# EXPERIENCES OF RURAL GIRLS IN A HISTORICALLY MALE DOMINATED ORGANISATION: SCOUTS IN MPUMALANGA, WESTERN CAPE AND EASTERN CAPE

### MARIA VAN STADEN

A minithesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Magister Artium

Department of Women & Gender studies
Faculty of Arts
University of the Western Cape

Supervisor: Dr. L. Clowes University of the Western Cape

**NOVEMBER 2006** 

#### **ABSTRACT**

This study explores the experiences of young rural girls in scouting practices, who reside in the rural areas of Mpumalanga, Western and the Eastern Cape provinces of South Africa. This exploratory study draws special reference to their participation in scout programmes in what is observed as a predominately male-dominated organisational alignment.

The South African Scout Association, formerly known as the Boys Scout of South Africa was founded in 1908. In June 2002 the Association adopted a Gender Policy which aimed to developed transformation, making youth programmes of this organisation more relevant, attractive and gender-inclusive for all its members. This Gender Policy outlines the organisational process to be followed to address gender and other related issues in Scout programme activities.

This exploratory study uses a qualitative feminist investigation, through focus groups and semi-structured interviews to investigate the impact of these organisational change initiatives on the experiences of girls in scouting. Although the aim of the study was to explore the experiences of rural girls, boys were included in the study to explore the gender dynamics and to problematise how gender inequalities can be understood and addressed in scouting.

It was found that the admission of girls in the groups did not take place without difficulties. The boys showed resistance towards the change in the organisation and tension between the boys and the girls was reported. Although girls challenged the perceptions which the boys (and some of girls) have or had of girls in leadership it seems that things might be slowly changing.

.

It is noteworthy that despite different socialisation practices in broader society, both boys and girls rated the outdoor activities as the most liked, and physical exercises as the least liked activities, suggesting that there are similarities between boys and girls that can fruitfully be developed.

#### **DECLARATION**

I, the undersigned, hereby declare that *The experiences of rural girls in a previously male dominated organisation: Scouts in Mpumalanga, Western Cape and Eastern Cape* is my own work, that it has not been before for any degree or examination in any other university, and that all the sources I have used and quoted have been indicated and acknowledged.

Signed:

Maria van Staden

Date: November 2006



#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I wish to thank all those who supported me through this project. Firstly, my husband, who has been my source of inspiration, showing understanding of the sacrifices of being a student, supporting me patiently when times were difficult. My daughter and son who were concerned *when* exactly I would finish this mammoth task, but at the same time sighted me as a role model.

I wish to thank my family members, especially my sisters who have liaised with my supervisor, ensuring that she receives my e-mails during the times I had to work outside the larger Cape Town-area.

My supervisor, Lindsay Clowes, who provided me with so much support, and always being available despite her heavy schedule at times.

The National Scout Council who granted permission for this venture, allowing me to access the organisation's documentation. My heartfelt thanks especially to Luke van der Laan, the Chief Executive of the South African Scout Association, who allowed this research to be an extension of my work, enabling me to reach the groups in Mpumalanga Eastern Cape and the Western Cape. In this, I was extremely pleased with the welcome and hospitality that I received from the different groups; especially the adult leaders and the participants. I am especially grateful for the commitment and the availability of the participants during this venture, enabling me to complete my studies.

### **KEY WORDS**

girls

scouts

transformation

gender

feminism

patriarchy

culture

participation

integration



### **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

	Abstract	i
	Declaration	ii
	Acknowledgements	iii
	Keywords	iv
	Table of Contents	v-vi
	PREAMBLE	1
l.	Chapter One: Historical Overview of developments in Scouting	
1.1	General overview of girls in scouting	5
1.2	The history of Scouting in the world and the integration of girls	6
1.3	A historical overview of Scouting in South Africa and the integration of	8
	girls	
1.3.1	As from 1908	8
1.3.2	As from 1994 onwards	9
1.4	The experiences of other scout associations when they opened their	
	doors to girls	14
1.5	Policies shaping the process of gender equality in scouting	16
1.5.1	World Organisation Scout Movement: Policy on girls and boys, women	
	and men within the scouting movement (1999)	16
1.5.2	The South African Scout Association Gender Policy, 2002	18
1.6	Conclusion	21
2.	Chapter Two: Literature Review	
2.1	Introduction	22
2.2	Studies around the world	22
2.3	Studies in Africa	30
2.4.	Conclusion	33
3.	Chapter Three: The Research Design and Methodology	
3.1	Introduction	35
3.2	Methodology and Framework	35
3.3	Research procedures	36
3.3.1	Aims of the study	36
332	Research participant	36

3.3.2.	3.3.2.1 Selection of participants		
3.3.2.2	2 Details of participants	3	37
	_		
3.4	Focus groups		38 40
3.4.1	Focus groups and Interviews format		
3.4.2	Details of venues		41
3.4.2.1 Mpumalanga			41 41
	3.4.2.2. Eastern Cape		
3.4.2.3. Western Cape			41 42
3.5	Pre-Focus Group Programme		
3.6	The Focus Group Programme		
3.7	Reflexivity		43
3.8.	Data analysis		46
3.9.	Ethical considerations	5	47
3.10.	Conclusion		47
		memememem.	
4.	Chapter Four:	Gender experiences in Scouting	
4.1	Introduction		49
4.2	Joining scouting	<u></u>	49
4.3	Describing scouting	UNIVERSITY of the	50
4.4	The Scout Ethics	WESTERN CAPE	51
4.5.	Scouting as a Social	Institution	53
4.6	Scouting: Providing R	esources	54
4.7	Scouting and Its Prog	ramme	56
4.8	Activities liked and dis	sliked	59
4.9	Uniform		60
4.10	Conclusion		61
5.	Chapter Five: Trans	formation in Scouting	
5.1	Introduction		63
5.2	Transformation and G	Gender Roles	63
5.3	Transformation and A	accessibility	64
5.4.	Transformation and Ir	ntegration	65
5.4.1	Transformation at troop level		
5.5.	Single vs Mixed Patro	ol Settings	68
5.6	Differences and Com	monalities	69
5.7	Leadership and girls in Scouting		

5.7.1	Boys responding to girls' leadership	72
5.7.2	Girls responding to girls' leadership	73
5.7.3.	Girls, power and leadership	74
5.8	Conclusion	74
6.	Chapter Six: Conclusion	77
7.	References	81
8.	Appendices	85



#### **PREAMBLE**

The South African Scout Association (SASA) started to operate in South Africa in 1908 and was initially restricted to boys only. Women in the association were only involved in the programmes as adult leaders of the Cub Section that catered for boys between the ages of 7-11 years. Women leaders were however not allowed in the Scout section that catered for older boys from 11-18 years.

With the change of the South African political status quo in 1994, ending in the adoption of the New Constitution in South Africa in 1996, alongside the background of progressive policies of the international scouting movement, the integration of girls in scouting was then intensely debated. Policy decisions taken by the World Scout Conference in 1999 that national bodies should promote gender equality, gave further impetus to organisational changes within this association. In 1999 SASA opened its doors for girls. Subsequently, a motion endorsing the need for a specific gender policy was adopted in June 2002 at the National Scout Council in Pretoria.

In this study I aim to explore how this organisational integration of girls, in accordance with the new gender policy, still poses challenges, beyond simple logistics. It involves challenges to culture, tradition and patriarchy in the organisation as well in the families from which young scouts emerge.

Recent research demonstrates that groups in certain provinces are still apparently excluding girls from their programmes. According to the 2001

National Statistics of South Africa, only 13% of the total membership of this organisation was girls (SASA census, 2001). By 2003 this percentage had grown to a mere 15% and the 2005 statistics (SASA census, 2005) reflects only a 16% female membership. Clearly this poses a number of questions and suggests that simply opening the doors to admit girls is not sufficient to address gender imbalances. It is hoped that this study will be able to provide some answers and to point to possibilities for further research.

This exploratory qualitative study explores the experiences of rural girls in the scouting programme which are identified by CAMFED International as the most disadvantaged social group in the world. Rural young men and women in South Africa are identified as target groups in the National Youth Policy, which needs special attention from government and youth development agencies. It is further reported that rural girls are unable to challenge the status quo from their position of acute vulnerability. CAMFED International suggests that the girls' circumstances can only improve if the community support them and in turn rural communities can only change if the girls' circumstances change. The South African Scout Association (SASA) unlocked the resources that began the process of change through the Phakamani outreach programme which made in roads to the rural areas, trying to address challenges faced by these vulnerable groups. Through my research I wanted to establish in what way SASA addresses some of the challenges of rural girls, which include less access to resources and opportunities, high number of teenage pregnancies and poverty. Secondly, how SASA's programmes reinforces or weakens the social and economic constraints operating against the equal participation of girls.

For this study, I have obtained permission from the National Scout Council to conduct research within these various provincial structures of the association. A situational analysis was conducted by collating information on the history, the community, the membership profiles, the location of groups and the leadership of these Scouting structures. Secondly, I attempted to determine the basis on which girls and boys currently participate in the association's youth programme in rural areas, and how girls experience their participation.

The study begins by providing an historical overview of the integration of girls internationally and in South Africa in Chapter One. An outline of the various policy frameworks formulated by the World Organisation of Scouts Movement (WSOM) will also be narrated; especially those on how SASA had to align their transformation agenda to these policy frameworks.

In Chapter Two I report on other people's work on similar questions and reveal the scarcity of studies conducted with rural girls. Most studies involving rural girls pose questions around agriculture and farming rather than considering their experiences in this male-dominated association. There are however some studies conducted in developed countries focusing on the experiences of urban girls and women moving into traditionally male

domains, such as engineering and construction.

WESTERN CAPE

Chapter Three provides an account of the research processes with an exposition of the research methodology and research design. My research draws upon data from three Scout groups in three provinces: Mpumalanga, the Eastern Cape and the Western Cape. With permission from the National

Scout Council I employed focus groups and conducted semi-structured interviews, with additional follow-up interviews (where needed) with members of these focus groups to obtain data for this research. I analysed my data using grounded theory analysis.

Chapter Four commences my analysis of the data captured as obtained through these focus groups by means of semi-structured interviews. I discuss the experiences shared by female and male respondents, and I analyse the organisation by focusing on key aspects of membership such as scouting ethics and programmes – also known in the organisation as the Scouts as the Promise, the Scout Law and the badge work

Chapter Five continues this discussion. Herein I focus on the processes that informed transformation, and compare and contrast boys and girls experiences of transformation as well as looking at girls' experiences of leadership as agents in transforming the organisation.

The study concludes with a summary of the main findings and shares additional conclusions and recommendations drawn from this research study.

#### **CHAPTER ONE**

#### HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF DEVELOPMENTS IN SCOUTING

### 1.1. GENERAL OVERVIEW OF GIRLS IN SCOUTING

Throughout the world, gender discrimination and stereotyping limit the full development and participation of girls and women, even more so than those of boys and young men. Until all girls receive the same opportunities as their male counterparts, their fundamental human rights are denied and the conditions for sustainable development are unfulfilled (CEO, nd: 6).

The World Organisation of the Scout Movement (WOSM), one of the world's largest youth organisations with its emphasis on education, faced the challenge of opening its doors to girls in order to provide opportunities to girls through its non-formal education programme. This integration of girls has brought new dynamics to the Scout organisation. This research suggests that the integration of girls introduces new complexities as they had to operate in structures and systems basically designed by and for men, and geared to meet their needs.

Whilst raising the challenges, it was further noted that the scouting movement has also benefited as the integration of girls brought about increased membership and thus presents a financial advantage to the organisation. It has now been seen as an organisation that tries to operate 'politically correctly' as it addresses the needs of both genders.

# 1.2. THE HISTORY OF SCOUTING IN THE WORLD AND THE INTEGRATION OF GIRLS.

Originally Robert Baden-Powell had envisaged scouting as a movement for boys between the ages of 11 and 18 years, but as early as 1909 Scout Masters were facing the problem of younger sisters and brothers wanting to join the troops (Scout Base UK:06). Thus debates on gender in scouting surfaced as early as 1908. The debates centred on whether to include girls in the scouting programme. In this, Baden-Powell remarked

I have had several quite pathetic letters from little girls asking if they may share delights of a Scouting life with Boys, but of course they may! I am always glad to hear of girls' patrols being formed (cited in Nielson, 2000:1).

This suggests that Baden-Powell was in favour of allowing girls in Scouts but in separate troops. Baden-Powell considered it right that young girls should also be allowed to participate in camping, hiking and other activities as long as they did so in troops of girls. However, girl patrols did not survive for long, because at the same time the suffragette movement was addressing the issue by setting up the sister movement, the Girl Guides, in 1910; an initiative of Baden-Powell's sister Agnes, supported by his wife, Olave (Nielsen, 2001:1). The first guidelines for girls were published in autumn of 1909 (in response to the fact that 6,000 girls had already enrolled as Boy Scouts). These guidelines drew on the contemporary thinking about gender and suggested that girls should not be like Scouts. Instead it suggested that while girls should take part in some scouting activities, these activities should

be modified and that the emphasis in the girl's section should be on training their characters towards making them good mothers and moral guides. A further suggestion was that troops of girls should not be called Scouts. Reflecting on the idea of girls and women as moral guides, a new name was suggested, the Girl Guides (Nielsen, 2001:1).

In 1960 there was a strong move in Europe and America towards coeducational schools and colleges and this influenced the World Scout Conference decision in 1977 to eliminate references to scouting serving the needs of boys only. The first time that girls were allowed into the boy's youth movement since Baden-Powell started up the Guide movement in 1910 was in 1977, when WOSM officially opened itself to both genders. The seventies can be characterised as a period where mixed gender became the dominant model in Europe (Nielsen, 2001:2). It is reported that in some cases the associations for girls and boys merged. In other cases the associations for girls chose to stay female and many associations for boys opened up for girls. Another factor that pressurised associations to consider the integration of girls was apparently government funding. It is reported that most associations in Europe combined the Guides and Scouts because this became a condition for government funding. In 1999, the World Scout Conference in Durban adopted an official policy on girls and boys, as well as women and men. Presently WOSM practises two admission policies. The first admission policy was where Guide and Scout associations are amalgamated; and the second is where the Scout associations admit girls. From the 154 national Scout associations, only 120 belonged to the WOSM and 34 belonged to both the WOSM and WAGGS (The World Organisation of Girl Guides and Girl Scouts). Only 20 of these Scout associations had a 'boys only' policy.

