corruption and fund embezzlement were made within the leading NGO partner, implicating KAVO. It resulted in calls for the local councillor representing the White-dominated, local government authority – the Beaufort West Municipality – to become more involved in administering project funds. KAVO dissolved as an NGO and also withdrew from the partnership initiative as a result of these allegations. It was completely dismantled, leaving the State and the RDP Forum as the remaining partners in the initiative. During this period, the number of people attending the
project steering committee meetings diminished to just six members: only four local
government officials, all White; a Coloured, female, State social worker; and a Coloured,
female, NGO volunteer remained on board.

After that, the Beaufort West Municipality managed all the project funds, from book-keeping
to auditing. This also explained the number of local government officials serving on the
project management committee board. Given the developments around finances; and while
still awaiting the outcome of the planning phase and feasibility studies, a project field co-
ordinator was appointed, in 1997, to assist with the initial establishment of the co-operative
working group environment. To give practical effect to the planning, an alternative bore-hole
for groundwater was successfully sourced; and this influenced the steering committee’s
decision to kick-start the project without the final outcome and recommendations of the
feasibility study.

Help for the project staff was obtained through the Department of Health and the local health
clinic. They assisted to identify and recruit local women with malnourished children. In
recruiting women participants, the committee followed the guidelines set by the national pilot
programme (NDSW Policy Guidelines for Implementation of Flagship Project:
Developmental Programme for Unemployed Women with Children Under Five Years, 1996);
but, as confirmed by a respondent, few women matched all the set criteria (Male, Acting
Chairperson, Participant No.13). It would appear that the national guidelines for selecting
suitable participants were then adapted to suit the needs of the local women. Three of these
criteria remained compulsory for participants, namely that they had to be unemployed, have
children and be a child maintenance grant recipient. Most of the subsequent recruits received
either the State Maintenance Grant (SMG), an old grant that was being phased out by 2001;
or else they received the new child grant, the Child Support Benefit (CSB) (Lund 2008: 51).

The recruited women were organised to form their own group that was named Masakhe an
isiXhosa phrase, meaning ‘we build together’. Before skills training commenced, the first
phase of project development consisted of infrastructural development involving hard
physical labour by the women themselves: levelling the soil; digging holes for irrigation; and
volunteering their time and labour with no payment. The municipality assisted with the
logistics of infrastructure: fencing; irrigation; the erection of the building; and the installation
of boreholes and pumps.
Officials from the Department of Agriculture undertook the skills training of the female recruits. This was followed by the cultivation of the land. An expert on small farms was sent from Oudtshoorn to provide a one week long, on the job, skills training course covering skills such as the sowing of seeds, cultivation, composting, irrigation, weeding and pesticides. This was followed up with a six week long, on-the-job, skills training course offered by the Cape Training and Development College of Paarl; a course supported by the Department of Agriculture. The women were also provided with training in childcare, as well as in arts and crafts.

However, one of the problems that affected implementation was the attrition rate of recruits. Many of the women who received training left the project; and new participants joined, but lagged behind in basic agricultural skills training (focus group discussion, 2000). A misperception, however, prevailed that all the participants had been provided with skills training. No analysis done on dropout rates, on their impact in project implementation, or on their impact in the loss of skills on projects, was done in any reports until these research questions from my study were presented. The assessments also contained no mention of adult basic literacy and numeracy.

By mid-1997, the project steering committee was restructured as a partnership relationship between the following: five different government departments (namely, local government, health, labour, agriculture and social services), one community NGO (namely, the Beaufort West Branch of the South Africa Union of Housewives League), and the Masakhe Women’s Group. Apart from the initial gardening activities – where vegetables were grown in beds using flood irrigation techniques, a decision was taken by the project steering committee to experiment with cultivating vegetables under protective covering (namely, tunnel farming), using drip irrigation, due to the extreme temperature variations between the winters and summers; and problems with wind, water availability and irrigation in these semi-desert conditions. They also experimented, with cultivating different cultivars of flowers and vegetables under protective covering, in order to assess which cultivars would be most suitable as summer and winter crops. This was reported to have been very costly. In my opinion, it should thus have been undertaken and financially supported by the Department of Agriculture, not by unemployed women using poverty relief funds. All this experimentation led to a snowballing project implementation process – one of trial and error – at a huge cost to the poverty-stricken. Apart from various types of vegetables that were planted for sale as
income in the short term, indigenous prickly pears and 68 olive trees were also planted, in an effort to provide income opportunities for the 12 women, and the seasonal casual workers, in the long term.

Against this background, official assessments still reported the excellent all-round performance of the project; and reports strongly endorsed the full expenditure of monies allocated, to allow for the diversification of income-generating activities (Department of Social Development, 2000). Some of the milestones boasted of, in line with this recommendation, were a presidential award for the third best community project in the Western Cape; and having sound financial management practices, run according to the business plan (PAWC Quarterly Provincial Reports, 1996-2000). Referring to criteria such as skills acquisition, empowerment and project management, the award observed the positive self-image of women, claiming that the female beneficiaries were now ‘empowered’ in various ways which had led to a positive contribution within the local community. However, by the end of the 1997 – 1998 financial year, it was clear that beneficiaries only received a fixed income of R50.00 per week, in addition to the monthly child grant of R100; and that childcare arrangements were still not a part of the project.

After the KAVO debacle and the local government’s social intervention; and also due to overspending on experimentation, the State, in line with national treasury’s new public finance policy, introduced more stringent measures to curb unnecessary spending. Due to delays in the releasing of poverty relief funds for IGPs from the State treasury, the project field co-ordinator position within the project was cut due to cash flow problems. At the time of restructuring, one of the key informants, who had intimate knowledge of the history of this process, coincidentally acted in multiple roles and capacities on the project, namely as chairperson of the agricultural committee; Health Department representative of the RDP Forum; chairperson of the project steering committee; and supervisor on the project, in the absence of a project co-ordinator. This situation continued for at least 18 months, while he held down his full-time professional position as State environmental health officer. Given the position of power, having one white male person in such a dominant role, performing all these tasks was questionable in light of the project aim of gender empowerment and skills development.

In summary, critical factors, such as agricultural expertise; the knowledge of suitable vegetables to cultivate in the harsh Karoo conditions (namely, barren soil, a short growing
season, extremely hot summers and cold winters); and the fact that fewer women would benefit than was originally planned, all pointed to potential failures in profitability and sustainability in the transfer of skills and knowledge. This, however, did not deter the planners, who continued on with implementation. All of these factors were instead used as arguments to support the project steering committee’s wish to diversify the project production process; one that resulted in more experimentation with new ventures (for example, planting lucerne to sell as feed to local sheep farmers, planting more olive trees, the possible establishment of a dairy plant, bee farming, poultry and egg farming).

Specific skills training for further development was identified as becoming critical in the ongoing implementation activities, but was postponed to the 1999 financial year. These skills were:

Writing a business plan, computer training, finance and budgeting, marketing, vegetable growing in tunnels, childcare, building self-image, meeting procedures, negotiating skills, communication, conflict resolution, and project management. (PAWC Quarterly Provincial Reports, 1996-2000)

7.5 Applying the PEOC approach

My investigation into the Developmental Social Welfare flagship partnership policy structure; and into the social relations building processes, drew on various data collection techniques described in Chapter 5 of this thesis. These techniques were focus groups, key informant interviews and documentary analyses. These took into account the different perspectives of the multiple stakeholders involved in policy development; and in implementation processes, that evolved nationally, provincially, and locally at community and project level, in Beaufort West. The complexity and local context of the unequal power relations were deeply masked and not clear to the naked eye of researchers like me, who are interested in understanding new policy structures and processes from the perspective of beneficiaries.

Fisher and Tronto (1990) discussed care as a process; and introduced the four components of the care perspective, with its corresponding principles to evaluate good care. Their analyses served again when reviewing these project developments. The framework served as an
important guide to reread, code and analyse the case data; in order to identify the implications of these events. My analytical task thus contemplated all four components of the caring process described by Fisher and Tronto (1990): caring about, or attentiveness; taking care of, or responsibility; caregiving, or competency; and care receiving, or responsiveness, integrating different phases in this implementation.

7.5.1 Attentiveness: Caring about

While observing the evolving policy implementation practices of this Flagship Project through the lens of PEOC, the question of who articulated the needs addressed by this project, became contentious. The study revealed that the actual beneficiaries were not involved in the initial assessment of needs; and that this was done by mostly professionals, together with State officials, and civil society organisations. By being attentive to needs, the caring about phase of the policy implementation process invokes overt actions by actors who care. The question of whose needs were addressed via implementing a national public policy experiment is a politically sensitive one. There were the needs of the democratic State to pursue its national partnership initiative and DSW ideals with civil society; the need for caretaking by local government officials; and the concrete individual and group needs of marginalised, unemployed, poor women and mothers who were disempowered and had very little voice. The purpose and scope of the national programme left it open to interpretation, by regions, multi-stakeholders and by individual State officials not all equally conscious of gender, or sensitive to the ideal of caring social development and of reducing gender inequalities. The four broad goals of the National Flagship Programme on Developmental Social Welfare clearly state whose needs should be addressed. Ironically, departmental and State business plans excluded any reference to the target income to be earned by poor beneficiaries.

In my attempt to investigate how attentively the national vision was realised, key informants (namely, the provincial facilitator, the chairperson of the project steering committee, and project beneficiaries), all had different interpretations of project needs, on the initial policy ideas, and on the stage of project development at local level. These provided crucial insights on the orientation and historical background of the setting. The assumptions of different stakeholders about gender, difference and social development clearly impacted on how attentively needs were assessed, interpreted, and translated to finally arrive at a suitable production activity. This deserves further scrutiny.
When asked about the purpose of the programme, and how goals were interpreted to develop the flagships regionally, the provincial representative, responsible for convening and facilitating discussions by the steering committee, provincial and local government relations of the programme, had only been active in the project for only three months. At this time, she made the following statement; one that foregrounds a perceived lack of direction and clear purpose in the project:

I wasn’t initially part of the whole implementation of the flagship programme in the province. I’ve been in the project now for three months and from my interaction with the projects beneficiaries and from the previous provincial co-ordinator, as well as from the national office, I would say that – the project never had a very specific brief – its brief or its mandate was very broad. In the interpretation, I think, some of the essence got lost or moved it in a different way from the initial idea. (Respondent 15)

She was candid that the national goals lacked clarity of purpose, were constantly shifting, and became confusing to implement for organisations and partners in the provinces. Guidelines were also vague about specific goals associated with the meaning of DSW, the safety net and the accompanying social security package; as well as about the gendered, empowerment aspects of the programme which all proved problematic (NDSW Policy Guidelines for Implementation of Flagship Project: Developmental Programme for Unemployed Women with Children under Five Years, 1996). These manifested in different tensions and contradictions at local project level. In the words of the provincial co-ordinator, the ambiguity of the national goals and the narrow focus affected difficulties experienced in targeting beneficiaries or. Recruiting poor women, in a sense, deviated from the original gender aware policy’s intention and purpose:

The flagships are programmes for women with children under the age of six, and [were] meant for those women who were to come off the maintenance grant system which would have been unfair if you look at the Black communities: they have never received the State maintenance grant. It’s only now, with the new maintenance system (for example, the Child Support Benefit) that they can apply for maintenance: that is all single, unemployed women. From a policy perspective, I would say, this in the beginning was not made clear. Originally, that was one of the key objectives, but in the end,
people were told that they can apply for maintenance (namely, in the new CSB system). So, the purpose of the programme, the way I understand it, was also for those people who were previously excluded from the maintenance system, but was then also applied to those falling off the system, from the previous era, where the grant was mostly accessed by so-called Coloured single mothers with children. That is why I’m saying that from the outset, this whole programme, I think, wasn’t thoroughly or comprehensively thought through, because, with the implementation, all sorts of different gaps came up. Those were, in many instances, hindrances – stifling the project to such an extent that you had to go back to the initial purpose and in that way, shape more, or influence, or inform better or find more comprehensive ways that will ultimately lead the project to become self-sustainable. (Respondent 15)

Responses to questions about the background as to where and how the idea of the selected production activity of a vegetable garden originated from, in a region that was widely known for its poor soil and lack of water, were again mixed. Several views expressed by State officials in interview data were corroborated with policy documents (Annual and Progress Reports, 1996–2000) and also compared with direct responses of beneficiaries. It confirmed a conspicuous lack of appropriate gendered needs assessments (Moser Framework, 1993) and revealed a project/policy implementation process that continued with inattentiveness to, and a mismatch with, beneficiary issues and needs.

It also clearly exposed perceived othering (Tronto, 1993: 130) as well as the contradictions and power play in policy practices by State officials; reminiscent of an old, historical, undemocratic era. Many in the health field, mostly White health officials (for example, nursing sisters, health inspectors and counsellors attached to local authorities), took decisions without consulting communities on the activities and needs they identified in terms of their patients. Disenfranchised citizens were never before asked for input on their existing strengths (namely, skills) and weaknesses (i.e. strategic adult learning needs). It became evident, through my research process, that the establishment of a state-initiated, flagship, community vegetable garden, two years after democracy, was in fact an old idea originating during apartheid times:

When we started looking at this thing, we were mostly concerned about the TB patient at the clinic and about nutrition – to involve him with a type of
vegetable garden where every guy is allowed to cultivate some vegetables for himself. That is what we were working on. We did not really work on an idea of mass production where vegetables would be sold in town. It was more about the guy that was underfed and the TB patient. (Participant No. 13)

The expressed idea, although attuned to match policy expectation of a new era, clearly provided new space for perceived othering (Tronto, 1993), manifesting contradictions and power play in need of interpretation and policy practices by State officials that was reminiscent of an historical, undemocratic era.

In corroborating available policy planning evidence on the idea for this policy initiative, policy documents pointed out a dual purpose in the planned experiment of the community vegetable garden. This seemed far removed from beneficiary income generation and skills development needs and from the flagship goals. For example an amended business plan from the 1998 – 1999 period, detailed that, “The project was initiated as a vegetable garden which would have been developed by utilising purified sewerage water as a sustainable source of water.” (PAWC Provincial Coordinator, 1998: 01). Due to the scarcity of water in the local town during the summer months, the idea of purified, recycled sewage water seemed a particularly important general local authority concern that should be funded as scientific investments by municipalities. The use of poverty relief funds appeared at odds with a national welfare interest to design Flagships from the perspective of local women and children’s needs as stated in the policy guidelines. The implemented vegetable garden flagship and project activities were thus funded for different purposes; and were tacitly supported and initiated by local, provincial and national government.

As far as could be established, none of the beneficiaries, or their participating community members, was consulted about their material needs and interests at the time of the call for proposals involving Flagship Projects. KAVO, as an NGO initially submitted the proposal and business plan, based on previous information, obtained through an alleged needs assessment for a previous aborted venture, without updates (Male Chairperson, Participant No.13). The clinic staff had gathered this information from TB patients. The idea was to start a small-scale vegetable garden to serve the health needs of patients. This was later aborted for the very reasons the Flagship Project failed to address, that is, poor soil quality, water shortages and amongst political timing.
7.5.2 Responsibility: Taking care of

The central skill, involved in taking care of, that Fisher and Tronto (1990) discuss in their argument about caring as a process, is judging (namely, the skill of choosing which courses of action to follow). This implies the assessment of available resources; and the mobilising of those resources, in order to fulfil the responsibilities that are considered important activities for the caring process.

The notion of taking care of, and taking responsible actions, however, assumes some decision-making power, not only in terms of the ability to predict, or judge, but also to command resources. Without resources, taking care of, or caring for, becomes very difficult and almost negligible.

In the case of this project, the human resource services of a local, female, Coloured, project co-ordinator were contracted; to assist, both with the facilitation of the group of women, and with the development of the project. A second, male, Coloured resource replaced the first co-ordinator. By the time that this study commenced, his contract had been terminated; and the project ran for 18 months without a co-ordinator. At the time of study, a male, White, environmental health officer was seconded to oversee the community project, while acting as chairperson of the project steering committee.

With the background of Developmental Social Welfare policy assumptions about care and development; and specifically, how flagship projects in Beaufort West were conceptualised to meet local women and children’s needs, the question about how educare services were to be rendered within these projects, became relevant. Further questions also surfaced, namely:

- Who would ultimately remain responsible for meeting these twin goals of income generation and social development and care?

- How were caring roles and responsibilities assigned?

- Who ended up being the actual caregivers?

- What was the nature of the relationship between the caregivers and care receivers?

- Was there conflict between caregivers and care receivers, or amongst each of these groups themselves?

- What kind of resources was needed to provide good care?
• How do care receivers respond to the care that they have been provided with?

• How well did the care process, as assumed within a developmental policy context, meet participants, or care receivers, needs?

• If there was conflict, who resolved it?

• What would likely consequences be for beneficiaries of project interventions (namely, care receivers) and for State officials (namely, caregivers)?

• How did the roles and responsibilities through this interaction change? For example, how did restructuring as a result of financial cutbacks by national treasury; and the departure of the supervisor, affect the workload and redistribution of tasks?

Finding answers to some of these questions elicited mixed responses from participants. Most agreed that the team spirit amongst the group that stayed behind improved, unlike before. The sudden departure of the co-ordinator, whose role it was to allocate daily duties to be performed, effected swift changes as it meant that the women, themselves, had to make fast decisions in order to survive as a group (for example, planning future direction, allocating daily tasks and activities, setting objectives about time, and executing project objectives), without adequate preparation. Despite the positive development of having to be oriented to the daily operational planning and duties, participants reported a rapid decline in the number of project participants. They all agreed that the reduced size of the group improved the cohesion and co-operation amongst members of the team, unlike when it had been larger. However, the project was left without other needed resources; the computer was removed, and no skills training or knowledge transfer of financial matters was provided. According to the respondents (namely, the focus groups), the co-ordinators had more knowledge in this field and mediated on their behalf, giving input and providing feedback from steering committee meetings. They expressed a strong desire to receive more information and knowledge about project income, expenses and budgeting, seeming to lack an understanding of the project’s financial details; a request that I understood to be for accountability and greater transparency about the funds of the project. Positive changes that were reported by the women referred to a diversification and expansion in project activities to increase their income potential and add value to their work (for example, poultry and egg farming, the erection of the buildings, and the installation of a telephone). The project improvements provided a sense of stability to a smaller group of ten women who persevered with the
challenges of restructuring and down-scaling project operations. These respondents learned to accept and console each other; fewer arguments were noted than when the group had been larger. What became apparent is the fact that on-site, educare arrangements for the women’s dependent children under six years of age – which had formed part of the state’s original project planning documents – were not mentioned by the women, in the group context, as required to improve their working conditions. Negative issues that group members mentioned, affecting the operations and the role of the project, could be categorised into five themes: interpersonal, relational issues; income; working conditions, resources; the standardisation of skills training, and leadership issues. Table 7.1 details these:

Table 7.1 Negative issues about the project raised by project participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of issue</th>
<th>Negative comment by project participants (users/ beneficiaries)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interpersonal, relational</td>
<td>• The attitude of the acting project supervisor, who was also the chairperson of the project steering committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td>• More income</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working conditions, resources</td>
<td>• The improvement of health and safety standards (namely, the provision of protective clothing for working with pesticides, and boots and clothes to wear in bad weather);</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The improvement of hygiene (for example, the need for showers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standardisation of skills training</td>
<td>• Adult basic literacy and numeracy;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Obtaining driver’s licences;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Continuous education (namely, certificates for training received, and also the completion of matric for some);</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Work ethical issues and discipline (namely, absenteeism and respect for working tools)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership</td>
<td>• The need for empowerment and ownership;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• The need for leadership development and management skills training</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Source: Focus group discussions with beneficiaries]

Four months later, during the second interval when additional data was collected, the group became even smaller, reduced from ten to eight members. They functioned as an even more cohesive self-employed group and they learned to accept, console and support each other, which resulted in less conflict.
Due to the scheduled focus group discussions, all respondents completed individual questionnaires providing details about their family structures and dependents. When asked about necessary changes and improvements they would like to see in future project operations, the extracted suggestions, in Table 7.2 below, were found to be very similar to the five themes identified earlier.