# 1.3. HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF SCOUTING IN SOUTH AFRICA AND THE INTEGRATION OF GIRLS

#### 1.3.1. As from 1908

The movement in South Africa began at the same time as it did in Britain and other parts of the world. Boys read the book <u>Scouting for Boys</u> written by Robert Baden-Powell and this inspired them to start patrols and troops. Scout troops were formed as early as 1908.

In South Africa, Provincial Councils of the Boy Scouts were established between 1912 and 1916 and these fulfilled co-ordinating functions. These councils were directly accountable to the Scout Headquarters in London and apparently had no direct contact with one another (Boy Scouts of South Africa, 1992:11). The first Union Scout Council was formed in 1922 to provide a common national control on an advisory basis. Six years later, the Union Scout Council adopted a constitution, which gave it the power to perform the functions of Imperial Head Scout Headquarters.

In 1929 a separate structure for African Scouts, known as the Pathfinder Council was formed, and it was under the control of the South African Scout Council. A year later, the London-based Imperial Headquarters affirmed the complete independence of the Scout movement in South Africa (Boy Scouts of South Africa, 1992:11). In 1937 the Boy Scouts of South Africa became a member of the International Scout Conference (now called the World Scout Conference) and was registered with the International Bureau (now World

Scout Bureau) on 1 December 1937 after a visit of Baden-Powell in 1936 when the constitution was finalised. This constitution made provision for four parallel movements in South Africa built around racialised identities: the [white] Boy Scout Association, African Boy Scout Association, the Coloured Boy Scout Association and the Indian Scout Association (Boy Scouts of South Africa, 1992:11).

Several structural changes were recorded in the history of scouting, and 1953 is marked by the appointment of an Executive Chief Scout and Deputy: the African, Coloured and Indian Associations each having a Chief Scout Commissioner as its executive head under the [European] Chief Scout. From 1960 onwards, constitutional amendments were made to the four parallel associations in order to ensure: the strengthening of structures to co-ordinate the policy of all sections of the scout movement in South Africa, the building of a national team for different functions and also to increase the co-operation between the four parallel associations (Boy Scouts of South Africa, 1992:12).

On 2 July 1977 a new constitution was adopted which brought about an important change when a single association replaced the four associations: the Boy Scouts of South Africa. Membership was open to all boys and adults who were willing to accept the aim, method and principles of scouting.

#### 1.3.2. From 1994 onwards

At the 18<sup>th</sup> meeting of the National Scout Council held in November 1994, a motion was tabled suggesting a new constitutional document. It was suggested that the document should contain a statement of basic principles

as contained in the World Constitution. Amongst the other points discussed were that the word 'boy' be dropped from the name of the Boy Scouts of South Africa in recognition of the new South African interim Constitution. Secondly, that a statement must be made that the removal of the word 'boy' does not mean that troops and patrols must accept girls. It was agreed that a member of the council should redraw the proposal along these lines and that the proposal should be resubmitted to the council in May 1995 (National Scout Council, 26-27 November 1994:3).

This discussion with regard to the changes to the country's Scouting Constitution continued at the National Scout Council in June 1995. The chairperson ruled that the incorporation of the change of the name was acceptable, but that a change of wording from 'boys' to 'persons' was of such a fundamental importance to the movement, and that it should be subjected to a separate motion. Discussions were called on the proposal from the Western Cape with regard to girls in scouting. It was reported in the June 1995 National Scout Council minutes that the proposal generated hot discussions and the following conclusions were reached. It was suggested that internally appointed members of the council should undertake an investigation into the experiences of other scouting associations in other countries when opening their membership to girls. Combined research the methods. problems, into limitations recommendations arising from these experiences. A consultative process was suggested. It was made clear to the council members that while waiting for the report, no 'experiments' should take place. It was further stated that, as matter of principle, a merger with the Girl Guides was not proposed, and that any research must be undertaken along the lines of opening the scout movement to girls who are not members of the Girl Guides (National Scout Council, 10 June 1995:12).

At the National Scout Council held in November 1996, a report was tabled and lively discussions on the report ensued. Also present at this particular Council meeting was the Girl Guide Chief Commissioner, also a delegate to the Beijing Women's Convention, who strongly opposed the introduction of girls into scouting, stating that she would use every means at her disposal to oppose it as this move would then ultimately threaten the growth of the Girl Guides in South Africa. After discussions with 35 Christian churches, the Chief Scout reported that the churches would have a problem with a youth programme which did not permit membership of both boys and girls. At the meeting the consequences of including girls were discussed as well the difficulties with adult leadership and the fact the youth programme should be changed. This meeting decided that a written report needed to be circulated to all the provinces for further discussions. Furthermore, it was noted that the area councils should create opportunities for consultation down to group level with the personnel in the area and views to be communicated from the areas to the South African Headquarters by Easter 1997. The Western Cape was tasked to prepare the notice of the motion to amend the constitution and the Policy Organisation and Rules (POR) together with a proposal for the criteria, which would need to be implemented if the motion was to be accepted (National Scout Council, 23-24 November 1996:13).

At the 5<sup>th</sup> meeting of the commissioners in November 1997, areas (provinces) reported that they discussed the 'Girls in scouting' proposal in

depth and that they would come to the March 1998 National Scout Council Meeting with their area's mandate (Commissioners, 22-23 November 1997).

At the National Scout Council held in March 1998 the areas presented the following proposals:

- That girls be admitted as full members of the association at all levels subject to the wishes of the scout group,
- ◆ A counterproposal that girls should only be admitted into either a Girl Cub pack (7-11 age group) or a Girl Scout troop (11-18 age group).
- A close working relationship with the Girl Guides was suggested so it was not necessary for the movement to open up for girls, as there is already a bond between the Scouts and the Girl Guides.
- No groups should be obliged to accept girls. It was the feeling that no Area should feel threatened by the proposal, and if there were a single troop within the Area, which did not want to admit girls, they could continue not to do so.
- Another proposal suggested a joint support structure with Guides and that the co-operation with the Girl Guides should form joint local associations, and even joint group committees.
- The Rover Crew (members over 18 years old) admitted women and reported that this was a satisfactory arrangement (National Scout Council, 29 March 1998:3).

Other debates centred on various historical issues and the fact that traditional gender divisions were breaking down rapidly which meant that it

was inevitable that scouting would eventually admit girls. It was further stressed that mistakes that were made by other associations abroad should not be repeated. Another concern was the availability of adequate staff to implement the changes. It was also stressed that girls should be made aware that the association was not universally opened to girls and that a girl might not be able to join another group if she moved to another place. The council was also given the assurance that there was nothing in the interim South African Constitution (1993) that required the association to amend their constitution to open their doors for girls. It was further stated that no unfair discrimination was involved in the Scout movement in terms of providing training and membership for boys and not for girls. Based on these legal justifications it was felt that a vote against the proposal could also be considered. It was also advised that it could be revisited year by year. These concerns and opinions were challenged in the meeting, which stated that the issue was not about the admission of girls into scouting but rather a challenge to the council to take the movement to where it was intended to be, as a service to the community. The view was frequently stated that the focus should not be on whether to allow girls or not, but on the management of the change in the movement so that it could serve everybody. At the meeting representatives from rural scouting reported that the majority of the votes for the admission for girls had come from the disadvantaged sector.

After various proposals concerning how the vote should be taken it was agreed that the amended first sub-section of motion 1/98, be voted on. As amended, it read 'that the Constitution and the Policy, Organisation and Rules (POR) be amended to allow the admission of girls and women to membership of the South African Scout Association at all levels' (National

Scout Council, 29 March 1998:2). These guidelines and associated amendments had to be submitted to the council for approval. The motion was passed after a vote was taken with thirteen votes in favour, twelve against, and one abstention.

The National Scout Council (1999) minutes reflected progress made in terms of the integration of girls. Two motions were tabled of which motion 1/99 refers to the admission of girls to association by forming troops and packs in parallel, with female adult leaders in charge of the troops and the packs. Motion 2/99 stated that 'by accepting Motion 1/99 it was also necessary to make alterations to the POR'. The motions were carried by a majority vote indicating that the leadership support the integration of girls (National Scout Council, 28 March 1999:6).

# 1.4. THE EXPERIENCES OF OTHER SCOUT ASSOCIATIONS WHEN OPENING THEIR DOORS TO GIRLS.

Change in South Africa was mirrored by further changes elsewhere. On 21 November 1998 the Canadian Scout Council passed a motion whereby Scouts Canada reaffirmed that it is a co-educational organisation and it shall not discriminate on the basis of gender (Scouts Canada:1). The changes in their legislation thus no longer provided for all male groups except under special circumstances. It was suggested that any female requesting admission to a section should be accepted on the same basis as any male. One of the challenges that Canadian scouting was faced with was whether a co-educational section should have a co-educational leadership. It was recommended that a co-educational leadership was important for camps or day outings. It was further suggested that considerations should be given to

the sleeping accommodations, toilets and bathing facilities of the two gendergroupings. There were, however, some groups that remained male only. These were groups affiliated to certain theological institutions, which requested gender separation.

The Scouts Canada has now integrated gender into their Scout programme. The legislation suggested that adult leaders would need to monitor some aspects of the programme, such as contact games, sensitively, to ensure that differences as well as similarities were taken into account (Scouts Canada:4).

United Kingdom scouting organisation has welcomed mixed membership in all sections since 1991, although the Venture Scout Section formalised membership for young women as early as 1976 (World Scout Bureau, 2000:1). The movement was provided with a set of guidelines for 'mixed membership', but there were no changes to the programme material or real support for the leaders who wished to work co-educationally. This policy stated that for a section to provide scouting for girls and boys, there must be female leaders in the leadership team, or consider the possibility that all of the leadership be female. This prevented many Scout troops from offering mixed membership, which then also prevented the younger sections in keeping with 'sectional continuity'. That is to say, female scouts would not be able to move up from one section to another, within a group. There were also 'blocks' at district level, where some commissioners would look for the difficulties rather than the advantages of mixed membership, and not encourage groups to offer mixed membership or even actively block it. Statistics from 2000 showed that after 8 years only 6% of the total youth

membership in Britain was female (World Scout Bureau, 2000:1). It was reported that in both Canada and the UK, the Girl Guides have remained numerically superior to the Scouts for many years.

Overall, the Canadian Scouts as well as the UK and Australian Scout Associations experienced that the 10-14-year-old group had the greatest divergence in the rate of development and generated the most challenges in the co-educational scouting. It was found that girls tend to be more mature than boys between these ages and often take a leadership role which boys at that age seem unable or reluctant to accept.

# 1.5. POLICIES SHAPING THE PROCESS OF GENDER EQUALITY IN SCOUTING

# 1.5.1. World Organisation of the Scout Movement: Policy on girls and boys, women and men within the scout movement (1999)

Around the world women's participation has been an essential aspect of scouting leadership for many years for the younger age section. As discussed earlier, girls were not allowed to be part of the youth programme until 1977 when WOSM (World Organisation of the Scout Movement) became co-educational (Nielsen, 2001:3). This change was not initiated by the World Scout leadership, but was a result of the strong pressures from within the organisation, yet, from the global field girls have already joined scouting. The World Association of Girl Guides and Girl Scouts (WAGGS), the international organisation for Girl Scouts and Girl Guides, did not want to give up their own identity and thus stayed a girl-only movement (Nielsen, 2001:3).

Prior to the 35th World Conference held in Durban in 1999 where WOSM policy was adopted, many requests had been made and formal resolutions adopted that highlighted the need for further work on gender related issues in scouting. Resolution 6/93 taken at the 33rd World Conference in Bangkok in 1993 refers to the equal opportunities for both genders stating that 'the Conference considered the importance of equal opportunities for girls and boys, women and men' (35th World Conference, 1999-Document 9). Furthermore, National Associations which offered their programme to both boys and girls, young men and women were also encouraged to ensure that their programmes were designed specifically to reflect a truly co-educational process and that their adult training opportunities reflect the co-educational purpose, process and programme (35th World Conference, 1999-Document 9). Resolution 8/93 of the Bangkok conference in 1993 highlighted the equal opportunities for both genders in the area of adult resources and the management of associations. Herein, the World Adult Resource Policy states that 'in an association which is open to both girls and boys, the adult leadership need to develop and function effectively requires: a distribution of roles and functions within the operational teams based on competencies, not gender, while continually striving to achieve and maintain a balance between male and female membership at all levels' (35th World Conference, 1999-Document 9:5).

It was decided at the 34<sup>th</sup> World Scout Conference in Oslo in 1996 that World Bodies should work for 'a more equitable representation of females and males'. It further recommended that the 'World Scout Committee must ensure that in all its activities, especially in the context of youth programme and leader training, meets the different needs of females and males' (35<sup>th</sup>)

World Conference, 1999-Document 9:2). These policy statements gave direction on the subject of girls, boys, women and men in the Scout movement. These motions clearly set out the implications of integrating women into scouting for national Scout associations in terms of membership, youth programmes, adults in scouting and management as well as the implications for the world and regional levels of the movement.

#### 1.5.2. South African Scout Association (SASA) Gender Policy, 2002

With these changes, the South African Scout Association had to conform, not only to the provisions of the Constitution of the South Africa, but also with the progressive policies of the movement internationally. Since 1994, reflecting wider debates about equality and social change, debates in scouting have centred on the transformation of the organisation. This included issues of gender equality. For this, a gender specialist was appointed to facilitate the process to look into the gender issues in the movement. After a consultative process a gender policy was developed, and at the end of 2001 the Transformation Manager was appointed. One of her tasks was to refine and to finalise the Gender Policy. The Gender Policy was eventually presented and adopted at the June 2002 National Scout Council.