Table 7.2 Personal views about necessary improvements to the project

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Comments by respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interpersonal relations</td>
<td>“I think the supervisor’s attitude should change.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td>“We could be paid more.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“I would like to earn more money.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working conditions, resources</td>
<td>“More things could be improved, for example, installing a shower, cool storage room, and by buying a bicycle.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“We need a telephone, an alarm system and more training.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Source: Questionnaires]

When asked the question about who should take responsibility for caregiving; and what actions were needed to improve their current situation in the absence of income improvement, the respondents expressed varied opinions about group ownership. This concept was being promoted by PAWC Department of Social Services, in line with national programme goals. The participants all had similar perceptions: that the executive of the management committee, consisting mostly of State officials with a strong presence of local government, had to assist them to become self-reliant. However, they lamented that they were only occasionally consulted, such as when they had asked about buying the land collectively, through land subsidies, for themselves. While the executive was taking all the important decisions, they, as a group, did not feel totally responsible, or in control. There was clearly a sense of disempowerment and of feelings of exclusion. This may be explained by the fact that none of the participants was either able to or trained to write minutes or reports.

In the absence of leadership training (namely, writing minutes, financial management, basic project administration, and accounting skills), participants’ knowledge was restricted to handling day-to-day functioning activities (for example, petty cash, receipts and work
schedules), with no additional skills training in any other area. The biggest decision made by the project team and committee in the 18 months prior to this study was to let the co-ordinator’s post become redundant at the end of their contract. Although the participants were consulted about the expiry of the co-ordinator’s contract; and although their work committee representative regularly attended monthly meetings, respondents did not feel that their group made this final and crucial decision. They felt that since the management committee, which was dominated by professionals, made most of the decisions, the steering committee should help the group to prepare for when they would be able to make these important decisions.

By taking over the responsibilities of managing and administering this Flagship Project, as the State did in this important start-up phase, or caring for it, the state generally assumed overt responsibility for meeting the identified needs. However, monitoring, assessment and evaluation, from the perspectives of the beneficiaries, did not happen.

By taking care of, the responsibility of overseeing and facilitating the assessment of needs in the project community, the nature of implementing state-led, partnership structures; and the role assumed by the state, appeared as that of referee and player. However, the state’s inability to manage and co-ordinate its own flawed, social development, planning practices for unemployed women and children became more exposed to the public. The composition of the partner relationship (namely, a range of different State departments, a dwindling civil society participation, and a smaller than anticipated target group), as documented in provincial reports, highlighted the contradictions in the project policy goals of self-reliance, economic empowerment, decision-making and financial management (PAWC Quarterly Provincial Reports, 1996-2000). Together with the over-involvement of different government departments on this project, these contradictions could be viewed as important aspects to consider for future monitoring and evaluation.

7.5.3 Competency: Caregiving

Caregiving is linked to the principle of competence; and refers to the actual practice and work of caring by caregivers in relation to care receivers. This leads to striving for the integration of the thinking and doing of care as a practice.

The person, people or group providing caregiving, in this view, may not be the same people or institutions who cared about the need (namely, for care) in the first place; or who are responsible for caring. However, since they are responsible for the actual physical work of
caring, there is a corresponding moral question about whether or not that care work is done well. Thus competence becomes a moral question. Questions asked about competent caregiving are the following:

- Who are the actual caregivers?
- How well can and do they perform their work?
- What are some of the conflicts that exist between caregivers and their care receivers, or within and between themselves?
- What resources do caregivers that profess to be doing DSW need to care competently?

By assuming responsibility for caregiving in the state-led project development; and by initiating and facilitating the partnership relationship-building process, meant that the partners or Flagship partnership initiative could be held accountable for the caring activities. PAWC Social Services played this role on this project, by partnering with all sectors of the Beaufort West local government, representatives of local CSOs, and local women.

From the standpoint of State officials, acting as caregivers in this project, the alleged shortage of funds and resources; bureaucratic red tape; time limits on the implementation cycle; a results driven approach rather than a learning organisational, personal developmental, process driven, adult education approach, seemed to have impeded the short-term, caregiving process. In terms of caregiving the professionals blamed care receiving participants for not being responsive in terms of taking enough responsibility.

Moreover, the women participants had no ideas on future leadership; and had clearly not been stimulated to think of themselves as potential leaders. They were ambivalent about the challenges; and when asked about electing possible leaders from their own ranks, nobody had any suggestions as to whether they needed or wanted a leader. Given this lack of capacity and leadership, the responsibility for financial statements of the project was delegated, by the management committee, to the Beaufort West Municipality. Their officials reported, on a monthly basis, to the project management committee that administered the project.

A local company of chartered accountants was appointed to audit the annual statement; and they reported favourably on the general State of the project’s financial practices and affairs (PAWC Quarterly Provincial Reports 1996 – 2000). However, the Chartered Accountants boldly commented on the audit they had conducted on the project, explaining its definition,
purpose and function of the audit as: “Die organisasie is nie self-onderhoudend nie, en kan tans nie voortbestaan sonder subsidies en staatstoelaes nie.”, translated from the Afrikaans, meaning “This organisation is not self-reliant and cannot survive without subsidies and State allowances” (PAWC Quarterly Provincial Report, 2000:01).

Closer analyses of income and expenditure; and, by implication, evaluating the competencies of the state, explained the quote from the auditors. Most of the income for this agricultural project was generated through allocations from a variety of government departmental and other sources. Amongst them are: PAWC Social Services; Public Affairs; the Health Department; the Poverty Relief Fund; the parastatal, the Independent Development Trust (IDT); Dogda Projects; and Ithuba.

Huge amounts were spent on infrastructural development of the project: to set up the poultry shed, tunnel netting, bee hives, furniture, fencing, the nursery and electricity; to purchase the poultry; for cultivation; to upgrade the building; on irrigation equipment, the telephone, transport, maintenance and cleaning materials; and on school fees.

It is notable that the amount paid in wages to participants was a meagre two per cent, or R17 402 of the total of R782 476 spent in 2000; compared with 12.9 per cent, or R32 058 of the total of R248 341 spent in 1999 (PAWC Quarterly Provincial Reports 1996 – 2000). In 2000, the local government, with a special note that in this instance the State was charging itself, charged the project R10 996 for administration costs; and R32 004, or four per cent for the training component. Unspent money for daily functioning included an investment and interest earned; and as at 31 March 2000 – the end of the fourth financial year – amounted to about R83 000. By November 2000, the time of my last visits, these funds were almost depleted.

At the time of data collection, the local authority responsible for financial statements, started basic, on the job, bookkeeping skills for the women participants at the request of the PAWC Department of Social Services. Until then, no formal or informal training was given other than in managing cash flow; and that was limited to the writing of receipts for the sale of vegetables. No skills training was done in adult basic literacy and numeracy; business planning; proposal writing; costing; pricing; marketing and budgeting; or in fundraising.

Given this background, the lack of trust by participants wanting more information and clarity appeared understandable.
7.5.4 Responsiveness: Care receiving

Care receiving could be defined as the response to caregiving by those to whom care is directed (Fisher & Tronto, 1990: 44). Questions that were considered for the investigation of this principle were directed at how care receivers responded to the care provided in project practices. These are:

- How well did the care process as it existed meet their needs?
- If the care process was in conflict with their needs, who resolved those conflicts?

In the case of the Beaufort West project, the responses of the project participants were likened to those of care receivers, as they responded to the care provided by State officials; as well as to self-care in times of financial difficulties. This anomalous position was critical to explore through further observation. The responses of both care receivers (namely, project beneficiaries) and caregivers were clearly affected by ability factors (for example, time, skill, knowledge, and resources) within the context of the caring situation. Fisher and Tronto (1990) argue that care receivers may acquire more intimate knowledge of their needs, as they experience them. Moreover, when people needing care become their own caregivers; and they survive with little income as did these participants, they may help by teaching each other and themselves new caregiving skills (for example, resilience, collective decision-making, questioning); or they may invent creative ideas about further survival strategies. But the capacity of care receivers to make use of this knowledge may also be limited by the resources available to them; and even where resources abound, there some needs remain that care-receivers can meet only with the help of caregivers (Fisher & Tronto, 1990:45). Judging from the respondents’ views captured below, self-help strategies do not totally avoid conflict between caregivers and care receivers:

"We could see that we have vegetables for winter and summer so that we are never without sales."

"We must plant more."

"More things could be improved e.g. installing a shower, cool storage room, and buying a vehicle ...."

"I would like to go forward with planting."
"We could be paid more."

"We should do things which could help us to move forward."

"We need a telephone and alarm system and more training."

"I would like to earn more money."

"I think the supervisor's attitude should change."

We get told we are the boss but we are not....."

Source: Focus Group Discussions

The value of responsiveness does not assume that the care process is over after caregiving. It takes into account that the object, person or group that received care, will respond to it. For, as Fisher and Tronto (1990) argue, the complexity of the interrelationship among the different phases of caring about, taking care of, and caregiving is heightened by the reactions of those who received care. Those engaged in the act of caring will thus have to use those responses to determine whether or not care has been completed; and whether alternative types of care are necessary.

7.6 Conclusion

By investigating the views of key informants (namely, female beneficiaries), on their experiences of how attentively the new, democratic state-led social partnerships (WPSW, 1997) and gender contracts operate, I developed a very illuminating understanding of the disconnection between macro policy ideals; and local community and project-based implementation. Protocols about responsibilities determined nationally and provincially, were exposed; starting with caregiving activities; and with the resources dealing with targeted groups of people making choices about who is in, who is out, and who does what (March et al., 1999).

In the second project case of the Beaufort West Community Vegetable Garden, my observations of the interactions and transactions between State officials (namely, caregivers) and female project participants (namely, care receivers) suggests a more superficial, top-down, social partnership; intersectoral working relationships within and between national,
provincial and local levels of government; and minimal civil society legitimacy and support. Poor women became co-opted in a politically conservative, racially polarised, township community development setting orchestrated by the local state. Vulnerable, underemployed women were not provided with any meaningful leadership skills training. Their disempowerment was evident in constant experimentation and diversification, from single a vegetable garden project to a multi-faceted, small-scale cultivation farming site; by the lack of sustainable income; in their vulnerability with the little income that they did earn; and in the fear of more risky decision-making. They were disempowered, with no evidence of the educare that was supposed to be an important pillar of the DSW project design. The operationalisation of the flagship project became deeply politicised and embroiled in local RDP and political party agendas. By co-opting the new language of gender and development policy the strategic policy direction to embark on innovative gender and development policies addressing critical national developmental goals appeared compromised by false claims of provincial and local ‘achievements’, delivering on nationally defined programme criteria.
Chapter Eight: Developmental social welfare: Crossroads, Cape Town, Western Cape

“We want to work for straight wages....”

8.1 Introduction

The gendered social development project approach adopted in this setting is both similar and different to the project case discussed in Chapter Seven. It is similar because it formed part of the overall ‘developmental social welfare’ initiative facilitated by the Provincial Administration of the Western Cape (PAWC), Social Services Department in terms of the commitment to regionally implement two of the total of 20 national Flagship projects, following the same broad NDSW policy guidelines (1995). However, unlike the semi-rural agricultural (community vegetable garden) project of Beaufort West, in which several layers of local and provincial government together led the partnership relationship with NGOs and local women, Philani Flagship Project, was peri-urban-based; and due to the tendering process, differently conceptualised. It was initiated and managed under the auspices of an established civil society organisation (CSO), the Philani Nutrition Centre (based in Crossroads and Khayelitsha), with the State as a background funding partner.

The Philani Nutrition Centre (PNC) is a registered Non-Profit Organization in terms of the Non-Profit Organisations Act No. 71 of 1997. It is one of a few Health NGOs established in opposition to the apartheid systems neglect of local residents living in informal settlements. The organization always had a dual focus: to rehabilitate malnourished children through nutrition and health care programmes; and to provide income-generating skills training for unemployed mothers as part of its service programme. This focus formed the basis of its historical alternative gender-based organisational strategy, which later (post-1994) became a key policy targeting area that it shared with the state’s intended project goals of its newly launched NDSW Policy Guidelines for Implementation of Flagship Project: Developmental Programme for Unemployed Women with Children under Five Years, (1996), demonstration programmes that the Beaufort West Flagship formed part of. Based on this shared focus,
PAWC Social Services (representing the state) thus set the parameters for the implementation of the criteria, acting as silent partner, donor and watchdog in the regional concept development phase. The gender aspects and the organisational emphasis of targeting both poor unemployed women and vulnerable children, through the skills training component and childcare in informal settlements, clearly strengthened PNC’s position to become a service provider with the State in this new venture.

The purpose of this chapter is to report the findings of investigating the policy implementation process of social development or developmental social welfare through the Flagship Projects from the perspective of both care receiving beneficiaries and caregiving partners (CSO/state). Corresponding care-taking practices (Fisher & Tronto, 1990) and the interactive relations embedded within and between different caregiving partners (PNC and state), in relation to community-based, care receiving women’s groups, will be captured in the discussion of findings. Unlike the case discussed in the previous chapter of this thesis, Philani acted as the leading project implementing partner, with the State as donor and policy regulator.

The policy process structures (such as partnership building and stakeholder relations) and practices have had important consequences for the way in which notions of gender, gender relations and care have been incorporated and shaped in organisational partnership contracts. I continue here to build my argument that the simple, yet thought provoking, questions based on the political ethic of care framework (Fisher & Tronto, 1990), could lay the basis for monitoring policy programmes, implementation structures and their processes. These organisational issues of change should be explored to bring policy practices into perspective. Using this analytical frame, the questions are posed to assist with the explanation and understanding of tensions and conflicts in determining social planning and policy priorities by those who hold power (Tronto, 1995).

8.2 Historical context of the community setting

Crossroads is a high-density informal settlement situated on the outskirts of Cape Town in the Western Cape, South Africa, about 28 kilometres from the Central Business District and about 14 kilometres from Cape Town International Airport. It is located on what is known as the Cape Flats’, a large, flat area of wind-blown land covered predominantly by sand, situated
to the North of Cape Town and commonly described as the dumping ground of apartheid, due to relocation of whole communities here during forced removals as a result of the Group Areas Act (Group Areas Act No 41, 1950).

People first settled in Crossroads in 1975 as a rebellion against the racist laws enforced by the apartheid government. By 1979, Crossroads had been given the status of an emergency transit camp by the Cape Town judiciary and was therefore immune to the wholesale slum clearances that took place across the Cape Flats and other shanty towns across South Africa following the Soweto uprising (16 June 1976). Mainly African families began to settle here as Langa, one of Cape Town’s first African townships established in terms of apartheid Bantu Laws, became overcrowded.

By 1980, Crossroads had over 110 000 residents and had become the Western Cape’s largest informal settlement. It further developed into sub-sections, such as New Crossroads, Old Crossroads, Upper Crossroads and KTC (Klipfontein Transit Camp). In the mid-1980s, Crossroads became the centre of numerous protests against apartheid laws, such as the Group Areas Act No 41 of 1950, Natives (Urban Areas) Act of 1923 and Pass Laws Act of 1952. These laws, used for influx control and forcible removals, galvanised resistance by anti-apartheid social movements and resulted in daily struggles for improvements in living, housing and working conditions. During the mid-1980s, many lives were lost, shacks were burnt down and houses destroyed by the apartheid state, resulting in upheavals leaving many families homeless. In 1981-82 I was working as a practitioner social worker at Boys Town Duin-en-Dal, a childrens home situated on the border of this ‘illegal’ informal settlement, and recall many raids by the apartheid military forces to ‘bull doze’ shanty structures.

In an attempt to address the problem of overcrowding, the Cape Town local authorities followed a race-based differentiated strategy to relocate African and Coloured residents to new township settlements, further away from the predominantly White city centre. For example, Coloured residents were relocated to Mitchells Plain and Atlantis (both new township developments); while Khayelitsha, a newly created settlement, was developed to accommodate African residents. However, some of these residents did not have temporary resident permits as required by the apartheid state, dividing them into legal and illegal squatters. The illegal squatters were continuously harassed with threats of repatriation to the apartheid Homeland (Bantustans), and their shelters demolished. This caused tension between
illegals who wanted to stay and some elements of those considered legal, and who were co-opted by the State into vigilantism in typical apartheid divide-and-rule fashion.

In 1985, riots broke out in Crossroads (Ngcoto, 1990). Some anti-apartheid activists joined these struggles by living and hiding in Crossroads and KTC to fight against these evictions. Eight people were killed and a few hundred injured during clashes between protestors and the police that sparked initial campaigns. Between May and June 1986, around 60 000 people were forcibly removed from their homes in squatter camps in Crossroads and the immediate surrounding areas. Some were moved to the Khayelitsha formal settlement, while others moved to wherever they could find a place to erect a new shelter. Many of the residents of Old Crossroads were eventually resettled in Khayelitsha and other newly created informal settlements and townships, such as Philippi, Mfuleni, Delft and Wesbank. ‘Boys Town’ Childrens Home moved out of the area to Macassar but the area in “Old Crossroads” that it vacated maintained the name and became to site where the Philani Flagship project was initially established.

8.3 Partnership formation and gendered planning

Crossroads continued to have high rates of gangsterism, unemployment, poverty and related health problems, such as tuberculosis and malnutrition. There were few NGOs operating within informal settlements like Crossroads. However, Philani Nutrition Centre had a particular role as service provider in the field of gender, health and social development during the anti-apartheid struggle in Crossroads and Khayelitsha.

Philani is a Xhosa word meaning ‘be well’. Philani Nutrition Centre (PNC) is a registered non-profit organisation (NPO). It was established in the squatter community of Crossroads in 1979, on the initiative of a Swedish medical doctor, Ingrid le Roux, who worked with local community health workers to rehabilitate malnourished children through interventions with both children and mothers. The local health workers worked tirelessly with other progressive health organisations to create awareness about the importance of primary health interventions. The organisation’s aim was to provide basic child health and nutrition services in poor disenfranchised communities that were ignored and neglected by the apartheid health authorities.
Since its establishment 33 years ago, and 18 years into the new democracy, PNC is still addressing the socio-economic problems of unemployment, poor housing, child malnutrition and related diseases that continue to prevail. Apart from its original focus on children, the organisation responded to the expressed needs of surrounding communities, providing adult education and skills training to women, setting up income-generating projects and pre-schools, doing home-based nutrition and child health outreach, and establishing projects for mothers-to-be, orphans and vulnerable children, dental health, and care and support for HIV positive mothers and children (PAWC, 1997). PNC survived extreme political turbulence during the 1980s and struggled financially due to a lack of State funding and government opposition to progressive initiatives. The post-apartheid democratic era did not automatically bring improvements or the resolution of funding problems for NGOs like PNC, as a decrease in international funding and insufficient subsidies affected available funds for NGOs. This situation did not see much improvement over the last two decades either.

At the time of this study, some of PNC’s organisational programmes were partially funded by the PAWC Departments of Health and Social Services, with little co-ordination between these two State departments. Each department appeared as implementing its own set of criteria for the funding of NPOs.