The SASA's Gender Policy outlines the process surrounding how the SASA aimed to address gender-related issues in relation to the South African transformation agenda. The policy document also reflects the organisation's commitment to gender equality in the policy statement:

SASA's gender policy will challenge and interrogate unequal gender relations in a manner, which is

transformatory and uses redistributive interventions. In this regard SASA will provide a setting in which girls; boys, women and men operate together in a manner that offers equal opportunities to both sexes when participating in scouting activities. This will also apply in sharing tasks, responsibilities and making decisions (SASA's Gender Policy, 2002:4).

Gender has now been used as a transformational concept in the policy stating that 'SASA need to be transformed into an organisation which is gender responsive and offers redistributive interventions, thus striving to create a more balanced relationship between women and men. It seeks to make visible patterns of inequality between men and women' (SASA''s Gender Policy, 2002:5). In this policy document, the term 'gender' is used as an inclusive concept, stating:

WESTERN CAPE

[T]he emphasis will be on gender rather than on women, recognising that the inequality of women cannot be understood by looking at women alone but it must be based on a fuller understanding of the relationship between women and men in SASA (SASA's Gender Policy, 2002:5).

Gender sensitisation training and education are seen as methods in building equitable partnerships between men and women. However, as the organisation serves a diverse group of members from different ethnic groups, cultures and classes, it is important to keep in mind that gender identities intersect with other socially constructed identities in complex ways. An

emphasis solely on gender may not provide the complex understanding and responses necessary to address inequalities among people.

Nevertheless, the policy document outlines the national and provincial structures responsible for the implementation of the Gender Policy. The policy states that mainstreaming is the 'approach [that] will be adopted in order to strengthen the effectiveness of development co-operation in addressing the situation of women and achieving progress to gender equality'. For SASA it means emphasis on reshaping the mainstream rather than adding activities for women at the margin. Secondly, it focuses on gender equality as an objective, rather than women as a target group (SASA's Gender Policy; 2002:7).

Both WOSM and SASA have adopted an approach which involves putting into place a basic infrastructure that takes gender into account; this includes an organisational policy, gender units which need to work on programmes, gender training, the development of gender analysis tools, as well as increasing women's representation.

Despite all these policy documents and organisational changes aimed at advancing gender equality, it appears that little has actually been achieved on ground level. Although more girls and women have entered the movement in leadership positions here in South Africa, this seems not to have really transformed the nature of the structures (in terms of decision-making, power, or accessibility). This study will explore the ways in which integrating girls and women into scouting have proved to be challenging.

#### 1.6. CONCLUSION

In this chapter I provided an historical overview of scouting in South Africa and internationally and the policies that were formulated by WOSM and SASA to address gender equality. The history marked the important dates when WOSM opened its doors to girls in 1977, and when the policy on girls and boys in the movement was adopted in 1999. This chapter further reports on the debates that took place in the leadership structures in SASA to ensure the integration of girls. The next chapter provides an overview of the literature, which includes studies that focus on the experiences of women entering male dominated organisations in countries around the world and Africa.

WESTERN CAPE

#### **CHAPTER TWO**

#### LITERATURE REVIEW

#### 2.1 INTRODUCTION

The following chapter explores research into the experiences of females who are drawn into previously male dominated organisations. One of the first points to note is that there is very little research in relation to the experiences of rural girls entering male dominated organisations. In searching for literature to conceptualise this study. I found my search for studies exploring the experiences of rural girls to be largely fruitless. Although various qualitative and quantitative studies have been conducted that consider the experiences of girls and women entering male dominated organisations and work places, none of these focused specifically on rural girls. Studies that consider the lives of rural women tend to focus on access to resources and information around agriculture and farming. Because of this I was forced to widen my research perspective. I looked at theories and literature that explored the experiences of young women/girls entering male dominated organisations and institutions. While it was unfortunate that most of these tended to deal with girls in urban areas, and generally those in the developed world, such findings underlined the need for more exploratory studies involving rural girls.

#### 2.2 STUDIES AROUND THE WORLD

The studies that were conducted provided some indication as to what women or girls can experience if they enter male dominated environments. One such study focused on girls joining male dominated gangs (Pagewise, 2002). This research suggests that more and more female teenagers are joining street gangs controlled by male gang leaders. And herein, most researchers tend to ignore or

misrepresent the role of female gang members. Researchers concluded that there is very little known about female gang involvement, particularly the factors which motivate adolescent girls to join male dominated gangs. More recently, researchers further maintain that much of the research in this area is characterised by a gender bias with researchers typically ignoring young women or, when they do take them in to account, utilising male gang members as their source of information about females. This study of Pagewise (2002) further showed parallels to other studies that female members were nothing more than sexual objects to be controlled by male gang members. Pagewise (2002) further argues this is no longer the case and reports that there is evidence that girls are no longer just appendages to male gangsters. Pagewise (2002) states that there is some indication that girls are beginning to form their own gangs, apparently in reaction to the sexism and gender inequality found in male dominated gangs. It was found that girls are frustrated by the absence of equal rights and by not having a voice in the male dominated gang (Pagewise, 2002). It is further reported that many female gang members apparently experience severe problems in gangs including, sexual exploitation and violence. Researchers have arrived at solutions to draw attention to the growing female gang problem. One study concluded that in order to truly protect female youth it is important to find the underlying causes that attract girls to join male dominated gangs (Pagewise, 2002). While this is a useful study in that it assesses the work of other researchers, it is limited in terms of my research study in that it is not clear in which country the research is situated, how or where the study was conducted, or even whether it is in an urban or a rural setting, although it is likely to be urban. From the perspective of my research, this work is limited to the extent that it does not make girls experiences the central focus, although it does raise questions about sexism and sexual exploitation as girls move into male dominated spaces and institutions. This study also focuses on girls' experiences with semistructured interviews with male-counterparts.

Van Nostrand (1993) explored the integration of women into a co-educational sailing course in North America. She specifically focused on the struggles women experienced in this traditionally male sphere. The men were apparently more advantaged than the women. According to the research the instructor appeared to be insensitive as it was reported that he used non-inclusive and sexist language, thus creating a learning environment that advantaged men. Although the instructor apparently strived to assign tasks equally, he did not intervene if males allegedly 'appropriated' most tasks. Seemingly, the instructor did not try to involve females who sat by, waiting to be asked, deferring to men's dominance (Van Nostrand, 1993:93). The study demonstrated how women were marginalised by their male peers and how the instructor as an educator apparently reinforced this marginalisation by perpetually favouring men. It was further reported that male crew members and instructors assumed that women were less capable and therefore less was therefore expected from them. The female sailors consequently accomplished fewer tasks, presumably learned less and many failed the course (Van Nostrand, 1993:100). The study illustrated how female sailors were both under-challenged and over-challenged in the attempt to bring them into the traditionally male dominated activity of sailing.

Diamond and Kimmel (2002) explored the integration of women into a somewhat different masculine environment in America. They conducted their studies at two military educational institutions, with the focus of examining gender integration in the cadets. Gender, they argue, was and remains the most significant social construct structuring the experiences of women cadets. According to Diamond

and Kimmel, although the institutions both had rigorously challenging, physically demanding training programmes their overall approaches differed. One institution maintained a system of 'equivalent training', which recognised physical differences between women and men but that was perceived as establishing lower standards for women, thus fostering animosity between male and female cadets, and making it more difficult for women to finish the programme. This study suggests that integrating women in male dominated areas can become a contentious issue. This will be one of the issues I will explore in my study.

The other institution studied by Diamond and Kimmel maintained a single fitness standard for male and females. But, as Diamond and Kimmel note, although superficially appearing gender neutral, it is a standard that was developed by men for men. They suggested that men felt very strongly that if women wanted to join they should pass the same physical test and that the institution should not 'lower' the standards. Many female cadets thus failed the test as the standard was based on exercise to complement the male physique. What was surprising is that female cadets were also adamant that the standards should not be changed. In this study it seemed the women preferred to maintain a single standard even though fewer of them would pass (Diamond and Kimmel, 2002:177). These two studies are more useful in terms of my own research and point to the difficulties in trying to integrate women into organisations and institutions that have been set up by and for men, as the scouts were. They raise questions that I will need to take into account in my own work.

A study that initially seemed more likely to prove useful to my work is research in Jamaica, which supposedly focused on the experiences of women in the construction sector. Although the study focused on adult women I hoped it would

raise issues relevant to my study of girls. The aim was to investigate what problems women experience in this traditionally male dominated sector and what prevailing attitudes towards women were (Habitat, 1997). From the 868 workers interviewed in the sector, 132 members were women. Seven male and two female contractors were interviewed and it was reported that having women as workers was seen to create additional expenses as far, for example as the toilet facilities are concerned. Other concerns that arose were the management of the utilisation of facilities as it was reported that men were peeping at women in the changing rooms. In this study women's work performances were compared to male counterparts. Contractors believed that men manifested better skills than women due to their years in the sector, although they also believed that because the women are competing in the man's world they tend to try harder and hence provide better work. All contractors agreed that one problem that was rampant on all construction sites was sexual harassment and sex. But they justified the male worker's behaviour by saying that it is given that men will always make advances towards women. Overall this study tended to report on employers views about their experiences of adult women rather than those of young women, and tended to privilege male perspectives about including women.

Marshall's (1987) study conducted in the United Kingdom explored the implications for women working in the business world largely by dominated by professional men. According to Marshall, women felt isolated and had doubts about continuing in management for their entire careers. This study demonstrates how male cultures are perpetuated in organisations and as a result they remain hostile environments for women and deprive women from using their full talents and capabilities. While the focus is on career women in the United Kingdom, some of the questions asked by this study will inform the questions' theoretical

underpinning in the interview segment of this research study. It may well be that organisations that involve young people are more flexible.

The economics profession has strongly remained male dominated until very recently. This situation is beginning to change as the number of women studying economics to post-graduate level, and pursuing careers as economists in the private sector, academia, government, international organisations and nongovernmental organisations (NGOs), has increased significantly. A study which could be of great value for answering my research question, was conducted by Kimmis (2003) in the United Kingdom, which aimed to gain a better understanding of the barriers faced by women as their careers developed. According to Kimmis (2003), respondents felt that they need to be more qualified and productive in order to gain equal recognition. Some of the women thought their male colleagues excluded them from discussions by their style of behaviour. It was also reported that men seemingly valued the views and the opinions of other men above those of women (Kimmis, 2003:11). The perspective of the respondents on how these barriers could be removed or overcome is included in the research. The study illustrated that women in the field of economics can break through the 'glass ceiling' but they are very much the exception than the rule. Although this study raised issues that could be relevant to my study, asking questions about the informal ways in which women can be marginalised, it is limited because it focused on the experiences of adult women in corporate Britain.

The general 'glass ceiling' hypothesis states that not only is it more difficult for women than for men to be promoted up the hierarchies of authority within work places, but also that the obstacles women face relative to men become greater

as they move up the hierarchy. Wright and Baxter (2000) explore this hypothesis with data from three countries: the USA, Australia and Sweden. Again the target group of this study does not resemble my target group. However the discussions of the practical issues arising out of integrating women into previously male dominated hierarchies are of relevance to my study and will inform my research.

Allmendinger and Hackman (1995) conducted a comparative study in four nations: the USA, the United Kingdom, former East Germany and former West Germany, Allmendinger and Hackman (1995) explored what happens when an increasing number of women enter a professional symphony orchestra, a relatively elite and traditionally male organisation. The research draws upon data on 78 professional symphony orchestras in the mentioned nations. Four types of data were obtained for each orchestra: archival information, interviews, observations and player surveys. Herein, gender integration of professional symphony orchestras is still in its early stages. Allmendinger and Hackman (1995) analysed the effects of gender integration on three levels: firstly, at the level of the individuals involved, both the 'old hands' and the new entrants; secondly that of the relationships amongst the members; and thirdly that of the structures, processes and the performance of the organisation as a whole. The findings of this research study reported that almost all measures of perceived organisational functioning, including men's motivation and satisfaction, show an initial decline as the proportion of women in an orchestra increases (Allmendinger and Hackman, 1995:422). Furthermore, it was found that men responded strongly to changes in organisational gender composition. Allmendinger and Hackman (1995) found that men's reports were more favourable when there were few female players. The study provides a list of instruments which are described as of a female type (such as violins, violas, cellos) and of a male type (such as woodwind, percussion, bass and instruments in the brass section) (Grisworld and Chroback in Allmendinger and Hackman, 1995:422). It was found that women were significantly over-represented in the first and second class violins, violas and cellos, and they were under-represented in the woodwind, percussion, bass and brass section. This study is useful in terms of my own research as it deals with transformation issues, such as change in the gender composition of the organisation and the impact this has on the organisation and its members.

Richards-Broschart, (1992) examined several critical questions about the working lives and the status of women in the Soviet Union. According to Richards-Broschart, while women in the Soviet Union officially held the same constitutional rights as men, they did not enjoy equal status or comparable rewards in the labour market. The study demonstrates that constitutional guarantees of equality and full employment do not necessarily result in equality for women in their daily lives. Likewise, the existence of a gender policy in the Scouts has not resulted in the full integration of girls.

While these international studies are very useful in demonstrating the extent of the biases against girls and women, they do not clearly complement my research contextually. It is not clear for example whether the girls and women involved in many of these studies were from rural or urban areas; the focus is mainly on adults rather than on girls or young women, and these adults are within the corporate or other working environments. The emphasis also tends not to be on women's experiences. So from the perspective of my research question, their usefulness is limited. They do however raise a number of questions and issues that I will need to take into account in terms of the practical problems emerging when marginalised groups are drawn into the mainstream.

# 2.3 STUDIES IN AFRICA

In Africa, a study (Habitat, 1997) was conducted of women and girls in the construction industry in Ghana. In Ghana, this construction sector has tended to be regarded as the preserve of men. Until recently, training programmes in construction were consciously targeted at boys. Training institutions had no facilities for girls even to participate as day students. It is against this background that the UNCHS (United Nations Centre for Human Settlement) and Women in Human Settlement Development Programme (WHSDP) commissioned a study into the Ghanaian construction sector to investigate the impact of women on the sector, including problems encountered by women and possible interventions which could address these issues. The study reveals that despite a great deal of work by government, women's involvement in the sector has remained low. Worst of all most of the trained women leave the sector after a few years in practice, suggesting that their experiences were not positive.