The Flagship Project initiative undertaken by PNC was a natural progression by the organisation to expand its own organisational operations as it launched deeper into the field of job creation by diversifying income-generating skills training with mothers of malnourished children under the age of five. To execute its organisational mission, PNC competed with 12 other NGOs in a State tendering process to launch the Western Cape’s first Cape Town-based DSW Flagship Project in partnership with PAWC’s Department of Social Services. In 1996, with a changing policy climate and more support for women and children from the new democratic state, PNC adapted its organisational targeting criteria to cater for women with children under the age of six years in order to meet the necessary requirements for the tender. With its long history of serving the poorest of the poor in the City of Cape Town, PNC won the tendering process. It became one of the first NGOs to partner with PAWC Department of Social Services to initiate the Western Cape regional division of the National Flagship Programme funded by poverty relief funds and the State Treasury. The Philani Flagship Project was formally established in 1997 when PNC entered into an official agreement with the State to facilitate and run a project that would provide PNC with
organisational support in the form of additional fundraising, management, marketing and sales of project goods (Mullagee et al., 2001).

The first business plan submitted by PNC for the state’s approval included the idea for establishing of a screen-printing skills-training project (using paper and fabric) for a group of 20 to 30 women over a 12-month period. As with the Beaufort West project, besides skills training for production and income generation, PNC undertook to provide early childhood development through educare. The women were also to be taught basic business skills.

The figure below shows the management structure of the Philani project as described in its business plan for 2000. The head of the structure was the PNC’s Board of Trustees, to which the PNC Committee reported. The Board had quarterly meetings, while the Committee met on a monthly basis. On the next tier, The Philani Flagship Project Management Committee administered the Flagship Project and met on a weekly basis. The Project Management Committee consisted of the management staff of the Nutrition Centre, a project co-ordinator, project administrator and one representative from each of its three business units. At the bottom of the governance structure was another Management Committee made up of three project staff members and the 31 project women (Mullagee et al., 2001).

Figure 8.1: Philani governance structure
8.4 Project development and implementation

Given the public tendering process and the PNC’s standing as an established non-governmental service provider in informal settlements, the Flagship Project Initiative developed without any further community consultation or participation by external, local, political or community forums.

The first group of fifteen women (Group 1) was recruited for training through a special process of advertisement on the local community radio. With more visibility, subsequent groups were recruited through advertisement by word of mouth, applying the admission selection criteria for women as developed by the State (being unemployed women with children under the age of six years). A survey conducted during 2001 by PNC revealed that only 18 per cent of women interviewed at the Philani Flagship Project and Khulani Nutrition Centre (another income generation project site of PNC) preferred to continue their current income activities, while the vast majority expressed the need for different income generation activities. For example, of the 84 women carpet weavers, only eight wanted to continue as weavers. While only three per cent were already engaged in sewing, 30 per cent indicated their preference for sewing activities. This practice and project intention to recruit a larger number of participants later changed after February 2001 due to financial cutbacks and project restructuring.

At the time of my field research over October 2000 to February 2001, the project occupied rented office and work space in Crossroads on the premises of a Christian faith-based development organisation Mfesane (meaning ‘mercy’). Mfesane had an office building, a store room and four working studios, which altogether comprised the Mfesane Sobambisana Community Centre in Boys Town, Old Crossroads. The Flagship Project Co-ordinator managed the project administration from the headquarters of the Philani Nutrition Centre in Khayelitsha, while the Supervisor, Administrator and marketing staff member worked from the Mfesane Sobambisana Community Centre.

As agreed in the terms of the partnership, PAWC’s Department of Social Development was the main donor. A second source of funding was income generated from the sale of project goods. The project budget for the period March 2000 to February 2001 made provision for several line items: salaries of three staff members, rent, office consumables, transport, telephone, cleaning, teas, outreach, training, bookkeeping and accounting, auditing, product
development, promotional material and marketing. However, as the hosting organisation, PNC subsidised the costs for project management; administration and co-ordination support, transport, pensions and unemployment benefits for the staff. Staff salaries constituted the largest proportion of the budget received from the Department, which was noted as a concern in a PAWC (2000) status report. The Flagship Project Co-ordinator received around R4,500 per month, while the supervisor and administrator (both ex-group members) each earned around R2,500. Staff salaries were augmented by PNC’s payment of pensions and unemployment benefits. Together with bookkeeping, auditing, rent and office expenses, staff salaries consumed more than half of the organisation’s annual budget.

As the project progressed, the first group of trainees opted for a co-operative producer group structure, with equal share of labour inputs and income among group members. This set a precedent for future new ventures. The income of the women in the three business units was generated from the sale of their products. This was earned after the deduction of 30 per cent earmarked as savings for raw materials and operational costs. The remaining 70 per cent was divided equally among the women in each business unit, with deductions being made for participants’ absenteeism and late coming. Each worker in Group 1 (Phambili) earned an average income between R450 and R1,000 per month. The monthly earnings for Group 2 were slightly less, being between R400 and R800, while Group 3 earned significantly less at around R200 to R400 per month (PAWC, 2000; Mullagee et al., 2001). Compared against project staff salaries, members earned far less than staff. The project’s budget for the period March 2001 to February 2002 reflected a 20 per cent salary increase for the supervisor and administrator, and an 11 per cent increase for the co-ordinator. According to Mullagee et al. (2001), these increases widened the earnings gap between staff and business unit members. They also noted other discrepancies between staff and workers, arguing that while staff members enjoyed fixed monthly salaries, incomes of the women workers were subject to production and changes in the market (Mullagee et al., 2001).

With the PAWC’s Department of Social Services conducting hardly any research at the time of my study, little was known about the actual selection and recruitment process of participants for the project. PAWC’s Annual Report for 1997 (PAWC, 1997) for example indicated that participants were from different informal settlements within the broader Crossroads area, including Browns Farm and Nyanga informal settlement. The same report
indicated that some women also came from areas as far away as Khayelitsha, travelling by taxi to participate in project activities.

After the first financial year, only two groups of women comprising a total of 25 members were trained, as opposed to the initial target of 90. By that time, it was clear that, given the nature of the production activity and ability factors – organisational resources, time, knowledge and skills training, as discussed in Fisher & Tronto, 1990 – the implementation and operational costs of the project were much more than anticipated. With existing costs, provision of skills training for more than 20 members per group would have been impossible. PNC proposed reducing targets for the project through dropping the beneficiary target from 90 to 45 and by adding an additional month to the three-month training period. However, from the state’s contractual partnership perspective, changing the original organisational strategy and broadening the original scope of the training period at such an early stage of project development was problematic (PAWC, 1997). The premise from which the State as a donor and partner raised concerns was the undertaking given by PNC to ensure that the project reached its aim of empowering women as opposed to just equipping women with skills (PAWC, 1997). State officials, through the words of the facilitator, thus documented an understanding proposing that the training continue bringing the total number of women trained to between 40 and 50 women by October 1998 (PAWC, 1997).

However, after the four-month training period of the first two groups, PAWC (1997) documents reported that women beneficiaries themselves identified a need for ongoing, advanced training in design and entrepreneurial skills. As the project’s operational needs expanded, a constant shifting of goals in terms of time, skills and money surfaced. These were noted as serious concerns in terms of sustainability and profitability of the initiative for State budgets. Organisational efforts to raise additional funds, beyond funds disbursed via PAWC Social Services, were thus supported (PAWC, 1998).

To ensure their survival in a highly competitive market-related production environment, ongoing training of women in marketing became the focus for the following six months. Marketing of the produce would get special attention to stimulate demand and supply. To ensure sustainability, three alternatives to expand the scale of operations were suggested:

- Diversification of skills training to include ethnic pottery;

---

29 This target was later reduced to a total of 45.
- Sewing skills to sew the cloth produced by the women; and
- Decentralising the training to areas with an influx of tourists.

By June 1998, a third group was in training. By then, the focus of screen printing was mainly on designing patterns or prints and transferring these onto handmade paper and cards. Basic literacy and numeracy classes were incorporated in addition to the productive skills training programme. This was done to accommodate the needs of those women who were recruited later than the initial groups, and who continued their participation throughout the financial year.

Despite organisational efforts to have childcare included from the outset, this component of PNC’s service agreement with government was eventually abandoned in favour of priority skills training for production and income. Given the time that would be missed out in terms of training which happened simultaneously with production, the organisation reasoned that releasing trainees for childminding would be difficult, if not impossible, due to time needed for adequate skills training and generation of income. The childcare component was then outsourced to the Mfesane crèche on the same premises, and participating women were encouraged to make use of this service, for which the Flagship Project had to pay.

8.5 Applying the political ethics of care approach (PEOC)

The four components of the political ethics of care perspective and its corresponding principles to evaluate good care again provided the framework for interpreting, coding and analysing the Philani case data (Fisher & Tronto, 1990). As demonstrated in the two previous cases, ‘caring about’ presupposed the value of attentiveness, where care is validated as a need that has to met. ‘Caring about’ thus required that the caretakers or caregiving partners (in this case PNC and their Flagship Management Committee, together with the state) call on the moral quality of being attentive to the needs of others (Fisher & Tronto, 1990), being, in this instance, the care receiving project participants. When one applies this moral principle, questions arise about the nature of the needs for care that exist (Tronto, 1993).

Hence how the need is perceived, who determines what a need is and how it is defined become critically important. Following this moral reasoning, the phase of ‘caring for’ is linked to the value or principle of responsibility. Once needs are identified and recognised by actors, as in the case of this government and NGO partnership, attempts made to meet these
needs direct the evolution of the further process. The problem of assessment to discover what the existing needs are raises expectations about how to meet these needs. ‘Caring for’ thus assumes that there are actors who will take responsibility for meeting needs. This raises questions as to who will do so and how in order to discuss the actions that have to be taken and who needs to be involved.

Caregiving is linked to the principle of competence, and refers to the actual practice and work of caring by caregiving partners in relation to care receiving participants. This points to the integration of the thinking and doing of care as a practice. The person or group that does the caregiving (in this case the PNC/State partnership) may, however, not be the same actors or institutions that care about the need in the first place (Fisher & Tronto, 1990). However, since the partnerships are responsible for the actual physical work of caring, there is the corresponding moral question as to whether or not the caregiving work is done well. The issue of competence in doing this thus becomes a key moral question.

The final value discussed by Fisher and Tronto’s account of the political ethic of care (1990) is care receiving (responsiveness). This value does not assume that the care process is over after caregiving has taken place. It takes into account that ‘care receivers’ (in this case participants) will respond to the practice of caring. As Tronto (1993) argues, those engaged in the act of caring will have to use that response to determine whether or not the process of care has been completed, thus assessing whether more or different types of care are necessary. Therefore, care receiving raises the moral question of responsiveness.

My study of social relations within different phases of the PNC/State partnership contract took account of different interacting partner perspectives (such as caregiving organisations and care receiving participants). The nature of the partnership formation process, which was preceded by a more business-oriented demand and supply tendering policy process, affected the practical realities of implementing the terms of the contract and the regulating function of the caring process of DSW that evolved in this peri-urban community context.

Given the complexity of such a partner relationship, the actors and relations involved presupposed preconditions of the caring activity or certain ability factors that were specific to each phase of the process. The most critical of these are time, material resources, knowledge and skill.
8.5.1 Attentiveness: Caring about

The topic of how the national vision for DSW and macro policy guidelines for flagships affected the overall purpose and design of the regional partnership initiatives, which I previously argued, is a complex one (see chapter 7 of this thesis). An example is how the organisation and the new partnership formation with the State used its organisational policy and expertise to make assumptions interpreting women’s needs called for clarity from the project participants’ perspective.

When asked about the overall purpose and goals of the project, all stakeholders (beneficiaries and staff) shared their different views in both focus groups and in-depth interviews. During interviews, the two co-ordinators employed by the Flagship during its main project implementation cycle had very different understandings of the organisation’s mandate and the needs of project beneficiaries that they assessed to be in line with the agreement with the State. In the words of the first co-ordinator who held the position of fieldworker:

*The initial target in terms of the agreements of the Department of Welfare was for 90 women to be trained on a three-year period in this particular Flagship. Within a month or two of starting our training, we realised that to try to train 90 women sufficiently in that space of time, was quite unrealistic, because it’s a very long process of acquiring the skills. The 90 was then reduced to 45 with the agreement by the Department of Welfare. So in terms of our first group, we had problems with recruiting. No one knew – and could not really relate to – what was screen printing .... We struggled with recruiting people into the programme .... Our first group was small. We identified that 15 to 20 was the maximum that one could have in a group. So we recruited 15 which, during the training programme, whittled down to actually being 11, completing the four months’ training. It included everything from technical practical design work, you know, printing with potato cut-outs and leaves, moving onto drawing pictures and moving onto then, you know, eventually using the screen printing techniques. Aside from the technical practical printing skills, all the additional skills that people need to learn ..., design development, organising your own raw materials, supervising your own stock, supervising your production. That in itself took almost a year for people to move from being completely new, to having the skills to be actually able to manage orders. On*
the business side, which we’re still struggling with, some people have really, you know, that kind of flying with the wave, and the other people are really struggling with that. And this is also within the groups as well.

(Project Coordinator, Respondent 11)

However, this statement contrasts with that of the Project Co-ordinator appointed in 2000, who followed up on the work of the first one. She had this to say about the organisation’s orientation towards the Flagship:

I think originally there were two different [competing] ideologies ... the difference between the Philani Flagship and others (PNC’s projects). Number one, other projects have a particular group structure.... It doesn’t seem to be divided; it hasn’t got this internal division of groups. But I think initially the Department’s idea was, this is going to be a project that you set up. You have to support people in the beginning but then all the people within that project are trained to take over that whole project. Basically you are starting a business, developing a business plan and have mentors. People are to provide mentorship and support, until that project is independent. That’s now, after all these six months, how I understand the Department’s idea with the Flagship.

But even then when they were having arguments about it, I’ve been saying to the facilitator: “I don’t see it like that.” To me, that wasn’t the way this project was developed. Philani’s [the organisation’s] idea for that project, if you read their business plan, was fundamentally different in that they maintained permanent staff in that project. There was permanent staff like Co-ordinator, the Trainer, people who were permanently based there. And people moved through that project on their way to independence. In other words, as individuals. Or the way Philani functions, for example in the weaving, was the women get trained, they weave mats from home or from wherever. They take advantage of Philani’s marketing or whatever. But, they are basically on their own. There’s no capital. If they need strings, they help with strings. They function as individuals. It’s called an employment project.

(Provincial Coordinator No.2, Respondent 12)
As stated in the business plan for 2000/02, cited in Mullagee et al. (2001) a strategic objective reported for the first phase (March 2000-February 2001) of the project was to empower women so that they can earn a basic monthly income to meet their basic needs by having successfully and legally organise themselves into IGPs. The plan further envisaged that women would have achieved the goal of an increased income through commercialisation of processes; skills training and greater participation at the end of phase one. And since the first funding was received towards the end of the funding period, it was not possible for the project to achieve these goals. (Mullagee et al., 2001).

The new production experiment, unlike weaving (a skills training activity that is closer linked to the nutrition programme based in Khayelitsha), involved entirely different human and other resources (for example, new skills, knowledge, new terms of production, and time-frames) which called for a different costing approach. Although providing a new challenge to experiment with a co-operative group style of project management, PNC in attending to the start-up phase, assessing and targeting women’s individual potential, seemed totally under prepared in budgeting, planning and managing new self-help group dynamics to empower subjects. These terms that were set within the service agreement between State and the NGO service provider thus appeared back grounded.

At the time of my research, the experiment with a three-tier co-operative group structure as evident in its management and functioning, became seriously affected by major tensions and conflict within and between the first and the second and third care receiving producer groups on the one hand; and between PNC’s and the State (caregivers) over the terms and mandate in understanding the terms of the service agreement (memorandum of understanding) as partners in caregiving’. Given the range of different learning needs to which the flagship service provider (PNC) responded through skills training, ‘caring about’ was the phase in which the care abilities – expertise, knowledge, resources – of the organisation were visibly challenged. In this instance, caring about did not necessarily bring with it the needed skills and competencies (Fisher & Tronto, 1990).

Given that PNC itself lacked expertise in utilising an adult basic literacy training approach and lacked resources, particularly space, for educare, these special resources had to be contracted in or purchased, and then factored into costs. Such limitations pressurised both caregivers (the organisation and the donor) to make choices or trade-offs which may or may not have been in the best interest of the organisation and beneficiaries at a particular time.
when budgets were challenged. Yet catering for basic needs such as adult basic education (including literacy and numeracy) was realistic given the historical neglect of poor working class women’s needs before and during the transition to democracy. Addressing such needs required designated time, knowledge and resources which may have been seriously compromised. For, as Fisher and Tronto (1990) argue, caregivers (in this case PNC/State partnership) are often pressurised to do more than they can manage: caring for (or prioritising) some things – such as the content and duration of skills training for production and income generation – more than others (particularly personal development, empowerment and self-care). The lack of individual and personal assessments of training potential as had been done previously by the organisation may thus have been compromised by the group’s development in terms of a workable managing structure. For example, some candidates’ suitability or aptitude for the artistic skill of hand-painted screen printing was identified as problematic and a hindrance to production.

During my focus group discussions with representatives from all three groups, I established that not all members received the same training over time. Different groups were recruited at different stages in the implementation of the Flagship Project. This lack of holistic understanding was reflected in their narratives about project goals and functioning and the end goal of becoming independent business operations. In fact, all women who participated in the focus group discussions made it clear that they would prefer to work for a weekly wage than on a profit-share basis. This credo was corroborated in findings of another research study conducted into the general working conditions of the women (Mullagee et al., 2001). In the latter report, women who were asked how they would want their working conditions to be changed replied that they wanted a basic wage. The study also reported that when they made this demand to the management of PNC, it was rejected.

At the time of my own study (December 2000), a bank account for Groups 2 and 3 had just been opened. Each group was expected to follow the PNC’s requirement to collectively retain or save 30 per cent of their total income to cover inputs (raw material). This business principle was not one which all women agreed to or understood. Almost all the women expressed a very basic practical caring need:

*We were thinking that because we don’t get money, from that 30 per cent of ours in the bank, we could get something so that we can see what to do about buying clothes for the kids in December.*
The lack of understanding of such basic business principles was apparent for all the women who participated in the focus groups.

8.5.2 Responsibility: Taking care of

Given its years of experience as a skills training organisation, PNC perceived its role as a caregiver and service provider very seriously in relation to income-earning skills training. Given the periodical assessment in terms of operational caregiving and skills training, the organization did adapt its programme with some input from participants. The programme changes responded positively to the women’s strategic gender needs\(^{30}\) by addressing and advancing participants’ numeracy and literacy levels. Furthermore, a study conducted by Masu, (cited in Mullagee \textit{et al.}, 2001), found that of the 31 women that received training, only 15 (42 per cent) had formal education at primary school level. These findings suggested that the women would benefit from a literacy, numeracy and Business English skills programme, which was subsequently introduced by the organisation. A further ten of the total group (28 per cent) achieved functional literacy through PNC contracting an NGO service provider that followed the Adult Basic Education (ABET) Level 3 curriculum. The remaining six participants had already achieved matric or Level 4 of the National Qualifications Framework (NQF) before joining the project.

Although Group 3 complained of gaps, all three groups of women received technical skills training in silkscreen printing and design. This programme ran for three to four months after the first group’s recruitment in April 1997. Follow-up training also took place during October-December 1998, with programme activities consisting of:

- Formal workshops and on-the-job training in paper and textile silkscreen printing and design;
- Papermaking and printing techniques;
- The enhancement of design skills;
- Supplementary courses in sewing and pattern making;
- Leadership empowerment workshops; and

---

\(^{30}\) See Molyneoux (1985:232)’s distinction between strategic and practical gender needs/interests.
- Literacy and numeracy classes.

(Mullagee et al., 2001; PAWC 1998b)

In addition to this, five participants underwent a business skills training course, while more women indicated the need for such training (Masu, cited in Mullagee et al., 2001; Mullagee et al., 2001). The final business plan (2000) also envisaged women receiving more training sessions to cover current skills (paper and textile screen printing as well as weaving) and on-the-job business management skills during the March 2000-February 2001 funding period.

But while the project – and the PNC as care giver – took the responsibility for more skills training seriously, this did not happen without difficulties. When I investigated how the recipients of care accepted responsibility for care, several responses were noted. These were divided between those who had exposure to some sense of independent decision-making – such as the group that was first trained (Phambili Printing, Group 1) and that had experienced the supportive role played by the caregiving organisations – and other, more subordinate groups that were formed later. From PNC’s perspective, Phambili Printing set the trend for the second and third groups (Siyazama Printing, Group 2; and Mphumalanga Printing, Group 3), whose members had to abide by the rules laid for the initial idea of the three-tier co-operative productive group structure. However, some of the women argued that Phambili Printing exercised undue power and control over which group accessed the bigger orders. Phambili and Siyazama were trained in the same techniques but used different designs which did not sell equally well. Phambili’s animal prints of the big five wild animals were perceived as commercially more popular with tourists, earning them more orders and sales. These prints became tightly controlled and were treated as Group 1’s copyright. The more ethnic designs produced by Group 2 depicting township life and commercial symbols (such as labelling of local produce popular with poor working class, such as tinned food and hair products), did not sell as well as the popular wild life themes due to different production and marketing strategies. This lack of demand caused a major rift and fierce competition among the groups for an equal share of sales to the tourist market. The Siyazama group (Group 3) who was trained in beading and earned less income, raised these concerns about the pricing, marketing strategy and earnings. The further promotion of two Phambili project members to office duties, including business administration, added a further dimension to Siyazama as well the Mphumalanga group’s dissatisfaction. They accused Phambili’s members of nepotism and abuse of power. The majority of the women did not feel ready for the expected independence
and self-reliance that was under discussion at the time of my investigation. Some members appeared less confident than the other two groups involved with screen printing on cloth. Moreover, they earned far less than the other groups through screen printing on paper to produce cards. Lastly, while sewing and beading added to their repertoire of skills and production activities, this did not make up for their lower earnings.

To understand the vacillating expectations about waged work and how these differentiating production and marketing strategies operated and how power dynamics manifested amongst care receivers, Fisher and Tronto (1990), in discussion of the care process, alert us to appraise the most pervasive contradictions involved in the caretaking phase, being the inequality between responsibilities and power. The extent to which the women (care-receivers) were assigned responsibility for generating their own work and income through marketing and sale of goods without receiving appropriate business skills training (e.g., as in the case of Group 3), exacerbated the contradictions between responsibility and power. This served to increase mounting tensions. And while the responsibility placed on these groups were great, the power to perform well was limited (Fisher & Tronto, 1990).

It became evident that, as much as it was expected of the project and its groups to absorb some of the cost of not having a salaried co-ordinator at a particular time during the project process, the responsibilities shared in terms of how much they as participants were willing to absorb the costs depended on a variety of factors: skills, availability of resources, the existence of others to share the responsibilities and, more importantly, the degree to which they developed self-confidence through caring (Fisher & Tronto, 1990). The hostility, competitiveness, tensions and anxiety amongst the groups were produced by an apparent three-tier structure that was not effectively researched and which added to the contradictions and pressures that were involved in taking responsibility for managing a potentially unsustainable project operation. Many of the women were truly vulnerable in terms of food security and income. For them, the strictly business nature of operations, tensions of competition and scope of this kind of project was overwhelming. Some of the issues raised in Fisher and Tronto’s (1990) argument, including burn-out syndrome, disillusionment and disempowerment, were clearly visible in my observations of interactions and transactions between the service organisation and the women.

In probing the hopes and aspirations that individuals had when joining this type of project, one respondent shared:
It was difficult in the beginning, but was okay as time went on. We were told we were going to be trained and thereafter work. So I thought really I was going to be better off than working in the fields.... When we came here, we were told that we must sign a contract, otherwise we are not employed; but we didn’t sign it, so we were not paid. They said we are self-employed.

Source: Individual Interviews (January, 2001; Participant 4.).

When asked about difficult decisions that the group had to make, the respondent had this to say:

Okay, the decision we made was that if you are late your salary is going to be deducted. It was not easy for us ... we were supposed to at least talk to each other before getting to that decision but we are not employed here. So some people didn’t come and apologise when they were late.

Source: Individual Interviews (January, 2001; Participant 4).

In responding to the question of what was needed to make amendments and to improve the conditions of work for their groups, she continued,

We should discuss, and things should be explained even to those who don’t understand, because they just agreed with those others.

Source: Individual Interviews (January, 2001; Participant 4).

When I asked this same woman what changes she saw for herself within the next period, she responded,

We want to work for straight wages. I want to change. I want to look for another job.

Source: Individual Interviews (January, 2001; Participant 4).
As observed before, too much responsibility with the burden of taking care may lead to less care (Fisher & Tronto, 1990).

Another important matter that was not fully resolved was the fact that the production process suffered setbacks through slowing down while women underwent training, which in turn affected income earned as not all received the same income. A further problem already identified during 2000 was the fact that training programmes did not make provision for meals. The working hours and low pay caused women to be hungry all day with no available shops or cafes on the site. While some women had to wait to be paid a stipend, others who had children under the age of five received the monthly child support benefit.

Caregiving partnership organisations like PNC that depended on international funding and that were already vulnerable as a result of the overwhelming nature of their organisational service work and activities in informal settlements, suffered a serious shortage of funding during this reform period, as many donors preferred to channel funding directly via the government rather than through NGOs.

8.5.3 Competency: Caregiving

The fact that PNC, together with its NGO training partners, took responsibility for the actual physical activities, doing care work through skills training while the State remained an absent donor partner, raises the moral question as to whether the caregiving that was done (or the service rendered, being direct skills training incorporating literacy and numeracy) had any impact. The competencies of the PNC project staff, along with the state’s experimentation with and implementation of DSW policy which followed this business model provides grounds for a notable moral question.

PNC articulated a clear desire for more time and resources to be able to do what it deemed necessary, underscoring caregiving through skills training for production and income generation. As a seasoned service provider in this field, its experiential knowledge allowed it to exercise flexibility in its practical interventions, understanding the need to be open to change in organisational programme structure and approach. However, as a result of continuous changes and amendments of targeting and production strategy, the marketing and sale of new products suffered in the project implementation process. Through trial and error, a very expensive lesson was learnt. For example, the organisation needed to understand and appreciate the appropriate planning, timing and investment required to fund a relevant,
infused, adult-learning, needs-based approach in a financial policy climate that restricted social spending by the State partner. The partnership programme that was funded by the PAWC state subsidy demanded far more transparency, accountability, proficiency, knowledge, experience, skill, resources and calculative judgment about the design and planning projects in order for it to allow participants to appropriately achieve the empowerment goals of embracing leadership as well as literacy and numeracy skills from this partnership than the way in which the state operated its own (state) initiated project in Beaufort West at this time. These demands appeared as serious shortcomings in the strategic roles played by both the implementing agency (PNC) and its main partner, the State (PAWC), who had also seriously neglected to fund basic adult literacy needs in its own programme designs.

Given the hostilities that I had observed in the Philani three-tier group structure, and in order for me to understand the complex competencies that related to what appeared to be a rather divisive tool for caregiving, some further questions emerged:

- What were the underlying motive and ideas behind the co-operative mode of production in this particular flagship project?
- How well did this work for the negotiated gender contract and social partnership model to meet the goal of empowerment and skills training?
- What were the underlying assumptions or the roots of the conflict that emerged between or among caregivers and care receivers? (State and NGO and between the different member groups) What resources did caregivers identify to care competently?
- Did gender and care as understood by the project play a role?
- How were gender and the conflict it produced, understood in this context?

8.5.4 Responsiveness: Care receiving

The value of responsiveness implied by the care perspective does not assume that the care process is over after caregiving. Care receiving could thus be defined as the response to care by those to whom care is directed (Fisher & Tronto, 1990: 44). It takes into account that the object, person or group that received the care will respond in a myriad of ways. Tronto argues that those engaged in the act of caring will have to use that response to determine whether or not care has been completed or whether additional types of care are necessary. Care receiving therefore inadvertently raises the moral question of responsiveness that needs to be deliberated.
Since care work is by its very nature a challenge, especially to those who believe in the ability of individuals to be entirely autonomous and self-supporting, some questions need to be investigated: How did care receivers respond to the care provided in the project practice? Why did care receivers respond to the care provided in the way that they did? How well did the care process meet their needs? Why was there so much conflict? Was it related to their call for more attentiveness? How were the conflicts resolved? Who resolved these conflicts?

The state’s insistence on the establishment of self-reliant micro-enterprises at a time when the majority of participants was clearly still undecided on the idea of collective ownership, raised serious doubts about the underlying care and developmental approach prescribed in the National Department of Social Welfare’s Financing Policy (1999). The major dissatisfaction and conflict during the implementation of the project process manifested in the structural relationship, being the hierarchy between those in powerful positions who were responsible for managing the co-operative structure and communicating unpopular decisions that stemmed from different sources to the workers.

General discontent about how the project operations were carried out was, from the care receiving participants’ point of view, was sparked by the 30 per cent deduction of project income that participants forfeited on a monthly basis. As mentioned above, all participants in focus group discussions over 2000 and 2001 stated that they preferred to receive straight wages and failed to grasp the basic business principle that was key to the PNC organisational approach of subsidising project inputs, including raw materials. The groups had tried to clarify this confusion with management for a long time, arguing for either retention or management of the 30 per cent by their own groups. Their call was for greater accountability and transparency on how the 30 per cent was spent by PNC staff. In their opinion, this information or clarification of approach was not forthcoming.

An additional complaint was that PNC deducted a further ten per cent from goods sold at the Centre’s shop in Khayelitsha. Flagship participants did not see why this money should be deducted from the sale of goods when the project budget made provision for marketing costs. These demands raised by the participants propelled the organisation to introduce changes and new practices in their operations of income generation projects for poor women e.g. opening of banking collective banking accounts for each group that they had not considered before. This new development appears to have satisfied the request for more openness.
Women in the groups struggled to express a sense of ownership of the project. They still perceived the Board and Trustees of PNC as employers and decision-makers. The division of labour and tasks between groups within the project structure was clearly hierarchical, and similar to that of a small-scale factory set-up (PAWC, 1997b) or small industry/production unit, with waged workers producing goods, and managing staff supervising and controlling the quality and production activities, taking responsibility for supplying staff doing office duties, purchasing raw material, pricing, and marketing and selling goods, and not a more democratic ‘cooperative’ structure (Satgar, 2007).

Although the Flagship project was linked to wider PNC programmes, the women who participated in these smaller pilot flagship projects expressed major concerns about their low income and health that are affected by the working conditions (e.g. inhalation of the smell of paint, poor ventilation etc), feeling that they did not have the power to change their conditions. Their limited knowledge and understanding of business principles suggested a lack of knowledge, capacity and poor control over funding arrangements, budgets, marketing and pricing decisions.

The co-ordinator had to deal with all the grievances regarding the 30 per cent deduction for raw materials as the groups demanded higher rates of pay with no regard for the longer-term sustainability implications. To create more accountability and transparency, the three groups were eventually assisted to open their own banking accounts to each manage their 30 per cent shares. Other than this, no further strategic thought regarding future project operations, leadership development or alternative fundraising strategies were instituted.

8.6 Conclusion

The purpose of this chapter was to report results based on the user perspectives of beneficiaries who participated in the implementation of DSW policy process through the community-based Philani Flagship Project. The caretaking social partnership role and practices resulted in interactive social relations embedded within and between different development partners: PNC (an NGO) and the State (specifically PAWC) as caregivers, and participating local women who were positioned as vulnerable care receivers. Unlike the example of the previous project case, Philani as civil society partner took a leadership position implementing the gender contract, with the state’s participation as donor being in the background.
The partner relationship building process had important consequences for the way in which notions of gender, gender relations and a care ethic had been incorporated and shaped. As a result, some thought-provoking questions, informed by care ethics, were explored. In order to understand how macro social policy priorities manifest at local level through micro projects facilitated by actors who hold power, the validity of care ethics as a frame opened space to raise even more questions than the answers I could provide. User perspectives, to highlight and understand conflict and contradictions, became more pronounced. Given the background to the national programme, and bearing in mind the state’s leading role in conceptualising and designing of the community-based idea of settings, applying the political ethic of care to understand the policy implementation process elicited the following questions:

- How were the National Flagship Programme and the Philani Flagship Project in Crossroads, an informal settlement on the outskirts of Cape Town in Western Cape, related to the earlier case (as discussed in Chapter 7 of this thesis) in terms of design?

- Given that the nature and form of the partnership with an established NGO, why did misunderstanding and conflict arise between the State and NGO about the actual terms of reference and partnership arrangements concerning organisational input in planning, actual design and implementation and timelines?

- How were needs determined? Why were other role players (NGO networks working in these impoverished areas, other community forums) left out in the articulation of needs? Who ultimately articulated needs?

- Whose needs were really being addressed through which types of project measures?

- What is the true nature of these partnership relationships in the functioning of the project and the group structure, given the reproduction of subsequent hierarchies between PNC and State as caregivers and the unemployed mothers as care receivers?

- Who was actually responsible for meeting needs? If care was amongst these needs, who took on the responsibility for meeting them?

- Who are the actual caregivers and how well did they perform this work?

In this particular project case, the ethic of care as a normative framework exposed conflict and contradictions in policy implementation at different project levels raising unanswered questions. Firstly, the tensions between the caregiving partners became inflamed around interpretation and commitment to common agreements or memorandum of understandings, such as funding principles. Secondly, there was conflict between the policy implementers and the beneficiaries. Thirdly, there were tensions between care receivers and responsiveness amongst the women themselves. The ensuing conflict raised questions about the kind of
resources that were needed for competent caregiving, which placed under the spotlight the way in which these women, as care receivers, responded to the care that had been provided within the NGO-led partnership.
Chapter Nine: Conclusion

9.1 Introduction

The purpose of this concluding discussion is to summarise the findings of the last three chapters in terms of the main research questions that precipitated my investigation into the gendered dimensions of new social policies to address poverty and inequalities. I draw attention to some of the major feminist ethical theories and issues in exploring alternative historical and contextual frameworks to study transitional community settings, projects and social relations, pointing to Tronto’s (1993) PEOC frame that served as an important research and analytical approach to examine key social issues that surfaced in the implementation of policy services. The adopted care perspective exposed complex social issues that intersected with gender, race and class posing new questions for further studies. It challenged norms and standards set by the accepted justice and rights-based assumptions embedded in the newly adopted social and human developmental policy approach. While attempting to investigate the latter as a new policy paradigm seeking to redress the legacies of fragmented, race-based, separate development (namely, apartheid), the validity and strength of the PEOC frame, as an alternative to existing normative rights-based evaluative research approaches (Sawyer, 2007)\(^{31}\), emerges as a critical point of discussion when comparing cross-case settings. The theoretical discussion in social work and other disciplines, and debates of using the frame for policy monitoring and evaluation research, stretches beyond the confines of a single thesis; and should be regarded as a new starting point for a broader field of policy research that is already booming. To conclude my discussion and due to the need for further study, lessons learned through case analysis using PEOC as lens are also compared with the empowerment and human agency concerns initiated and shared by the World Bank studies.\(^{32}\)


One of the key questions, and one that this thesis set out to answer, is whether poverty and inequality were satisfactorily addressed through the policy actions during a significant, historical reform period in the country’s post-colonial policy development. To answer this question, I explored and applied Tronto’s 1993 PEOC frame as an alternative, normative, policy research and analytical approach to gender and social development. In my thesis, I developed the argument that this approach could work best when the goal is for more effective monitoring and evaluation of policies through incorporating an amplified consumer voice; and by empowering and involving affected beneficiaries, clients and citizens (Johnson, 1994; Rapp, Kisthardt, Gowdy, & Hanson, 1994).

During the historical period of transition (1994-2001) that I investigated, poverty reduction and work creation were the underlying objectives of the new dispensation in terms of social policies. These objectives were to be delivered using policy mechanisms such as partnerships, consortiums and multi-stakeholder relations that placed a great emphasis on human agency (role played by different partners/actors) and ‘empowerment’ in their interactions, relations or transactions.

Kabeer’s (2001) ideas of ‘empowerment’ captures the essence of what I think these new policies with its assumptions about human development and capabilities intended. She refers to empowerment as ‘the expansion in people’s ability to make strategic life choices in a context where these abilities were denied to them’ (cited in Schuler & Boender, 2002:6). Two key issues associated with this definition helps to distinguish it from previous notions reviewed by others i.e. the idea of process or change from a condition of disempowerment, and the notion of human agency and choice

My design – of a feminist qualitative multi-case study – explored Tronto’s 1993 PEOC lens as a coding and analytical research frame (Appendix 4) to capture the evolution of these relational dynamics as policies were implemented. In applying this, I explored the usefulness of, within a community setting, using feminist ethics to draw out some of the common policy issues emerging at this historical time of reform. This research found that the intersection of gender, race and class seriously challenged the new democratic justice and rights-based claims made by the social developmental paradigm. This shift – to a developmental paradigm – raised expectations for redressing the legacy of fragmented, race-based, separate development (namely, apartheid); and the unequal distribution of resources and skills. I realised that it was possible to validate the EOC frame as an appropriate theoretical and
ethical research approach for conducting social work policy studies by comparing the outcomes of critical issues; and also by analysing the questions raised when applying PEOC within case issues to cross-case patterns (namely, those generated by an analytical matrix developed in a World Bank study that I discuss in the next section).

The focus of my study was to analyse the multi-dimensional policy phenomenon of gender and social development: policies that experimented with social safety nets; and with IGPs addressing unemployment, poverty and gender planning to create opportunities for work, empowerment, security and care. These pro-poor policies, known as DSW, were modelled on World Bank guidelines. They were adapted in different policy sectors of the South African economy, in ways that analysts proclaimed to be new and innovative. This was particularly evident in the role played by the National Department of Social Welfare that were renamed as the Department of Social Development in order to execute its widely acclaimed DSW policies.

With deeper investigation; and using case analyses based on the PEOC, these novel new ideas were demystified as replications of globalised, neoliberal, policy strategies; strategies that resonated very closely with similar ‘workfare’ policies initiated in the US described by Rose (1995), and with ‘social safety net policies’ referred to by Kanji (2001) or ‘conditional cash transfer’ (CCTs), now known as ‘social protection’ in research in several developing countries (Cook & Razavi, 2012). The study found that the implementation styles and operational project aspects of these new policies mimicked several conservative ideological initiatives from the old apartheid era (see Chapter 7 of thesis); albeit in the context of implementing a new democratic developmental policies. The language of gender sensitivity, and socio-economic constitutional rights and entitlements has been effectively coopted to legitimate and continue the disempowerment of poor women’s access to economic citizenship. The lack of ownership in all three cases was evident in the operational styles.

My discussion of the last three chapters reported on evidence produced through case methodology using with-in case analyses (Eisenhardt, 1989; Ragin, 1994; See Chapters 6, 7, 8 of this thesis; Yin, 2003). The PEOC framework (Fisher & Tronto, 1990; Tronto, 1993) and questions served as a basis to code within-case data (Braun & Clark, 2006) to reconstruct narratives on IGPs implemented through new partnership organisations. This coding frame was then used to separate out four critical aspects of the policy implementation process, namely:
• The historical context of the community setting;
• Partnership formation and gendered planning;
• Project development and implementation; and
• Applying the PEOC approach.

In discussing the findings within these four sections; and by applying the elements of the EOC (namely, attentiveness, responsibility, competence and responsiveness), several similar or common policy issues emerged. These are displayed in the table that follows.