The study shows that providing women with access to historically male-dominated fields does not mean that the field becomes 'women friendly'. Though professional women spend a lot of time in training, the Ghanaian study suggested they soon become frustrated and leave. This is attributed to work-place politics, dissatisfaction with allocation of tasks and cultural barriers. At institutional and professional levels cultural barriers, lack of interest in training, work place politics, and lack of respect from male subordinates seem to be the main problems.

This study helps address my research question because it focuses on policy initiatives and strategies that were suggested to foster integration of women in a historically male dominated environment and the outcomes thereof. But at the same time it is limited because it is not clear whether any rural girls were included

in this study, and because the experience of women in Ghana is likely to be different in many ways to the experiences of women and girls in South Africa.

In terms of Africa-based research, the emphasis tends to be on rural women and their access to information and resources around agricultural production. The Food and Agriculture Organisation survey data report (1989) indicates that women's unequal access to such resources is connected to the lack of female extension agents. The International Labour Organisation report (2000) argues that male extension services do not consider the dual roles of women in farming and the family, and that this has an adverse impact on women.

Back in South Africa, a study conducted by the Institute for Black Research in 1990, aimed to explore the experiences of black women in Trade unions. The study points to the patriarchal practices in institutions and how they are maintained. The study claimed that most decision making positions were held by men, and that meetings were held in the evenings which made it difficult for women to attend, and thus to climb the organisational hierarchy.

Between 1994 and 1999 in South Africa, new discourses and practices around social justice and gender equity enabled the entry of significant numbers of women into previously all-male domains of the educational bureaucracy (Chrisholm, 2001:387). Chrisholm (2001) explores the experiences of women entering into leadership positions in the administration of the Gauteng Department of Education. Sixteen in-depth interviews were conducted with eight men and eight women in senior management positions in the department. The interviews focused on the three main areas: difficulties experienced at work, especially in terms of race and gender; the institutional culture and whether it

could be described as supportive and individual responses and coping mechanisms. The study shows that despite an overarching discourse of gender equity to which all subscribe, discourses of leadership, which were both raced and gendered, structured the lived experience and the identity of both men and women. All women powerfully and painfully experienced race and gender shaping opportunities in their workplace. The women interviewed reported on their struggles to have their authority accepted once appointed. Lack of visibility and recognition were key issues for them. The majority of black women felt unsupported by the political head who, they felt, had consistently undermined their authority. It was further reported that women found their domestic responsibilities interrupted their participation in the public life and compromised their ability to play leadership roles. Although men felt the tensions between work and home, as did women, none of them had to carry domestic responsibility; and if they did, this was something they chose (Chisholm, 2001:396). Reflections on these issues did evoke questions about how constitutional culture could change to become sensitive to the needs of both genders. Chrisholm (2001) reported that African women expressed a need for gender training programmes to change the attitude of male managers at district and provincial level. Caucasian women suggested that greater attention be given to gender representation in the department, to ensuring less intense workloads and pressure, to establishing more realistic time-frames, and to creating more support for both men and women, with the recognition that people have personal lives (Chisholm, 2001:397). The study demonstrates how women in leadership positions in male dominated institutions are challenged in terms of the acceptance of their authority and how it impacts on their performance. Girls have been appointed in leadership positions in Scout groups and the study is relevant to inform my discussions on the experiences of girls in leadership in scouting and how gender shapes their experiences. However the study of Chrisholm (2001) focused on discourses of leadership, which were both raced and gendered, structured the lived experiences of both men and women.

Overall, in searching for literature for this study, it was challenging to find studies focusing specifically on rural girls moving into previously male dominated domains. Most of the literature dealing with rural girls focused on education, attempting to explain for instance why girls steer clear of science (Wondimagegnehu, 1991:109) or educational systems (EC Courier, 1994). Other studies considered questions around the social barriers limiting girls' access to education (UNESCO, 1999; IBE, 1999). Studies that considered the integration of females into previously male dominated institutions focused on adult women rather girls, and tended to consider the experiences of urban rather than rural women, and even then women's voices have tended to be silenced and men's voices privileged. Given that very little or no research has been done to give rural girls the space to share their experiences, and in the context of the constitutional requirement to achieve gender equality, the need for an exploratory study such as mine is marked.

#### 2.4 CONCLUSION

This chapter provided a theoretical background in terms of literature from around the world that explores women's experiences moving into male dominated fields. In my search for literature on the experiences of girls moving in male dominated organisations it was found that there are very few studies. In most of the studies conducted on the inclusion of women and girls in male dominated organisations, mostly negative experiences were reported. Other studies also show that the entry of women and girls into previously male dominated organisations could

raise some concerns among men about their dominance within the organisation and control of its operations. Despite the limits to other studies in terms of my own research question, I was able to draw on these studies to inform my own work and approach. In the next chapter I outline my approach through a discussion of the methodology and of my experiences in conducting the research.



# **CHAPTER THREE**

# RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

# 3.1. INTRODUCTION

This chapter outlines the feminist framework that underpins the research process. It explores the epistemological basis of the research and outlines the methodology and the techniques employed.

# 3.2. METHODOLOGY AND FRAMEWORK

A qualitative methodology was used for this study. In Development studies, and especially in the field of Women and Gender studies, Mies (1993) has argued that feminist researchers have recognised the need to develop research methodologies that are consistent with feminist values. One of the goals of feminist research is to ensure that women have a 'voice' within the production of knowledge, and to bring women into the research process. A crucial element of doing feminist research has often been to 'grasp the experiences, understanding and lives of women themselves as seen from their own perspective' (Millen; 1997:3) and this is precisely what my research aims to do.

My concern to privilege young women's experiences led me to decide to utilise qualitative means of inquiry as this research methodology values the subjective, helps prioritise personal meanings and definitions and helps to give voice to the silenced and the oppressed. It is also argued that quantitative methods represent a hierarchical form of knowing (Maynard, 1994:11) whereas qualitative research is more appropriate for research that aims to decrease power inequalities (Millen, 1997:10). However Maynard states that it is not easy to reduce power dynamics that are likely to be present in research and it is unlikely that they can be

eradicated completely (Maynard, 1994:16). In contrast, quantitative research often reinforces power inequalities and hierarchies because it is constructed in terms of testing theories and making predictions in a supposedly objective, value-free manner where the researcher is assumed to be detached from both the participants and the research process.

#### 3.3. RESEARCH PROCEDURES

# 3.3.1. Aims of the study

The aim of the study is to explore the experiences of rural girls in scouting living in the provinces of Mpumalanga, the Western Cape and the Eastern Cape of South Africa. Firstly, I had to conduct a situational analysis by collating information on the history, the community, the membership profile, the location of groups, the leadership and the scouting organisational structures. Secondly, I attempted to determine the basis on which girls and boys currently participate in the association's youth programme in rural areas, and how girls experience their participation.

# 3.3.2. Research participants

# 3.3.2.1. Selection of participants

This research study was conducted in the rural areas of Mpumalanga, the Western Cape and the Eastern Cape by using the purposive sampling method. The participants in the study were all registered Scout members (girls and boys between the ages of 14 and 18 years), living in the rural areas of their provinces. These provinces were chosen because they offer access to diverse cultural and linguistic communities, and because access to them can easily be obtained. The member groups, known as troops, were selected from the databases of their

respective provincial offices. These existing units or groups were used to form the focus groups within this research study.

Firstly, a proposal was presented to the National Scout Council Executive in order to get official permission and support for this. Contact was then established with different area commissioners of the different areas in order to get their support and permission to conduct the research in their province. The provincial offices played a vital role in providing the contact details of the groups. The group leaderships of the different groups were very supportive as they informed the scouts about the research. There was strong support and enthusiasm for this research amongst the membership of the different provinces. The parents of the participants received a letter informing them of the research study and each parent was asked to complete an informed consent form, in which it was explained to them that their child's participation was entirely voluntary and that their child would be free to withdraw from the study at any time.

# 3.3.2.2. Details of the participants

Thirty participants, fifteen of whom were girls, were involved in the study. Although the aim of the study was to explore the experiences of rural girls, boys were included in the study to explore the gender dynamics and to problematise how gender inequalities can be understood and addressed in scouting.

WESTERN CAPE

The following table provides the details of the participants per research setting:

Age Range	Research setting 1	Research setting 2	Research setting 3
	Mpumalanga	Western Cape	Eastern Cape
14-16	5	6	10
17- 18	5	4	0
Scout			
Advancement			
Membership	3	1	5
Pathfinder	7	8	5
Adventurer	0	0	0
Explorer	0	1	

# 3.4. FOCUS GROUPS

I conducted three focus groups altogether, one in each of the three regions. Each group comprised ten scouts and all of them were members of the identified group. The participants knew each other and this, as discussed below, had its advantages. I supplemented the material obtained from these focus groups by doing one-on-one semi-structured interviews with two female and two male participants. I felt that using focus groups as a method of research was the best way of getting responses to my research questions despite the disadvantages of the method.

Focus groups were preferred because the data obtained from focus groups is often more 'authentic' or closer to the essential meanings of the participants than

data elicited by other methods such as one-to-one interviews. In focus groups, the individual is not in a study in isolation but within a social context, which is relatively 'naturalistic' (Fontana and Frey, 2000:652). The social context of focus groups provides an opportunity to examine how people engage in generating meaning, how opinions are formed and expressed and (sometimes) modified within the discussion and debate with each other (Wilkinson, 1999:227). Focus groups thus tap into the social processes and everyday interchanges. As the interactions between participants' increases and interaction between the facilitator and participants decreases, so participants play a more significant role in shaping the research results.

One of the main problems experienced with focus groups was that both transcription and translation was extremely taxing and protracted. It was sometimes difficult to pick up what is said, especially in groups, where multiple respondents voice their opinions at once. Some practical disadvantages include the difficulty to recruit appropriate participants for the group, although I did not encounter it as a problem in my case. Fontana and Frey, (2000) argued that the requirements for a skilled interviewer are greater than are needed for individual interview because of the complex group dynamics that are present. As I have experience in conducting focus groups and interviews I feel I was able to work with the group dynamics effectively. During the focus group process I was able to keep one or a small coalition of persons from dominating the group and encourage recalcitrant respondents to participate. So despite these disadvantages, focus groups have shown their value, both as theory and as a method (Wilkinson, 1998; 123). In my study I conducted my focus groups with pre-existing Scout groups. The idea was that these groups could provide an environment in which participants can share their ideas, beliefs and attitudes in the company of people with whom they are familiar (Madriz, 2000:835). Focus groups were advantageous for this study because I could pay attention to the ideas of those who have little voice and, with my limited time available, I could gather very rich data.

Despite the problems, the good outweighed the bad; particularly because being a professional social worker with previous exposure to group work I was skilled in handling the focus groups. With the permission of the participants I made a recording of proceedings as well as taking notes during the discussions to keep track of who said what. The equipment for recording was tested in a pre-study focus group. I paid more attention to the interactive nature of the focus group reporting and analysing interactions among group members in a way that tried to do justice to their roles as meaning makers.

# 3.4.1. Focus group and Interview format

An hour-long session was planned and the groups were conducted at the venues where they usually meet. I believe that this helped to minimise any discomfort. I further conducted individual interviews with two girls and two boys on issues discussed in the focus groups that need more clarification or that could have been too sensitive to discuss in the group. These interviews took place after focus groups discussions. I chose to do semi-structured interviews because they help decrease power inequalities and acknowledge that the participant is the expert on the interpretation of her own life experiences. By using semi-structured interviews I could flesh out some of the issues raised in the focus groups and this overcame some of the disadvantages of the focus groups.

# 3.4.2. Details of the venues

At each venue I contacted the different group leaders to confirm the dates and place of the focus groups. At all three venues the adult leaders introduced me to the group by giving details of my role in the movement.

# 3.4.2.1. Mpumalanga

The focus group was conducted with a community-based Scout troop in a township near to Nelspruit. The group was under the leadership of two male troop scouters. The venue was located at a community centre used by different groups. On that specific Friday a community choir was also practising. Unfortunately this made it very difficult to conduct interviews due to acoustic interference at the venue for the first half an hour. Luckily this time was utilised for the pre-focus group programme planned by the group. I will narrate more about this programme later.

# 3.4.2.2. Eastern Cape

The focus group was conducted at a school in an informal settlement near East London. Two female troop scouters, who were also teachers by profession, led the Scout troop. The group was a school-based Scout group and the meeting was conducted in the school hall. I utilised the hall nearest to the playground, which also served as a classroom. The place was not really conducive for the focus group because children on the playground interrupted the discussion but unfortunately there was no other suitable room available. At times one of the scouters had to request that the children not play near to the hall.

WESTERN CAPE

# 3.4.2.3. Western Cape

The focus group was conducted with a community-based group in Worcester, which is led by one male and one female scouter. This group is privileged to have their own Scout hall. Although it is close to the N1 highway I experienced the venue as conducive to conduct focus group and interviews.

#### 3.5. PRE-FOCUS GROUP PROGRAMME

Both in Mpumalanga and in the Eastern Cape the scouters and the scouts planned group pre-focus group programmes. The aim of the programmes was to serve as an ice-breaker to welcome me to their troops. In Mpumalanga the group staged a concert, which included a variety of items such as singing and drama. In the Eastern Cape the boys and the girls were doing traditional dancing and were dressed in traditional outfits, with weapons. When I arrived at the Western Cape research setting the scouts and scouters were preparing the hall for the focus group session. After the focus group snacks were provided by the scouters and scouts. I had informal conversations with them.

# 3.6. THE FOCUS GROUP PROGRAMME

At the beginning of my session with the focus groups, I welcomed each participant and thanked them for being available for the study. Once again, I introduced myself to the group and explained the purpose of the study and the meeting to ensure there was no confusion. A programme was drawn up and also explained. Time was negotiated in order for the participants to articulate their concerns. The participants were informed of the tape recorder and how it would be used in the session. I also explained to them that I would be making notes in the session in order to keep track what was said. I also encouraged the scouts to feel free to express themselves in their own language as I had arranged with the

adult leaders to assist with the translation. I also explained to the participants what role the troop scouters would fulfil in the focus groups. At times I observed that the participants did not feel comfortable to express their opinions. The adult leaders attempted to keep their presence to a minimum in order to cause the least interference with the research.

The focus groups were conducted mostly in English and Afrikaans. In Mpumalanga and the Eastern Cape where the participants responded in Xhosa and Pedi, the adults gave English summaries of the discussions. This was not the most ideal arrangement, as much may have been lost in translation, and I have no way of knowing the extent to which the translator mediated the message. On the other hand it was seen as an opportunity to explore options in cross-cultural settings.

# 3.7. REFLEXIVITY

Beoku-Betts (1994:414) states that a researcher may benefit if she has 'insider status'. I am uniquely positioned to conduct the study in this setting because I have a good understanding of the culture, programmes and structures of the association from a volunteer as well from a professional staff perspective. I am a black, middle class, urban, Afrikaans speaking woman in my early 40s with a social work background. I was also the first female appointed to the position of a troop scouter in 1992 when I managed the Scout programme as a project in Cape Town. At that time scouting was not open for girls and my programme was only offered to the boys in the institution. This project was aimed at raising awareness of the equalisation of opportunities for persons with disabilities. I faced many challenges as a female scouter. On one occasion our troop had to participate in the Senior Scout Adventure event in the Cedarberg and I was

informed that taking women on this event could be a problem as there are no ablution facilities in the area for women. The leadership was also concerned that the troop's boys wouldn't be able to cope with the programme. I felt that we, as marginalised groupings, were not the problem but it was the rules and regulations that were applied rigidly. This situation demonstrated that the responsibility was shifted and that the leadership did not properly explore how to include persons with disabilities and women in order for them to participate. Finally, after many discussions we were informed that the troop and women could participate. Another challenge faced by the group was when the disabled girls of the institution wanted to join the Scouts. I was strongly convinced that these girls could also benefit from the scout programme but it was not allowed. I found it very difficult to advance only boys. I observed that the girls with disabilities experienced double oppression firstly as people with disabilities and secondly as females.

# UNIVERSITY of the

However, having insider/outsider status may also present certain dilemmas. I am presently a manager at the National Office responsible for overall management of the organisational transformation process, and this might make people wary of speaking with me, particularly if they have something critical to say about the Scouts. Whilst the abovementioned points were important to orientate me in doing this research, I was also continuously conscious of the class and other differences between myself and the research participants, which could affect the research process (Beoku-Betts, 1994:428).

An attempt was made to honestly reflect on my experiences in the research process whereby I endeavoured to assess the ways in which my insider knowledge shapes the process of research. I kept a journal in which I

documented my thoughts before and after conducting the focus groups. My initial acceptance by the group was facilitated by my scouting background and the ability to have knowledge of scouting. I shared some of my experiences of being a troop scouter and this relieved the anxiety in the different groups. I found this necessary in order to build trust and rapport with participants. However, I observed that some of the participants at the Eastern Cape were wary of me at first but I felt that I could gain their trust quickly by creating a non-threatening atmosphere. I was especially concerned having adults present at research settings.

At both the Mpumalanga and the Eastern Cape venues, the adults were assisting with translation. I explained to the scouts why the adults should be present and at the same time reminded adults of their role in the study. At times I experienced difficulties in following the discussions in the focus groups in Mpumalanga and the Eastern Cape but I managed by asking the adults and the scouts to clarify information to ensure that my understanding was accurate. However in some instances I felt that the participants saw the focus group exercise as a test. They responded with statements that I sensed they thought I wanted to hear. This impacted on our conversations at times; I found it challenging to try to understand the participants and treat them respectfully when they expressed differing opinions.

As a social worker I always found myself working with marginalised groups, such as persons with disabilities, street people and rural communities, and in my role as a change agent I have challenged issues that contribute to depriving people of access to opportunities.

In both my work and my studies, I have embraced a gender perspective on the society in which I live. This includes a view that gender relations are dynamic, variable and context specific. Gender relations are shaped by the historical processes, which influence how gender interacts with all the axes of inequality. In South Africa the central forces that have shaped social relations were colonialism, capitalism and apartheid and it has fractured society along racial, class and gender lines.

#### 3.8. DATA ANALYSIS

With the permission of the participants, I conducted the focus groups and semistructured interviews with an audio-cassette recorder. The focus groups and interviews were tape recorded and later transcribed. Firstly I collected verbatim transcripts of focus groups and semi-structured interviews and put this alongside my notes. In the case of Mpumalanga and the Eastern Cape the summaries of the translators were transcribed. The transcription and translation proved to be extremely taxing and time-consuming. Transcripts were subject to grounded theory analysis (Strauss & Corbin, 1998) consisting of line-by-line analysis. At the heart of grounded theory analysis is the coding process, which consists of three types: open, axial, and selective. Open coding is the initial process in grounded theory, which involves breaking down, analysis, comparison, and categorization of data. In open coding, incidents or events are labelled and grouped together via constant comparison to form categories and properties. Axial coding, on the other hand, represents the delineation of hypothetical relationships between the categories and the subcategories, while selective coding can be described as the process by which categories are related to the core category. I began to code the data of the focus groups independently to generate many categories. Additional categories were developed from the codes in the interviews. As I found more instances of the same category code I would refine my idea of that category and record a memo of those ideas. The incidents or events were grouped together via constant comparison to form categories. The categories were finally organized as a system of conceptual themes related to transformation and scouting

A further stage of analysis focused on the group process. Firstly the groups were compared in terms of a number of variables: language, race, Scout advancement level and different group contexts. I also drew on the entries made in the personal journal regarding my experience of the sessions.

# 3.9. ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

Each participant's parent received a letter stating the aims and objectives of the research and inviting them to participate in the project. The fact that I worked with minors meant that I took extra care to make sure my participants were not harmed in any way. A research contract was drawn up which guaranteed anonymity and confidentiality for participants. The participants could leave the group at any point if they felt uncomfortable. It was also communicated to them that they could ask for the exclusion of the transcripts or records or anything they did not wish others to see. I also explained to them that a tape recorder would be used in sessions and that I would be making transcriptions of the recordings for use in my research.

# 3.9. CONCLUSION

This chapter has outlined the way in which I planned and conducted this research project. I used a feminist qualitative methodology to pose questions about girls' experiences in scouting to the respondents. I conducted three focus groups and

four in-depth interviews, which I analysed using grounded theory analysis. The next chapter will present the girls' experiences in Scouts, as an organisation.



# **CHAPTER FOUR**

# **GENDERED EXPERIENCES IN SCOUTING**

#### 4.1. INTRODUCTION

In this chapter I will present a discussion and analysis of the main findings that emerged from the focus groups conducted with the boys and girls in each of these research settings. This chapter will focus firstly on how rural girls and boys experience Scouts as an organisation, and secondly on the processes and interventions in and by the organisation in terms of their effects on girls, boys and the inter-relationships between these gender-groupings.

# 4.2. JOINING SCOUTS

In response to the question of why the participants joined Scouts, the majority indicated that they joined because 'it is fun' and it provides an opportunity to meet friends. Susan, a 17-year-old member and Meagan, a 15-year-old member in the troop of the Western Cape stressed that they joined because they were bored and they perceived scouting as a place where they could 'meet new friends.' Moira, a 15-year-old member at the Western Cape group reported that she was attracted to scouting because she likes 'hiking and it is an opportunity to explore nature.' She continued by saying, 'scouting is a place where I meet new people.' Peter and Charles, both members of the Western Cape group conveyed that they joined Scouts 'because it keeps them out of trouble.' Gloria, an 18-year-old member, reports that she was attracted to scouting because 'I love the uniform.' Sipho, in the troop in the Eastern Cape, states: 'I wanted to become a leader that's why I have joined scouting.' In turn, Nosisa a 14-year-old member in the same setting also joined because she loves the outdoor programme of scouting: 'I like camping, hiking and meeting other people.' So there were a variety of

reasons offered for joining scouting, ranging from enjoyment of outdoor activities to aiming to acquire leadership skills.

# 4.3. DESCRIBING SCOUTING

The aim of scouting is to encourage the spiritual, mental, social and physical development of boys and girls and these aims are accomplished through the 'Scout Method'. This method is what makes scouting different from other educational or youth organisations. It is defined by the WOSM as 'a system of progressive self-education.' (Boy Scouts South Africa, 1992:24) It is made up of various elements, all of which are interdependent and integrated. The seven elements are collectively known as the 'Scout Method'. The first element is the ethical code to which the scouts commit. More detail on this element will be presented later in this chapter. Learning by doing is the second element and emphasises personal development through the progressive Scout programme. The third element, small group operations, promotes group work in the form of scout patrols comprising of six to eight members under the leadership of one of the youth. It is aimed to develop the leadership skills of the scouts. The fourth element is about life in nature, which refers to understanding and caring for the environment. The fifth element is youth-adult relationships, and this refers to the relationship between the scout and the adult leader. The final element, personal progression and evaluation, refers to the sessions the adult leader has with each scout after the completion of each advancement badge in order for the scout to reflect on his or her achievement. This is an opportunity for the adult leader to provide guidance on the boy's or girl's scouting career. Overall these seven elements combine to build an organisation aiming to provide a range of opportunities to facilitate personal growth. Firstly it aims to develop the scout leadership skills, secondly developing their character, thirdly training them as responsible citizens and lastly to develop personal fitness (in body, mind and spirit).

Unsurprisingly in the discussions at the different provinces, participants held different perceptions of what scouting is, and few put their understanding of these perceptions in the language of the seven elements. Voyani, a 15-year old member, placed the emphasis on challenge in his understanding of scouting, stating: 'Scouting is a challenge. It provides a challenge and you also learn how to challenge.' Nomsa, a 15-year-old member in the same group said: 'Scouting is very supporting.' Bongali, a 15-year-old member of the Mpumalanga group shared his experience of scouting stating: 'scouting is about solving problems.' In this, Nosipho, a 15-year-old member in the same setting reported that she saw scouting 'as opportunity for girls.' In the Western Cape, 15-year-old Peter revealed that he experienced scouting as a programme, which aimed 'to keep young people from using drugs and alcohol.' Moira (age not disclosed) reported that 'scouting provides a safe environment where youth can socialise.' These responses reveal a variety of priorities around scouting. Young people enjoyed scouting for the opportunities it provided for meet other young persons, for the opportunities it offered to acquire leadership and other social skills, as well as the chance to engage in activities and visit places that are not available or accessible in everyday life. From what these scouts report, scouting creates a range of opportunities for meeting personal needs and fostering personal growth.

# 4.4. THE SCOUT ETHICS

In the movement, the scouts are encouraged to live up to the ideals of *The Scout Law* and *The Scout Promise* through the Scout programme.

The Scout Promise

'On my honour I promise that I will do my best -

to do my duty to God, and my Country;

To help other people at all times;

To obey the Scout Law'. (The Scout Badge Book - Edition 2005)

In *The Scout Promise* the scout promises to do his or her best and to live up to the ten parts of *The Scout Law*, which are as follows:

# The Scout Law

- 1. A Scout's honour is to be trusted.
- 2. A Scout is loyal.
- 3. A Scout's duty is to be useful and to help others.
- 4. A Scout is a friend to all and a brother and to every other Scout.

WESTERN CAPE

- 5. A Scout is courteous.
- 6. A Scout is a friend to animals.
- 7. A Scout obeys orders.
- A Scout smiles and whistles under all difficulties.
- 9. A Scout is thrifty.
- 10. A Scout is clean in thought, word and deed.

It was interesting to note that the boys in the different research settings confirmed that the *Promise* and the *Law* are important cornerstones in their scouting career. The boys I interviewed were committed to following and obeying the rules as stated in the Scout Law, which speaks directly to boys – 'A scout is a... brother to every other scout.' Voyani, a 15-year-old member in Mpumalanga, is convinced

that: 'living under the Law or taking the Law as a daily routine, I think it will make us better persons.' Shado agreed that the Scout Promise and Law are important and he shares it with his non-scout friends inviting them to: 'come and join scouting. You will learn something new. You will start a new life and will learn about the Scout Promise and the Law.' Sipho of the Eastern Cape troop also mentioned the Law and Promise, which he valued as an important aspect of scouting: 'scouting is good. We -... say the Law and the Promise.' Duma a 15year-old scout in the Eastern Cape reported that: 'I learn about the Promise and the Law, and this involved being friendly and respectful towards others.' Overall, the boys seemed to place a lot of emphasis on the Law and the Promise. The girls on the other hand referred to values that are important in scouting such as 'treating other people with dignity' and 'respecting other people.' But they did so without referring to the *Promise* and *Law* – perhaps because they see the *Law* as applying to boys. 'Scouting makes you a better person' observed Gloria in the Western Cape. In her view 'It is a lifestyle.' Thus it appears that while boys understand scouting ethics and practices as a set of rules that they need to adhere to, in order to be a scout, rules expressed in the Promise and the Law, girls - at least those in this study - seem to understand scouting ethics and practices as principles rather than rules, providing values that can strengthen their character and improve their relationships with others.

#### 4.5. SCOUTING AS A SOCIAL INSTITUTION

It is interesting to note that the participants associated scouting with other social institutions such as that of a 'family' and the 'church': 'Scouting', as 15-year-old Siyanda in Mpumalanga observed, 'is like a family, we are called a family because we are brothers and sisters.' As Dora, a 14-year-old in the same troop explained, 'I like scouting. I like to be a Scout, it is like church.' Adult scout

leaders are allied with 'parents' and 'teachers'. Participants' perceptions and experiences of being 'brothers and sisters' in scouting further substantiate their views of the organisation as more than just a 'club'. Charles referred to Meagan as his 'sister' because 'she understands me when I am difficult.' He explained that initially he experienced the 'girls as intruders, taking the space of boys but we have bonded with the girls and we are a big happy family.'