Table 9.1: Common policy issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project settings and activities</th>
<th>Common policy Issues</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Case 1: Mfuleni, Western Cape</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban township</td>
<td>Size and low priority of budget in relation to overall goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 kilometres from Cape Town CBD</td>
<td>Community involvement in needs identification</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brick making for men</td>
<td>RDP-related basic needs approach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garment Production for women</td>
<td>Work ethic and unemployment needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gender-specific, traditional division of labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sewing for women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brick making for men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fulltime Field co-ordination and Project manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Financial responsibility shifted to community groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participants were not the same group that identified needs or that selected the activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of ownership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dependency on International Donor Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Irregular Income and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No savings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No skills audit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Some evidence of marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No leadership Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of understanding of project history by participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Current group were not the same as the group that originally identified needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No management structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Failed production and income generation activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of power and decision-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High absenteeism and dropout rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conflict and lack of trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Case Two: Beaufort West</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community and RDP Forum involvement in</td>
<td>Fulltime field co-ordination discontinued</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of Ownership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lack of understanding of project history</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western Cape</td>
<td>Case Three: Crossroads/Khayelitsha, Cape Town, Western Cape</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Semi-rural
- 600 kilometres from Cape Town
- Vegetable and lucerne cultivation
- Poultry and egg farming
- Bee farming
- All work for women only

- Needs identification
- RDP-related goals of social development basic needs
- Unemployment
- DSW needs of poor unemployed women and children assessed top-down
- Local idea for vegetable garden project introduced top-down

- Due to finances
- Some team spirit
- Some evidence of leadership potential

- Irregular income
- Minimal savings
- Lack of self-reliance and continued dependency on State resources and infrastructure
- No skills audit
- Limited skills training that matched production
- No marketing
- No leadership or management training

- Current group were not the same as the group that originally identified needs
- Existence of project management structure, the Workplace Masakhe Committee
- Increased production and diversification
- Evidence of conflict between project supervisor, also the chair of the steering committee and participating beneficiaries
- Participants dependence on income support/social security
- High dropout rate and absenteeism
- Trust issues

- No involvement of community structures or RDP Forum in needs identification
- Needs assessed top-down by NGO based on experiential knowledge of running similar

- Full time field co-ordination discontinued due to finances
- Group structure: 3 producer groups
- Team spirit evident in one of the three groups
- Some leadership

- Lack of ownership
- Regular income
- Minimal savings
- Dependency on organisational infrastructure
- Skills audit
- More appropriate skills training matching

- Lack of understanding of project history
- Lack of power and decision making
- Evidence of conflict between individuals within and between groups
- Conflict between
• Production of hand-painted and screen printed fabric, paper and beading work
• All work for women only

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>IGPs</th>
<th>production activities</th>
<th>beneficiary groups, partners, the State and the NGO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RDP goals</td>
<td>Marketing evident</td>
<td>Lack of trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment</td>
<td>No leadership training</td>
<td>Survival and participation of subjects depended on income support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic adult literacy and numeracy</td>
<td>potential</td>
<td>High dropout rate and absenteeism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Source:] Cross-Case Analysis and Case study data of Three Project Cases (1996-2010)

In the first community setting, the traditional, gender-specific division of labour, falling into the attentiveness category, deserves attention. This resulted from the involvement of the local community health forum, a health forum representing all political parties, and unemployed residents, in a participatory, needs identification, planning process facilitated by academics. The emerging gender and community development dimension was interesting to note. By assuming a traditional, sexist division of labour (namely, men making bricks, a labour-intensive activity; and women sewing and making garments, far less labour-intensive activities), this project supported the international analyses on the role of patriarchy (see Chapters 3, 6 of this thesis).

Attentiveness in the second community involved the male-dominated, multi-party, community-based RDP Forum; a forum that appeared slightly less conservative about traditional gendered divisions in skill training. For example, participants (namely, women from the community) were trained in a variety of physical and labour-intensive skills (for example, vegetable, poultry and bee; lucerne planting and trench digging) normally associated with men. For work requiring skill, such as driving tractors, the project hired outsiders. In the existing farming sector, this specialised work is dominated by men.

The third community partnership setting had an experienced NGO as project implementer. Here, the needs identification process was based on past organisational experience; and on a tacit historical understanding of the profile of unemployed and unemployed residents. Having completed an individual audit during the recruitment of new participants (see Chapter 8 of
this thesis), the organisation understood that communities desperately needed basic numeracy and literacy skills to advance any income generation activity. A non-formal, specialised, Adult Basic Education and Training (ABET) service provider was thus contracted to experiment with an innovative, productivist, screen-printing skills training project subsidised by the new democratic state. These additional educational costs inflated the organisational project budget; and the State objected to this, instead of embracing the more educational approach (see Chapter 8 of this thesis). The introduction of ABET into the IGP project delivery approach by a respected NGO partner in this policy sector appeared at odds with the status quo and mainstream national educational policy vision of lifelong learning. Initiatives such as the current Future Education and Training (FET) policy initiatives were developed much later. The lack of synergy and cooperation between different policy sectors (social development, health, education, housing, trade and industry, etc) remains an ongoing challenge for effectively understanding and incorporating ABET as a bedrock for social development.

On the issue of responsibility, all the community sites experienced similar financial challenges, resulting in cutbacks, restructuring and staff retrenchments. An interesting phenomenon, not mentioned in the review of literature on IGPs (see Chapter 3 of this thesis), that affected the division of responsibilities between project participants and partners in this broader study, was the role that attrition (namely, dropping out) played in the project operational cycle. It had a bearing on skills development, on the production process, and in budgeting for staff to continue to provide skills training in IGPs. All sites reported dropout rates as affecting productivity, income, and the retraining of staff and participants. Due to time constraints, these processes were not studied in any depth. Given the high levels of donor subsidies at all three IGPs, production and income were adversely affected when these subsidies were reduced. When substantial restructuring of staffing took place, participants and self-help groups often had to make real financial sacrifices by doing self-care; by taking responsibility for project inputs or by forfeiting payment for labour (see chapters 6, 7, 8 of this thesis); and by coping with extra work. Their unpaid labour time was never appropriately recorded as an input to the project and partnering or community development efforts. There was little evidence of business administration skills development in all three community settings. In Case 3 (see Chapter 8 of this thesis), I reported on two group members being

33 See the goals of the Further Education and Training Colleges Amendment Act No 3 of 2012
promoted to perform the office administration duties as coming closest to mentoring and skills development.

The lack of competencies in business administrative operations (pricing, marketing, advertising) was evident in the organisational development approaches that were adopted. Minimal training was provided to help shift the initiated ‘self-help’ group to function as a small-scale, independent business unit or to move to a next phase of organizational development e.g. cooperative establishment. The NGO with the most experience in running IGPs as co-operatives (see Chapter 8 of this thesis) maintained its ‘dependency model’. That meant that as a small business unit the group could have used their ‘branding’ as an NGO, or their infrastructure and marketing approach. But although the NGO experimented with skills audits and with adult education for the flagship process, it needed to embrace a more empowering and emancipatory adult education and leadership skills training approach, in order to transform ownership issues of projects in terms of co-operative governance. The unsustainability of IGP partnerships and processes seems inevitable in the long term, due to the following recurring issues in all cases: the adverse policy environment; financial insecurity; and vulnerability and overdependence on bureaucratic state or NGO donor subsidies (See Chapters 6, 7 & 8).

Caregiving, according to Tronto (1993), may proceed where no one any longer cares about the original situation. Persons giving care may find themselves having to take care due to a vacuum in responsibility. As discussed previously, care receivers (namely, project participants) also disagreed with caregivers about the kind of care or services they received.

Responsiveness, meaning the interactions between caregivers and care receivers, is the fourth phase of the care process. In this case, this was a developmental care process. Responsiveness in the transactions between caregiving state and organizational staff and care receiving project participants became exposed through the fact that all three community settings lacked adequate participant-initiated leadership and management structures. This finding about gender and development policy services that aspired to bring change and to ‘empower’ individuals or groups, pointed to the recruited participants’ inability (disempowerment) to organise themselves into effective cooperative units or legal entities; a phenomenon that I argue needed further exploration and understanding. The unsustainability of the IGP projects on
– once conceptualised as ‘flagships’ for initial developmental funding proposals – directed my attention to consider the artificial nature of value assumptions associated with adopted gender policies. This observation resonate with other deficiencies in ideas about power and inequality (Chapter 3). The notion of equality in partner building processes, and the assumed harmony in such relationship building were clearly idealistic judging from transactions that evolved between care givers and care receivers in these case studies. The idealistic intention to combine the job creation for women and mothers with educare for their children presented its own difficulties for recruiting and targeting individual participants for these programmes. The profiles of women that were attracted ranged from very young mothers to older women while the opportunities for income generation activities did not match the real costs of caregiving that needed to include the provisioning of social development that embraced adult education approaches. Systematic assessments to explore the potential of participants for personal development (basic literacy, numeracy and further lifelong education) did not take place in any of the projects. All three settings experienced similar and different complexities in skills training for production, delaying progress in overall performance, in ways that were not anticipated in terms of targeting and time frames. Failed production and income targets therefore accompanied a serious lack of understanding of the age/gender/race profiles and needs of participating women, the particular business model, of the adult education and development approach, of language issues and communication, culture, and power and decision making. The high rate of absenteeism and dropouts observed in the operations of all the settings were indicative of other problems (namely, hunger, illness, and conflict and trust issues between the participants and staff) that were left underexplored. These are phenomena that are prevalent in many new policy projects undertaken by the State and by NGOs

9.2 Moving between, within-case and cross-case analysis

The policy process was studied as a caring process using the phases of the caring process and the four elements (namely, attentiveness, responsibility, competencies, and responsiveness). One finding of this critical research task was the need to explore cross-case patterns by comparing projects having similar caregiving and care receiving profiles; and similar outcome-based criteria (for example, job creation, income generation, gender-focused empowerment and educare), as was the case with the national flagship programme.
The critical analytical lens of PEOC incorporated gender and care. To provide more clarity, the social issues (namely, of empowerment, autonomy, income generation and care), raised in the PEOC analyses of individual cases (see chapters 6, 7, 8 of this thesis), will be contrasted with the more care-neutral empowerment model advanced by the World Bank’s source book, Empowerment and Poverty Reduction (Kanungo, 2004). Based at the World Bank, Kanungo (2004) reported on the empowerment outcomes of her cross-case examination of development projects. The World Bank framework endorsed the existence of four different elements viewed as a means to empower citizens and communities. These are: access to information; participation; accountability, and local organisational capacity. The World Bank found that all four elements are common across different social, institutional and political developmental settings. Each empowerment element plays a specific role in the empowering process; and is assumed to be working synergistically. This source book35 showed that the World Bank’s recognised the importance of empowering the poor; of investing in the poor to achieve developmental effectiveness; and of taking forward the empowerment agenda within its diverse institutional units. This understanding was accomplished by developing a knowledge base of analysed projects to see how empowering citizens and communities had resulted in developmental effectiveness (Kanungo, 2004:1).

A South African research project and case study forming part of Kanungo’s World Bank study – the Women’s Budget (Budlender, 1996), having the promotion of sustainable democracy as its objective – served as an important source of gendered empirical evidence produced on this historical period. The study included four relevant, analytically distinct categories of development projects for cross-case analysis with the aim of illustrating how cross-case analysis – as an empowerment tool for studying development projects – adds relevance to this discussion. These categories are:

- Information and communications technology;
- Participatory budgeting and public expenditure tracking surveys;
- Information disclosure as a vehicle for empowerment; and

Institutional innovations in financial services for the poor, with cross-case analytical matrixes and patterns.

Post-apartheid social policies, implemented by the new South African government, were largely influenced by globalised World Bank guidelines for safety net approaches.

In order to assess the effectiveness of a cross-case analytical matrix, Kanungo’s (2004) proposal for eight analytical dimensions (see Table 9.2) to assess empowerment outcomes were adapted to consolidate, organise, summarise, compare and systematically report on the commonalities of social issues by relating these to the PEOC components of attentiveness, responsibility, competency and responsiveness (see Table 9.1). The resulting World Bank analytical matrix is displayed in the table below.

Table 9.2: World Bank analytical matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Eight Analytical dimensions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Application domain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Areas, or sectors, served</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Actor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agencies, stakeholders, partners that played roles as implementers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Action or implementation process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design, strategy or methods employed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Means of empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Impact, or performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highlights, positive and negative strengths and weaknesses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Issues and lessons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capture some of the successes and the challenges as lessons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Learning issues by project</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

277
9.2.1 Application domain (areas served)

The projects discussed in my thesis (see Chapters 6, 7, 8 of this thesis) were implemented within particular partnership relationship structures and processes. They fall within the broad scope of DSW and social development projects; projects that experimented with social security and job creation measures to alleviate poverty. They also resonated with the World Bank’s social safety net strategies; and incorporated the five areas of focus (namely, application domains; actors; implementation processes; performance; means of empowerment; and issues and lessons) referred to by Kanungo (2004). The study’s selected project cases all share the same main foci: the building of partnerships; and the provision of income generation job opportunities that have an empowerment and gender dimension.

Two of the projects – those complying with State initiated national guidelines around DSW – had to additionally comply with an educare component required by the state, for women who were mothers of dependent children less than six years. The expected outcomes of projects were expected to correlate with national goals for poverty reduction, gender sensitivity (namely, gender planning), and the empowerment of women. Some of the projects subscribing to the national guidelines varied by type and design; and ranged from gender-specific (namely, those having a sexist, stereotypical, division of labour and skills development) projects, to gender-based (namely, agriculture; screen-printing and production; and weaving and beading) projects. The projects studies also had different objectives; and varied understanding of the important aspects of business development, project management, and the criteria for selecting income generation skills training. Given the overt economistic and income generation orientation, the social and service goals (for example, the educare service of the two flagships, DSW, state-led, partnership projects) both paid less attention to the care needs of the children under six for whom it was intended. One of these projects (see Chapter 8 of this thesis) outsourced this function to another organisation. The majority of the beneficiaries were, in fact, mothers receiving the newly introduced child-support benefit grant that replaced the old State maintenance grant (Lund, 2008).
A common thread running through all these State and organisational policy-led initiatives, is the historical legacy of the post-apartheid transitional context; a legacy that affected and promoted social compacts, and also State and civil society social partnership relations building (WPSW, 1997). Due to the funding crisis experienced by NGOs, almost all parties called upon to engage with the State used the opportunity to network and leverage influence within the enabling, multi-stakeholder environment that new policies promoted (for example, self-help groups and NGO partnerships). Many of the organisations that chose to work with the State in order to continue rendering services to underserved communities, assisted by providing access to information or by providing skills development that was intended to reduce poverty and unemployment through empowering approaches.

The diversity of the project cases (for example, variety of income activities) and settings (semi-rural, urban-based and peri-urban); as well as having different business orientation and ideas within which they were implemented, resulted in varied similarities in project experiences which have been left open to interpretation (Mullagee et al., 2001). The Philani project (see Chapter 8 of this thesis) was strongly influenced by past organisational experiences; whereas the other three (namely, the Mfuleni sewing and brick making projects, and the Beaufort West vegetable garden project; Beaufort West) were exposed to very novel inexperienced and experimental organisational approaches (see chapters 6, 7 of this thesis).

The premise underlying the state’s initiation of pilot DSW projects (namely, those in Beaufort West and Philani), was to demonstrate political commitment to the Beijing Platform of Action ideas; by using the development sector as a pilot to showcase how gender-sensitive IGPs can empower women to become more self reliant. The idea of combining skills training with income generation closely resembles the concept used in US-based workfare programmes (see Chapter 3 of this thesis; Midgley, 1995; Rose, 1995). These were socially constructed programmes aiming to eventually get people off welfare grants (see Chapter 7 of this thesis). Another main idea was that IGPs should, through skills training, provide beneficiaries with a ladder (see Chapter 3 of this thesis) to access the formal and informal labour markets. Both the Beaufort West (namely, Masakhe) and Philani projects invested heavily in skills training intended to go hand in hand with caring for children under six. All four projects made efforts to recruit participants, as unpaid volunteers, for skills training and empowerment towards self-reliant income earning activities. Philani was the only project, of the four, incorporating an adult learning approach, ABET, that challenged the participants to
develop competencies in numeracy and basic literacy skills but excluded computer-based training and literacy. The efficacy of skills training provided by other partnership initiatives (see Chapters 6, 7 of this thesis), excluded them. In the case of the vegetable garden project, the very first intake of participants received computer literacy training that appeared unrelated to daily tasks. When the position of project co-ordinator was disestablished, the project’s skills training component was discontinued; and the computer was deemed as no longer required, leaving many participants unhappy. The exclusion of ABET from budget allocation hugely implicated the general ‘developmental’ competencies of the state officials and also the understanding of its own governmental policies about lifelong learning, adult education and the social development policy process that were developed in the response to justice-inspired constitutional rights and obligations. The lack of inter-sectoral collaboration and cross-fertilization in debates about what needs to be done to enhance poverty reduction and to promote social development, improved health and education is an ongoing battle.

The general lack of expertise; and the lack of networking with adult learning organisations; or of liaison with emerging sectoral education training authorities (SETAs), was instark contradiction with what these isolated developmental partnership strategies attempted and remained an ongoing shortcoming to the present day.

9.2.2 Stakeholders that played a role

The actors – implementing agents – were a combination of partners: civil society or NPOs; individual citizens; self-help groups; and interventions by incompetent local and provincial State departments. The Mfuleni Sewing and Brick Making projects were part of a civil society and foreign donor driven initiative (namely, the WCCPP; while the Beaufort West project was an RDP Forum (namely, State and civil society) initiative, but a State led and funded partnership. Philani Flagship project was both a private and a public partnership initiative (namely, a registered NGO, working with the state); it was managed by the NGO and funded by the state. Notwithstanding the organisational differences, what is common across all the four projects is the involvement and participation by local women. There is enough evidence to support the view that the combination of implementing actors; and also differing partnership styles, competencies, strategies, business models, and quality of service delivery, led to similarities and differences in outcomes.
The nature of the unequal power relations; and of the dynamics within the implementation agency (namely, actor relationships with partners in the partnership), affected the implementation process and the role played by the dominant partners (namely, the State and the NGO). This clearly influenced the outcomes of these endeavours. In all project case instances – those with poverty reduction safety nets, such as the Philani Flagship and Beaufort West DSW projects (see Chapters 7, 8 of this thesis); as well as the Mfuleni gender-specific IGP (see Chapter 6 of this thesis) – the donor’s agenda and funding priorities, which made provision for skills training, included implementing budget cuts. These interim budget cuts at critical times of project development affected not only the sustainability of projects, but also the livelihoods of participants, by affecting their earnings.

9.2.3 Agencies, stakeholders and partners who played implementing roles

The implementing agencies reflected a combination of efforts by NPOs, NGOs, self-help community groups, individuals; and government. The WCCCP, based at UWC (see chapter 6 of this thesis), was a civil society partnership structure. Academics, the community and the State were in a partnership relationship on this service learning project; with the community-based Mfuleni Health Forum being a key partner. Philani was an NGO dependent on foreign funding and on local, State and corporate, funding. Philani partnered with PAWC, the Social Service Department of the new, democratic, provincial government, to initiate their new programmes. The Beaufort West Masakhe Self-help Community Group was initiated by the local, multi-sectoral, RDP Forum. This forum consisted of several interests: provincial government, local government departments; NGOs; and members of the community from faith-based and self-help groups. The reason for the RDP Forum’s creation was to find solutions to the lack of co-operation and capacity, and to the dysfunctionality of old apartheid thinking about communities; by creating new policy structures to legitimise and initiate democratic governmental policy interventions.

These service providers had their differences but all the four projects enjoyed community participation; and this had the ability to drive home assumptions about economic self-reliance, and the need to address poverty and unemployment. There is also evidence that the differing implementation styles of the different organising partners – competencies, strategies, business models, and quality of service delivery models – led to differentiated outcomes. Actors did not themselves determine the success or failure of initiatives; but the
nature of partnerships as implementation agencies influenced the outcomes of these endeavours.

9.2.4 Implementation process: Design strategy and methods

Since the four projects differed in the nature of productive activities (namely, brick making, sewing, agriculture, and screen printing); and in organisational experiences with IGPs, implementing partnership organisations used differing expertise, tools and business models. The required community development expertise displayed a level of variation in historical set up, community mobilisation strategies and operations. This was evident in: trust and relationship building; needs identification; in incorporating adult education, learning and ABET as prerequisites for skills training; in group dynamics; in macro-organisational development processes; and in implementation strategies (Brueggemann, 2006; Kirst-Ashman & Hull, 1997; 2010; Lombard, 1992; Patel, 2005). In the case of Mfuleni, WCCPP, with the help of the local Community Health Forum, appointed a facilitator (field coordinator). This person, a political activist active in the community-based health forum, recruited participants for the Health Forum by word of mouth. Given that two higher educational institutions were involved in the process of needs identification, no strategic approach to skills training in terms of formally assessed adult education needs, to develop personal capacities in community development process, was evident in the WCCPP’s community health or in their inter-professional health education approach. A variety of public health issues were included in community health worker education; and in community-based skills training. However, the substance of the training excluded appropriate (social scientific) community needs identification and organisational development approaches (Kirst-Ashman & Hull, 1997, 2010; Brueggemann, 2006; Lombard, 1992; Henderson & Thomas, 2000). Andrews’ (2004) descriptive analysis of community participation in the Mfuleni community confirmed this. The sewing project that initially encouraged women who were working from home to come together as a group, continually lost members. They dropped out due to a loss of production time; and due to the training programme for new illiterate members struggling with numeracy and literacy, vital skills required for pattern-making and matching in garment-making. The lack of capacity and of time invested in skills training slowed the garment production process and output. The brick making project also lost out on new tenders due to similar reasons; and faced an added challenge to meet the requirements of more formal input for capacity building and staff training to improve the quality in cement brick and block
production as laid down by the quality assurance body namely, the South African Board of Standards (SABS). All implementing staff employed by both State and NGO partnership structures appeared relatively out of their depth with modern technologies for each of the productive activities that they were responsible to manage in terms of skills training. Except for Philani Nutrition Centre (PNC), a registered NGO that worked out clear criteria based on previous organisational experiences, all projects seemed to have had similar problems with recruiting volunteers, managing absenteeism and attrition rates of participants that seem under-researched in the surveyed literature. Moreover, all projects struggled with setting up groups, managing group dynamics, training or nurturing leadership potential and shifting participants towards embracing entrepreneurial understanding and business management skills for generated income.

All these projects share common experiences in the women’s active involvement or participation. The feature that distinguished all initiatives, in terms of gender sensitivity, is the scope provided for skills training to engage in income generation activities. Philani Nutrition Centre is the only organisation that explored a broader capacity building approach that allowed for adult learning. This added expenditure was challenged by the State in that the organisation had to explain the cost to its funder and partner, namely, the State, who appeared rather unsympathetic to the much needed ABET investment in unemployed poor peoples. The issue of ownership and self reliance or autonomy emerged as contentious in three of the four projects, in relation to the degree of empowerment achieved. In Beaufort West, the transfer of agricultural land by the local authority to the Masakhe collective of local women was explored; while in Philani, the issue of own banking accounts and access to the 30 per cent retention monies surfaced. While Philani attempted to nurture and build participants capacity in access to banking skills and business practices, it lacked the resources and a paradigm shift to a particular independent workable business model to further invest in women’s confidence building towards achieving successful business and entrepreneurial skills, independent of the NGO.

Moreover, only the Philani project was able to generate relatively sustainable income for the period when data collection took place. By the end of the data collection period of ten months, all projects, especially the State funded DSW projects, were experiencing serious financial problems in production, sales and income generation due to State cutbacks and delayed payments linked to its structural stabilisation, GEAR policies.
9.2.5 Means of empowerment

The lack of access to information sources, especially information about citizenship, human rights, the new South African constitution and the Bill of rights, was endemic on all four projects. Sadly, although informing individual mothers about their children’s right to the child support benefit, the coverage of a rights-based approach was not a requirement for State-funded projects, which left participants ignorant about many citizens’ and human rights matters. Many participants were left uncared for by access to basic literacy, numeracy and health rights; and continued to be vulnerable and open to manipulation due to organisational strategies that excluded credible adult learning approaches to skills training, and were not linked to existing other labour policies.

Access to skills training and income generation, although a primary component of all these projects, did have some benefits; but these lacked credibility, were inadequate and were unsustainable. While the information and skills programmes required different types of expertise and information across the four projects, market-related information was the most commonly sought, for example, inputs, modern technology, pricing, sales, marketing, networking through ICTs etc, or about funding sources and policy services. For example, WCCPP bricks and garment products could not compete with products sold in the local open-market due to cheaper garments being sold by informal traders at local flea markets; and due to current corporate and commercial trends in pricing, production and inputs (see Chapter 6 of this thesis). Expecting and planning to grow vegetables in the harsh, arid weather conditions of the Karoo without awaiting the results of the feasibility studies first, was a high risk. The costs involved in the experimentation outweighed the importation and transport costs of cheaper produce from other areas (see chapter 7 of this thesis); while selling arts and craft products to tourists presented a big competitive challenge to Philani Flagship as they had to compete with so many other small enterprises and businesses (see Chapter 8 of this thesis).

All of these dilemmas were further complicated by the participants’ lack of understanding of the basic business principles that they were expected to operate under. The consequences of the slowing of production; slow or no sales; poor income or no wages; and the low stipends earned during project operations while learning new skills, badly affected the morale of different groups of beneficiaries. Due to the training approaches having omitted ABET, and the conscientising about the training model followed, most participants became impatient with
the lack of income earned while learning. This resulted in the high attrition rate that remains invisible and inexplicable in most research on the phenomenon.

Information is claimed, by Kanungo (2004), to be a mechanism for strengthening the economic, social and cultural lives of poor villagers, enabling people to voice their opinion and establish a sense of entitlement to enhance social status (Kanungo, 2004: 12). These projects, however, did not do so; as proved with evidence to the contrary. Poor access complicated the success factors; the State and NGOs battled with the lack of adequate access to ICTs at the time of the study. Access to information held a promise of improving knowledge delivery systems; and may have strengthened transparency and accountability of governments by providing the poor with a basis to act against the corruption (Kanungo, 2004), malfunctioning and misappropriation of power on the part of development agents or partners, whether government or NGO officials. It may also have helped to pacify and prolong ignorance of citizens about their civic and human rights, as enshrined in the country’s constitution. For instance, when participants (namely, the Philani groups) did challenge both State and NGO officials, the state, through its officials, chose to side with participants to the detriment of long-term social and economic organisational goals of the main implementing partner (see chapter 8 of this thesis).

The lack of individual assessment for adequate skills training to build capacities, targeting a strengths-based approach to enhance social development of participants, gave way to generalised assumptions about the needs of collective self-help groups of desperately under and unemployed women and men. Access to information on market-related prices, according to Kanungo (2004), helps to provide the farmers and villagers with decision-making powers to exercise choice about whom to sell to, whom to buy from, and at what price, thus eliminating exploitation by conduits.

**Inclusion/Participation**

Participation in projects is manifested at different levels: at the grassroots, project activity level; and at the management financial decision-making level. It is here that the most significant project leadership issues emerged. For example, managing activities when members are absent; and when production had to continue, proved most difficult as the participants and projects relied on managing in a co-operative style; and not a business
management approach. The expectation of income and wages (see chapters 6, 7, 8 of this thesis) by participants in all projects was common to all cases.

The adoption of a participatory development paradigm enabled these initiatives to aim for self-reliance and sustainability. However, the lack of focus on adult education and learning made these appear unrealistic. Despite the initial involvement of RDP Forum in Beaufort West, none of the four projects led to any large-scale community mobilisation and participation.

No major sense of ownership and no urge for civic participation emerged, or were encouraged (Kanungo, 2004). Participation did have some spin-offs at the economic and social levels; but, besides the grants for which most women and mothers qualified, income earned did not make a major contribution to their households, or improve their social status. Although some participants initially reported enhanced self-confidence, the funding crisis and cutbacks by the State affect this in conflicts that emerged.

**Accountability**

Knowledge delivery systems are assumed to contribute to greater accountability and transparency; and greater access to information is supposed to encourage greater connectivity between the poor and government institutions. A further assumption is that if poor people are equipped with relevant and timely information, they can access rights and entitlements (Kanungo, 2004). All four project cases fared very poorly in terms of their initiatives, displaying poor practices of accountability that were related to their project designs, lack of expertise and ill informed staff.

**Local organisational capacity**

The four partnership initiatives displayed no significant attempt to mobilise communities beyond the project or group level, raising the questions about cohesion; about the peculiar nature and conceptual understandings of gender (see Chapters 2, 3 of this thesis); about social development (Midgley, 1995; Patel, 2005), partnership and empowerment (Creevey, 1996; Dignard & Havet, 1995); and about care as implemented and assumed by these policy initiatives.
Impact performance (positive outcomes)

Organisational efforts and difficulties launching projects need to be acknowledged. However, the basis of the planning, implementation and performance of chosen project designs cannot be attributed to efficient, effective and well-thought through needs-based targeting and planning. The lack of involvement by private business corporations and networks – as partners, donors or mentors possessing expertise in specialised fields – was unfortunate. The major breakthrough in terms of developmental effort was in connecting participants with access and opportunities for some capacity building (that is, skills training). They learned a range of skills: labour-intensive use of tools (such as electric sewing machines, a hand operated cement mixing machine, basic computer literacy for a few women in Beaufort West, basic cultivation skills (such as planting and harvesting), book keeping, and basic skills in operating screen-printing equipment. Given the highly modernised, capitalist, industrial production system; and given the general use of ICT tools in formal and informal labour market production activities in South Africa, the fact that none of the four projects ventured into skills training to prepare participants for entrance into the economy, was disheartening from an educational and developmental perspective. The lack of an adult basic literacy and numeracy approach in the design was not in keeping with constitutional obligations. For example, Kanungo’s (2004) research into benefits accruing from the deployment of ICTs enabled through World Bank initiatives, suggested that access to information driven results in better negotiations for power and for the promotion of entrepreneurship through training, ensures accountability and transparency, should improve basic services through community demands for their entitlements, and in efforts to reduce corruption.

9.2.6 Highlights of strengths and weakness

All of the IGPs faced serious economic and operational sustainability (Kanungo, 2004) challenges. Apart from the implementation of a new NPO Act; and by having broad policy guidelines for DSW in a difficult competitive global environment, none of the projects were affected by statutory policy regulations. For example, legally, the Mfuleni project case operated under the auspices of the UWC and the Higher Education legislation; while local government and the municipal legislation covered the operations and finances of the Beaufort West project. The PNC was an existing and established NPO. The Basic Conditions of Employment Act (BCEA) and the Unemployment Insurance Fund (UIF), catering for the protection of ordinary workers, did not apply to the production activities covered by the
implemented projects. The definition and classification of such time-consuming, labour-intensive, productivist, co-operative project activities became very spurious – from a business and theoretical point of view.

Human resources like staffing (for example employment of project co-ordinators); and infrastructural limitations, such as availability; and cost, of electricity, water for irrigation; and land or space (such as for the Beaufort West agricultural project, the Mfuleni brick making and sewing projects, and the rented office and studio space of Philani in Crossroads, all affected the cost of production. This was miscalculated in the designs for budget planning and execution; as can be seen in the small size of the budgets and in the allocation of funds to project feasibility studies). Due to the changing policy climate, budgetary limitations and, restructuring of projects through serious cut-backs, having retrenched key staffing positions as in Beaufort West (see Chapter 7 of this thesis), impacted on planned project and production operations. Some activities had to be abandoned, or reprioritised as reported in some cases.

Some serious policy lessons that can be learned from the experiences of these initiatives include:

- There was a lack of understanding in design and planning IGPs, as fully fledged small-scale production units to overcome the legacies of apartheid. There was also a lack of understanding of the overwhelming adult educational, literacy and numeracy learning needs of the large majority of previously disenfranchised, poor, unskilled or semi-skilled, unemployed or under-employed, mostly Black female citizens heading family households. But, due to the legacy of migrant labour, the social development service needs of the majority of poor adults (namely, including poor, unemployed males residing in informal settlements, and poor, working class, urban and rural settlement communities), were also neglected by both State and NGO partners in this period.

- The local civic movement, existing during the anti-apartheid years in the form of the South African National Civic Association (SANCO), appeared paralysed, and collapsed. The influence of solid community networks of strategically aligned, organisational partnerships and locally integrated, community mobilisation approaches, using structures that incorporate a comprehensive (that is, mass literacy-based) adult citizen education and development movement, was seriously absent for most of this reform period.

- The emerging need for better integration of adult education; learning and actions to design and implement socially relevant developmental policies with a focus on lifelong adult learner-centred educational approaches; and integrating and linking
educare (early childhood development), primary, high school, formal and non-formal ABET, further education and tertiary education, in rural and urban centres that incorporated basic, individual assessments, starting at a personal level for every citizen, seemed far off, but critically important to stimulate the South Africa knowledge economy for appropriate future development. Failure to achieve this integrated understanding of the country’s human capacity needs and its gendered human resource profile seriously risked the success of building a sustainable democracy; as ignorance breeds contempt for both care and justice. The legitimacy crisis, by an elected democratic ‘developmental’ State both failing to uphold its own Bill of Human and Socio-Economic Rights and having a majority young and growing electorate that may be functionally semi-literate, is clearly manifested in serious contradictions; in relation to its own social protection efforts on the one hand, and to the growing restlessness by underserviced groups of citizens, the majority of whom are women, youth and disabled. State repression (for example, State assisted evictions due to lack of land and housing, labour struggles around unemployment, underemployment and labour broking) already evident in everyday basic service delivery working class struggles, all pose serious legitimacy issues for the current status quo.

- The lack of focus on mass literacy, without equal attention as to how NPOs and government engage in transfer of appropriate project skills training, should be critically reviewed in line with social development and economic goals that is truthful to sustain and develop democratic ideals and citizenship.
- Building on and developing existing progressive social policy activities may increase the likelihood of achieving sustainability and trust in progressive democratic ideals.
- Local indigenous knowledge aligned with the constitutional rights of all should be harnessed, respected and allowed for in content and information needs. Ongoing participatory needs assessments and policy and project assessment drawing on the PEOC ideas are critical for sustaining interest by the participants, the citizens who should derive maximum benefit.
- Incorporating ICT initiatives in all developmental activities may enable citizens to connect with the outside world; but should be context and sector specific. For example, if providing skills training in rural agricultural context is important, the computer skills provided should be regularly updated and must be sector specific, in order to teach individuals the benefits of ICTs to that specific activity and sector. According Kananga (2004), a particular business model cannot be replicated in its entirety. Strategies should be designed and customised in accordance with the specific social settings where the initiative is intended to be implemented. The business model should be flexible enough to accommodate emerging and evolving issues that arise during the implementation process (Kanungo 2004: 16).
Partnerships between private-public and non-government organisations, although important for effective and efficient social development, should clarify its value assumptions about power, decision making, accountability, transparency, and communication, sustainability, empowerment, gender, self-reliance and ownership issues.

Recording evidence of failed, unsustainable policy efforts using socially relevant frameworks, like the EOC, to analyse and explain why projects claiming income delivery failed to attract sufficient support, skills and investment by local corporates, should become a mandatory mainstream policy exercise for public debate. Outmoded IGPs and partnerships dominated by under-researched approaches, with accompanied non-specific business models, that fail to adopt appropriately researched adult education and skills training approaches, including those infused with ICTs, should be scrutinised or avoided.

9.2.7 Learning issues, by project

Challenges faced by all project settings were: inappropriate needs assessments; hierarchical decision-making (that is, power issues); the lack of voice by participants; the lack of participatory planning and ownership issues; and conflict and sustainability issues. Regardless of the type of production activity, each project was faced by risks associated with sustaining project and production activities. The risks were mostly linked to economic and infrastructural limitations; to lack of leadership and communication issues (that is, in the degree and quality of representation at management levels); to sustainable financing; and to a lack of trust between caregiving organisations and care receiving participants.

While there are specific issues and historical contextual lessons that emerged from each of these different community and organisational cultural settings and project design types (see chapters 6, 7, 8 of this thesis), there are several policy lessons that are common to all project cases under all programme categories. These include the following:

- Relationship building within and between different partners and citizens. Such community mobilisation and civic participation or organisation building strategies are vital inputs that contribute to sustainability of project activities.

- Business models based on partnerships between government and NGOs are essential but can only be effective in implementation if the power variables are clarified and addressed through regular and direct, non-confrontational communication mechanisms.
Access to information is a precursor for ethical, accountable, transparent and genuine empowerment of individual citizens, groups or communities. This will enable them to react to the inefficiencies of the system and demand responsiveness on the part of the governing bodies, whether they are NGOs, State or self-help collectives (Kanungo, 2004).

Based on this analysis, it can be safely concluded that, although each project was implemented with a project-specific business model or approach, there are observable areas of convergence and divergence in the implementation structures, partnership strategies, as well as in process and outcomes (Kanungo, 2004). Given the substantive insights that the PEOC lens added as a coding strategy, through thematic and within case analysis, the question remains what value would a CCA frame that used the PEOC add to further enrich the above analysis.

9.3 Towards a Public EOC

This section argues that feminist ethics and a PEOC could be potential answers to effectively research the complexities in studying and evaluating gendered DSW policies for poor women and men. My argument is developed by considering the following broad questions:

- What would be the defining elements of a public ethic of care?
- How will current social developmental policies, such as developmental welfare policy that involves social safety nets and public IGPs, fare when studied through a lens of a PEOC incorporating within case and cross-case analysis?
- What would social development look like if care became a central moral focus in our feminist policy reasoning?
- What policy lessons can practitioners like social workers and community developers learn using this combined framework?

In an earlier analysis of the new policies in the White Paper for Social Welfare (WPSW, 1997), the lens of a feminist PEOC was used to trace the normative framework to analyse this document (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003). Judgements about how adequately the WPSW addressed issues of care, welfare and citizenship were discussed. It was argued that policy texts display authoritative ways of talking about care and contain a range of gendered assumptions in the way that they represent the social practices of care. It was further argued that the White Paper for Social Welfare (WPSW, 1997) inserts care principally into a familialist framework and, in so doing, assigns meaning to sexual difference. The latter
policy framework did not address contemporary South African social problems in an adequate manner, nor did it correspond with social justice principles (for example, equality) which are endorsed and promoted in the Policy.

Following Fisher and Tronto (1990) and Tronto’s (1993) elaboration of the political EOC, Sevenhuijsen, Bozalek, Gouws and Minnaar-Mcdonald (2003; 2006) proposed that the care perspective can contribute in solving the theoretical and ethical dilemmas. It was proposed that care should be positioned in notions of social citizenship; rather than as privatised family or community descriptions, as was currently the case (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; 2006). In this way, the responsibility for care should be deprivatised and made a common concern that would place it more centrally in human life, involving both genders (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003; Tronto, 1993, 2006). By following this argumentation, I conducted this study to show the potential use of the frame when applied as a research and analytical framework to code and construct social development case narratives about implemented policies and programmes. To further develop my thesis of promoting the care ethic as a public ethic, I draw on others like Brandsen (2006) and Tronto (2006). Brandsen (2006: 208) defined a PEOC as a moral value that seeks to assure good care to all members of society. A public ethic, according to Brandsen (2006: 208), affirms care as a central moral value in the public square alongside equality and liberty, grounding it in a political context. By elaborating Tronto’s (1993; 1996a; 1996b) ideas, she too proposed that a political context is needed to support the ethic of care; otherwise care remains private and gendered.