# 4.6. SCOUTING PROVIDING RESOURCES

According to Kabeer (2000) institutions also mobilise and distribute resources. These may be human resources (for example, labour, education, and skills), material ones, such as equipment, or intangible ones, such as information, (Kabeer in March, Smith and Mukhopadhyay, 2000:106). Scouting is no exception to this and a variety of human, material and intangible resources are supposedly available to young people. One of the aims of this study was to assess the extent to which gender influenced the allocation of resources. During the interviews it was revealed that boys and girls in different research settings held different perceptions of whether it was girls or boys who were offered more access to the resources and opportunities available through scouting.

From the perspective of my participants it appears that opportunities in scouting appear to be greater for girls than boys. In the Western Cape, for example Gloria acknowledged that multiple opportunities are available for both boys and girls, and confirmed that the girls often took the initiative to access the opportunities that are available: 'Opportunities are provided for boys and girls but recently, I found that there are more opportunities for girls. But we (girls) have decided to access these opportunities'. These include opportunities to attend competitions and leadership camps. According to 15-year-old Charles, of the same troop,

there was a shift in the provision of opportunities. He states that: 'girls are offered more opportunities in scouting because initially we were only boys now we have more girls in the troop'. Charles supported girls having access to these opportunities, especially to leadership training courses such as patrol leadership courses.

So on the one hand, with girls outnumbering boys in the troop in the Western Cape, it appears that girls are perceived as having more opportunities. However, on the other hand, a male scout in the troop in the Eastern Cape felt that boys still tended to enjoy more opportunities: 'I think that boys are having more access to opportunities than girls.' Nwabisa, a 14-year-old member interviewed in the Eastern Cape, disagreed, stating: 'we (boys and girls) are treated the same. It is fine'. From these discussions it appears that in the Eastern Cape boys and girls' access to resources is relatively equal, while in the Western Cape, girls are perceived to have increased access to organisational resources. This may be related to the larger numbers of girl Scouts in the Western Cape. In Mpumalanga most of the participants agreed by nodding their heads that scouting provides opportunities. However, Nosipho states that 'I think that boys are favoured by the troop scouter who is an adult leader. He will first ask the boys especially if they had to plan sport activities.' Bongali disagreed with Nosipho stating 'girls do not want to volunteer when troop scouters put forward a task. I feel that girls are jeopardising their own progress because the opportunities are there.'

It appears from the discussions with the girls that the adult leader creates more opportunities for boys, and the feeling amongst boys is that girls should be held responsible for their under-performance, as they are encouraged to participate. The girls felt that their skills are underrated, especially when it comes to so called

male tasks, such as axing of wood, pitching tents and pioneering, which are seen as needing strength and energy. The number of girls relative to boys and the attitude of the adult scouter shape the perceptions that girls and boys hold with regard to the opportunities for girls in scouting. Where girls outnumber the boys in the Western Cape, it appears that girls have more access to opportunities, or at least see themselves as having substantial access to opportunities. In contrast, boys in the Eastern Cape hold the perception that boys have more opportunities than girls do. However, girls tend to be happy with their status and their opinions could be shaped by their upbringing that girls only take opportunities when it is granted but boys are allowed to seek opportunities.

# 4.7 SCOUTING AND ITS PROGRAMME

The Scout programme includes different activities such as nature observation and conservation, games, hikes and pioneering. The Scout programme has three major components. The first of these is the Scout advancement badges, which provide the core training, such as outdoor safety training, knotting, compass use and hiking. The second is the Scout craft and interest badges, which are aimed at extending the Scout's skills not included in the advancement programme. The third component is that of the challenge awards, such as the Patrol Leader Training Unit Badge. These challenge awards provide additional challenges for the senior scout. There are six programme advancement badges: Troop membership, Pathfinder, Adventurer, First Class, Explorer and the Top award (highest advancement level). Both male and female participants indicated that they enjoy the challenge of acquiring the skills to be awarded the various badges. Dora, a 16-year-old member in the Mpumalanga Troop confirmed that the scouts in her troop enjoyed the challenge of acquiring the skills signalled by obtaining a badge: 'we enjoy scouting; we play; we learn and do things. I love the badge

work. You have a choice what interest badge you can complete.' Ziyanda identified with the positive aspects mentioned by Dora: 'it is nice to be in scouting because we learn; we play together. I found the badge work very challenging. There are so many interest badges, which you can work on.' Bongali, a 15-year-old boy, confirms that 'the activities which I like are those that can award me a badge. It is a challenge, you are challenged as a young person.' Sipho in the Eastern Cape reported, 'I love the doing the knotting and the pioneering.' Fifteen year old Meagan in the Western Cape boasted of the badges she achieved conveying that 'I experienced the badge work as the challenge. I been awarded badges at the different camps which I have attended.' Overall the boys and girls at different research settings perceive badge work as a rewarding challenge and opportunity to acquire new skills.

The following excerpts strongly illustrate that the majority of the participants in this study understand scouting as an institution of learning. Nosisa in the Eastern Cape indicated that: 'in scouting I have learnt a lot of survival skills especially on the camps.' In the Western Cape, 18-year-old Gloria has been exposed to numerous educational activities and indicated that 'she could apply the things that I have learnt in projects at my school.' She further conveys that she was able to use the skills acquired in scouting to 'set objectives and develop an action plan for her school projects.' Gloria, the youth troop leader, experienced the obstacle course on the camp as challenging and associated it with the challenges in life, stating: 'in life you also need to overcome obstacles.' Gloria also confirmed that she feels 'more confident to take on new challenges.' The female participants confirmed that they acquired organisational leadership skills through their involvement in the planning of activities and running of patrol meetings. Most believe that acquiring these skills has positively impacted on their lives.

The boys also confirmed that they experienced scouting as an institution of learning. Just as Gloria conveyed that she 'has learned to take care of the environment' the majority of the boys also reported similar experiences. Voyani, a 15-year boy, stated: 'scouting is about exploring nature, things of nature. I never understood the value of nature until I have been exposed to the talks and the activities on nature.' He continued to say that 'we must preserve nature. Nature is a gift from God to us.' Bongali, a 15-year-old boy in Mpumalanga, conveyed that he had taken advantage of the outdoor programme which provides an outlet to release his stress, stating: 'some adults never learnt to release their stress but I have learned to be relaxed.' Peter in the Western Cape notes that: 'I acquired first aid skills through the Scout programme ... and that this is important because now I can help somebody if he or she sustains an injury.' Freddie claimed that the programme on healthy habits has taught him: 'all about drugs and alcohol.' The majority of the boys in the Eastern Cape confirmed that they have also learned more about nature and other more practical skills such as knotting. While the girls also learned these kinds of traditional scouting skills what transpired in the discussions suggested that the emphasis should shift away from knotting to other programmes such as sex education.

The leadership and social skills acquired by scouts spill over into other more private aspects of life. While in terms of sex education scouts are provided with information about the mechanics of sexual relationships and sexually transmitted diseases, they also learn a little about the dynamics of interpersonal relationships Sylvia, a 16-year-old member in Mpumalanga, reported that she had an opportunity 'to learn the facts of life.' Ziyanda in the same setting confirmed that she is able to make 'informed decisions because I have the facts of HIV/AIDS and I want my friends to join scouting so that they can be informed of HIV/AIDS.'

Rodney, a 16-year-old in the Western Cape, suggests that 'more attention should be given to sex education now that we are mixed groups.' Bongali in Mpumalanga felt strongly that 'separate programmes on sex education should be presented to boys and girls because 'when girls are talking about sex, they are talking too much.' The boys appeared to be critical towards the girls who appeared to be more comfortable talking about sex.

# **4.8 ACTIVITIES LIKED AND DISLIKED**

As the discussions around the activities of the Scout programme continued participants were asked to share which activities they liked the most. Outdoor activities and social activities were top of most lists while physical fitness exercises (excluding sports) were floored. There were clear gender dimensions surrounding these preferences. In Mpumalanga the majority of the girls liked 'Kim's game', an intellectual game, which enhances their observation skills, and 'riverbank' which enhances their listening and concentration skills. But they also liked camping and hiking, which could be seen as more traditionally boy's activities. Lindiwe, a 14-year-old member in the Eastern Cape also confirmed this, stating: 'I like hiking. It gives you the opportunity to explore nature. At night we have campfires and sing-a-longs, story telling and meet new friends.' The majority of girls in the Western Cape also liked the outdoor programme of scouting. Gloria, the youth troop leader, conveys that she 'likes to go to camps and meet other people.' Marlene, a 16-year-old, reported that she 'likes camping and knotting.' Boys also liked the outdoor programme. In Mpumalanga Bongali reported that 'I like camping and especially the campfire.' Shado, a 17-year-old member in the troop of Mpumalanga, reported that he likes 'to play in the water' and that 'some of the games teach me good skills.' My discussions with both boys and girls reveal that they both enjoyed these kinds of physical outdoor activities.

The things my participants disliked most were linked to the wider social environment in which scouting is embedded. Divisions between different racial and ethnic groups were observed and experienced in complex ways, with most scouts expressing dissatisfaction about racial imbalances. In Mpumalanga, Shado stated that: 'I dislike racism. You find on the camp that the majority of the youth attending the camp are black. The white scouts are not there. I don't like it; I use to like it when we were mixed; now they [the area Scout leadership] are dividing us.' In Mpumalanga, Noma conveys that 'the white people don't come here. The black scouts go to them.' Noma encouraged her group to commit themselves to bring about change stating that 'all of us should be change agents.' Nosipho expressed her dissatisfaction with the reported situation and suggests joint ventures between the different racial groupings stating: 'I don't like to be alone and black alone. We must be mixed (black and white).' Scouting promotes principles of mutual respect and equality and at least some scouts believe that it through embracing these values positive and respectful relations between different racial groupings could develop. As Shado stated: 'I believe that we [scouts] try to build the nation, and we [scouts] have to build the rainbow nation.'

#### 4.9 UNIFORM

Scouting is a uniformed movement. Both adults and youth wear uniforms. However, the badges on the uniforms of the adult and youth differ. The movement promotes a uniform as something that the scouts should take pride in and as something, which emphasises community and helps provide a sense of belonging. While, on the one hand uniforms limit individuality and tend to imply a

military style hierarchy (reinforced by the emphasis in the *Law* on obeying orders), in practice there is a great deal of flexibility.

The relevance and the appropriateness of the Scout uniform were among the issues that were discussed at the Strategic Transformation Workshop in 2001. The National Scout Council subsequently adopted a flexible uniform policy in June 2002, allowing each Scout group to have the option to select the most appropriate form of the standard uniform, given their unique and individual circumstances. This provides for a great deal of choice and flexibility. Despite this progressive policy most of the scouts seemed to prefer the founder's uniform (khaki trousers and shirts). According to both the boys and girls involved in this study, the uniform was one of the things that originally attracted them to scouting. Susan of the Western Cape troop said that: 'I like the uniform; I like to see somebody in a uniform. When I saw the Scout uniform I became interested to join scouting. It looks interesting with all the badges.' Sabelo, a 15-year-old member from the Eastern Cape troop, mentioned that: 'I like the movement and the uniform. You feel that you belong somewhere.' Edwin confirmed that 'the scout uniform promotes a sense of belonging. It is also seen as symbol of status.'

#### 4.10 CONCLUSION

It clear from the discussion that both boys and girls joined scouting because of its outdoor programme, and the uniform and the opportunities for social interactions it provides. This suggests that young people in South Africa join the Scouts for similar reasons to their European counterparts, as shown by Nielsen's study of European Scouts which suggests that outdoor activities are an important element in explaining the popularity of scouting in Europe. To return to South African scouting, my study suggests that both boys and girls see scouting as providing

some kind of 'family', as providing a relatively safe environment in which to socialise. Many if not most of the girls in this study were attracted to scouting because they saw it as place where they can meet new friends. Their emphasis was on cultivating relationships and learning to establish rapport. For both boys and girls physical fitness elements were the least enjoyed activities

Yet, there were also some important differences between boys' and girls' experiences. The boys tended to be more inspired by the organisational atmosphere, which promotes competition and subordination to the hierarchy and rules, with far more boys than girls making direct references to the *Law*. Adherence to the scouting ethics expressed in the *Law* and the *Promise* are viewed as critical by boys whilst girls viewed this as guiding principles to shape their behaviour. The boys in this study emphasised the need to follow the rules of scouting very strictly, whereas the girls used the rules as a general guideline, as a flexible guide rather than a fixed and rigid set of rules. In the next chapter I present a discussion of ideas and processes that informed transformation with a particular focus on girls' experiences of transformation. Secondly I present a discussion on the experiences of girls in leadership in scouting and how both boys and girls have responded to girl's leadership.

# **CHAPTER FIVE**

# TRANSFORMATION IN SCOUTING

# 5.1. INTRODUCTION

As stated earlier, the South African Scout Association (SASA) is in the process of transition and is faced with many challenges. To achieve an organisation free from racism and sexism the association has had to undergo a paradigm shift with regard to how resources should be allocated and how people relate to each other. The transformation agenda of SASA aimed to redress the imbalances of the past, and to ensure a more equitable sharing of resources and to foster social cohesion.

In this chapter I present a discussion of ideas and processes that informed transformation with a particular focus on girls' experiences of transformation. Secondly, I present a discussion on the experiences of girls in leadership in scouting and how both boys and girls have responded to girls' leadership.