Before applying the framework to study long-term public care, Brandsen (2006) distinguished two different ways to identify what a public ethic is not, which I regard as important to conclude this thesis:

- A PEOC is not a recurring recovery of traditional, stereotypical, individualistic family values, such as the heterosexual, two-parent nuclear family structure (that is, a myth due to the multiple other family arrangements); one that expect sacrifices of women (namely wives, mothers, partners, sisters, cousins and girl children) for families as is assumed in the South African White Paper (Sevenhuijsen et al., 2003). Such conservative family values and policies that draw on this, resulted in individualistic strategies that continue to make the act of caring invisible and gendered, overburdening women and girls.

- A PEOC is not merely a large group of caring individuals, or volunteers, who tirelessly work on valued community projects, as appeared in policy cases documented in this study. Such an understanding is considered dangerous as it
romanticises the potential for volunteers to become organised in order to address large-scale social or civic problems. It also legitimises minimal public activity in the private sphere of family life. This rhetoric is, according to Brandsen (2006), particularly dangerous for poor communities at local level; and may cause a myopic or narrow-minded type of community care view. Communities who are already advantaged may be able to care for themselves, due to available time, money and resources; but may become unwilling, or unable, to extend resources to those suffering economic hardships further away from themselves (that is, distant poorer communities and countries) (Robinson, 1999).

Brandsen (2006) suggests four benchmarks for public and organisational policy that apply a PEOC.

Firstly, it assumes that care, or lack of it is expressed in social and institutional contexts; and if one wants to acknowledge and reflect care as a central concern of human life, such structures and institutions must be challenged and changed. According to Brandsen (2006), policies that flow from a public ethic will start with a public discussion of needs; and they will be grounded in the life experiences and perceptions of those who give and receive care. Tronto (1993) contributes further that the questions of what counts as a need, and whose needs are catered for, are significant enough to avoid elitist interpretations of need possibly ignoring those without money or power. Policy developments must thus include the ideas of those whose lives are affected.

Secondly, policies claiming a public ethic will allow for a contextual and interactive approach to caregiving and care receiving. Those closest to the practice of care – interacting as caregivers and care receivers – must thus be able to work together to find the kinds of care that they both value most. Another example of this type of value is if funding cycles for care services were to follow stringent, summative evaluations of care, based on assessments completed by caregivers and care receivers; and in the context of a democratic discussion of needs. An argument is thus made for more flexible policies and programmes, so that good care can flourish (Brandsen, 2006: 209).

A third benchmark suggests that policies flowing from a public EOC will affirm a social conception of self; one that strengthen relationships within and between individuals. This aspect must be carefully examined; and should question whether the policy stigmatises and further divides people by their neediness. Brandsen (2006) further argues policies affirming a good social conception of self would also carefully consider how public and organisational
policies shape and define the problem of care (Brandsen, 2006: 210). A public ethic further needs collective responsibility to protect the welfare of vulnerable groups, including those who do the work of care; and this responsibility should be evident in how we intervene with caregivers and care receivers. Such a public ethic, however, needs structural change to deliver a stronger public or governmental presence; and to ensure a comprehensive range of social, economic, work-related, and medical services to support, and not exploit, care work.

Brandsen’s fourth benchmark suggests that a public EOC must be firmly grounded in a liberal, democratic, pluralistic society and be connected to a theory of justice. There is the recognition that all human beings need care at various points of their lives. This moves the discussion about care out of the marketplace; away from the commodification of needs where only those that can afford to pay, have access; and out of means-tested, residual, welfare programmes, where those with care needs are stigmatized. The discussion moved to the public arena, where open dialogue can take place about existing needs for care; and how to best allocate resources to ensure just care.

In conclusion, my recommendation is that, although the four benchmarks were developed in assessment of long-term care by institutions arguments about the public ethic orientation, based on Tronto’s (1993) political EOC, as demonstrated in this developmental context, the arguments opened up possibilities to apply the framework in different policy contexts and need to be further tested in new empirical research projects and studies. My application of the framework, as a research approach in this multi case design, and in a historical, developmental reform policy context, is but one example to demonstrate the potential of the frame. It shows the analytical possibilities when notions of care and social development are underpinned by public, work and income-based DSW policies. The South Africa policy case positioned these policies as innovative income generation projects that combined a work and care ethic as ‘changes’ in the aftermath of ‘separate development’/apartheid policies during the transition to democracy.
Reference list


Moghadam, V. (2007). Gender and the global economy. In J. Timmons Roberts and A. Bellone Hite (Eds.), *The globalisation and development reader perspectives on development and global change* (pp. 135-152). Oxford: Blackwell Publishing Ltd.


www.glp.net/c/document_library/get_file?folder/d=12858&name=DLFE-1153pdf

[7 November 2013]


Provincial Administration of the Western Cape (PAWC). (1996a). *Beaufort West flagship project: Community vegetable garden*. Cape Town: Provincial Administration of the Western Cape.


Rapp, C.A., Kisthardt, W., Gowdy, E., & Hanson, J. (1994). Amplifying the consumer voice: Qualitative methods, empowerment and mental health research. In E. Sherman & W.J. Reid (Eds.), *Qualitative research in social work* (pp. 126-134). New York: Columbia University Press.


Sen, A. (1990a). Development as capability expansion In K. Griffin and J. Knight (Eds.), Human development and international development strategy for the 1990s. London: Macmillan.


Title of Research:

_work, women, and welfare - a critical, gendered analysis_
_of social development with special reference to_
_income generation projects in the transitional period (1994-2001)_

SECTION A

The study has been described to me by means of the Information Sheet, in a language that I understand. I freely and voluntarily agree to participate. My questions about the study have been answered. I understand that my identity will not be disclosed and that I may withdraw from the study at any time during the research process and this will not negatively affect me at all.

Participant's Name: ..........................  Participant’s Signature: ..........................

Witness: ..............................

Date: ..............................

SECTION B
In agreeing to be part of the focus group discussion, I understand that I need to respect the privacy of the other participants by not revealing the information that has been discussed in the group session/s. In addition, I will not record or document any personal, identifying information of other group members nor speculate about their identity. In so doing, I shall maintain confidentiality of their identity and the information discussed.

Participant’s Signature: ……………………..

Date: …………………

Signed at: ……………………………

SECTION C

To ensure that the information is obtained without omitting vital information, the sessions will be audio-taped. These tapes/recordings will be kept in a secure place where only the researcher and the researcher’s supervisor will be aware of its location and will have access to its information.

I agree to be audio-taped during my participation in the study.

Participant's Signature: ………………………

Date: ………………………………………

I do not agree to be audio-taped during my participation in the study.

Participant’s Signature: ………………………
Date: ………………………………………

SECTION D

Declaration by Researchers: declare that:

- The research study and process has been explained to the participants verbally and via an information sheet.
- Each participant was given the opportunity to have their questions answered prior to partaking in the study.
- As a researcher I will maintain and protect the participants’ rights to privacy, in identity and in the information obtained.
- The research study is for academic purposes and not for any personal gain.

Researchers Signatures: ………………………

Date: ………………………

Signed at: ………………………
Should you have any questions regarding this study or wish to report any problems you have experienced related to the study, please contact the researcher. Should you have any questions regarding your rights as a research participant, you may also contact:

Supervisor:

Women and Gender Studies Programme

Tel:  (021) 959 2234

Fax:  (021) 959 1273

Email: mmcdonald@uwc.ac.za
ANNEXURE: A

PILOT INSTRUMENT

RESEARCH QUESTIONS:

1) ARE INCOME GENERATING PROJECTS AS PROPOSED WITHIN THE NATIONAL SOCIAL WELFARE POLICY FRAMEWORK ADDRESSING POVERTY AND GENDER INEQUALITY IN A SATISFYING WAY?

2) WHAT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE/GOOD NORMATIVE FRAMEWORKS (VALUES/GUIDING CONCEPTS) THAT CAN INCORPORATE A USER PERSPECTIVE IN PUBLIC DISCUSSIONS AND POLICY MAKING?

STRUCTURED QUESTIONNAIRES to be administered to:

1. Project participants (Female and male) beneficiaries or users of services in this case Income Generating Activities (IGA)/projects

2. Project Staff

3. Policy makers/organisational managers (state/n.g.o's including Church/Religious Organisations)

QUESTIONNAIRE: PROJECT PARTICIPANTS

A. BACKGROUND

1. Name of Group/Project (Village or Township)

2. Year started (eg after 1994)

3. Particulars of Individual Member/Participant:
- age, sex, occupation, schooling, status (family; parenthood), dependents, caring work, domestic (unpaid work), physically abled/disabled, life & working experience, language(s) training, residence (shared dwelling)

4. Position of the participant within the group/project

5. Time period that the person is affiliated with the group/project

6. Individual reasons for joining/participating in the group/project

7. Time spent in project (daily, weekly) the rest?

8. Views on project (its nature, location & income generated - is it sustainable, satisfying in terms of basic needs)

B. PROJECT DEVELOPMENT

1. How was the project initiated? Where is it located? What did you do before joining the project? How did your project secure funding? What were the requirements?

2. What type of I.G.A.'s does your group/project engage in?

3. How do you select the activity(s)? (eg needs assessment)

4. How do members contribute towards the decision?

5. What support do you get from the funders (donors i.e. state or N.G.O.'s)?

6. What support do you get from local people/leaders in establishing the group/project

7. What support do you get from staff (state or Other) in group formation/project development and I.G.A.'s
C. ORGANISATION OF GROUP

1. What process do you follow in selecting the leaders of your group?
2. What other positions do these leaders have in the community?
3. How do you participate in group processes?
4. Any Problem areas?

D. LEADERSHIP, EDUCATION AND SKILLS TRAINING (L.E.T.)

1. What education and/or training are given to members/participants (male/female) of the group? Were members/participants formally or informally trained for I.G.A.?
2. What role do staff (professionals and others) play in training group members in group processes?
3. What role do the community leaders and others play in education and training of group members?
4. What kind of leader helps the group to be successful?

E. ORGANISATION OF ACTIVITIES

1. How do participants or members organise to carry out the daily management and activities of IGP?
2. How do they formally/informally learn about financial management, production processes, and product management (marketing)?

3. What is the role of project staff in teaching the above skills?

4. What role do community members or other resource people play in helping participants to develop these skills?

5. How do members organise to market the product?

F. DECISION MAKING

1. Explain how you make decisions as a group/project?

2. How do you reach consensus or how do you resolve conflict when members do not agree?

G. EVALUATION OF I.G.A. PROJECT

1. What factors do you think have contributed to the success AND/OR failure of your group/project during the last (1-2) years (Problem Identification):

   Please mention Experiences in carrying out the programme in terms of:

   a. production/management/marketing problems/needs?

   b. education and training (eg impact of illiteracy, lack of numerical & other skills?)

   c. leadership issues?

   d. technical management?

   e. staffing issues?

   f. participants/group membership issues?
g. income generated (or failure)  

h. relationship  

i. gender issues  

2. What mistakes would you try to avoid if you have to start all over again?  

3. Have you tried contacting (consulting or networking with) other similar groups/projects (eg in other communities/towns/villages)?  

4. What changes would you propose for greater success in the next six months/next year/future?  

5. Would you prefer to continue working/participating in a group (as is) or would you like each member/participant to work on their own?  

6. What financial, material, social or any other benefit do you get from being a member or participating in this group/project?  

7. What are the problem areas that you have identified?  

8. Any other comments?  

QUESTIONNAIRE: FIELD/PROJECT STAFF  

A. BACKGROUND  

1. Name of Group/Project (Village or Township)  

2. Year started (eg after 1994)  

3. Particulars of Individual Staff Member:  
   - age, sex, schooling/Highest Qualification, family status, dependents, caring work, life & working experience, language(s), previous occupation (before
joining the project/group), education and training (general, specific gender training, and/or income generation activities; residential address vis-à-vis project location.

4. Position of the participant within the group/project

5. Time period that the person is associated with the group/project

6. Individual reasons for interest/working with the group/project

7. Hours/time invested in project (weekly/monthly)

B. GROUP FORMATION

1. Can you tell me how the group was started and what people were doing before it became funded by the State/N.G.O.

2. What type (or range) of IGA(s) are the group/project involved in?

3. How do you select or choose to be involved in some and not others? (Was any needs assessment done?)

4. How do staff members contribute to the selection of projects?

5. What support do you get from the local leaders in group formation and IGA?

6. What support do staff give in terms of group formation and/or project development/administration/management?

C. ORGANISATION OF GROUP

1. What was the process of selecting the leaders of your group/project?

2. What other positions did these leaders have in the community?

3. How do group members participate in group processes?

D. LEADERSHIP EDUCATION AND TRAINING (L.E.T)
1. What training (or relevant education) have you received in the area of IGA's? Group formation/dynamics?

2. Are members trained formally or informally in I.G.A.'s?

3. What role do project staff play in training group members in group processes?

4. What role do community leaders and other people play in L.E.T?

5. What kind of leader help the group to be successful or effective?

E. ORGANISATION OF ACTIVITIES

What are the different tasks/activities related to the project?

How are these gendered?

1. How do participants/members organise to perform daily management functions and activities of the I.G.A.'s?

2. How do members learn about production, management and marketing of produce/services, planning?

3. What is the role staff does staff play in educating and training in terms of these issues?

4. What is the role of community leaders and other people in helping participants learn about these?

5. How do members/participants organise to market the product?

6. What institutional/organisational support exist for the above?

F. DECISION MAKING
1. Can you explain how decisions about the group/project are made?

2. How are group decisions made when there is a conflict of interests among different group members?

G. EVALUATION OF I.G.A. PROJECT

1. What factors do you think have contributed to the success of your group/project during the last (1-2) year(s)?

2. What were the biggest constraints in carrying out your goals?

4. Are you aware of Gender

5. Please mention Experiences in carrying out the programme in terms of:

   a. production/management/marketing problems/needs?

   b. education and training (eg impact of illiteracy, lack of numerical & other skills?)

   c. leadership issues?

   d. technical management?

   e. staffing issues?

   f. participants/group membership issues?

   g. income generated

   h. relationship

   h. gender issues

2. What mistakes would you (as staffer) try to avoid if you have to start all over again?

3. Have you tried contacting (consulting or networking with) other similar groups/projects (eg in other communities/towns/villages)?
4. What changes would you propose for greater success in the next six months/next year/future success?

5. Would you prefer to continue working/participating in a group (as is) or would you like each member/participant to work on their own, or any other suggestions?

6. Apart from financial (salary) what material, social or any other benefit do you get as a staff member being associated with this group/project?

7. What are the problem areas that staff have identified over time?

8. Any other comments?

**QUESTIONNAIRE: ORGANISATIONS**

**IDENTIFYING PARTICULARS/Organisational Profile**

1. Name and Address of the Organisation; Date established

2. Name, sex, and position of the member (in terms of Rank or position on Management Structure)

3. Aims and Objectives (Mission Statement/Constitution of the Organisation)

4. Composition of and Representation on the Organisational Management Structure (Gender, Race, Class, beneficiaries)

5. Experience and Activities of the organisation in terms of Social Development (special employment programmes/small scale production or income generation)

Who is the target group(s) of such projects?

Total number of beneficiaries? Male/Female composition.

Any special women's projects?
Who do you employ to do the work or carry out these projects/programmes? (Categories or post description)

What level of education and training does your organisation demand for the work to be done in this area?

What organisational (and/or other) education and training do you provide to staff in the performance of these tasks

Total number of such workers: male and female

Does the organisation have a gender policy?

6. Legal or Other Status:

Is the organisation registered (e.g., Welfare Organisation, Section 21 Company etc)

Is the organisation regulated or affected by any other regulation and in what way

7. How are groups prepared for I.G.A.'s (group organisation, leadership, technical management of product, marketing etc)

8. How are staff prepared to help with I.G. A.'s

9. What role do local leaders play

10 What factors contribute to success and failure of the group (group organisation, leadership, technical management of product, marketing etc)

11. What policies/suggestions do you propose for I.G.A. groups to be successful.
12 Have you considered consulting or networking with other organisations with similar projects? If so, with what effect?

13. What financial, material and other benefit do members get from participating in this activity?

14. What are the major problem areas as seen by management?

15. Any other comments.
Appendix 3: Interview guide

RESEARCH PROJECT

Work, Women, and Welfare - A Critical, Gendered Analysis

of Social Development with Special Reference to


INTERVIEW GUIDE

Researcher & PhD Candidate:
Marie Minnaar-McDonald
Department of Social Work,
University of the Western Cape
Private Bag x 17
7535 BELLVILLE
Tel No: 021/959 2277; 959 2846
Fax 021 959 2845
e-mail: mmcdonald@uwc.ac.za

JULY 2000
GUIDE FOR INDEPT INTERVIEWS IN THE STUDY OF INCOME GENERATION PROJECTS/ACTIVITIES

TOPIC LIST

1. ORGANISATIONAL STATUS AND BACKGROUND

2. WOMEN AND GENDER IN PROJECT PROCESS DEVELOPMENT

3. ORGANISATION OF ACTIVITIES

4. STAFFING

5. LEADERSHIP, EDUCATION AND SKILLS TRAINING (L.E.T.)

6. FINANCE

7. DECISION MAKING

8. CONFLICT RESOLUTION
9. EVALUATION OF PROJECT

---

36 Topic List based on Pilot Instrument developed 1996-97
Appendix 4: Individual personal questionnaire

PHD RESEARCH PROJECT IN SOCIAL SCIENCE, UTRECHT UNIVERSITY

WORK, WOMEN AND WELFARE: A CRITICAL GENDERED ANALYSIS OF SOCIAL
DEVELOPMENT POLICY IMPLEMENTATION WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE
TO INCOME GENERATION PROJECTS DURING THE TRANSITION IN SOUTH AFRICA
(1994-2001)

RESEARCHER: MARIE MINNAAR-MCDONALD
UNIVERSITY OF THE WESTERN CAPE
PRIVATE BAG X17
BELLVILLE 7535

TEL: (021) 959 2277/2846
FAX: (021) 959 2845
EMAIL: mmcdonald@uwc.ac.za

PLACE OF INTERVIEWS AND FOCUS GROUPS: BEAUFORT WEST AND CROSS ROADS

DATE: 11-13.7.2000
PURPOSE

A) TO INVESTIGATE THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT POLICIES AND THE PRACTICAL IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS AND STRUCTURES OF PROJECTS

B) TO DETERMINE THE BASIS AND TERMS ON WHICH WOMEN PARTICIPATE AS USERS AND BENEFICIARIES OF INCOME GENERATING PROJECTS

C) TO DETERMINE THE IMPACT OF THE FLAGSHIP PROJECTS IN THE WESTERN CAPE ON WOMEN’S LIVES

THE RESEARCH STUDY WILL TRY TO ANSWER THREE BROAD QUESTIONS:

1) ARE INCOME GENERATING PROJECTS AS PROPOSED WITHIN THE NATIONAL DEVELOPMENTAL SOCIAL WELFARE POLICY FRAMEWORK ADDRESSING POVERTY AND GENDER INEQUALITY IN A SATISFYING WAY?

2) WHAT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE/GOOD NORMATIVE FRAMEWORKS (VALUES/GUIDING CONCEPTS) TO STUDY THESE?