# 5.2. TRANSFORMATION AND GENDER ROLES

Gender roles are roles that men and women are expected to play in society. Our socialisation teaches and reinforces these roles, and the cultures of our communities help define the content of these roles. Yoliswa, a 14-year-old member of the Eastern Cape scouting group, gave an account of her gendered experience of being that the youngest girl in the family and that she is expected to 'wash the dishes, scrub the floors and do the washing.' In contrast, work outside the house is understood as gendered for men: 'my uncle will work in the garden.' It is evident from the discussions in focus groups that Yoliswa is expected to take on primarily domestic reproductive roles at home, and that she

is expected to help take care of her family by cleaning the house. (Alvesson and Biling, 1997:454) state that 'by accepting culturally agreed rules as mediated by [the] people we interact with, we internalise the cultural norms and rules [and live] up to [the] expectation ['s of others]'. In other words, Alvesson and Billing suggest that we constrain ourselves in ways that fit prevailing gender roles. Yoliswa's account of the division of work in her home illustrates this point. But gender divisions of labour differ across time and place and from culture to culture, and community to community. Girls who have been exposed to the Scout programme have found themselves doing tasks that they had been taught were men's work in their communities. This has potential ramifications for gender-based power relationships in a variety of complicated ways. Nomsa, 15-year-old from East London, revealed that she has: 'learnt to make a fire' through her participation in scouting. Now she says, 'I do not need men or my father to help me to make a fire when I need to do a barbeque.' In Nomsa's mind, fire making was associated with men's work and represented something she was previously unable to do as a result of gender based stereotypes about the appropriate tasks for men and women. Her newly learned ability to make fire challenges these stereotypes. Scouting, as an institution in transition, and as an institution that aims to promote gender equity, acts as a secondary socialisation agent. Through non-formal education, scouting effectively challenges the contours of the gendered roles that society assigns people, based on their biological sex

# 5.3. TRANSFORMATION AND ACCESSIBILITY

As discussed earlier, scouting in contemporary South Africa is open to all, irrespective of their race and gender. Contemporary scouting is an organisation or institution containing extremely diverse constituencies that allows girls and boys to encounter different ways of doing things, emerging out of these diverse

constituencies. As Shado, a 17-year-old member of the Mpumalanga Scout group, explains, in scouting '[w]e learn of orher people's customs and cultures.' Bongali, a 15-year-old, supported Shado from Mpumalanga. He said, 'we learn about others cultures'. He also made the point that 'the members of the group are coming from different backgrounds.' One of the principles that underpin transformation is that members (adults, boys and girls) should respect each other's cultures.

### 5.4. TRANSFORMATION AND INTEGRATION

# 5.4.1 At troop level

The different troops went through different phases of change when faced with the challenge to integrate girls. The following section focuses on how the groups in the different provinces have been challenged when girls were admitted to their troops and the reactions of the boys and how they dealt with the changing institution.

WESTERN CAPE

In Mpumalanga the group was challenged by how to deal with issues around having male and female bodies interacting with each other in particular settings. Bongali found it very difficult to understand why girls don't want to be touched when they play physical contact games. Dora tried to explain this stating: 'I don't want to be touched.' She reported that: 'I think sometimes [boys] touch you the bad way.' She experienced the boys as being inconsiderate: 'they think [those other persons] enjoyed to be touched' but she re-emphasised that 'it is not nice.' She conveyed that she has been 'touched the bad way' when they played physical games with the boys. Noma articulated her opinion stating, 'Mam, if you are not touched the proper way, that's going to be a problem.' She experienced it as 'uncomfortable the way [boys] hold [her].' She is of the opinion that 'this could

become a problem.' Bongali appeared very shocked after the responses of the girls and he immediately apologised stating: 'I am sorry.' The girls appeared to be relieved as they voiced their concerns. I observed that participants felt uncomfortable with the situation and the group was plunged into a long period of silence. My analysis of the silence is that it appeared that this was the first time that the girls discussed their concerns so openly and this could be linked to the fact that the male adult leaders were not able to deal with these kinds of issues in the past. Also the fact that the boy was so shocked implied that he never knew that girls felt uncomfortable with the way the boys touched them when they played physical contact games.

Conflict and resistance is inevitable in any process that deals with change. Here in the Western Cape group the integration of girls posed another kind of challenge. Firstly, boys felt angry, uncomfortable and seemed to have difficulty accepting girls in scouting. It is further reported that the girls have been exposed to an environment marked by continued conflicts. Marlene, a 17-year-old member, conveyed that initially the boys expressed feelings that they do not want girls in their troop and because of the boys' reaction, the majority of the girls mentioned that they experienced rejection. Other than the rejection the girls mentioned that 'the boys let us feel that we do not fit into the Scout programme.' Dora mentioned that there were 'continued arguments' between the boys and the girls and the boys had 'a lot of complaints about the girls.' Dora went on to say that the girls were also exposed to a hostile environment and conflict emerged when 'we do better than them in activities' and 'they will display anger.' It was reported by Marlene in the Western Cape that over a period of time she has observed the changed attitude displayed by boys towards girls in scouting stating: 'at the end of the day [boys] realised that we are able to do the same [activities] like them.' She went on saying that the '[boys] are feeling 'OK' with us in the troop now.' Traditional gender roles were called upon to justify marginalizing girls in scouting. When Charles in the Western Cape had to deal with girls in the troop he originally felt that it was not 'the right thing for girls to join the Scouts.' He believed that 'girls must do girls' things and boys must do boy's things.' Since 'scout activities are outdoors' he holds on to his point of view that '[scouting] is for men and it is boy things.' However, although Charles strongly opposed the notion of girls joining scouting it seemed he has now accepted the change and acknowledged that he 'felt good that [the] [girls] have joined scouting.'

Contrary to what happened in both the Western Cape and Mpumalanga it seems that the process of integration was conducted more smoothly in the Eastern Cape. It appeared from the discussion that boys in East London were very happy with the girls joining the Scouts and their participation is experienced as an asset and a benefit. Sipho conveyed that: 'I feel very happy ..., happy ... that the girls have joined the troop'. When questioned why he is so happy he responded that: 'there are a lot of things that we are doing together.' Duma shared that 'it is good to have girls in our troop.' He saw it as an opportunity to understand girls, stating 'we learn to understand each other.' Although the boys appeared to be happy with the girls in the troop, the mixed troop setting still posed a challenge when girls and boys were participating in activities. The girls were depicted as being slow as the following comment from Sipho illustrates: 'when we are doing the knotting, [girls] are slow.' In contrast, the girls seemed not very impressed with Sipho's statement and argued that 'they are fast.'

### 5.5. SINGLE VERSUS MIXED PATROL SETTINGS

The participants were asked to give their opinions on mixed gender patrols versus single gender patrols. In this section I will discuss the opinions revealed at the different research settings. Many of the male participants supported the idea of mixed gender patrol settings but also communicated some of their concerns. Bongali in Mpumalanga seemed to support mixed patrols stating: 'I don't have a problem with mixed patrols.' However, he also expressed fears regarding the girl and boy relationships in the mixed patrol setting which he thought could develop into sexual relationships stating that 'the girls and the boys [should not be] full of immorality.'

Songela, a 14-year-old in Mpumalanga raised the concern of being equal in numbers stating: 'we need to be equal boys and girls in the patrol.' He continued to say, 'the patrol should be mixed, but equal.' Songela strongly emphasised equal numbers. When questioned why he proposes equal representation he responded that, when the patrol had to play team games they need to be divided into equal girls and boys. It is for these logistical reasons that equal numbers are recommended. It appears that equal representation is an important consideration for mixed patrol settings as this could be a determining factor which gender group 'owns' the territory. Similarly the girls also supported mixed patrol settings but their views differ from these of boys. Whilst the boys communicated their fears and proposed recommendations about how the mixed patrol settings should be structured, the girls' comments centred on how they can benefit from the mixed patrol setting. The majority of the girls preferred the mixed gender patrol settings. Sylvia in Mpumalanga communicated the importance of mixed patrol settings: 'I prefer mixed patrol settings. We and the boys learn from each other.' Ziyanda also preferred the mixed patrol setting and suggested that 'we need to mix with the boys because we learn the same things.' Siyanda expressed a need to understand boys better and suggested a more gender equitable patrol setting stating: 'we must learn to be equal and not take each other for granted.' The girls in Mpumalanga claimed that both genders complement and add value to each other. During the discussions, Sylvia found it very difficult to comprehend why the boys and the girls should be separated in scouting. She compared the Scout setting with her home and school settings: 'My mom does not say boys that side and girls the other side. It is not happening at school either.'

Whereas most of the girls and some of the boys favoured mixed patrol settings based on principles of mutual respect and equality, it was found that some of the boys have different preferences. As many of the boys want to demonstrate their masculinity to each other they felt that girls would distract and delay them from achieving these goals. The presence of girls somehow served to 'undermine' their masculinity. Edwin's experience with girls in his troop seemed to be negative: 'we could have finished the task but with the girls in the patrol we have been delayed.' According to Freddie 'the girls are too concern with their nails, afraid that it could be damaged when we are doing knotting and pioneering.' Freddie said that 'the girls have delayed the patrol on the obstacle course activity' and he feels that 'girls are too slow.' It is evident from his view that stereotypical attitudes remain.

## 5.6 DIFFERENCES AND COMMONALITIES

The majority of the participants, both male and female scouts, agreed that there is no difference between being a boy or a girl in scouting. Sipho in the Eastern Cape troop is of the opinion that 'there is no difference, we do the same activities.' Themba refers to the uniform as a symbol representing this sameness:

'there is no difference; we are wearing the same uniform.' Nwabisa's view concurred with the other girls: '[boys and girls] are doing the same things; I can do anything.' Meagan in the Western Cape shared the same view as girls in Mpumalanga stating: 'there is no difference. We all come to the same hall, doing the same activities. We are all at the same level.'

However, while some of the girls claimed to have the same experiences as boys, the differences in male and female biology couldn't be ignored. During an interview with Gloria, an 18-year-old at the Western Cape troop, she gave an account of being different based on her physical and biological needs stating: 'on the patrol leaders camp we are given a minute to wash ourselves. You know that we have our monthly periods. As a girl I want to feel fresh and clean.' She reported on the negative experiences with adult male scouters of being 'insensitive for the needs of the girls.' Based on what Gloria has experienced it seems that men adult leaders could feel uncomfortable with making provision for menstruation. When questioned how her menstrual cycle affects her interactions with the boys in the troop she responded that sometimes it is not 'an issue' but sometimes she feels 'irritated' and does not enjoy 'the [boys'] company.'

# 5.7 LEADERSHIP AND GIRLS IN SCOUTING

It seems that the girl leaders sometimes encountered resistance especially from the boys in the troop. Gloria confirmed that the boys often don't want to listen to her stating: 'the boys do not want to listen to me.' She continued to say that 'being the troop leader I found it difficult to call them to order.' Charles, a 15-year-old, responded to Gloria's statement by saying that he refused to obey orders from girls stating: 'for me if a girl instructs me to keep quiet, I won't listen to her.' He strongly felt that 'a man should instruct [him] to be quiet. He made it very clear

that 'I won't listen to a girl when instructed to be quiet.' This boy is strongly of the opinion that only men can instruct. His understanding of leadership is about giving orders and exercising control. His experience is that only men can instruct and it seems that men are viewed as having a higher status. An autocratic leadership style is also favoured because it is perceived more dominant and 'leaderlike.'

I approached the focus group in East London differently by sketching scenarios in order to assist participants to understand the questions. The girls were asked to explain how they allocate tasks such as the cleaning of the dishes and fetching of wood for campfire to a mixed patrol. The following responses were captured: Nosisa stated: 'I shall grant the boys the opportunity to choose the task they would like to be involved in.' She continued to say that 'if the guys want to do the dishes, they can do it but if they want to fetch the wood they are welcome to do it.' It is evident from the responses that the girls will as far as possible provide options to the boys to choose the activity they wish to participate in whilst the girls are deprived of options. It appeared from the discussion that Nosisa may be exposed to a family and community life where men are involved in decision making whilst girls must conform to the decisions taken for them. For Nomsa it is easier to assign tasks and responsibilities, which are aligned to the community norms. Nomsa stated that '[I] would ask the girls to do the dishes and boys to fetch the wood.' Nomsa suggested that girls need to assist boys in the task of fetching wood for the campfire. From the discussion it is clear that the internalised messages, experiences and the role models inform the girls' leadership styles. Although the girls have been tasked with responsibility of washing the dishes, Nomsa also expected the girls to assist the boys with the fetching of the wood, which appears to be an unequal distribution of work.

Girls were asked to share how they would respond to a situation where the boys refuse to fetch the wood. Nomsa responded stating, 'I will ask the girls to fetch the wood.' 'If they refuse', she says, 'I will do it myself.' Once again it was revealed in the discussion that girls found it difficult to give instructions to boys. Girls are placed and place themselves in a disadvantaged position, depriving them of choices and options.

Although the difficulties of girl leadership were raised, many of the girls were still of the opinion that they could be leaders. The topic unlocked a lot of discussion and boys became interested in sharing their view of girls appointed as leaders. Themba in the Eastern Cape strongly supported the girls' view stating, 'girls can also be leaders.' The other boys agreed that girls can become leaders but they are depicted as being slow stating: 'girls can lead but they are slow.'

In Worcester the girls shared positive experiences of being a leader in scouting. This following excerpt clearly conveys Gloria's confidence of being a leader stating: 'I am the troop leader. Boys are under my authority and I feel good about myself.' Gloria's positive experiences can be ascribed to her exposure to female role models in her troop. However, while overall leadership in scouting is experienced by girls as an opportunity to build their character and provide the girl a sense of status, it is not without its challenges as the following discussion reveals.

## 5.7.1. Boys Responding to Girl's Leadership

It was noted at all three research settings that older boys more easily accepted the girl as leaders than the younger boys. It was found that younger boys will set certain conditions and the following excerpts captured the strong opposition and disapproval of young girl leadership. Themba claimed that: '[he] must be the patrol leader. A girl younger than me cannot be a leader.' Mandla, 14-year-old stated: 'I won't listen to [a] [younger] [girl].' During the group interactions I could sense a great deal of unhappiness coming from the younger boys towards the idea of young girls as leaders, although from the discussions it appeared that younger boys are open to be led by older girls. Their remarks revealed that younger girls could not be considered as leaders but followers. Being told what to do by a girl younger than themselves was often seen as demeaning by young boys, eager to demonstrate their masculinity. This kind of situation threatened the boys' pride.