3) HOW CAN A USER PERSPECTIVE BE INCORPORATED IN PUBLIC DISCUSSION AND POLICY MAKING?
## Personal Details / Persoonlike Besonderhede

| Name / Naam: | ______________________ |
| Age / Ouderdom: | 20-24 | 25-30 | 31-35 | 36-40 | 41-45 | 46-50 |
| Race / Ras: | African/Swart | Coloured/Kleurling | Indian/Indier | White/Wit | Other/Andere |
| Gender / Geslag: | Male/Manlik | Female/Vrolik |
| Marital Status / Huwelik Status: | Married/Getroud | Co-habit/Leeftaam | Never Married/ | Divorced/Geskei | Widow/wer |
| Home Language / Huistaal: | English/Engels | Afrikaans | Xhosa | Other/Andere |
| Highest Level of Education / Hoogste Vlak van opvoeding: | No Formal Schooling/ | Grade/Graad 1-4 | Grade/Graad 9-10 | Grade/Graad 11-12 | Diploma After Matric/ | University Degree/ | PostGrad/ |
| Disability / Gestremdheid: | Yes/Ja | No/Nee |
| Monthly Income / Maandlike Inkomste: | >R499 | R500-999 | R1000-1999 | R2000-2499 | R2500-2999 | R3000-3499 | R3500-3999 | R4000-4499 | Don't Know/ |

Weet Nie
Dependents / Afhanklikes:

Children/Kinders:  
- Own/Eie: [ ]
- Foster/Pleeg: [ ]

Age/Oud: [ ]
- 0-1 yr
- 2-4 yr
- 5-6 yr
- 7-8 yr
- 9-10 yr
- 11-12 yr
- 13-14 yr
- 15-16 yr
- 17-18 yr

Parents/Ouers:  
- Own/Eie: [ ]
- Law/Skoonouers: [ ]

Previous Work Experience / Vorige Werk Ervaring:  
_____________________________________________________________________________

Position/Authority in Project / Posisie/Rang in Projek:  
_____________________________________________________________________________

Time period with project / Tydperk verbonde aan Projek:  
- 3 mths/mnd: [ ]
- 6-12 mths/mnd: [ ]
- 18 mths/mnd: [ ]
- 18+ mths/mnd: [ ]

Reasons for joining / Redes vir deelname:  
_____________________________________________________________________________

1.1 How many hours do you work per day / Hoeveel ure werk u per dag?  
_____________________________________________________________________________

1.2 How many hours do you work at home / Hoeveel ure werk u by die huis?  
_____________________________________________________________________________

1.3 Where do your children stay while you are at work /
### 1. FAMILY / FAMILIE

**1.4 Who looks after them / Wie kyk na hulle?**
- Husband/Man
- Family Members/Familielede
- Neighbours/Bure

**1.5 Do you have to pay for this / Moet u betaling gee?**
- Yes/Ja
- No/Nee

**1.6 Are there child care facilities in the community / Bestaan daar kleutersorgfasiliteite in die gemeenskap?**
- Yes/Ja
- No/Nee

**1.7 Do you make use of them / Gebruik u dit?**
- Yes/Ja
- No/Nee

**1.8 Why Not / Hoekom nie?**

### 2. HOUSING / BEHUSING

**2.1 What type of house do you live in / Watter tipe huis woon u in?**
- Brick/Baksteen
- Wood & Iron/Sinkhuis
- Shack
- Other/Ander

**2.2 What source of energy do you use / Watter bron van energie gebruik u?**
- Elec/Elek
- Gas
- Wood/Hout
- Candles/Kers

**2.3 Do you own the house / Besit u die huis?**
- Yes/Ja
- No/Nee

**2.4 How many rooms are in the house? (Rooms that are divided by a solid partition, i.e. brick/wood/iron/cardboard, etc.) / Hoeveel kamers is daar**

---

*UNIVERSITY of the WESTERN CAPE*
in die huis? (Kamers wat verdeel word met 'n soliede partisie, nl.
baksteen/hout/sink/karton, ens)

2.5 How often did you move house in the past five years?/ Hoe dikwels het u die
afelope vyf jaar van huis verander?

2.6 Who lives with you? / Wie woon saam met u?

2.7 Do you have a telephone/cellphone? / Het u 'n telefoon of 'n selfoon?

2.8 If you do not have a phone at home, how far (in km) is the nearest public phone?

3. HEALTH AND WELFARE / GESONDHEID EN
WELSYN

3.1 Have you had any children who have died? / Het u enige kinders aan die
Yes/Ja No/nee

Indien u nie 'n telefoon tuis het nie, hoe ver (in km) is die
naaste openbare telefoon?
3.2 What did they die of / Waaraan is hulle dood?

________________________________________________________________________

3.3 Do you have any of the following conditions? Het u enige van die volgende siektes?

3.3.1 Asthma / Asma

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.3.2 Bronchitis / Brongitis

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.3.3 TB

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.3.4 Heart Condition / Hart Probleme

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.3.5 Hearing Impairment / Gehoorgestremdheid

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.3.6 Sight Impairment / Gesigsgestremdheid

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.3.7 Anemia / Bloedarmoede

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.3.8 High Blood / Hoe Bloed Druk

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

If you are ill, where do you go? / Waarheen gaan u as u siek is?

________________________________________________________________________
3.4.1 Clinic / Kliniek

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.4.2 How far is the nearest clinic (km)? Hoe ver is die naaste kliniek (km)?

________________ km

3.4.3 Private Doctor / Privaat Geneesheer

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.4.4 Government Hospital / Staathospitaal

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.4.5 Traditional Healer or Herbalist / Tradisionele Geneesheer of Kruiedokter

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.4.6 Other, please specify / Ander, speeifiseer asseblief

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.5 Were you satisfied with the treatment? / Was u tevrede met die behandeling?

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

3.6 If not, why not? / Indien nie, waarom nie?

____________________________________________________________________________

3.7 Have all your children been immunized? / Is al u kinders ingeent?

Yes/Ja  No/Nee
3.8 Do you make use of family planning? / Maak u gebruik van gesinsbeplanning?
   Yes/Ja No/Nee

3.9 Did it ever happen that the household had to go without a meal before you started working on the project? / Het dit ooit gebeur dat die gesin sonder voedsel moes gaan voordat u op die projek begin werk het?
   Yes/Ja No/Nee

3.10 Did it ever happen that the household had to go without a meal after you started working on the project? / Het dit ooit gebeur dat die gesin sonder voedsel moes gaan sedert u op die projek begin werk het?
   Yes/Ja No/Nee

3.11 Did it ever happen that the family had to go without a meal during the last three (3) months? / Het dit ooit gebeur dat die gesin sonder voedsel gedurende die afgelope drie (3) maande?
   Yes/Ja No/Nee
3.12 If yes, why? / Indien ja, waarom?

3.13 Does anyone in the family make use of any kind of welfare? / Maak enige gebruik van enige tipe welsynhulp?
Yes/Ja
No/Nee

3.4.3 Private Doctor / Privaat Geneesheer

3.4.4 Government Hospital / Staatshospitaal

3.4.5 Traditional Healer or Herbalist / Tradisionele Geneesheer of Kruidenkerk

3.4.6 Other, please specify / Ander, speeifie asseblief

3.5 Were you satisfied with the treatment? / Was u tevrede met die behandeling?

3.6 If not, why not? / Indien nie, waarom nie?

3.7 Have all your children been immunized? / Is al u kinders ingeent?
3.8 Do you make use of family planning? / Maak u gebruik van gesinsbeplanning?

3.9 Did it ever happen that the household had to go without a meal before you started working on the project? / Het dit ooit gebeur dat die gesin sonder voedsel moes gaan voordat u op die projek begin werk het?

3.10 Did it ever happen that the household had to go without a meal after you started working on the project? / Het dit ooit gebeur dat die gesin sonder voedsel moes gaan sedert u op die projek begin werk het?

3.11 Did it ever happen that the family had to go without a meal during the last three (3) months? / Het dit ooit gebeur dat die gesin sonder voedsel moes gaan gedurende die afgelope drie (3) maande?

3.12 If yes, why? / Indien ja, waarom?

3.13 Does anyone in the family make use of any kind of welfare? / Maak enigeen in
3.14 Which welfare services do you use? / Watter welsynsdienste gebruik u?

_____________________________________________________________________________

3.15 Are you given any information on the following: /
Word u enige inligting oor die volgende gegee:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3.15.1</th>
<th>TB</th>
<th>On Project</th>
<th>In the community, i.e Church, hospital, clinic, etc.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>On Project</td>
<td>In die gemeenskap, bv. Kerk, hospitaal, Kliniek, ens.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15.2</td>
<td>AIDS / VIGS</td>
<td>On Project</td>
<td>In the community, i.e Church, hospital, clinic, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>On Project</td>
<td>In die gemeenskap, bv. Kerk, hospitaal, Kliniek, ens.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15.3</td>
<td>S.A Constitution and Human Rights / S.A. Konstitusie en Mense regte</td>
<td>On Project</td>
<td>In the community, i.e Church, hospital, clinic, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>On Project</td>
<td>In die gemeenskap, bv. Kerk, hospitaal, Kliniek, ens.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15.4</td>
<td>Family Violence Act / Gesinsgeweld Wetgewing</td>
<td>On Project</td>
<td>In the community, i.e Church, hospital, clinic, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>In die gemeenskap, bv. Kerk, hospitaal, Kliniek, ens.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.15.5  Maintenance Act / Wet op Onderhoud

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>On Projek</th>
<th>In the community, i.e Church, hospital, clinic, etc.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Op die Projek</td>
<td>In die gemeenskap, b.v. Kerk, hospitaal, Kliniek, ens.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.16  Have you received First Aid training on the job? / Het u ooit noodhulpopleiding by die werk ontvang?

- Yes/Ja
- No/Nee

3.16.1  Number of days / Aantal dae

____________________

3.16.2  Number of hours / Aantal ure

____________________

3.16.3  Are you satisfied with the First Aid training? Is u tevrede met die noodhulpopleiding?

- Yes/Ja
- No/Nee

3.16.4  If not, why not? / Indien nie. Waarom nie?

__________________________________________  ______________________________________

3.17  What safety measures are provided on the job? / Watter tipe voorsorg maatreels word voorsien vir veiligheid by die werk?

______________________________________________  ______________________________________

3.18  What is done when someone gets hurt on the job? / Wat word gedoen indien
iemand by die werk seerkry?

3.19 Did this job in any way improve the family’s standard of living? / Het hierdie werk op enige wyse die gesin se lewenstandaard verbeter?

Yes/Ja        No/Nee

If yes, how? / Indien ja,

3.19.1 hoe?

3.20 How active are you in your community? / Hoe aktief is u in u gemeenskap?

3.21 In which community activities do you participate? / Aan watter gemeenskapsaktiwiteite neem u deel?

4. FINANCIAL SITUATION / FINANSIËLE SITUASIE

4.1 Who is the main breadwinner in the household? (By breadwinner we mean the main person supporting the family) / Wie is die hoop broodwinner in die huishouding? (By broodwinner bedoel ons persoon wat die gesin onderhou)
4.2 How much did you earn on the project last month? / Hoeveel het u verlede maand verdien op die projek?

4.3 Does anyone in the family receive: / Onvang enige in die gesin:

4.3.1 A pension / 'n pensioen
Yes/Ja  No/Nee

4.3.2 A disability grant / 'n ongeskiktheidstoelaag
Yes/Ja  No/Nee

4.3.3 A child support grant / 'n kindertoelaag
Yes/Ja  No/Nee

4.3.4 Any other / Enige ander
Yes/Ja  No/Nee

4.4 Who handles the money in the family? / Wie hanteer die geld in die huishouding?

4.5 Is the family income enough to cover all expenses? / Is die gesininkomste genoeg om al uitgawes te dek?

Yes/Ja  No/Nee
4.6 What are your main monthly expenses? / Wat is u belangrikste maandelikse uitgawes?

_____________________________________________________________________________

4.7 Do you do any financial planning? / Doen u enige finansiële beplanning?

Yes/Ja No/Nee

4.8 Do you budget for monthly expenses? / Begroot u vir maandelikse uitgawes?

Yes/Ja No/Nee

4.9 Do you save money? / Spaar u geld?

Yes/Ja No/Nee

4.10 What other type of provision has been made for the future? / Watter ander tipe voorsiening het u gemaak vir die toekoms?

_____________________________________________________________________________

4.11 Do you sometimes have to ask an advance on your salary during the month? / Moet u soms gedurende die maand vir 'n voorskot op u salaris vra?

Yes/Ja No/Nee

4.12 Where do you go for financial help? / Waarheen gaan u vir finansiële hulp?

_____________________________________________________________________________

4.13 Do you have any loans that you are paying off? / Het u enige lenings wat u afbetaal?

Yes/Ja No/Nee

4.14 If yes, with whom? / Indien ja, by wie?
4.15 Do you own livestock? / Besit u lewende hawe?

4.15.1 How many goats / Hoeveel bokke

4.15.2 How many chickens / Hoeveel hoenders

4.15.3 How many cows / Hoeveel beeste

4.15.4 How many other / Hoeveel ander

5. EMPLOYMENT BENEFITS / WERKSOORDELE

5.1 What position do you hold in this project? / Watter posisie beklee u in die projek?

5.2 What form of wages do you prefer? / Watter tipe betaling verkies u?
5.3 What is the reason? / Wat is die rede?

5.4 Does the flagship Project provide any training? / Verskaf die Flagship Projek enige opleiding?

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

5.5 What skills, training or benefits did you acquire through the project? / Watter vaardighede, opleiding of voordele het u deur die projek verkry?

5.6 What skills/training do you still need? / Watter vaardighede/opleiding benodig u nog?

5.7 Is your household happier now that you are working on the project? / Is u huishouding gelukkiger noudat u op die projek werk?

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

If yes, why do you say that? / Indien ja, waarom sê u so?

5.8

If no, why do you say that? / Indien nee, waarom sê u so?

5.9

5.10 Which of the following makes you sad on the project? / Watter van die volgende
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Yes/No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.10.1</td>
<td>Relations with others / Verhouding met anders?</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10.2</td>
<td>Relations with Committees / Verhoudinge met die Komitees</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10.3</td>
<td>Relations with the supervisors / Verhoudinge met toesighouers</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10.4</td>
<td>Relations with project manager / Verhouding met projekbestuurder</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10.5</td>
<td>Relations with Department of Welfare / Verhoudinge met die Department van Welsyn</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10.6</td>
<td>Problems at home relating to the project? / Probleme tuis wat verband hou met die projek?</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10.7</td>
<td>If yes, specify / Indien ja, spesifiseer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10.8</td>
<td>Problems at home not relating to the project? / Probleme tuis wat nie verband hou met die projek nie?</td>
<td>Yes/No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10.9</td>
<td>If yes, specify / Indien ja, spesifiseer</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.10.10</td>
<td>Other / Ander</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5.11 Do you trust: / Vretou u:

5.11.1 Other workers / Ander werkers

Yes/Ja No/Nee

5.11.2 Your Supervisors / U toesighouers

Yes/Ja No/Nee

5.11.3 Your Committee / U Komites

Yes/Ja No/Nee

5.11.4 Your Project Manager / U Projekbestuurder

Yes/Ja No/Nee

5.12 Do you trust older people more than younger people? / Vretou u ouers of jonger mense meer?

Older Younger

5.13 Can you elaborate on these? / Kan u hierop uitbrei?

5.14 Has your community or household benefitted from the project? / Het u gemeenskap of gesin baat gevind by die projek?

Yes/Ja No/Nee

5.15 Explain / Verduidelik
5.16 What can be improved on the project? / Wat kan verbeter word in die projek?

6. PERSONAL HABITS AND FEELING / PERSOONLIKE GEBRUIKE EN GEVOELENS

6.1 Do you worry a lot? / Bekommer u uiself baie?

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

What do you worry about? / Waaroor bekommer u uiself?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self</th>
<th>Children / Kinders</th>
<th>Husband / Man</th>
<th>Other/Ander</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

6.2 Do you worry more than before working on the project? / Het u nou meer bekommerge as voordat u op die projek begin werk het?

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

6.3 Do you smoke cigarettes? / Rook u sigarette?

Yes/Ja  No/Nee

6.4 How many cigarettes do you smoke per day? / Hoeveel sigarette rook u per dag?

_________________

6.6 Do you drink alcohol? / Drink u sterk drank?

No/Nee
6.7 Does anyone in your household drink too much? / Drink enigiemand in die huishouding te veel?  
Yes/Ja  
No/Nee

6.8 Why do you think they drink too much? / Waarom dink u drink hulle te veel?  
_____________________________________________________________________________

6.9 Are there any problems in the household that you would like to talk about? / Is daar enige probleme in die huishouding waaroor u graag wil praat?  
Yes/Ja  
No/Nee

6.10 Please Elaborate / Brei uit asseblief  
_____________________________________________________________________________

7. GENERAL COMMENTS / ALGEMENE OPMERKINGS  
_____________________________________________________________________________
Appendix 5: Focus group questions

SIX FOCUS GROUP QUESTIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Question</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>What were your expectations and how did that change? How do you see things now?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>What were positive changes?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>What were negative changes?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>What more can be done? Who should do it?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>How do you feel about cooperating with the project staff/professionals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>What should be done to meet your needs? What would you propose to improve/amend past actions?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**ATTENTIVENESS**

*WHAT* care is necessary? What type of care exists? *WHO* articulates the nature of needs and to say *WHICH* problems must be catered for and *HOW* and *WHEN* they should be addressed?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CARE RECEIVERS</th>
<th>CARE GIVERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITY of the WESTERN CAPE</td>
<td>(state, NGO, Partnerships)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix 6 PEOC data matrix
## RESPONSIBILITY

*WHO* should be responsible for meeting the needs for care that exist? *HOW* can and should such responsibility be assigned? *WHY?*

## COMPETENCE

*WHO* are the actual care givers? *HOW* well can/do they perform their work? *WHAT* *CONFLICT* exist between them and their care receivers or within and between themselves? *WHAT* *RESOURCES* do caregivers need to care competently?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>RESPONSIBILITY</th>
<th>CARE RECEIVERS</th>
<th>CARE GIVERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>WHO</em> should be responsible for meeting the needs for care that exist?</td>
<td><em>HOW</em> can and should such responsibility be assigned?</td>
<td><em>(state, NGO, Partnerships)</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>COMPETENCE</th>
<th>CARE RECEIVERS</th>
<th>CARE GIVER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>WHO</em> are the actual care givers?</td>
<td><em>HOW</em> well can/do they perform their work?</td>
<td><em>(state, NGO, Partnerships)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>WHAT</em> <em>CONFLICT</em> exist between them and their care receivers or within and between themselves?</td>
<td><em>WHAT</em> <em>RESOURCES</em> do caregivers need to care competently?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**RESPONSIVENESS**

*HOW* do care receivers respond to the care that they are given? How well does the care process as it exist, meet their needs? If their needs conflict with one another, who resolves these conflicts?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CARE RECEIVERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CARE GIVERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(state, NGO, Partnerships)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**QUESTIONS RE:**

**CONFLICT AND INTEGRATION OF CARE**

*WHAT* conflicts exist to disrupt ‘integrated’ and ‘complete’ care? How far apart are care givers and care receivers? How distant are those who hold ‘responsibility’ from those who give care? What connection exists to make those claiming to ‘care about’ a particular problem to assume responsibility for it; to pay genuine attention to its outcome as a caring process?

What conflicts emerge between the expertise or (professionalism) of those who care about, care for, and give care with those who primarily receive care?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CARE RECEIVERS</th>
<th>CARE GIVERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(state, NGO, Partnerships)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**QUESTIONS RE: CONTEXT OF CARE**

*HOW* are needs perceived in this realm to help define and shape the nature of the caring process?

*WHAT* forms of power and privilege (if at all) reside in this care process as perceived.

What are related factors/issues likely to threaten change in current forms of care?

What construction of *‘otherness’*(*‘difference’*) contributes to our understanding of these questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CARE RECEIVERS</th>
<th>CARE GIVERS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(state, NGO, Partnerships)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>