# 5.7.2 Girls Responding to Girl's Leadership

Women as leaders had to prove themselves as being capable of leadership. Men are assumed to be good leaders because they are men. The studies of Van Nostrand (1993) and Chrisholm (2001) found that women feel a strong sense of inadequacy unless they are accepted by both men and women. A similar construction of girls and leadership was encountered in my study. It carries the assumption that women are somehow inferior to men and that leadership is for men. Even girls themselves appeared to prefer male leadership. The girl patrol leaders experienced several difficulties if they had to lead a girl-only patrol. Gloria in the Western Cape mentioned that when she was appointed as patrol leader at a winter camp 'the younger girls did not want to take any instructions from [her].' Marlene said that: 'I observed that younger boys would obey orders given by older boys.' She asked, 'why it is so difficult for younger girls to obey instructions given by older girls?' The discussions continued and I observed that Gloria appeared to be despondent when she shared her experiences of the pressure she felt when she had to lead a girl-only group. Very disappointed, she states

that: 'I feel that the other girls work against me.' She argued that this could be because the girls deny that women can use power. Given the situation it appeared that girls and boys would always test girls' authority. It also appeared that girls and boys would try to undermine the authority of girls.

# 5.7.3. Girls, Power and Leadership

During the interview with Gloria, she responded that she feels very good to be the troop leader 'because the boys are under my control and authority.' She then withdrew her statement saying it is 'not good, but it shows that I could be a leader.' The socialisation of girls and boys begin with the assumption of male power and female powerlessness. The study conducted by Van Nostrand in 1993 revealed that women in leadership positions often downplay their ability to lead, fearing that they may seem unfeminine.

### 5.8 CONCLUSION

The acceptance of the principle of gender equality as a substantial policy imperative in SASA's transformation agenda has introduced new challenges for the organisation. One of the challenges was the integration of girls at troop level and in leadership roles and this chapter unbundled some of the reactions of both boys and girls towards these progressive steps in scouting. The boys were especially challenged by the girls' responses towards their negative perceptions of the girls' poor participation in physical contact games. It appeared that earlier in the transformation process there was more opposition from boys towards the integration of girls in troops, who understood girl's presence as posing a threat to their masculinity and their 'ownership' of space and resources - especially where girls outnumbered boys. However it was observed in the other settings that many of the boys had come to value the presence of girls in their troops. Each girl

interviewed had a narrative of the struggle to have her authority accepted once she was appointed as a leader. In general boys showed resistance towards girls' leadership and stifled group operations at times. Furthermore girls in leadership received similar treatment from girls'-only patrols. However it was noted that some boys acknowledged and valued girl's leadership. Despite these difficulties, girls felt being in a leadership role enhanced their personal growth.

As discussed, girls acquired new skills such as organisational and leadership skills through their exposure to the non-formal educational Scout programme and this challenged the gender stereotypical perceptions and expectations held by Scouts and members of the wider communities. Both girls and boys in the study claimed that there are no differences being male or female in the group, citing their exposure to the same activities in the Scout programme and wearing the same uniform as proof of their equality. However one of the girls complained that adult leaders do not recognise physical differences, especially during camps. The girls suggested that more time needs to be allocated for the bathing and dressing as girls are faced with other biological processes, such as menstruation. This illustrates that the scouting programme, originally designed by men for boys, needs to be rethought. Despite these matters, the majority of the girls and some of the boys prefer mixed patrol settings. Girls believed that mixed settings provide an opportunity to learn and to understand boys better. Although some of the boys shared the same sentiment, other boys observed a measure of discomfort, fear and uncertainty. Equal representation is a password to ensure girls do not outnumber them, while boys' stereotypical generalizations of girls as 'slow' reinforces the notion that girls hold boys back, but also provides an excuse for male failure.

To conclude, traditional roles and gender stereotypes persist and continue to place the girls at a disadvantage in terms of opportunities, especially in fulfilling leadership positions.



#### **CHAPTER SIX**

### CONCLUSION

Scouting is a global phenomenon and in South Africa it has a history dating back to 1908. This study has attempted to explore and understand some of the recent organisational changes in South African scouting. In order to do this it was essential to first gain an understanding of the unfolding of the evolutionary processes globally, and this study starts by attempting to locate local change against the international context. Policy changes in the international scouting arena and in the post-1994 era necessitated that the SASA align their strategic agenda to international and national instruments.

One of the first changes was the organisation's name which was changed from Boy Scouts of South Africa to the South African Scout Association (SASA) following which the word 'boy' was then deleted from the constitution and the Policy Organisation and Rules (POR).

SASA then adopted an infrastructural approach to ensure the implementation of the critical priority of the integration of girls. However it is evident – just by looking at the numbers of girl versus boy scouts - that having policies and structures in place does not ensure gender equality. Other mechanisms, such as gender sensitisation-training, need to be in place to facilitate attitudinal changes of persons in leadership and on an operational level. My research suggests that conducive environments, which foster change, need to be created at troop level in order for the scouts to embrace change.

Official reporting on the integration of girls into scouting at National Scout Council meetings has been by men, with girls and women's voices largely silent. Through adopting a feminist approach to my research I've tried to ensure that the girls were given an opportunity to speak about their experiences of the integration process and to be part of the production of knowledge around integration. Although the aim of the study was to explore the experiences of rural girls, boys were included in the study to explore the gender dynamics and to show how gender inequalities can be understood and addressed in scouting. While the study attempted to explore the experiences of rural girls in scouting living in the previously disadvantaged communities of the provinces of Mpumalanga, the Western Cape and the Eastern Cape, it has certainly not been reflective of the views of all the scouts in these provinces especially those from more affluent rural communities and urban communities.

SASA aims to promote gender equality, which entails systematically identifying and removing the underlying causes of discrimination in order to give girls and boys equal opportunities in every sphere of the organisation. However, it was found in the study that the same treatment did not always lead to equal results. The physical needs of girls – such as menstruation - are not always recognised which may then impact on their participation in the activities. Furthermore physical contact games, which are mostly rough and steam-releasing activities, were not well received by some of the girls as physical contact with boys provoked feelings of discomfort. Therefore sometimes there may be a need to treat girls and boys differently, to achieve gender equity in practice.

It is noteworthy that despite different socialisation practices in broader society, both boys and girls rated the outdoor activities as the most liked, and physical exercises as the least liked activities, suggesting that there are similarities between boys and girls that can fruitfully be developed.

Another finding was that the values of scouting are still promoted through emphasising the *Scout Law* and the *Promise*. My research suggests that boys wanted to live strictly by these rules whereas girls placed less emphasis on them, seeing them primarily as a guide. The manner in which the *Law* promotes a sense of exclusivity for boys might partly explain why girls interpret the *Promise* and the *Law* differently, and the wording of these guides is something that probably needs to be considered in terms of the implementation of gender equity.

One of the steps toward gender equity required to integrate girls into Scout groups is the presence of a female adult leader. As discussed earlier, female adults were only allowed to work with the 7-11-year-olds in the past. When this changed difficulties were experienced obtaining female adult leaders to provide programmes for 11-18-year-olds. Guidelines were drafted which informed the integration of girls. These guidelines provided options to groups to admit girls or not. It was found that there were groups in the provinces which admitted girls, whilst the opposite was observed at other groups. The adoption of the Gender Policy in 2001 encouraged groups to admit girls, and operational guidelines were reviewed to assist with integration.

It was found that the admission of girls in the groups did not take place without difficulties. The boys showed resistance towards the change in the organisation and tension between the boys and the girls was reported. Although girls challenged the perceptions which the boys (and some of girls) have or had of girls in leadership it seems that things might be slowly changing. Boys observed

that girls could do things such as pioneering (the building of constructions) and the axing of wood, which they perceived to be a boys' domain and for some at least this appeared to be a threat to their ideas about masculinity. As girls became more involved in the troops they were appointed as patrol leaders and troop leaders in their settings and this further challenged the distribution of power contributing to the production of new gender dynamics in troops, especially where girls outnumbered boys. Some of the boys in this study reported that they refused to take instructions from girl leaders, while some of the girl leaders reported that they had faced and largely overcome challenges of maintaining discipline in both girls only and mixed groups.

Several of my participants had suggested that troops needed a 50/50 membership policy as this would help with the processes of integration and encourage the development of more egalitarian ways of behaving in the organisation. However, as noted in the introduction, the ratio of boys to girls is 6:1 and this obviously has major implications for the numbers of girls relative to boys in each troop, with subsequent implications for the ways in which troop members interact with each other, as discussed in Chapter Five. Given the unequal numbers and the severe under-representation of girls, it appears that the organisation remains overwhelmingly dominated by men despite the changes in policy. While it wasn't the aim of this study to explore the reasons why girls did not join Scouts (after all the focus was on those who had joined) it would seem to be important that those in charge consider ways in which more girls could be encouraged to join the Scouts. In addition this research suggests as well that it is important to find ways to smooth the path of girls who do join, to help them and boys adjust to the new realities in which gender equity is a non-negotiable constitutional requirement.

#### REFERENCES

# **Primary sources**

# Focus groups

Focus group: Mpumalanga Scout Troop, 7 November 2003
Focus group: Western Cape Scout Troop, 17 September 2004
Focus group: Eastern Cape Scout Troop, 23 September 2004

#### Interviews

Interviewed Ziyanda in Mpumalanga on the 7 November 2003
Interviewed Gloria in Western Cape on 17 September 2004
Interviewed Charles in the Western Cape on the 17 September 2004
Interviewed Duma in the Easter Cape on the 23 September 2004

# **Minutes**

National Scout Council Meeting minutes, 23- 24 November 1996 Commissioners' Meeting minutes, 22-23 November 1997 National Scout Council Meeting minutes, 29 March 1998 National Scout Council Meeting minutes, 28 March 1999

# Pamphlets/Newsletters

Adult Resources Service World Scout Bureau. 2000. *Information Exchange*.2<sup>nd</sup> series No.27. Geneva

WESTERN CAPE

Boy Scouts of South Africa. (1992). What is Scouting? A brief guide to the Aims, History, Principles and the Methods of the Boy Scouts of South Africa. Cape Town

CEO (nd) of the YMCA, YWCA, WOSM, WAGGS, IFR, IAA. *Girls and Young Women in the 21st Century: A call to action* 

South African Scout Association. (2002) Gender Policy

World Organisation of the Scout Movement. (1999) *Policy on girls and boys,* women and men within the scout movement

# **Secondary Sources**

Allmendinger J, Hackman J R. (1995). The More, the Better? A four-nation study of the inclusion of Women in Symphony Orchestras. *Social Forces*. December 1995, 74(2): 423-460.

Banister, P, Burman, E, Pooker, I, Taylor M and Tindall. (1994). *Qualitative Methods in Psychology, Buckingham*. Open University Press.

Beoku-Bets J. (1994). When Black is not enough: Doing Field Research among Gullah Women. NWSA Journal, 6(3): 413-433.

Chrisholm L. (2001). Gender and leadership in South African Educational Administration. *Gender and Education*. 13(4): 387-399.

Diamond D, Kimmel M. (2002). Gender integration at Virginia Military Institute and the United States Military Academy. In Datnow A and Hubbard L, *Gender in Policy and Practice: Perspectives on Single sex and Co-educational Schooling*.

Fontana A, Frey J. (2000). *The* interview: From Structured Questions to Negotiated Text. In *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, second edition, Norman K, Denzin. (Eds). Sage Publication Inc: 645-672f.

Habitat. (1997). Women Constructing their Lives: Women Construction Workers - Four Evaluative Case Studies, Community Development Library 2.1. -2000 Edition.

March C, Smyth and Mukhopadhyay. (2000) A Guide to Gender -Analysis Frameworks.

Maynard, M. (1994). Methods, Practise and Epistemology: The Debate about Feminism and Research. In M.Maynard and Jarvis (ed.), *Reflections on what* 

Constitutes Feminist Research in Researching Women's Lives from a Feminist perspective, London: Taylor & Frances Ltd.

Meer F, (1990). Black-Woman-Worker: A study of patriarchy and woman production workers in South Africa, Durban. Madiba Publishers.

Mies, M (1991). Women's Research for Feminist Research: The debate Surrounding Feminist Science and Methodology. In M.M. Fonow and J.A. Cook (Eds), *Beyond Methodology: Feminist Scholarship as Lived Research*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Millen D, Feminist research: a question of method, methodology or epistemology? *Cambridge University School of Education Research Methodology Conference*. Lucy Cavendish College, 14-15 April 1997.

Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. (1998). *Basics of qualitative research* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Striebel A, (1995), Focus groups in Aids Research. Community and Health Sciences. 2(2), 1995. UNIVERSITY of the

WESTERN CAPE

Wilkinson S. (1998). Focus groups in Feminist Research: Power, Interaction and the co-construction of meaning, USA. *Psychology of Women.* Quarterly 23: 221-244.

Wilkinson S. (1999). Focus groups: A Feminist Method, Cambridge University Press, *Women's Studies International Forum*, 21, (1): 111-125.

# **Websites**

Food and Agriculture Organisation. (1998) *Raising women's productivity in the Agriculture* retrieved from:

http://www.fao.org/docrep/w580e06.htm on 10 July 2004

Pagewise, Inc. (2002) *Girls in gangs* retrieved from: <a href="http://www.me.essortment.com/girlsgang\_rbhl.htm">http://www.me.essortment.com/girlsgang\_rbhl.htm</a> on August 14, 2004

Scout Base UK. (2004) *The history of scouting* retrieved from:

http://www.scoutbase.org.uk/library/history on 2 December 2005

Accessed Online: 02 December 2005

Scout Canada Coeducational – Scouting retrieved from: http://www.bsa-discriminations.org/html/gender\_policy.html

Accessed Online: 02 December 2006

World organisation of the Scout Movement. (2003) *Scouting around the world:*National Scout Organisations retrieved from: <a href="http://www.scout.org/satw/links.sntm">http://www.scout.org/satw/links.sntm</a>
on 10 December, 2003

UNIVERSITY of the WESTERN CAPE

# **APPENDICES**

# Focus group interview schedule

- 1. Why did you join Scouting?
- Do you prefer to be a member of a mixed of a single gendered troop//patrol? Explain why.
- 3. What activities do you like and disliked in Scouting? Explain why.
- 4. What does the Scouting promise and Laws means to you?
- Scouting needs to serve boys and girls. What is your opinion regarding this statement.
- 6. Do you prefer to be lead by a girl or boy patrol leader? Explain why?
- 7. What does the expression "equal opportunities" to each of you?
- 8. Do girls and boys have the same opportunities?

UNIVERSITY of the WESTERN CAPE